

# ON $T$ -SYSTEMS OF GROUPS

M. J. DUNWOODY

(received 5 June 1962)

## 1. Introduction

Let  $G$  be an  $n$ -generator group and let  $g = (g_1, g_2, \dots, g_n)$  be an ordered set of  $n$  elements which generate  $G$ , then  $g$  is called a *generating  $n$ -vector* of  $G$ . Let  $\Gamma_G^n$  denote the set of all generating  $n$ -vectors of  $G$ .

If  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n$  is a set of generators of the free group  $F_n$  of rank  $n$  and if  $\alpha$  is an automorphism of  $F_n$  such that

$$x_i \alpha = w_i(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n) \quad \text{for } i = 1, 2, \dots, n,$$

then the elements

$$g'_i = w_i(g_1, g_2, \dots, g_n) \quad \text{for } i = 1, 2, \dots, n$$

define a generating  $n$ -vector

$$g' = (g'_1, g'_2, \dots, g'_n).$$

In this way there is assigned to every automorphism  $\alpha$  of  $F_n$  a permutation  $\alpha_G$  of  $\Gamma_G^n$ . If  $\beta$  is an automorphism of  $G$ , then a permutation  $\beta_G$  of  $\Gamma_G^n$  is defined by

$$g\beta_G = (g_1\beta, g_2\beta, \dots, g_n\beta).$$

Let  $P$  be the group generated by all the permutations of  $\Gamma_G^n$  arising in this way from automorphisms of  $F_n$  and automorphisms of  $G$ . The transitivity sets of  $\Gamma_G^n$  under  $P$  are the  *$T$ -systems* of  $G$ . The number of  $T$ -systems of generating  $n$ -vectors of a group  $G$  will be denoted by  $t_n(G)$ . A full discussion of the significance of  $T$ -systems can be found in [1].

An abelian group which can be generated by  $n$  elements has one  $T$ -system of generating  $n$ -vectors. In answer to the question — raised by Gaschütz — of whether finite nilpotent groups also have one  $T$ -system, B. H. Neumann [2] constructed a finite 2-group which is nilpotent of class 10 and soluble of length 3 and has at least two  $T$ -systems of generating 2-vectors. This example led Neumann to ask: "What is the least possible class of a nilpotent group, or the least possible derived length of a soluble group, with more than one  $T$ -system?". In this note the following theorem will be proved which completely answers the above question.

**THEOREM 1.** *To every pair of integers  $n > 1$  and  $N > 0$  and every prime  $p$ , there exists a  $p$ -group which is nilpotent of class 2 and has at least  $N$   $T$ -systems of generating  $n$ -vectors.*

The method devised for proving this theorem does not in general give the exact number of  $T$ -systems of a group. In particular the method does not distinguish between the  $T$ -systems of some groups for which the Higman criterion does (e.g. Neumann's example in [2]).

In § 2 a lower bound for the number of  $T$ -systems of a certain type of group is established by showing that each  $T$ -system of such a group can be mapped into a set of transitivity of a certain abelian group under a subgroup of its right regular representation. In § 3, Theorem 1 is proved by calculating this lower bound for some class 2 groups.

The work for this note was carried out while I was receiving generous financial help from the Australian National University in the form of a Research Scholarship.

I thank Professor B. H. Neumann F. R. S. for suggesting this topic. I am greatly indebted to Dr. M. F. Newman who supervised my researches.

## 2. $T_k$ -systems

The verbal subgroup of a group  $G$  generated by all the commutators and all the  $k$ -th powers ( $k$  a positive integer) of elements of  $G$  will be written  $V_k(G)$  or, where there is little likelihood of confusion, simply  $V_k$  or even  $V$ .

For positive integers  $k$ ,  $n$  a group  $G$  is said to be a  $(k, n)$ -group if

(a)  $G$  can be generated by  $n$  elements  
and

(b)  $G/V_k$  is the direct product of  $n$  cyclic subgroups of order  $k$ .

The integers  $0, 1, \dots, k-1$  with operations addition modulo  $k$  and multiplication modulo  $k$  form a ring which will be denoted  $R_k$ . The set of  $n \times n$  matrices with elements in  $R_k$  also form a ring which will be denoted  $R_k^n$ . The determinant of an element  $A$  of  $R_k^n$  which is an element of  $R_k$  will be denoted  $\det A$ . The elements of  $R_k$  which are coprime to  $k$  form a group  $A_k$  under multiplication modulo  $k$ . The set of  $n \times n$  matrices of  $R_k^n$  with determinants in  $A_k$  also form a group (see, for example, [3], Theorem 37, p. 185) which will be denoted  $A_k^n$ .

In the remainder of this section  $G$  will denote a finite  $(k, n)$ -group,  $h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n$  will denote a fixed basis of  $G/V_k$  and  $\theta$  will denote the mapping of the automorphism group of  $G/V_k$  into  $R_k^n$  defined as follows:

If  $\tau$  is an automorphism of  $G/V_k$  and

$$h_i \tau = h_1^{\tau_{i1}} h_2^{\tau_{i2}} \dots h_n^{\tau_{in}} \quad (i = 1, 2, \dots, n)$$

where  $0 \leq \tau_{ij} < k$  ( $i, j = 1, 2, \dots, n$ ), then

$$\tau\theta = (\tau_{ij}).$$

If  $g = (g_1, g_2, \dots, g_n)$  is a generating  $n$ -vector of  $G$ , then  $gV = (g_1V, g_2V, \dots, g_nV)$  is a generating  $n$ -vector of  $G/V$ . Thus there is a unique automorphism  $\gamma$  of  $G/V$  such that

$$(1) \quad h_i\gamma = g_iV \quad (i = 1, 2, \dots, n);$$

hence a mapping  $D$  of  $\Gamma_G^n$  into  $R_k$  is defined by

$$D(g) = \det(\gamma\theta).$$

LEMMA 1. *The image of  $\Gamma_G^n$  under  $D$  is  $A_k$ .*

PROOF. It is easy to see that if  $\tau, \sigma$  are automorphisms of  $G/V$ , then

$$(2) \quad (\tau\sigma)\theta = (\tau\theta)(\sigma\theta).$$

Since the identity automorphism of  $G/V$  maps onto the identity matrix of  $R_k^n$  under  $\theta$ , it follows that every matrix belonging to the image set of  $\theta$  has an inverse in  $R_k^n$ . Therefore (see [3], Theorem 37, p. 185) the image set of  $\theta$  is contained in  $A_k^n$  and consequently the image set of  $D$  is contained in  $A_k$ . Since ([4], Satz 1) there is, for each  $\lambda$  in  $A_k$ , a generating  $n$ -vector  $g$  of  $G$  such that  $gV = (h_1, h_2, \dots, h_{n-1}, h_n^\lambda)$ , the image set of  $D$  is  $A_k$  itself.

LEMMA 2. *There is a mapping  $D_F$  of the automorphism group  $A(F_n)$  of the free group of rank  $n$  into the right regular representation  $R(A_k)$  of  $A_k$  such that  $D(g)D_F(\alpha) = D(g\alpha_G)$  for all  $g \in \Gamma_G^n$  and all  $\alpha \in A(F_n)$ , where  $\alpha_G$  is the induced permutation of  $\Gamma_G^n$  defined in § 1. The range of  $D_F$  consists of two elements: the identity and the element which maps every element to its negative.*

PROOF. Let  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n$  be a set of generators of  $F_n$  and let  $\alpha$  be an arbitrary automorphism of  $F_n$  such that

$$x_i\alpha = w_i(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n) \quad \text{for } i = 1, 2, \dots, n,$$

then there is a unique automorphism  $\alpha^V$  of  $G/V$  such that

$$h_i\alpha^V = w_i(h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \quad \text{for } i = 1, 2, \dots, n.$$

Moreover

$$h_i\alpha^V\gamma = w_i(g_1V, g_2V, \dots, g_nV) \quad \text{for } i = 1, 2, \dots, n$$

where  $\gamma$  is the automorphism of  $G/V$  as defined in (1). Now,

$$g\alpha_G V = (g'_1V, g'_2V, \dots, g'_nV)$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} g'_iV &= w_i(g_1, g_2, \dots, g_n)V \quad \text{for } i = 1, 2, \dots, n \\ &= w_i(g_1V, g_2V, \dots, g_nV). \end{aligned}$$

Therefore

$$g\alpha_G V = (h_1\alpha^V\gamma, h_2\alpha^V\gamma, \dots, h_n\alpha^V\gamma)$$

and

$$D(g\alpha_G) = \det(\alpha^V\gamma)\theta.$$

So, by (2),

$$D(g\alpha_G) = D(g)\det(\alpha^V\theta).$$

Let  $D_F(\alpha)$  be the element of  $R(A_k)$  corresponding to  $\det(\alpha^V\theta)$ ; the first part of the lemma follows.

It is easy to see that  $D_F$  is a homomorphism. In order to prove the second part of the lemma it is only necessary, therefore, to consider a set of generators of  $A(F_n)$ . The four automorphisms  $\mu, \nu, \pi, \rho$  defined by:

$$\begin{aligned} x_1\mu &= x_2, & x_2\mu &= x_1, & x_i\mu &= x_i & (i = 3, \dots, n); \\ x_1\nu &= x_1, & x_n\nu &= x_2, & x_{i-1}\nu &= x_i & (i = 3, \dots, n); \\ x_1\pi &= x_1, & x_2\pi &= x_2^{-1}, & x_i\pi &= x_i & (i = 3, \dots, n); \\ x_1\rho &= x_1, & x_2\rho &= x_1x_2, & x_i\rho &= x_i & (i = 3, \dots, n), \end{aligned}$$

form a generating set of  $A(F_n)$  (see [1], § 6).

Hence

$$\begin{aligned} \mu^V\theta &= \left( \begin{array}{cc|c} 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & \\ \hline & & I_{n-2} \end{array} \right); \\ \nu^V\theta &= \left( \begin{array}{cc|c} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & & I_{n-2} \\ \hline 0 & 1 & 0 \end{array} \right); \\ \pi^V\theta &= \left( \begin{array}{cc|c} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & -1 & \\ \hline & & I_{n-2} \end{array} \right); \\ \rho^V\theta &= \left( \begin{array}{cc|c} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & \\ \hline & & I_{n-2} \end{array} \right). \end{aligned}$$

(Here  $-1$  represents the negative of 1 in the ring  $R_k$ , and  $I_{n-2}$  the identity matrix of  $R_k^{n-2}$ ).

Hence

$$\begin{aligned} \det(\mu^V \theta) &= -1; \\ \det(\nu^V \theta) &= 1 \quad \text{if } n \text{ is even,} \\ &= -1 \text{ if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ \det(\pi^V \theta) &= -1; \\ \det(\rho^V \theta) &= 1. \end{aligned}$$

The result follows immediately.

LEMMA 3. *There is a mapping  $D_G$  of the automorphism group  $A(G)$  of  $G$  into  $R(A_k)$  such that*

$$D(g)D_G(\beta) = D(g\beta_G)$$

for all  $g \in \Gamma_G^n$  and all  $\beta \in A(G)$ , where  $\beta_G$  is the induced permutation of  $\Gamma_G^n$  defined in § 1.

PROOF. Since  $V$  is a characteristic subgroup of  $G$  an automorphism  $\beta$  of  $G$  induces an automorphism  $\beta^V$  of  $G/V$  given by

$$gV\beta^V = g\beta V$$

for all  $g \in G$ . Now,

$$\begin{aligned} g\beta_G V &= (g_1\beta V, g_2\beta V, \dots, g_n\beta V) \\ &= (g_1V\beta^V, g_2V\beta^V, \dots, g_nV\beta^V) \\ &= (h_1\gamma\beta^V, h_2\gamma\beta^V, \dots, h_n\gamma\beta^V) \end{aligned}$$

where  $\gamma$  is the automorphism of  $G/V$  as defined in (1). So

$$\begin{aligned} D(g\beta_G) &= \det((\gamma\beta^V)\theta) \\ &= D(g)\det(\beta^V\theta). \end{aligned}$$

Let  $D_G(\beta)$  be the element of  $R(A_k)$  corresponding to  $\det(\beta^V\theta)$ ; the lemma follows.

Let  $P_k$  denote the subgroup of  $R(A_k)$  generated by all the  $D_F(\alpha)$  and  $D_G(\beta)$  arising in the above manner from automorphisms of  $F_n$  and  $G$  respectively. The transitivity sets of  $A_k$  under  $P_k$  will be called the  $T_k$ -systems of  $G$ , and  $t_{n,k}(G)$  will denote the number of  $T_k$ -systems of  $G$ .

Clearly  $T$ -systems map into  $T_k$ -systems under  $D$  and so a lower bound is obtained for the number  $t_n(G)$  of  $T$ -systems of generating  $n$ -vectors of  $G$ .

THEOREM 2. *If  $G$  is a finite  $(k, n)$ -group, then*

$$t_n(G) \geq t_{n,k}(G).$$

Inequality can hold here, as has been indicated in the introduction.

### 3. Examples

In this section  $p$  denotes a prime and  $n, r$  are integers such that  $n > 1, r > 0$ ; let  $q = p^r$ .

Let  $A_{a,n}$  be the abelian group generated by  $a_2, \dots, a_n$  with the relations  $a_i^{q^{2(i-1)}} = a_n^{q^{3n-2-i}}$  ( $i = 2, \dots, n - 1$ ) and  $a_n^{q^{3n-2}} = e$ ; i.e.

$$A_{a,n} = \text{gp}\{a_2, \dots, a_n \mid [a_i, a_j] = e (i, j = 2, \dots, n), \\ a_i^{q^{2(i-1)}} = a_n^{q^{3n-2-i}} (i = 2, \dots, n - 1), a_n^{q^{3n-2}} = e\}.$$

(Here and below  $e$  denotes the identity element, and  $[x, y]$  denotes the commutator  $x^{-1}y^{-1}xy$ ). Since

$$(a_i^{1+q^{2(i-1)}})^{q^{2(i-1)}} = a_i^{q^{2(i-1)}} \quad (i = 2, \dots, n - 1)$$

and

$$(a_n^{1+q^{2(n-1)}})^{q^{3n-2-i}} = a_n^{q^{3n-2-i}} \quad (i = 2, \dots, n - 1),$$

there is a unique automorphism  $\psi$  of  $A_{a,n}$  such that

$$a_i\psi = a_i^{1+q^{2(i-1)}} \quad (i = 2, \dots, n).$$

The order of  $\psi$  is  $q^n$ . Let  $B_{a,n}$  be the splitting extension of  $A_{a,n}$  by a cyclic group of order  $q^{3n-1}$  generated by an element  $b$  which induces  $\psi$  in  $A_{a,n}$ ; i.e.

$$B_{a,n} = \text{gp}\{a_2, \dots, a_n, b \mid \text{relations of } A_{a,n}, \\ b^{-1}a_i b = a_i^{1+q^{2(i-1)}} (i = 2, \dots, n), b^{q^{3n-1}} = e\}.$$

The elements  $b^{q^n}$  and  $a_n^{q^{3(n-1)}}$  are in the centre of  $B_{a,n}$ , so that  $a_n^{q^{3(n-1)}} b^{-q^{3n-2}}$  is self-conjugate in  $B_{a,n}$ . Let  $G_{a,n}$  be the group  $B_{a,n}/\{a_n^{q^{3(n-1)}} b^{-q^{3n-2}}\}$ .

Thus

$$G_{a,n} = \text{gp}\{a_2, \dots, a_n, b \mid \text{relations of } A_{a,n}; \\ b^{-1}a_i b = a_i^{1+q^{2(i-1)}} (i = 2, \dots, n), b^{q^{3n-2}} = a_n^{q^{3(n-1)}}\}.$$

Clearly  $G_{a,n}$  is nilpotent of class 2, so every element can be written uniquely in the form

$$a_2^{\xi_2} \dots a_n^{\xi_n} b^\eta [a_n, b]^\zeta \\ 0 \leq \xi_i < q^{2(i-1)}, \quad 0 \leq \eta < q^{3n-2}, \\ 0 \leq \zeta < q^n \quad (i = 2, \dots, n).$$

Let  $\beta$  be an automorphism of  $G_{a,n}$  and let

$$a_i\beta = a_2^{\alpha_i} \dots a_n^{\alpha_n} b^{\delta_i} [a_n, b]^{\varepsilon_i}, \\ b\beta = a_2^\alpha \dots a_n^\alpha b^\delta [a_n, b]^\varepsilon \\ 0 \leq \alpha_{ij} < q^{2(i-1)}, 0 \leq \delta_i < q^{3n-2}, 0 \leq \varepsilon_i < q^n \quad (i, j = 2, \dots, n), \\ 0 \leq \alpha_i < q^{2(i-1)}, 0 \leq \delta < q^{3n-2}, 0 \leq \varepsilon < q^n \quad (i = 2, \dots, n).$$

Since  $(a_i\beta)^{q^{2(i-1)}}$  belongs to the derived group, it follows that  $q^{2(j-i)}$  divides  $\alpha_{ij}$ , if  $j > i$ , and  $q^{2n-2i}$  divides  $\delta_i$  for every  $i$ . Now  $G_{q,n}$  is a  $(q, n)$ -group and, if  $a_2V_q, \dots, a_nV_q, bV_q$  is chosen as the basis for reference of  $G_{q,n}/V_q$ , then

$$\det(\beta^V\theta) \equiv \delta \prod_{i=2}^n \alpha_{ii} \pmod{q}.$$

The  $a_i\beta$ 's and  $b\beta$  must satisfy the same relations as the  $a_i$ 's and  $b$ . In particular

$$(3) \quad [a_i\beta, b\beta] = (a_n\beta)^{q^{2n-2-i}} \quad \text{for } i = 2, \dots, n$$

and

$$(4) \quad (b\beta)^{q^{2n-2}} = (a_n\beta)^{q^{2(n-1)}}.$$

Now,

$$\begin{aligned} [a_i\beta, b\beta] &= \prod_{j=2}^n [a_j, b]^{\alpha_{ij}\delta - \delta_i\alpha_j} \\ &= [a_n, b]^{\sum_{j=2}^n (\alpha_{ij}\delta - \delta_i\alpha_j)q^{(n-j)}} \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\sum_{j=2}^n (\alpha_{ij}\delta - \delta_i\alpha_j)q^{(n-j)} \equiv \alpha_{ii}\delta q^{(n-i)} \pmod{q^{(n-i+1)}}.$$

Also

$$(a_n\beta)^{q^{2n-2-i}} = a_n^{\alpha_{nn}q^{2n-2-i}} a$$

where  $a \in \{a_n^{q^{2n-1-i}}\}$ . It follows from (3) that

$$\alpha_{ii}\delta \equiv \alpha_{nn} \pmod{q} \quad \text{for } i = 2, \dots, n.$$

Similarly

$$\delta \equiv \alpha_{nn} \pmod{q}$$

follows from (4). Hence

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_{ii} &\equiv \delta \pmod{q} \quad \text{for } i = 2, \dots, n \\ &\equiv 1 \pmod{q}. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore

$$\det(\beta^V\theta) = 1.$$

Thus, for  $G_{q,n}$ , the group  $P_q$  consists of just two elements, namely the identity and the element which maps every element to its negative. But  $A_q$  has order  $(p-1)p^{r-1}$ , so

$$t_{n,q}(G_{q,n}) = \max(1, \frac{1}{2}(p-1)p^{r-1}).$$

Theorem 1 then follows from Theorem 2.

### References

- [1] Bernhard H. Neumann und Hanna Neumann, Zwei Klassen charakteristischer Untergruppen und ihre Faktorguppen. *Math. Nachr.* **4** (1951) 106—125.
- [2] B. H. Neumann, On a Question of Gaschütz. *Archiv der Mathematik* **7** (1956) 87—90.
- [3] Claude Chevalley, *Fundamental Concepts of Algebra*. Academic Press Inc., New York (1956).
- [4] Wolfgang Gaschütz, Zu einem von B. H. und H. Neumann gestellten Problem, *Math. Nachr.* **14** (1955—56) 249—252.

Australian National University,  
Canberra.