

and crafted design, to comprehend the number of stages and hands the rock goes through before it ends up with its owner, and the complex social, political, and economic contexts in which inkstones – somewhere between art and craft – lie. You feel Ko's empathy for the forgotten figures and her desire to make material the lives of not just the inkstones, but the inkstone makers. For those interested in material culture histories, Chinese art history or Chinese culture more broadly, this is a must-read.

Emily Williams

Xi'an Jiaotong-Liverpool University

JOY LIDU YI:

Yungang: Art, History, Archaeology, Liturgy.

xii, 242 pp. London and New York: Routledge, 2018.

ISBN 978 1 138 04990 1.

doi:10.1017/S0041977X19000223

In this monograph, Joy Lidu Yi combines several tools of analysis – archaeological, textual, iconographic and stylistic – to build up a social art history of the fifth-century CE Buddhist caves of Yungang 雲崗, in Shanxi province. Placing herself in the lineage of Japanese scholars Mizuno Seiichi and Nagahiro Toshio, and the archaeological and typological methodology initiated by Su Bai in the 1950s, Yi chooses to emphasize social motivations when determining the caves' chronology and function, with special attention devoted to sutras translated by the enigmatic Tanyao 曇曜 (pp. 67–8): the *Fufazang yinyuan zhuan* 付法藏因緣傳, the *Zabaozang jing* 雜寶藏經 and the *Dajiyi shenzhou jing* 大吉義神咒經 (p. 69). One can only welcome this effort at correlating a specific literature to the spaces and images, paired with considerations on the role of the patrons and the relative chronology of the caves.

The challenge of delivering a contextual study in a short monograph is met by the structure of the book, with a first chapter clearly laying out the historiography of the topic followed by a second chapter introducing the site, three chapters (3, 4 and 6) for each of the construction phases, and one case study (chapter 5) on the liturgical function of certain caves.

In chapter 1, the author seeks a delicate balance between locating herself in the historiography of the topic or within the community of research that surrounds Yungang and avoiding internal disputes. Still, the literature review could include comparable research on the question of relating text and image in cave temples, with similar methodologies applied to Dunhuang, Kizil and Kucha.

Chapter 2 covers recent archaeological excavations, after first reviewing Japanese digs in the 1940s through to early Chinese digs in the 1970s–90s. One gets a glimpse of the two monasteries above cave 39 and caves 5 and 6, composed of rows of residential cells and a stupa (pp. 32–8). The author argues that freestanding monasteries predate the rock-cut complex, which was thus not meant to introduce Buddhism (p. 11), and the temples above the caves are where the monks lived and translated texts, which explains why Yungang has no vihara cave. The excavations would have been better conveyed by a groundplan, combined with the drone photographs. For the contextual study promised by the author, only two maps are available: Plate 1, a map of Shanxi province with no information on the physical

geography, and Plate 4, a cropped satellite view. Both maps lack a legend and a scale and indicate other cave temple sites not mentioned elsewhere in the book.

In chapter 3, the author, as expected, focuses on the Buddha-ruler identification, with the five Northern Wei imperial caves laid out according to the *Zhao Mu zhi* 昭穆制 procedure for ordering ancestral tablets. Apart from their primary function as a royal family shrine, she argues that the threat of Buddhist persecutions and the coming age of “decline of the law” (*mofa* 末法) motivated the choice of sutras illustrated by the five caves: the *Fufazang yinyuan zhuan*, promoting a succession of Buddhas paralleled with a succession of rulers, and the *Dajiyi shenzhou jing*, promoting the protection of the dharma.

Chapter 4 engages in a tight discussion on the controverted chronology of the second phase caves (summary on p. 103). Dating is reconsidered based on comparisons of the surrounding cliff surface with the dimension and spacing of precedent caves, the presence of imagery derived from texts translated at a known date such as the *Zabaozang jing*, and the political situation, which motivated the recourse to new iconography such as dharma protectors to support the power of the emperor. To the author, the caves are mostly not for meditation and some second phase caves (cave 12, 7, 8) functioned as halls for the reading of scriptures (*jiangjing tang* 讲经堂). The narrative structure of murals and the presence of musicians is related by the author to rituals of *changdao* 唱導 and proselytization rather than circumambulation, image worship or making offerings. She relates the *Tiwei Boli jing* 提謂波利經, a text believed to have originated in Yungang, to images of rebirth and karmic deed.

Finally, in chapter 6, Yi explores the third phase caves. Stemming from the author’s dissertation (2009), the impulse to look at little-studied later niches is laudable and refreshing. The catalogue goes from the most refined examples to caves made after skilled craftsmen moved south to the new capital, Luoyang 洛陽. Here, dry facts are supported with a list of narrative themes paired with the caves’ iconography. Yi expands the definition of the “sinicization” (pp. 174–82), a too-often simplistically used term, by looking at the synchronization of painting and sculpture and their interrelation in the fifth–sixth centuries (pp. 177–8). The author justly criticizes the usual neglect of visual evidence, particularly sculpture and architecture, which are considered as “labour work” in Chinese civilization. The following art-historical narrative, however, essentially argues that painting led the changes in sculpture, with the latter compensating for the lack of material evidence of the former’s evolution, still complying with the hierarchy of the arts in Chinese connoisseurship. Generally, the book favours local influence over long-distance imports, with parallels made with the Shaling 沙嶺 tomb murals (p. 40) or clay models of tents from the Yanbei shiyuan 雁北師院 tombs (pp. 55–6), but the list of artefacts excavated in Yungang remains schematic (p. 34).

While Professor Yi justly deplores the lack of understanding about the cave makers’ scientific ingenuity, the book provides little technological analysis. Apart from a few judicious remarks (pp. 98–9) and citations (p. 66), observations on the excavation process of caves are vague (pp. 32, 36), with obscure terminology (p. 113: “there is a *dapuo* (打破) spatial relationship between the niches”). Generally, more consistency is needed when translating descriptive terms from academic literature in Chinese language. While key terms that refer to cave typologies or sculptural styles are useful, some paraphrases (p. 47) or descriptions such as “drapery ... forming an angular 八” (p. 161) are incomprehensible for the English reader. If bilingual terminology is necessary, it should be applied throughout the book (pp. 134, 140).

Overall, the author successfully addresses the challenge of compressing several decades of scholarship, ongoing debates and a decade of personal study on a

huge topic into little more than 200 pages. Joy Lidu Yi took over the thankless task of dealing with “traditional scholarship” on the chronology, typology and stylistic classification of the caves, providing English-language readers with an updated view of the last decade of scholarship in Japanese and Chinese. Strong methodological points are her attention to relating word and image, and her emphasis on social history. Particularly innovative aspects of the book with respect to the study of Yungang are the proposal to look at *changdao* as liturgical functions for some of the caves and the report on third phase caves, which may be the basis for further study.

Lia Wei
Renmin University of China

SUK-YOUNG KIM:

K-pop Live: Fans, Idols, and Multimedia Performance.
xi, 275 pp. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2018.
ISBN 978 150360599 2.
doi:10.1017/S0041977X19000211

Kim’s superbly crafted text is a worthy addition to the rapidly mushrooming literature on contemporary Korean pop music. Destined to be celebrated much as was her earlier account of theatre, film and everyday performance in North Korea, *Illusive Utopia* (Ann Arbor, University of Michigan Press, 2010), her new account benefits from access to a rich, fluid and diverse research environment in, and beyond, her native South Korea. She has interviewed producers, performers and consumers, worked on a BuzzFeed video series on K-pop, as a journalist, and as a panelist at K-pop fan events. Her data is brought together within a framework grounded in cultural/critical studies, media studies, and performance/theatre studies. Her central theme is “liveness”. She explores how pop artists have been transformed since the beginning of the new millennium from singers to all-round entertainers. They are encountered primarily online but, in keeping with contemporary hyper-consumerism, much effort is expended to transform their 2D images viewed on an iPhone or computer screen into something more affective and intimate. Hence, she takes in Seoul’s physical shrines to K-pop (SM Town and Klive), the development of hologram technology that renders distant idols as interactive, 3D, human beings, and the live concert scene. Concerts function as fan meetings rather than music performances. Being a fan requires considerable financial investment and, to our selfie generation, it involves self-promotion as tweeting and retweeting turns “the fleeting present into already documented memories from the past”, luring us “into the fuzzy matrix of liveness” (p. 202). However, fans are made involuntary actors by the manipulative workings of companies trying to maximize their own profits, while K-pop is used by the Korean government not in its own right, but as a way to spice up the exports of more mundane industrial products.

Korean pop music has become an international phenomenon. Although hardly considered in *K-pop Live*, foundations were laid in the early 1990s, as pop was transformed from a conservative local product by absorbing and assimilating genres ranging from rap through reggae to hip-hop. By 1996, it had begun to move from the aural – and the physical products of the recorded music industry – to visual spectacle, as the rise in satellite and cable TV encouraged dance routines within