www.cambridge.org/tro

# **Research Article**

**Cite this article:** Mutuku PM, Kenfack D (2019) Effect of local topographic heterogeneity on tree species assembly in an *Acacia*-dominated African savanna. *Journal of Tropical Ecology* **35**, 46–56. https://doi.org/10.1017/ S0266467419000014

Received: 23 September 2018 Revised: 14 January 2019 Accepted: 15 January 2019

#### **Keywords:**

East Africa; ForestGEO; Kenya; Laikipia; savanna; species-habitat association; species richness; topographic habitat; tree diversity

Author for correspondence: \*David Kenfack, Email: kenfackd@si.edu

# Effect of local topographic heterogeneity on tree species assembly in an *Acacia*-dominated African savanna

# Paul Musili Mutuku<sup>1</sup> and David Kenfack<sup>2,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>East African Herbarium, Botany Department, National Museums of Kenya, P.O. Box 40658 – 00100 GPO, Museum Hill Road, Nairobi, Kenya and <sup>2</sup>ForestGEO, Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute, P.O. Box 37012, Washington, DC 20013-7012, USA

#### Abstract

Stand structure and tree species diversity patterns were examined plot-wide and among four topographically defined habitats (plateau, cliff, low plain and depressions) in a 120-ha permanent plot in an *Acacia*-dominated savanna in Mpala Ranch, central Kenya. The four habitats were defined by clustering the 3000 quadrats of  $20 \times 20$  m in the plot based on their altitude, slope and convexity. Structural and floristic differences among the four habitats were examined and species-habitat associations were tested for the 30 most abundant species using torus translation randomization tests. The plot included 113 337 trees in 62 species with diameter at knee height  $\geq 2$  cm (18.4 species ha<sup>-1</sup>), 41 genera and 23 families. Fabaceae with the genus *Acacia* were the dominant family, followed by Euphorbiaceae and Ebenaceae. Tree density and basal area were twice as high on low plain and depressions than on the plateau. Species richness was highest in the cliff and was seven times higher than in the adjacent plateau. Half of the species assessed showed significant positive associations with one habitat and 21 showed significant negative associations with at least one habitat. The variation in stand structure and tree species diversity within the Mpala plot shows that topography is among the important drivers of local species distribution and hence the maintenance of tree diversity in savannas.

#### Introduction

Savannas are one of the world's most important biomes. They are characterized by plant communities with co-dominance of scattered woody species and a continuous grass stratum (Belsky 1984, Frost & Robertson 1985, Sankaran *et al.* 2004, 2005). Land use, recurring fires, large herbivores and livestock all influence the diversity and structure of plant communities in tropical savannas. Frequent fires reduce the abundance of herbs and small shrubs, mainly by killing or suppressing seedlings and saplings of fire-sensitive plant species (Frost & Robertson 1985, Morrison *et al.* 1995, Trapnell 1959). Browsers, especially elephants, cause serious damage to tree and shrub canopies, reduce the growth rate of twigs, and in general, suppress tree and shrub encroachment (Augustine & McNaughton 2004). Indeed, exclosure experiments in savannas have shown that large herbivores increase bare ground area and reduce woody canopy cover (Asner *et al.* 2009, Young *et al.* 2018). In contrast, grazers including livestock reduce the tree–grass competitive balance, resulting in an increase in trees abundance (Kimuyu *et al.* 2014, Langevelde *et al.* 2003, Roques *et al.* 2001).

The role of biotic factors in shaping species diversity and distributions in savannas is fairly well understood. In contrast the effects of abiotic factors have been poorly studied in this biome. At a subcontinental level, it has been determined that tree height, tree cover, basal area and woody species richness all decrease in savannas with decreasing rainfall and increasing soil clay content (Williams *et al.* 1996). Local variation in topography is widely recognized as one of the most important determinants of vascular plant diversity (Moeslund *et al.* 2013). Topography can temporarily influence the patterns of water loss and accumulation which in turn can shape the patterns of species distribution (Coughenour & Ellis 1993, Wu & Archer 2005). The role of topography in regulating species diversity and distribution has been widely investigated in forest ecosystems (Chuyong *et al.* 2011, Gunatilleke *et al.* 2006, Harms *et al.* 2001, Lai *et al.* 2009), but research is still lacking in savannas.

We established a large (120 ha) long-term monitoring plot to understand the dynamics of tree and shrub populations and explore the physical patterns of biodiversity within a savanna landscape. The plot is located in an *Acacia*-tall grass savanna in central Kenya that undergoes heavy grazing by livestock and large herbivores, a state common to savannas in this region. The plot is topographically diverse, and traverses two main soil types with a transition zone. Thus, it provides an ideal setting for testing the role of physical features of the landscape on savanna tree species distribution and richness. Here, we present the patterns of tree and shrub (hereafter tree)

© Cambridge University Press 2019





Figure 1. Location of the Mpala plot in Mpala Ranch, Central Kenya.

diversity in the plot and investigate species-topographic habitat associations by testing the following hypotheses: (1) Savanna structure and tree species composition vary with topography; and (2) a large proportion of species are significantly associated to the different topographic habitats.

#### Methods

#### Study site

The study was carried out in the Mpala Ranch (Figure 1, hereafter Mpala), 195 km<sup>2</sup> of unfenced conservancy located on a large plateau in the northern part of the central highlands of Kenya, northwest of Mt Kenya, and 43 km north-east of the city Nanyuki in the Laikipia district  $(36^{\circ}10'-37^{\circ}3'\text{E}, 0^{\circ}17'\text{S}-0^{\circ}45'\text{N})$ . Between 1999 and 2016 rainfall at Mpala averaged 646 mm y<sup>-1</sup>, with high precipitation (>1000 mm) in 2012 (Caylor *et al.* 2017, Young *et al.* 1997). Warm days and cool nights predominate, with very low humidity in the driest season (January–April), and moderate humidity at other times. Temperatures range between 12°C and 24°C. Anthropogenic fires in the ranch stopped during the 1960s and only sporadic accidental low-scale fires have been recorded in recent years (Kimuyu *et al.* 2014).

The vegetation of the area is classified as *Acacia*-tall grass savanna dominated by *Acacia* species (Edwards 1940). An estimated 600–800 plant species, 300 species of birds and at least 70 mammal species including impala, zebra, scrub hare, waterbuck, Cape buffalo, eland, Günther's dik-dik, rodents and elephant, as well as predators such as spotted hyena, lion, leopard and wild dog, are found within the Mpala conservancy (Young *et al.* 1997).

#### Plot establishment

The Mpala plot is 120 ha  $(2400 \times 500 \text{ m})$ , with the long axis oriented SW–NE. The geographic coordinates of the south-west corner are 0°17′30.48′′N, 36°52′51.24′′E and the altitude ranges from 1668–1792 m asl. The plot consists of an almost flat plateau in the south-west and descends through steep slopes to a lower area in the north-east, with undulating topography (Figure 2a). The plot traverses the two major soil types of the Laikipia area. The first 50 ha towards the south-west end of the plot (at higher altitude) lie on poorly drained deep clay nutrient-rich vertisols, also known as black-cotton soils, which changes gradually (about 15 ha) to the red rocky friable sandy loams at the lower end of the plot (lower altitude). The plot lacks any permanent stream (Figure 2a). However, there are a few marshy areas in the lower end of the plot, and a small creek with temporary streams.

The establishment of the plot was initiated in 2010, following standard methods (Condit 1998) of the Forest Global Earth Observatory (ForestGEO, https://forestgeo.si.edu/). The plot was surveyed and permanently demarcated in the horizontal plane into 3000 quadrats of 400 m<sup>2</sup> (20 × 20 m) each and the altitude was then measured at each corner post. Because of the short stature and low branching of the majority of the trees and the abundance of shrubs in the plot, the diameter of trees was measured at 0.5 m (instead of 1.3 m) above ground level (diameter at knee height, dkh). In 66 ha, all free-standing trees with dkh ≥1 cm were tagged, mapped, measured and identified to species/morphospecies. In the remaining 54 ha, only trees with dkh ≥2 cm were included in the census. For plot-wide analyses presented in this paper, we use only data with dkh ≥2 cm. Tree species identification was done in the field



Figure 2. Variation of soil and vegetation types in the 120-ha plot in Mpala, Kenya. Aerial photograph showing the location of the plot and the two main soil types (a). Vegetation of the black cotton soil (b). Vegetation of the cliff on transition soils (c). Vegetation of the lowest part of the plot on the red soils (d).



Figure 3. Topographic map of the Mpala 120-ha (2400 × 500 m) plot with 10-m contour interval and overlay of the four topographic habitats defined in the study, based on altitude, slope and convexity.

and in the herbarium. Vouchers from all morphospecies are housed at the East African Herbarium (EA) at National Museums of Kenya, Nairobi and the Smithsonian herbarium (USA). Species' nomenclature follows Beentje *et al.* (1994). In spite of recent proposals to split the genus *Acacia* into *Vachellia* and *Senegalia* (Kyalangalilwa *et al.* 2013), we follow a more conservative, inclusive definition of the genus *Acacia*. All plot data are managed following ForestGEO standards (Condit *et al.* 2014).

### Topography and habitat categorization

Habitats within the Mpala plot were defined by three physical parameters, i.e. altitude, slope and convexity, calculated in a regular  $5 \times 5$ -m grid, and then assigned to  $20 \times 20$ -m quadrats that divided the plot. For each quadrat, the altitude was calculated by averaging the altitude of the four corners. The slope of the quadrat was obtained by dividing the quadrat into four triangular planes, each consisting of three joined corners of the quadrat, and then averaging the angular deviation of the four planes from the horizontal. Convexity was calculated by substracting the mean altitude of the focal quadrat from the mean altitude of the eight surrounding quadrats. For edge quadrats, convexity was obtained by substracting the altitude of their centre point from the mean altitude of their four corners (Yamakura et al. 1995). Negative values of convexity denoted concave quadrats while positive values indicated convex quadrats. After standardization, the three variables were used to group the 3000 quadrats of the plot into four groups (habitats) using the Ward hierarchical clustering (Ward 1963). The four habitats were the plateau which largely overlaps with the black-cotton

soils; the cliff, mostly on transition soils; the low plain; and the depressions that overlap with the red soils (Figure 3). The means, the minima and the maxima of the three topographic variables for each habitat are provided in Table 1.

# Floristic and structural parameter calculations and species habitat test

To characterize the tree community within the plot, the number of species, the Fisher's alpha, the basal area and tree abundances were calculated by averaging the values in 120 subplots of 1 ha  $(100 \times 100 \text{ m})$  each within the plot. To assess the structural and floristic differences among the four topographic habitats, the same parameters were calculated for  $20 \times 20$ -m quadrats.

#### Species-habitat associations

Species–habitat associations were determined for the 30 most abundant species ( $\geq 1$  individual ha<sup>-1</sup>), using the torus-translation test (Harms *et al.* 2001). The test evaluates if significant associations are present between the spatial distribution of a focal species and a given habitat. This is achieved by translating the habitat map in four cardinal directions, moving the entire habitat map one column or row of 20 × 20-m quadrats at a time, resulting in 2999 translations for the plot. The observed relative densities of individuals in each of the habitats is compared with the expected relative densities. With an approximated P-value of ~0.05, a relative density in the true habitat map >97.5% of the values obtained from translated maps denoted a positive association.

Table 1.	Area,	mean and	range of th	e three physical	parameters	characterizing	the four	topographic	habitats	delimited	within t	the Mp	oala p	olo
----------	-------	----------	-------------	------------------	------------	----------------	----------	-------------	----------	-----------	----------	--------	--------	-----

		Altitude (m)		Slope	e (degree)	Convexity		
Habitat	Area (ha)	Mean	Range	Mean	Range	Mean	Range	
Plateau	50.9	1788	1775–1792	0.90	0.04-7.57	0.02	-0.36-0.37	
Cliff	15.5	1740	1679–1780	14.9	2.58-27.0	0.03	-2.37-2.64	
Low plain	36.6	1686	1669–1708	3.54	0.52-7.57	0.05	-0.17-0.57	
Depressions	17.0	1691	1669–1779	4.53	0.38-10.6	-0.31	-1.17-0.00	

**Table 2.** Summary of the floristics of the Mpala 120-ha plot: Number of individuals, basal area ( $m^2$ ), number of tree species, of genera and families, and Fisher's alpha the entire 120 ha and per ha. The means are calculated by averaging the values in 120 subplots of 100  $\times$  100-m each. dkh (diameter at knee height) is the diameter of trees measured at 0.5 m above ground

			Average (h	a <sup>-1</sup> )			120-ha plot					
dkh size class (cm)	Number of individuals	Basal area (m²)	Species	Genera	Families	Fisher's Alpha	Number of individuals	Basal area (m²)	Species	Genera	Families	Fisher's alpha
≥2	944	3.71	18	12	9	3.37	113,337	445	63	42	22	6.56
≥10	66.3	1.29	5	3	3	1.62	7959	155	36	22	17	4.86
≥30	0.54	0.06	2	1	1	1.58	65	6.82	13	6	6	4.89

**Table 3.** Five most important families in terms of abundance, basal area and number of species for trees with dkh  $\geq$  2 cm in the 120-ha Mpala plot. BA = basal area in m<sup>2</sup> ha<sup>-1</sup>

Rank	Family	Trees (ha <sup>-1</sup> )	%Trees	Family	BA	%BA	Family	Species	%species
1	Fabaceae	513	54.3	Fabaceae	2.44	65.8	Fabaceae	12	19.4
2	Ebenaceae	166	17.6	Ebenaceae	0.58	15.7	Malvaceae	8	11.9
3	Euphorbiaceae	140	14.8	Euphorbiaceae	0.21	5.76	Rubiaceae	6	8.96
4	Malvaceae	24.4	2.6	Balanitaceae	0.14	3.74	Capparaceae	5	7.46
5	Rubiaceae	23.2	2.5	Capparaceae	0.10	2.80	Apocynaceae	4	5.97

Significant negative associations were those with the relative density in the true map <97.5% of the values obtained from the translated maps. The analysis was performed in R (https://cran. r-project.org), using the function tt\_test of the package fgeo.habitat (https://github.com/forestgeo/fgeo.habitat).

#### Results

#### Stand structure and floristics

A total of 245 578 stems belonging to 113 337 individuals with dkh  $\geq 2$  cm were inventoried in the plot. These individuals included 63 morphospecies,41 genera and 22 families (Appendix 1, Table 2). Ninety-eight per cent of all individuals (52 morphospecies) were identified to species level, 2% of the individuals (11 morphospecies) were identified because they were leafless during the enumeration and died before we could collect good voucher specimens. The Fabaceae with 12 species in three genera were the richest family in the plot, followed by the Malvaceae and Rubiaceae (Table 3). The genera *Acacia* and *Grewia* were the most species-rich in the plot, with 10 and 6 species respectively (Table 3). For all trees with dkh  $\geq 2$  cm, there were 18 species ha<sup>-1</sup>, but only five species ha<sup>-1</sup> for all trees with dkh  $\geq 10$  cm and two species ha<sup>-1</sup> and two for larger

trees with dkh  $\geq$ 30 cm. For the entire plot, Fisher's alpha was 6.56 for trees with dkh  $\geq$ 2cm and 4.86 for trees with dkh  $\geq$ 10 cm (Table 2).

#### Abundance and basal area

For all individuals with dkh  $\geq 2$  cm, tree density was 944 individuals ha<sup>-1</sup> and only 66 individuals ha<sup>-1</sup> for trees  $\geq 10$  cm. Basal area was  $3.71 \text{ m}^2 \text{ ha}^{-1}$  for all trees  $\geq 2$  cm, and  $1.29 \text{ m}^2 \text{ ha}^{-1}$  for larger trees with dkh  $\geq 10$  cm. The Fabaceae with 513 individuals ha<sup>-1</sup> were the most abundant family, followed by Ebenaceae and Euphorbiaceae. The Fabaceae also had the highest basal area (2.44 m<sup>2</sup> ha<sup>-1</sup>), followed again by the Ebenaceae and Euphorbiaceae (Table 3).

The genus *Acacia* (Fabaceae) was the most abundant, representing 54% of all individuals in the plot. *Euclea* (Ebenaceae) was the second most abundant genus, representing 17% of all individuals. The genera with the highest basal area were *Acacia* and *Euclea* (Table 4). *Acacia drepanolobium* had the highest density, with 212 individuals ha<sup>-1</sup>, accounting for 22% of the total individuals with dkh  $\geq$ 2 cm. *Euclea divinorum* followed with 165 individuals (17% of the total). *Acacia brevispica* and *Croton dichogamus* accounted for 16% each. The remaining species accounted for <10% of the total individuals (Table 5). Thirty-three

**Table 4.** Five most important genera in terms of abundance, basal area and number of species for trees with dkh  $\geq 2$  cm in the 120-ha Mpala plot. BA = basal area in m<sup>2</sup> ha<sup>-1</sup>

Rank	Genus	Trees (ha <sup>-1</sup> )	%Trees	Genus	BA	%BA	Genus	species	%species
1	Acacia	513	54.3	Acacia	2.44	30.6	Acacia	10	14.9
2	Euclea	166	17.6	Euclea	0.58	26.7	Grewia	6	8.96
3	Croton	140	14.8	Croton	0.20	23.3	Acokanthera	3	4.48
4	Grewia	24.4	2.58	Balanites	0.14	3.45	Maerua	3	4.48
5	Carissa	16.4	1.73	Boscia	0.10	3.50	Balanites	2	2.99

Table 5. The 10 most abundant tree species in Mpala plot with their densities in the entire plot and different topographic habitats. Numbers in parentheses indicate the rank in abundance of the species in the plot or the habitat

Species	Family	Plot	Plateau	Cliff	Low plain	Depressions
Acacia drepanolobium	Fabaceae	208 (1)	487 (1)	0.07 (51)	3.12 (18)	1.2 (29)
Euclea divinorum	Ebenaceae	163 (2)	13.6 (3)	352 (2)	182 (3)	399 (1)
Croton dichogamus	Euphorbiaceae	138 (3)	0.75 (11)	552 (1)	110 (5)	232 (3)
Acacia brevispica	Fabaceae	138 (4)	3.44 (6)	252 (3)	200 (1)	301 (2)
Acacia mellifera	Fabaceae	66.9 (5)	13.7 (2)	67.6 (4)	120 (4)	112 (4)
Acacia etbaica	Fabaceae	63.8 (6)	0.14 (23)	7.56 (21)	187 (2)	40.1 (6)
Acacia gerrardii	Fabaceae	23.8 (7)	7.59 (5)	14.2 (14)	40.0 (6)	45.8 (5)
Carissa spinarum	Apocynaceae	15.9 (8)	11.3 (4)	34.8 (6)	4.19 (16)	37.8 (7)
Balanites glaber	Zygophyllaceae	12.9 (9)	0.02 (37)	3.75 (26)	29.6 (7)	23.8 (9)
<i>Grewia</i> sp. 1	Malvaceae	9.97 (10)	0 (45)	16.2 (12)	13.7 (9)	26.0 (8)

**Table 6.** Tree density, basal area, species richness and Fisher's alpha of the topographic habitats in the 120-ha Mpala plot. The habitat-wide values are calculated per ha ( $100 \times 100$  m) and the quadrat values are for  $20 \times 20$ -m quadrats

Habitat	Plateau	Cliff	Low plain	Depressions
Density				
Habitat wide	551	1569	970	1384
Mean per quadrat	21.9	56.5	46.4	46.4
SD per quadrat	14.9	29.3	28.8	31.4
Basal area				
Habitat wide	1.67	3.99	5.47	5.3
Mean per quadrat	0.07	0.16	0.22	0.2
SD per quadrat	0.04	0.10	0.11	0.1
Species richness				
Habitat wide	44	57	50	53
Mean per quadrat	1.89	10.8	6.89	9.1
SD per quadrat	1.83	3.31	2.68	3.1
Fisher's alpha				3.4
Habitat wide	5.24	7.13	5.85	6.6
Mean per quadrat	0.75	4.24	2.91	3.5
SD per quadrat	0.04	1.96	1.56	1.4

species (51% of the total) were rare, with <1 individual ha<sup>-1</sup>. The five most important species in terms of basal area were *Acacia mellifera*, *A. etbaica*, *Euclea dinovirum*, *A. drepanolobium* and *A. gerrardii* (Appendix 1).

#### Stand structure and floristic variation among habitats

The plateau habitat on clay soils had the lowest tree density, the lowest basal area, the lowest species richness and the lowest Fisher's alpha. Tree density, species richness and Fisher's alpha were highest on the cliff. This habitat had the highest tree density especially of small-sized diameter (dkh 2–4 cm), but also the second lowest basal area due to the low proportion of large trees (dkh >15 cm). The bigger trees in the plot are concentrated in the lower end of the plot that also has the highest basal area (Table 6, Figure 2b).

All dominant species had consistently low densities in the plateau habitat, except for *Acacia drepanolobium*, which dominates this habitat with 487 individuals ha<sup>-1</sup> (550 for all trees with dkh  $\geq 2$  cm) and making 94% of all trees with dkh  $\geq 2$  cm. The densities of the other dominant species were inconsistent across the remaining habitats. The density of *Croton dichogamus* in the cliff (552 individuals ha<sup>-1</sup>) was more than five times higher than in the low plain and depression habitats respectively. Despite having different densities, dominant species have nearly similar ranks in the low plain and depressions habitats (Table 5).



**Figure 4.** Species–habitat associations of 30 species of trees with dkh  $\geq$ 2 cm and  $\geq$ 120 individuals in the Mpala plot, based on a two-tailed torus-translation test. Three types of association are indicated: significant positive association (green), neutral association (blue) and significant negative association (orange).

#### Species-habitat association

Of the 30 species subjected to the species-habitat association test, 21 (70%) were either negatively or positively associated to one or two of the four topographic habitats. The remaining nine species were neutral (that is, not significantly associated with any of the habitats) (Figure 4, Appendix 2). Fifteen species were positively associated to one habitat. The distribution maps of selected species positively associated to each habitat are presented in Figure 5. The low plain and the depressions had the highest number of positive associations (five species each) and the plateau had the lowest (two species). No species was positively associated to the plateau while no species was negatively associated to the plateau while no species was negatively associated to the low plain habitat. *Acacia drepanolobium* was the only species negatively associated to more than one habitat.

All the species positively associated to one habitat were also negatively associated to the plateau habitat, except for *Acacia drepanolobium*, *A. mellifera* and *A. gerardii* (Appendix 2). Seventeen species (57%) were negatively associated to one or two habitats, of which 15 were negatively associated to the plateau. *Phyllanthus sepialis*, known to grow in riverine formations (Beentje *et al.* 1994), was negatively associated to the plateau habitat, but surprisingly not associated to the depressions (Appendix 2).

#### Discussion

#### Structure and diversity

We inventoried 63 species of trees with dkh  $\geq 2$  cm within 1.2 km<sup>2</sup> of non-protected savanna in Central Kenya. As expected, the species richness (18 species ha<sup>-1</sup>) was low compared with other tropical biomes with comparable data (Anderson-Teixeira *et al.* 2015). Species richness varied by five to seven orders of magnitude across the topographic gradient, with the south-west end of the plot on clay soils having the lowest number of species. The variation in topography in the plot almost overlaps with the variation in soil types, both of which could explain the change in species composition across the plot. Such a change has already been reported in the savanna biome, though at a smaller scale. Moe *et al.* (2009) showed a turnover in species between termite mounds

and the adjacent Acacia savanna in Uganda. Similarly, Cox & Gakahu (1985) showed differences in grass and tree species composition between Mima mounds and the surrounding savanna on black cotton soil in Central Kenva. However, the impact of both livestock and large herbivores could have contributed to the low tree species diversity of the plot (Georgiadis et al. 2007, Kinnaird & O'Brien 2012). Augustine & McNaughton (2004) showed in the Mpala Ranch that the combined effect of browsers of different sizes, from dik-dik to elephant, results in a significant reduction of leaf density, leaf biomass and growth rate of twigs, tree cover and seedling recruitment, thus reducing tree establishment. Elsewhere, high densities of elephants have been shown to significantly alter the structure and composition of savannas (Cumming et al. 1997). Tree density was three and two times higher on the cliff, low plain and depressions habitats respectively, than on the plateau habitat. The low tree density observed in this area of the plot can be attributed to the soil type, but also to the suppressing effect of large herbivores. Indeed, experimentally excluding elephants and other large mammals (Young et al. 1997) in a similar habitat increased tree density by 42% (Kimuyu et al. 2014).

The Mpala plot is dominated by Fabaceae among which *Acacia drepanolobium* alone represents 22% of all individuals in the plot. The success of this species lies on its singular ability to adapt to harsh edaphic conditions of the black-cotton soil (Pringle *et al.* 2016) and the mutualistic relation with associated ants that significantly reduce herbivory (Goheen & Palmer 2010, Madden & Young 1992, Palmer *et al.* 2010).

#### Species-habitat associations and their maintenance

Several studies have shown the importance of microtopographic habitats as drivers of plant species distribution in large census plots, especially in tropical rain forests (Chuyong *et al.* 2011, Gunatilleke *et al.* 2006, Harms *et al.* 2001, Lai *et al.* 2009, Pei *et al.* 2011, Valencia *et al.* 2004). Our study is the first of its kind in a savanna biome. We show that as in tropical rain forest, microtopographic habitats can play an essential role in shaping the structure of the vegetation and tree species distribution in savannas. Thirty-six per cent of the species were positively associated to one of the topographic habitats. In the Mpala plot, this species-habitat association indirectly supports the idea of soil-nutrient niche partitioning (Andersen *et al.* 2010, Paoli *et al.* 2006, Russo *et al.* 2005), given the variation in soil of the defined topographic habitats.

Two-thirds of the species were negatively associated to the plateau habitat, suggesting that this habitat is stressful for tree species establishment. In fact, the black-cotton soils that prevail in this habitat undergo shrink-swell and cracking cycles, with limited water infiltration and low water potentials during the dry season (Pringle *et al.* 2016). These conditions are physically challenging for seedling establishment and contribute to the maintenance of low species diversity in this habitat. The cliff habitat was dominated by small shrubs, had the highest tree abundance, fewer large trees and therefore the lowest basal area (Table 6). This pattern could be explained by the shallow soils and drier conditions imposed by the high slope that does not allow high water infiltration after rain (Coughenour & Ellis 1993). In the low-altitude habitats, the nutrient-poor sandy loams provide less stressful conditions and have more positively associated species.

Less than half of the species showed positive associations to the defined topographic habitats in the Mpala plot. In contrast, a higher proportion of species (70%) showed significant negative



Figure 5. Distribution maps of selected species positively associated to the four topographic habitats in the 120-ha (2400 × 500 m) Mpala plot. Plateau – Acacia drepanolobium (a), cliff – Croton dichogamus (b), low plain – Acacia etbaica (c), depressions – Grewia lilacina (d).

associations. These results indicate that the low tree species richness in the plot cannot be explained by the lack of topographic niche partitioning in this savanna. Soil texture and nutrients seem to have a stronger effect on species distributions. The sharp difference in plant community composition between the black-cotton and the red soils is also maintained by large-mammal herbivory. Evidence from field experiments showed that in the absence of large herbivores, transplanted seedlings of A. drepanolobium (monodominant on black cotton soil) and A. brevispica (dominant on sandy loams) establish on both soil types (Pringle et al. 2016). However, browsers suppress the growth and survival of A. drepanolobium on sandy soils, while the combination of elephant browsing and stress from the cracking clay vertisols prevents most A. brevispica from attaining maturity on black-cotton soils (Pringle et al. 2016). This means that biotic processes can mediate the habitat-species associations observed within the plot and attributed to purely environmental (abiotic) conditions.

As reported in tropical forests, topographic variation is an important factor that contributes in shaping local tree species diversity, distribution and composition in African savannas. In the specific case of Mpala Ranch, habitat specificity is maintained by the interaction between large-mammal herbivory and the edaphic variation among the topographic habitats.

#### Author ORCIDs. David Kenfack i https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8208-3388

Acknowledgements. Special thanks go to the Mpala plot field leaders Staline Kibet, David Melly, Kimani Ndung'u, Solomon Kipkoech, Augustine Chebos,

Barnabas Bolo and S. Akwam who were instrumental in running the first census and supervising the field crews. The field assistants Gilbert Busienei, Abdi Aziz Hassan, Sammy Ethekon, George Koech, Robert Malakwen, Peter Lorewa, Julius Nairobi, Nicholas Kipsuny, Buas Kimiti, David Sangili and Eripon Samson Eloiloi are also acknowledged for their effort and hard work in the field during the first census and thereafter. Also, we are grateful to the National Museums of Kenya and the Mpala Research Centre, especially to Dino Martin, Margaret Kinnaird, Gikenye Chege, Tuni Bara for the administrative and infrastructural help. Finally, we appreciate Ms Suzanne Lao for help with data management and screening, Drs Stuart Davies, Sean McMahon and Gabriel Arellano for their constructive critique on the early manuscripts of this paper. The location map was drawn by Duncan Kimuyu.

**Financial support.** The 120-ha Mpala plot is a collaborative project of the National Museums of Kenya and the Mpala Research Centre in partnership with the Forest Global Earth Observatory (ForestGEO) of the Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute (STRI). Funding for the first census was provided by ForestGEO.

#### Literature cited

- Andersen KM, Turner BL and Dalling JW (2010) Soil-based habitat partitioning in understorey palms in lower montane tropical forests. *Journal of Biogeography* 37, 278–292.
- Anderson-Teixeira KJ, Davies SJ, Bennett AC, Gonzalez-Akre EB, Muller-Landau HC, Joseph Wright S, et al. (2015) CTFS-ForestGEO: a worldwide network monitoring forests in an era of global change. Global Change Biology 21, 528–549.
- Asner GP, Levick SR, Kennedy-Bowdoin T, Knapp DE, Emerson R, Jacobson J, Colgan MS and Martin RE (2009) Large-scale impacts of herbivores on the

structural diversity of African savannas. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA 106, 4947–4952.

- Augustine DJ and McNaughton SJ (2004) Regulation of shrub dynamics by native browsing ungulates on East African rangeland. *Journal of Applied Ecology* 41, 45–58.
- Beentje H, Adamson J and Bhanderi D (1994) Kenya Trees, Shrubs, and Lianas. Nairobi: National Museums of Kenya, 762 pp.
- Belsky AJ (1984) Role of small browsing mammals in preventing woodland regeneration in the Serengeti National Park, Tanzania. African Journal of Ecology 22, 271–279.
- Caylor KK, Gitonga J and Martins DJ (2017) Mpala Research Centre Meteorological and Hydrological Dataset. Laikipia: Mpala Research Centre.
- Chuyong GB, Kenfack D, Harms KE, Thomas DW, Condit R and Comita LS (2011) Habitat specificity and diversity of tree species in an African wet tropical forest. *Plant Ecology* **212**, 1363–1374.
- **Condit R** (1998) Tropical Forest Census Plots: Methods and Results from Barro Colorado Island, Panama and a Comparison with other Plots. New York, NY: Springer Science & Business Media, 216 pp.
- Condit R, Lao S, Singh A, Esufali S and Dolins S (2014) Data and database standards for permanent forest plots in a global network. *Forest Ecology and Management* 316, 21–31.
- Coughenour MB and Ellis JE (1993) Landscape and climatic control of woody vegetation in a dry tropical ecosystem: Turkana District, Kenya. *Journal of Biogeography* 20, 383–398.
- **Cox GW and Gakahu CG** (1985) Mima mound microtopography and vegetation pattern in Kenyan savannas. *Journal of Tropical Ecology* **1**, 23–36.
- Cumming DH, Fenton MB, Rautenbach IL, Taylor RD, Cumming GS, Cumming MS, Dunlop JM, Ford AG, Hovorka MD and Johnston DS (1997) Elephants, woodlands and biodiversity in southern Africa. South African Journal of Science 93, 231–236.
- Edwards DC (1940) A vegetation map of Kenya with particular reference to grassland types. *Journal of Ecology* 28, 377–385.
- Frost PGH and Robertson F (1985) Fire: the ecological effects of fire in savannas. In Walker TS and Walker BH (eds), Determinants of Tropical Savannas. Oxford: IRL Press, pp. 93–140.
- Georgiadis NJ, Olwero JGN, Ojwang' G and Romañach SS (2007) Savanna herbivore dynamics in a livestock-dominated landscape: I. Dependence on land use, rainfall, density, and time. *Biological Conservation* 137, 461–472.
- Goheen JR and Palmer TM (2010) Defensive plant-ants stabilize megaherbivore-driven landscape change in an african savanna. *Current Biology* 20, 1768–1772.
- Gunatilleke CVS, Gunatilleke IAUN, Esufali S, Harms KE, Ashton PMS, Burslem DFRP and Ashton PS (2006) Species-habitat associations in a Sri Lankan dipterocarp forest. *Journal of Tropical Ecology* 22, 371–384.
- Harms KE, Condit R, Hubbell SP and Foster RB (2001) Habitat associations of trees and shrubs in a 50-ha neotropical forest plot. *Journal of Ecology* 89, 947–959.
- Kimuyu DM, Sensenig RL, Riginos C, Veblen KE and Young TP (2014) Native and domestic browsers and grazers reduce fuels, fire temperatures, and acacia ant mortality in an African savanna. *Ecological Applications* 24, 741–749.
- Kinnaird MF and O'Brien TG (2012) Effects of private-land use, livestock management, and human tolerance on diversity, distribution, and abundance of large African mammals. *Conservation Biology* 26, 1026–1039.
- Kyalangalilwa B, Boatwright JS, Daru BH, Maurin O and Van Der Bank M (2013) Phylogenetic position and revised classification of *Acacia* s.l. (Fabaceae: Mimosoideae) in Africa, including new combinations in *Vachellia* and *Senegalia*. *Botanical Journal of the Linnean Society* 172, 500–523.
- Lai J, Mi X, Ren H and Ma K (2009) Species-habitat associations change in a subtropical forest of China. *Journal of Vegetation Science* 20, 415–423.
- Langevelde FV, Van Der Vijver CADM, Kumar L, Van Der Koppel J, Ridder ND, Andel JV, Skidmore AK, Hearne JW, Stroosnijder L, Bond WJ, Prins HHT and Rietkerk M (2003) Effects of fire and herbivory on the stability of savanna ecosystems. *Ecology* 84, 337–350.

- Madden D and Young TP (1992) Symbiotic ants as an alternative defense against giraffe herbivory in spinescent Acacia drepanolobium. Oecologia 91, 235–238.
- Moe SR, Mobæk R and Narmo AK (2009) Mound building termites contribute to savanna vegetation heterogeneity. *Plant Ecology* **202**, 31.
- Moeslund JE, Arge L, Bøcher PK, Dalgaard T and Svenning J-C (2013) Topography as a driver of local terrestrial vascular plant diversity patterns. *Nordic Journal of Botany* **31**, 129–144.
- Morrison DA, Cary GJ, Pengelly SM, Ross DG, Mullins BJ, Thomas CR and Anderson TS (1995) Effects of fire frequency on plant species composition of sandstone communities in the Sydney region: inter-fire interval and timesince-fire. *Australian Journal of Ecology* **20**, 239–247.
- Palmer TM, Doak DF, Stanton ML, Bronstein JL, Kiers ET, Young TP, Goheen JR and Pringle RM (2010) Synergy of multiple partners, including freeloaders, increases host fitness in a multispecies mutualism. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA 107, 17234–17239.
- Paoli GD, Curran LM and Zak DR (2006) Soil nutrients and beta diversity in the Bornean Dipterocarpaceae: evidence for niche partitioning by tropical rain forest trees. *Journal of Ecology* 94, 157–170.
- Pei N, Lian J-Y, Erickson DL, Swenson NG, Kress WJ, Ye W-H and Ge X-J (2011) Exploring tree-habitat associations in a Chinese subtropical forest plot using a molecular phylogeny generated from DNA barcode loci. *PLoS ONE* 6, e21273.
- Pringle RM, Prior KM, Palmer TM, Young TP and Goheen JR (2016) Large herbivores promote habitat specialization and beta diversity of African savanna trees. *Ecology* 97, 2640–2657.
- Roques KG, O'Connor TG and Watkinson AR (2001) Dynamics of shrub encroachment in an African savanna: relative influences of fire, herbivory, rainfall and density dependence. *Journal of Applied Ecology* 38, 268–280.
- Russo SE, Davies SJ, King DA and Tan S (2005) Soil-related performance variation and distributions of tree species in a Bornean rain forest. *Journal of Ecology* **93**, 879–889.
- Sankaran M, Hanan NP, Scholes RJ, Ratnam J, Augustine DJ, Cade BS, et al. (2005). Determinants of woody cover in African savannas. *Nature* 438, 846–849.
- Sankaran M, Ratnam J and Hanan NP (2004) Tree-grass coexistence in savannas revisited – insights from an examination of assumptions and mechanisms invoked in existing models. *Ecology Letters* 7, 480–490.
- Trapnell CG (1959) Ecological results of woodland and burning experiments in Northern Rhodesia. *Journal of Ecology* 47, 129–168.
- Valencia R, Foster RB, Villa G, Condit R, Svenning J-C, Hernández C, Romoleroux K, Losos E, Magård E and Balslev H (2004) Tree species distributions and local habitat variation in the Amazon: large forest plot in eastern Ecuador. *Journal of Ecology* 92, 214–229.
- Ward JH (1963) Hierarchical grouping to optimize an objective function. *Journal of the American Statistical Association* **58**, 236–244.
- Williams RJ, Duff GA, Bowman DMJS and Cook GD (1996) Variation in the composition and structure of tropical savannas as a function of rainfall and soil texture along a large-scale climatic gradient in the Northern Territory, Australia. *Journal of Biogeography* 23, 747–756.
- Wu XB and Archer SR (2005) Scale-dependent influence of topography-based hydrologic features on patterns of woody plant encroachment in savanna landscapes. *Landscape Ecology* 20, 733–742.
- Yamakura T, Kanzaki M, Itoh A, Ohkubo T, Ogino K, Chai EOK, Lee HS and Ashton PS (1995) Topography of a large-scale research plot established within the Lambir rain forest in Sarawak. *Tropics* 5, 41–56.
- Young TP, Okello BD, Kinyua D and Palmer TM (1997) KLEE: a long-term multi-species herbivore exclusion experiment in Laikipia, Kenya. African Journal of Range and Forage Science 14, 94–102.
- Young TP, Porensky LM, Riginos C, Veblen KE, Odadi WO, Kimuyu DM, Charles GK and Young HS (2018) Relationships between cattle and biodiversity in multiuse landscape revealed by Kenya Long-Term Exclosure Experiment. Rangeland Ecology and Management 71, 281–291.

# Appendix 1

Total number of individuals and total basal area (m<sup>2</sup>) for each of the 63 species of trees with dkh  $\geq$ 2 cm recorded in the Mpala 120-ha plot

Family	Species	Individuals	Basal area
Anacardiaceae	Rhus natalensis Bernh.	342	0.325
Anacardiaceae	Rhus sp. 1	812	0.770
Anacardiaceae	Rhus sp. 2	1	0.000314
Apocynaceae	Acokanthera sp. 1	133	0.840
Apocynaceae	Acokanthera sp. 2	41	0.319
Apocynaceae	Acokanthera sp. 3	48	0.526
Apocynaceae	Carissa spinarum L.	1962	4.95
Asteraceae	Psiadia punctulata (DC.) Vatke	4	0.00265
Balanitaceae	Balanites aegypticus (L.) Delile	243	3.09
Balanitaceae	Balanites glaber Mildbr. & Schltr.	1568	13.5
Boraginaceae	Cordia sinensis Lam.	91	0.315
Burseraceae	Commiphora schimperi (O. Berg) Engl.	3	0.0162
Capparaceae	Boscia angustifolia A. Rich.	1066	12.3
Capparaceae	Cadaba farinosa Forssk.	24	0.0253
Capparaceae	Maerua angolensis DC.	40	0.0337
Capparaceae	Maerua edulis (Gilg & Gilg-Ben.) DeWolf	8	0.00590
Capparaceae	Maerua triphylla A. Rich.	54	0.0692
Celastraceae	Maytenus buchananii (Eckl. & Zeyh.) N. Robson	5	0.00256
Celastraceae	Mystroxylon aethiopicum (Thunb.) Loes.	408	2.41
Celastraceae	Mystroxylon sp.	57	0.370
Combretaceae	Combretum molle R. Br. ex G. Don	23	0.0721
Ebenaceae	Euclea divinorum Hiern	19,899	69.8
Euphorbiaceae	Croton dichogamous Pax	16,780	24.5
Euphorbiaceae	Phyllanthus sepialis Müll. Arg.	625	1.14
Fabaceae	Acacia brevispica Harms	16,774	19.5
Fabaceae	Acacia drepanolobium Harms ex Sjostedt	25,495	68.9
Fabaceae	Acacia etbaica Schweinf.	7779	71.9
Fabaceae	Acacia gerrardii Benth.	2906	29.0
Fabaceae	Acacia mellifera (Vahl) Benth.	8172	101
Fabaceae	Acacia nilotica (L.) Willd. ex Delile	363	2.87
Fabaceae	Acacia seyal Delile	32	0.120
Fabaceae	Acacia sp.	1	0.00138
Fabaceae	Acacia tortilis (Forssk.) Hayne	1	0.0113
Fabaceae	Acacia xanthophloea Benth.	5	0.0547
Fabaceae	Dichrostachys cinerea R. Vig.	34	0.0370
Fabaceae	Ormocarpum trachycarpum (Taub.) Harms	6	0.00251
Lamiaceae	Ocimum sp. 1	3	0.00194
Lamiaceae	Tinnea aethiopica Kotschy ex Hook. f.	169	0.0839
Malvaceae	Grewia bicolor Juss.	3	0.00366
Malvaceae	Grewia kakothamnos K. Schum.	870	1.10
Malvaceae	Grewia lilacina K. Schum.	1,214	1.68
Malvaceae	Grewia sp. 1	591	0.944
Malvaceae	Grewia sp. 2	164	0.293

Family	Species	Individuals	Basal area
Malvaceae	Grewia sp. 3	83	0.0653
Malvaceae	Triumfetta brachyceras K. Schum.	4	0.00261
Meliaceae	Turraea mombassana C. DC.	39	0.0236
Moraceae	Ficus bussei Warb. ex Mildbr. & Burret	1	0.0871
Oleaceae	Olea capensis L.	9	0.101
Rhamnaceae	Rhamnus staddo A. Rich.	199	0.298
Rhamnaceae	Scutia myrtina (Burm. f.) Kurz	710	1.45
Rhamnaceae	Ziziphus mucronata Willd.	17	0.129
Rubiaceae	Canthium pseudosetiflorum Bridson	570	1.18
Rubiaceae	Pavetta gardeniifolia Hochst. ex A. Rich.	463	0.623
Rubiaceae	Psydrax schimperiana (A. Rich.) Bridson	370	0.649
Rubiaceae	Pyrostria phyllanthoides (Baill.) Bridson	1056	4.82
Rubiaceae	Tarenna graveolens (S. Moore) Bremek.	324	0.593
Rutaceae	Clausena anisata (Willd.) Hook. f. ex Benth.	2	0.00122
Rutaceae	Fagaropsis hildebrandtii (Engl.) Milne-Redh.	72	0.0928
Rutaceae	Teclea nobilis Delile	39	0.489
Rutaceae	Zanthoxylum chalybeum Engl.	23	0.431
Sapindaceae	Dodonaea angistifolia L. f.	1	0.000491
Sapindaceae	Pappea capensis Eckl. & Zeyh.	497	1.36
Solanaceae	Lycium europaeum L.	11	0.0140
Unknown	Unidentified	28	0.0295

## Appendix 2

Species-habitat association randomization test result of the 30 most abundant species in the Mpala plot. N = number of individuals, Sig = significance of the test: 1 = positive association, -1 = negative association, 0 = neutral

Species	N.Plateau	Sig. Plateau	N.Cliff	Sig. Cliff	N.Depressions	Sig. Depressions	N.Low flat	Sig. Low plain
Acacia brevispica	175	-1	3905	0	5118	1	7317	0
Acacia drepanolobium	24820	1	1	-1	21	-1	114	0
Acacia etbaica	7	-1	117	0	681	0	6846	1
Acacia gerrardii	386	0	220	0	779	0	1464	1
Acacia mellifera	699	0	1047	0	1901	0	4376	1
Acacia nilotica	62	0	53	0	56	0	189	1
Acokanthera sp. 1	0	-1	39	0	43	0	51	0
Balanites aegypticus	143	1	0	-1	8	0	87	0
Balanites glaber	1	-1	58	0	405	0	1084	1
Boscia angustifolia	35	-1	408	1	247	0	353	0
Canthium pseudosetiforum	25	0	289	0	113	0	131	0
Carissa spinarum	575	0	538	0	643	0	153	0
Croton dichogamous	38	-1	8546	1	3938	0	4017	0
Euclea divinorum	695	-1	5449	0	6786	1	6664	0
Grewia lilacina	0	-1	251	0	442	1	503	0
Grewia sp. 1	5	-1	79	0	252	1	245	0
Grewia sp. 2	5	-1	38	0	65	1	54	0
Grewia kakothamnos	29	-1	118	0	296	0	406	0

Species	N.Plateau	Sig. Plateau	N.Cliff	Sig. Cliff	N.Depressions	Sig. Depressions	N.Low flat	Sig. Low plain
Mystroxylon aethiopicum	21	0	184	0	125	0	68	0
Pappea capensis	32	0	325	0	95	0	31	0
Pavetta gardeniifolia	2	-1	337	0	67	0	54	0
Phyllanthus sepialis	0	-1	1	0	351	0	263	0
Psydrax schimperiana	7	0	265	0	66	0	30	0
Pyrostria phyllanthoides	27	-1	244	0	247	0	517	0
Rhamnus staddo	7	0	79	0	88	0	21	0
Rhus sp. 1	10	0	582	0	147	0	68	0
Rhus natalensis	77	0	190	0	35	0	26	0
Scutia myrtina	68	0	206	0	264	0	154	0
Tarenna graveolens	2	0	170	1	89	0	61	0
Tinnea aethiopica	1	-1	138	0	19	0	8	0