

VOLUME 26

NUMBER 1

JANUARY 2017

CQ

---

*Cambridge*

---

*Quarterly of*

---

*Healthcare*

---

*Ethics*

---

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to  
Engaging a World Community  
of Bioethicists*

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# CQ

**Cambridge**  
**Quarterly of**  
**Healthcare**  
**Ethics**

**A Quarterly**  
**Journal Devoted**  
**to Engaging a**  
**World Community**  
**of Bioethicists**

## EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*  
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

## ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

Neuroethics Network/Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education/International Bioethics Retreat

<http://www.icmbioethics.com/cambridge-home.html>

## EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*  
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*  
Arthur Caplan, *Division of Medical Ethics, NYU Langone Medical Center, New York*  
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*  
Denise Dudzinki, *Department of Bioethics and Humanities, University of Washington School of Medicine*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*  
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center for Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University*  
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*  
James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center*  
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*  
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*  
Christine Mitchell, *Center for Bioethics, Harvard Medical School*  
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Bioethics, University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine, Philadelphia*  
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*  
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*  
Doris Schroeder, *Centre for Professional Ethics, University of Central Lancashire, England*  
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*  
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*  
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburgh & West Virginia University*

## SECTION EDITORS

Bioethics and Literature  
Antonio Casada Rocha, *University of the Basque Country, Spain*

Bioethics (Re)Considered  
Raymond DeVries, *University of Michigan*  
Jill Fisher, *University of North Carolina*

Bioethics and Information Technology  
Kenneth W. Goodman, *University of Miami*

By Invitation  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*

The Great Debates  
D. Michah Hester, *University of Arkansas*  
Alissa H. Swota, *University of North Florida*

CQ Review  
Greg Loeben, *A.T. Still University-School of Health Management*

Ethics Committees and Consultants at Work  
Ruchika Mishra, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*

The Caduceus in Court  
Jennifer Chandler, *University of Ottawa, Canada*  
Ben A. Rich, *University of California, Davis*

Health and Human Rights  
Doris Schroeder, *University of Central Lancashire, England*

Dissecting Politics  
Matti Häyry, *Aalto University, Helsinki, Finland*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

Professionalism  
David Barnard, *Oregon Health and Science University*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburgh and West Virginia University*

Pediatric Ethics  
Kellie R. Lang, *Medical College of Wisconsin*  
Douglas J. Opel, *Seattle Children's Hospital*

## The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups: Connecting Bioethics Educators Around the World

The purpose of the Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups is to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. These focus groups invite others to share their information and develop mutual projects to further how bioethics is taught in universities, hospitals, and for the general public.  
[journals.cambridge.org/bioethics](http://journals.cambridge.org/bioethics)

## Clinical Neuroethics ADVISORY BOARD

EDITOR  
Thomasine Kushner  
*University of California, Berkeley*  
[kushnertk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnertk@gmail.com)

ASSOCIATE EDITOR  
James Giordano  
*Georgetown University Medical Center*

EDITORIAL BOARD  
Yves Agid  
*Institut du Cerveau et de la Moelle Épineière, France*

Jennifer Chandler  
*University of Ottawa, Canada*

Markus Christen  
*University of Zurich, Switzerland*

Joseph J. Fins  
*Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*

Paul J. Ford  
*Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*

Grant Gillett  
*University of Otago Medical School, New Zealand*

John Harris  
*University of Manchester, England*

Judy Illes  
*The University of British Columbia, Canada*

Philipp Kellmeyer  
*University of Freiburg Medical Center, Germany*

Catherine Madison  
*California Medical Center, San Francisco*

Christine Mitchell  
*Harvard Medical School*

Erik Parens  
*The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*

John R. Shook  
*University at Buffalo*

Alan Yee  
*California Pacific Medical Center*

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 26, Number 1, January 2017

## CONTENTS

Contributors	1
<i>Special Section: Conscientious Objection in Healthcare: Problems and Perspectives</i>	
Guest Editorial: Conscientious Objection in Healthcare: Problems and Perspectives ALBERTO GIUBILINI AND JULIAN SAVULESCU	3
Conscientious Objection in Healthcare and Moral Integrity MARK WICCLAIR	7
Tolerance, Professional Judgment, and the Discretionary Space of the Physician DANIEL P. SULMASY	18
Conscientious Objection and “Effective Referral” ROGER TRIGG	32
My Conscience May Be My Guide, but You May Not Need to Honor It HUGH LAFOLLETTE	44
The Legal Ethical Backbone of Conscientious Refusal CHRISTIAN MUNTHE AND MORTEN EBBE JUUL NIELSEN	59
The Cost of Conscience: Kant on Conscience and Conscientious Objection JEANETTE KENNETT	69
The Inevitability of Assessing Reasons in Debates about Conscientious Objection in Medicine ROBERT F. CARD	82
Two Concepts of Conscience and their Implications for Conscience-Based Refusal in Healthcare STEVE CLARKE	97
Conscientious Objection, Complicity in Wrongdoing, and a Not-So-Moderate Approach FRANCESCA MINERVA	109
How to Allow Conscientious Objection in Medicine While Protecting Patient Rights AARON ANCELL AND WALTER SINNOTT-ARMSTRONG	120
Conscientious Non-objection in Intensive Care DOMINIC WILKINSON	132
Refusing to Treat Sexual Dysfunction in Sex Offenders THOMAS DOUGLAS	143

Contents continued

*Contents continued*

***Departments and Columns***

*Responses and Dialogue*

When the Milk of Human Kindness Becomes a Luxury  
(and Untested) Good: A Reply to Harris’s Unconditional  
Embrace of Mitochondrial Replacement Techniques  
INMACULADA DE MELO-MARTIN 159

A Response to “Germline Modification and the Burden of  
Human Existence,” by John Harris (CQ 25(1))

How to Welcome New Technologies: Some Comments on  
the Article by Inmaculada de Melo-Martin  
JOHN HARRIS 166

*Perspectives*

Principles of Ethical Leadership Illustrated by Institutional  
Management of Prion Contamination of Neurosurgical  
Instruments  
TIM LAHEY, JOSEPH PEPE, AND WILLIAM NELSON 173

***Corrigendum***

The Effects of Closed-Loop Medical Devices on the Autonomy  
and Accountability of Persons and Systems—CORRIGENDUM  
PHILIPP KELLMEYER, THOMAS COCHRANE, OLIVER MÜLLER,  
CHRISTINE MITCHELL, TONIO BALL, JOSEPH J. FINS,  
AND NIKOLA BILLER-ANDORNO 180

***Best Practices Guidelines for Publishing in the Bioethics Literature***

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to [kushnertk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnertk@gmail.com). Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, 2532 N. 4th Street, #442 Flagstaff, AZ 86004. Books for review on neuroethics should be sent to Thomasine Kushner, 1001 Bridgeway #A1, Sausalito, CA 94965.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006/Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 26 (2017) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$607/£378; online only: \$481/£300; print only: \$602/£376. Individual rates, print only: \$125/£76. Single part: \$173/£108. Students and retirees: \$103/£64. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: \$82/£49. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2016. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).