

Braun's first case study covers familiar territory in the Fingoland, Gcalekaland, and Tembuland Districts in what used to be known as the Transkei. This has been worked over in terms of frontier warfare, mission history, the House of Phalo, and the Glen Grey Act. Braun gets beyond the obvious faults and injustices of the Glen Grey Act and shows how difficult it was to implement. Even efforts to get white settlers to take up designated sections of land foundered on the rocks of expense and defiance. Colonial treasurers soon discovered that they could fill their coffers more efficiently through hut taxes on communal lands than through sale of surveyed titles and collection of quitrents.

No such scruples applied north of the Orange River in the nineteenth century. From the time of Voortrekkers, the Boer Republics had little need of surveyors to back their claims to everything. They simply declared all land available for sale to white settlers, many of whom never visited the farms they acquired through 'inspections' that consisted of marking out quadrilateral sections by riding a horse for a designated period north, east, south, and west. Africans did not need to be erased from maps on which they had never appeared. Here again, however, Braun shows that enforcing rights to their lands was as difficult for the Transvaal Republic as in any other thickly populated part of Southern Africa. His study of contests for control over land in the Venda-held Zoutpansberg range is the best yet made of this previously neglected terrain. Venda kings Makhado and Mphephu held their own right into the twentieth century. In fact, this section of the book deserves to stand alongside the previous kingdom histories of Delius, Bonner, Cobbing, Guy, and Peires. It is richly documented with reference to all the available sources.

It is understandable but a pity that Braun could not extend his work to the whole of Southeast Africa. It would be particularly helpful to bring KwaZulu-Natal into the comparative framework, building on previous research into the large locations, the rent farmers, the African land-buying syndicates, the Mission Reserves devised by George Grey, and the workings of the Natal Native Trust. Indeed, Braun's template for research could be usefully applied almost everywhere, even by scholars less conversant with the black arts of the surveyor.

NORMAN ETHERINGTON
University of Western Australia

NO LONGER AT EASE

Accented Futures: Language Activism and the Ending of Apartheid.

By Carli Coetzee.

Johannesburg: Wits University Press, 2013. Pp. xvi + 182. \$34.95/R290, paperback (ISBN 978-186814740-3).

doi:10.1017/S0021853716000475

Key Words: South Africa, arts, education, linguistics, literature, violence.

In *Accented Futures: Language Activism and the Ending of Apartheid*, Carli Coetzee explores the 'enduring ending' (p. ix) of apartheid in South Africa, conceptualized as an ongoing process. She theorizes two possible responses to this enduring ending, which

she terms ‘accenting’ and ‘translation’. Accenting, in her understanding, means cultivating ways of thinking and engagement that ‘are aware of the legacies of the past, and do not attempt to empty out the conflicts and violence under the surface’ (p. x). Accenting is an activist task that embraces conflict and disagreement as a necessary part of the work that must be done to eventually bring about the long ending of apartheid – work that includes academic writing and teaching, but also extends beyond the academic domain.

Accenting is presented as an alternative to ‘translation’. Translation is frequently viewed as enabling communication across linguistic and cultural divides, promoting equality and reconciliation. Coetzee’s aim is to expose the fallacy of translation as benevolent, equalizing, and conciliatory, instead drawing attention ‘to translation’s silencing effects and to the enduring effects of early translation practices in South Africa’ (p. xiv). A substantial body of theoretical and empirical work in translation studies has demonstrated how translation is profoundly imbricated in structures of power; relationships of power direct the movement of translation, privileging the linguistic and cultural representations of dominant languages and cultures, and effacing the linguistic and cultural difference of less powerful languages and cultures.

Lawrence Venuti has theorised this argument extensively, contending that in translation from minor to major languages, the expectation of fluency (in other words, conformance to the expectations of the receiving culture and language) serves to remove traces of difference in the text, violently domesticating it to the purposes of the dominant, receiving culture. In contrast, Venuti promotes resistant translation strategies – strategies that disrupt the expectation of fluency. Coetzee’s view of translation echoes that of Venuti’s domesticating, fluent translation, and her argument in favour of accenting shows much overlap with the ethical project of foreignisation:

Therefore this book makes an argument against translation in contexts where being ‘understood’ is not to the advantage of the speaker. Resisting translation, and being misunderstood, can be powerful tools for bringing about transformation. Such instances of challenging and deliberately difficult discourses are what I regard as ideally ‘accented’. (p. xi)

The book comprises ten chapters. The first chapter sets out Coetzee’s position against translation, and in favor of accent, from a theoretical perspective. The subsequent chapters range across a number of case studies that examine a variety of texts, artworks, and artefacts as well as the discursive practices that shape (and are shaped by) the texts. These discursive practices are most frequently placed in contexts of learning and teaching, in particular the university, since part of Coetzee’s argument aims to demonstrate how accenting is an essential component of the South African teaching and learning environment.

The texts analyzed include a wide range of contemporary written texts (and their readings) including Antjie Krog, Nosisi Mpolweni, and Kopano Ratele’s *There Was This Goat: Investigating the Truth Commission Testimony of Notrose Nobomvu Konile* (2009); the essays of Njabulo Ndebele collected in *Rediscovery of the Ordinary* (1991) and *Fine Lines From the Box* (2007); *Three Letter Plague* (Johnny Steinberg, 2009); *Native Nostalgia* by Jacob Dlamini (2009); and, the scholarly and creative work of Zoë Wicomb and J. M. Coetzee. It also moves beyond the written text in its concern with visual texts and the discourses surrounding them, including both art and art history and (dubbed

and subtitled) film. Coetzee's interests are not only contemporary. In Chapter Five she presents an analysis of early translation practices at the Cape, finding that '[i]nstead of the mutuality and equality promised by translation encounters, we find instead examples of unequal language contact, and asymmetries which have remained as dominant features of the South African multilingual landscape' (p. 79). There is a personal, reflective strand woven throughout the book devoted to her own experiences with accented teaching practices.

Coetzee presents an important argument about the importance of actively engaging with conflict and difference, relevant to current concerns in South Africa. The range of analyses and diversity of topics presented is one of the strengths of the book. The fine-grained analyses produce reflective readings of considerable depth – even if one might find some cause for disagreement with them. For the most part, the central focus on the concepts of accenting and translation provides a sufficient degree of conceptual coherence to tie the diverse analyses together, allowing the reader to see the diverse forms that accenting may take: the refusal to be translated; the recovery of hidden language histories; the cultural reframing of narratives of disease; and, the insistence on living at difficult multilingual intersections rather than submitting to the easy homogeneity of translation. The concern with teaching and learning is another consolidating theme, where accented practices are seen as part of the work of both teacher and student, both writer and reader. A recurrent attention to situatedness, involving a focus on the notion of 'address' (simultaneously both the *place* where one speaks *from* and the *audience* one speaks *to*), is another thread that runs through the book. Despite this, some sections of the book appear somewhat fragmentary and disjointed: the latter part of the book is a collection of loosely-connected essays rather than a sustained argument.

As a translation scholar, I have some theoretical reservations as well. Coetzee's thinking echoes that of prominent scholars in translation studies, yet her engagement with theorisation from within that field is scant, and does not reflect the breadth or depth of the ways the discipline has taken up questions similar to those that concern her. Furthermore, Coetzee makes little reference to the work of South African translation scholars, many of whom have theorised the question of identity and translation in African contexts. At some points in the text, this leads to a characterization of 'translation' in South Africa that appears at odds with reality. For example, the statement that 'translation nowadays, in official contexts in South Africa, predominantly happens into English, out of other South African languages' (p. 5) is highly contestable. Many analyses of South African publishing have demonstrated precisely the inverse: English and Afrikaans dominate the publishing landscape as languages of original text production, while publishing in the African languages relies heavily on translation from English. Her emphasis on 'official contexts' neglects the multiple, complex ways in which translation functions in the informal contexts of development in South Africa. This does not necessarily invalidate Coetzee's argument, but certainly raises some questions about the notion of 'translation' that is the foil for the central concept of accenting.

Despite these points of criticism, *Accented Futures* is a challenging and provocative set of readings of South African culture that foregrounds the importance of difference and conflict as part of activist writing, reading, learning, and teaching practices in the ongoing work

of bringing about the ending of apartheid. As such it is a necessary, unsettling, difficult antidote to comfortably anodyne versions of post-apartheid South Africa.

HAIDEE KRUGER

Macquarie University and North-West University

DOCUMENTING VIOLENCE

Daniel J. Danielsen and the Congo: Missionary Campaigns and Atrocity Photographs.

By Óli Jacobsen.

Ayrshire, Scotland: Brethren Archivists and Historians Network, 2014. Pp. 200. No price given, paperback (ISBN 978-0-9570177-4-0).

doi:10.1017/S0021853716000487

Key Words: Zaire, archives, labour, missions, violence.

Daniel J. Danielsen (1871–1916) was a pioneer of the Brethren movement in the Faroe Islands. Earlier in his career, between 1901 and 1903, he served as an engineer and lay preacher for the Congo Balolo Mission (CBM), a British-run organization that recruited missionaries from Hartley College, London, to serve in various stations in King Leopold II of Belgium's Congo Free State. He also steered the ship that took Roger Casement on his famous consular tour of investigation, which confirmed the widespread existence of colonial abuses in the Upper Congo in 1903. Casement's report initiated the events that would lead to Belgian annexation of the territory in 1908. As its title makes clear, Óli Jacobsen's book is mainly focused on the central African part of Danielsen's career, though a shorter second section covers his missionary work in the Faroe Islands. This review centers on Part One, 'Congo Missionary and Campaigner' and its accompanying appendices.

Jacobsen brings to light Danielsen's role in the emergence of the Congo reform movement. The book makes two main 'discoveries' that are likely to be of interest to historians of the Congo Free State and the campaign against it. First, Danielsen took some of the most famous 'atrocity photographs', photographs that were subsequently attributed to other British missionaries. Jacobsen convincingly suggests that the Congo reformers deliberately attributed these images to other more respectable missionaries rather than to Danielsen, who left the Congo under the accusation of violent treatment of African workers on his steamship. Second, Danielsen held the earliest public meetings – in Scotland and the Faroes – to raise public awareness of colonial abuses. The book is not without other insights; Jacobson reveals that *Bokwala: The Story of a Congo Victim* (1910), an anonymous anti-Leopoldian propaganda text promoted as the *Uncle Tom's Cabin* of the day by Congo reformers, had been authored by missionary Lily Ruskin. Jacobsen's slim volume is lavished with eighty illustrations, and though many are low resolution and some are of questionable relevance, others are rarely seen in print. Scholars of Casement will find insights in the chapter about his 1903 tour.

Even within its modest confines the book has limitations. There are a number of typographical errors and occasional misspellings. Unfortunately, several endnotes for