

ARCHAEOLOGICAL FUTURES

A stable relationship: isotopes and bioarchaeology are in it for the long haul

Kate Britton*

Elemental beginnings

Given their ubiquity in dietary reconstruction, it is fitting that the story of isotopes began with a conversation over dinner. Although coined in scientific literature by Frederick Soddy (1913), the word ‘isotope’ was first conceived by Margaret Todd, a medical doctor (also known as the novelist ‘Graham Travers’, and an all-round gender-stereotype-smasher of their age). In 1912, Soddy and Todd were attending a supper in Glasgow. When talk turned to work, Soddy described the then nameless concept of elements of different masses that occupy the same place in the periodic table. Todd suggested the term ‘isotope’, from the Greek *isos* (‘same’) + *topos* (‘place’), and the name stuck (Nicol 1957; Nagel 1982).

Two decades after Soddy’s death, the first stable isotope studies in archaeology were published. Emerging from advances in radiocarbon dating, plant sciences and ecosystem research (e.g. DeNiro & Epstein 1978a; Vogel 1978), initial applications focused on the uptake of maize agriculture in North America, with prehistoric human bones serving as ‘markers’ for maize consumption (Vogel & van der Merwe 1977; van der Merwe & Vogel 1978). These seminal studies demonstrated the ground-breaking potential of this new technique in estimating past dietary patterns.

The use of nitrogen isotopes in exploring trophic level relationships in terrestrial and marine ecosystems followed soon after (DeNiro & Epstein 1981; Minagawa & Wada 1984; Schoeninger & DeNiro 1984), and archaeological investigations of marine resource exploitation using carbon and nitrogen isotope data were published (e.g. Schoeninger *et al.* 1983). Research on oxygen isotope ratios of meteoric water (Craig 1961; Dansgaard 1964) allowed relationships between drinking water, body water and mammalian mineralised tissues to be investigated as a means of reconstructing climate (Longinelli 1984; Luz *et al.* 1984). In 1985, the first study relating skeletal strontium isotope ratios to geologically sourced strontium to establish lifetime mobility in archaeological individuals was published (Ericson 1985).

* Department of Archaeology, University of Aberdeen, Meston Building, Aberdeen AB24 3UE, UK; Department of Human Evolution, Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology, Deutscher Platz 6, 04103 Leipzig, Germany (Email: k.britton@abdn.ac.uk)

Fractionating into a field

Research into the relationship between isotopic inputs and bodily isotope values has been central to the development of isotope bioarchaeology. This has involved probing the complexities of environmental, physiological and metabolic variation in modern plants and animals (e.g. Ambrose 1991; Kohn 1996; Burton *et al.* 1999; Heaton 1999). Controlled feeding experiments provided vital perspectives on the systematics, caveats and capabilities of isotopic approaches (e.g. DeNiro & Epstein 1978b; Tieszen *et al.* 1983; Ambrose & Norr 1993; Ambrose 2000; Howland *et al.* 2003; Sponheimer *et al.* 2003). Of equal importance were studies of the ways isotope ratios can be altered after burial (e.g. DeNiro 1985; Nelson *et al.* 1986; Tuross *et al.* 1988; Hedges *et al.* 1995; Collins *et al.* 2002).

Quality criteria for bone collagen have increased confidence in the data produced (Ambrose 1990; van Klinken 1999; Nehlich & Richards 2009). While similar easily applicable criteria are not available for the assessment of biomineral isotope data, there are emerging consensus: e.g. that tooth enamel best preserves *in vivo* signatures, and that preparation protocols can alter isotope measurements substantially, particularly in bone (e.g. Koch *et al.* 1997; Hoppe *et al.* 2003; Grimes & Pellegrini 2013).

By highlighting the caveats and limitations of isotope approaches in bioarchaeology, these studies have together led to greater certainty that isotope measurements determined from archaeological remains are representative of *in vivo* values and have widened their applications. With the parallel developments in mass spectrometry (and its increased cost-effectiveness and availability), the 1990s and 2000s saw a huge increase in the output of isotopic data for archaeological case studies (Makarewicz & Sealy 2015: 147).

With the non-specialist in mind, this commentary aims to provide a discursive overview of the history of isotope bioarchaeology, explore some highlights and challenges, and speculate a little on the position of isotope analysis in bioarchaeology now and into the future. Given the burgeoning size of the field, and in light of the author's own experiences, case studies explored here are largely focused on (relatively) recent time periods, and on Western Europe, although themes are hopefully universal. With a view to brevity, the reader, and the confines of word count, a limited number of references are given in the main text, and a more extensive (but not exhaustive) list of recommended further reading is provided as online supplementary material for some of the topics explored here. In the companion bibliography I also refer the reader to excellent specialist reviews for detailed information on the background, theory and methods, current status and future directions of isotope bioarchaeology.

Major contributions

Stable isotope approaches have made central contributions to several archaeological debates, and have opened new lines of enquiry. For example, isotope evidence for the diets and movements of our earliest ancestors has had profound implications for our understanding of human ecology and evolution (Lee-Thorp *et al.* 2010; Copeland *et al.* 2011; Schoeninger 2014).

Isotope analysis has also proved to be a valuable tool for investigating major archaeological transitions, such as the shift from Mesolithic hunter-gatherer-fisher communities to Neolithic farmers. Initial bone collagen studies suggested the abandonment of marine foods at the onset of the British Neolithic (Richards *et al.* 2003). This sparked debate, as researchers sought to reconcile isotope data with other evidence (Milner *et al.* 2004; Richards & Schulting 2006). Dental micro-sampling approaches have somewhat resolved this, confirming not only the dietary *predominance* of terrestrial foods, but also the intermittent, regional consumption of marine resources (Montgomery *et al.* 2013). Beyond the issue of fish, the first studies were significant in contributing to a rethinking of the *mode* of change during the Mesolithic to Neolithic transition in Britain, prompting new analyses that now overwhelmingly support an 'abruptist' model (Rowley-Conwy 2011). Isotope approaches have, however, demonstrated that the dynamics of 'Neolithisation' were non-homogeneous world-wide. Strontium and oxygen isotopes, for example, indicate a more prolonged transition in Thailand, with changes in residency patterns as matrilocality gained predominance alongside agriculture (Bentley *et al.* 2005). In contrast, analyses in Central Europe have concluded that patrilocality very likely prevailed (Haak *et al.* 2008; Bentley 2013).

These studies illustrate perhaps the most valuable contribution that isotope bioarchaeology makes to archaeology: the illumination of past intra-society variation. By providing evidence for individual life-histories, isotope studies reveal differences between individuals and within societies, such as dietary variation by age group (Pearson *et al.* 2015) or faith (Alexander *et al.* 2015). Multi-isotope approaches are particularly effective for characterising inter-personal variations linked to socio-cultural identities (Knudson & Stojanowski 2008); for example, the combination of isotope analyses used to identify fish consumption among the high-status immigrant Bishops of Whithorn (Müldner *et al.* 2009).

Expanding the spectrum

Isotope bioarchaeology is not confined to human mobility and diet; other aspects of nutrition, malnutrition and similar physiological conditions have been investigated. Isotope datasets evidencing the age at onset and subsequent completion of weaning (evidenced by a drop in trophic level; Fogel *et al.* 1989) have been published from British sites across multiple periods, from the Iron Age to the eighteenth/nineteenth centuries AD (e.g. Jay *et al.* 2008; Nitsch *et al.* 2011). Despite being from geographically and socially disparate populations, the volume of isotope data allows broad trends to emerge. Within a diachronic framework, the implications of the post-medieval reduction in breastfeeding duration in Britain highlight the potential relationship between breastfeeding, population increase and urbanism (Haydock *et al.* 2013).

Isotope studies of infant feeding practices are significant in that they illuminate an aspect of the past that is otherwise 'invisible', and create a narrative built around the experiences of women and children. These studies also mark an emerging area of bioarchaeology to which isotopes will contribute heavily in the future; namely, the interaction between socio-cultural change and diet, mobility and other life-history events. Culture-mediated biological

and ecological change in humans has become highly topical in bioarchaeology in recent years. For example, research on the evolution of the human microbiome (Warinner *et al.* 2015) can be viewed as a response to the shift in archaeological theoretical frameworks to include those from evolutionary ecology, such as gene-culture co-evolution and niche construction theory (Laland & O'Brien 2010; Laland *et al.* 2010; Makarewicz 2016: 200). Urbanism and industrialisation are likely to be focal points of future bioarchaeological research within these new frameworks. The near unique potential of isotope analyses to access the cultural, biological and environmental (White & Longstaffe 2016), and to broaden our understanding of past activities and culturally mediated ecological changes, places these approaches at the centre of future bioarchaeological research.

If isotope bioarchaeology is to rise to these and other challenges, new or refined analytical approaches must be a priority. While bulk bone collagen studies are the current mainstay of palaeodietary reconstruction, carbon isotope analysis of single amino acids can provide more nuanced insights into protein sources, particularly in complex foodwebs (Fogel & Tuross 2003; Corr *et al.* 2005; McCullagh *et al.* 2005; Webb *et al.* 2015). Single amino acid nitrogen isotope analysis, along with the compound-specific carbon isotope analysis of lipids and bone mineral, also have the potential to provide more nuanced insights into diet (Jim *et al.* 2004; Styring *et al.* 2010; Colonese *et al.* 2015). 'Non-traditional' elements, such as calcium (Reynard *et al.* 2013) and zinc (Jaouen *et al.* 2016), will prove increasingly useful in palaeodietary studies, particularly where organics are not preserved (Jaouen & Pons 2016). Underused since initial research, lead isotope applications will also become more widely used, corroborating strontium isotope evidence for human and animal mobility (e.g. Shaw *et al.* 2016). Other isotopes, such as neodymium (Tütken *et al.* 2011), may also prove to be useful provenance proxies. Finally, recent advances in micro-sampling approaches to human dentition (Beaumont & Montgomery 2015; Willmes *et al.* 2016) will make their application more routine, thereby enhancing temporal resolution in isotope studies by providing time-series dietary or mobility data for archaeological individuals.

Compound-specific approaches and new sampling strategies will help in taking stable isotope analyses 'beyond diet', and will aid in the identification of nutritional stress and disease (Reitsema 2013). Similarly, as our understanding of the impact of culinary preparation on the isotope ratios of food and drink improves, other applications will arise. Boiling and fermentation, for example, can alter the oxygen isotope values of drinking water and therefore potentially alter human tissues when consumed (Brettell *et al.* 2012). While this poses problems for mobility studies, it could throw light on past drinking habits (Lamb *et al.* 2014). If experimental studies can improve our understanding of the isotope systematics of post-procurement foodways, then the use of established or 'non-traditional' isotope approaches in investigating cooking, or other preparation/culinary practices, may move to the fore.

Four legs good

Isotope zooarchaeology has recently proved valuable in disentangling complex aspects of human-animal subsistence, and economic and socio-cultural relationships (Makarewicz 2016). Often using intra-tooth sampling (which provides time-series isotope records;

Balasse 2003; Zazzo *et al.* 2006), aspects of animal husbandry such as foddering and birth seasonality have been investigated, illuminating the experiences of animals and the decisions of herders (Balasse *et al.* 2006; Towers *et al.* 2014). Strontium isotope studies on archaeological fauna have explored aspects of past human lifeways such as trade and transhumance (Bentley & Knipper 2005; Thornton 2011). The need to provide food for omnivorous domesticates brings additional considerations to human foodways, and isotope studies have explored these in a range of contexts (e.g. McManus-Fry *et al.* 2016).

Remains of wild animals from Pleistocene sites have also been analysed to explore ancient foodwebs and environmental change (Bocherens 2003; Richards & Hedges 2003; Stevens *et al.* 2008; Feranec *et al.* 2010). While this kind of isotope palaeoecology is well-established, its potential for archaeological studies is only now being realised. Archaeological faunal remains are significant in that they are often the product of human activity, and can provide insights into that activity. Herbivore intra-tooth oxygen isotope data can, for example, provide evidence of seasonal temperature variations and, when applied to anthropogenically derived assemblages, generate terrestrial palaeoclimate proxy data near-synchronous to human site-use (e.g. Bernard *et al.* 2009). Strontium isotope evidence for migratory behaviours of important prey species, such as reindeer, can provide useful insights into human behaviours and decisions, such as landscape-use and hunting strategies (Britton *et al.* 2011; Price *et al.* 2017).

Connected lines of enquiry in isotope ecology and archaeology are now set to emerge; for example, in investigating the relationship between past climatic change, faunal migrations and human societies. Cross-disciplinary research projects will require specialists from both fields, and the combination of methodological and theoretical frameworks. Site-formation processes, and site-specific physical and chemical taphonomy, must all be understood in order to assess the potential and limitations of any particular assemblage or research question. New approaches to sampling must be sought, since the large sample sizes and controls typical in isotope ecology are difficult for archaeological materials to meet. To utilise isotope evidence for climatic change or faunal mobility (and through this, human behaviours and experiences), novel methods of analysing isotope data are also required. Among these, GIS tools and computational models that are commonly used in spatial ecology could allow landscape-level approaches to isotope data. This could take intra-tooth strontium data beyond the identification of migratory or non-migratory individuals, to the modelling of seasonal movements across 'iscoscapes'. First, however, it will be essential to develop these tools within a proof-of-concept framework using modern materials.

An unnatural abundance

A growing strength of isotope bioarchaeology is the sheer quantity of data generated from 'routine' applications. The publication of full isotope datasets, along with %C, %N, C:N or strontium concentration data, is increasingly common and ensures that other scientists can properly access the data. Although practices in data reporting still require improvement (Szapak *et al.* 2017), it is now possible to conduct original research using datasets combined from previously published studies. Such syntheses reveal diachronic and population-level trends, and allow enhanced critique of the capabilities of the techniques to, for example,

© Antiquity Publications Ltd, 2017

identify immigrants from oxygen isotopes (Lightfoot & O'Connell 2016). New methods of analysing large datasets, such as Bayesian mixing models or GIS tools, will prove increasingly valuable (e.g. Fernandes *et al.* 2014; Willmes *et al.* 2014).

User-contributed datasets, such as 'GenBank' for DNA, present a promising new method of collating large quantities of bioarchaeological isotope data ready to be 'excavated' later. A recent call for a similar 'IsoBank' from the ecological community (Pauli *et al.* 2015) was met with enthusiasm from isotope archaeologists (Pilaar Birch & Graham 2015). The framework, management and costs of such a database, among other issues, still need to be addressed by the broader community (Pauli *et al.* 2015). Once these hurdles are overcome, however, 'IsoBank' will represent not only a sound curatorial move for a field with burgeoning data, but (and more significantly) will yield fantastic new opportunities to generate new knowledge.

Concluding thoughts and moving forward

In the era of 'big data', isotope analyses provide a valuable, accessible and relatively inexpensive means of exploring past human lifeways and experiences. From population-level insights to individual 'biographies' (Eriksson & Lidén 2013), isotopic studies help to answer archaeological enquiries at a range of scales. Isotope data allow the experiences of individual people, and intra-societal differences, to be traced. Applied *en masse* and in the context of societal or cultural transitions, isotope data can illuminate the modes and temporalities of change, and its consequences.

As archaeological research begins to focus on the relationship between human life-histories, physiology and socio-cultural change, isotope approaches are well positioned to drive these emerging research directions. They are a tool for accessing the past by encompassing both the cultural and the ecological (Bogaard & Outram 2013). Methodological and analytical developments must continue, however, for more nuanced interpretations to become possible, and to distinguish between dietary, physiological or other influences. Multi-isotope approaches, compound-specific analyses, and intra-tissue/multi-tissue comparisons must become more routine. A better understanding of how culinary preparation or other culturally mediated behaviours can influence isotope values in food or water is also required. Fundamental experimental investigations and proof-of-concept research must continue *alongside* archaeological applications for both the adoption of new analytical approaches and the more confident (and creative) use of existing ones (Pollard 2011). It is essential that funders and grant reviewers recognise these priorities.

Another priority must be the continued integration of isotopic datasets into broader archaeological frameworks. This should embrace the complementarity of diverse lines of enquiry, while exploiting the contradictions of parallel datasets, to explore new research directions. For example, isotopic records of human diets could be contrasted with excavated evidence of food remains to raise questions about cultural construction of space, waste and diet. Isotope studies do not, and should not, exist in isolation, but should be components of well-integrated studies using diverse theoretical and methodological approaches; for example, in the combination of isotope and genetic data for studying Romano-British 'origins' (Martiniano *et al.* 2016). The integration of isotope data with other lines of

evidence is key. Archaeologists can contribute to this by integrating broad datasets from a range of specialisms (including isotopes) in their research designs, with all data properly collected, analysed and contextualised.

Isotope zooarchaeology will continue to grow as a sub-field, facilitating the understanding of past human societies and natural environments. This is illustrative of the continued growth of inter-disciplinary research in academia, and isotope archaeologists are now actively contributing to other fields. To meet the challenge of emerging fields (such as faunal spatial palaeoecology), cross-disciplinary methodologies and epistemologies will need to be reconciled. Issues of research design and sample size are sources of discrepancy, as are the methods of analysing, visualising and interacting with data and the theoretical frameworks used to interpret it. To move forward, an understanding of the archaeological record, taphonomy and diagenesis will need to be combined with ecologically derived theoretical and practical approaches.

Perhaps the most immediate concern for the discipline and its future, however, lies with the availability and usability of datasets. The creation of a universal isotope data repository will not only allay curatorial concerns, but will lead to new directions in research. The harnessing of large datasets is likely to stimulate entirely new lines of enquiry into temporal, spatial and cultural variation. As recently voiced in ecological literature, and echoed in the archaeological community, 'IsoBank' would be a very welcome addition. Forty years on from the first published applications, we can be confident that bioarchaeology and isotopes are in it for the long haul, so perhaps it is time to start saving.

Supplementary material

To view supplementary material for this article, please visit <http://doi.org/10.15184/aqy.2017.98>

Acknowledgements

I am grateful for the invitation to contribute this piece and for comments on earlier versions, especially from two anonymous reviewers. Thanks are also due to Gundula Müldner, Mike Richards, Michelle Alexander, Jennifer Jones, Joshua Wright and Orsolya Czére. Finally, I should like to acknowledge the isotope archaeology community in the UK and elsewhere, who make for lively conferences and an exciting and inclusive field.

References

- ALEXANDER, M.M., C.M. GERRARD, A. GUTIÉRREZ & A.R. MILLARD. 2015. Diet, society, and economy in late medieval Spain: stable isotope evidence from Muslims and Christians from Gandía, Valencia. *American Journal of Physical Anthropology* 156: 263–73. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ajpa.22647>
- AMBROSE, S.H. 1990. Preparation and characterization of bone and tooth collagen for isotopic analysis. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 17: 431–51. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0305-4403\(90\)90007-R](https://doi.org/10.1016/0305-4403(90)90007-R)
- 1991. Effects of diet, climate and physiology on nitrogen isotope abundances in terrestrial foodwebs. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 18: 293–317. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0305-4403\(91\)90067-Y](https://doi.org/10.1016/0305-4403(91)90067-Y)
- 2000. Controlled diet and climate experiments on nitrogen isotope ratios of rats, in S.H. Ambrose & M.A. Katzenberg (ed.) *Biogeochemical approaches to palaeodietary analysis*. New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum.
- AMBROSE, S.H. & L. NORR. 1993. Experimental evidence for the relationship of the carbon isotope ratios of whole diet and dietary protein to those of bone collagen and carbonate, in J.B. Lambert & G. Grupe (ed.) *Prehistoric human bone: archaeology at the molecular level*: 1–37. New York: Springer.
- BALASSE, M. 2003. Potential biases in sampling design and interpretation of intra-tooth isotope analysis. *International Journal of Osteoarchaeology* 13: 3–10. <https://doi.org/10.1002/oa.656>

- BALASSE, M., A. TRESSET & S.H. AMBROSE. 2006. Stable isotope evidence ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) for winter feeding on seaweed by Neolithic sheep of Scotland. *Journal of Zoology* 270: 170–76. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-7998.2006.00104.x>
- BEAUMONT, J. & J. MONTGOMERY. 2015. Oral histories: a simple method of assigning chronological age to isotopic values from human dentine collagen. *Annals of Human Biology* 42: 407–14. <https://doi.org/10.3109/03014460.2015.1045027>
- BENTLEY, R.A. 2013. Mobility and the diversity of Early Neolithic lives: isotopic evidence from skeletons. *Journal of Anthropological Archaeology* 32: 303–12. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaa.2012.01.009>
- BENTLEY, R.A. & C. KNIPPER. 2005. Transhumance at the early Neolithic settlement at Vaihingen (Germany). *Antiquity* 79(306): Project Gallery. Available at: <http://www.antiquity.ac.uk/projgall/bentley306/> (accessed 8 May 2017).
- BENTLEY, R.A., M. PIETRUSEWSKY, M.T. DOUGLAS & T.C. ATKINSON. 2005. Matrilocalty during the prehistoric transition to agriculture in Thailand? *Antiquity* 79: 865–81. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003598X00115005>
- BERNARD, A., V. DAUX, C. LÉCUYER, J.-P. BRUGAL, D. GENTY, K. WAINER, V. GARDIEN, F. FOUREL & J. JAUBERT. 2009. Pleistocene seasonal temperature variations recorded in the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ of *Bison priscus* teeth. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 283: 133–43. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2009.04.005>
- BOCHERENS, H. 2003. Isotopic biogeochemistry and the palaeoecology of the mammoth steppe fauna. *DEINSEA—Annual of the Natural History Museum Rotterdam* 9: 57–76.
- BOGAARD, A. & A.K. OUTRAM. 2013. Palaeodiet and beyond: stable isotopes in bioarchaeology. *World Archaeology* 45: 333–37. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00438243.2013.829272>
- BRETTELL, R., J. MONTGOMERY & J. EVANS. 2012. Brewing and stewing: the effect of culturally mediated behaviour on the oxygen isotope composition of ingested fluids and the implications for human provenance studies. *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry* 27: 778–85. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c2ja10335d>
- BRITTON, K., V. GRIMES, L. NIVEN, T. STEELE, S. MCPHERRON, M. SORESSI, T.E. KELLY, J. JAUBERT, J.-J. HUBLIN & M.P. RICHARDS. 2011. Strontium isotope evidence for migration in late Pleistocene *Rangifer*: implications for Neanderthal hunting strategies at the Middle Palaeolithic site of Jonzac, France. *Journal of Human Evolution* 61: 176–85. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhevol.2011.03.004>
- BURTON, J.H., T.D. PRICE & W.D. MIDDLETON. 1999. Correlation of bone Ba/Ca and Sr/Ca due to biological purification of calcium. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 26: 609–16. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jasc.1998.0378>
- COLLINS, M.J., C.M. NIELSEN-MARSH, J. HILLER, C.I. SMITH, J.P. ROBERTS, R.V. PRIGODICH, T.J. WESS, J. CSAPÓ, A.R. MILLARD & G. TURNER-WALKER. 2002. The survival of organic matter in bone: a review. *Archaeometry* 44: 383–94. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-4754.t01-1-00071>
- COLONESE, A.C., T. FARRELL, A. LUCQUIN, D. FIRTH, S. CHARLTON, H.K. ROBSON, M. ALEXANDER & O.E. CRAIG. 2015. Archaeological bone lipids as palaeodietary markers. *Rapid Communications in Mass Spectrometry* 29: 611–18. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.7144>
- COPELAND, S.R., M. SPONHEIMER, D.J. DE RUITER, J.A. LEE-THORP, D. CODRON, P.J. LE ROUX, V. GRIMES & M.P. RICHARDS. 2011. Strontium isotope evidence for landscape use by early hominins. *Nature* 474: 76–78. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature10149>
- CORR, L.T., J.C. SEALY, M.C. HORTON & R.P. EVERSLED. 2005. A novel marine dietary indicator utilising compound-specific bone collagen amino acid $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of ancient humans. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 32: 321–30. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2004.10.002>
- CRAIG, H. 1961. Isotopic variations in meteoric waters. *Science* 133: 1702–703. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.133.3465.1702>
- DANSGAARD, W. 1964. Stable isotopes in precipitation. *Tellus* 16: 436–68. <https://doi.org/10.3402/tellusa.v16i4.8993>
- DENIRO, M.J. 1985. Postmortem preservation and alteration of *in vivo* bone collagen isotope ratios in relation to palaeodietary reconstruction. *Nature* 317: 806–809. <https://doi.org/10.1038/317806a0>
- DENIRO, M.J. & S. EPSTEIN. 1978a. Carbon isotopic evidence for different feeding patterns in two hyrax species occupying the same habitat. *Science* 201: 906–908. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.201.4359.906>
- 1978b. Influence of diet on the distribution of carbon isotopes in animals. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 42: 495–506. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037\(78\)90199-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(78)90199-0)
- 1981. Influence of diet on the distribution of nitrogen isotopes in animals. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 45: 341–51. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037\(81\)90244-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(81)90244-1)
- ERICSON, J.E. 1985. Strontium isotope characterization in the study of prehistoric human ecology. *Journal of Human Evolution* 14: 503–14. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0047-2484\(85\)80029-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0047-2484(85)80029-4)

- ERIKSSON, G. & K. LIDÉN. 2013. Dietary life histories in Stone Age Northern Europe. *Journal of Anthropological Archaeology* 32: 288–302. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaa.2012.01.002>
- FERANEC, R., N. GARCÍA, J.C. DÍEZ & J.L. ARSUAGA. 2010. Understanding the ecology of mammalian carnivores and herbivores from Valdegoba Cave (Burgos, northern Spain) through stable isotope analysis. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 297: 263–72. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2010.08.006>
- FERNANDES, R., A.R. MILLARD, M. BRABEC, M.-J. NADEAU & P. GROOTES. 2014. Food Reconstruction Using Isotopic Transferred Signals (FRUITS): a Bayesian model for diet reconstruction. *PLoS ONE* 9: e87436. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0087436>
- FOGEL, M.L. & N. TUROSS. 2003. Extending the limits of paleodietary studies of humans with compound specific carbon isotope analysis of amino acids. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 30: 535–45. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-4403\(02\)00199-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-4403(02)00199-1)
- FOGEL, M.L., N. TUROSS & D. OWSLEY. 1989. Nitrogen isotope tracers of human lactation in modern and archaeological populations. *Carnegie Institute Year Book* 88: 111–17.
- GRIMES, V. & M. PELLEGRINI. 2013. A comparison of pretreatment methods for the analysis of phosphate oxygen isotope ratios in bioapatite. *Rapid Communications in Mass Spectrometry* 27: 375–90. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.6463>
- HAAK, W., G. BRANDT, H.N. DE JONG, C. MEYER, R. GANSLMEIER, V. HEYD, C. HAWKESWORTH, A.W.G. PIKE, H. MELLER & K.W. ALT. 2008. Ancient DNA, strontium isotopes, and osteological analyses shed light on social and kinship organization of the Later Stone Age. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA* 105: 18226–31. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0807592105>
- HAYDOCK, H., L. CLARKE, E. CRAIG-ATKINS, R. HOWCROFT & J. BUCKBERRY. 2013. Weaning at Anglo-Saxon Raunds: implications for changing breastfeeding practice in Britain over two millennia. *American Journal of Physical Anthropology* 151: 604–12. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ajpa.22316>
- HEATON, T.H.E. 1999. Spatial, species and temporal variations in the $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ ratios of C_3 plants: implications for palaeodiet studies. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 26: 637–49. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jasc.1998.0381>
- HEDGES, R.E.M., A.R. MILLARD & A.W.G. PIKE. 1995. Measurements and relationships of diagenetic alteration of bone from three archaeological sites. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 22: 201–209. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jasc.1995.0022>
- HOPPE, K.A., P.L. KOCH & T.T. FURUTANI. 2003. Assessing the preservation of biogenic strontium in fossil bones and tooth enamel. *International Journal of Osteoarchaeology* 13: 20–28. <https://doi.org/10.1002/oa.663>
- HOWLAND, M.R., L.T. CORR, S.M.M. YOUNG, V. JONES, S. JIM, N.J. VAN DER MERWE, A.D. MITCHELL & R.P. EVERSLED. 2003. Expression of the dietary isotope signal in the compound-specific $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of pig bone lipids and amino acids. *International Journal of Osteoarchaeology* 13: 54–65. <https://doi.org/10.1002/oa.658>
- JAOUEN, K. & M.-L. PONS. 2016. Potential of non-traditional isotope studies for bioarchaeology. *Archaeological and Anthropological Sciences*. First published online 3 November 2016. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12520-016-0426-9>
- JAOUEN, K., P. SZPAK & M.P. RICHARDS. 2016. Zinc isotope ratios as indicators of diet and trophic level in arctic marine mammals. *PLoS ONE* 11: e0152299. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0152299>
- JAY, M., B.T. FULLER, M.P. RICHARDS, C.J. KNÜSEL & S.S. KING. 2008. Iron Age breastfeeding practices in Britain: isotopic evidence from Wetwang Slack, East Yorkshire. *American Journal of Physical Anthropology* 136: 327–37. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ajpa.20815>
- JIM, S., S.H. AMBROSE & R.P. EVERSLED. 2004. Stable carbon isotopic evidence for differences in the dietary origin of bone cholesterol, collagen and apatite: implications for their use in palaeodietary reconstruction. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 68: 61–72. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037\(03\)00216-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037(03)00216-3)
- KNUDSON, K.J. & C.M. STOJANOWSKI. 2008. New directions in bioarchaeology: recent contributions to the study of human social identities. *Journal of Archaeological Research* 16: 397–432. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10814-008-9024-4>
- KOCH, P.L., N. TUROSS & M.L. FOGEL. 1997. The effects of sample treatment and diagenesis on the isotopic integrity of carbonate in biogenic hydroxylapatite. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 24: 417–29. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jasc.1996.0126>
- KOHN, M.J. 1996. Predicting animal $\delta^{18}\text{O}$: accounting for diet and physiological adaptation. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 60: 4811–29. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037\(96\)00240-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037(96)00240-2)
- LALAND, K.N. & M.J. O'BRIEN. 2010. Niche construction theory and archaeology. *Journal of Archaeological Method and Theory* 17: 303–22. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10816-010-9096-6>

- LALAND, K.N., J. ODLING-SMEE & S. MYLES. 2010. How culture shaped the human genome: bringing genetics and the human sciences together. *Nature Review Genetics* 11: 137–48. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nrg2734>
- LAMB, A.L., J.E. EVANS, R. BUCKLEY & J. APPLEBY. 2014. Multi-isotope analysis demonstrates significant lifestyle changes in King Richard III. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 50: 559–65. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2014.06.021>
- LEE-THORP, J.A., M. SPONHEIMER, B.H. PASSEY, D.J. DE RUITER & T.E. CERLING. 2010. Stable isotopes in fossil hominin tooth enamel suggest a fundamental dietary shift in the Pliocene. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 365: 3389–96. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2010.0059>
- LIGHTFOOT, E. & T.C. O'CONNELL. 2016. On the use of biomineral oxygen isotope data to identify human migrants in the archaeological record: intra-sample variation, statistical methods and geographical considerations. *PLoS ONE* 11: e0153850. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0153850>
- LONGINELLI, A. 1984. Oxygen isotopes in mammal bone phosphate: a new tool for paleohydrological and paleoclimatological research? *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 48: 385–90. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037\(84\)90259-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(84)90259-X)
- LUZ, B., Y. KOLODNY & M. HOROWITZ. 1984. Fractionation of oxygen isotopes between mammalian bone-phosphate and environmental drinking water. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 48: 1689–93. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037\(84\)90338-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(84)90338-7)
- MAKAREWICZ, C.A. 2016. Toward an integrated isotope zooarchaeology, in G. Grupe & C.G. McGlynn (ed.) *Isotopic landscapes in bioarchaeology*: 189–209. Berlin & Heidelberg: Springer.
- MAKAREWICZ, C.A. & J. SEALY. 2015. Dietary reconstruction, mobility, and the analysis of ancient skeletal tissues: expanding the prospects of stable isotope research in archaeology. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 56: 146–58. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2015.02.035>
- MARTINIANO, R., A. CAFFELL, M. HOLST, K. HUNTER-MANN, J. MONTGOMERY, G. MÜLDNER, R.L. McLAUGHLIN, M.D. TEASDALE, W. VAN RHEENEN, J.H. VELDINK, L.H. VAN DEN BERG, O. HARDIMAN, M. CARROLL, S. ROSKAMS, J. OXLEY, C. MORGAN, M.G. THOMAS, I. BARNES, C. McDONNELL, M.J. COLLINS & D.G. BRADLEY. 2016. Genomic signals of migration and continuity in Britain before the Anglo-Saxons. *Nature Communications* 7: article no. 10326. <https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms10326>
- MCCULLAGH, J.S., J.A. TRIPP & R.E. HEDGES. 2005. Carbon isotope analysis of bulk keratin and single amino acids from British and North American hair. *Rapid Communications in Mass Spectrometry* 19: 3227–31. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.2150>
- MCMANUS-FRY, E., R. KNECHT, K. DOBNEY, M.P. RICHARDS & K. BRITTON. 2016. Dog-human dietary relationships in Yup'ik western Alaska: the stable isotope and zooarchaeological evidence from pre-contact Nunalleq. *Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports*. First published online 29 April 2016. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jasrep.2016.04.007>
- MILNER, N., O.E. CRAIG, G.N. BAILEY, K. PEDERSEN & S.H. ANDERSEN. 2004. Something fishy in the Neolithic? A re-evaluation of stable isotope analysis of Mesolithic and Neolithic coastal populations. *Antiquity* 78: 9–22. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003598X00092887>
- MINAGAWA, M. & E. WADA. 1984. Stepwise enrichment of ^{15}N along food chains: further evidence and the relation between ^{15}N and animal age. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 48: 1135–40. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037\(84\)90204-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(84)90204-7)
- MONTGOMERY, J., J. BEAUMONT, M. JAY, K. KEEFE, A.R. GLEDHILL, G.T. COOK, S.J. DOCKRILL & N.D. MELTON. 2013. Strategic and sporadic marine consumption at the onset of the Neolithic: increasing temporal resolution in the isotope evidence. *Antiquity* 87: 1060–72. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003598X00049863>
- MÜLDNER, G., J. MONTGOMERY, G. COOK, R. ELLAM, A. GLEDHILL & C. LOWE. 2009. Isotopes and individuals: diet and mobility among the medieval Bishops of Whithorn. *Antiquity* 83: 1119–33. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003598X00099403>
- NAGEL, M.C. 1982. Frederick Soddy: from alchemy to isotopes. *Journal of Chemical Education* 59: 739–40. <https://doi.org/10.1021/ed059p739>
- NEHLICH, O. & M.P. RICHARDS. 2009. Establishing collagen quality criteria for sulphur isotope analysis of archaeological bone collagen. *Archaeological and Anthropological Sciences* 1: 59–75. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12520-009-0003-6>
- NELSON, D.E., M.J. DENIRO, M.J. SCHOENINGER, D.J. DEPAOLO & P.E. HARE. 1986. Effects of diagenesis on strontium, carbon, nitrogen, and oxygen concentration and isotopic composition of bone. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 50: 1941–49. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037\(86\)90250-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(86)90250-4)
- NICOL, H. 1957. The word 'isotope'. *The Lancet* 269: 1358–59. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(57\)91885-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(57)91885-8)

- NITSCH, E.K., L.T. HUMPHREY & R.E.M. HEDGES. 2011. Using stable isotope analysis to examine the effect of economic change on breastfeeding practices in Spitalfields, London, UK. *American Journal of Physical Anthropology* 146: 619–28. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ajpa.21623>
- PAULI, J.N., S.A. STEFFAN & S.D. NEWSOME. 2015. It is time for IsoBank. *BioScience* 65: 229–30. <https://doi.org/10.1093/biosci/biu230>
- PEARSON, J.A., S.D. HADDOW, S.W. HILLSON, C.J. KNÜSEL, C.S. LARSEN & J.W. SADVARI. 2015. Stable carbon and nitrogen isotope analysis and dietary reconstruction through the life course at Neolithic Çatalhöyük, Turkey. *Journal of Social Archaeology* 15: 210–32. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1469605315582983>
- PILAAIR BIRCH, S.E. & R.W. GRAHAM. 2015. A stable isotope data repository as part of Neotoma, a paleoecological database. *BioScience* 65: 953. <https://doi.org/10.1093/biosci/biv133>
- POLLARD, A.M. 2011. Isotopes and impact: a cautionary tale. *Antiquity* 85: 631–38. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003598X00068034>
- PRICE, T.D., D. MEIGGS, M.-J. WEBER & A. PIKE-TAY. 2017. The migration of Late Pleistocene reindeer: isotopic evidence from Northern Europe. *Archaeological and Anthropological Sciences* 9: 371–94. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12520-015-0290-z>
- REITSEMA, L.J. 2013. Beyond diet reconstruction: stable isotope applications to human physiology, health, and nutrition. *American Journal of Human Biology* 25: 445–56. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ajhb.22398>
- REYNARD, L.M., J.A. PEARSON, G.M. HENDERSON & R.E.M. HEDGES. 2013. Calcium isotopes in juvenile milk-consumers. *Archaeometry* 55: 946–57. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-4754.2012.00715.x>
- RICHARDS, M.P. & R.E.M. HEDGES. 2003. Variations in bone collagen $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values of fauna from northwest Europe over the last 40 000 years. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 193: 261–67. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0031-0182\(03\)00229-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0031-0182(03)00229-3)
- RICHARDS, M.P. & R.J. SCHULTING. 2006. Against the grain? A response to Milner *et al.* (2004). *Antiquity* 80: 444–56. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003598X00093765>
- RICHARDS, M.P., R.J. SCHULTING & R.E.M. HEDGES. 2003. Sharp shift in diet at onset of Neolithic. *Nature* 425: 366. <https://doi.org/10.1038/425366a>
- ROWLEY-CONWY, P. 2011. Westward ho! The spread of agriculture from Central Europe to the Atlantic. *Current Anthropology* 52: S431–51. <https://doi.org/10.1086/658368>
- SCHOENINGER, M.J. 2014. Stable isotope analyses and the evolution of human diets. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 43: 413–30. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-anthro-102313-025935>
- SCHOENINGER, M.J. & M.J. DENIRO. 1984. Nitrogen and carbon isotopic composition of bone collagen from marine and terrestrial animals. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 48: 625–39. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037\(84\)90091-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(84)90091-7)
- SCHOENINGER, M.J., M.J. DENIRO & H. TAUBER. 1983. Stable nitrogen isotope ratios of bone collagen reflect marine and terrestrial components of prehistoric human diet. *Science* 220: 1381–83. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.6344217>
- SHAW, H., J. MONTGOMERY, R. REDFERN, R. GOWLAND & J. EVANS. 2016. Identifying migrants in Roman London using lead and strontium stable isotopes. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 66: 57–68. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2015.12.001>
- SODDY, F. 1913. Intra-atomic charge. *Nature* 92: 399–400. <https://doi.org/10.1038/092399c0>
- SPONHEIMER, M., T. ROBINSON, L. AYLIFFE, B. ROEDER, J. HAMMER, B. PASSEY, A. WEST, T. CERLING, D. DEARING & J. EHLERINGER. 2003. Nitrogen isotopes in mammalian herbivores: hair $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values from a controlled feeding study. *International Journal of Osteoarchaeology* 13: 80–87. <https://doi.org/10.1002/oa.655>
- STEVENS, R.E., R. JACOBI, M. STREET, M. GERMONPRÉ, N.J. CONARD, S.C. MÜNDEL & R.E.M. HEDGES. 2008. Nitrogen isotope analyses of reindeer (*Rangifer tarandus*), 45,000 BP to 900 BP: palaeoenvironmental reconstructions. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 262: 32–45. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2008.01.019>
- STYRING, A.K., J.C. SEALY & R.P. EVERSHED. 2010. Resolving the bulk $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values of ancient human and animal bone collagen via compound-specific nitrogen isotope analysis of constituent amino acids. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 74: 241–51. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2009.09.022>
- SZPAK, P., J.Z. METCALFE & R.A. MACDONALD. 2017. Best practices for calibrating and reporting stable isotope measurements in archaeology. *Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports* 13: 609–16. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jasrep.2017.05.07>
- THORNTON, E.K. 2011. Reconstructing ancient Maya animal trade through strontium isotope ($^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$) analysis. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 38: 3254–63. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2011.06.035>
- TIESZEN, L.L., T.W. BOUTTON, K.G. TESDAHL & N.A. SLADE. 1983. Fractionation and turnover of stable carbon isotopes in animal tissues: implications for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ analysis of diet. *Oecologia* 57: 32–37. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00379558>

- TOWERS, J., A. GLEDHILL, J. BOND & J. MONTGOMERY. 2014. An investigation of cattle birth seasonality using $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profiles within first molar enamel. *Archaeometry* 56: 208–36. <https://doi.org/10.1111/arcm.12055>
- TUROSS, N., M.L. FOGEL & P.E. HARE. 1988. Variability in the preservation of the isotopic composition of collagen from fossil bone. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 52: 929–35. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037\(88\)90364-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(88)90364-X)
- TÜTKEN, T., T.W. VENNEMANN & H.-U. PFRETZSCHNER. 2011. Nd and Sr isotope compositions in modern and fossil bones—proxies for vertebrate provenance and taphonomy. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 75: 5951–70. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2011.07.024>
- VAN DER MERWE, N.J. & J.C. VOGEL. 1978. ^{13}C content of human collagen as a measure of prehistoric diet in Woodland North America. *Nature* 276: 815–16. <https://doi.org/10.1038/276815a0>
- VAN KLINKEN, G.J. 1999. Bone collagen quality indicators for palaeodietary and radiocarbon measurements. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 26: 687–95. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jasc.1998.0385>
- VOGEL, J.C. 1978. Isotopic assessment of the dietary habits of ungulates. *South African Journal of Science* 74: 298–301.
- VOGEL, J.C. & N.J. VAN DER MERWE. 1977. Isotopic evidence for early maize cultivation in New York State. *American Antiquity* 42: 238–42. <https://doi.org/10.2307/278984>
- WARINNER, C., C. SPELLER & M.J. COLLINS. 2015. A new era in palaeomicrobiology: prospects for ancient dental calculus as a long-term record of the human oral microbiome. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* 370: article no. 20130376. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2013.0376>
- WEBB, E.C., N.V. HONCH, P.J.H. DUNN, G. ERIKSSON, K. LIDÉN & R.P. EVERSHED. 2015. Compound-specific amino acid isotopic proxies for detecting freshwater resource consumption. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 63: 104–14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2015.08.001>
- WHITE, C.D. & F.J. LONGSTAFFE. 2016. Stable isotopes and selective forces: examples in biocultural and environmental anthropology, in M.K. Zuckerman & D.L. Martin (ed.) *New directions in biocultural anthropology*: 241–57. Hoboken (NJ): Wiley Blackwell. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118962954.ch12>
- WILLMES, M., L. MCMORROW, L. KINSLEY, R. ARMSTRONG, M. AUBERT, S. EGGINS, C. FALGUÈRES, B. MAUREILLE, I. MOFFAT & R. GRÜN. 2014. The IRHUM (Isotopic Reconstruction of Human Migration) database—bioavailable strontium isotope ratios for geochemical fingerprinting in France. *Earth System Science Data* 6: 117–22. <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-6-117-2014>
- WILLMES, M., L. KINSLEY, M.H. MONCEL, R.A. ARMSTRONG, M. AUBERT, S. EGGINS & R. GRÜN. 2016. Improvement of laser ablation *in situ* micro-analysis to identify diagenetic alteration and measure strontium isotope ratios in fossil human teeth. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 70: 102–16. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2016.04.017>
- ZAZZO, A., M. BALASSE & W.P. PATTERSON. 2006. The reconstruction of mammal individual history: refining high-resolution isotope record in bovine tooth dentine. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 33: 1177–87. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2005.12.006>