

Notes

1 Introduction: a Catholic composer in the age of Bismarck

- 1 E.g. William M. Johnston, *The Austrian Mind: An Intellectual and Social History 1848–1938* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1972), pp. 134–5.
- 2 ‘Bruckners gründerzeitliche Monumentale Symphonie: Reflexionen zur Heteronomie kompositorischer Praxis’, in *Musik-Konzepte 23/24: Anton Bruckner*, ed. Heinz-Klaus Metzger and Rainer Riehn (Munich, 1982), p. 88.
- 3 Constantín Floros, ‘On Unity between Bruckner’s Personality and Production’, in *PAB*, p. 286.
- 4 *Ibid.*, pp. 286–8, citing Erwin Ringel, ‘Psychogram für Anton Bruckner’, in *Bruckner-Symposion, ‘Bruckner, Liszt, Mahler und die Moderne’ (Linz 1977): Bericht*, ed. Franz Grasberger (Linz, 1978), pp. 19–26.
- 5 Martin Geck, *Von Beethoven bis Mahler: die Musik des deutschen Idealismus* (Stuttgart, 1993), pp. 386–7; see the reservations of Manfred Wagner, *Anton Bruckner: Werk und Leben* (Vienna, 1995), pp. 70–3.
- 6 Peter Gülke, *Brahms, Bruckner: zwei Studien* (Kassel, 1989), p. 88. For a consideration of Bruckner’s ‘necrophilia’ from a more mundane Austrian perspective, see Elisabeth Maier, ‘A Hidden Personality: Access to an “Inner Biography” of Anton Bruckner’, in *BS*, p. 51.
- 7 See Frederic Morton, *A Nervous Splendour: Vienna 1888/1889* (London, 1979), pp. 18–20, 44–5, 97–8, 276–8, and 295.
- 8 Nagler, ‘Bruckners gründerzeitliche Monumentale Symphonie’, pp. 96–101.
- 9 Gülke, *Brahms, Bruckner*, pp. 91–4.
- 10 Pieter M. Judson, ‘Rethinking the Liberal Legacy’, in *Rethinking Vienna 1900*, ed. Stephen Beller (New York and Oxford, 2001), p. 61.
- 11 Geck, *Von Beethoven bis Mahler*, pp. 381–5.
- 12 *Ibid.*, pp. 383–4; Nagler, ‘Bruckners gründerzeitliche Monumentale Symphonie’, pp. 104–10. ‘Gründerzeit’ denotes the period of industrialized expansion that began in the mid 1860s in Germany and Austria.
- 13 Gülke, *Brahms, Bruckner*, pp. 102–3.
- 14 Nagler, ‘Bruckners gründerzeitliche Monumentale Symphonie’, pp. 101 and 112–13; Gülke, *Brahms, Bruckner*, p. 94.
- 15 James Shedel, ‘*Fin de Siècle* or *Jahrhundertwende*? The Question of an Austrian *Sonderweg*’, in *Rethinking Vienna 1900*, p. 83.
- 16 Nagler, ‘Bruckners gründerzeitliche Monumentale Symphonie’, p. 97; Morton maintains that Bruckner was ‘no anti-Semite’ in spite of his connections to Schönerer: *A Nervous Splendour*, p. 162. For a biographer who concludes that the exclusively ‘religious’ nature of Bruckner’s anti-Semitism was ‘harmless’, see Karl Grebe, *Anton Bruckner* (Reinbek bei Hamburg, 1995), p. 66. For the degree to which Bruckner remains concealed behind his friends and biographers over the Vincent affair, see Maier, ‘A Hidden Personality’, pp. 46–7.
- 17 Judson, ‘Rethinking the Liberal Legacy’, p. 68.
- 18 Shedel, ‘*Fin de Siècle* or *Jahrhundertwende*?’, pp. 97–9.
- 19 Péter Hanák, *The Garden and the Workshop: Essays on the Cultural History of Vienna and Budapest* (Princeton, NJ, 1998), p. 174.
- 20 John W. Boyer, *Political Radicalism in Late Imperial Vienna: Origins of the Christian Social Movement, 1848–1897* (Chicago and London, 1981), pp. 77 and 122.
- 21 *Ibid.*, p. 78.
- 22 Ulrike Tanzer, ‘Anti-clericalism in Literary Journalism of the Liberal Era: Ferdinand Kürnberger, Friedrich Schöllgl, Daniel Spitzer and Ludwig Anzengruber’, in *Catholicism and Austrian Culture*, ed. Ritchie Robertson and Judith Beniston (Edinburgh, 1999), pp. 65–78; Lucian Hölscher, ‘The Religious Divide: Piety in Nineteenth-century Germany’, in *Protestants, Catholics and Jews in Germany, 1800–1914*, ed. Helmut Walser Smith (Oxford and New York, 2001), p. 46.
- 23 Boyer, *Political Radicalism*, pp. 31 and 137.
- 24 Monika Glettlér, ‘Die *Monarchia Austriaca* und die deutsche Musik’, in *Anton Bruckner: Tradition und Fortschritt in der Kirchenmusik des 19. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Friedrich W. Riedel (Sinzig, 2001), pp. 29–46.
- 25 See Wolfgang Altgeld, ‘Religion, Denomination and Nationalism in Nineteenth-Century Germany’, in *Protestants, Catholics and Jews*, pp. 49–65.

- 26 'Students and Friends as "Prophets" and "Promoters": the Reception of Bruckner's Works in the *Wiener Akademischer Wagner-Verein*', in *PAB*, pp. 317–27.
- 27 'The Annexation of Anton Bruckner: Nazi Revisionism and the Politics of Appropriation', *MQ* 78 (1994), 584–604; reprinted in *BS*, pp. 72–90.
- 28 Erwin Doernberg, *The Life and Symphonies of Anton Bruckner* (London, 1960), p. 122; Benjamin M. Korstvedt, "Return to the Pure Sources": the Ideology and Text-Critical Legacy of the First Bruckner *Gesamtausgabe*', in *BS*, pp. 91–109; Günter Brosche, 'Ideologische Einflüsse auf das Nachleben Anton Bruckners', in *Österreichische Musik – Musik in Österreich. Theophil Antonicek zum 60. Geburtstag*, ed. Elisabeth Theresia Hilscher (Tutzing, 1998), pp. 451–61; Christa Brüstle, 'Politisch-ideologische Implikationen der ersten Bruckner-Gesamtausgabe', in *B-P*, pp. 192–201.
- 29 Manfred Wagner, 'Response to Bryan Gilliam regarding Bruckner and National Socialism', *MQ* 80 (1996), 118–23.
- 30 Leon Botstein, 'Music and Ideology: Thoughts on Bruckner', *MQ* 80 (1996), 1–11.
- 31 Glettler, 'Die *Monarchia Austriaca* und die deutsche Musik', pp. 45–6; Bryan Gilliam, 'Bruckner's Annexation Revisited: a Response to Manfred Wagner', *MQ* 80 (1996), 126–8.
- 32 Gilliam, 'Bruckner's Annexation Revisited', 129.
- 33 Botstein, 'Music and Ideology', p. 9.
- 34 *Ibid.*
- 35 Thomas Leibnitz, *Die Brüder Schalk und Anton Bruckner: dargestellt an den Nachlassbeständen der Musiksammlung der Österreichischen Nationalbibliothek* (Tutzing, 1988).
- 36 Thomas Leibnitz, 'Anton Bruckner and "German Music": Josef Schalk and the Establishment of Bruckner as a National Composer', in *PAB*, pp. 328–40.
- 37 Gilliam, 'Bruckner's Annexation Revisited', 130.
- 38 Botstein, 'Music and Ideology', 10; Benjamin M. Korstvedt, 'Anton Bruckner in the Third Reich and After: An Essay on Ideology and Bruckner Reception', *MQ* 80 (1996), 149 and 159.
- 39 See Richard Taruskin, *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance* (New York and Oxford, 1995), pp. 164–72.
- 40 Wagner, 'Response to Bryan Gilliam', 120.
- 41 Geck, *Von Beethoven bis Mahler*, pp. 384–5; Albrecht von Massow, 'Anachronismus als Moderne: zur Eigenart eines kompositorischen Prinzips in der Musik Anton Bruckners', in *B-P*, pp. 156–57.
- 42 Michael Bringmann, 'Kirchliche Monumentalarchitektur im späten 19. Jahrhundert', in *Anton Bruckner: Tradition und Fortschritt*, pp. 49–51.
- 43 Winfried Kirsch, 'Anmerkungen zu einem Spätwerk: Anton Bruckners 150. Psalm', in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung (Walter Wiora zum 30. Dezember 1986)*, ed. Christoph-Helmut Mahling (Tutzing, 1988), p. 98.
- 44 Ilona Sármany-Parsons, 'Religious Art and Modernity in the Austro-Hungarian Empire around 1900', in *Catholicism and Austrian Culture*, p. 95.
- 45 'Volksconcerte in Vienna and Late Nineteenth-Century Ideology of the Symphony', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 50 (1997), 426–39.

2 Musical life in Upper Austria in the mid-nineteenth century

- 1 For the church music repertoire in St. Florian see Walter Pass, 'Studie über Bruckners ersten St. Florianer Aufenthalt', in *Bruckner-Studien*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1975), pp. 13–42.
- 2 *Göll-A*, I, p. 141.
- 3 See Franz Zamazal, 'Johann Baptist Schiedermayr: ein Vorgänger Bruckners als Linzer Dom- und Stadtpfarrorganist', in *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Musikstadt Linz – Musikland Oberösterreich' (Linz 1990): Bericht*, ed. Othmar Wessely et al. (Linz, 1993), pp. 119–60.
- 4 Othmar Wessely, 'Das Linzer Musikleben in der ersten Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts', *Jahrbuch der Stadt Linz* (1953), 205.
- 5 *Göll-A*, I, p. 164.
- 6 See Walter Deutsch, 'Eine Ländlersammlung aus Windhaag', in *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Bruckner und die Musik der Romantik' (Linz 1987): Bericht*, ed. Renate Grasberger et al. (Linz, 1989), pp. 120–52; Othmar Wessely, 'Zu Bruckners Windhaager Jahren', in *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Anton Bruckner – Persönlichkeit und Werk' (Linz 1992): Bericht*, ed. Renate Grasberger et al. (Linz, 1995), pp. 49–56.
- 7 Friedrich Eckstein, *Alte unennbare Tage: Erinnerungen an siebzig Lehr- und Wanderjahre* (Vienna, 1935; repr. Vienna, 1988), p. 156.
- 8 See Elisabeth Maier and Franz Zamazal, *Anton Bruckner und Leopold von Zenetti* (Graz, 1980).
- 9 Letter of 30 July 1852, in *H-SI*, p. 2.

- 10 Letter from Ferdinand Ruckenstein, 17 December 1855, in *H-SI*, p. 5.
- 11 *Linzer Zeitung*, 19 September 1867.
- 12 *Linzer Zeitung*, 27 July 1858, p. 669 quoted from the *Wiener Zeitung*.
- 13 *Linzer Zeitung*, 3 December 1861, p. 1165, quoted from the *Wiener Zeitung*.
- 14 Letter to the Linzer Musikverein, 6 November 1863, in *H-SI*, p. 39.
- 15 Letter to Rudolf Weinwurm, 7 June 1860, in *H-SI*, p. 18.
- 16 Letter to Rudolf Weinwurm, 10 February 1861, in *H-SI*, p. 21.
- 17 *Linzer Zeitung*, 30 November 1864.
- 18 *Linzer Zeitung*, 20 December 1864.
- 19 See Andrea Harrandt, “Vivat! Und nochmals Vivat!”: Rudolf Weinwurm und sein Preischor *Germania*, in *Österreichische Musik – Musik in Österreich: Beiträge zur Musikgeschichte Mitteleuropas (Theophil Antonicek zum 60. Geburtstag)*, ed. Elisabeth Theresia Hilscher (Tutzing, 1998), pp. 385–94.
- 20 *Linzer Zeitung*, 8 June 1865.
- 21 Letter to Rudolf Weinwurm, 18 October 1864, in *H-SI*, p. 47.
- 22 Letter to the Dom-Musikverein, Salzburg, 22 June 1861, in *H-SI*, p. 24.
- 23 Letter to Rudolf Weinwurm, 29 January 1865, in *H-SI*, p. 51.
- 24 Letter to Anton M. Storch, 11 December 1866, in *H-SI*, p. 64.
- 25 Letter to Johann Herbeck, 30 April 1866, in *H-SI*, p. 55.
- 26 Letter from Johann Herbeck to Bruckner, 10 June 1868, in *H-SI*, p. 89.
- 27 Letter to Hans von Bülow, 20 June 1868, in *H-SI*, p. 91.
- 28 Letter from Johann Herbeck to Bruckner, 20 June 1868, in *H-SI*, p. 92.
- 29 Letter to the Episcopal Ordinariate, Linz, 24 July 1868, in *H-SI*, pp. 93–4.
- 30 *Alpenbote*, 24 September 1868.
- 31 *Linzer Zeitung*, 7 April 1868.
- 32 *Linzer Zeitung*, 13 May 1868.
- 33 Letter from Alois Weinwurm to Bruckner, 8 November 1868, in *H-SI*, p. 98.
- 3 Bruckner in Vienna**
- 1 *Linzer Zeitung*, 14 February 1867, quoted from the *Fremdenblatt*.
- 2 Letter to Moritz von Mayfeld, 13 July 1869, in *H-SI*, p. 110.
- 3 Management of the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde to Bruckner, 15 January 1891.
- 4 Letter to the Ministry for Culture and Education, 11 May 1870, in *H-SI*, p. 117.
- 5 Letter to Moritz von Mayfeld, 13 February 1875, in *H-SI*, p. 154.
- 6 Letter of Johann E. Habert to Bernhard Deubler, 22 October 1890, in *H2*, no. 901022.
- 7 *Neue Freie Presse*, 11 January 1870.
- 8 *Vaterland*, 20 June 1872.
- 9 See Andrea Harrandt, ‘Students and Friends as “Prophets” and “Promoters”’: The Reception of Bruckner’s Works in the *Wiener Akademischer Wagner-Verein*, in *PAB*, pp. 317–27.
- 10 It was during this stay in Bayreuth that Bruckner dedicated the Third Symphony to Richard Wagner.
- 11 See Franz Grasberger, ‘Anton Bruckners II. Symphonie’, in *Bruckner-Studien*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1975), 303–21.
- 12 *Neue Freie Presse*, 28 October 1873.
- 13 *Fremdenblatt*, 28 October 1873; F. G. [= Franz Gehring], in *Deutsche Zeitung*, 28 October 1873.
- 14 *Neue Freie Presse*, 18 December 1877.
- 15 *Wiener Zeitung (Abendpost)*, 17 December 1877.
- 16 C. B., in *Deutsche Zeitung*, 4 February 1880.
- 17 Franz Gehring, in *Deutsche Zeitung*, 22 February 1881.
- 18 *Vaterland*, 3 March 1881.
- 19 *Neue Freie Presse*, 13 February 1883.
- 20 On the occasion of the piano performance of the second movement of the Seventh Symphony and the third movement of the Fourth Symphony on 4 November 1884 by Josef Schalk at the Wiener Akademischer Wagner-Verein (*Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, 5 December 1884).
- 21 *Wiener Salonblatt*, 28 December 1884.
- 22 *Deutsche Kunst- und Musikzeitung*, 1 January 1885.
- 23 *Deutsche Zeitung*, 23 March 1886.
- 24 *Neue Freie Presse*, 30 March 1886.
- 25 *Die Presse*, 3 April 1886.
- 26 *Deutsche Zeitung*, 25 March 1886.
- 27 *Deutsche Zeitung*, 27 January 1888.
- 28 Letter to Hermann Levi, August 1888, in *H2*, no. 880800.
- 29 Letter to Hans von Wolzogen, 1 January 1889, in *H2*, no. 890101/2.
- 30 h-m., in *Deutsche Zeitung*, 17 October 1889 (the reference is to the First Symphonies of Brahms and Schumann respectively).
- 31 *Neue Freie Presse*, 24 December 1890.
- 32 *Deutsche Zeitung*, 23 December 1890.
- 33 *Ostdeutsche Rundschau*, 21 December 1890.
- 34 h-m., in *Deutsche Zeitung*, 14 December 1891.
- 35 Letter of Helm to Bruckner, 5 January 1893, in *H2*, no. 930105.

36 *Neue Freie Presse*, 23 December 1892.

37 E. v. H. and h.-m., ‘Programm-Wünsche’, in *Deutsche Zeitung*, 29 September 1893.

38 *Deutsche Zeitung*, 30 November 1894.

39 *Deutsche Zeitung*, 11 January 1896.

40 Unsigned obituary, *Neue Freie Presse*, 12 October 1896.

41 *Deutsche Zeitung*, 13 October 1896.

4 Bruckner’s large sacred compositions

1 Göll-A, IV/2, pp. 141–2. The German ‘kirchlich’ (‘und kirchli’ is ‘do’ nöt!’) has been translated as ‘ecclesiastical’ with a view to taking full advantage of the musical, religious, and sociological overtones the English word provides. Although questions of venue and function may well have occupied the composer, there is no way to know the extent to which Bruckner intended to differentiate, for example, between ‘kirchlich’ and ‘geistlich’. The latter, with reference to music might be translated as ‘sacred’ or ‘religious’, terms that are used interchangeably in this article without regard to issues of liturgical function.

Göll-A is the source of much of the biographical information in the remainder of this essay. The concert in question took place on 14 December 1884; August Böhm, *Geschichte des Singvereines der Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde in Wien* (Vienna, 1908), *Beilage*, p. 55.

2 Comment by [Ludwig Speidel] in an otherwise favourable review of the first performance of the Mass, *Fremdenblatt*, 20 June 1872. For a selection of reviews of the F minor Mass see Paul Hawkshaw (ed.), *ABSW*, XVIII, *Kritischer Bericht* (Vienna, forthcoming).

3 The specific relationship between the Te Deum and the Ninth Symphony has recently been discussed by John A. Phillips, ‘The Facts behind a “Legend”: the Ninth Symphony and the Te Deum’, in *PAB*, pp. 270–81. Phillips points out that, regardless of the state of completion of the instrumental Finale, in Bruckner’s mind there was a symbiotic programmatic and musical relationship between the Te Deum and the symphony. On a broader scale, assessments of Bruckner’s sacred music as ‘symphonies for the church’ or of his symphonies as ‘Masses for the concert hall’ are commonplace in the literature. See, for example, Leopold Nowak, ‘Symphonischer und kirchlicher Stil bei Anton Bruckner’, in *Über Anton Bruckner: gesammelte Aufsätze 1936–1984* (Vienna, 1985), pp. 47–54.

4 See, for example, Leopold M. Kantner, ‘Die Frömmigkeit Anton Bruckners’, in *Anton Bruckner in Wien: eine kritische Studie zu seiner Persönlichkeit* (Graz, 1980), pp. 229–78.

5 See Karl Gustav Fellerer, ‘Bruckner und die Kirchenmusik seiner Zeit’, in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung*, ed. Christoph-Hellmut Mahling (Tutzing, 1988), pp. 41–62. Bruckner had no qualms about allowing the same piece to serve both church and concert hall. The second performance of the D minor Mass, for example, took place under his direction in the Redoutensaal in Linz in 1868. A performance of the Mass in F minor in the Grosser Musikvereinsaal, Vienna, 23 March 1893, was one of the most successful public appearances of his career. Three ‘religious’ but ‘non-liturgical’ works mentioned in this chapter (*Entsagen* WAB 14, *Festgesang* WAB 15, and *Festkantate* WAB 16) are also considered in the context of Bruckner’s secular vocal music by Crawford Howie in Chapter 6.

6 ‘Large’ is something of a misnomer in that the pieces vary considerably in dimension, both in terms of performance forces and duration. There are also two Kyrie fragments, WAB 139 (1845–8?) and 140 (*Missa pro Quadragesima*, 1845–6?), and a Requiem fragment, WAB 141 (September, 1875).

7 It is known to have been performed at Vespers in St. Florian on selected feasts between 1852 and 1855: Paul Hawkshaw, ‘Bruckners Psalmen’, in *B-P*, p. 73.

8 Except Psalm 146, the early history of which is a mystery: see Paul Hawkshaw, ‘The Enigma of Anton Bruckner’s Psalm 146’, in *Musica Conservata: Günter Brosche zum 60. Geburtstag*, ed. Josef Gmeiner, Zsigmond Kokits, Thomas Leibnitz, and Inge Pechotsch-Feichtinger (Tutzing, 1999), pp. 105–19; Hawkshaw, ‘A Composer Learns his Craft: Anton Bruckner’s Lessons in Form and Orchestration with Otto Kitzler, 1861–3’, in *PAB*, 17; and ‘Die Psalmkompositionen Anton Bruckners’, in *Bruckner Vorträge: Tagung Wien 1999*, ed. Elisabeth Maier, Andrea Harrandt, and Erich Wolfgang Partsch (Vienna, 2000), pp. 8–10. The third article has reproductions of handwritten programmes for music evenings at the monastery.

Festgesang was composed in 1855 for the name day of Jodok Stülz, *Stiftsdechant* in St. Florian, and the *Festkantate* was commissioned for the corner-stone-laying ceremony of the new cathedral in Linz in 1862: Franz Zamazal, ‘Festgesang (WAB 15)’ and ‘Festkantate (WAB 16)’, in *Anton Bruckner:*

ein Handbuch, ed. Uwe Harten (Salzburg and Vienna, 1996), pp. 151–3. *Entsagen* was composed for the name-day ceremony of Prelate Michael Arneith in St. Florian, possibly in 1851; Hofkapellmeister Joseph Hellmesberger planned to use the *Te Deum* for the biretta ceremony of the new Viennese Cardinal Ganglbauer in 1884, though he eventually decided against it owing to its length; and Psalm 150 was intended for the opening ceremony of the International Music and Theatre Exhibition, Vienna, 1892, but the piece was not finished in time: Elisabeth Maier, ‘Entsagen (WAB 14)’, ‘Psalm 150 (WAB 38)’, and ‘Te Deum (WAB 45)’, *Anton Bruckner: ein Handbuch*, pp. 145, 345, and 439–41.

9 An autograph note on the title page over the inscription *A[d]. M[ajorem]. D[ei]. G[loriam]*. indicates that the Kyrie and Gloria were added in 1845, though they cannot be located today. There is also a lost Requiem from 1845 (*Göll-A. I*, p. 280). Given the two fragments that exist (see Table 4.1), it is clear that Bruckner was more active as a church composer during his Kronstorf and early St. Florian years than his surviving repertoire indicates. One wonders what he destroyed in the process of moving to Belvedere in 1895.

10 St. Florian Bibliothek 20/66.

11 See above, Chapter 2, p. 17.

12 The parts are kept in the Wels Stadtarchiv 2692.

13 *Liber usualis* (Tournai, 1947), p. 64. Elisabeth Maier has observed that there is also an audible relationship between the opening phrase and the plainchant *Kyrie Deus Sempiterna*: Elisabeth Maier, ‘Der Choral in den Kirchenwerken Bruckners’, in *Bruckner-Symposion, ‘Anton Bruckner und die Kirchenmusik’* (Linz 1985): *Bericht*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Linz, 1988), p. 119. See also Keith William Kinder, *The Wind and Wind-Chorus Music of Anton Bruckner* (Westport, Conn., 2000), pp. 2–3.

14 Zenetti, who was an important influence on the aspiring musician, lived in Enns, so lessons required a considerable expenditure of time and effort on Bruckner’s part. See Elisabeth Maier and Franz Zamazal, *Anton Bruckner und Leopold von Zenetti* (Graz, 1980); Walter Schulten, ‘Anton Bruckners künstlerische Entwicklung der St. Florianer Zeit (1845–1855)’, Ph.D. thesis (University of Mainz, 1956), contains an exhaustive investigation of Bruckner’s Marburg studies.

15 An extensive performance archive of scores and parts as well as weekly lists of music performed at the liturgies survive

today at the monastery. For a discussion of the musical activities at St. Florian see Walter Pass, ‘Studie über Bruckners ersten St. Florianer Aufenthalt’, in *Bruckner-Studien*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1975), pp. 11–51; and Schulten, ‘Anton Bruckners künstlerische Entwicklung’. Contrary to views expressed in much of the Bruckner literature, Renaissance music was performed only rarely at the monastery while Bruckner was resident there.

16 Preserved under signature 20 in the St. Florian library.

17 Elisabeth Maier, ‘Requiem in d-Moll (WAB 39)’, in *Bruckner-Handbuch*, p. 350. Bruckner continued to use the Mozart Requiem as a model well into the 1870s; Timothy L. Jackson, ‘Bruckner’s *Oktaver*: The Problem of Consecutives, Doubling, and Orchestral Voice-leading’, in *PAB*, pp. 37–45.

18 As a general rule, text setting did not come easily to Bruckner in his early works. His surviving composition scores from the period demonstrate that he often laboured over issues of declamation, not always with meritorious results; see Paul Hawkshaw, ‘The Enigma of Psalm 146’, pp. 112–14.

19 *Göll-A*, II/1, p. 70.

20 *Ibid.*, p. 156.

21 *Ibid.*, pp. 186–8.

22 The author is grateful to Dr Friedrich Buchmayr, monastery librarian, for the information that St. Florian is in possession of more than one hundred first editions and early copies of both sacred and secular music of Schubert.

23 Othmar Wessely, ‘Bruckners Mendelssohn Kenntnis’, in *Bruckner-Studien*, p. 88. While he lived in St. Florian Bruckner also travelled to Linz to study and hear performances. On one of these occasions in 1847 or 1848 he may have heard *St Paul*; he certainly studied the work in St. Florian. See Leopold Nowak, ‘Mendelssohns *Paulus* und Anton Bruckner’, in *Über Anton Bruckner*, pp. 191–4.

24 There was little call for Bach’s liturgical music in St. Florian. Bruckner encountered some of his fugues in his investigations of Marburg and presumably studied some of the organ music with Kattinger.

25 See Othmar Wessely, ‘Zur Geschichte der Equals’, in *Beethoven-Studien* (Vienna, 1970), pp. 341–60. Trombone Aequale, of which Bruckner composed two (WAB 114 and 149), were performed at funerals in St. Florian – one of the many rhetorical connections between trombones and death in Bruckner’s experience.

- 26 The secular cantata *Heil, Vater! Dir zum hohen Feste* (WAB 61) has a melodic fragment that first appears in the second movement and recurs thereafter; Kinder, *Wind and Wind-Chorus Music*, p. 19.
- 27 He sent the piece to Assmayr on 30 July 1852; see *H-SI*, p. 2.
- 28 The clash is emphasized by a glaring cross relation between $g\sharp$ of the chorale's cadential chord in bar 9 and $g\sharp$ of the opening chord of the first chorus in the next bar. It is difficult to imagine that Assmayr was impressed by Bruckner's voice-leading, at least in this instance.
- 29 Layers of handwriting in the two manuscript sources demonstrate that Bruckner worked on them over an extended period of time, perhaps after he had moved to Linz. For a discussion of the various theories about the genesis of the work, see Hawkshaw, 'The Enigma of Psalm 146', pp. 105–12. The Psalm survives in a fragmentary autograph composition score and a copy in the Music Collection of the Austrian National Library, Mus. Hs. 40.500 and 6011 respectively, neither of which is dated.
- 30 *Göll-A*, II/1, p. 184.
- 31 Bruckner completed his studies with Sechter in March 1861 and started with Kitzler before the end of the same year. In between there was a brief flurry of compositional activity that included two important motets, *Afferentur Regi* (WAB 1) and *Ave Maria* [à.7] (WAB 6), and possibly work on the *Festkantate* (WAB 16). For more on Sechter and Kitzler see Ernst Schwanzara, *Anton Bruckner: Vorlesungen über Harmonielehre und Kontrapunkt an der Universität Wien* (Vienna, 1950), pp. 17–34; and Paul Hawkshaw, 'A Composer Learns his Craft: Lessons in Form and Orchestration, 1861–3', pp. 3–29.
- 32 Bruckner only began to use the standard nineteenth-century score order with woodwinds at the top and strings at the bottom, for example, after working with Kitzler.
- 33 Kitzler conducted *Tannhäuser* in Linz on 13 February 1863. Bruckner prepared the Liedertafel *Frohsinn* to sing the 'Pilgrims' Chorus'; see Otto Kitzler, *Musikalische Erinnerungen mit Briefen von Wagner, Brahms, Bruckner und Richard Pohl* (Brünn [Brno], 1904), pp. 29–31.
- 34 *Um Mitternacht* (WAB 89), *Herbstlied* (WAB 73), and *Germanenzug* (WAB 70). Although it is a chronological inaccuracy, the Mass is usually referred to as No. 1 in concert programmes; the Masses in E and F minor are Nos. 2 and 3 respectively. The numbering dates from Bruckner's time and stems from the fact that, for the remainder of his life, he regarded the end of the Kitzler studies as the beginning of his career as a professional composer.
- 35 Letter to Rudolf Weiwurm, 26 December 1864, *H-SI*, p. 47.
- 36 In the autograph score (Austrian National Library, Mus. Hs. 19.483) the woodwind of bars 100–9 are scored for organ, which was no doubt used for the first performance in the Linz Cathedral. He rescored the part for woodwind for performances where the organ was not available or where its pitch didn't match that of the orchestra. The woodwind interpolation proved practical: in Bruckner's experience orchestral pitch had already climbed above that of most organs by 1865. See the letter to Weiwurm of 21 January 1865, *H-SI*, p. 59.
- 37 See Othmar Wessely, 'Vergangenheit und Zukunft in Bruckners Messe in D Moll', *Österreichische Musikzeitschrift* 29 (1974), 412–18 for an extensive discussion of Bruckner's rhetorical gestures in a historical context. In particular Wessely connects the falling semitones to the Baroque gesture of the *passus duriusculus*.
- 38 *Linzler Abendboten*, cited in *Göll-A*, III/1, pp. 297–9.
- 39 *Göll-A*, III/1, p. 299.
- 40 *Ibid.*, pp. 300–1.
- 41 Auer, *Bruckner als Kirchenmusiker*, p. 38. It is not uncommon to find, especially in the German literature, analyses of the Mass movements in the terminology of sonata form; i.e. the opening of the Gloria is referred to as the *Hauptsatz* and the 'Gratias' as the *Nebensatz*; see Horst-Günther Scholz, *Die Form der reifen Messen Anton Bruckners* (Berlin, 1961).
- 42 See Ludwig Speidel's remark about the Wolf's Glen scene in a review of the Credo of the F minor Mass, note 2.
- 43 The earthquake metaphor was already present in the *Missa solemnis*, and trombone chorales had found their way into the Requiem and the *Missa solemnis* setting of 'mortuorum' ('of the dead') in the Credo; see note 24.
- 44 The reference is to the 1882 version (bar 49 in 1866). Kinder (*Wind and Wind-Chorus Music*, p. 55) connects the opening phrase of the Gloria to the plainchant Gloria VIII in the *Liber usualis*, p. 37.

45 Witt was founder of the German Cecilian Society that saw Gregorian chant and the music of Palestrina as models for a church music renaissance. For more on Bruckner's relationship with the Cecilianists see Karl Gustav Fellerer, 'Bruckners Kirchenmusik und der Cäcilianismus', *Österreichische Musikzeitschrift* 29 (1974), 404–12.

46 ABSW, XVIII (Vienna, 1960), Preface.

47 *Neue Freie Presse*, 29 June 1872; the call for a concert performance of the Mass became a recurring theme in Viennese criticism. See the chapter on reviews in ABSW, XVIII, *Kritischer Bericht*.

48 Bruckner had not used obbligato solo instruments to accompany singers in such an extended passage since his St. Florian days. One wonders whether an encounter with the *Missa solemnis* during his Linz years opened his eyes to new possibilities in this regard. A similar passage occurs with a violin solo at 'Christe eleison' (Kyrie, bars 36–54); Bruckner would return to this kind of writing with passages in the Te Deum (bars 191–204 and 273–86) and Psalm 150 (bars 109–42).

49 Hans Ferdinand Redlich (ed.), *Mass in F Minor* (London, 1967), Foreword, p. 31.

50 *Liber usualis*, p. 26.

51 See the list of performances in Theophil Antonicek, *Anton Bruckner und die Wiener Hofmusikkapelle* (Graz, 1979), pp. 142–4.

52 *Göll-A*, IV/2, p. 143.

53 For more on the revisions see Leopold Nowak, 'Bruckners Formveränderungen an seiner e-Moll-Messe', in *Über Anton Bruckner*, pp. 200–3 and Paul Hawkshaw, 'An Anatomy of Change: Anton Bruckner's Revisions to the Mass in F Minor', in *BS*, pp. 1–31. Robert Haas, unaware of the 1883 changes to the autograph score of the F minor Mass, incorrectly dated the first version 1881 in his edition in the first Bruckner Collected Edition.

54 *Göll-A*, III/1, pp. 88 criticizes Bruckner's early fugues for their extended passages of parallel thirds and sixths, and Maz Graf, 'Anton Bruckner: der Entwicklungsgang', *Die Musik* 1 (1901–2), 581, laments the lack of technical freedom in the voice leading, short phrases, and standard contrapuntal progressions in the fugue of Psalm 146.

55 See for example Fritz Grüninger, *Anton Bruckner: der metaphysische Kern seiner Persönlichkeit und seiner Werke*, 2nd edn (Augsburg, 1949).

56 *EKB*, vol. II, p. 1201. Kurth went on to suggest that a major accomplishment of Bruckner's mature sacred music was a

successful blend of romantic melodic style with plainchant.

5 Bruckner and the motet

1 It may have been written slightly later, during his period as a choirboy at St. Florian (1837–40), but certainly pre-dates his teacher training year (1840–1). For a facsimile of the autograph of the revised 1891 version see *Göll-A*, II/1, p. 230; also A. C. Howie, 'The Sacred Music of Anton Bruckner', Ph.D. thesis (University of Manchester, 1969), pp. 213–44; Leopold Nowak, 'Die kleinen Kirchenmusikwerke Anton Bruckners', in *Über Anton Bruckner: gesammelte Aufsätze* (Vienna, 1985), pp. 245–6; Nowak, 'Anton Bruckners Kirchenmusik', in *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Anton Bruckner und die Kirchenmusik' (Linz 1985): Bericht*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Linz, 1988), pp. 85–93; Helmut Loos, 'Zu Bruckners Kirchenmusik', in *B-P*, pp. 64–70; Hartmut Krones, "'Und 1000 Jahre sind ihm wie ein Tag": Kirchenmusik in Österreich 996–1996', *Österreichische Musikzeitschrift* 51 (1996), 705–6.

2 WAB 3 was printed in *Göll-A*, III/2, pp. 140–1. Auer considered it a later composition, dating from the Linz years, but this must be ruled out on stylistic grounds. *Asperges me* is sung during the distribution of holy water at the Sunday services during Lent.

3 All five settings were published by Gross of Innsbruck in 1893.

4 It may have been performed together with Bruckner's 1852 *Magnificat* at St. Florian on 1 August 1854. The work was printed in *Göll-A*, II/2, pp. 255–8.

5 *Göll-A*, II/2, pp. 141–4.

6 The first piece was printed in *Göll-A*, II/2, pp. 83; in ABSW, XXI/1 (Vienna, 1984), 52–3, Hans Bauernfeind supplied the missing bass part of the second.

7 See Harry Slapnicka, *Bischof Rudigier: eine Bildbiographie* (Linz, 1962) and 'Bischof Rudigier und die Kunst', in *Bruckner-Symposion Linz 1985*, pp. 23–31; also Elisabeth Maier, "'Kirchenmusik auf schiefen Bahnen": zur Situation in Linz von 1850 bis 1900', in *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Musikstadt Linz – Musikland Oberösterreich' (Linz 1990): Bericht*, ed. Othmar Wessely et al. (Linz, 1993), pp. 109–17.

8 One smaller sacred piece from the Linz period which has been lost is *Litanei* (WAB 132). For a successful performance of it in Linz in 1858 see Sechter's letter of 26 September to Bruckner (*H-SI*, pp. 13–14).

- 9 For a facsimile of the autograph of *Afferentur regi* see Max Auer, *Anton Bruckner als Kirchenmusiker* (Regensburg, 1927), p. 64. See also Wolfgang Hoffmann, “‘Sextaccord’-Folgen im geistlichen Vokalschaffen Anton Bruckners’, *B-J 1994/95/96* (1997), 157–73.
- 10 *Frohsinn*, with Bruckner at the organ, gave it its first performance in Linz Parish Church on 6 February 1865. There is a facsimile of the autograph in *Göll-A*, III/2, pp. 219–24.
- 11 Bruckner referred to the 1868 setting of *Pange lingua* as ‘my favourite *Tantum ergo*’ in a letter of 18 October 1892; it was to be performed ‘very slowly and solemnly’; see Max Auer (ed.), *Anton Bruckner: gesammelte Briefe (Neue Folge)* (Regensburg, 1924), pp. 264–5.
- 12 This ‘correction’ was amended in the Gross edition of 1895 and subsequent editions of the piece. Prior to its publication in Franz X. Witt, *Eucharistische Gesänge* 5 (1888), it appeared in the supplement of Witt (ed.), *Musica Sacra* 18 (1885), p. 44. Witt made some rhythmical changes in bars 9–11. For an account of Bruckner’s reaction, see Friedrich Eckstein, *Erinnerungen an Anton Bruckner* (Vienna, 1923), pp. 13–17.
- 13 For a facsimile of the autograph of the 1868 *Pange lingua* see *Göll-A*, III/1, p. 500.
- 14 As editor of the *Fliegende Blätter für katholische Kirchenmusik* and the *Cäcilienverein* catalogue (a kind of repertoire codex including only those church music works which adhered to strict Cecilian principles), Witt’s reform ideas became even more radical. Habert effectively prevented Witt from gaining a foothold in Austria. For an overview of Cecilianism in Austria, see Otto Biba, ‘Der Cäcilianismus’, in *Bruckner-Symposion (Linz 1985)*, pp. 123–8; Josef Moser, ‘Zum Thema Kirchenmusik: cäcilianische Bestrebungen in der Diözese Linz’, in *Oberösterreichische Heimatblätter* 39 (1985), 62–85; Maier, “‘Kirchenmusik auf schiefen Bahnen’”, 115–17; Hartmut Krones, ‘Bruckners Kirchenmusik im Spiegel der Cäcilianismus’, in *Anton Bruckner: Tradition und Fortschritt in der Kirchenmusik des 19. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Friedrich W. Riedel (Sinzig, 2001), pp. 91–104; Hubert Unverricht (ed.), *Der Caecilianismus: Anfänge – Grundlagen – Wirkungen* (Tutzing, 1988).
- 15 For a facsimile of the autograph see Auer, *Anton Bruckner als Kirchenmusiker*, p. 64, and *Göll-A*, III/2, pp. 239–44.
- 16 The dedicatee of *Iam lucis* was the abbot of Wilhering Abbey, and Robert Riepl, a priest in the abbey, supplied the text; see G. K. Mitterschiffthaler, ‘Die Beziehungen Anton Bruckners zum Stift Wilhering’, in *Bruckner Studien*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1975), p. 128. It was first published in Linz in 1868 and was printed again later, in a transposed version and with four of the original eight verses omitted, in the Viennese magazine *An der schönen blauen Donau* in May 1886.
- 17 There is an entry in the Hofkapelle schedule for 8 December 1873 which clearly refers to a performance of this setting of *Christus factus est*. See Theophil Antonicek, *Anton Bruckner und die Wiener Hofmusikkapelle* (Graz, 1979), for detailed information about Bruckner’s appointment at the Hofmusikkapelle. See also Walburga Litschauer, ‘Bruckner und die Wiener Kirchenmusiker’, in *Bruckner-Symposion (Linz 1985)*, pp. 95–101; Leopold M. Kantner discusses the typical *Hofkapelle* repertoire in ‘Kirchenmusikalische Strömungen bis Bruckner’, in *Bruckner-Symposion (Linz 1985)*, pp. 53–7.
- 18 See Imogen Fellinger, ‘Die drei Fassungen des “Christus factus est”’, in *Bruckner-Symposion (Linz 1985)*, pp. 145–53.
- 19 Elisabeth Maier identifies the similarity of the opening phrase to the second, third, or eighth psalm-tone or the ‘Alleluia’ of the *Officium in festo immaculatae Conceptionis Beatae Mariae Virginis* (‘Der Choral in den Kirchenwerken Bruckners’, in *Bruckner-Symposion (Linz 1985)*, p. 118). Hartmut Krones also discusses the three-note head-motive of this opening phrase in the context of Bruckner’s use here and elsewhere of what Constantin Floros has called the ‘tonal symbol of the cross’ in ‘Musiksprachliche Elemente aus Renaissance und Barock bei Anton Bruckner’, *Bruckner-Symposion, ‘Bruckner – Vorbilder und Traditionen’ (Linz 1997): Bericht*, ed. Uwe Harten (Linz, 1999), p. 57.
- 20 Bruckner sent a signed copy of the work to Rudigier, its dedicatee, on 30 May 1878 (see *H-SI*, p. 178).
- 21 See *H-SI*, pp. 181ff. for the text of this letter, dated Vienna, 25 July 1879. Traumihler asked Bruckner to make some changes, particularly in the middle section. Bruckner complied and on 28 July added the organ-accompanied versicle ‘Inveni David’. See *Göll-A*, II/1, p. 269, and Nowak, ‘Die Motette “Os justi” und ihre Handschriften’, in *Über Anton Bruckner*, pp. 246–9.

22 The text of *Os justi* is from the *Missa de Doctoribus*. Although there appears to be no pre-existent model for the ‘Inveni David’ versicle, the melody for the ‘Alleluia’ is taken from the ‘Alleluia’ of the Introit *In medio ecclesiae* in the *Commune Doctorum*; see Maier, ‘Der Choral in den Kirchenwerken Bruckners’, p. 117. There is a facsimile of the autograph of the first version of the motet in *Göll-A*, IV/1, between pages 568 and 569.

23 Erwin Horn suggests that just as Bruckner sublimated his feelings for Aloisia Bogner when he wrote *Entsagen*, so in this *Ave Maria*, he put his obvious affection for Luise Hochleitner on one side: ‘separated from the private connection . . . it is “religious” in the best sense of the word and can be conducive to religious edification at any time. Its religious “worth” is in no way diminished by the presence of other resonating factors’; see Horn, ‘Eros und Marienlob: Gedanken zu Anton Bruckners Marienmotetten’, in *B-J 1989/90* (1992), 225.

24 Timothy L. Jackson – in ‘The Enharmonics of Faith: Enharmonic Symbolism in Bruckner’s *Christus factus est* (1884)’, *B-J 1987/88* (1990), 19 – argues that it is the ‘overwhelming significance of this “rising” D \flat become C \sharp that “raises” Jesus’ name above all others’ (‘super omne nomen’).

25 The work was first published in a facsimile of the autograph in *Göll-A*, IV/2, pp. 496 and 497.

26 Maier suggests that Bruckner’s harmonization of *Veni creator* is closer to a Lutheran chorale harmonization, with pauses coming at the end of each line. In addition Bruckner has ‘compromised’ the modality of the piece by harmonizing the first syllable of ‘Creator’ with an A major chord. See Maier, ‘Der Choral in den Kirchenwerken Bruckners’, 114–15. For the use of plainsong in Austrian abbeys and large churches, St. Florian in particular, during the nineteenth century, see Franz K. Prassl, ‘Die österreichische Choralpflege im 19. Jahrhundert’, in *Bruckner-Symposion (Linz 1997)*, pp. 35–51.

27 A revised version of the E minor Mass was performed on the final day of the celebrations, 4 October 1885 (see *H-SI*, p. 264).

28 This doxology is taken from the fourth psalm tone in the *Tonus solemnus* (see Maier, ‘Der Choral in den Kirchenwerken Bruckners’, 118). The text of *Ecce sacerdos magnus* is taken from the *Responsory for the Reception of a Bishop*.

29 *Virga Jesse floruit*, the setting of a text from the Feast of the Blessed Virgin, was dedicated to the memory of Traumahler. Its first performance was probably as a gradual during the F minor Mass, which Bruckner conducted in the Hofkapelle on 8 December 1885.

30 The text of *Ave regina caelorum* is taken from a Lenten antiphon, but the plainsong comes from a gradual verse with ‘Alleluia’ in the *Missa de Sancta Maria ab Adventu usque ad Navitatem Domini*. See Elisabeth Maier, ‘Der Choral in den Kirchenwerken Bruckners’, 115.

31 For this ‘inner compulsion’ see Auer (ed.), *Bruckner: gesammelte Briefe*, pp. 257 and 259.

32 This is particularly relevant in the first verse where the B dominant seventh chord at ‘morte’ is followed by the first inversion E \flat major chord at ‘vitam’ (bars 25–9). Timothy Jackson refers to the sketches in noting that the corrections Bruckner made to the music and metrical numbers ‘testify eloquently to Bruckner’s considerable effort in setting the last line of text’, the enharmonic passage in particular. See Timothy L. Jackson, ‘Bruckner’s Metrical Numbers’, *NCM* 14 (1990–1), 114 and 118.

6 Bruckner and secular vocal music

1 Gernot Gruber, ‘Nachmärz und Ringstrassenzeit’, in *Musikgeschichte Österreichs 3: von der Revolution zur Gegenwart*, ed. Rudolf Flotzinger and Gernot Gruber (Vienna – Cologne – Weimar, 1995), pp. 24–6.

2 Hans Commenda, *Die Geschichte des Oberösterreichischen Sängerbundes* (Linz, 1953), p. 29.

3 *Frohsinn* was founded in 1845, *Sängerbund* in 1857. Because of their similar repertoires, they frequently joined forces. See Karl Kerschbaum, *Chronik der Liedertafel ‘Frohsinn’ in Linz über den 50jährigen Bestand vom 17. März 1845 bis anfangs März 1895* (Linz, 1895); Andrea Harrandt, ‘Aus dem Archiv der Liedertafel “Frohsinn”; zum Chorwesen im 19. Jahrhundert’, in *Bruckner-Symposion, ‘Musikstadt Linz – Musikland Oberösterreich’ (Linz 1990): Bericht*, ed. Othmar Wessely et al. (Linz, 1993), pp. 57–70.

4 See Andrea Harrandt, ‘Bruckner und das bürgerliche Musiziergut seiner Jugendzeit’, in *Bruckner-Symposion, ‘Bruckner und die Musik der Romantik’ (Linz 1987): Bericht*, ed. Renate Grasberger et al. (Linz, 1989), pp. 93–103; ‘Bruckner and the *Liedertafel* Tradition: His Secular Music for Male Voices’, *Choral Journal* 37 (1996), 15–21; ‘Bruckner und die

Chormusik seiner Zeit', *Oberösterreichische Heimatblätter* 51 (1997), 184–95; Erich Wolfgang Partsch, 'Bruckner-Pflege in Steyr bis zur Jahrhundertwende', *Internationale Bruckner-Gesellschaft Mitteilungsblatt* 35 (1990), 5–10.

5 See Angela Pachovsky, 'Anton Bruckners weltliche Chorwerke: zum Inhalt von Band XXIII/2 der Bruckner-Gesamtausgabe', in *Bruckner-Tagung Wien 1999: Bericht*, ed. Elisabeth Maier, Andrea Harrandt, and Erich Wolfgang Partsch (Vienna, 2000), pp. 35–46.

6 *Göll-A*, I, pp. 229–35.

7 See *H-SI*, p. 1.

8 *Der Lehrerstand* was possibly performed by the St. Florian *Liedertafel* in the late 1840s. See Christoph Meran and Elisabeth Maier, 'Anton Bruckner und Charles O'Hegerty: zur Geschichte eines lange verschollenen Bruckner-Autographs', *B-J 1994/95/96* (1997), 195–210, for further information about *Des Dankes Wort* written during the St. Florian period for Count Charles O'Hegerty of Tillysburg.

9 The text for *Sternschnuppen* was provided by Ernst Marinelli (1824–87), for whom see *Anton Bruckner: ein Handbuch*, ed. Uwe Harten (Salzburg and Vienna, 1996), p. 271. *Ständchen* is discussed in *Göll-A*, II/1, pp. 47–51.

10 The original manuscript (Oberösterreichisches Landesarchiv, Linz) lacks date and title-page. A facsimile of a page (in Pachovsky, 'Bruckners weltliche Chorwerke', p. 38) reveals the insertion of metrical numbers which Bruckner began to use during his period of study with Kitzler. The first performance probably took place in 1898 with new words by Anton August Naaf – 'Dir holde Heimat soll erklingen' – and sung by the *Schubertbund* in Vienna.

11 See Paul Hawkshaw, 'The Manuscript Sources for Anton Bruckner's Linz Works: a Study of his Working Methods from 1856 to 1868', Ph.D. thesis, University of Columbia (1984), pp. 255 and 262.

12 Letter to Rudolf Weinwurm dated Linz, 3 October 1861, *H-SI*, pp. 25–6.

13 Hawkshaw, 'Manuscript Sources', p. 223.

14 *Göll-A*, III/1, p. 254.

15 *H-SI*, p. 63.

16 *Ibid.*, 64.

17 See Fritz Racek, 'Ein neuer Text zu Bruckners "Vaterländisches Weinlied"?' in *Bruckner-Studien*, ed. Franz Grasberger (Vienna, 1964), pp. 83–6.

18 See *H-SI*, p. 114, for the second letter, which is dated 24 November 1869. Bruckner

was mistaken in believing that Joseph Mendelssohn, the author of the poem, was Felix Mendelssohn's grandfather.

19 The text of *Das hohe Lied* was provided by Heinrich von der Mattig, the pseudonym of Dr Heinrich Wallmann (1827–98), an army doctor, writer and journalist. In 1902 it was edited for publication by Hans Wagner, who dispensed with the humming parts and retained only one solo tenor part, redistributing material among the chorus.

20 The text of the original version, *Nachruf*, was provided by Wallmann. See also *H-SI*, p. 176.

21 Wallmann was responsible for the text of *Abendzauber*. In the first edition of the work (Vienna, Universal Edition, 1911), Viktor Keldorfer provided a text underlay derived from the words of the solo part. As Bruckner did not provide any specific syllabic underlay for the yodelling voices, Keldorfer also added 'yodelling syllables corresponding to the typical way of singing in the Austrian alpine districts'.

22 See *Göll-A*, IV/1, pp. 520–1, where the date of composition is given wrongly as 11 November 1878.

23 See *H-SI*, p. 197 for Bruckner's letter to August Göllerich sen., the dedicatee, dated 17 February 1882, to which he attached the finished chorus. According to Franz Bayer, the original words were provided by Wallmann, but the chorus was later furnished with another text by Kerschbaum, edited by Keldorfer, and published by Universal Edition in 1911.

24 Quoted by Andrea Harrandt in 'Bruckner und das bürgerliche Musiziergut', 97.

25 The advert appeared in the *Deutsche Zeitung*, which also reported the decision on 16 April 1882. Auer, who erroneously assigned an earlier date to the piece, commended its 'powerful folk-like' quality; *Göll-A*, III/1, p. 105; also III/2, p. 191 for a facsimile of the autograph.

26 The second setting of *Um Mitternacht* was dedicated to the Strasbourg Male Voice Society, which published a facsimile edition of the piece in 1886. Angela Pachovsky compares the two settings in 'Bruckners weltliche Chorwerke', pp. 42–3.

27 According to the autograph, *Das deutsche Lied* was composed on 29 April. For extracts from contemporary reviews of the work, see Harrandt, 'Bruckner und das bürgerliche Musiziergut', 97–8, and Elisabeth Hilscher, 'Bruckner als Gelehrter – Bruckner als Gehrter', in *Bruckner-Symposium*, 'Anton

Bruckner als Schüler und Lehrer (Linz 1988): Bericht, ed. Othmar Wessely et al. (Linz, 1992), pp. 120–1.

- 28 The first version is described on the manuscript title-page as an ‘attempted musical setting of a short poem in the chamber style’. The second version, written about a month later, added a dedication to Knauer. The work received its definitive title in its third version, dedicated to Friedrich Mayr, who was later to succeed Arneth as prelate of St. Florian. See *Göll-A*, I, pp. 283–300 for a facsimile; also Leopold Nowak, ‘Vergissmeinnicht von Anton Bruckner’, in *Über Anton Bruckner*, pp. 249–53.
- 29 The text of the cantata, which Bruckner dedicated to Arneth on his name-day, is taken from Redwitz’s poem, *Amaranth*. See *Göll-A*, II/2, pp. 47–58 for a facsimile.
- 30 *Heil, Vater! Dir zum hohen Feste* was performed in revised versions on at least two other occasions with altered texts (by Marinelli and by Beda Piringner). The published autograph facsimile (*Göll-A*, II/1, pp. 112–30) is of the second version; see Hawkshaw, ‘Manuscript Sources’, pp. 214–21; Franz Zamazal, ‘Bruckners Namenstag-Kantate für Propst Michael Arneth (1852)’, *B-J 1989/90* (1992), 205–12. *Göll-A*, II/2, pp. 241–54 has a facsimile of the manuscript of *Sankt Jodok spross* in which the piano part is incomplete.
- 31 See *Göll-A*, III/2, pp. 197–216 for a facsimile of the autograph score of *Preiset den Herrn*; also Hawkshaw, ‘Manuscript Sources’, pp. 189–91 and 269–70.
- 32 For Silberstein, the Wiener Männergesangverein, and the various socio-political issues which provide a backcloth to Bruckner’s two settings, see Johannes-Leopold Mayer, ‘Die Zwielfichtigkeit des Erfolges: Anton Bruckners *Helgoland* im historischen Umfeld des Wiener Männerchorwesens’, *B-J 1980* (1980), 21–6; Alexander L. Ringer, ‘*Germanenzug bis Helgoland*: zu Anton Bruckners Deutschtum’, in *B-P*, pp. 25–34.
- 33 See *H-SI*, p. 35–7; also *Göll-A*, III/1, pp. 208–9 for a facsimile of *Germanenzug* in Silberstein’s handwriting.
- 34 See *H-SI*, pp. 40 and 42–3; Paul Hawkshaw, ‘From Zigeunerwald to Valhalla in Common Time: The Genesis of Anton Bruckner’s *Germanenzug*’, *B-J 1987/88* (1990), 21–3.
- 35 Bruckner was convinced that *Germanenzug* marked the true beginning of his career as a recognized composer. His first

published work, it was certainly the most popular and probably the most frequently performed of his works during his lifetime; after his death and at least up until the outbreak of the 1914–18 war, hardly a year passed without a public performance. The Akademischer Gesangverein under Eduard Kremser performed the vocal quartet from the chorus at Bruckner’s funeral.

36 See Franz Gräflinger, *Anton Bruckner: gesammelte Briefe* (Regensburg, 1924), pp. 64–6; Max Auer, *Anton Bruckner: gesammelte Briefe – neue Folge* (Regensburg, 1924), p. 274; *Göll-A*, IV/3, pp. 331 and 341–2 for letters to Viktor Christ, Cyrill Hynais and Eduard Kremser.

37 Ringer, ‘*Germanenzug bis Helgoland*’, p. 31.

38 See Wolfgang Grandjean, ‘Anton Bruckners “Helgoland” und das Symphonische’, *Die Musikforschung* 48 (1995), 349–68; Mayer, ‘Die Zwielfichtigkeit des Erfolges’, 22.

39 Bruckner probably intended to dedicate both ‘Mild wie Bäche’ and ‘Wie des Bächleins Silberquelle’ to Arneth, who was no doubt the ‘father’ mentioned in the text of the former. The text of the latter is the same as that of *Ständchen* (WAB 84). The author of the poems is unknown but was probably Marinelli. There are facsimiles of the sketches of both pieces in *Göll-A*, II/2, 59–60, and 65–6. There is a facsimile of the original manuscript of ‘Frühlingslied’ in *Göll-A*, II/1, pp. 41–3.

40 *H-SI*, p. 14.

41 See *Göll-A*, III/1, p. 56 and *ABSW* XXIII/1, vii.

42 *Göll-A*, III/1, p. 514.

43 Walther Dürr, ‘Das romantische Lied’, in *Bruckner-Symposion* (Linz 1987), p. 165.

44 See above and note 25 for discussion of the choral version. There are facsimiles of both versions in *Göll-A*, III/2, pp. 191–2.

7 The Brucknerian symphony: an overview

1 Deryck Cooke, ‘Anton Bruckner (1824–96)’, in *The Symphony*, ed. Robert Simpson, 2 vols. (Harmondsworth, 1966), I, pp. 283–306.

2 See Warren Darcy, ‘Bruckner’s Sonata Deformations’, in *BS*, p. 260.

3 Manfred Wagner, ‘Zum Tremolo in der Musik Anton Bruckners’, in *Bruckner-Studien*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1975), pp. 328–40 and 342–6.

4 Adolf Nowak, ‘Die Wiederkehr in Bruckners Adagio’, in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung* (Walter Wiora zum 30.

Dezember 1986), ed. Christoph-Helmut Mahling (Tutzing, 1988), p. 168.

5 Dika Newlin, *Bruckner – Mahler – Schoenberg*, 1st edn (New York, 1971), pp. 52–3.

6 See Thomas Röder, *Auf dem Weg zur Bruckner-Symphonie* (Stuttgart, 1987), p. 132.

7 Wendelin Müller-Blattau, ‘Chor- und Orchestersatz im *Te Deum* von Anton Bruckner’, in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung*, pp. 149–58.

8 *Ibid.*, pp. 157–8.

9 Carl Dahlhaus, *Nineteenth-Century Music*, trans. J. Bradford Robinson (Berkeley, 1989), p. 333.

10 Manfred Wagner, *Anton Bruckner: Werk und Leben* (Vienna, 1995), pp. 4–5; cf. the same author in *Bruckner: eine Monographie* (Mainz, 1983), p. 359.

11 *Schematismus und Evolution in der Sinfonik Anton Bruckners* (Munich and Salzburg, 1983), p. 88.

12 ‘Thesen über Bruckner’, in *Musik-Konzepte 23/24: Anton Bruckner*, ed. Heinz-Klaus Metzger and Rainer Riehn (Munich, 1982), pp. 7–11; translated as ‘Bruckner Propositions (I)’, *Bruckner Journal* 1/1 (1997), 4–5 and ‘Bruckner Propositions (II)’, *Bruckner Journal* 1/2 (1997), 8–9.

13 Rainer Boss, *Gestalt und Funktion von Fuge und Fugato bei Anton Bruckner* (Tutzing, 1997), p. 171–2.

14 Othmar Wessely, ‘Bruckners Mendelssohn Kenntnis’, in *Bruckner-Studien*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1975), pp. 98–9; Leopold Nowak, ‘Mendelssohns *Paulus* und Anton Bruckner’, in *Über Anton Bruckner: gesammelte Aufsätze 1936–1984* (Vienna, 1985), pp. 191–4.

15 E.g. the idea of ‘rotational form’ in Warren Darcy, ‘Bruckner’s Sonata Deformations’, in *BS*, pp. 264–6.

16 ‘Zur Stellung der “Nullten” Symphonie in Bruckners Werk’, in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung*, pp. 70–3.

17 See Peter Gülke, *Brahms, Bruckner: zwei Studien* (Kassel, 1989), pp. 103–4; for how the Wagnerians dealt with the problem, see Stephen M. McClatchie, ‘Bruckner and the Bayreuthians; or, *Das Geheimnis der Form bei Anton Bruckner*’, in *BS*, pp. 110–21.

18 Graham H. Phipps, ‘Bruckner’s Free Application of Strict Sechterian Theory with Stimulation from Wagnerian Sources: an Assessment of the First Movement of the Seventh Symphony’, in *PAB*, pp. 228–58.

19 See also Timothy L. Jackson, ‘Schubert as “John the Baptist to Wagner-Jesus”’: large-scale Enharmonicism in Bruckner and his Models’, *B-J* 1991/92/93 (1995), 61–107.

20 Mathias Hansen, ‘Bruckners “Ton”: das Streichquintett im Umfeld der Sinfonien’, in *B-P*, p. 102.

21 Joseph C. Kraus, ‘Phrase Rhythm in Bruckner’s Early Orchestral Scherzi’, in *BS*, pp. 278–97.

22 Floros, ‘Thesen über Bruckner’, p. 9.

8 Bruckner’s symphonies – a reinterpretation: the dialectic of darkness and light

1 John 8: 12.

2 Job 10: 21: ‘The land of darkness and the shadow of death’; Isaiah 9: 2: ‘The people that walked in darkness have seen a great light: they that dwell in the land of the shadow of death, upon them hath the light shined’; Luke 1: 79: ‘To give light to them that sit in darkness and in the shadow of death, to guide our feet into the way of peace’.

3 Quoted in Hans Hubert Schönzeler, *Bruckner* (London, 1970), 80.

4 Genesis 1: 2–4.

5 August Halm, *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners* (Munich, 1914), p. 43, quoted in Dika Newlin, *Bruckner – Mahler – Schoenberg*, rev. edn (London, 1979), p. 83. The second quotation is from Derek Watson, *Bruckner*, 2nd edn (Oxford, 1996), p. 74.

6 *Anton Bruckner: Sein Leben und Werk*, 2nd edn (Vienna, 1934), p. 424, quoted in Newlin, *Bruckner–Mahler–Schoenberg*, p. 83.

7 Robert Simpson, *The Essence of Bruckner*, 3rd edn (London, 1992), p. 210.

8 That the pairing of themes originated in Bruckner’s reaction to a body lying in state amid the sounds of a grand ball from an adjacent mansion is well known. The anecdote is from *Göll-A*, IV/2, p. 663.

9 ‘*Media vita morte sumus*’ is from an antiphon c. 911 AD attributed to Notker Balbulus of the monastery of St Gall, Switzerland, and appears in the *Book of Common Prayer* (‘Burial of the Dead’) as ‘In the midst of life we are in death.’

10 In the same way as writing is understood as an absence of the voice, but the voice is not an absence of writing; see Jacques Derrida, *Of Grammatology*, trans. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Baltimore, 1976), pp. 144 and 295.

11 *Ibid.*, and *Writing and Difference*, trans. Alan Bass (London, 1978).

12 Simpson, *Essence*, p. 204. The metaphor of the cathedral was common in the critical reception of Bruckner in the 1920s.

13 Oxford University Press (originally published in 1843).

14 Simpson, *Essence*, p. 232; a reference to the Eighth Symphony follows.

- 15 Ernst Bloch, *Essays on the Philosophy of Music*, trans. Peter Palmer (Cambridge, 1985), p. 41.
- 16 Rose Rosengard Subotnik, *Developing Variations: Style and Ideology in Western Music* (Minneapolis, 1991), p. 21. She is explaining ideas from Adorno based on her own translation of passages from his *Einleitung in der Musiksoziologie* (Reinbek bei Hamburg, 1968), pp. 223–5 and 232, *Moments Musicaux* (Frankfurt am Main, 1964), pp. 182–3, and from *Philosophy of Modern Music*, trans. Anne G. Mitchell and Wesley V. Blomster (New York, 1973), pp. 55–6.
- 17 Quotations from Bloch, *Essays*, pp. 41–2.
- 18 Subotnik, *Developing Variations*, p. 23, referring to Adorno's *Einleitung*.
- 19 *Ibid.*, p. 217, referring to Adorno's *Philosophie*.
- 20 Simpson, *Essence*, p. 172.
- 21 Susan McClary, *Feminine Endings: Music, Gender, and Sexuality* (Minneapolis, 1991), p. 15.
- 22 *Ibid.*, p. 114.
- 23 See Max von Oberleithner, *Meine Erinnerungen an Anton Bruckner* (Regensburg, 1933), excerpted in Stephen Johnson, *Bruckner Remembered* (London, 1998), pp. 99–100.
- 24 'Bruckner Propositions (II)', *Bruckner Journal* 1/2 (1997), 8–9. 'Propositions' were originally published as 'Thesen über Bruckner', in *Musik-Konzepte* 23/24: *Anton Bruckner*, ed. Heinz-Klaus Metzger and Rainer Riehn (Munich, 1982), pp. 5–14.
- 25 See Derrick Puffett, 'Bruckner's Way: the Adagio of the Ninth Symphony', *Music Analysis* 18 (1999), 13–14.
- 26 A. Crawford Howie, 'Traditional and Novel Elements in Bruckner's Sacred Music', *MQ* 67 (1981), 554.
- 27 Erwin Doernberg, *The Life and Symphonies of Anton Bruckner* (London, 1960), p. 109.
- 28 In Karl Grunsky (ed.), *Bruckners Sinfonien* (Berlin, 1907), p. 165; cited by Benjamin M. Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8* (Cambridge, 2000), p. 54.
- 29 This is not the only way in which Bruckner changes his motives, but it is the way that is relevant to my argument. Another type of change to motives has been interpreted as mutation by Werner Korte in *Bruckner und Brahms: die spätromantische Lösung der autonomen Konzeption* (Tutzing, 1963).
- 30 See also Constantin Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner: Studien zur musikalischen Exegetik* (Wiesbaden, 1980), pp. 186–8.
- 31 Carl Dahlhaus, *Nineteenth-Century Music*, trans. J. Bradford Robinson (Berkeley, 1989), p. 272.
- 32 *Ibid.*
- 33 Simpson, *Essence*, pp. 151 and 156.
- 34 Watson, *Bruckner*, p. 109.
- 35 Matthew 17: 2.
- 36 Linda Murray, *The High Renaissance and Mannerism: Italy, the North and Spain 1500–1600* (London, 1977), pp. 68–70; monochrome illustration, 69. For a colour illustration, see Marco Albertario, *Raphael* (Milan, 1996), p. 55.
- 37 Doernberg, *Bruckner*, p. 194.
- 38 I am indebted to Stan and Carmen Hawkins for providing me with this information.
- 39 *Briefe Hugo Wolfs an Emil Kauffmann*, ed. Edmund Hellmer (Berlin, 1903), p. 82.
- 40 Alan E. Brooke, 'John', in Arthur S. Peake, ed., *A Commentary on the Bible* (London, 1919), p. 746.
- 41 Watson, *Bruckner*, p. 111.
- 42 *Ibid.*, p. 118.
- 43 Simpson, *Essence*, p. 131.
- 44 Eero Tarasti, *Myth and Music: a Semiotic Approach to the Aesthetics of Myth in Music* (The Hague, 1979), p. 92.
- 45 Simpson, *Essence*, 103.
- 46 Deryck Cooke, 'Bruckner', *The New Grove Late Romantic Masters* (London, 1985), p. 53.
- 47 *Ibid.*, p. 50.
- 48 Gregory Bateson, *Steps to an Ecology of Mind*, rev. edn (Chicago and London, 2000), p. 113.
- 49 Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, trans. Brian Massumi (Minneapolis, 1987), p. 22.
- 50 *Ibid.*
- 51 Evidence for this claim is provided by the work of German critical scholarship in the nineteenth century; see Rowland Williams, 'Bunsen's Biblical Researches', in Frederick Temple, Rowland Williams, Benjamin Jowett, et al., *Essays and Reviews* (London, 1860; repr. Farnborough, 1970), pp. 50–93.
- 52 Quoted by Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8*, p. 7. This statement originally appeared in 'Anton Bruckner', *Die Zeit* 7 (1896) and is reprinted in *Heinrich Schenker als Essayist und Kritiker: gesammelte Aufsätze, Rezensionen und kleinere Berichte aus den Jahren 1891–1901*, ed. Hellmut Federhofer (Hildesheim, 1990), pp. 200–1.
- 53 Puffett, 'Bruckner's Way', 9 and 33.
- 54 Deleuze and Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus*, p. 22; a rhizome is an underground stem with a mixture of roots and shoots.

- 55 Simpson, *Essence*, p. 232.
- 56 *Ibid.*, p. 128.
- 57 Watson, *Bruckner*, pp. 66–7.
- 58 Newlin, *Bruckner–Mahler–Schoenberg*, p. 96.
- 59 Simpson, *Essence*, p. 164.
- 60 *Ibid.*, pp. 167–8.
- 61 Ernst Kurth, *Selected Writings*, ed. and trans. Lee A. Rothfarb (Cambridge, 1991), p. 203.
- 62 Doernberg, *Bruckner*, p. 136.
- 63 Bryan Gilliam, ‘The Two Versions of Bruckner’s Eighth Symphony’, *NCM* 15 (1991–2), 59–69, in particular 66.
- 64 *Ibid.*
- 65 *Ibid.*, n. 22.
- 66 The original coda of this work was revised; see Arthur D. Walker, ‘Foreword’, *Overture in G minor by Anton Bruckner* (London, 1971), pp. iii–iv.
- 67 Deleuze and Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus*, p. 12.
- 68 Doernberg, *Bruckner*, p. 220.
- 69 Deleuze and Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus*, p. 9.
- 70 Robert S. Hatten, ‘The Expressive Role of Disjunction: a Semiotic Approach to Form and Meaning in the Fourth and Fifth Symphony’, in *PAB*, 145–84.
- 71 ‘Bruckner Propositions (II)’, 9.
- 72 Newlin, *Bruckner–Mahler–Schoenberg*, p. 92.
- 73 ‘Zur Stellung der “Nullten” Symphonie in Bruckners Werk’, in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung* (Walter Wiora zum 30. Dezember 1986), ed. Christoph-Helmut Mahling (Tutzing, 1988), pp. 63–79, in particular 69–79. I am grateful to John Williamson for bringing this to my attention.
- 74 Cited by Peter Palmer, ‘Ludwig Wittgenstein’s Remarks on Bruckner’, in *PAB*, pp. 353–62; the remarks are in Ludwig Wittgenstein, *Vermischte Bemerkungen*, ed. Georg Henrik von Wright (Frankfurt am Main and Oxford, 1977).
- 75 Martin Pulbrook, ‘“Death, Release and Resolve”: an Analysis of Anton Bruckner’s Seventh Symphony’, *Maynooth Review* 9 (1983), 93, n. 4.
- 76 *Meine Erinnerungen an Anton Bruckner* (Vienna, 1901), cited in Johnson, *Bruckner Remembered*, p. 33.
- 77 See Elisabeth Maier, ‘A Hidden Personality: Access to an “Inner Biography” of Anton Bruckner’, in *BS*, pp. 32–53, in particular 51.
- 78 Newlin, *Bruckner–Mahler–Schoenberg*, p. 81.
- 79 Cooke, ‘Bruckner’, 20.
- 9 Programme symphony and absolute music**
- 1 Rebecca Grotjahn, *Die Sinfonie im deutschen Kulturgebiet 1850 bis 1875: ein Beitrag zur Gattungs- und Institutionengeschichte* (Sinzig, 1998).
- 2 Matthias Wiegandt, *Vergessene Symphonik? Studien zu Joachim Raff, Carl Reinicke und zum Problem der Epigonalität in der Musik* (Sinzig, 1997).
- 3 See F. E. Kirby, ‘Beethoven’s Pastoral Symphony as a *Sinfonia Characteristica*’, *MQ* 56 (1970), 605–23.
- 4 Grotjahn, *Die Sinfonie*, p. 271.
- 5 *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 256–65; see Carl Dahlhaus, *The Idea of Absolute Music*, trans. Roger Lustig (Chicago, 1989), pp. 40–1, and ‘Bruckner und die Programmmusik: zum Finale der Achten Symphonie’, in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung* (Walter Wiora zum 30. Dezember 1986), ed. Christoph-Helmut Mahling (Tutzing, 1988), pp. 7–32.
- 6 *Brahms und Bruckner: Studien zur musikalischen Exegetik* (Wiesbaden, 1980), pp. 155–6 and 158–9. That Bruckner sometimes thought of Berlioz, Liszt, and Wagner as a group does not make them indispensable for understanding his music; see Martin Geck, *Zwischen Romantik und Restauration: Musik im Realismus-Diskurs 1848–1871* (Kassel and Stuttgart, 2001), p. 130.
- 7 Leopold Nowak, ‘Anton Bruckner, der Romantiker’, in *Über Anton Bruckner: gesammelte Aufsätze* (Vienna, 1985), pp. 157–9.
- 8 Walter Wiora, ‘Über den religiösen Gehalt in Bruckners Symphonien’, in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung*, pp. 274–5 and 269.
- 9 Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, p. 174; letter of 19 September 1876, in *H-SI*, p. 2.
- 10 Ernst Decsey, *Bruckner: Versuch eines Lebens* (Stuttgart and Berlin, 1919), pp. 131–2; Max Auer, *Bruckner: sein Leben und Werk*, 2nd edn (Vienna, 1934), p. 192.
- 11 *H-SI*, p. 228.
- 12 Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, p. 173.
- 13 Joseph von Eichendorff, *Werke*, ed. Ansgar Hillach, 3 vols. to date (Munich, 1970), vol. III: *Geschichte der poetischen Literatur Deutschlands*, p. 779; Jean Paul, *Werke*, ed. Norbert Miller and Gustav Lohmann, 6 vols. (Munich, 1959–63), vol. V: *Vorschule der Ästhetik*, p. 91.
- 14 *Göll-A*, IV/1, p. 519; Decsey, *Bruckner*, p. 197; Auer, *Bruckner*, pp. 197–8.
- 15 For the ‘Promethean’ interpretation of Josef Schalk, see Benjamin M. Korstvedt,

Bruckner: Symphony No. 8 (Cambridge, 2000), pp. 49–51.

16 Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, p. 183, citing an often-quoted letter.

17 Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8*, p. 52.

18 Göll-A, IV/3, p. 15; Decsey, *Bruckner*, pp. 216–17; Friedrich Eckstein, *Alte unennbare Tage* (Vienna, 1936; repr. 1988), p. 145.

19 Göll-A, IV/3, p. 18.

20 Thomas Röder, ‘Anton Bruckners Glaube’, in *B-P*, pp. 61–2.

21 Eckstein, *Alte unennbare Tage*, p. 145.

22 ‘Der deutsche Michael erwacht: zur Bruckner-Rezeption im NS-Staat’, in *B-P*, pp. 206–7.

23 Heinrich Heine, *Werke und Briefe*, ed. Hans Kaufmann, 2nd edn, 10 vols. (Berlin and Weimar, 1972), vol. V, p. 34.

24 Dümmling, ‘Der deutsche Michael erwacht’, p. 207.

25 See Hermann Kretzschmar, ‘Anton Bruckner, Symphony No. 4’, in *Music Analysis in the Nineteenth Century*, ed. Ian Bent, 2 vols. (Cambridge, 1994), vol. II: *Hermeneutic Approaches*, pp. 109–17.

26 See Gerold Wolfgang Gruber, ‘Brahms und Bruckner in der zeitgenössischen Wiener Musikkritik’, in *Bruckner-Symposium, ‘Johannes Brahms und Anton Bruckner’* (Linz 1983): *Bericht*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Linz, 1985), p. 207.

27 Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, pp. 174–9, in particular 178. Auer explains this tale as an example of the Austrian fondness for concealing serious matters with a jest (*Bruckner*, p. 195).

28 See Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, p. 178; Robert S. Hatten, ‘The Expressive Role of Disjunction: a Semiotic Approach to Form and Meaning in the Fourth and Fifth Symphonies’, in *PAB*, pp. 166–7.

29 François René de Chateaubriand, *Génie du Christianisme*, ed. Pierre Reboul, 2 vols. (Paris, 1966), vol. I, p. 401.

30 Constantin Floros, ‘Zur Deutung der Symphonik Bruckners: das Adagio der Neunten Symphonie’, *B-J 1981* (1982), 89–96.

31 *EKB*, vol. II, pp. 733–7.

32 Paul Thissen, *Zitattechniken in der Symphonik des 19. Jahrhunderts* (Sinzig, 1998).

33 Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen takes an even more sceptical view of the Wagnerian origins of this ‘quotation’, pointing out that it also has associations with the Kyrie of the D minor Mass; see ‘Bruckners Wagner-Zitate’, in *B-P*, pp. 124–5.

34 These criticisms draw on Hinrichsen, ‘Bruckners Wagner-Zitate’, pp. 115–33; Thissen, *Zitattechniken*, pp. 109–32, and Wolfram Steinbeck, “‘Dona nobis pacem’: religiöse Symbolik in Bruckners Symphonien’, in *B-P*, pp. 87–96. They do not deny the existence of an ‘intertextual pool’ (Hatten, ‘The Expressive Role of Disjunction’, p. 179), but see it in conjunction with a ‘common stylistic heritage’ and strategies of coherence rather than as a programmatic narrative.

35 Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, pp. 168–70 and 207; Dahlhaus, ‘Bruckner und die Programm Musik’, pp. 15–16.

36 Hinrichsen, ‘Bruckners Wagner-Zitate’, pp. 116 and 121; Peter Gülke, *Brahms – Bruckner: zwei Studien* (Kassel, 1989), p. 136.

37 Robert Schollum, ‘Umkreisungen: Anmerkungen zum Beginn des Adagio der Neunten Symphonie Bruckners’, in *B-J 1981* (1992), p. 101; Röder, ‘Anton Bruckners Glaube’, pp. 61–3.

38 Dahlhaus, ‘Bruckner und die Programm Musik’, p. 32.

39 Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, pp. 16–17 and 156; Dahlhaus, ‘Bruckner und die Programm Musik’, pp. 28–32.

40 Carol S. Bevier, ‘The Program Symphonies of Joseph Joachim Raff’, Ph.D. dissertation, North Texas State University (1982), pp. 29–30.

41 Wiegandt, *Vergessene Symphonik?*, p. 308.

42 Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, p. 181.

43 Hatten, ‘The Expressive Role of Disjunction’, pp. 146–7; Timothy L. Jackson, ‘The Finale of Bruckner’s Seventh Symphony and the Tragic Reversed Sonata Form’, in *BS*, p. 143. Jackson does not use ‘programmatic’ here in quite the same sense as Floros, and ‘affective-rhetorical’ may be closer to the kind of analysis that he proposes.

44 See Warren Darcy, ‘Bruckner’s Sonata Deformations’, in *BS*, pp. 276–7.

10 Bruckner editions: the revolution revisited

I would like to thank my colleagues Paul Hawshaw, Thomas Röder, and William Carragan for their helpful comments and suggestions about various aspects of this article, and Crawford Howie for his bibliographic assistance.

1 The term ‘Bruckner Problem’ was made famous by Deryck Cooke’s ‘The Bruckner Problem Simplified’, in *Vindication: Essays about Romantic Music* (Cambridge, 1982), pp. 43–71; originally published in *The Musical Times* 110 (1969), 20–2, 142–4, 362, 479–82, and 828.

- 2 See Leopold Nowak, 'Die Anton Bruckner Gesamtausgabe: ihre Geschichte und Schicksale', in *B-J 1982/83* (1984), 33–67, and William Carragan, 'The Early Version of the Second Symphony', in *PAB*, pp. 85–8.
- 3 Letter to Wilhelm Tappert, 12 October 1877, in *H-SI*, pp. 175–6 and in Max Auer (ed.), *Anton Bruckner: gesammelte Briefe – neue Folge* (Regensburg, 1924), pp. 144–5.
- 4 See, in particular, Manfred Wagner, *Der Wandel des Konzepts: zu den verschiedenen Fassungen von Bruckners Dritter, Viertes und Achter Sinfonie* (Vienna, 1980), and Timothy Jackson, 'Bruckner's Metrical Numbers', *NCM* 14 (1990–1), 101–31, and 'Bruckner's Oktaven: The Problem of Consecutives, Doubling, and Orchestral Voice-leading', in *PAB*, pp. 30–66.
- 5 IX. *Symphonie D-moll, Finale (unvollendet): Rekonstruktion der Autograph-Partitur nach den erhaltenen Quellen*, ABSW, Supplement to IX, ed. John A. Phillips (Vienna, 1994) and II. *Symphonie C-moll: Fassung von 1872*, ABSW, II/1, ed. William Carragan (Vienna, forthcoming).
- 6 A seminal early collection is *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Die Fassungen'* (Linz 1980): *Bericht*, ed. Franz Grasberger (Linz, 1981).
- 7 Tabulations of details of instrumentation in the first published versions of the Sixth, Eighth, and Ninth Symphonies may be found in Wolfgang Doebel, *Bruckners Sinfonien in Bearbeitungen: die Konzepte der Bruckner-Schüler und ihre Rezeption bis zu Robert Haas* (Tutzing, 2001), pp. 451–70.
- 8 The 1888 version of the Fourth Symphony will be published as *Anton Bruckner: IV Symphonie Es-Dur, Fassung von 1888*, ABSW, IV/3, ed. Benjamin M. Korstvedt (Vienna, in preparation); also see Korstvedt, 'The First Printed Edition of Anton Bruckner's Fourth Symphony: Collaboration and Authenticity', *NCM* 20 (1996–7), 3–26.
- 9 Influential English-language statements of this position may be found in Cooke's 'The Bruckner Problem Simplified' and in his article on Bruckner in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, 20 vols. (London, 1980), vol. III, pp. 352–71, as well as in Robert Simpson, *The Essence of Bruckner*, 3rd edn (London, 1992). Erwin Doernberg, *The Life and Symphonies of Anton Bruckner* (London, 1960) contains an early, partisan exposition; see pp. 113–24.
- 10 Cooke, 'The Bruckner Problem Simplified', p. 53.
- 11 'zum erstenmal den von Bruckner festgelegten Text' – Pamphlet advertising Haas' edition of the Sixth Symphony (1935), reproduced in Nowak, 'Die Anton Bruckner Gesamtausgabe', p. 57, emphasis in the original.
- 12 'Wichtige Aufgaben der Musikwissenschaft gegenüber Anton Bruckner', *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 1 (1919), 293–5.
- 13 'Bruckner-Ausgaben (eine Erwiderung)', *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 1 (1919), 422–4. Göhler also published two brief replies to Orel: a 'Nachschrift' appended to Orel's article (*Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 1 (1919), 424–5) and a brief comment published in the 'Mitteilungen' section of *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 1 (1919), 735.
- 14 'Original und Bearbeitung bei Anton Bruckner', *Deutsche Musikkultur* 1 (1936–7), 193–222. On the circumstances of Orel's removal see Christa Brüstle, *Bruckner und die Nachwelt: zur Rezeptionsgeschichte des Komponisten in der ersten Hälfte des 20. Jahrhunderts* (Stuttgart, 1998), pp. 166–9.
- 15 From Goebbels' address at the installation of the Bruckner bust in Walhalla on 6 June 1937; quoted in Paul Ehlers, 'Das Regensburger Bruckner-Erlebnis', *Zeitschrift für Musik* 104 (1937), 747; also see the translation of this speech by John Michael Cooper in *MQ* 78 (1994), 605–9 and Bryan Gilliam's discussion of the event in 'The Annexation of Anton Bruckner: Nazi Revisionism and the Politics of Appropriation', *MQ* 78 (1994), 584–604.
- 16 Nowak, 'Die Anton Bruckner Gesamtausgabe', p. 39.
- 17 See Doebel's discussion of Haas' interpretation of the percussion in *Bruckners Sinfonien in Bearbeitungen*, pp. 395–8.
- 18 See Carragan, 'The Early Version of the Second Symphony', pp. 85–8; Benjamin M. Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8* (Cambridge, 2000), pp. 104–6; and Doebel, *Bruckners Sinfonien in Bearbeitungen*, pp. 302–401.
- 19 This position has recently received a lengthy and detailed restatement in Doebel's *Bruckners Sinfonien in Bearbeitungen*.
- 20 Noteworthy examples include Egon Wellesz, 'Anton Bruckner and the Process of Musical Creation', *MQ* 24 (1938), 265–90; Gertrud Staub-Schläpfer, 'Einige Glossen zur "Originalfassung" von Bruckners 8. Sinfonie', *Schweizerische Musikzeitung* 79 (1939), 542–7; Werner Wolff, *Anton Bruckner: Rustic Genius* (New York, 1942), pp. 261–70; Emil Armbruster, *Erstdruckfassung oder "Originalfassung"?: ein Beitrag zur Brucknerfrage am fünfzigsten Todestag des Meisters* (Leipzig, 1946); and Joseph Braunstein, Notes to Anton

Bruckner, Symphony No. 8 in C minor (1890 version), Vienna Pro Musica Orchestra, cond. Jascha Horenstein (Vox CDX2 5504).

- 21 Important contributions include Brüstle, *Bruckner und die Nachwelt*; Brüstle, 'Politisch-ideologische Implikationen der ersten Bruckner-Gesamtausgabe', in *B-P*, pp. 192–201; and Morten Solvik, 'The International Bruckner Society and the N.S.D.A.P.: A Case Study of Robert Haas and the Critical Edition', *MQ* 82 (1998), 362–82. Also see Benjamin M. Korstvedt's "'Return to the Pure Sources": the Ideology and Text-critical Legacy of the First Bruckner Gesamtausgabe', in *BS*, pp. 91–109; 'Anton Bruckner in the Third Reich and after: an Essay on Ideology and Bruckner Reception', *MQ* 80 (1996), 132–60; and 'The First Edition of Anton Bruckner's Fourth Symphony: Authorship, Production, and Reception', Ph.D. thesis, University of Pennsylvania (1995), esp. pp. 7–241. Also important and somewhat different in approach is Nowak's 'Die Anton Bruckner Gesamtausgabe'.
- 22 See Korstvedt, 'The First Edition of Anton Bruckner's Fourth Symphony' as well as the overview offered in Thomas Röder, 'Neues zur Fassungsfrage bei Anton Bruckner', *Neues musikwissenschaftliches Jahrbuch* 8 (1999), 115–35. Paul Hawkshaw offers a measured view of the editorial issues raised by the re-evaluation of the first published versions in 'The Bruckner Problem Revisited', *NCM* 21 (1997–8), 96–107.
- 23 This score was owned by Ferdinand Löwe's son and surfaced under unusual circumstances in 1940; see Brüstle, *Bruckner und die Nachwelt*, pp. 159–67. It has since returned to an unknown private collection, but a complete set of photos is preserved in the Wiener Stadt- und Landesbibliothek; see Korstvedt, 'The First Printed Edition of Anton Bruckner's Fourth Symphony', pp. 7–16.
- 24 III. *Symphonie D-moll, Revisionsbericht*, ABSW, Supplement to III, ed. Thomas Röder (Vienna, 1997) and IX. *Symphonie D-moll, kritischer Bericht*, ABSW, Supplement to IX, ed. Benjamin Gunnar Cohrs (Vienna, 2001).
- 25 Haas reportedly made this assertion in a lecture before the first Viennese performance of his edition of the Fifth Symphony; see Paul Stefan, 'Um Bruckner', *Die Stunde*, 15 March 1936.
- 26 See 'The Bruckner Problem Simplified', p. 61 and Redlich, Preface to *Anton Bruckner: Symphony No. 4 in E flat major, 'Romantic'* (London, [1955]), pp. v–vi.
- 27 Paul Hawkshaw, 'Bruckner', in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed.

Stanley Sadie and John Tyrrell, 2nd edn, 29 vols. (London and New York, 2001), vol. IV, p. 467; also see his 'The Bruckner Problem Revisited', 101–3.

- 28 The text of this document has been widely reproduced. Two recent sources are Manfred Wagner, *Bruckner: eine Monographie* (Mainz, 1983), pp. 300–1 and Rolf Keller, 'Die letztwilligen Verfügungen Anton Bruckners', in *B-J* 1982/83 (1984), 98–9. The instructions regarding his manuscripts are found in the fourth section of the will. A recent and careful appraisal of the will and its implications is found in Hawkshaw, 'The Bruckner Problem Revisited', 96–107.
- 29 *Bruckner und die Nachwelt*, p. 183.
- 30 The phrase was Haas'; see Alfred Orel, 'Original und Bearbeitung bei Anton Bruckner', p. 201, and Doebel, *Bruckners Sinfonien in Bearbeitungen*, p. 263.
- 31 'Bericht zur Gesamtausgabe der Werke Anton Bruckners', 25 April 1938; quoted in Brüstle, 'Politisch-ideologische Implikationen', p. 198 and in Solvik, 'The International Bruckner Society and the N.S.D.A.P.', 369.
- 32 In February 1940 the Reich Ministry of Volksaufklärung and Propaganda actually urged a ban on public debate of the 'original versions' until a 'conclusive scholarly resolution' was reached; see Günter Brosche, 'Ideologische Einflüsse auf das Nachleben Anton Bruckners', in *Österreichische Musik – Musik in Österreich: Theophil Antonicek zum 60. Geburtstag*, ed. Elisabeth Theresia Hilscher (Tutzing, 1998), pp. 458–9, and Brüstle, *Bruckner und die Nachwelt*, p. 160, n. 94.
- 33 For a full discussion of this see Brüstle, *Bruckner und die Nachwelt*, pp. 123–236, and Korstvedt, 'The First Edition of Anton Bruckner's Fourth Symphony', pp. 83–185.
- 34 Doebel, for example, describes these developments as 'opposition' to Haas and Nowak and 'vehement' support for the Schalk and Löwe 'party', oddly reviving the positions taken in the 1930s; see *Bruckners Sinfonien in Bearbeitungen*, pp. 409–15.
- 35 'Ideologische Einflüsse auf das Nachleben Anton Bruckners', p. 451.
- 36 *John Wayne's America: the Politics of Celebrity* (New York, 1997), p. 26.
- 37 'Myth and Historiography', in *Myth and Modern Philosophy* (Philadelphia, 1990), pp. 9–10; quoted in Arved Ashby, 'Schoenberg, Boulez, and Twelve-tone Composition as "Ideal Type"', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 54 (2001), 619.
- 38 Robert Pascall, 'The Editor's Brahms', in *The Cambridge Companion to Brahms*, ed.

- Michael Musgrave (Cambridge, 1999), p. 252; also see his 'Brahms and the Definitive Text', in *Brahms: Biographical, Documentary and Analytic Studies*, ed. Robert Pascall (Cambridge, 1982), pp. 59–75.
- 39 'Overriding the Autograph Score: The Problem of Textual Authority in Verdi's *Falstaff*', *Studi Verdiani* 8 (1992), 13–51.
- 40 *Ibid.*, 19–29.
- 41 *Ibid.*, 21–2.
- 42 Jerome McGann, *A Critique of Modern Textual Criticism* (Chicago and London, 1983; reprint. Charlottesville, 1992), p. 42.
- 43 On this point see Peter Shillingsburg, 'An Inquiry into the Social Status of Texts and Modes of Textual Criticism', *Studies in Bibliography* 42 (1989), 55–79.
- 44 'Public and Private in the Study of Manuscripts', *Text* 6 (1994), 51.
- 45 'The Editor's Brahms', p. 251.
- 46 *A Critique of Modern Textual Criticism*, p. 75.
- 47 *The Critical Editing of Music: History, Method, and Practice* (Cambridge, 1996), p. 19.
- 48 *H-SI*, p. 217 and Auer (ed.), *Bruckner: gesammelte Briefe*, p. 164.
- 49 *H-SI*, p. 224 and Auer (ed.), *Bruckner: gesammelte Briefe*, pp. 169–70.
- 50 This is clear, for example, in the 1888 version (i.e. the first published version) of the Fourth Symphony.
- 51 Peter Gülke, 'The Orchestra as Medium of Realization: Thoughts on the Finale of Brahms's First Symphony, on the Different Versions of Bruckner's Sixth Symphony, and on "Part One" of Mahler's Fifth Symphony', *MQ* 80 (1996), 272.
- 52 For the first suggestion, see Rudolf Stephan, 'In und Jenseits der Tradition: zur sechsten Symphonie Anton Bruckner', *Österreichische Musikzeitschrift* 51 (1996), 31; for the second, see Simpson, *Essence*, pp. 168–9. William Carragan examined how various conductors handled tempi in the first movement in 'Tempo studies on Bruckner's Sixth and Eighth Symphonies', a paper read at 'The Wagnerian Symphony', a conference held in Troy, New York, 22 November 1996.
- 53 See Gülke, 'The Orchestra as Medium of Realization' as well as Constantin Floros, 'Historische Phasen der Bruckner-Interpretation', in *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Bruckner-Interpretation'* (Linz 1982): *Bericht*, ed. Franz Grasberger (Linz, 1982), pp. 93–102, and William Carragan's 'Reconstructing Bruckner's Tempos', *American Record Guide* (Nov./Dec. 1996), 73–5 and 177 and 'Tempo Studies on Bruckner's Fourth Symphony', unpublished paper read at 'Perspectives on Anton Bruckner', a conference at the University of Manchester, April 1996, all of which incorporate studies of historical recordings.
- 54 On this point, see Korstvedt, 'Anton Bruckner in the Third Reich and after', 149–50, and on the evolution of performing styles see Robert Philip, *Early Recordings and Musical Style: Changing Tastes in Instrumental Performance, 1900–1950* (Cambridge, 1992).
- 55 Richard Taruskin has argued for the positive role of unfamiliarity in historically informed performance and for the aesthetic ends of this pursuit; see 'The Limits of Authenticity: a Contribution', in *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance* (New York and Oxford, 1995), pp. 77–81.

11 Bruckner and the symphony orchestra

1 See Max Auer, 'Anton Bruckner, die Orgel und Richard Wagner', *Zeitschrift für Musik* 5 (1937), 477–81; Alfred Lorenz, 'Zur Instrumentation von Anton Bruckners Symphonien', *Zeitschrift für Musik* 4 (1936), 1318–25.

2 See Auer, 'Anton Bruckner, die Orgel und Richard Wagner', 477.

3 *Ibid.*, 478.

4 The passage is bars 175–200 in ABSW, V (Vienna, 1951).

5 See Auer, 'Anton Bruckner, die Orgel und Richard Wagner', 478.

6 See Lorenz, 'Zur Instrumentation von Anton Bruckners Symphonien', 1381.

7 See *ibid.*, 1325. Compare this for example with Goebbels' views at the 1937 Regensburg Bruckner Festival; see *Goebbels Reden*, ed. Helmut Heiber, 2 vols. (Düsseldorf, 1971), vol. I, pp. 281–6.

8 See for example Ingrid Fuchs, 'Klingt Bruckner "wagnerisch"?' and Gerda Lechleitner, 'Bruckner – Wagner: ein messbarer Unterschied', in *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Bruckner, Wagner und die Neudeutschen in Österreich'* (Linz 1984), ed. Othmar Wessely (Linz, 1986), pp. 111–22 and 123–47.

9 Gerald Abraham, *A Hundred Years of Music*, 1st edn (London, 1938), p. 193.

10 Alfred Einstein, 'Bruckner, Anton', in *The Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 3rd edn, ed. H. C. Colles, 5 vols. (London, 1927), vol. I, p. 482; Hans Redlich, 'Bruckner, Anton', in *The Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 5th edn, ed. Eric Blom, 9 vols. (London, 1954), vol. II, p. 971.

11 See Deryck Cooke, 'Anton Bruckner', in *The New Grove Late Romantic Masters* (London, 1980); Denis Arnold, 'Bruckner, Anton' in *The Oxford Companion to Music* (Oxford, 1983), p. 278; Donald Jay Grout and Claude Palisca, *A History of Western Music*, 5th edn (New York, 1996), p. 592; Derek Watson, *Bruckner*, 2nd edn (Oxford, 1996), p. 64; Hans-Hubert Schönzeler, *Bruckner* (London, 1970), p. 164.

12 See for example Bryan Gilliam, 'The Annexation of Anton Bruckner: Nazi Revisionism and the Politics of Appropriation', in *BS*, pp. 72–90.

13 See Alexander Rehding, 'Trial Scenes at Nuremberg', *Music Analysis* 20 (2001), 239–67; Stephen McClatchie, *Analyzing Wagner's Operas: Alfred Lorenz and German Nationalist Ideology* (Rochester, 1998); McClatchie, 'Bruckner and the Bayreuthians; or, *Das Geheimnis der Form bei Anton Bruckner*', in *BS*, pp. 110–21. Auer's engagement with contemporary politics took a different form, emphasizing suggestive parallels between the growth of the Bruckner movement in the 1930s and the spiritual rebirth of the German nation under National Socialism. See for example Göll-A, IV/4, pp. 61–2, translated in Benjamin M. Korstvedt, 'Anton Bruckner in the Third Reich and After: An Essay on Ideology and Bruckner Reception', *MQ* 80 (1996), 136.

14 See Paul Hawkshaw, 'A Composer Learns his Craft: Anton Bruckner's Lessons in Form and Orchestration with Otto Kitzler, 1861–63', in *PAB*, pp. 3–29.

15 See for example bars 318–50 of the first movement.

16 Kurth advances a similar notion in his distinction between lengthwise and crosswise profiles (*Längsschnitt*, *Querschnitt*). He regarded Bruckner's forms as compounds of symphonic waves (*Wellen*), which in their lengthwise profile are constructed from the build-up and dissipation of tiers (*Schichtungen*); *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 279–355. This passage from the Sixth Symphony is considered in pp. 291–308.

17 Persistently in the second statement, the theme is accompanied by free rhythmic imitations in the horns, a common Brucknerian habit. Generally in this analysis I will consider such instances to be amplifications of an existent stratum, rather than as a separate stratum, unless the imitations proliferate to form a substantial part of the texture, as is the case in bars 159–82.

18 See for example *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 279–89.

19 As for example in Simpson's idea that the symphonies embody a 'patient search for pacification', rather than the dynamic 'struggle–victory' archetype of the Beethovenian symphony, or more recently Benjamin Korstvedt's contention that 'the final tonic major [in the Eighth Symphony] is not wrested from the darkness with Beethovenian might, but granted to us with awesome ease'; see Robert Simpson, *The Essence of Bruckner*, 1st edn (London, 1967), pp. 198–9 and Benjamin M. Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8* (Cambridge, 2000), p. 49.

20 On Bruckner's relation to the Baroque, see for example Carl Dahlhaus, 'Bruckner und der Barock', *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 124 (1963), 335–6.

21 See Paul Hawkshaw, 'The Bruckner Problem Revisited', *NCM* 21 (1997–8), 96–107 and especially p. 106.

12 Between formlessness and formality: aspects of Bruckner's approach to symphonic form

I would like to thank William Carragan for his careful reading of and thoughtful responses to a draft of this essay.

1 *Wiener Abendpost*, 28 October 1873; reprint in *Göll-A*, IV/1, p. 252.

2 *Wiener Allgemeine Zeitung*, 30 March 1886; reprint in *Göll-A*, IV/2, p. 438.

3 *Wiener Salonblatt*, 28 December 1884; reprint and trans. in *The Music Criticism of Hugo Wolf*, ed. and trans. Henry Pleasants (New York, 1979), p. 99.

4 Max Kiel, 'Ist Bruckner Formlos?', *Neue Musik-Zeitung* 23 (1902), 176.

5 'Der erste Satz von Bruckners Neunter: ein Bild höchster Formvollendung', *Die Musik* 18 (1925–6), 210–34 and 104–12. On the ideological context of Grunsky's project, see Stephen McClatchie, 'Bruckner and the Bayreuthians; or, *Das Geheimnis der Form bei Anton Bruckner*', in *BS*, pp. 110–21.

6 On the Seventh, see Leopold Nowak, 'Das Finale von Bruckners VII. Symphonie' (1956), in *Über Anton Bruckner* (Vienna, 1985), pp. 30–4, esp. p. 30. For a critical study of the formal evolution of Bruckner's Finales see William Carragan, 'Structural Aspects of the Revisions of Bruckner's Symphonic Finales', in *Bruckner-Symposion, Fassungen, Bearbeitungen, Vollendungen* (Linz 1996), ed. Uwe Harten *et al.* (Linz, 1998), pp. 177–88.

7 'Zur Klärung der Wagnerkontroverse' (1896); reprint in Christian von Ehrenfels, *Philosophische Schriften*, vol. II, *Ästhetik*, ed. Reinhard Fabian (Munich, 1986), p. 107.

- 8 Rudolf Louis, *Der Widerspruch in der Musik: Bausteine zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst auf realdialektischer Grundlage* (Leipzig, 1893), p. 103; quoted in Christa Brüstle, *Bruckner und die Nachwelt* (Stuttgart, 1998), p. 20.
- 9 Quoted in Margaret Notley, 'Bruckner and Viennese Wagnerism', in *BS*, p. 61.
- 10 Franz Schalk, 'A. Bruckner: Betrachtungen und Erinnerungen (1921)', *Die Musik* 24 (1931–2), 882; reprint in Lili Schalk (ed.), *Franz Schalk: Briefe und Betrachtungen* (Vienna and Leipzig, 1935), p. 89.
- 11 Halm, *Von zwei Kulturen der Musik* (Munich, 1913; 3rd edn, Stuttgart, 1947), p. 253; quoted from Carl Dahlhaus, *The Idea of Absolute Music*, trans. Roger Lustig (Chicago and London, 1989), pp. 123–4.
- 12 *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 241–2.
- 13 'Bruckner, Josef Anton', *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, 17 vols. (Kassel, 1949–86), vol. II, cols. 369–71.
- 14 See Donald J. Grout and Claude V. Palisca, *A History of Western Music*, 6th edn (New York, 2001), pp. 561–2; Leon Plantinga, *Romantic Music* (New York, 1984), p. 437.
- 15 See "'Urfassung" und "Endfassung" bei Anton Bruckner', in *Über Anton Bruckner*, pp. 34–7.
- 16 Blume's position on Bruckner's schematicism found considerable acceptance in its day; see Werner Korte, *Bruckner und Brahms: die spätromantische Lösung der autonomen Konzeption* (Tutzing, 1963), pp. 44–6, 54, 61–4. More recent scholars have contested and refined Blume's position: e.g. Wolfram Steinbeck, 'Form als Schema bei Anton Bruckner: zum Adagio der VII. Symphonie', in *Analysen: Beiträge zu einer Problemsgeschichte des Komponierens (Festschrift für Hans Heinrich Eggebrecht zum 65. Geburtstag)*, ed. Werner Breig, Reinhold Brinkmann, and Elmar Budde (Stuttgart, 1984), pp. 304–23; Steinbeck, *Anton Bruckner: Neunte Symphonie D-Moll, Meisterwerke der Musik* 60 (Munich, 1993), pp. 25–49; Bo Marschner, 'Schema und Individualität in der Formbildung Bruckners anhand seiner Reprisenkonzeption ab der Vierten Symphonie', in *Bruckner-Symposion, Fassungen, Bearbeitungen, Vollendungen* (Linz 1996), ed. Uwe Harten *et al.* (Linz, 1998) pp. 17–24.
- 17 Wolfram Steinbeck, 'Bruckner, (Joseph) Anton', in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, rev. edn, Personenteil, 6 vols. to date (Kassel, 2000), vol. III, col. 1090.
- 18 'Bruckner: Romantic Symphony in E flat Major, no. 4', in *Essays in Musical Analysis*, 6 vols. (Oxford, 1935–9), vol. II, p. 73.
- 19 'Issues in Composition', in *Between Romanticism and Modernism: Four Studies in the Music of the Later Nineteenth Century*, trans. Mary Whitall (Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1980), p. 44.
- 20 August Halm, *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners* (Munich, 1913), pp. 62–4.
- 21 'Mahler and Episodic Structure: the First Movement of the Seventh Symphony', in *The Seventh Symphony of Gustav Mahler: a Symposium*, ed. James L. Zychowicz (Madison, Wisc., 1990), p. 31. Also see Dika Newlin's suggestion that Bruckner's third themes derive from Beethoven's codetta themes in *Bruckner – Mahler – Schoenberg* (New York, 1971), p. 90; and Friedrich Blume's comments in *Classic and Romantic Music: A Comprehensive Survey*, trans. M. D. Herter Norton, 1st edn (New York, 1970), p. 153.
- 22 See Rey M. Longyear and Kate R. Covington, 'Sources of the Three-Key Exposition', *Journal of Musicology* 6 (1988), 448–70.
- 23 James Webster, 'Schubert's Sonata Form and Brahms's First Maturity (II)', *NCM* 3 (1979–80), 61.
- 24 'Beethoven's Ninth Symphony: Its Place in Musical Art', in *Essays in Musical Analysis*, vol. II, p. 5.
- 25 For further discussion of the technique of *Steigerung*, see below, Chapter 13, pp. 198–9.
- 26 *Mahler: A Musical Physiognomy*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Chicago and London, 1992), p. 27.
- 27 See Constantin Floros, 'Die Zitate in Bruckner's Symphonik', in *B-J 1982/83* (1984), 7–18; Egon Voss, 'Wagner Zitate in Bruckners Dritter Sinfonie?', *Die Musikforschung* 49 (1993), 403–6; and Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen's nicely critical 'Bruckners Wagner-Zitate', in *B-P*, pp. 115–33.
- 28 James Buhler, "'Breakthrough" as Critique of Form: the Finale of Mahler's First Symphony', *NCM* 20 (1996–7), 135–7.
- 29 James Webster, 'Sonata Form', in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie and John Tyrrell, 2nd edn, 29 vols. (London and New York, 2001), vol. XXIII, p. 688.
- 30 The term 'sonata principle' seems to have been coined independently by Wilfrid Mellers, in Alec Harman and Wilfrid Mellers, *Man and His Music: The Story of Music Experience in the West*, vol. III, *The Sonata Principle, from c. 1750, 1st edn* (London, 1957), and Edward Cone, in *Musical Form and Musical Performance* (New York, 1968) – see pp. 76–8. My quotation is from Charles

Rosen, *Sonata Forms* (New York, 1980; rev. edn, 1988), pp. 284–5. James Hepokoski's critical history 'Beyond the Sonata Principle', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 55 (2002), 91–154 appeared only after I had finished work on the present article.

31 See Benjamin M. Korstvedt, "'Harmonic Daring" and Symphonic Design in the Sixth Symphony: an Essay in Historical Musical Analysis', in *PAB*, pp. 185–205.

32 For a more extensive analysis of the passage, see Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8* (Cambridge, 2000), pp. 34–6.

33 Louis, *Der Widerspruch in der Musik*, p. 103; quoted in Brüstle, *Bruckner und die Nachwelt*, p. 20.

34 Korte, *Bruckner und Brahms*, p. 61.

35 'Sonata Forms', in *The Forms of Music* (New York, 1956), p. 232.

36 Robert Simpson, *The Essence of Bruckner*, 3rd edn (London, 1992), p. 175; for more examples, see pp. 26–7, 170, and 209.

37 *Musical Form and Musical Performance* (New York, 1968), p. 82.

38 'The New Musical Horizon' (1937), in *Roger Sessions on Music* (Princeton, 1979), p. 47.

39 *The Classical Style*, rev. edn (London, 1976), p. 120. See also Mark Evan Bonds, *Wordless Rhetoric: Musical Form and the Metaphor of the Oration* (Cambridge, Mass., 1991), pp. 23–6.

40 'Issues in Composition', p. 42.

41 Review of Bruckner's Eighth Symphony, *Neue Freie Presse*, 23 December 1892; translation as in Eduard Hanslick, *Music Criticisms 1846–1899*, trans. Henry Pleasants (Baltimore, 1950), pp. 288–9 (modified).

42 'Anton Bruckners Stellung in der Musikgeschichte', in *In Memoriam Anton Bruckner*, ed. Karl Kobald (Vienna, 1924), p. 12.

43 *Classic and Romantic Music*, pp. 143–4.

44 Adler, 'Bruckners Stellung', p. 12.

45 *Ibid.*, pp. 12 and 13.

46 'Liszts Faust-Symphonie und die Krise der symphonischen Form', in *Über Symphonien: Festschrift Walter Wiora zum 70. Geburtstag*, ed. Christoph-Hellmut Mahling (Tutzing, 1979), p. 132.

47 Theodor Helm, 'Anton Bruckner als Tondichter', *Oesterreichische Musik und Theaterzeitung*, 1–15 November 1896; cited in Rudolf Louis, *Anton Bruckner*, rev. edn (Munich, 1918), p. 342.

48 *The Romantic Generation* (Cambridge, Mass., 1995), p. 50.

49 *Ibid.*, p. 51.

50 *Musical Elaborations* (New York, 1991), p. 102.

13 Formal process as spiritual progress: the symphonic slow movements

I would like to thank Kevin Salfen for reading a draft of this chapter.

1 Bernhard Paumgartner, 'Das Instrumental Ensemble', in *Musica aeterna*, ed. Gottfried Schmid, 2 vols. (Zurich, 1950), vol. II, pp. 13–14.

2 August Halm, *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners* (Munich, 1923), pp. 117–18.

3 I have chosen not to discuss the slow movements of the two unnumbered symphonies. Bar numbers are for the collected edition begun under the supervision of Leopold Nowak; I refer to the Linz version (1866) of the First Symphony and the second versions of both the Fourth (1878–80) and Eighth Symphonies.

4 See Margaret Notley, 'Late-Nineteenth-Century Chamber Music and the Cult of the Classical Adagio', *NCM* 23 (1999–2000), 33–61.

5 On *unendliche Melodie*, see Ernst Kurth, *Romantische Harmonik und ihre Krise in Wagners 'Tristan'*, 2nd edn (Berlin, 1923), pp. 444–571. Kurth uses figures from the Vienna version of this Adagio as one of his examples; see *ibid.*, pp. 558–9. See also *EKB*, vol. II, p. 759.

6 *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 564–5.

7 Review in *Deutsche Zeitung*, 17 December 1891, 1–2.

8 Walter Wiora, 'Über den religiösen Gehalt in Bruckners Symphonien', in *Religiöse Musik in nicht-liturgischen Werken von Beethoven bis Reger*, ed. Günther Massenkeil, Klaus Wolfgang Niemöller, and Walter Wiora (Regensburg, 1978), p. 160; reprinted in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung* (Walter Wiora zum 30. Dezember 1986), ed. Christoph-Hellmut Mahling (Tutzing, 1988), pp. 235–75.

9 Interestingly, Helm included the Benedictus in a group of 'Adagios' by Beethoven. See Notley, 'Late-Nineteenth-Century Chamber Music', 41.

10 Wiora, 'Über den religiösen Gehalt in Bruckners Symphonien', pp. 170–9.

11 *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 587–8.

12 Wiora, 'Über den religiösen Gehalt in Bruckners Symphonien', p. 176.

13 See Notley, 'Late-Nineteenth-Century Chamber Music'.

14 Reinhold Brinkmann, *Late Idyll: the Second Symphony of Johannes Brahms*, trans. Peter

- Palmer (Cambridge, Mass. and London, 1995), p. 144.
- 15 Walther Vetter, 'Das Adagio bei Anton Bruckner', *Deutsche Musikkultur* 5 (1940–1), 121–32.
- 16 Quoted in *Göll-A*, IV/3, p. 293.
- 17 See the discussion in Margaret Notley, 'Volksconcerte in Vienna and Late Nineteenth-Century Ideology of the Symphony', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 50 (1997), 432–9.
- 18 See the review of Brahms' Third Symphony quoted in Notley, 'Volksconcerte', 437.
- 19 Heinrich Christoph Koch, *Musikalisches Lexikon* (1802; reprint Hildesheim, Zurich, and New York, 1964), p. 1386.
- 20 For a discussion of the Adagio of Bruckner's Eighth and the aesthetics of the sublime, see Benjamin M. Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8* (Cambridge, 2000), pp. 54–67.
- 21 Arnold Schering, 'Über den Begriff des Monumentalen in der Musik', reprinted in his *Von grossen Meistern der Musik* (Leipzig, 1940), pp. 10, 12, and 14.
- 22 *Ibid.*, p. 15.
- 23 *Ibid.*, p. 17.
- 24 Kurth has written the most eloquent commentary on Bruckner's construction of intensifications and smaller-scale 'waves'. For a recent treatment of Kurth, see Wolfgang Krebs, 'Zum Verhältnis von musikalischer Syntax und Höhepunktsgestaltung in der zweiten Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts', *Musiktheorie* 13 (1998), 31–41.
- 25 Wiora, 'Über den religiösen Gehalt in Bruckners Symphonien', p. 177.
- 26 Vetter, 'Das Adagio bei Anton Bruckner', p. 125.
- 27 *EKB*, vol. II, p. 1002.
- 28 Wolfram Steinbeck, "'Dona nobis pacem': religiöse Symbolik in Bruckners Symphonien", in *B-P*, pp. 87–96.
- 29 *EKB*, vol. II, p. 737.
- 30 Wolfram Steinbeck, *Anton Bruckner: Neunte Symphonie d-Moll* (Munich, 1993), p. 25.
- 31 *EKB*, vol. II, p. 719.

14 Bruckner and harmony

- 1 See Edward Laufer, 'Some Aspects of Prolongational Procedures in the Ninth Symphony', in *BS*, pp. 209–55.
- 2 Smith's system was first presented in Charles J. Smith, 'Prolongations and Progressions as Musical Syntax', in *Music Theory: Special Topics*, ed. Richmond Browne (New York, 1981), pp. 139–74, and later

- revised in Charles J. Smith, 'The Functional Extravagance of Chromatic Chords', *Music Theory Spectrum* 8 (1986), 94–139.
- 3 Throughout this essay, roman numerals are case sensitive to the modality of the chord, and all assume an integrated major-minor context. Therefore, in the key of C major-minor, VII refers to a B major triad, \flat VI to an A \flat major triad, \flat iii to an E \flat minor triad, etc.
- 4 Smith, 'Functional Extravagance', 126–7.
- 5 Daniel Harrison, *Harmonic Function in Chromatic Music* (Chicago and London, 1994), pp. 116–17.
- 6 The idea that harmonic function is not a property of chords themselves, but is instead a phenomenon that exists in the motion of one chord to the next is appropriated from Harrison, *Harmonic Function*, passim.
- 7 Once again, this explanation and language is clearly indebted to Harrison, *Harmonic Function*.
- 8 I use the terms 'basic idea' and 'contrasting idea', as well as other formal terminology, in the sense defined in William Caplin, *Classical Form: A Theory of Formal Functions for the Instrumental Music of Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven* (New York and Oxford, 1998).
- 9 I have discussed the ubiquity of this progression in Bruckner's oeuvre elsewhere; see Kevin J. Swinden, 'Harmonic Tropes and Plagal Dominant Structures in the Music of Anton Bruckner', Ph.D. dissertation, State University of New York at Buffalo (1997).
- 10 The omnibus was first introduced in Victor Fell Yellin, 'The Omnibus Idea', paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Musicological Society, Dallas, 1972. Yellin eventually expanded this paper in *The Omnibus Idea* (Warren, Mich., 1998), reviewed by Paula J. Telesco in *Music Theory Spectrum* 23 (2001), 129–36. See also Paula J. Telesco, 'Enharmonicism and the Omnibus Progression in Classic-Era Music', *Music Theory Spectrum* 20 (1998), 242–79, and Robert W. Wason, *Viennese Harmonic Theory from Albrechtsberger to Schenker and Schoenberg* (Ann Arbor, 1985), pp. 15–19.
- 11 Telesco, 'Enharmonicism', 259.
- 12 Yellin, *Omnibus Idea*, p. 73 refers to omnibus progressions in the first movement of Bruckner's Seventh Symphony, but he does not discuss any in particular, nor does he refer to their precise location.
- 13 *Ibid.*, pp. 73–5.
- 14 Richard Cohn, 'Maximally Smooth Cycles, Hexatonic Systems, and the Analysis of Late Romantic Triadic Progressions', *Music Analysis* 15 (1996), 9–40; also Cohn, 'As

Wonderful as Star Clusters', *NCM* 22 (1998–9), 213–32.

15 Substantial work on neo-Riemannian transformations of seventh-chord cycles has been done by Adrian P. Childs, 'Moving beyond Neo-Riemannian Triads: Exploring a Transformational Model for Seventh Chords', *Journal of Music Theory* 42 (1998), 181–91.

16 Jack Douthett, personal correspondence to Richard Cohn, cited in Richard Cohn, 'Weitzmann's Regions, My Cycles, and Douthett's Dancing Cubes', *Music Theory Spectrum* 22 (2000), 95–6.

17 The choice of $\langle 1 \rangle$ was fairly arbitrary in this instance; selecting to interpret the E as $\langle 0 \rangle$ has no bearing on the present discussion. However, defining the $\langle 0,0,0,0 \rangle$ and $\langle 1,1,1,1 \rangle$ cases as fully-diminished seventh chords permits a complete cycle through 16 (2^4) recognizable harmonic chords, including two diminished sevenths, four half-diminished sevenths, four dominant sevenths, four minor sevenths, and two French sixth chords. There would be four distinct regions possible with this construction, but only two regions that would be mutually exclusive; each region would share half of its members with another of the four possible regions.

18 Hugo Riemann, *Katechismus der Musik* (Berlin, 1890), pp. 123–7.

19 David Kopp, 'A Comprehensive Theory of Chromatic Mediant Relations in Mid-Nineteenth-Century Music' Ph.D. dissertation, Brandeis University (1995), pp. 148–50.

15 Conductors and Bruckner

1 Daniel Barenboim, 'Mystische Erfahrung', in *Bruckner-Symposion*, 'Bruckner Interpretation' (Linz 1982): *Bericht*, ed. Othmar Wessely (Linz, 1983), pp. 29–30.

2 Tess James, 'Celibidache and Bruckner', *Music Theory Online* 4/5 (1998), <http://smt.ucsb.edu/mto/issues/mto.98.4.5/mto.98.4.5.james.html#AUTHORNOTE>.

3 Bruckner, Symphony No. 4, cond. Sergiu Celibidache, EMI, 7243 5 56690 2 5.

4 Bruckner, Symphony No. 4, cond. Karl Böhm, Iron Needle, IN 1414. See Benjamin M. Korstvedt, 'Anton Bruckner in the Third Reich and After: An Essay on Ideology and Bruckner Reception', *MQ* 80 (1996), 160; although Korstvedt notes the influence of the Schalk score on this performance, Böhm was a self-proclaimed exponent of the 'original versions'; see Karl Böhm, *Ich erinnere mich ganz genau: Autobiographie*, ed. Hans Weig (Zurich, 1968), pp. 78–81.

5 Bruckner, Symphony No. 4, cond. Karl Böhm, Decca, 425 036–2.

6 Korstvedt, 'Anton Bruckner in the Third Reich and After', 149; Leon Botstein, 'Music and Ideology: Thoughts on Bruckner', *MQ* 80 (1996), 10.

7 Botstein, 'Music and Ideology', 8–10; Taruskin, *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance* (New York and Oxford, 1995), pp. 164–72.

8 Korstvedt, 'Anton Bruckner in the Third Reich and After', 150–1 and 159.

9 Constantin Floros, 'Historische Phasen der Bruckner-Interpretation', in *Bruckner-Symposion* (Linz 1982), p. 96.

10 Harry Halbreich, 'Verlangt Bruckner ein einheitliches Tempo?', *B-J* 1981 (1982), 191–204; *H-SI*, 217 and 225.

11 Bruckner, Symphony No. 7, cond. Karl Böhm, Archipel Records, ARPCD 0040.

12 Bruckner, Symphony No. 7 (and Mahler, *Das Lied von der Erde*), cond. Hans Rosbaud, Vox, CDX2 518; cond. Nikolaus Harnoncourt, Teldec, 3984-24488-2; cond. Sir Simon Rattle, EMI, 7243 5 56425 2 3.

13 Adolf Nowak, 'Die Wiederkehr in Bruckners Adagio', in *Anton Bruckner: Studien zu Werk und Wirkung* (Walter Wiora zum 30. Dezember 1986), ed. Christoph-Helmut Mahling (Tutzing, 1988), p. 159.

14 Floros, 'Historische Phasen', pp. 97–9.

15 The 1938 Jochum recording – Music & Arts, CD-1086(1) – presents considerable evidence for consistency.

16 That this was entirely conscious is suggested by Mark W. Kluge ('Eugen Jochum Conducts Bruckner's Fifth Symphony: The Historic 1938 Telefunken Recording', notes to Music & Arts, CD-1086(1), p. 8), where he quotes Jochum, 'About the Phenomenology of Conducting', in *The Conductor's Art*, ed. Carl Bamberg (New York, 1965).

17 Benjamin M. Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8* (Cambridge, 2000), pp. 98–103.

18 Roger Norrington, 'En route to the Wagner Symphony', note accompanying Bruckner, Symphony No. 3, EMI, 7243 5 56167 2 2, pp. 8–10; 'Performing Brahms', in Michael Musgrave (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Brahms* (Cambridge, 1999), pp. 234–9.

16 The musical image of Bruckner

1 See Winfried Kirsch, 'Die Bruckner-Forschung seit 1945 (I–IV): eine kommentierte Bibliographie', *Acta Musicologica* 53 (1981), 157–70; 54 (1982), 208–61; 55 (1983), 210–44, 56 (1984), 1–29;

- Renate Grasberger, *Bruckner-Bibliographie (bis 1974)* (Graz, 1985).
- 2 Mathias Hansen, *Anton Bruckner* (Leipzig, 1987), p. 19.
- 3 Renate Grasberger and Erich Wolfgang Partsch, *Bruckner – skizziert: ein Porträt in ausgewählten Erinnerungen und Anekdoten* (Vienna, 1991).
- 4 See Thomas Röder, 'Anton Bruckners Glaube', in *B-P*, pp. 50–63.
- 5 Manfred Wagner, 'Die Nekrologe von 1896: rezeptionsstiftend? – oder Wie Klischees von Anton Bruckner entstanden', in *Musik-Konzepte 23/24: Anton Bruckner*, ed. H.-K. Metzger and R. Riehn (Munich, 1982), p. 138.
- 6 E.g. Franz Brunner, *Dr. Anton Bruckner: ein Lebensbild* (Linz, 1895), p. 14; *Göll-A*, I, p. 39.
- 7 Emphases mine; see for example Max Auer, 'Anton Bruckner: zum 100. Geburtstag am 4. September'; Siegfried Kallenberg, 'Das Unrecht an Bruckner', *Zeitschrift für Musik* 91 (1924), 481–6 and 487–8.
- 8 Arthur Schopenhauer, *The World as Will and Representation*, trans. E. J. F. Payne, 2 vols. (New York, 1966), vol. II, pp. 383–4, 389–90, 393.
- 9 *Ibid.*, vol. I, p. 383.
- 10 Max Auer, *Anton Bruckner: sein Leben und Werk* (Zurich, Leipzig, and Vienna, 1923), pp. 5–6.
- 11 *Göll-A*, II/1, p. 237.
- 12 *Die Gesellschaft: Monatsschrift für Literatur, Kunst und Sozialpolitik* (1896), 1402 and 1404.
- 13 Max Graf, 'Anton Bruckner', *Die Musik* 1 (1901–2), 28.
- 14 See Martin Eybl, 'Das bedrohliche Neue: konservative Konzepte von Musikgeschichte in Wien', in Anselm Gerhard (ed.), *Musikwissenschaft – eine verspätete Disziplin? Die akademische Musikforschung zwischen Fortschrittsglauben und Modernitätsverweigerung* (Stuttgart and Weimar, 2000), pp. 119–27.
- 15 See Franz Müller, 'Warum lieben wir Bruckner?', in *In Memoriam Anton Bruckner*, ed. Karl Kobald (Zurich, Vienna, and Leipzig, 1924), p. 198.
- 16 Alfred Heuss, 'Wie steht es heute um Bruckner: allerlei Brucknerfragen', *Zeitschrift für Musik* 91 (1924), 493.
- 17 *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 1–17.
- 18 See Peter Wapnewski, 'Der Merker und der Mittler, Richard Wagner und sein Mittelalter', in *Mittelalter-Rezeption (I): gesammelte Vorträge des Salzburger Symposions 'Die Rezeption mittelalterlicher Dichter und ihre Werke in Literatur, bildender Kunst und Musik des 19. und 20. Jahrhunderts'*, ed. Jürgen Kühmel et al. (Göppingen, 1979), pp. 7–38.
- 19 In his *Bruckner* Kurth refers in many formulations to Oswald Spengler's *Der Untergang des Abendlandes* (1918); but Spengler according to Kurth had 'completely overlooked Bruckner's importance' (*EKB*, vol. I, p. 594).
- 20 *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 594–5.
- 21 Ernst Kurth in a letter to Max Auer of 30 October 1927 (Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, F 31 Auer 381); see Oskar Lang, *Anton Bruckner: Wesen und Bedeutung* (Munich, 1924); Fritz Grüninger, *Anton Bruckner: der metaphysische Kern seiner Persönlichkeit* (Augsburg, 1930).
- 22 Christa Brüstle, *Anton Bruckner und die Nachwelt: zur Rezeptionsgeschichte des Komponisten in der ersten Hälfte des 20. Jahrhunderts* (Stuttgart, 1998), pp. 73–4.
- 23 *EKB*, vol. I, p. 290; Fritz Grüninger (ed.), *1. Badisches Brucknerfest 6. bis 10. November 1929* (Karlsruhe, 1929), p. 14.
- 24 Auer, *Anton Bruckner*, p. 5.
- 25 See Klose, *Meine Lehrjahre bei Bruckner*, p. 153; also Grasberger and Partsch, *Bruckner – skizziert*, p. 214.
- 26 See also Manfred Wagner, 'Gefahr der Anekdote', in *Bruckner-Symposion 1977: Bericht*, ed. Franz Grasberger (Linz, 1978), pp. 27–33.
- 27 August Stradal, 'Anton Bruckner: eine Studie', *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 69 (1902), 315.
- 28 See Franz Zamazal, 'Göllerich – Auer – Gräflinger', *Bruckner-Symposion, 'Bruckner-Freunde – Bruckner-Kenner'* (Linz 1994): *Bericht*, ed. Othmar Wessely et al. (Linz, 1997), pp. 113–31.
- 29 August Göllerich, 'Anton Bruckner', *Deutsche Worte* 4 (1884), 147–8.
- 30 See Bruckner's astonished reaction to the talk of the 'second Beethoven' in *Göll-A*, I, p. 29, and the letter from Bruckner to Göllerich of 7 July 1885, in *H-S1*, p. 270.
- 31 See Theodor Helm, 'Anton Bruckner', in *Musikalisches Wochenblatt* 17 (1886), 4–6, 34–5, 46–8, 60–1; and 27 (1896), 679–81, 694–9.
- 32 See Wagner's essay 'Über die Anwendung der Musik auf das Drama', *Bayreuther Blätter* 2 (1879), 313–25; also Josef Schalk, 'Beiträge zur Charakteristik der Zeit, XXV: Lichtblicke aus der Zeitgenossenschaft – Anton Bruckner', *Bayreuther Blätter* 7 (1884), 334: 'Attempts to explain the content of purely symphonic pieces of music I frankly confess to finding futile.'
- 33 See Rudolf Flotzinger, 'Bruckner – Hausegger – Wagner', *Bruckner-Symposion*,

- 'Bruckner, Wagner und die Neudeutschen in Österreich' (Linz 1984): Bericht, ed. Othmar Wessely (Linz, 1986), pp. 201–10, in particular p. 208.
- 34 Rudolf Louis, *Der Widerspruch in der Musik: Bausteine zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst auf realdialektischer Grundlage* (Leipzig, 1893), p. 103.
- 35 Rudolf Louis, 'Anton Bruckner', *Allgemeine Musik-Zeitung* 23 (1896), 617.
- 36 Rudolf Louis, *Anton Bruckner* (Berlin, 1904), p. 36: see also Louis, 'Anton Bruckner: der Mann und sein Werk', *Neue Musik-Zeitung* 23 (1902), 180–1, 200–1, 215–17.
- 37 Rudolf Louis, *Anton Bruckner* (Munich, 1905), pp. 224–5 and 210.
- 38 See Eduard Hanslick, *Vom Musikalisch-Schönen*, ed. Dietmar Strauss, 2 vols. (Mainz, 1990), vol. I, p. 75.
- 39 Louis, *Anton Bruckner* (1905), p. 226.
- 40 *Ibid.*, pp. 192 and 196.
- 41 See August Halm, 'Melodie, Harmonie und Themenbildung bei Anton Bruckner', *Neue Musik-Zeitung* 23 (1902), 170–4, 196–8, 211–14, 227–8; *Von zwei Kulturen der Musik* (Munich, 1913); *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners* (Munich, 1914).
- 42 *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners*, p. 81.
- 43 See Lee A. Rothfarb, 'Musik und Theologie: August Halm am Kreuzungspunkt seines beruflichen und schöpferischen Weges', *Musik in Baden-Württemberg* 3 (1996), 115–34 (I am grateful to Lee Rothfarb for sending me the English manuscript of his essay entitled 'Music and Theology: August Halm's Crossroads of Career and Creativity' which I quote later); Rothfarb, 'The "New Education" and Music Theory, 1900–1925', in *Music Theory and the Exploration of the Past*, ed. Christopher Hatch and David W. Bernstein (Chicago and London, 1993), pp. 449–72.
- 44 See August Halm, *Von Form und Sinn der Musik: gesammelte Aufsätze*, ed. S. Schmalzriedt (Wiesbaden, 1978); also Rudolf Stephan, 'Über August Halm', in *August-Halm-Preis 1989 für Ernest Bour: Festschrift*, ed. Volker Scherliess (Trossingen, 1989), pp. 6–13.
- 45 Rothfarb, 'Music and Theology'.
- 46 Halm, *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners*, pp. 199–200.
- 47 The remark about two principles attributed to Beethoven, about whose meaning there was then no unanimity, Halm interpreted as a 'psychological' contrast of themes: see Arnold Schmitz, *Beethovens 'Zwei Prinzipie': ihre Bedeutung für Themen- und Satzbau* (Berlin and Bonn, 1923).
- 48 Halm, *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners*, pp. 47–56.
- 49 *Ibid.*, p. 27; see also August Halm, *Harmonielehre* (Leipzig, 1900).
- 50 Halm, *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners*, p. 182. In his essay 'Melodie, Harmonie und Themenbildung bei Anton Bruckner' (see above, n. 41) Halm deals with harmonic function. For him it has tonal importance in homophonic and polyphonic composition, dynamic significance in underlining *crescendo* and *diminuendo*, and an articulating function in relation to symphonic form. Harmony 'serves' the form according to one of his principal theses.
- 51 Halm, *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners*, pp. 200–1.
- 52 See Lee A. Rothfarb, 'Zwischen Originalität und Ideologie: die Musik von August Halm (1869–1929)', *Musik in Baden-Württemberg* 5 (1998), 175–99.
- 53 Hugo Riemann, *Handbuch der Musikgeschichte*, 2 vols. in 5 parts (Leipzig, 1904–13), vol. II /3, p. 240.
- 54 Halm, *Die Symphonie Anton Bruckners*, p. 42.
- 55 *Ibid.*, p. 128 and p. 223. The 'plain' (*das Kunstlose*) is the symphonic apotheosis that Bruckner knew how to organize in the Finale without the aid of rhetoric (words or texts), unlike Beethoven.
- 56 See Halm, *Von Form und Sinn der Musik*, pp. 176–81.
- 57 *EKB*, vol. I, pp. 239–42; see also Stephen Parkany, 'Kurth's *Bruckner* and the Adagio of the Seventh Symphony', *NCM* 11 (1987–8), 262–81.
- 58 See Carl Dahlhaus, *The Idea of Absolute Music*, trans. Roger Lustig (Chicago and London, 1978), pp. 39–41 and 122–7.
- 59 Ernst Bloch, *Geist der Utopie*, 2nd edn (Frankfurt am Main, 1985), p. 97.
- 60 Somewhat in the sense of Victor Zuckerkandl, when he said that 'community of musical language' is also 'community of civilization' and accordingly that 'the music of Austria is a special type of German music'; see *Vom musikalischen Denken: Begegnung von Ton und Wort* (Zurich, 1964), p. 227.
- 61 Josef Schalk, 'Anton Bruckner und die moderne Musikwelt: Vortrag gehalten im Wiener Akademischen Wagner-Verein', *Deutsche Worte* 5 (1885), 474. See also Thomas Leibnitz, 'Anton Bruckner "Deutscher" oder "Österreicher": Deutungen, Vereinnahmungen, Hintergründe', in *Österreichische Musik – Musik in Österreich: Beiträge zur Musikgeschichte Mitteleuropas (Theophil Antonicek zum 60. Geburtstag)*, ed. Elisabeth Theresia Hilscher (Tutzing, 1998),

- pp. 463–76; also Brüstle, *Anton Bruckner und die Nachwelt*, pp. 60–2.
- 62 See also Rudolf Flotzinger, ‘Bruckners Rolle in der Kulturgeschichte Österreichs’, in *B-P*, pp. 9–24; Gottfried Scholz, ‘Wer gilt als österreichischer Komponist? Der Österreich-Begriff im Wandel der Geschichte als Problem nationaler Musikgeschichtsschreibung’, *Bericht über den Internationalen musikwissenschaftlichen Kongress Bayreuth 1981*, ed. Christoph-Hellmut Mahling and Sigrid Wiesmann (Kassel, 1984), pp. 445–9.
- 63 Franz Gräflinger, *Anton Bruckner: Leben und Schaffen* (Berlin, 1927), p. 313.
- 64 *Ibid.*, p. iv.
- 65 Paul Bekker, *Die Sinfonie von Beethoven bis Mahler* (Berlin, 1918), pp. 37–9; W. Steinbeck, ‘Symphonie der Nationen: zur Frage einer “österreichischen Symphonik”’, in *Bruckner-Symposion, “Entwicklungen, Parallelen, Kontraste – Zur Frage einer “österreichischen Symphonik”* (Linz 1993): *Bericht*, ed. Otto Wessely *et al.* (Linz, 1996), pp. 69–74.
- 66 Alfred Orel, *Anton Bruckner: das Werk, der Künstler, die Zeit* (Vienna and Leipzig, 1925), pp. 165 and 52.
- 67 Orel strengthened a cliché that was to have long-lasting effect. Only recently have basic studies been undertaken into this connection, e.g. Franz Grasberger, ‘Schubert und Bruckner’, *Schubert-Kongress Wien 1978: Bericht*, ed. Otto Brusatti (Graz, 1979), pp. 215–28; Timothy L. Jackson, ‘Schubert as “John the Baptist to Wagner-Jesus”’: large-scale Enharmonicism in Bruckner and his Models’, *B-J 1991/92/93* (1995), 61–107.
- 68 Even foreign voices subscribed to this: see Peter Jost, ‘Die französische Symphonie im 20. Jahrhundert’, *Die Musikforschung* 47 (1994), 132.
- 69 See Carl Dahlhaus, ‘Musikgeschichte Österreichs und die Idee der deutschen Musik’, in *Deutschland und Österreich: ein bilaterales Geschichtsbuch*, ed. R. A. Kann and F. E. Prinz (Vienna and Munich, 1980), pp. 322–49; Rudolf Flotzinger and Gernot Gruber, *Musikgeschichte Österreichs*, vol. III: *Von der Revolution 1848 zur Gegenwart*, 2nd edn (Vienna, 1995), pp. 173–5.
- 70 Anton Reichel, ‘Deutsch-Österreichs künstlerische Sendung’, *Neue Musik-Zeitung* 42 (1921), 214.
- 71 Speech by the Reich Chancellor Wilhelm Marx, who led a contemporary Berlin Bruckner society: cited according to an undated document in Historisches Archiv der Stadt Köln, Nachlass Marx, No. 260, provided by Stehkämper with the information 11 October 1924; see *Der Nachlass des Reichskanzlers Wilhelm Marx*, 5 vols., ed. Hugo Stehkämper (Cologne, 1968–97), vol. IV, p. 33. In *Göll-A*, IV/4, p. 76 the date of the event is June 1924, but see also the report in *Die Musik* 16 (1923–4), 533–4.
- 72 *Göll-A*, II/1, p. 358. See *Die Musik* 17 (1924–5), 238: in Germany President Ebert made a contribution of 500 gold marks.
- 73 *Bruckner-Blätter* 3 (1931), 3. When Kurth attempted to found a Swiss Bruckner society, ‘there was a fair amount of fuss then in the press and elsewhere, that it [the IBG] was a German National and Austrian affair, that it was an attempt to drag the Swiss in, that it was a biased organization only “international” in name’ (letter from Kurth to Auer of 31 December 1928, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, F 31 Auer 381).
- 74 See Christa Brüstle, ‘Siegmond von Hausegger: a Bruckner Authority from the 1930s’, in *PAB*, pp. 341–52.
- 75 Oskar Lang, ‘Bruckners Bedeutung im deutschen Geistesleben’, *Deutsche Zeitschrift* 48 (1934–5), 10–16.
- 76 See Rosenberg, ‘Um die nationalsozialistische Weltanschauung’, *Völkischer Beobachter*, 18 November 1933.
- 77 See Alfred Rosenberg, ‘Bauernum und Kultur’, *Deutsche Kultur-Wacht* 2 (1933), 2. For many years there had been controversy about Bruckner’s peasant origins. For a new genealogy of the composer, see Ernst Schwanzara, ‘Neue Bruckner-Forschungen: die Vorfahren stammen aus Niederösterreich’, *Neues Wiener Tagblatt*, 9 January 1932, ‘Anton Bruckners Urahnen – niederösterreichische Bauern: Richtigstellung eines Irrtums’, *Bruckner-Blätter* 5 (1933), 11–13, 22, also *Göll-A*, IV/4, pp. 135–222.
- 78 Report on the Freiburg Bruckner Festival, *Zeitschrift für Musik* 102 (1935), 750–1.
- 79 Robert Haas, *Anton Bruckner* (Potsdam, 1934), p. 6; R. Zimmermann, *Um Anton Bruckners Vermächtnis: ein Beitrag zur rassistischen Erkenntnis germanischer Tonkunst* (Stuttgart, 1939); Morten Solvik, ‘The International Bruckner Society and the N.S.D.A.P.: A Case Study of Robert Haas and the Critical Edition’, *MQ* 83 (1998), 362–82.
- 80 Hitler’s ‘takeover’ of the Walhalla followed on 21 May 1936 and was directly linked to his decision to set up the Bruckner bust: Friedrich Heer, *Der Glaube des Adolf Hitler: Anatomie einer politischen Religiosität* (Munich and Esslingen, 1968), p. 309 (also pp. 27, 34, and 309–10). For Hitler and Bruckner see also Henry Picker, *Hitlers*

Tischgespräche im Führerhauptquartier (Frankfurt am Main and Berlin, 1993), p. 336.

81 See for example Max Auer, *Anton Bruckner: sein Leben und Werk* (Vienna, 1934), p. 397.

82 See also Brüstle, 'Politisch-ideologische Implikationen der ersten Bruckner-Gesamtausgabe', in *B-P*, pp. 192–201.

83 An anti-Semitic subtext of the quarrel about the *Bruckner-Gesamtausgabe* referred to Bruckner's pupil Ferdinand Löwe, but also was directed against Universal Edition as inheritor of the first published editions; see Benjamin M. Korstvedt, "Return to the Pure Sources": the Ideology and Text-Critical Legacy of the First Bruckner *Gesamtausgabe*', in *BS*, pp. 91–109, and Brüstle, 'Politisch-ideologische Implikationen der ersten Bruckner-Gesamtausgabe', in *B-P*, pp. 192–201.

84 See *Zeitschrift für Musik* 103 (1936), Bruckner Number. The opponents of the *Gesamtausgabe* also obtained support from the well-known Wagner expert Alfred Lorenz, in 'Zur Instrumentation von Anton Bruckners Symphonien', *Zeitschrift für Musik* 103 (1936), 1318, and 'Klangmischung in Anton Bruckners Orchester', *Allgemeine Musikzeitung* 63 (1936), 717–20. See also the recent account in Wolfgang Doebel, *Bruckners Symphonien in Bearbeitungen: die Konzepte der Bruckner-Schüler und ihre Rezeption bis zu Robert Haas* (Tutzing, 2001); also above, Chapter 11, pp. 138–41.

85 Alfred Orel, 'Original und Bearbeitung bei Anton Bruckner', *Deutsche Musikkultur* 1 (1936–7), 193–222.

86 In the Leipzig branch of the Musikwissenschaftlicher Verlag the following was considered at the end of 1936: 'At the moment we are mulling over the problem of how to make the whole complex of the original versions comprehensible to the highest levels of the Party and win them to our side . . . For example, we must under all circumstances be punctual in convincing Goebbels of the importance and necessity of the original versions' (letter of Hilde Wendler to Max Auer of 1 December 1936, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, F 31 Auer 560). One result was the brochure *Anton Bruckner: Wissenschaftliche und künstlerische Betrachtungen zu den Originalfassungen* (Vienna, 1937).

87 See Paul Ehlers, 'Das Regensburger Bruckner-Erlebnis', *Zeitschrift für Musik* 104 (1937), 745–8.

88 Goebbels regarded Bruckner's music as 'magnificent music for Party occasions', as he noted in 1938: *Die Tagebücher von Joseph Goebbels: sämtliche Fragmente*, Part I/*Aufzeichnungen 1924–1941*, ed. Elke Fröhlich et al., 4 vols. (Munich, 1987), vol. III, pp. 465, 491 and vol. IV, p. 55.

89 Auer gave up his position to the celebrated conductor; see Auer's announcement 'Furtwängler setzt den Schlusspunkt zum Streit um die Fassungen bei Bruckner', *Zeitschrift für Musik* 106 (1939), 81–2.

90 Speech by Goebbels at the Düsseldorf Reichsmusiktag in May 1939; sound recording of the *Original-Tondokumente zur Ausstellung 'Entartete Musik'*, ed. Albrecht Dümling (Düsseldorf, 1988). In April 1938 Robert Haas, the editor of the *Gesamtausgabe*, had 'dedicated this "monumental work" to the German people and our leader Adolf Hitler'; see Brüstle, *Bruckner und die Nachwelt*, pp. 306–11. Haas was a party member from 1933 and thus belonged to the 'illegal National Socialists' in Austria before 1938; see Pamela M. Potter, *Most German of the Arts: Musicology and Society from the Weimar Republic to the End of Hitler's Reich* (New Haven and London, 1998), p. 115.

91 Hanns Kreczi, *Das Bruckner-Stift St. Florian und das Linzer Reichs-Bruckner-Orchester (1942–1945)* (Graz, 1986).

92 Ingo Sarlay, *Hitlers Linz: die Stadtplanung von Linz an der Donau 1938–1945*, dissertation, University of Graz (1985), and *Baukunst im Dritten Reich – Hitlers Linz* (Graz, 1987). See also Albrecht Dümling, 'Der deutsche Michel erwacht: zur Bruckner-Rezeption im NS-Staat', in *B-P*, pp. 202–14.

93 Hansen, *Bruckner*, p. 312.

94 See also Floros, *Brahms und Bruckner*, pp. 12–13 and 34–5.

95 Dika Newlin, *Bruckner – Mahler – Schoenberg*, 1st edn (New York, 1947), p. 1.

96 Robert W. Wason, *Viennese Harmonic Theory from Albrechtsberger to Schenker and Schoenberg* (Ann Arbor, 1985), p. 84; Ulrich Krämer, *Alban Berg als Schüler Arnold Schönbergs: Quellenstudien und Analysen zum Frühwerk* (Vienna, 1996).

97 Newlin, *Bruckner – Mahler – Schoenberg*, p. 102; Arnold Schoenberg, 'Brahms the Progressive', in *Style and Idea*, ed. Leonard Stein, trans. Leo Black, 2nd edn (London and Boston, 1975), pp. 398–441.

98 Bekker, *Die Sinfonie von Beethoven bis Mahler*, pp. 54–6. In the Bruckner literature of the twenties and early thirties the negative evaluation of Mahler predominated (against

- the background of anti-Semitic resentment), in so far as he was mentioned; Orel dealt with Mahler in comparative detail in *Anton Bruckner: das Werk, der Künstler, die Zeit*, pp. 195–7.
- 99 Hansen, *Bruckner*, p. 316.
- 100 E.g. Hans F. Redlich, *Bruckner and Mahler*, rev. edn (London, 1963); Rudolf Stephan, ‘Zum Thema “Bruckner und Mahler”’, in *Vom musikalischen Denken: gesammelte Vorträge*, ed. Rainer Damm and Andreas Traub (Mainz, 1985), pp. 91–7; Constantin Floros, ‘Von Mahlers Affinität zu Bruckner’, *Bruckner-Symposion, ‘Bruckner, Liszt, Mahler und die Moderne’ (Linz 1986): Bericht*, (Linz, 1989), pp. 109–17; Timothy L. Jackson, ‘Die Wagnersche Umarmungs-Metapher bei Bruckner und Mahler’, in *B-P*, pp. 134–52.
- 101 The author of the liner notes of the CD of Wetz’s First Symphony in C minor op. 40 is of the opinion that this composer was forgotten in the face of so many ‘uninteresting’ modern composers; CD of 1995, Cracow Philharmonic Orchestra conducted by Roland Bader, cpo, 999 272–2.
- 102 Richard Wetz, *Anton Bruckner: sein Leben und Schaffen* (Leipzig, 1922), a small reader in which the author provides no analytical or technical information.
- 103 Fred K. Prieberg, *Musik im NS-Staat* (Frankfurt am Main, 1982), p. 187; Erik Levi, ‘Richard Wetz (1875–1935): a Brucknerian Composer’, in *PAB*, pp. 363–94.
- 104 Jürgen Schaarwächter, *Die britische Sinfonie 1914–1945* (Cologne, 1995).
- 105 See S. Phillippo, ‘Assessing Robert Simpson: the Perpetual Striver’, *The Musical Times* 139 (1998), 30. On Simpson and Bruckner, see Stephen Johnson, ‘Robert Simpson’s Ninth’, *The Musical Times* 128 (1987), 196–9.
- 106 Wolfgang Rihm, *ausgesprochen: Schriften und Gespräche*, ed. Ulrich Mosch, Veröffentlichungen der Paul Sacher-Stiftung 6, 2 vols. (Winterthur, 1997), vol. II, p. 289.