

based on papers dating from 1956 to 1968. These deal at length with the criteria of analysability. Only Freudians will be able to appreciate the detailed discussions and arguments in all the sixteen chapters, but I am sure everybody will agree that 'effective analysis depends on a sound therapeutic alliance'. This is explicated in the eleventh and other chapters. What interests the outsider is that the traditional aloof Olympian detachment of the psychoanalyst is no longer the rule, and that interpersonal reactions between analyst and analysand are being recognized more and more—though Harry Stack Sullivan, who was one of the first to insist on this, receives no mention in this book. At the end there is a bibliography of all Dr. Zetzel's writings from 1940 to 1970.

I. ATKIN.

Freud and Psychology. Penguin Modern Psychology Readings. Edited by S. G. M. LEE and MARTIN HERBERT. Penguin Books. 1970. Pp. 398. Price 50p.

This excellent series of readings continues with a selection of twenty papers concerning attempts by academic psychologists to test some of the basic tenets of Freudian psychoanalysis. It is a pity that the title has an air of discouraging naïvety, because all the studies quoted, from Rosenzweig onwards, are well worth attention, even though interested readers will have in mind a score or two of similar papers that might easily have qualified for inclusion.

Three of the twenty papers are allotted to a single author, who is a philosopher of science much occupied with general considerations of how and in what sense psychoanalytic postulates can be regarded as potentially scientific hypotheses. He and others indicate that the psychodynamic mechanisms have a more secure underpinning from psychological investigations than has developmental theory, and they go on to imply that psychoanalysis will remain viable only as far as it is capable of independent confirmation. This is to misrepresent the complex relationship between clinical practice and academic investigation in this field. The scientist provides interpretations of phenomena: the psychotherapist may find these interesting, but his main need is for something rather different, namely a method of coming to grips with the patient's experiences. He also requires a theory which will enable him to effect change through the elucidation and manipulation of emotions. It is just this hope that psychoanalysis and its derivatives provide, and it will not be given up easily whatever the 'scientists' may say. This question is not discussed in the volume, but

one cannot have everything and what one is given here is certainly interesting.

N. KREITMAN.

Trauma, Growth and Personality. By PHYLLIS GREENACRE. New Printing. New York: International Universities Press. 1969. Pp. 328. Price \$7.50.

This volume, first published in 1952, is a collection of papers by the author, originally printed elsewhere. Based on psychoanalytic work done before 1950 with patients suffering from various psychoneurotic and personality disorders, including borderline cases, it provides one with a picture of Dr. Greenacre's efforts to widen psychoanalytic concepts in the light of her own observations. Many of the papers, e.g. those dealing with the biological economy of birth, the predisposition to anxiety, infant reaction to restraint, and early female sexual development, indicate clearly how she managed to integrate classical psychoanalytic concepts with biological data, and to relate later phases of psychological development to early infantile experience. Although many of her findings, often illustrated with detailed reports from case studies, and her contributions to the understanding of personality development, have since been extended further as the result of more recent developments in object relations theory and actual observation of children, the reprinting of her papers in this volume will be welcomed by those interested in the development of psychoanalytic theory and practice and in the influence of early childhood experience on later phases of development.

HEINZ WOLFF.

CHILDREN

The Child, his 'Illness' and the Others. By MAUD MANNONI. London: Tavistock Publications. 1970. Pp. 286. Price £3.15. English Translation. Originally published as 'L'Enfant, Sa "Maladie" et les Autres'. Paris. 1967.

This is a refreshing and provocative re-examination of the psychoanalysis of children based on the concept that the child cannot be treated in isolation from his family and those in his immediate environment. The analyst must listen to both parents and child, and this cannot be achieved at second hand by child and parents having separate therapists.

This discourse between the child and 'others' is the key to treatment, and is of vital importance, as the child is only as sick as his parents need him to be and communicate to him. This basic hypothesis leads to a revealingly critical account of the major schools of child psychoanalysis. For example, Freud's

failure to listen to little Hans's mother led to her alienation from the family and abandonment of the child; and while Melanie Klein is dealt with more sympathetically, she too is criticized for failing to examine this discourse in terms of the language used rather than of reality factors.

Throughout the book the author identifies closely with the theories of Jacques Lacan; returning to an orthodox Freudian viewpoint, but again focusing on the relationship between self and others and the language used in this communication.

As the author quite rightly points out, Lacan's theories are difficult to grasp, requiring themselves a whole new language, the translation of which is only partially clarified by an extensive glossary at the end of the book.

Thus far, however, one cannot quarrel greatly with the main theme; many would, however, take issue with the criticism of Anna Freud and of the British Child Guidance movement for which the author indicts the team approach as cutting off the 'child from the necessary contribution of the mother's words and failing to take fantasy sufficiently into account as it is too occupied with providing help in reality'. Whatever criticisms may be levelled at this latter movement, this is surely not the case!

In discussing transference in child psychoanalysis, it is rightly concluded that this can be seen as successfully removing the child from the pathological dialogue with the parents which is maintaining his illness. However, in discussing the psychotherapy of psychosis, the combination of Lacan's terminology and odd misconceptions about the nature of psychosis and its relationship to adult schizophrenia leads to confusion in the author's interpretation of her full case histories; and it is not surprising that she finds astonishing Bleuler's statement that 'the therapy of schizophrenia is most rewarding for the physician who does not attribute the results of a natural remission to his own intervention'.

The remainder of the book comprises more of these vivid case studies, and there is little doubt that as a therapist, Dr. Mannoni is able to cope with the sort of problems which would daunt most analysts. The application of her principles to the management of mentally retarded children and to the setting up of a special school is a logical conclusion of special interest.

This book requires a willingness on the part of the reader to overcome prejudices arising from his own particular orientation and to overlook the more obvious diagnostic errors while struggling with what must be to most readers a new vernacular.

The effort is, however, rewarding in giving new insights into the analytic process.

JOHN CORBETT.

Childhood and Destiny: The Triadic Principle in Genetic Education. By JOACHIM FLESCHER. International Universities Press Inc. New York. 1970. 349. Price \$10.

In the introduction to this book the author makes the awesome proposition that his approach based on the 'triadic' principle will, if adhered to, 'preserve future generations from crowding psychiatric wards, hospitals and prisons as well as saving countless victims of collective irrationality from ending their lives in death camps, mass graves and military cemeteries.'

The responsibility for achieving this by correcting traumatic influences on the developing child is placed squarely on the parents who should be helped to rewrite their 'genetic scripts' so that their children may establish harmonious relationships with both senior partners of the triad of mother, father and child. In this the patient may be aided by 'dual therapy' devised by the author in which male and female therapists are provided alternately to deal with the transference relationships to parents of both sexes.

The term, genetic, is used to describe the emotional environment of the family and this is re-examined in terms of traditional psychoanalysis although in doing so he refers mainly to his own writings. Traditional analysis is found wanting because of its dyadic restrictions, excluding the third number of the genetic triad (a point confirmed by Freud's need to resort to the help of a female analyst in dealing with the repeated relapses of the Wolf Man). Criticism is also levelled at what the author regards as the failure of progressive education; and also at the traditional rules of child rearing with their emphasis on compulsory breast feeding, demand feeding and rigid toilet training.

A large number of case studies oriented around the genetic scripts or emotional background of the individual patients and their families are given to emphasize the author's point of view. These appear to be only loosely interconnected and are mainly concerned with interpretation of the family dynamics from material produced in dual therapy sessions. Without knowing to what extent the other members of the triad were involved in the treatment, it is difficult to know what credence to place on these interpretations. They frequently conclude with the statement that the patient's conflicts were resolved in dual therapy without giving details of how this was achieved; while in the case of some of the more gross 'genetic' misadventures nothing is said about the outcome leading to some bewilderment about the benefits of this particular form of treatment.