

case with Lemass's emphasis on the role that the state could play in job creation through its fiscal policies. Savage mentions Lemass's Clery's Hotel speech in 1955 calling for the creation of 100,000 new jobs which Whitaker would subsequently damn as 'simple Keynesianism'. A more critical approach to Lemass's economic legacy would point to the legacy of fiscal profligacy that produced the disastrous budget deficits of the late 1970s.

The two strongest chapters in the book with are those on Northern Ireland and on the Catholic Church. Savage was not able to consult David McCann's monograph on Unionist governments and North–South relations (David McCann, *From protest to pragmatism: The Unionist government and North–South Relations 1959–72*, (Basingstoke, 2014)). If he had, his overview might have been more sceptical of those who have claimed that Lemass's approach to Northern Ireland was a radical shift from de Valera. Although commentators at the time and since were impressed by his emphasis on building relations with Stormont through practical schemes of economic and social cooperation, the fact remains that he continued to periodically sound more traditionalist notes. The Tralee speech in July 1963 in which he admitted that Unionists had legitimate fears that had to be conciliated is given as a key instance of revisionism. However, as Savage points out, this has to be balanced against a subsequent speech in Washington where he raised partition and called on the British government to make a statement 'that there would be no British interest in maintaining partition when Irishmen wanted to get rid of it' (p. 55).

In his conclusion Savage claims that such a statement was eventually accepted by the British and endorsed in the Sunningdale Agreement – wrongly dated as 1971 (p. 124). In fact there was a major difference. Lemass was looking for a statement from the British welcoming the ending of partition by agreement between the main political traditions on the island. In the Northern Ireland Act of 1973 and at Sunningdale, the U.K. government's position was that Northern Ireland would not cease to be part of the U.K. without the vote of a majority of its population. Lemass in the 1960s, like John Hume and Gerry Adams in the 1990s, wanted more than this: for the British to become 'persuaders' of the Unionists for a united Ireland. Thus despite his historic summit with Terence O'Neill in 1965, Lemass's legacy on Northern Ireland was far from uniformly revisionist.

One of strengths of the book, apart from Savage's sure-footed survey of the academic literature and the main historiographical issues, are the gems from his own archival research which leads him to astringent judgements of the Irish state which was seeking to incorporate the Unionists. In his excellent analysis of how the clerical iron fist was wielded against the Fianna Fáil Health Bill in 1952, he points out that Ulster Protestants had good reason to fear that their religious liberties would not be respected in a united Ireland. He also reveals that Unionist paranoia about 'Romanist penetration' of the border counties of Northern Ireland had some support in the pressure of the papal nuncio on the government in 1959 to support a fund to clandestinely support the Catholic acquisition of land in Northern Ireland and ultimately out-breed Protestants (p. 42).

Overall this is an excellent introduction to a pivotal figure in modern Irish history.

doi: 10.1017/ihs.2015.45

HENRY PATTERSON

School of Criminology, Sociology and Politics, Ulster University

hpatterson47@gmail.com

IRISH RELIGIOUS CONFLICT IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE: CATHOLICS, PROTESTANTS AND MUSLIMS. Edited by John Wolffe. Pp xi, 280. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan. 2014. £60.

In this collection of essays, editor John Wolffe introduces a new breadth to his many studies of religion and its role in society, particularly the relationship between faith and

national identity. Reaching beyond historical Catholic/Protestant conflicts, this volume explores how these Christian experiences compare to contemporary Christian/Muslim relations, and considers whether analysis of the past can provide lessons for dealing with current religious friction. The continuing influence of religion in social and political life calls into question the nature and impact of secularisation, suggesting that a more complex process is at work than that reflected in popular and political discourse.

The book is divided into three sections, moving out from the mainstream religious divisions of Irish society to contextualise them from a European perspective and finally to explore the similarities and continuities between their sectarian expression and the Islamophobia which has come to dominate today's headlines.

The opening chapters focus on how attitudes to religion relate to formulations of national identity. Nicola Morris and David Tombs's historical approach traces the shift from the Protestant churches' apparently 'robust' (though actually incomplete) support for the Ulster Covenant in 1912 to their more ambivalent response a century later, when what authority remained was focused on managing the outbreaks of sectarianism carried out in their name. Jennifer Todd's comparison of religious identity in the two political jurisdictions of Ireland demonstrates 'profound differences' in how the interrelationship between national, state and religious identity are continued, negotiated and adapted. Although institutional religious allegiance may be in decline, these studies confirm that local social and political dynamics, underpinned by historical narratives, encourage 'individuals to use religious concepts and repertoires to inform other interests and to understand other divisions' (pp 55–6). In chapter three Gladys Ganiel suggests a key reconciliatory role for Christian activists unconstrained by the limited power of bureaucratic religious institution. While the work carried out by Corrymeela and the Irish School of Ecumenics is encouraging, I find it difficult to see how such moral authority could be effectively disseminated. Francis Stewart's example of the spontaneous, unofficial approach to peacebuilding provided by Punk Rock is refreshing and interesting, though again difficult to envisage on a wider cross-generational, as opposed to cross-cultural, scale.

Building on the analyses of Irish religio-political interactions provided by the first two chapters, the second section examines 'how cleavages of nationalism and religion reinforced each other' (p. 99) in different parts of Europe. Brian Walker sets the scene with a critique of academia's 'restrictive intellectual assumptions about the role of religion in politics' (p. 94), a view reflected in Stewart Brown's examination of the religious sanction given to communal violence in Scotland. Shane Nagle's study of the central role of religion in the construction of national history in post-Reformation Germany again demonstrates its potency as a 'mechanism for "othering"', whether within or outside the boundaries of the nation (p. 142). Joseph Ruane compares the experiences of Protestant minorities in the Gard Department of France and County Cork in Ireland to further explore the role of ethnicity and colonialism in determining attitudes and experience. While demonstrating the persistent influence of religion on political choices, this section also highlights the complex and sensitive approach necessary in disentangling the interacting social and cultural factors embroiled in national narratives.

The final chapters, complementing the structure of earlier sections, applies these comparative, historical and sociological methodologies to the impact of Islam. Humanayun Ansari's discussion of the failures of cultural assimilation, past and present, sets the scene, arguing the need for a 'continued process of mutual engagement' between religious groupings to counter the hostility and oversimplification of post-9/11 rhetoric. While Philip Lewis continues this theme, pointing to how 'issues of industrialization, poverty and racism became conflated with fears of Islam, Muslims and the so-called "War on Terror"' (p. 193), his analyses of recent bridge-building projects provide tentative but potentially positive glimpses of ways forward. The 'culturally destabilizing' effect of secularization in Britain and the Netherlands is the focus for David Herbert, and with Katy Scrogin providing a comparative analysis of historic anti-Catholicism and contemporary Islamophobia in America, it is clear that,

despite commonalities and continuities, for those engaging in such comparative research there is 'no substitute for good, local, contextualized knowledge' (p. 205).

The volume is introduced and concluded by Professor Wolffe, the opening chapter providing an over-arching historical and theoretical context – a rationale for the study that certainly makes a timely contribution to the debates generated by recent events and the responses to them. The conclusion largely focuses on the search for more positive relations between those of different faiths, with academics themselves given a central role. For example, Wolffe urges historians 'to balance fascination with conflict to give greater attention to conflict resolution and peace building' (p. 249), a task which, while no doubt worthy, would require a significant shift in academic mindsets. He argues that, as the chapters in this volume demonstrate, historians and sociologists alike could work towards a more contextualized understanding of religious history, greater religious literacy, mutual engagement between those of different faiths and a more sophisticated approach to diverse migrant compositions. Moreover, as he suggests, to render such work more accessible to wider constituencies would be an important step forward. By exploring the rich cultural heritages of a range of nation states, this attractive and accessible volume confirms the role of religion, past and present, as significant but complex, with shifting narratives and a wide range of socio-political contexts ensuring that their disentanglement will continue to occupy the minds of those seeking a more harmonious future.

doi: 10.1017/ihs.2015.46

MYRTLE HILL

School of History and Anthropology, Queens University Belfast
myrtle.hill@me.com

NEITHER UNIONIST NOR NATIONALIST: THE 10TH IRISH DIVISION IN THE GREAT WAR. By Stephen Sandford. Pp. xviii, 318, illus. Sallins: Irish Academic Press. 2015. €65.

From their assumed connections with the Irish Volunteers and Ulster Volunteer Force, both the 16th and 36th Divisions have attracted academic and popular attention. The 10th (Irish) Division actually entered battle earlier – at Suvla on the Gallipoli peninsula – than either the 16th or 36th Divisions, yet has been comparatively neglected. In part, as Stephen Sandford's new study demonstrates, this was not only because the 10th Division had no obvious sectarian affinity, but also through its resemblance to other Kitchener divisions, notwithstanding its inclusion of battalions from all eight nominally Irish regiments. Indeed, Sandford profitably draws parallels between the 10th and another of those in 'K1', the 13th (Western) Division. As the 10th had to be made up with a battalion of the Hampshire Regiment, and received significant drafts of English recruits – particularly from Wiltshire – it does certainly resemble the haphazard process of recruiting the New Armies that has emerged from other studies in recent years. There was even a 'Pals' element in the 7th Royal Dublin Fusiliers drawn from the Irish Rugby Football Union although most Irish recruits were unskilled.

Rather in the manner of Richard Grayson for West Belfast, Sandford has used census material and medal rolls rather than *Soldiers died in the Great War* (1919) to identify those serving in the 10th Division, as well as surviving service records. There are almost thirty pages of statistical appendices. With regard to those Irishmen serving in the division, it enables Sandford to challenge the existing interpretation of Irish recruitment patterns in 1914 by earlier historians such as Patrick Callan and, especially, David Fitzgerald in terms of earlier suggestions of motivation derived from assumed social composition. Detailed scrutiny of the division's officers also leads Sandford to showing that Cooper's old history of the 10th at Gallipoli, published in 1918, was quite wrong in claiming 90 per cent of the officers were Irish. In reality, it was somewhere between 67 and 74 per cent, with a surprising number of those who were Irish being