

law and grace while Luther speaks of law and Gospel. He notes that “when Luther thinks of this difference he speaks of law and gospel, because he takes the gospel to be an external means of grace, having a kind of sacramental efficacy” (37). “For the mature Luther,” writes Cary, “the gospel not only requires us to believe we are forgiven, it gives us the comfort of a gracious God whom we can love” (50) since “the gospel gives the righteousness that the law demands” (50). This is significant in relation to Augustine because of what Cary believes is “the most essential difference between Augustine and the mature Luther: instead of a prayer for grace, we have a promise of grace; instead of a human word seeking God’s gift, we have a divine word giving it. As a result, Luther now has something external to cling to when he is fearful and anxious about his sins” (51). The contrast with Augustine is that for Augustine, “words and signs never have the power to give what they signify” (39). Cary claims “the notion of a specifically sacramental kind of efficacy, whereby external things can be an effective means of grace, arises within the Augustinian tradition of the west long after Augustine.” In this regard, “Luther is closer to Peter Lombard and Thomas Aquinas [than] to Augustine. He is . . . more Catholic than Augustine” (39). In the end, “what Luther wants us to learn . . . is to cling to the gospel as an external word that gives us Christ and, in Christ, all good things” (54).

In “What Can Catholics Learn from Luther?” Thiessen considers “Luther and the Role of Images”; Saarinen writes on “Luther and the Reading of Scripture”; and Helmer presents “The Common Priesthood: Luther’s Enduring Challenge.” David Bagchi’s epilogue advocates for the ecumenical study of Luther. This approach “provides us with the opportunity for mutual learning and a genuine appropriation of new insights, not merely a formal recognition of the validity of our respective positions” (239). In short, says Bagchi, “Catholics and Lutherans can learn from each other, and those of us who stand outside the process can learn from both” (239). To that end, this volume stands as a model source and resource for Luther study today, and tomorrow.

Donald K. McKim, *Germantown, Tennessee*

*Music and Culture in the Middle Ages and Beyond: Liturgy, Sources, Symbolism.*  
Benjamin Brand and David J. Rothenberg, eds.  
Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016. xvi + 362 pp. \$99.99.

---

This collection groups its fifteen essays into three themes reflecting its dedicatee Craig Wright’s interests in sources, ceremonies, and symbolism. The editor’s introductory chapter frames the volume, but also provides a useful literature review within these fields and of Craig Wright’s distinctive contributions. Thomas Forrest Kelly pieces together the fragments of the almost-vanished liturgy of Capua in Southern Italy, a set-

tlement that experienced waves of upheaval, most recently in 1943, and whose once-abundant manuscripts are now mostly gone. Barbara Hagg-Huglo posits a pioneering role for Hucbald's late ninth-century numerical office for Saint Peter's Chair, *De plateis*; the distinctive melodic and cadential gestures found in *De plateis* would later characterize the model antiphon series *Primum quaerite*. From the other end of the Middle Ages, Marica Tacconi places the Florentine office of Saint Zenobius within the worldly context of the Medici rehabilitation in 1512. Brand's study on Tuscan *pulpita*, focusing on Pisa's surviving *pulpitum* (moved to Sardinia in 1312), further amplifies our knowledge of ecclesiastical upper spaces as visible sites for musical performance—a reminder that screens need not constitute barriers.

Bridging liturgy and source studies, Rebecca Baltzer's study of Notre Dame's sanctorale provides a chronological framework for the festal polyphony being sung there; Mark Everist, meanwhile, makes the case for the monophonic motet, a form widely circulated but generally overlooked. Three studies take us forward to the Quattrocento. Margaret Bent amplifies her previous identification of "prepositus brixiensis" and his links with the manuscript Bologna Q15, while Planchart considers why north-east French dioceses, and Cambrai in particular, proved such fertile recruiting ground for the papal choir; Jane Bernstein considers Ulrich Han's *Missale Romanum* of 1476, the first printed edition with musical notation, as a legacy of Sixtus IV and his fellow Franciscans—a move toward ritual uniformity prefiguring the Council of Trent by several decades.

David Rothenberg perhaps best exemplifies the interdisciplinary aims of this collection in a fine-grained examination of the motet *Porta Preminentie / Porta Penitentie / Portas* as a trope of Mary-as-haven/gate, also instantiated in the three-dimensional shrine Madonna (illustrated with a German exemplar of ca. 1300 in the Metropolitan Museum of Art). Tracing the cantus firmus of *Servant Regem / O Philippe / Rex Regum* to the use of arras, Anne Walters Robertson considers Philippe de Vitry's authorship of this late Capetian court motet. Jennifer Bloxam considers Jacob Obrecht's dedication motet, *Laudemus nunc Dominum*, as a sequel to Du Fay's more famous *Nuper Rosarum Flores*, and as a counterpart to new epideictic preaching styles around 1500: hence the call to praise with which Obrecht's motet begins (one might add that the musical declamation quoted on page 280 evokes the call to prayer, "Oremus"). The remaining three essays are outliers: Lorenzo Candelaria takes us beyond Europe to the Spanish conquest of Mexico, while Andrew Tomasello analyzes popular music videos. Within a wide-ranging overview of documentary sources on instrumental music, Keith Polk shows how fourteenth-century musicians might transform a vocal composition (Machaut's *De toutes fleurs*) into an instrumental piece (the Faenza Codex's *Bel fiore dança*).

Do we need books of this type? The fifteen essays' thematic alignment is a testament to Craig Wright's breadth and vision, and the editors' syncretizing ingenuity. But why should these essays appear together in one volume, rather than in peer-reviewed journals or, indeed, online? The economics of print necessitate invidious choices: illustra-

tions have been well produced here, but is hard-copy monochrome really preferable to online color? And do page margins need to be so generous when some of the music examples are reduced to near illegibility? Book-format publication quickens hopes of coherence and comprehensiveness that aren't fully met when the topographical focus is so selective. Spain is represented only through its colonial endeavors (Candelaria); Germany as a source of printing know-how (Bernstein), and through the provenance of a shrine Madonna (Rothenberg); and England provides a dateable witness for Vitry's *Servant Regem / O Philippe / Rex Regum* (Robertson). Some quite significant cultural spaces extend beyond the title's "beyond."

Magnus Williamson, *Newcastle University*

*Companion to Music in the Age of the Catholic Monarchs.* Tess Knighton, ed. Brill's Companions to Musical Cultures 1. Leiden: Brill, 2017. xvi + 728 pp. \$275.

---

The age of the Catholic monarchs, opening in 1469 with the marriage of Isabella and Ferdinand, heirs, respectively, to the kingdoms of Castile and Aragon, and closing with Ferdinand's death in 1516, was momentous by any measure. Dynastic and territorial union gave birth to a unified Spanish nation; the Inquisition—established in 1478—helped impose the illusion of unity through its systematic persecution of Jews, Muslims, conversos, and heretics; Columbus's voyages led to the opening of previously unimaginable cultural, scientific, and geographical horizons; the conquering of the Moorish kingdom of Granada in 1492 signaled a triumphant symbolic completion of the Christian project of reconquest; and in the same year Jews were officially expelled from Spanish territory.

The study of music during the reign of the Catholic monarchs was first seriously undertaken by the Catalan priest Higiní Anglés (1888–1969), who, in the period 1947–65, published the results of his extensive archival work in a series of volumes that focused on music manuscripts preserving both sacred and secular music associated with the courts of Ferdinand and Isabella. Anglés was followed in 1960 by Robert Murrell Stevenson (1916–2012), whose *Spanish Music in the Age of Columbus*, described by the author as a "résumé of Spanish music to 1530," brought to an anglophone audience a distillation of Anglés's findings together with the results of his own archival work, especially in Seville. While inevitably conditioned by the concerns of the intellectual milieus from which they arose, these studies laid the pioneering contours that have influenced all subsequent studies of the subject.

When Knighton began work on her PhD at Clare College, Cambridge, in the early 1980s, she sought to amplify the documentary base through her own archival work. In the process, she consciously weighted the balance of treatment in Fernando's favor, partly because he outlived Isabella. In addition, Knighton embraced a wider geographic