

attention to ethnic affiliations and faultlines is important given the degree to which Afghan social life is organized on ethnic lines. Osman shows that although TV networks use their programming for ethnic aggrandizement, they all subscribe to the idealistic vision of creating a united, multiethnic, and peaceful Afghanistan. One example that Osman provides is that of the Pashtun-affiliated Shamshad TV's efforts to bring Pashtun people "into the fold of the nation" and out of tribalism through Pashto educational programming (p. 152). While Osman argues that this vision of a united Afghanistan that drives the original programming created by Shamshad TV and other Afghan channels is a positive impact of the "development gaze," its effect on the intended audiences is not discussed.

Osman's book is an excellent addition to the scholarship on Afghanistan, especially given the continued dominance of Western and non-Afghan scholars the field. Beyond the book's obvious contribution to media studies, Osman's political economy focused approach makes it an excellent introductory text on contemporary Afghanistan through a non-western perspective that centers the everyday life, agency, and desires of ordinary Afghans.

doi:10.1017/S002074382100060X

Israel/Palestine: Border Representations in Literature and Film. **Drew Paul, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2020.) Pp. 224. \$100. Cloth.** **ISBN: 9781474456128**

Reviewed by Yue Han, Near and Middle East Section, School of Languages, Cultures and Linguistics, SOAS, University of London, London, UK (634090@soas.ac.uk)

With *Israel/Palestine*, Drew Paul makes a valuable contribution to filling a gap in scholarship about the Israeli and Palestinian literary and cinematic representations of borders. Namely, he focuses on novels and films that center on borders and Palestinian encounters with them. In doing so, Paul unfolds for readers the various natures of borders that Israeli and Palestinian authors and filmmakers represent from the late 1960s to the post-Second Intifada period, the artistic strategies they use in representation and the ways their illusions of Israeli-Palestinian coexistence (affected by their own experiences, the change of border spaces and social-political contexts) inform their representations.

The book is well structured and layered. The first chapter gives a comprehensive and in-depth introduction to the border in question—the "wall", also known as the "separation barrier" or the "security fence", which was built by Israel to separate Palestinian-controlled regions of the West Bank from Israeli-administered territories, as well as the internal barriers within the Palestinian-controlled regions consist of checkpoints, walls and settlements which were built by Israel to restrict Palestinian space and movement—including the border's definition, expansion, influence, and illusory nature, as well as the metaphor, fiction, allegory, fantasy, and symbolic meanings that are engaged with borders and border encounters. Then Paul groups border representations in both literature and film into two sections according to different themes. The first section focuses on the theme of border expansion in literary works with Chapters 2 and 3, while the second section centers on the theme of the deceptive nature of the borders with Chapter 4 examining literary works and Chapters 5 and 6 analyzing cinematic border representations. Paul reveals the deceptive nature of the borders represented in both literature and film from the perspective of representation techniques, including the stray narratives used in literary works and different cinematic languages, such as camera movement, performance and editing, applied in cinematic works.

Chapters 2 and 3 chart the gradual disappearance of a utopian vision of Israeli-Palestinian coexistence in which the proliferation of border spaces plays a vital catalytic role in border representations in literary works. By comparing Ghassan Kanafani's novella *Returning to Haifa* (*'A'id Ila Hayfa*, 1969) with one of its literary afterlives, Sami Michael's novel *Doves in Trafalgar* (*Yonim be-Trafalgar*, 2005), Paul contends

that a commitment to a utopian future, sewn through the representation of the ignorance of borders in the former, falters with the representation of accumulated borders in the latter, with over the thirty-five years between the two works. In studying Sayed Kashua's novels *Let It Be Morning* (Ve-Yehi Boker, 2004) and *Second Person Singular* (Guf Sheni Yehid, 2010), Paul argues that the border is not only a sign of the failure of coexistence, but also a producer and an impeller of it (p. 101). This shows how the proliferation of physical borders has shaped literature in this region. He demonstrates that by revealing how the border's incursion engenders new forms of estrangement and exile through silence, fear, panic and misinformation. Meanwhile, Paul points out the deceptive nature of borders by showing the act of crossing borders as a form of self-estrangement achieved by naturalizing differences. The deception is, in Paul's words, that "one can cross borders with ease by assuming, either through socioeconomic status or linguistic-ethnic disguise, the dress, language and mannerisms of others" (p. 100). While in fact, it is at the borders where ethnic difference is made explicit and the effort to cross the borders by concealing such distinction uncovers certain deceptions of the borders as creating elusive coexistence. Once the impossibility of coexistence is revealed, the idea of the borders as deceptive becomes more pronounced. Chapters 4 and 5, then, further illustrate the border's deception through analyzing stray narratives—writing with "multiple layers of narrator and author"—in Raba'i al-Madhoun's novel *Lady from Tel Aviv* (*Al-Sayyida min Tall Abib*, 2009) and the interrupted act of documenting process—"filming with unsteady and unreliable cameras"—in Simone Bitton's film *Mur* (2004) and Emad Burnat and Guy Davidi's film *5 Broken Cameras* (2011) (p. 29). These strategies of representation reinforce the disillusionment of coexistence by emphasizing the rupturing and destabilizing power of borders. In the sixth and final chapter, Paul reveals the instability and fragility of the border itself by analyzing Elia Suleiman's techniques of "camera positioning and movement, shot sequences and limited perspectives" in his film *Divine Intervention* (*Yadd Ilahiyya*, 2002) (p. 160). Here, by critically examining how narratives are constructed with distinct narrative, visual and formal strategies, Paul highlights the illusory, rupturing and deceptive natures of borders and calls for the awareness of a possible role of art in beautifying, aestheticizing, or normalizing borders.

Overall, *Israel/Palestine* makes a compelling argument. Paul's choice to study works from the late 1960s to the post-Second Intifada period allows him to not merely show a clear trajectory of change in border representations over time, but also to exhibit the impact of earlier representations on contemporary border depictions. Moreover, by covering both literary and cinematic works and exploring topics related to borders—from the right of return to the reenactment of exile, from Palestinian solidarity to Palestinian self-estrangement—shows that he has considered his subject matter in impressive depth and through various lenses.

Of particular interest is Paul's chapter titled "The Illusion of the One-way Mirror: Filming the checkpoint in *Divine Intervention*," in which Paul points out that Suleiman represents the checkpoint as constructed and unstable by manipulating camera positioning and movement, shot sequences, and limited perspectives (p. 160). He argues that Suleiman represents the checkpoints as "a staged charade of sovereignty and power" (p. 36). It marks Suleiman's work as a breakthrough in border representation compared with works by other Israeli and Palestinian authors and filmmakers. In the emerging genre of "roadblock films" in the 2000s identified by Nurith Gertz and George Khleifi, while other films, such as *Ticket to Jerusalem* by Rashid Masharawi (2002) and *Rana's Wedding* by Hany Abu-Assad (2002), reveal the potent power of borders, *Divine Intervention* makes an attempt to break down power. In this way, the borders are no longer places where Palestinians suffer oppression, but, with Suleiman's inversion of fantasy and reality, become the sites of powerful rebellions. Moreover, Suleiman shows two ways of Palestinian resistance in his film. One is a silent, calm and almost mournful perseverance. As Paul maintains, the silence is actually a speech—non-verbal communication reflected in the movement of the camera's shot/reverse shot progression—which functions as a mode of control in Suleiman's film (p. 174). The other is a confident and thrilling revolt (p. 182). For instance, the characters manage to cross the checkpoints by playing tricks with the Israeli soldiers. The female character, especially, not only crosses the checkpoint but also destroys it with her charisma. At last, she even succeeds in fighting against the Israeli soldiers like a ninja. All these representations that reveal the instability of checkpoints and the weakness of the Israeli soldiers are made through Suleiman's technique of fantasy in an improvised and playful manner.

A call for Palestinian resistance and a commitment to struggle against occupation is not only reflected in this chapter's focus on *Divine Intervention* but runs through the entire book. When showing the rupturing and deceptive natures of the excessively expanded borders, Paul also points out the urge represented by the writers and filmmakers to break the status quo through their emphasis on the disillusionment of peaceful Israeli-Palestinian coexistence. This is the purpose of the border representations in this study, which shapes cultural resistance against physical, discursive and political constraints (p. 183).

Beyond the strength of Paul's arguments and layout, his text is well-researched. This is clear from his detailed and helpful notes for each chapter, as well as in the myriad scholars who are cited in the text and his thorough bibliography. In his research, Paul draws on works of both Palestinian and Israeli authors and filmmakers, though privileging Palestinian texts, as the pervasive borders have more impact on the daily lives of Palestinians than the Israelis. However, the existence of the borders also influences the lives of Israelis to some degree. For readers interested in complimenting this book with a study of Israelis' encounters with the borders the Israeli films *Close to Home* (*Karov la bayit*, 2005) directed by Dalia Hager and Vidi Bilu, *Lemon Tree* (*Etz Limon*, 2008) directed by Eran Riklis and *Foxtrot* (2017) directed by Samuel Maoz are worth analyzing.

All things considered, Paul's *Israel/Palestine* is a crucial addition to Israeli-Palestinian cultural scholarship. It provides a significant resource to anyone researching post-colonial studies, cultural studies, and peace and conflict studies.

doi:10.1017/S0020743821000507

Graveyard of Clerics: Everyday Activism in Saudi Arabia. Pascal Menoret (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2020). Pp. 246. \$24.00 paper. ISBN: 9781503612464

Reviewed by Jonas Elbousty, Department of Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations, Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA (Jonas.elbousty@yale.edu)

Inspired by the Palestinian writer Abu Mumammad al-Maqdisi's statement when he aptly stated that "Saudi Arabia is a graveyard of clerics and a prison for preachers," Pascal Menoret captured the essence of the statement, entitling his book *Graveyard of Clerics: Everyday Activism in Saudi Arabia*. This pithy title underscores the inevitably perilous destiny faced by clerics, preachers, and young activists when they attempt to unsettle or mobilize against the repressive Saudi apparatus, which "paint[s] its enemies with a wide brush and claim[s] they [are] 'radicals,' 'extremists,' enemies of reason and moderation" (p. 38). In this study, Menoret directly engages with these constituents, shedding light on Islamic movements in Saudi Arabia, their recruitment strategies, tactics of mobilizations, daily activities, political activism, and unpleasant interactions with the Saudi State and its surveillance apparatus.

The book is divided into four parts: "The Islamic Awakening," "Saudi Suburbia," "Awareness Groups and Summer Camps," and "Leaving Islamic Activism Behind." In the first part, Menoret discusses the concept of Islamic Awakening, a movement that has swept the Muslim world, and how Islamic groups have been tortured by a repressive regime, zeroing in on the plight of Islamic activists and how "Saudi Arabic has imprisoned them by the thousands since the late 1970s" (p. 7). The second part of the book focuses on building of the city of Riyadh and the false belief that constructing "village-like communities could save modern cities from congestion and revolutions" (p. 53). Menoret shows how, despite the absence of public squares and space to mobilize, the car has become the essential mobilizing cell in the

This review has been updated since its initial publication. For details, see doi: [10.1017/S0020743821000854](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0020743821000854).