

The heads and limbs piled everywhere
Seemed polo balls upon a pitch" (p. 141).

As regards the selections of shorter poems the translators explain that they have aimed to bring out, "the sense of otherness" in the Gurus' teachings. In particular they suggest the Sikh scriptures emphasise the shortness of life and the ever-presence of death. So for example one poem describes the ten stages of life, explaining that:

"The tenth is for burning till ashes are left.
As the funeral party utters laments,
The soul flies away and asks where to go.
Life came and is gone and so too has the fame,
Leaving only the offerings for crows to be called to"
(Majh ki Var, M1 1.2, p. 137/p. 25).

In keeping with this the theme of the first selection is impermanence, and this is followed by sections on the nature of the self, ethical action, guru, Word and Name, and ecstatic bliss.

As regards the translations themselves two important features which are bound to be lost are the musical settings, and the variations in vocabulary. However, Shackle and Mandair have tried to reproduce something of the directness and brevity of the originals' highly inflected language, and made the translations metrical. The brief selections reproduced here show how far they have succeeded in conveying not just the ideas but much of the emotional force of the originals. Succinct and refreshingly down-to-earth, free from the tendencies of some earlier translators to adopt archaisms such as 'Thy', 'Thee' and 'Thou', these translations will be appreciated not just by experts but by anyone with an interest in Sikhism. Offering in addition to the translations some original insights and unfamiliar perspectives on the Gurus' teachings, this book cannot be too highly recommended.

HUGH BEATTIE
The Open University

AN ANTHOLOGY OF CHINESE DISCOURSE ON TRANSLATION. VOLUME 1: FROM EARLIEST TIMES TO THE BUDDHIST PROJECT. Edited with Annotations and Commentary by MARTHA P. Y. CHEUNG. pp. xxix, 268. Manchester, St Jerome Publishing, 2006.
doi:10.1017/S135618630800922X

This book comes from a publisher who specialises in studies of translation, but is not known for being active in Asian Studies, so it may not have caught the attention of many who might find it interesting. It is worth seeking out, because it has much to offer not only to scholars of the theory and practice of translation, but also to specialists in cultural and social history, to say nothing of those working in Buddhist Studies. Although the volume does consider the role of translation in the secular and diplomatic contexts, the major part is devoted to materials arising from the massive and enduring project of translating Buddhist works from Indian languages into Chinese. This was a vast and ambitious endeavour that occupied some of the finest minds of the medieval period. Fortunately for us, it is not just the translations themselves that survive, but also texts written around and about the process of translation. The sources collected and discussed in this volume thus represent an invaluable archive for the study of a particularly interesting case of cultural transmission, one that is still well worth reflecting on in our current global age.

The majority of the eighty-two sources in the book are rendered into English for the first time. The editor has presented them in chronological order, and has striven to maintain consistency of

terminology across the span of the centuries covered by the volume. The structure of the work is thus helpful for tracing developments in translation practices. The many cross-references between the entries ensure that this is a well-integrated book that can be read from cover to cover, not just dipped into as the need arises. Some of the passages Cheung has selected will, inevitably, be well known (at least to scholars), but a fair number of them are still relatively obscure. All the texts are by men, save one by Empress Wu (r. 690–705 CE) on p. 168. One of the strengths of the volume is that it includes a fair number of passages from writers who were not direct participants in translation projects but who still had interesting things to say about language – men like the third-century commentator and thinker Wang Bi (pp. 63–65), or the statesman, poet, and scholar Shen Yue (441–513 CE) (pp. 113–114).

For each entry in the book, there is a headnote to introduce its author, followed by the passage in English translation, and then a commentary. Both the passage and commentary are well documented with footnotes. The translations themselves are readable and mostly reliable. Chinese characters are used liberally throughout the book and, most usefully, also appear in the index, although for some reason they are conspicuously absent from the table of dynasties where they might have been helpful. The brief biographies of people mentioned in the text (pp. 203–217) will save the reader from continually consulting other reference works while engaging with the book. Scholars and teachers may find a variety of uses for this volume, but I suspect that, as a single volume in which a variety of relevant primary sources on translation of scriptures may be readily located, it might find a useful place in graduate seminars on Chinese Buddhism. It will certainly not supersede more specialised studies of individual translators and their works, but it does provide an overview which is otherwise not easily available to students.

As might be expected from a volume whose advisory board is staffed exclusively by Chinese scholars, it is particularly strong on the contributions of Chinese scholarship to the study of translation. It is indeed most useful to have a guide to that body of work, some of which may be unfamiliar to scholars in the West. The book is unfortunately weaker on the contributions of those who write in English and European languages. For example, although there is an extended discussion of the meaning of the terms ‘hu’ and ‘fan’, one seeks in vain for any mention of seminal works such as Daniel Boucher’s article “On *Hu* and *Fan* Again: the Transmission of ‘Barbarian’ Manuscripts to China”, (*The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 23 no. 1 (2000), pp. 7–28). The translation and discussion of passages relating to the ‘Great Cloud Sutra’ and Empress Wu (pp. 172–173 and 195–197) are severely compromised by the lack of reference to the extensive work on this topic by Antonino Forte (see, most importantly, his *Political Propaganda and Ideology in China at the End of the Seventh Century: Inquiry into the Nature, Authors and Function of the Tunhuang Document S. 6502, Followed by an Annotated Translation*, (Naples, Istituto Universitario Orientale, 1976); and the heavily revised and much expanded second edition, (Kyoto, Scuola Italiana di Studi sull’Asia Orientale, 2005). If the treatment of western scholarship is a little skimpy, then Japanese scholarship is barely even mentioned. Given the great interest that Japanese scholars have taken in the languages of Buddhism and the transmission of the tradition from India to East Asia, there is no doubt a great deal of relevant work that could have been drawn upon here. It is a little unsettling to discover that not even the most basic Japanese dictionaries for the study of Buddhist texts and terminology appear to have been consulted. Instead one finds the unreliable and outdated dictionary of Soothill and Hodous (1937) cited repeatedly in place of the many superior Japanese reference works that are commonly available.

Although the book appears to have been carefully checked by experts in translation, there are many inconsistencies and errors in rendering Indic terms that could have been prevented by having an expert who works with Buddhist Sanskrit materials read the manuscript, even once. Diacritical marks, in particular, are applied in a slap-dash manner throughout the book. ‘Sarvāsti-vāda-vinaya-bhikṣu-pratimokṣa’ (p. 77), for example, is a pretty ugly attempt at a title which might be better

transcribed as ‘Sarvāstivāda Vinaya bhikṣu-prātimokṣa’. The English renderings of titles of Buddhist texts do not always seem to hit the mark: is “*Verses on Sublime Truth*” a standard translation of the title of the *Dharmapāda* (p. 60)? The choice of “Sutra on the Land of the Practice of Tao” for the Chinese title *Xiuxing daodi jing* 修行道地經 (p. 54, n. 54) seems to be based on an overly literal reading of *di* 地 as ‘land’. In Buddhist sources, it often means ‘stage’ and translates the Sanskrit term *bhūmi*, as in the ‘*Yogācārabhūmi sūtra*’, which is how this Chinese title might be back-translated. This is a particularly noticeable inconsistency, since the title *Dadao di jing* 大道地經 is rendered (more accurately) as ‘*Sutra of the Stages in the Great Way*’ (p. 86, n. 128).

There are some minor errors: on p. 67, one character appears to be missing in the Chinese given for the catalogue called *Jinglun dulu*. The reference to the “Western Xia”, occurring as it does in a fifth-century source (p. 112), cannot be to the Tangut kingdom of 1038–1227 CE. ‘Huiji’ (p. 124) is more usually read ‘Kuajiji’.

In conclusion, this is a useful volume which provides interesting perspectives on the history of translation in China, especially the Buddhist project. But it should not be used as the sole guide to the literature of Buddhist translation – the reader should not hesitate to consult more reliable reference works and studies of that material.

JAMES A. BENN
McMaster University

CHINESE SCULPTURE, A GREAT TRADITION, By ANN PALUDAN, pp. 559. Chicago, Serindia Publication, 2007.

doi:10.1017/S1356186308009231

Survey books present a unique set of challenges: how to justify what is most important and give adequate attention to everything else that must be covered; how to balance discussion of one’s primary research subjects with those about which an author is knowledgeable mainly through secondary literature; when to express a theory or idea, particularly a personal one; and determination of the appropriate length for the anticipated audience. For art books, there is the additional matter of number of illustrations. Ann Paludan’s, *Chinese Sculpture, a Great Tradition*, deals with all five in an exemplary way. Tracing the history of Chinese sculpture from the Neolithic period through the twentieth century, the 559-page book and its 361 plates, most of them in colour, offer an even-handed yet stimulating survey of the material. It is the kind that only someone who has been fully immersed in her subject for decades, and who has studied first-hand almost every object about which she writes, could produce.

Paludan lays the ground rules for her study in the introduction. This is first and foremost a book about art. Readers will examine objects as thoroughly as is possible through descriptive writing and pictures. The readership should be familiar with the major periods of western art and a few masterpieces of western sculpture, such as relief sculpture of Chartres Cathedral or Michaelangelo’s *David*. The author will provide basic background about Chinese thought and history, and characters for the major Chinese terms and sites. Finally, the author will offer her personal observations.

Following the introduction, the book is divided into four parts with a total of twelve chapters and an epilogue. Part one deals with sculpture of China’s pre-Buddhist age. Most of the material comes from tombs. Chapter One is a very quick survey of pottery, bronze, and stone, including jade from the fourth millennium BCE until the unification of China in 221 BCE. The First Emperor’s terra cotta army and other funerary sculpture, as well as terra cotta, pottery, and metal sculpture of the Han dynasty (206 BCE – CE 220), are the subjects of Chapter Two. The last chapter of part one focuses on stone.