The faults for which atonements are prescribed in Trilocanaśiva's *Prāyaścittasamuccaya* include many that are not specific to initiates of the Śaiva Siddhānta, such as those committed while eating, bathing, urinating, excreting, having sex or menstruating (the detailed list of the latter being the inspiration for Goodall's analysis of the role of women in the Śaiva Siddhānta), those pertaining to the use of books or those incurred by being born or dying, and the five great sins or *mahāpātaka*s. There are also offences relating to the practices of Saiddhāntika initiates such as mistakes in the performance of worship, defilement of a *śivaliṅga* and misbehaviour in the presence of the guru. The methods of atonement themselves may consist of ways of purifying objects that have been defiled or of purifying the person who is at fault. The latter most commonly involves the repetition of a mantra, usually one of the five *brahmamantra*s; of them, it is the Aghora mantra which is most commonly prescribed. Indeed, the Aghora mantra is a cure-all; verse 496 says "As for when a combination of many sins arises, one should recite the Aghora mantra until one's mind is set at ease". Bathing, fasting and consuming the *pañcagavya*, the five products of the cow, are also regularly prescribed as methods of atonement, and details of different types of fast and the preparation of the *pañcagavya* are given in the text. The specific types of fault described attest to a rigidly stratified and sectarian society: penances are graded not only according to which level of initiate is at fault, but also according to their *varṇa* and, where the fault involves interaction with someone else, that person's religion, *varṇa* and *jāti*.

This is an excellent work firmly in the tradition of the publications of the Institut français de Pondichéry and Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient in that it presents a truly critical edition of an important but recently neglected text together with an annotated translation and introduction that use the meticulous text-critical scholarship involved in producing the edition to draw conclusions about the historical context of the text's production.

James Mallinson
SOAS University of London

BRIAN BLACK and LAURIE PATTON (eds):
Dialogue in Early South Asian Religions: Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain Traditions.
(Dialogues in South Asian Traditions: Religion, Philosophy, Literature and History.) xi, 265 pp. Farnham: Ashgate, 2015. ISBN 978 1 4094 4012 3.
doi:10.1017/S0041977X16000914

Dialogue in Early South Asian Religions. Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain Traditions constitutes the fourth volume in the series "Dialogues in South Asian Traditions: Religion, Philosophy, Literature and History" which will seek to examine "the use of the dialogical genre in South Asian religious and cultural traditions" (preface). Based on the premise that "face-to-face conversation and dialogue are defining features of South Asian traditional texts, ritual and practice", the series aims at establishing a "dynamic historical and literary mode of analysis" (preface) suited to the South Asian pluri-religious context. The contributions gathered in this volume are a welcome addition to the series.

The 11 articles are all stimulating and equivalent in quality. They are preceded by a model introduction by Brian Black and Laurie Patton (pp. 1–21) which exposes the book's inception and intent. Although dialogue is a compositional device central to and shared by Hindu, Buddhist and Jain textual traditions, previous scholarship has largely neglected this literary genre. This book is a first endeavour to compensate for this lack, proposing a systematic survey of the forms of the dialogical genre, its uses, purposes, and effects across religious traditions in order to highlight common patterns or distinct features.

To this end, the contributions explore a wide range of Vedic, Hindu, Buddhist and Jain texts and are divided into three sections which each focus on a distinct aspect of dialogue. Part I "Dialogues inside and outside the texts" looks at religious conversations within the *Ṛg Veda* (Laurie Patton, pp. 25–36), the *Mahābhārata* and the *Rāmāyaṇa* (Alf Hiltebeitel, pp. 37–77), the Śvetāmbara Canon (Anna Aurelia Esposito, pp. 79–98) and the Pali *Jātakas* (Naomi Appleton, pp. 99–112). It reveals how a dialogue can function as a commentary on its own oral transmission and as an efficient didactic device to dispense the complex theological content of the text. Dialogue also acts as a window into the audiences outside the text which it targets. Issues of intertextuality are the focus of Part II, "Texts in dialogue". Douglas Osto (pp. 115–36), Elizabeth M. Rohlman (pp. 137–50), and Andrew J. Nicholson (pp. 151–69) respectively examine how *Prajñāpāramitā Sūtras*, the *Sarasvatī Purāṇa* and philosophical dialogues found in *Gītā*, polemic and doxography draw upon earlier sources to legitimate the new teachings which they deliver. By recasting authoritative characters or reproducing the dialogical settings of well-known scriptures, these texts cloak the innovative nature of their content under deceitful conservatism while establishing a lineage in the transmission of a now refashioned theology. Part III, "Moving between traditions", turns attention to the relationship, both real and imagined, between Hindus, Buddhists and Jains as reflected in dialogues. While Jonathan Geen's (pp. 191–205) and Lisa Wessman Crothers's (pp. 207–41) discussions on the rhetorical effectiveness and the non-verbal conditions of dialogue outline patterns common to Hindu, Buddhist and Jain literary traditions, the essays by Michael Nichols (pp. 173–90) and Brian Black (pp. 243–57) highlight how the topics and modalities of conversation are "calibrated" according to the interlocutors' gender, caste and religious affiliation. Ultimately, the four essays demonstrate how the dialogical genre offers an insight into the negotiation of religious boundaries in Ancient India.

The reader will appreciate how each author draws upon other contributions within the volume to support and nuance his or her argument. The characterization of the literary genre is thus refined through the active scholarly dialogue between the various authors. The contributions respectively and collectively shed light on religious communication in South Asia, thus sharpening the understanding of the dialogical genre and its many shades. Reciprocally, the dialogical proves to be a compelling heuristic approach to unravel threads underlying the formation of literary traditions, their purport and their scope. One example from each section can be cited as an illustration. In her essay Laurie Patton convincingly argues that the reflection about dialogue provides scholars with a valuable perspective to understand the performance of dialogue in Vedic ritual. By underlining how *Gītās*, polemic and doxography are modelled on the structure of dialogue in narrative texts, Andrew J. Nicholson invites scholars to rethink the definition of Indian philosophical texts. Finally, the strategies of accommodating the religious other that Brian Black identifies in ancient Hindu and Buddhist texts offer inspiring examples against which to consider modern debates about religious diversity and plurality.

If one desideratum had to be expressed for the future of the series, it would be the inclusion of media other than the literary one in the exploration of dialogue within and between religious traditions. The concentration on the written and oral media is fully justified in this volume which primarily seeks to study the literary genre of dialogue. Yet one may wonder whether this restriction to the literary might not distort the enquiry into the plurality of South Asian religious identity which the series proposes to undertake. If one assumes, as the editors of the series do, that dialogues shaped not only texts but also rituals and practices, "the dynamic historical and literary mode of analysis" which this book has started to establish is certainly a powerful tool but also potentially one-sided. Visual imageries for instance are often, particularly in ancient India, worthy additional sources to infer testimonies of the encounters between religious groups, their circumstances, their modes, and their consequences.

Yet one should not expect one volume in a newly established series (2012) to answer from the start questions which have far-reaching implications. *Dialogue in Early South Asian Religions. Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain Traditions* fulfils the promises eloquently articulated in the introduction. It engages with an extensive range of literary sources, gives a lucid and rigorous insight into the dialogical genre, and offers an innovative and inspiring theoretical framework within which to consider the multiplicity of South Asian religions and their literary productions.

Jessie Pons
Ruhr University Bochum

PURUSHOTTAMA BILIMORIA and ALEKSANDRA WENTA (eds):
Emotions in Indian Thought-Systems.
x, 287 pp. New Delhi: Routledge, 2015. ISBN 978 1 138 85935 7.
doi:10.1017/S0041977X1600077X

Emotions have a history in South Asia, if hardly anything like an adequate historiography. The editors of this book agree: "much more work … needs to be done to improve our understanding of emotions in India, especially with regard to historical development of emotional experience and the methods of its conceptualization" (p. 1). Any such history will have to be twinned with the history of what we, not always helpfully, call religions, tracked in this book as species of a genus the editors call "Indian thought-systems" in the title, and "pre-modern Indian traditions of knowledge" in the preface (p. ix). The vast South Asian corpus of theoretical literature affords us one of the best sources for the contested descriptions under which emotions can be seen to come into view and change. To that end, this book represents what the editors call "a modest step" (p. 1). Along with love – surely the best-studied emotion in South Asia – the book includes desire, fear, heroism, awe, anger, disgust and "modern" despair. Severally, the papers address many traditions, in not a few languages, periods and places. The step may be modest but the stride is wide.

The path from conference to publication risks a book uneven in focus and unevenly successful. A collection of nine essays stemming from a seminar at the Institute for Advanced Study in Shimla in 2012, this book does not escape the limitations of its genre. The essays that do succeed, however, recommend the book to any serious student of South Asia and emotions in general.

The contributions by Rafaele Torella, Bettina Sharada Bäumer and Aleksandra Wenta are uniformly rewarding, combining exacting philological rigour with