

latter claim. While Rothschild is not a pan-Marcionite in the way that Markus Vinzent is, some of her assertions in this area seemed to be predicated upon fragile evidence and to depend upon a multiplication of hypotheses (to accept her view on the anti-Marcionite tendencies of 1 Clement 25 and the interpretation of the Phoenix, you needed perhaps to have accepted what she had already argued about 1 Clement 53). I also wondered whether both in relation to the apparently anti-Marcionite background of 1 Clement and to Rothschild's claims about the role of 1 Corinthians in the same epistle, more could have been made of that text's interest in the Christian Old Testament. The matter is important in different ways for both subjects (see especially 1 Clement 45.2, which could have been exploited by Rothschild to bolster her anti-Marcionite case). The claim that 1 Clement is a Pseudepigraphon could be said to raise as many problems as it apparently solves, not least relating to the kind of specificity given to the letter by its unknown author(s), a specificity which raises just the kind of questions about the significance of Rome as a centre of 'proto-orthodoxy', which, in Rothschild's view, is raised by the assumption of 'Roman' authority if the letter is not considered pseudonymous.

Other observations could be made (for instance, does Rothschild's reading of Barnabas's allegorical hermeneutic as tempering a straightforwardly supersessionist account risk making him more of a theoretical hermeneut rather than a man concerned with the actuality of Jewish-Christian interaction? The two things may not be mutually exclusive but the issue of balance is raised). But it would be wrong to end with criticisms. This is a rich collection of essays, from which those interested in the Apostolic Fathers will learn a great deal, whether in agreement or disagreement.

PETERHOUSE,
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

Christianity at the crossroads. How the second century shaped the future of the Church. By Michael J. Kruger. Pp. xii + 256. London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 2017. £19.99 (paper). 978 0 281 07131 9

Christianity in the second century. Themes and developments. Edited by James Carleton Paget and Judith Lieu. Pp. xii + 354 incl. 4 ills and 2 tables. Cambridge–New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017. £74.99. 978 1 107 16522 9
JEH (70) 2019; doi:10.1017/S0022046918002312

The volumes under review are two of the most recent contributions to the study of the second century, a period that is widely recognised as vital for the study of Christian origins and for understanding the history of early Christianity. The approach of Kruger's book, as set forth in his introduction which bears the subtitle 'What is so important about the second century?', is to provide a topical introduction, employing both primary and secondary sources, to what he calls 'the transitional century for the early Christian faith' (p. 1). Seven chapters are devoted to the transitions that Kruger describes as sociological, ecclesiological, doctrinal-theological and textual-canonical.

The first two chapters, 'A peculiar identity: the sociological make-up of second-century Christianity' and 'A strange superstition: the political and intellectual

acceptability of second-century Christianity', consider the social identity of those individuals who constituted the early Christian movement as well as Christianity's relationship with Judaism and Roman political authorities. Chapter iii, 'Worshipping Jesus: the ecclesiological structure of second-century Christianity', considers the development of church polity towards moniscopacy and the elements of Christian worship. Chapters iv and v, 'Alternative pathways: diversity in second-century Christianity' and 'The Great Church: unity in second-century Christianity', focus predominantly on issues raised in W. Bauer's massively influential study *Orthodoxy and heresy in earliest Christianity* (1934; London 1971). Kruger agrees that there is diversity in the second century but that it was not 'merely a cacophony of variegated and divergent traditions' (p. 166). Chapter vi bears the title 'A textual culture: the literature of second-century Christianity' and considers orality and literacy along with various early Christian writings. The final chapter before Kruger's conclusion is 'A new Scripture: the New Testament canon in second-century Christianity'. Here Kruger argues that there are roots of the New Testament canon early in the second century and that the canon did not come about as 'the result of debates over orthodoxy and heresy, but [is] the very thing that allowed the Church to survive in the midst of those debates' (p. 226).

Kruger informs the reader of his interest in the significance of the second century for the modern Church (cf. pp. viii, 230–1) and he occasionally assumes traditional viewpoints. For example, with reference to 1 Timothy iv.13, Kruger simply states that 'Paul exhorts Timothy' (p. 100) and in another instance 2 Peter iii.16 and 1 Tim. v.18 are cited as evidence for the contention that 'already in the first century, there are hints of an emerging canonical consciousness' (pp. 202–3). In the course of his study, Kruger argues for his position that despite there being diversity in the second century, there is a centre to be found in the *regula fidei* that is 'not just one of many traditions, but the set of beliefs and practices that emerged as the dominant form of the faith for the next 2,000 years' (p. 166). This reviewer had the sense that alongside a predominantly judicious presentation of second-century figures and texts, this view of there being 'an impressive unity that must be appreciated and understood' (p. 136) is present throughout the book, both undergirding and shaping the discussion. In sum, however, Kruger has provided a very helpful overview of numerous important second-century issues, texts and individuals and his work serves as a valuable introduction to the types of questions confronted in scholarship on this era.

The second volume, edited by James Carleton Paget and Judith Lieu, had its genesis in a 2013 conference held at the University of Cambridge entitled 'The Christian Second Century'. The majority of the contributors are affiliated with universities in the UK (Philip Alexander, Lewis Ayres, James Carleton Paget, Mark Edwards, Rebecca Flemming, William Horbury, Judith Lieu, Teresa Morgan, John North, Tessa Rajak, Tim Whitmarsh, Greg Woolf), though scholars based in continental Europe (Winrich Löhr, Oskar Skarsuane, Joseph Verheyden) and the USA (Erich S. Gruen, Karen King, Laura Salah Nasrallah) are also among the contributors. It is notable that not only professors of New Testament or Christian history are among the authors, but also classicists and scholars of ancient Judaism. It is not surprising that this diversity results in the lack of a unifying ideology in the work; however, this reality does not ultimately lead to a

discordance that would undermine the volume's value. In fact, in some ways it could be said that the diversity of this collection of essays reflects the diversity of its object of study. The editors' introduction provides a summary of the themes and contents of the chapters and highlights how the purpose of the subjects treated 'reflect key aspects of the changing world of second-century studies' (p. 3). This changing world is one in which 'the aim of second-century history becomes a more comprehensive, nuanced, inclusive account, where the old certitudes of a once apparently familiar map, delineating a story of continuities, disappear and new accounts become necessary' (pp. 2–3).

The eighteen chapters are organised under four headings: 'Contexts' (four chapters), 'Discerning Continuity and Discontinuity in Early Christianity' (five chapters); 'Interpreting Texts and Engaging in Practice' (four chapters); and 'Modelling Identities' (five chapters). It is unfortunate that the limitations of space for this review do not allow for a discussion, or even the mentioning, of all eighteen chapters, each of which is worth close study and careful reading. From stimulating discussions of what role, if any, ideas of Christian continuity play and the manner in which diversity is to be viewed and understood (King, Edwards, Ayres) to the second century as a 'laboratory' (Lieu) for Christian theology as *philosophia* (Löhr), to considerations of Plutarch (Morgan) and oracles (Nasrallah) as evidence that it is too facile and an oversimplification to distinguish Christianity from pagan and Jewish religion categorically by identifying the first as a religion of doctrine or belief and the latter two as ones of cult or praxis, to issues of authoritative texts (Flemming, Verheyden), to questions of ethnicity (Gruen, Skarsaune), to pagan and Roman views of early Christianity (North, Whitmarsh), this volume is an outstanding and thoroughly engaging contribution to the scholarly voices engaged in dialogue about the second century.

JOHANNES GUTENBERG-UNIVERSITÄT,
MAINZ

DIETER T. ROTH

Sancti Cypriani episcopi. De habitu virginum. Opera pseudo-Cyprianea. De laude martyrii, Ad Vigilium episcopum de Iudaica incredulitate, De rebaptismate. Edited by Laetitia Ciccolini and Paul Mattei. (Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina III F, Sancti Cypriani Episcopi Opera Pars IV, Opera Pseudo-Cyprianea I.) Pp. 626 incl. 26 graphs and 0 tables. Turnhout: Brepols, 2016. €335. 978 2 503 55790 8
JEH (70) 2019; doi:10.1017/S002204691800146X

This book, beautifully produced by Brepols, well illustrates the very high standards that are regularly achieved in the editing of the Church Fathers, especially in the Francophone countries. All the certainly genuine works of Cyprian have now taken their place in the *Corpus Christianorum*, and these new editions of the spurious *De laude martyrii*, *De Iudaica incredulitate ad Vigilium* and *De rebaptismate* replace editions in Hartel's third *CSEL* volume. The two editors state that they take joint responsibility for the volume, but pp. 1–505 seem to be almost entirely the work of Laetitia Ciccolini, who has edited the first three of the texts listed above, and pp. 507–96 of Paul Mattei.

Ciccolini's monumental discussion of the manuscripts is in a different league of excellence from that of earlier scholars. For example, she shows better than her