

## Reviews

---

*Theologische Realenzyklopädie*, XXIX: *Religionspsychologie – Samaritaner*. Edited by Gerhard Müller. Pp. iii+798+26 plates. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1998. DM 394. 3 11 002218 4; 3 11 016127 3

Of fundamental articles there is the Roman Catholic Church briefly surveyed with world-wide statistics, the shaping of *Romanitas* and an article on the city of Rome. There is Secularisation (*Säkularisierung*, a weighty essay, and the Secularisation (*Säkularisation*) of 1803 which doubts whether the axiom that it produced ‘RC inferiority’ is correct. The article on Sacraments is useful, together with *Sacramentalia* and unction (*Salbung*). On the rosary (*Rosenkranz*) it is original, though it is hard to think that the use of psalms was so crucial in the Christian origins. A long article on Ritschl surprises by the effects, like the number of Ritschlian professors afterwards. The volume includes geniuses of Protestant and Catholic art in Rembrandt (under *Rijn*) and Rubens, each with good illustrations – by contrast *Rokoko* is brief. Of British studies James Cameron’s history of the University of St Andrews is very interesting. For the Reformation we have Reuchlin and Urbanus Rhegius, the latter more influential than English readers usually realise, and a delightful article on Josel of Rosheim who was so successful in efforts for oppressed Jews. Of the early Fathers only Rufinus comes, a lucid account by Nathalie Henry which clears up difficulties and shows him as no minor figure. The University of Rinteln was founded just before the Thirty Years War, for decades a literal battle-ground, troubled all its days until abolition in 1810; a hard-liner on witches; endowment diminished for the sake of the army; professors the worst paid in Germany – a warning to our age of what happens to a university which by fault of government becomes a very bad place of higher education.

SELWYN COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK

*The disenchantment of the world. A political history of religion*. By Marcel Gauchet, foreword Charles Taylor. (New French Thought.) (Trans. by Oscar Burge of *Le Désenchantement du monde*, Paris: Editions Gallimard, 1985.) Pp. xv+228. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1997. £16.95. 0 691 04406 6

This important work was originally published in Paris by Éditions Gallimard in 1985, and appears in this translation in Princeton University Press’s series *New French Thought*. Properly this is a book of ‘grand theorising’ within the field of the sociology of religion as defined by that discipline’s earliest mentors Weber and Durkheim, with a little help from Marx and Feuerbach and, later, from Mircea

Eliade. Gauchet, professor at the École de Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales and editor of the prestigious intellectual journal *Le Débat*, has a dual thesis, offering a new theory of the birth of modernity and the role played by Christianity in that birth. The first of these claims that the ‘religious’ as such has reached the end of its life in the modern world. The second part asserts that this modern-western world is radically original in the way it has restructured the human-social universe and that Christianity has played a key role in this. Indeed Christianity is ‘*a religion for departing from religion*’ (author’s italics). According to Gauchet the fundamental role of religion is societal. He speaks of the broad common bond between the religious sphere and the social reality ‘whereby sacral otherness allows the group to found itself or expresses and institutes the essential superiority of collective-being over that of its individual members’. Contrary to all theories of development, ‘religion’ existed in its perfected state in the primeval religions which existed for countless millennia before the coming into being of the major world religious traditions. Over against ‘religion’, political history (the rise of the state) is concerned with the story of the demise of ‘religion’ and the coming into existence of our contemporary ‘disenchanted’ world, where individuals are free to exercise their freedom. Out of the disjunction, which began in the city states of Egypt and Mesopotamia about 3,000 years before the birth of Jesus, comes existential anxiety, giving rise in due course to the ‘religions’ of what Jaspers called the Axial age. But these are poor substitutes for real ‘religion’. In these constructions God became ‘transcendent’, paradoxically setting human beings free either to privatise their religious apprehension or, as with the Christian case, to become fully autonomous, leaving behind any kind of religious ‘superstructure’. Gauchet is, however, no admirer of the Enlightenment project of human autonomy, for now and into the future, ‘we are destined to live openly and in the anguish from which the gods had spared us’.

The pages of this book are full of brilliant insights, hidden too often by an abstruse prose style (special congratulations are due to the translator for making so much that is opaque in the French clear in the English, but much yet remains obscure). As ‘grand theory’ it may not appeal to all historians, for it seriously lacks close attention to detail and is curiously unaware of other contributors to the disenchantment process (Machiavelli and Thomas Hobbes to name but two). But those concerned with the history of the Christian movement will want to reflect seriously upon the relevance of the ‘grand theory’ to their own fields of study. Theologians and philosophers will have their own problems with Gauchet’s thorough-going atheism, and it is helpful to have Charles Taylor’s superb interpretative foreword, which ends by asking if the great religious figures are to be understood simply in terms of the hunger for meaning. Taylor gently suggests that the mutations Gauchet is so concerned with might just be explained, in his words, ‘by supposing that something like what they relate to – God, Nirvana – really exist. In that case a purely cultural account of religion would be like Hamlet without the Prince’.

BRITE DIVINITY SCHOOL,  
TEXAS CHRISTIAN UNIVERSITY,  
FORT WORTH,  
TEXAS

KENNETH CRACKNELL

*Forschungen zur Reichs-, Papst- und Landesgeschichte. Peter Herde zum 65. Geburtstag von Freunden, Schülern und Kollegen dargebracht.* Edited by Karl Borchardt and Enno Bünz. 2 vols. Pp. xxi + 574 incl. frontispiece and 10 ills; vi + 575–1048 incl. 7 ills. Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1998. DM 280. 3 772 9805 0; 3 7772 9806 9; 3 7772 9803 4 (set)

These sixty-one pieces, some of exceptional length – with another thirteen on Bavarian and Franconian history published elsewhere – celebrate one of post-war Germany's most distinguished scholars. Though the collection is edited by two former pupils, it is not so much a show put on by Herde's 'school' as a tribute offered by his distinguished contemporaries, colleagues or friends. His international reputation may be simply gauged from the fact that one-third of the contributions appears in a language other than German (three French, three Spanish, fifteen English). The pieces are arranged in roughly chronological order and with as many as nine topics from the sixteenth century onwards, Herde's reach clearly extends well beyond that of most medievalists. As the title suggests, topics connected with the papacy (twenty-one) and the medieval empire (fourteen) predominate. However, since the papal topics stretch in time from the Byzantine interests of the *Liber Pontificalis* to John xxiii's summons of the Second Vatican Council and the imperial studies from the barbarian invasions of the fifth century to the defenestration of Prague, the title hardly prepares one for the full variety of subjects treated. The only critic qualified to evaluate all the contributions is the honorand himself. Others, who profit from it more selectively, must judge it as a whole for what it reveals of the range of Herde's impact on historical scholarship world-wide. His own initial research, showing what original documents from the papal Curia can be made to yield for understanding how institutions actually worked, has clearly inspired the cluster of fifteen papers on aspects of notarial practice and canon law from the thirteenth century onwards. Other papers reflect his interests in such fields as the crusades, Christian–Jewish relations and Florentine history. Half the contributions deal with the period of the late Middle Ages which he has done so much to illuminate. But anyone with historical interests will find rewarding pieces to read here. There are a few of art-historical interest and a number dealing with British medieval history (Barrow, Jones, Duggan, Noonan, Sayers) though Herde himself has not published in this field. Herde's historical gifts have clearly endeared him to all the contributors. The dozen pieces concerned with Italy neatly exemplify the best features of the whole collection since essays by recognised authorities, such as J.-M. Martin, Loud and Takayama, are found alongside those of pupils, three of which, by Göbbels, Kiesewetter and Hofmann, are amongst the most substantial in the book. Herde's contribution to history, not only directly as a teacher, but as one whose work has been an encouragement and a model for fellow historians everywhere, could not be more convincingly honoured.

UNIVERSITY OF READING

D. J. A. MATTHEW

*The Armenians.* By A. E. Redgate. (The Peoples of Europe.) Pp. xix + 331 incl. 14 plates, 3 figs and 22 maps. Oxford: Blackwell, 1998. £40. 0 631 14372 6

This is a broadly conceived introduction to the political and social history of Armenia, which will provide a useful background for all those interested in the

ancient and medieval worlds. The author has treated exactly the same period as the influential *Histoire de l'Arménie des origines à 1071* by Grousset, published in 1947. Since then Armenian studies have developed quite remarkably in the west, though no reliable general introduction to Armenian history in a single volume has previously appeared. Elizabeth Redgate shows her familiarity with all the main scholarship of recent years. Hers is a work of synthesis rather than original interpretation of the sources; untranslated texts are rarely quoted. It approaches the medieval Armenian historians in a more critical spirit than did Grousset with his narrative approach, even if compression in order to cover more than two millennia does lead to some simplifications. It is, however, unfortunate that the battle of Manazkert is seen as a terminus for Armenian history. Redgate defends the inclusion of the Armenians in a series called *The Peoples of Europe*. Perhaps by implication their history over the last millennium belongs to world history. In her final sketchy chapter, '1071 to the present', more than four centuries (1400 to 1828) are passed over in four pages entitled 'the twilight years'. The historian of international trade may raise an eyebrow. None the less, this is a valuable book which fills a serious gap. It deserves a wide circulation among those interested in the early history of the Armenian people and their Church.

UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD

ROBERT W. THOMSON

*Tauffragen und Bekenntnis. Studien zur sogenannten Traditio apostolica, zu den Interrogationes de fide und zum Römischen Glaubensbekenntnis.* By Wolfram Kinzig, Christoph Marksches and Markus Vinzent. (Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte, 74.) Pp. ix + 486. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1998 (1999). DM 188. 3 11 016302 0

This volume contains three studies that try to elucidate the background of the Old Roman creed ('R'), the predecessor of our Apostolic Creed. Wolfram Kinzig reviews the history of the baptismal interrogations in the western Church (pp. 75–183): since the short version of the baptismal interrogations in the 'Sacramentarium Gelasianum' resembles 'R' in both the first and the third article, Kinzig argues that the second article with its succinct summary of the life of Christ ('natum et passum') is the original that has been elaborated in 'R'. He rejects the suggestion that the Gelasianum might simply have abbreviated 'R'. According to Kinzig the Gelasianum contains the baptismal interrogations in the form they had probably acquired in Rome in the second half of the second century. Developing an idea of F. J. Badcock, Kinzig then speculates that the transformation of the Roman baptismal interrogations into 'R' was possibly effected under the influence of Marcellus of Ankyra (pp. 112f). Indeed, the elusive bishop of Ankyra has been accorded a pivotal role in this volume. This comes as no surprise since Marcellus is – apart from the so-called 'Apostolic Tradition' of Hippolytus (?) – our only witness to the text of this creed before Rufinus of Aquileia (cf. Epiphanius of Salamis, *Haer.* 72.3.1). Once you have succeeded in casting sufficient doubt on the conventional dating, the provenance and the integrity of the so-called 'Apostolic Tradition' (cf. Christoph Marksches's contribution at pp. 1–74), the path seems to be cleared for Markus Vinzent's ambitious project (pp. 185–409) of reading the relevant passage in Marcellus' letter to Julius of Rome not as the attempt of a beleaguered bishop to prove his

own orthodoxy by quoting 'R' but rather as Marcellus' topical counterblast against the theological doctrines of Asterius the Sophist, the propagandist of, and – as Vinzent would perhaps like to claim – the brain behind, early Arianism. Already Tetz had tried to show that it was Marcellus who had inserted the phrases 'only begotten' and 'our Lord' into 'R'. According to Vinzent, it was, in effect, Marcellus of Ankyra who formulated 'R' in the context of a specific controversy. Here one might also note that according to Rufinus of Aquileia it was precisely Marcellus' pupil Photinus who preceded him in writing a commentary on the 'Apostolic Creed' (PL xxi. 336B). In the course of his tightly argued study Vinzent makes important remarks on how fourth-century creeds were composed by paraphrasing, rephrasing and glossing other creeds.

Vinzent's bold and elegant thesis will have to be examined in greater detail; it should be noted, however, that he is making much if circumspect use of the *argumentum e silentio*. Moreover, quite a lot depends on his ingeniously argued view that the relevant passage from Marcellus' letter to Julius (Epiphanius, *Haer.* 72.3.1) should not be seen as the rather awkwardly inserted 'R' but has to be read as the second ('economic') part of a credal statement by Marcellus comprising three parts (*Haer.* 73.2.6–3.3).

Thanks to the contributions of this volume we have to prepare ourselves for a new round in the controversy on the origins of the Apostolic Creed.

ST EDMUND'S COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

WINRICH LÖHR

*Prayer and spirituality in the early Church.* Edited by Pauline Allen, Raymond Canning and Lawrence Cross (with B. Janelle Caiger). Pp. xv + 409 incl. frontispiece + 12 plates. Everton Park, Queensland: Centre for Early Christian Studies, Australian Catholic University, 1998. \$40 (paper). 0 646 36055 8

*Studies in patristic Christology. Proceedings of the Third Maynooth Patristic Conference, October 1996.* Edited by Thomas Finan and Vincent Twomey. Pp. ix + 245. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1998. £35. 1 85172 354 9

Here are two volumes of proceedings: at Melbourne in 1996 of a conference under the heading 'Prayer and spirituality in the early Church'; at Maynooth in the same year of the Third Patristic Conference. None of the papers is outstanding for novelty, but all are, to different degrees, worthy of the public domain and rightly brought into it: sponsors need to be assured that their money is being well spent, and there is value in keeping scholarly conversation going about important themes regardless of whether much fresh can be said. Twenty-four papers are ranged in the Australian volume under five heads: prayer, spirituality, asceticism, land and neighbour, the Cappadocian Fathers. An introduction by Lawrence Cross summarises the contributions and frees me to comment selectively on those I found useful. The best piece in the book is Andrew Louth's 'Dogma and spirituality in St Maximus the Confessor'. He raises the question which any, even amateur, reader of Maximus will certainly ask: what connection, if any, is there between the warmly religious Maximus of the early writings on prayer and the later leather-dry defender of Christological dualism? The essay convinces that there is a connection, indeed that Maximus' dogma and

spirituality coinhere. It is well worth reading. Three essays are about approaches to prayer: Hilarion Alfeyev on 'Prayer in St Isaac of Niniveh' – an excellent summary, bringing out the physical aspects; Robert Gaston on 'Attention and decorum in early Christian prayer', dealing with deportment in prayer; and Joan Barclay Lloyd on 'The depiction of figures from the Hebrew Scriptures in the art of the Roman catacombs', an illustrated guide to the pictures. These are all good pieces, illuminating incidental matters and drawing attention to actualities. There are essays about people: Philip Rousseau on 'Jerome's search for self-identity' (good quotations – a pity the basic idea is so naff); Pierre Éviéux rewrites usefully for anglophones his general introduction to Isidore of Pelusium; and Kathleen Hay gives a good short sketch of Peter the Iberian. Pier Franco Beatrice on 'Ascetical fasting and original sin' makes a valid minor point (that orthodoxy places Adam's sin in the belly, not in the bodily parts below it); Wendy Mayer has a good essay on 'Monasticism at Antioch and Constantinople in the late fourth century: a case of exclusivity or diversity?', amongst other things correcting Peter Brown's exaggerations. The Cappadocians have not brought out the best in the essayists, but Mary Sheather makes a useful contribution to the elementary secondary literature with her 'Pronouncements of the Cappadocians on issues of poverty and wealth'.

The Irish volume contains ten essays. I report on them in turn. The first by Thomas Finan, 'The desired of all nations', deals with 'Socrates as a possible "Christ-figure" in his life and death'. From Socrates the author's mind expands to meditate on extra-biblical revelation. The examples are good, the piece is perceptive and its conclusion comforting. Nicholas Madden writes on 'An aspect of Origen's Christology'. I did not gather what the 'aspect' was (and indeed all the contributions in this volume have a fairly loose relation to the titles they bear), the essay seeming to deal broadly with Origen's Christology. It is a good piece, but defensive, in an outmoded way, of his essential orthodoxy. Raymond Moloney takes us through much of the literature in his 'Approaches to Christ's knowledge in the patristic era', concluding that the patristic consensus has not settled the matter. Janet Rutherford writes an essay I found distinctly interesting on 'Sealed with the likeness of God: Christ as Logos in Diadochos of Photike'. It summarises her doctoral dissertation, and its main point is to interpret Diadochos as responding to 'Messalianism', in particular to its call to eradicate the evil in the soul through continuous prayer. Tarsicius van Bavel writes on 'The "Christus Totus" idea: a forgotten aspect of Augustine's Christology'. A good theme with a generous array of texts in Augustine, its treatment comes to grief through the author's too trusting reliance on Wheeler Robinson's notion of 'corporate personality' in the Old Testament. Lewis Ayres's 'The Christological context of Augustine's *De trinitate* XII: toward relocating books VII–XV' defeated me and I get nothing out of it beyond the platitude that Augustine was not so neo-platonic as one might think. Other readers may fare better. Eoin Cassidy writes on '*Per Christum hominem ad Christum deum*: Augustine's homilies on John's Gospel'. Homilies 17–19 and 23–54, a series delivered in 414, are looked at to illuminate Augustine's understanding of Christ's mediatorship and of Christian discipleship. A perceptive and thoughtful piece, it will send the reader back to the original homilies which, it goes without saying, are much more interesting than anything one can write about them. Thomas O'Loughlin writes

on 'Christ as the focus of Genesis exegesis in Isidore of Seville'. The author's contention is 'that the *In Genesim* was deliberately constructed as a sustained reflection on the person and work of Christ, to the exclusion of other matters relating to Genesis'. Isidore wrote no treatise 'de incarnatione'; instead what he had to say on the theme found expression in figurative exegesis of Genesis. This is a learned and instructive piece, explaining lucidly Isidore's approach and making a plausible point. Finbarr Clancy writes on '*Vive in Christo, ut Christus in te*: the Christology of St Columbanus'. He says some things about Columbanus I did not know, and says them with feeling and sympathy, even if the upshot is that *qua* technical theologian Columbanus is negligible. Finally (and to justify publication of the volume in a series which must have something on Ireland), Martin McNamara writes a fascinating but inconclusive essay tracing an apparent connection between Theodore of Mopsuestia *via* Julian of Eclanum with an old Irish tradition of 'historical' and 'Davidic' exegesis of the psalter.

FACULTY OF DIVINITY,  
CAMBRIDGE

L. R. WICKHAM

*Marcella – discipula et magistra. Auf den Spuren einer römischen Christin des 4. Jahrhunderts.* By Silvia Letsch-Brunner. (Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche, 91.) Pp. xi + 272. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1998. DM 168. 3 11 015808; 0171 6441

Nineteen of Jerome's letters are to Marcella. These, with ep. cxxvii, to Principia, comprise most of the evidence Silvia Letsch-Brunner had on which to base her *Marcella – discipula et magistra*. Ep. cxxvii, from 413, summarises Marcella's life. Letsch-Brunner works through the data (pp. 16–43). Next, Marcella's network in Rome is traced (pp. 44–83), with imperial, senatorial and ecclesiastical connections made explicit. At the heart of the book are Letsch-Brunner's summaries of the letters, first from 382–5, then from the time of the Origenist controversy in the 390s (pp. 172–217). A difficulty is evident: what do letters to Marcella show about her, since they are treatises for publication? Letsch-Brunner is reduced to inferring (for example, pp. 98, 107, 201) the high quality of Bible study done by Marcella and her circle. Fair enough: but the didactic and public predominates in the correspondence and raises a question over Letsch-Brunner's enterprise. She ends by translating (for the first time into German) the *Letter to Marcella* (CSEL xxix. 429–36), possibly by Pelagius and from 410 (pp. 225–34). This generally valuable study suffers from patchy reference to recent research: on the age of Roman girls at marriage, for instance (p. 29 n. 49, but see Brent D. Shaw, 'The age of Roman girls at marriage: some reconsiderations', *Journal of Roman Studies* lxxvii [1987], 30–46), or on Athanasius as author of the *Life of Antony* (p. 68 n. 91, but see Timothy D. Barnes, *Athanasius and Constantius*, Cambridge, Mass. 1993, 240 n. 64). Greek words are poorly printed.

UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND

PAUL McKECHNIE

*The Bible in Christian north Africa. The Donatist world.* By Maureen A. Tilley. Pp. 232. Philadelphia, PA: Fortress Press, 1998. 0 8006 2880 2

This is an interesting and original book, a study of the use of Scripture by the

north African Donatists, written from a Donatist standpoint. The author, who is an associate professor at Florida State University in Tallahassee, considers that most accounts of the Donatists have been at best partial, based on a record written by the winners, the Catholics. She also questions what she considers to be a static view of Donatist theology, that throughout the fourth and early fifth century they continued to regard themselves as the 'Church of the Pure' awaiting the dawn of the millennium. She asks, quite rightly, how much a narrow concept of religion could have attracted some of the best minds of Christian north Africa and enabled the Donatist Church to be the majority Church in north Africa through most of the fourth century.

The Donatists used the Bible to make sense of their world. Their interpretation of the text followed on that of Tertullian and Cyprian but their ingenious use of typology went beyond it. Biblical texts enabled martyrs from Perpetua in 203 to Typasius in 298 to make sense of their situation as persecuted Christians. But what was the position after the conversion of Constantine when there were no more martyrs? The author sees the Donatist account of the Martyrs of Abitina written between 304 and 311 while Caecilian was still archdeacon of Carthage, as a point of transition. The Donatists move from being a 'Church of the Martyrs' to becoming the *collecta* of Israel, the Christian representatives of the People of Israel, ever opposed to the surrounding world and threatened by it. While previously favourite biblical texts stressed the glory of the martyr, texts chosen by Donatist writers in the fourth century emphasised the necessity of a separate existence by true members of the Church. Parmenian (Donatist bishop of Carthage 355–91) and the theologian Tyconius provided the Donatists with new and original concepts of the nature of the Church.

The author has provided a convincing fresh insight into how the Donatists viewed themselves, independent of the distorting lens of Augustine's polemic. If criticism there must be, it is that she fails, through no fault of her own, to take into account the continuing reality of the martyr concept in the southern Numidian heartland of Donatism. No one can explore the multitude of chapels that dominated the life of the Numidian villagers without being aware of the part played throughout the fourth century by martyrs and their relics. The latter, lying beneath the altars on which the eucharist was performed, must have been regarded as an essential part of the Donatist liturgy.

One can only hope that one day central Algeria will be open again to scholarly research. Until then, one can only praise the author's study of the vibrant and coherent outlook of what with all its imperfections was the largest Christian Church in the west during the fourth century.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

W. H. C. FREND

*The shadows of poetry. Vergil in the mind of Augustine.* By Sabine MacCormack. (The Transformation of the Classical Heritage, 26.) Pp. xx + 258 incl. frontispiece and 15 ills. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 1998. Pp. £30 (\$40). 0 520 21187 1

With a mind well-attuned to cultural encounter and assimilation, MacCormack,



the author of fine studies of late antique art and ceremonial as well as of Andean culture and religion, here considers the encounter of Augustine and Virgil. Augustine was writing at a time when Virgil enjoyed great vogue, especially among his pagan contemporaries. MacCormack places Augustine's interest in Virgil firmly in the context of his fourth- and early fifth-century expositors and commentators. Comparison allows her both to identify shared assumptions – Augustine had been, after all, a late antique rhetor and grammarian – and to spotlight his own, personal, attitudes to the poetry that had moved him to tears in his youth and provided one of the targets of his anti-pagan polemic in old age. Two preliminary chapters treat Virgil and his reputation among his readers, interpreters and commentators in late antiquity, Christian and pagan. Three long chapters follow on the large themes in Augustine's interests where Virgil's poetry provided either a foil to his views or help in formulating them: human nature and emotions, true and false worship, Rome and its historical destiny. In his early dialogues Virgil often provided stimulus to Augustine's discussion and ways of expressing his own views. In his later work, especially in the *City of God*, opposition and rejection, sometimes taking the form of crude polemic, comes to dominate Augustine's explicit references to and use of Virgil. He came to see Virgil, especially in old age, as the supreme representative of a culture from which he sought to distance himself; but his imagination remained dominated by Virgil's language and imagery. The greater part of MacCormack's book is devoted to sketching the oppositions; but she also allows us to appreciate the warmth of Augustine's love of Virgil and the natural ease and the frequency with which he turned to his poetry for the means of expressing himself. As MacCormack says, Virgil's poetry was, quite simply, part of Augustine's mental furniture. Her book is a fine study by a scholar equally at home in both worlds.

NOTTINGHAM

R. A. MARKUS

*Religion in late Roman Britain. Forces of change.* By Dorothy Watts. Pp. xii + 208 incl. 9 figs. London–New York: Routledge, 1998. £45. 0 415 11855 7

This is a small but ambitious book, the sequel to the author's *Christians and pagans in Roman Britain* (London 1991). Though Dr Watts is interested in pagan cults in the Britain of the fourth century, her main concern is the rise and decline of Christianity there in this period. That Christianity faltered instead of flourishing, as it did on the continent in the last quarter of the century, seems to be borne out by all available evidence. The abandonment of the churches at Silchester and Colchester, the latter a relatively large and well-constructed building sited in a cemetery outside the Roman town, tell their own story. Romano-Celtic paganism, on the other hand, was evidently much stronger in Britain than its counterpart in northern and central Gaul, and on the Rhineland. The author meticulously examines the evidence for the longevity of Romano-Celtic temples and their worship, and there is much of interest and originality in her discussion of ritual decapitated burials in fourth-century cemeteries, surely, as she says, a revival of an Iron Age custom traceable in Britain and Ireland. Her conclusion that 'the one force which worked to the detriment of all religious cults in Britain (including

Christianity) was the decline of economy' is sound. Probably neither the pagan reaction under the Emperor Julian (361–3), nor, as this reviewer has urged, the damaging effects of the 'barbarian conspiracy' of 367–9, of themselves were responsible for the decline of Christianity after its increasing influence during the previous thirty years. The lack of missionary leaders drawn from a Christianised aristocracy, as in Gaul, was another factor.

Gaps, however, remain in the author's thesis. It is difficult to date precisely the decline of either the towns or the villas in Roman Britain, and also to interpret the finds from cemeteries of the period. What seems to have happened was a growing Celticisation of society, typified by the reoccupation of Iron Age hill-fort sites, such as Lydney and Maiden Castle, and the revival of specifically Celtic art forms, which were not Christian, demonstrated long ago by E. T. Leeds (*Celtic ornament*, Oxford 1933, ch. vi). Reversion to pre-Roman burial rites was another instance. In the fifth century the immediate Celtic successors of Roman administrators appear to have been either indifferent or hostile to Christianity. Vortigern was no 'new Constantine'.

This study contains much of value, not least the appendix devoted to discussing the iota-chi (not chi-rho) symbolism on lead water tanks probably used for Christian baptisms. The author has written a sound and well-documented study and a useful guide to future research on a key issue of fourth-century Roman Britain.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

W. H. C. FREND

*The devil, heresy and witchcraft in the Middle Ages. Essays in honor of Jeffrey B. Russell.*

Edited by Alberto Ferreiro. (Cultures, Beliefs and Traditions. Medieval and Early Modern Peoples, 6.) Pp. xv + 388 + frontispiece and 16 plates. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 1998. Nlg 208. 90 04 10610 3; 1382 5364

This volume, the sixth in the series *Culture, Beliefs and Traditions*, signals clearly the remarkable change which has taken place over the last thirty years or so in our concepts of 'proper history' (shades of G. R. Elton) and 'culture'. It is dedicated to J. B. Russell, a pioneer in this development whose influence is warmly acknowledged in many of the seventeen essays here collected. They are all 'close-ups' seeking, with an admirably high level of scholarship, to penetrate into fascinating corners of the medieval mind. They can broadly be grouped in five categories: (a) Social attitudes shaping the spiritual climate, nos 1, 4, 15, by L. J. Simon, R. Kieckhefer and C. B. Tkacz respectively; (b) Evil in the medieval imagination, nos 2, 3, 11, 14, by K. L. Jolly, A. Ferreiro, N. Forsyth and R. K. Emmerson; (c) the Church's perception of its role in controlling the spiritual climate, nos 5, 6, 12, 16, by A. E. Bernstein, E. Peters, B. M. Kienzle and J. Tolau; (d) Prophecy and cosmology, nos 7, 10, by C. A. Riggs and L. Smoller; (e) Heresy, nos 8, 13, 17, by A. Friesen, H. A. Kelly and G. Macy. Bernard McGinn's elegant essay on 'Cosmic and sexual love in Renaissance thought' (no. 9) stands rather apart. There are many flashes of illumination throughout the book which there is no space to mention here. Critically, this reviewer only wishes

to protest against the antithesis proposed in number seven between Prophecy and Order: much medieval prophecy was deeply concerned with a future new order.

ST ANNE'S COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

MARJORIE REEVES

*Die karolingische Kalendarreform.* By Arno Borst. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Schriften, 46.) Pp. lvii + 864. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1998. DM 180. 3 7752 5446 3

Arno Borst is one of the most distinguished medievalists of his generation and this remarkable book is his crowning achievement. Everyone knows that there have been exactly two great, universally recognised, reforms of the calendar. The first was undertaken by Julius Caesar and the second by Pope Gregory XIII. Everyone has managed to miss a crucial calendar produced at Lorsch in 789, almost certainly with the indirect involvement of Charlemagne himself. The heart of Borst's book is an edition of this calendar (pp. 254–98) but by far its longest sections serve to interpret that calendar and to place it into context. The Lorsch exemplar, known from two ninth-century derivatives, combines elements of solar, lunar and liturgical calendars while adding historical information as well. It was intended to serve more than merely liturgical purposes. To make comprehension of this calendar possible Borst studies the secondary literature on calendars and time-reckoning systems from remote antiquity to the present, and then he turns to a careful assessment of all the kinds of sources – calendars, computistical manuals, encyclopedias, martyrologies, annals, etc. – that can help to show what the anonymous Carolingian compiler had to work with and how his achievement differs from its predecessors. The Lorsch compiler artfully combined ancient systems of time-keeping with current events – dates in Charles's life, for example. In setting forth a sanctoral cycle, the compiler took the unusual step of including mainly saints that were recognised by the whole Church, and where authority was needed on whom to include the Roman liturgy provided the standard. Borst argues that the calendar fits very well with what we know of Charlemagne's principal legislative efforts in the years between about 785 and 795. This long, erudite and beautifully written book is a feast for any student of the Carolingian period, of course, but can be read with profit by anyone interested in European culture.

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA

THOMAS F. X. NOBLE

*The rite of church dedication in the early medieval era.* By Brian V. Repsher. Pp. 204 incl. 5 ills. Lewiston–Queenston–Lampeter: Edwin Mellen Press, 1998. £49.95. 0 7734 2231 5

The rite of church dedication was one of the most elaborate and impressive Christian rites in the early Middle Ages. In the book under review here Brian Repsher analyses some Carolingian evidence for the performance of this rite in an attempt to 'expose how the liturgy functioned as a vehicle to instruct and transform the Christian people by its action and words' (p. 15). In the first chapter Repsher gives a short historical introduction on the development of the

rite and lists several examples for the way it was interpreted in the New Testament, by the Church Fathers and by later theologians. In the last section of this chapter Repsher introduces the two texts which stand at the centre of his study, that is, the *Ordo ad benedicendam ecclesiam* (no. 40 in the Romano-Germanic Pontifical) and a detailed commentary on the rite of church dedication, commonly known as *Quid significent duodecim candelae*. Repsher has no doubt that the author of the latter used the *Ordo ad benedicendam ecclesiam*, or one very close to it, when he composed his commentary. However, a close examination of both texts clearly reveals that the author of *Quid significent duodecim candelae* commented on a much shorter and simpler version of the *ordo* (which indeed could have been the basis for the *Ordo ad benedicendam ecclesiam* as well). A careful look at the manuscript evidence and the question of transmission could have helped in this case.

The second chapter is dedicated to the *Ordo ad benedicendam ecclesiam*, and in it Repsher follows the text and describes the ceremony step by step, adding some helpful diagrams to illustrate the various movements outside and inside the church. More analysis is to be found in the third chapter, where Repsher discusses the commentary of *Quid significent duodecim candelae*. Repsher manages to demonstrate quite convincingly that the rite of church dedication was explained and understood as the ‘baptism’ of the building itself and, consequently, of the entire community. In the last chapter Repsher attempts to place the development of the rite against the background of the Carolingian reforms, and in the appendix he provides an English translation of both the *Ordo* and the commentary.

Repsher’s discussions and analysis, however, are slightly disappointing. In many cases he simply repeats in his own words the content of his sources and adds very little analysis. Although he is trying to place the rite of church dedication in the context of the Carolingian reforms, he simply ignores much of the Carolingian liturgical evidence for church dedication, as well as the many references to it in the various writings of Carolingian thinkers and theologians. Moreover, there are several idiosyncrasies and inaccuracies scattered throughout the book. For example, the Old Gelasian Sacramentary (Vat. reg. lat. 316) is, according to Repsher, ‘an edition of an original Roman form of the early sixth century’ (p. 114 n. 304), and ‘the Roman rite of baptism’, we are told, ‘was at the heart of the [Carolingian] reform movement’ (p. 136). From the footnotes it appears that too often the author relies on English translations of primary sources rather than on scholarly editions, and in many cases in which the Latin text is cited, the author used older and inadequate editions, when more recent and definitely more accurate ones exist. On top of all that, it seems that while discussing several topics (such as the cults of relics, the conversion of Europe, or the Carolingian reforms) the author was unaware of some recent and most crucial publications.

In his introduction the author states that ‘one reason medieval liturgical texts have been neglected by modern social and cultural historians is that few have been translated from the Latin. Another reason is that they have been published in sources unfamiliar to all but liturgists or Carolingian specialists’ (p. 15). This assertion is emphatically wrong. In recent years there has been an increase of interest in matters liturgical, and many historians had realised the importance

and the potential of liturgical studies, not only for the understanding of the Christian rite itself, but also for the understanding of a given society and its culture. Subsequently, much attention had been paid in recent years to liturgy by eminent scholars, such as Arnold Angenendt, Rosamond McKitterick, Janet Nelson, Michael Lapidge or Fred Paxton (most of whom are not even mentioned in the bibliography).

Repsher's book is indeed a nice beginning, but the history of the rite of church dedication in the Carolingian period has still to be written.

UNIVERSITY OF HAIFA,  
ISRAEL

YITZHAK HEN

*Charlemagne.* By Roger Collins. Pp. xvi + 234 incl. 4 maps. Basingstoke-London:

Macmillan, 1998. £45 (cloth), £14.99 (paper). 0 333 65054 9; 0 33 65055 7

Every generation needs its Charlemagne, and indeed – European Union notwithstanding – in three or four different national languages. Several short scholarly accounts of the man and the reign (not really separable!) have appeared in recent years although the one in English, in the *New Cambridge Medieval History*, is surprisingly disappointing. It seems to be true, however, that Roger Collins has produced the first book-length account for more than three decades. His concise discussion of 'The sources of information' has some important and novel things to say about the principal narrative, i.e. annalistic, source-texts, although the detailed arguments must be sought elsewhere and may not, in the end, hold the field. Subsequent chapters are strong where most twentieth-century accounts are weak, in the comparatively-detailed accounts of military campaigns and conquests; and Collins makes gallant attempts to interpret and not merely rehearse the 'contemporary' skeletal records of events. The occasional factual error is inevitable in a work of this scope: it is far from true that the 'Symmachan forgeries' from which Alcuin quoted in 798 exist is a single manuscript which is that actually used by him; and the statement that the sacrament of baptism 'was traditionally administered on the Thursday of Easter Week' will surprise many readers. These and other slips can easily be corrected in a second (paperback) edition – which will surely be required – of a fresh, economically-documented and clear review of a forty-five year reign that, 1200 years on, still invites attention from anyone interested in the history of Europe and its neighbours.

ST ANDREWS

D. A. BULLOUGH

*Alfred the Great. War, kingship and culture in Anglo-Saxon England.* By Richard Abels.

(The Medieval World.) Pp. xviii + 373 incl. genealogical table, 7 maps and

2 figs. London–New York: Longman, 1998. £14.99 (paper). 0 582 04048 5;

0 582 04047 7

The editor's preface to this book stresses the need for a balanced and careful overview of Alfred's reign for the non-specialist. This need became more pressing after a recent polemical work tried unsuccessfully to revise or reverse much accepted thinking, and Abels's book offers a welcome introduction to Alfred now that the dust has settled. Abels is very strong in his accounts of Alfred's wars

against the Vikings, of battle tactics and the strategic positioning of forces, and is worth reading for this alone. For instance, Abels's suggestion that Æthelred's late arrival at the 871 Battle of Ashdown was pre-arranged to dismay the Vikings and gain a surprise attack upon a distracted enemy, seems a much better explanation than any previously advanced. Parallels from Carolingian dealings with the Vikings are usefully woven into the English story, and Abels also draws on Old English literature, analogies from other periods and 'translations' of Alfred's activities into modern-day terms in a way that is usually fresh and engaging, as when he notes that Alfred was losing a 'war of attrition' against the Vikings.

Abels's drive for clarity leads him to oversimplify in places, though this may be a deliberate trade-off to produce an accessible introductory work. The treatment of King Ceolwulf of Mercia is a case in point. Throughout the book, Ceolwulf is portrayed as a Viking puppet-king, like Ecgberht of Northumbria and unlike the martyred Edmund of East Anglia. This is a plausible Viking tactic, but when Abels reviews the evidence of charters and coins that Ceolwulf acted as king apparently just as his predecessors had done, and notes that the negative account produced in Alfred's reign was coloured by a desire to portray Alfred as the only English ruler who managed to defeat the Vikings, it is difficult to see why Abels returns to the view that Ceolwulf was a Viking puppet. (Ceolwulf lost the eastern half of his kingdom to the Vikings in 877, but he retained control of the western half. Just as the *Chronicle* interpreted Alfred's dealings with the Vikings in the best possible light, by omitting cash payments which he almost certainly made, it may be that the record of Ceolwulf's peace with the Vikings in 874 is biased in the opposite direction.)

The book emphasises that all of Alfred's activities worked towards the common goal of ensuring that his kingdom could be defended and would be worthy of divine support. Alfred's military reforms and fortress construction, his gathering of learned men around him and the translations they produced, his law code and his emphasis on education are all competently introduced, though here again Abels notes in places that more detailed discussion would be beyond the scope of his book. This is unfortunate: while Abels argues convincingly in his concluding chapter for the unity of Alfred's activities, in what is clearly the work of a scholar very familiar with his subject, it would have followed more naturally from a more complete exposition of the material. But this comes back to the point that the book was designed as an overview for the non-specialist, and it succeeds quite well in that, providing excellent coverage of Alfred's campaigns and a reasonable introduction to other areas, along with a chapter of suggested further reading. (The Anglo-Saxon Charters web page that he mentions now has the less unwieldy URL of <http://www.trin.cam.ac.uk/chartwww/>.)

FITZWILLIAM MUSEUM,  
CAMBRIDGE

SEAN MILLER

*Charters of Selsey*. By S. E. Kelly. (Anglo-Saxon Charters, 6.) Pp. xviii + 123 + 4 plates. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for the British Academy), 1998.  
£35. 0 19 726175 2

This volume has been a long time in preparation and several different authors

began work on parts of it but the whole has been brought to a triumphant conclusion by Susan Kelly. Only twenty-one South Saxon charters have been preserved in the Chichester cathedral archives, of which two are single sheets and the rest known only from later medieval cartularies; there are in addition two South Saxon charters in the archive of Christ Church, Canterbury. Several of the charters present considerable problems in interpretation, not least because of interpolations or revisions at various points in their transmission. The difficulties are clearly explained by the editor, who sets out a range of possible explanations. If certainty is not possible she is not afraid to say so, and although she makes clear her own preferences, she also reveals the strengths and weaknesses of any particular position. The result is that we are now in a much better position to assess the historical value of the South Saxon land grants which are such crucial documents for the early history of the kingdom for which little other written evidence has survived. Thirteen of the South Saxon charters date to the seventh and eighth centuries and they are the sole source of evidence for most of the South Saxon kings and a major source for the bishops of Selsey. The evidence for both groups is reviewed here. The South Saxon material is also of considerable interest for other facets of the ecclesiastical history of the province. We appear to see the piecemeal establishment of a minster system in Sussex in a series of eighth-century grants to laymen to establish religious communities; a number then seem to have delegated the task to female relatives. A substantial part of the see's Domesday Book endowment seems to have been made up from the lands originally allocated to support these local minsters, and there is a surprising absence of lands granted directly to the bishop and the episcopal community. It would appear that the holdings of the see at the end of the Anglo-Saxon period are likely to have been substantially different from what they were during its first century of establishment, though the tenth-century community seems to have tried to disguise this fact by fabricating a new foundation charter and doctoring other grants. The Selsey charters also have an important contribution to make to our knowledge of early Anglo-Saxon diplomatic, and this is an area where the value of having an editor who has worked on several other volumes in the series is apparent. Kelly makes the intriguing suggestion that certain distinctive features of South Saxon diplomatic, which are shared with charters of the kingdom of the Hwicce, may provide evidence for the lost diplomatic of Northumbria whose missionaries were active in setting up bishoprics in both provinces.

KING ALFRED'S COLLEGE,  
WINCHESTER

BARBARA YORKE

*Family, commerce, and religion in London and Cologne. Anglo-German emigrants, c. 1000–c. 1300.* By Joseph P. Huffman. (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought.) Pp. xviii + 276 incl. 2 maps and 2 genealogical tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £35. 0 521 63292 7

Joseph Huffman has done an immense amount of work on a very intractable subject. He is hampered by a lack of coherent source material and has only been able to give us glimpses of life for men of Cologne in London and of Englishmen in Cologne. He lets us know that there is a vast wood of experience somewhere,

but is only able to show us individual trees in detail. It does not, and cannot, add up.

In his first two chapters he uses English sources to let us see something of the Cologne community in London, a community that included merchants from other towns in the Rhineland and Westphalia. These chapters run from their first privilege, which he dates to 1173–5, through their submersion in the general grouping of *mercatores de Alemannie* to the *Carta Mercatoria* of 1303, with the parallel transformation of the *domus* or *Gildhalla* of Cologne into the *Steelyard* for the whole Hansa. He does not refer to Pamela Nightingale's *Medieval mercantile community* (New Haven–London 1995), which no doubt came out whilst his book was in the press. If he had had access to it, he would have been able to emphasise the extraordinary nature of the Cologne merchants' 1173–5 privilege (*Family, commerce, and religion*, 20, text at n. 47) by which they 'possint ire ad ferias per totam terram nostram et emere et vendere' so by-passing the Londoners' staple privilege of acting as intermediaries with all foreign merchants. (See Nightingale, *Medieval mercantile community*, 65, for a similar privilege which breached the Londoners' monopoly in favour of the merchants of St Omer.)

Huffman continues with a background chapter on the moneys of Cologne and of England which were identical in value during his period. This was originally published in the *British Numismatic Journal* for 1995, and is accompanied by a number of extracts from the *Schreinsbücher* from various Cologne parishes which demonstrate the extent to which English sterling was commonly used in thirteenth-century Cologne. Although he prints documents that reveal the end of this period of identical value, he did not pick up that between 1297 and 1299, the coinage of Cologne sank suddenly to around half the value of English sterling.

The heart of the book is part II in which he used the *Schreinsurkunden* to look at families in Cologne with English connections. He first looks at the group of families called *Anglicus* or *de Anglia*, who, he plausibly argues, had English origins. His earliest example is a Jewish family in St Laurence parish, datable to c. 1135–59, and his last is two centuries later, although he concentrates heavily on the extensive documentation for the family and property of Walterus Anglicus in the mid thirteenth century. He then looks in similar close detail at the Zudendorps, a family of archiepiscopal *ministeriales* from the neighbourhood of Cologne, whose known English contacts start at the beginning of the thirteenth century with their part in the embassies to England about the Plantagenet–Welf alliance. Their involvement in diplomatic contacts with England continued for fifty years. They ended up with an English fief and increasingly extensive urban property in Cologne (which Huffman puts together painstakingly from the *Schreinsurkunden*) as well as rural landholdings. They were not the only ambassadors from the archbishop of Cologne to receive a grant from the English crown. Although Joseph Huffman does not deliberately emphasise political connections and set out to seek commercial ones, the nature of the evidence means that he has had to bring in a considerable amount of international politics and diplomatic activity.

The next chapter follows on from this, to bring together a large number of scattered references to other men from Cologne in England, particularly in London, between the late twelfth and the early fourteenth century. He especially emphasises the chronicler Arnold fitz Tedmar, who, although he had a father



from Bremen and a mother with Cologne origins, built up considerable urban property in London. His sisters intermarried with great London patrician families. After representing the German merchants in London in negotiations with the city, he became part of the London city establishment himself as alderman of Billingsgate ward until his death in 1274. Available material does not allow Huffman to make it clear whether he retained any contacts with Cologne. This chapter very properly brings us back full circle to the first two chapters. Although the title of the book gives the dating *c.* 1000–*c.* 1300 this is not really appropriate, since up to this point the book is about the long thirteenth century.

However Huffmann had picked up a large number of disparate pieces of information along the way that did not quite fit either with this time span or with the commercial–familial shape of the rest of the book. These have been put together into part III, the last and shortest section, the one that will be of most interest to readers of this *Journal*, entitled ‘Anglo-German religious and cultural life’. It is mainly about the twelfth century. Like the earlier parts it is a series of well-worked-out vignettes, starting with the exchange of prayers for deceased monks between Christ Church, Canterbury, and Sieburg Abbey before 1132, and ending with the participation of crusaders from the Rhineland, including Cologne patricians, in the English fleet that brutally captured Lisbon from Muslim hands in 1147. On the way we have William of Malmesbury’s retelling of the Cologne-focused hagiography of St Ursula and her numerous virgins, English pilgrims to the Three Kings at Cologne, Cologne pilgrims to Canterbury, and Gerard Pucelle, John ‘de Garlandia’ and Duns Scotus teaching at Cologne. As in the rest of the book each vignette is worked out as exactly as the documents allow, and placed in context, but, alas, the scarcity of the surviving information makes not only this section, but the whole book episodic. This means that the book cannot make a coherent whole. It is, however, a lucky dip into which historians should put their hands in the hope of pulling out a hidden gem.

QUEENS’ COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

PETER SPUFFORD

*The art of the book. Its place in medieval worship.* By Margaret M. Manion and Bernard J. Muir. Pp. xvi+337 incl. 98 black-and-white plates+8 colour plates. Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 1998. £45. 0 85989 566 1

The two parts of the title of this generously produced book should have been combined: its subject matter is in fact the place of the book in medieval worship, expansively defined. The body of the work consists of ten chapters by as many authors, all of whom are, or have been, connected with either Melbourne or LaTrobe universities in Australia. Every contribution deals with late medieval books save the first, Bernard Muir’s, which aims to provide the early Insular background for the development of the book of hours (*Horae*), itself to be central to several of the pieces that follow. The most substantial of these essays is Margaret Manion’s on the devotional imagery in three fourteenth-century prayer books made for female members of the French royal family: part, she explains, of a larger project aiming to deal with the varied relationships between text and imagery in such royal books. In this case, the fragmentary psalter-hours

of Blanche of Burgundy (alias the Savoy Hours), the Hours of Jeanne of Navarre and the Psalter of Bonne of Luxembourg are analysed towards substantiating the author's assertion that 'the women for whom they were made were trained in a number of different kinds of prayer and were expected to devote considerable time to its practice' (p. 39). Joan Naughton studies six books made for the grand Dominican nunnery of Poissy, a royal foundation, between 1332 and 1346. Given that two of the six are in Paris, one in a private collection in London, one in Philadelphia (mis-catalogued) and one in Melbourne, it is extremely useful to have fourteen illustrations from them, all showing lots of text as well as miniatures. Also related to Dominican liturgy is John Stinson's presentation of the texts and music for the (Dominican) office of the Assumption; here the plainsong for the entire office is written out in modern notation, with supplementary, highly useful tables. Useful tables are a feature also of Bronwyn Stocks's discussion of the illustrated Office of the Passion in Italian *Horae*, which uncovers three distinct versions of that paraliturgical devotion. Others of these essays deal with manuscript illumination at Besançon, the work of Master Jacques from that city, depictions of jewellery in the borders of Flemish manuscripts, and book-like devotional diptychs belonging to, especially, Margaret of Austria. Throughout, the ample use made of a handful of manuscripts in antipodean collections, enhances the value of this welcome volume.

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA,  
CHAPEL HILL

RICHARD W. PFAFF

*Medieval iconography. A research guide.* By John B. Friedman and Jessica M. Wegmann. (Garland Medieval Bibliographies, 20. Garland Reference Library of the Humanities, 1870.) Pp. xxiv + 437. New York–London: Garland Publishing, 1998. \$95. 0 8153 1753 0

This annotated list of almost 2,000 publications large and small is aimed at students of both medieval art and more general medieval culture. The first section is concerned with general and wide-ranging sources of information, the second is divided into chapters on more specific themes such as the classics, the Christian tradition, the natural world and aspects of everyday life. The authors make no claim to have compiled a comprehensive bibliography and it is very easy to point to gaps. For example, large numbers of popular editions of individual Books of Hours appear, but there is no comparable cover for Psalters, not even the Luttrell Psalter, which must surely be the most celebrated single source of visual daily life imagery in the world. Entries are not limited to work in English but several prolific writers on manuscript subjects, including François Avril and Otto Mazal, make no appearance. On the other hand, at least one book (299, Susie Nash's study of illumination in Amiens) cannot possibly be known to the authors, as it has yet to appear. None the less I can see this book proving very useful as a point of first reference on such subjects as baths (including vermin!), clocks and distaffs, not to mention Jesse, Job and Jonah, particularly for those faced with descriptive rather than with pictorial problems. It is attractively laid out and very clearly printed.

BRITISH LIBRARY

JANET BACKHOUSE

*Daibert von Pisa. Zwischen Pisa, Papst und erstem Kreuzzug.* By Michael Matzke. (Vorträge und Forschungen, Sonderband, 44.) Pp. 255 incl. 2 maps. Sigmaringen: J. Thorbecke, 1998. DM 96. 3 7995 6754 2

Historians from the twelfth century onward have seldom found much good to say about Daibert (alias Daimbert or Dagobert), archbishop of Pisa from 1088 and Latin patriarch of Jerusalem from 1099. To Sir Steven Runciman Daibert appeared 'vain, ambitious and dishonest', while Hans Eberhard Mayer described him as a crass blackmailer. Bernard Hamilton's judgement was even darker. He not only deemed Daibert's behaviour following the death of Godfrey of Bouillon 'criminally irresponsible', but also accused him of embezzling money earmarked for the defence of the Holy Land. Daibert was in fact convicted of this last charge (as well as of simony, treason and conspiracy to commit murder) by two legatine synods in 1101 and 1102. He was in consequence deposed from the patriarchate, but then appealed to Pope Paschal II, who reinstated him in 1105. Daibert died shortly thereafter, before he could return to Jerusalem. Michael Matzke argues that Daibert's unsavoury reputation was largely undeserved. He sees him as an idealist, yet also a vigorous administrator, a member of the reforming circle associated with Matilda of Tuscany, a confidant of Pope Urban II, an effective prelate who implemented the church reform programme in Pisa. Matzke would even number Daibert among the architects of the First Crusade. Daibert was, he notes, at the pope's side throughout the months leading up to the Council of Clermont in 1095 and must necessarily have been party to the discussion and planning that culminated in the announcement of the crusade project at Clermont. As for Daibert's reputation for greed, Matzke argues that this was entirely undeserved. Daibert was instead a conscientious churchman, intent upon recovering church property from the hands of laymen, a course of action that aroused the hostility that the chroniclers' accounts of him reflect. Daibert's political machinations during his patriarchate, as Matzke sees things, represented nothing more sinister than concerted efforts to implement Pope Urban's plans for the governance of Jerusalem once the crusade had succeeded in conquering the holy city. Contemporary allegations about the patriarch's lust for power were coloured, Matzke insists, by the interests of the lay rulers of the Crusader States. Matzke argues his brief vigorously and with an impressive command of the sources, but his gallant attempt to rehabilitate Daibert's shady reputation ultimately fails to convince.

UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS

JAMES A. BRUNDAGE

William of Malmesbury, *Historia novella. The contemporary history.* Edited by Edmund King, translated by K. R. Potter. (Oxford Medieval Texts.) Pp. cxiv + 143 incl. 4 plates. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998. £40. 0 19 820 192 3

The *Historia novella* survives essentially in two versions and this new edition breaks new ground by printing not Ce, used in the 1955 *Nelson's Medieval Texts* edition, but AB. Edmund King argues that Ce, which was also the choice of Bishop Stubbs in the *Rolls Series*, was in fact a second edition, and probably not the work

of William of Malmesbury. He suggests instead that the changes made in Ce were probably the work of a clerk in the household of Roger, bishop of Worcester, a son of Earl Robert of Gloucester, to whom the text was dedicated. The AB version published here looks, as the editor points out (p. cviii) ‘unfamiliar, possibly a little austere’, but it is this which represents William of Malmesbury’s own text, with variant readings and missing rubrics supplied for the reader in the footnotes. The textual differences in Ce amount to a little new material, such as the fact that Geoffrey de Mandeville fought alongside the Londoners at Winchester in 1141, although according to the second charter issued by the empress in his favour shortly before they were his mortal enemies; changes of emphasis: the loss of Henry 1’s heir in the White Ship was downgraded from a disaster to a misfortune, and changes in presentation: the addition in the second edition of rubrics which highlight the importance of Earl Robert. The translation is a slightly revised version of that in the 1955 edition: thus, for example, in 1955 the passage referring to the grant made to Queen Adeliza at Christmas 1126 ‘comitatum Salopesberie dedit’ was translated by Potter (p. 3) as ‘he gave... the earldom of Shrewsbury’ and by King (p. 7) as ‘he gave... the county of Shropshire’. King’s annotations and introduction provide a judicious evaluation of the author’s perspective on the politically sensitive events he records, written in a lively and accessible style and full of useful insights on specific issues. For instance, in his discussion of the last years of Henry 1’s reign, he suggests that the king’s refusal to hand over castles had a lot to do with Matilda’s fortunes after 1135. Henry was in effect rejecting his settlement of the succession, leaving Matilda to fight ‘on her own and for herself’ (p. xlii). This fine addition to the *Oxford Medieval Texts* series throws new light on the working methods of William of Malmesbury and on the transmission of texts.

THE QUEEN’S UNIVERSITY OF BELFAST

JUDITH A. GREEN

Galand de Reigny, *Petit Livre de proverbes*. Edited by Jean Châtillon, Maurice Dumontier and Alexis Grémois. (Sources Chrétiennes, 436). Pp. 238 incl. frontispiece. Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1998. Fr. 144. 2 204 06082 8; 0750 1978

Galand de Reigny, wandering scholar, hermit and, finally, Cistercian monk, reflects the reforming spirituality of the first half of the twelfth century. His *Little book of proverbs* (*Libellus prouerbiorum*) is not quite what its stocking-filler title might suggest. Few of its ‘proverbs’ (each accompanied by an allegorical interpretation) would fit the modern definition. Most are general observations on daily life (including monastic customs), together with a few *exempla* taken from Scripture and the classics; and although Galand claims that the work can be read on two levels, as practical and as spiritual advice, the two levels are closely, sometimes indissolubly, connected (one small group of riddles makes sense only in terms of its allegorisation). A more appropriate description of its genre might be (to borrow a title from William de Montibus) *Similitudinarium*. The work’s relatively simple Latin and a number of addresses to the reader suggest, as Grémois argues, a literate but uncultivated audience: probably monks, perhaps novices in particular. The text, edited by Jean Châtillon, was first published in the *Revue du*

*moyen âge latin ix* (1953), 5–152, with a translation by Maurice Dumontier; Alex Grélois has revised the translation and provided a new introduction, textual notes and index. The edition as a whole offers the combination of scholarship and accessibility characteristic of this series, and makes a significant contribution to the history of European pastoral literature; Galand explicitly recognises preaching as an integral part of the Cistercian vocation, and his work anticipates the pastoral compilations produced from the later twelfth century onwards.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

BELLA MILLETT

*Abbot Suger of St-Denis. Church and State in early twelfth-century France.* By Lindy Grant. (The Medieval World.) Pp. xix + 338 incl. 4 genealogical tables, 2 maps and 3 plans. London–New York: Longman, 1998. £42. 0 582 05154 1; 0 582 05150 9

There was a risk that this book would have been rendered redundant by Michel Bur's recent biography, *Suger, abbé de Saint-Denis, régent de France* (Paris 1991). Instead, Dr Grant has succeeded in producing not only the first biography in English, but also an original interpretation of the career of the famous abbot. I confess to being irritated by the format of this book, which no doubt is the responsibility not of the author but of the publisher. The large print and numerous sub-chapters (many less than two pages in length) suggest that the book may be aimed at undergraduate, or even younger, students. The idea of the 'sound-bite' comes to mind, but Dr Grant's prose is lively and interesting enough not to need such devices to keep the reader's attention. Appearances can deceive, though. The content is rigorous and detailed enough in its use of primary sources and in argument to satisfy the specialist reader. Much of the interest in Suger has come from art historians, but, as Grant observes, in interpreting Suger's patronage of art and architecture, art historians have been guided by the historiographical orthodoxies that Suger was socially a *parvenu*, and intellectually the creator of the Capetian royal ideology. This book persuasively undermines both suppositions. Grant is careful to place Suger's career in the context of ecclesiastical history. Suger's problem was the need 'to balance his monastic and his political careers, at a period when there was growing pressure on monks to stay enclosed in their cloisters' (p. 6). Grant refutes the orthodoxy that Suger neglected Saint-Denis while pursuing his own political career, only focusing his attention on the abbey when he lost royal favour in the 1140s. She demonstrates that Suger performed his 'balancing act' rather well, often managing to benefit his king and his abbey simultaneously. Other contemporary dichotomies created tensions in Suger's career. Grant discusses the tension between old-fashioned Benedictinism and the new ascetic monastic orders, embodied in Suger and St Bernard of Clairvaux respectively, but seeks to minimise the degree of personal conflict between the two men. Another dichotomy which Dr Grant identifies as presenting a challenge to Suger as abbot of Saint-Denis was the enhanced role and effectiveness of episcopal authority in ecclesiastical affairs brought about by the reform movement. Throughout, this book is a refreshing reinterpretation of Suger's life and career, firmly based on the evidence of primary sources, and above all an attempt to dispel anachronism and, as the title indicates, to

understand Suger in the context of 'Church and State in early twelfth-century France'.

FITZWILLIAM COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JUDITH EVERARD

*The cartulary of St Augustine's Abbey, Bristol.* Edited by David Walker. (Gloucestershire Record Series, 10.) Pp. xxxvi + 439. Gloucester: Bristol and Gloucestershire Archaeological Society, 1998. £30 + £4 post and packing from Bristol and Gloucestershire Archaeological Society, 22 Beaumont Road, Gloucester GL2 0EJ. 0 900197 46 3

This volume is a most worthy addition to the Bristol and Gloucestershire Archaeological Society's series of editions of Gloucestershire records. The Victorine house of St Augustine's Abbey (which became the Bristol Cathedral at the Reformation) was founded in 1148 and endowed with lands by Robert fitz Harding, that substantial man of Bristol whose grandfather was a thegn of Edward the Confessor and who himself became lord of Berkeley. The abbey's late thirteenth-century cartulary, 'The Red Book of St Augustine's', was preserved at Berkeley Castle, and is the most substantial of the sources for the abbey's history: the texts of 599 charters issued between 1148 and 1275 together with a small number of later documents provide the historian with material primarily to study the abbey's acquisition of property from its numerous patrons, but much else besides. Most of the lands and churches given to the canons lay close to Bristol, in Gloucestershire, Somerset and south Wales; there was also a substantial urban estate, in Bristol itself, of at least seventy-three tenements. The publication of the charters relating to these burgages, from a period of the town's history of which relatively little is known, will be particularly welcome to urban historians; however, the range of matters listed in the subject index and the long index of persons and the places together leave little doubt that this volume will inform the research of numerous ecclesiastical and social historians. As well as the excellent indices, an appropriate introduction steers the reader through the contents of the cartulary, and usefully discusses matters such as the foundation and the siting of the abbey. The charters are thoroughly footnoted in an impressive display of erudition. In all, this is a meticulous piece of work, as one has come to expect from this skilful and experienced editor.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

RICHARD HOLT

*Catalogue of seals in the National Museum of Wales, II: Ecclesiastical, monastic and collegiate seals with a supplement concerning Wales.* By David H. Williams. Pp. ix + 67 incl numerous ills. Cardiff: National Museums & Galleries of Wales, 1998. £15.50. 0 7200 0452 7

This is the second volume of the *Catalogue of seals in the National Museum of Wales* and lists all impressions (mostly Victorian in origin) of ecclesiastical, monastic and collegiate seals from outside Wales held by the museum's Department of Numismatics. The majority of these impressions are of English seals although some from the continent are also included. The volume's introduction gives a

succinct summary of the development and significance of the seal, including some particularly interesting details about forgery and the loss of seals during travelling, and an analysis of the development of seal imagery which is particularly well demonstrated through photographs, although a more detailed discussion of monastic seal imagery would have been helpful. The catalogue itself includes a wide variety of seal casts, from episcopal to capitular and parochial as well as those of hospitals and guilds, from a wide variety of dates. All are well described with a suitable amount of detail and a number are also illustrated in extremely clear photographs. Even more images would have improved the volume (occasionally an intriguing description is impossible to follow up), but the constraints of space must, of course, be accepted. The index of principal seal motifs will also prove extremely useful. Overall, the volume gives the impression of a collection of not overwhelming size but of high quality where the sigillographer would find much to interest them, and which would provide some useful material for comparative study.

BORTHWICK INSTITUTE OF HISTORICAL RESEARCH

PHILIPPA HOSKIN

*The history of the tyrants of Sicily* by 'Hugo Falcandus' 1154–69. Translated and annotated by Graham A. Loud and Thomas Wiedemann. (Manchester Medieval Sources Series). Pp. xii + 286 incl. 2 maps and 5 genealogical tables. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 1998. £45 (cloth), £16.99 (paper). 0 7190 4894 X; 0 7190 5435 4

The *Manchester Medieval Sources* series is rightly becoming renowned for producing accessible translations of key texts accompanied by scholarly introductions and notes, and this latest volume maintains that high standard. On the face of it, 'Pseudo-Hugo', as Loud and Wiedemann style the author of their main text, would not appear to be a very promising subject to engage students' attention. His text is basically undatable (although safely twelfth-century), the author is unknown, and the scope of the work limited to the intrigues and local rivalries surrounding the court of Palermo and, occasionally, other parts of Sicily and southern Italy. As if aware of these potential shortcomings, the translators offer an additional collection of contemporary extracts from the *Chronicon* of Romoald of Salerno (more wide-ranging); Boso's *Life* of Pope Adrian and the text of the Treaty of Benevento (partially illustrating the diplomatic relations of the Norman kingdom); and a letter, the *Letter to Peter*, which on manuscript and stylistic evidence is assumed to come from Pseudo-Hugo's pen. Ironically such comparative material, whilst extremely useful to course tutors starved of English translations with which to teach this period of southern Italian history, only serves to further justify the translation of the main text. Romoald's account is strangely flat in comparison to Pseudo-Hugo's colourful prose, packed as the latter is with a wealth of classical allusions (neatly summarised in Wiedemann's introduction to the author's use of classical texts) and detailed incident. In the *History* and the *Letter* there is material aplenty for historians of urban life and rituals, with a richness of detail which northern chronicles achieve only later: the cities teem with crowds, volatile and often hostile. The *Letter* is particularly valuable for its section in praise of Palermo – a genre which was gaining in

popularity again in the twelfth century (compare for instance the debate between Mantua and Canossa in Donizo's slightly earlier *Life* of Matilda of Tuscany). The map of medieval Palermo might have included further speculative detail (where was the *Via Coperta*?), and a map of Messina would have enhanced the often lengthy passages of that city. These are minor quibbles, however: the translation itself serves Pseudo-Hugo well, doing justice to his often complex Latinity whilst conveying the liveliness of his narrative. Loud and Wiedemann's assiduous footnotes, particularly the mini-biographies of most of the major actors in the *History*, provide an essential guide to what is actually going on. The genealogical tables help the reader through the complicated family rivalries which afflicted the *regno* in this period. All in all, a valuable addition to the range of sources available in English, and one which deserves attention from students of all parts of medieval Europe.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

PATRICIA SKINNER

*La Bibliothèque de l'abbaye de Clairvaux du XIIe au XVIIIe siècle, II: Les Manuscrits conservés. Première partie. Manuscrits bibliques, patristiques et théologiques.* Edited by Jean-Paul Bouhout and Jean-François Genest. (Documents, Études et Répertoires.) Pp. 767 + 8 colour and 8 black-and-white plates. Paris: CNRS Éditions Turnhout: Brepols, 1997. 503 50691 7; 0073 8212

*Zisterzienser und ihre Bücher. Die mittelalterliche Bibliotheksgeschichte von Kloster Eberbach im Rheingau unter besonderer Berücksichtigung der in Oxford und London aufbewahrten Handschriften.* By Nigel F. Palmer. Pp. 356 incl. 197 colour plates. Regensburg: Schnell and Steiner, 1998. DM 78. 3 7954 1189 0

Of these two volumes concerned with long-dispersed Cistercian libraries the one devoted to Clairvaux, the fourth house of the Cistercian order, may take pride of place in this review, having (whether by accident or design) been published eighteen years after the appearance of its first volume, in time to mark the 900th anniversary of the founding of the Order in 1098. That first volume comprised editions of the extant catalogues of the library and identification of extant manuscripts; the present volume is devoted to descriptions of these manuscripts, presented in the order of the 1471 catalogue, supplemented by thirty-eight pages of historical introduction and some eighty pages of indices. As its title makes clear, it covers only a part of the surviving library, pressmarks A to L. A third volume will contain descriptions of the remaining manuscripts in the 1471 catalogue.

Confiscated at the Revolution, the Clairvaux library was split between the Bibliothèque municipale in Troyes, where all but twenty-one of the present volume's manuscripts now are, and to a lesser extent Montpellier (thirteen plus a fragment), Paris (three in two libraries), Florence, Laon, London (each one) and Budapest (a fragment). Once in Troyes and Montpellier the books were arbitrarily rearranged and poorly catalogued (albeit in the two earliest volumes [1849, 1855] of the *Catalogue général des manuscrits* in the libraries of the départements). Now we have descriptions which come up to modern standards with the result that this volume will be welcomed not only as an essential companion to its first volume and as a source of illumination on one of medieval France's greatest religious houses, but for its descriptions of the books for their



own sake. For their descriptions of the literary contents of the manuscripts the editors deserve our special gratitude, for these seem to be comprehensive, and up-to-date in their references to supporting literature. Their descriptions of the physical features of the books are, they tell us, limited to essentials, but this is liberally interpreted: details of quiring, foliation, decoration, binding, old pressmarks and *ex libris* inscriptions are comprehensive, and each manuscript is given its own bibliography. The almost invariable omission of any indication of the script used or the standard of production attained is acceptable for manuscripts produced in the twelfth-century Clairvaux *scriptorium* where large format books in good script were standard but for books of the later centuries, which came from a variety of sources – gift, bequests, purchases and exchanges – specific information on these points would have been welcome. Indices seem to work well, presentation is standardised and space-saving, typography good and the general effect agreeable. The plates, however, are of no more than average quality; those in colour are unconvincingly gaudy and some of the black-and-white ones look out of focus.

More specifically than the Clairvaux book the Eberbach volume is intended to mark the same gooth Cistercian anniversary. Eberbach, founded in 1136, became the most important Cistercian house in Mittelrheingebiet. In the twelfth century it had its own *scriptorium* and at the beginning of the sixteenth century had about 2,500 volumes. Despite great losses in the aftermath of the Thirty Years War the house was rebuilt and received major accessions to its library until shortly before its secularisation in 1803, when it housed about 8,000 volumes. The largest single group of surviving manuscripts (112) is now in Oxford; the largest elsewhere are in Giessen, London, Wiesbaden and Wolfenbüttel. Nigel Palmer's account of the diaspora is absorbing and illuminating, covering *inter alia* and in some detail the occupation of the house in the early 1630s by alternately Swedish and Hessian troop (during which the Swedes, he thinks, were probably not the major plunderers); the acquisition by Thomas Howard, earl of Arundel, of the Eberbach volumes that are now in the British Library; the much more numerous acquisitions by Archbishop Laud for the University of Oxford and, with the secularisation, once again the library's complete destruction.

Palmer's book is basically an edition (the first) of the 1502 catalogue with identification of ninety manuscripts, plus thirty-seven probables and eighteen possibles. He also lists and describes over fifty Eberbach manuscripts and large numbers of incunables and fragments that are unidentifiable in the catalogue. His accompanying text is, however, no less important – six impressive chapters on the history of the abbey and the growth, use and influence of its library; a chapter on Cistercian spirituality; an appendix comprising Eberbach excerpts from the *Rheinischer Gesamtkatalog* of the 1470s; the descriptions of the books I have referred to above ('Verzeichnisse der Handschriften, Inkunabeln und Fragmente'); lists of missing and rejected books; bibliography; and indices. The only feature I miss is a second index of manuscripts, allowing for a separation of Eberbach manuscripts from non-Eberbach manuscripts that are cited (or alternatively the present single index with differentiation of type to distinguish the categories). An index of incunables under their modern pressmarks would also be useful. Even as it is, however, the reader gets much more than I have indicated: technically this is an exceptionally fine book, with almost 200

informative illustrations, some of buildings but most of manuscripts, most of them in superb colour and some in full size. These last really look like manuscripts: the colours are right, the parchment looks like parchment and not like lifeless alabaster. The overall design of the volume is generous, imaginative and practical. The expense of production must have been great but so must the generosity of the principal patron, the Sparkassen Versicherung Hessen-Nassau-Thüringen. The Freundeskreis Kloster Eberbach is to be congratulated on the vision and determination which have resulted in the production of a work of beauty as well as of fine scholarship.

OXFORD

ANDREW G. WATSON

*Wells Cathedral west front. Construction, sculpture and conservation.* By Jerry Sampson, foreword HRH The Prince of Wales, preface Peter Lasko, Pp. xix + 298 incl. numerous ills + 8 colour plates. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 1998. £45.00 7509 1450 5

It may be that, as an art and architectural historian, I should not be reviewing this book, for the author states very forcibly in his acknowledgements (p. xi) that 'this book is not an art history...neither...is it conventional architectural history'. This caveat is made because there is no attempt to put Wells into a larger historical or formal context. Instead, the nature of the work is archaeological, the methodology emphasising the building as the primary document. Yet, of course, this approach is fundamental to medieval architectural history in particular, even if less so to other aspects of medieval art history; most medievalists indulge perforce in a close reading of the fabric and the subsequent, consequent, exercise of logical deduction from what they see.

The work is divided into five chapters ('Construction'; 'The sculpture'; 'The painting of the west front'; 'The design'; and 'The meaning of the west front': pp. 1–181) which are followed by a catalogue of the sculpture (pp. 182–270). The last involves a rather lengthy detailed description of the pose and costume of each piece (I found the use of the 'heraldic' terms 'dexter' and 'sinister' for 'right' and 'left' [see note 2] irritating), followed by an analysis of its condition and further remarks regarding repairs and traces of paint. There is, however, no discussion of, indeed scarcely any mention of, style. Consequently, and considered as a work that originated in the context of the necessary conservation of the west front sculpture from 1974 to 1986, its strengths and interest, primarily, and surprisingly, reside in what the author has to tell us about the architecture of the building rather than the sculpture. Three of the chapters (i, iv and v) are primarily concerned with architecture, especially the process of building. In this respect perhaps the most interesting observations concern the refinements in the building phases, here further clarified by attention to the type of stone used. Sampson especially emphasises a logical sequence of pre-planned phases each of which was to provide a functioning section. As to the west front, the author produces fundamental evidence to confirm the obvious, that it is not the design intended when construction started in the 1170s; rather, any earlier design was revised perhaps *c.* 1186/8, with the final form – characterised by towers placed outside the aisle and deep buttresses – certainly fixed before 1209, the foundations

possibly laid as early as *c.* 1200. One new and intriguing feature is presented (pp. 174–6), the possibility of a trumpeter's gallery placed high up at the base of the gable, in the form of eight circular holes. (Such a function might well also explain a series of openings similarly placed in the much later façade of Beverley Minster.) Perhaps the most controversial proposal will be that the west front was not intended to receive free-standing stages to its 'towers'. There may be structural grounds on which to question this conclusion (intended vaulting on two levels, extreme depth of buttresses), or even formal – why was not a type of west transept built? And in terms of the meaning advanced (p. 181), one may ask if the later medieval builders, by adding free-standing stages, committed blasphemy or had merely already forgotten the meaning of the façade?

Although the book is well illustrated with plans, diagrams and photographs, the illustrations are unnumbered and there are seldom any references to them in the text. This is both annoying and a pity. Relatively little of the sculpture – all 350 pieces (of an intended 500) are dated to the brief period between *c.* 1235 and 1243 – is illustrated and then generally only in order to reveal some technical detail. Few details have escaped the author's observation and he has had the patience to record them with considerable precision and to worry or tease every possible conclusion out of them. It is surprising just how much speculation there is compared to the hard data. It is not an easy read, but it is an interesting one – one that might have been more so if some larger context had been provided in which to place (to evaluate?) the conclusions derived from the meticulous observations of a myriad of small details.

DALHOUSIE UNIVERSITY,  
NOVA SCOTIA

J. PHILIP MCALEER

*Catálogo dos códices da livraria de mão do Mosteiro de Santa Cruz de Coimbra na Biblioteca Pública Municipal do Porto.* Edited by Aires Augusto Nascimento and José Francisco Meirinhos. Pp. cxiv + 524 incl. frontispiece and 143 plates. Oporto: Biblioteca Pública Municipal do Porto, 1997. 972 634 089 6

This catalogue was produced as part of celebrations of the eight-hundredth anniversary of the birth in Lisbon in 1195 of St Antony of Padua, who before his transfer to the Franciscan Order was an Augustinian canon at Coimbra. It describes ninety-seven codices, dating from the ninth century to the sixteenth, about eighty of them written in the monastery's *scriptorium* and all formerly in its library. Their contents are on the whole standard monastic, with the addition of rarer texts of Iberian origin or interest. When the abbey, with other religious houses, was suppressed in 1834, they were transferred to their present home in the municipal library in Porto. Several specialists have collaborated in the production of this new catalogue and the result is admirable. Introductory chapters cover *inter alia* the history of the monastery and its *scriptorium*; the descriptions of the contents and of codicological aspects of the books are clear and comprehensive; ten indices facilitate just about every possible approach – to texts, copyists, illuminated manuscripts, music manuscripts and so on. I say 'just about' because, oddly, the names of places where manuscripts originated other than Santa Cruz itself, whether precise places or just countries, seem not to be indexed. Although typography and layout are unsophisticated, both are very clear and a

remarkable feature of the book is its 143 plates, mainly of texts but also of bindings and constructional features.

OXFORD

ANDREW G. WATSON

*Bernard Itier. Chronique.* Edited by Jean-Loup Lemaître. (Les Classiques de l'histoire de France au moyen âge, 39.) Pp. cxix + 385 + 8 figs. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1998. Fr. 240 (paper). 2 251 34050 5; 0184 7082

This is a welcome new edition of the thirteenth-century chronicle of Bernard Itier (d. 1225), librarian of the abbey of Saint-Martial de Limoges. Principally concerned with the affairs of Saint-Martial and its possessions, and of Limoges and its environs, it is very much local history. Due to Itier's interest in recording the affairs of his monastery, however, the chronicle is valuable as a source for the daily life of a Cluniac abbey in the early thirteenth century, mentioning the administration of the abbey's temporal possessions, its architecture, church ornaments, liturgy and religious observance, and relations with Cluny and with the bishop of Limoges. The chronicle is also a source for attitudes to heresy, Bernard Itier being an eye-witness to the Albigensian Crusade. This edition gives the text from the beginning (AD 60) to 1225, although the chronicle is an original source only for the years 1184–1225. Detailed notes and commentary, conveniently placed at the end of the text, explain each entry. The chronicle is published in its original Latin (with lapses into Limousin) with a parallel text in French. The translation should be treated with caution, not only due to some minor errors, but also because the extremely succinct text is subject to ambiguity.

FITZWILLIAM COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JUDITH EVERARD

*The church in the medieval town.* Edited by T. R. Slater and Gervase Rosser. Pp. xiv + 307 incl. 1 table and 51 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998. £49.95. 1 84014 213 8

This is the first of two projected volumes to emerge from a Leverhulme Trust-funded interdisciplinary research project exploring the interaction of church and town in medieval England and focused on the University of Birmingham. It comprises a dozen papers addressing the majority of the major themes currently under investigation in the field authored by a variety of eminent archaeologists, geographers and historians from Birmingham and beyond, together with an introduction and index. The essays include a study of contemporary status distinction in the urban context by Hilton, an issue subsequently examined in closer focus using Hereford as a case study by Gervase Rosser. John Edwards provides a novel analysis of Jewish–Church relations in British cities prior to the expulsion of the 1290s, laying particular stress on the houses for converts founded in London as a consequence of the edicts of the Third Lateran Council, while the early history of the mendicants themselves are discussed separately in a contribution to London history by Röhrkasten. Chris Dyer investigates from where, and from whom the church in the West Midlands purchased its goods and services. Robert Swanson considers the normally poorly-documented subject of

the finances of the late medieval parish churches, and then provides a fascinating case-study of St Margaret's, Bishop's Lynn, in an era of economic decline, 1370–1530. The papers of greatest interest to your reviewer, those on topography and the built environment, form the second half of the book. Monastic towns are considered from an Irish perspective by Brian Graham, and that of the English Benedictines, concentrating primarily on St Albans, by Terry Slater. Keith Lilley applies his skills of town-plan analysis to the enigmatic rise of Coventry in the twelfth century and shows how the successful monastic economic initiative in Coventry caused the Norman bishops to seek 'a piece of the action that Coventry offered' (p. 199). Interestingly it is suggested (p. 191) that Coventry's Abbot Leofric may have built towns outside the gates of the three major abbeys he held, Coventry, Peterborough and Burton-upon-Trent: it should be noted that the evidence for Leofric's monastic empire is thin indeed and there is no Coventry evidence at all (see *English episcopal acta*, xiv, p. xxvi). Messrs Baker and Holt consider the topographical history of Worcester and Gloucester. In their introduction the volume's editors exhort us to new heights of interdisciplinary collaboration: a laudable aim indeed, but evidently one not always preached in practice by their authors. On p. 227 Baker and Holt comment on an *actum* of a Bishop 'W.' of Worcester, attributed by them to Bishop William de Blois (1218–36). I am assured by the British Academy's editors of Worcester *acta* – Mary Cheney and Philippa Hoskin – that the document is assuredly twelfth-century, as other scholars have previously thought, and as such not included in *English episcopal acta*, xiii (published in 1997). The volume closes with an enthralling study of the surviving building evidence for Canterbury, demonstrating just how frequently the high medieval parish churches of the city were rebuilt on new sites, and a penetrating analysis of the conflicting needs of the laity and surviving urban minster communities within the same architectural space in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, by John Blair. I much look forward to the promised second volume with its intensive investigation of the West Midlands cities.

HUGHES HALL,  
CAMBRIDGE

M. J. FRANKLIN

*St Bartholomew's hospital, Bristol. The excavation of a medieval hospital, 1976–8.* By Roger Price (with Michael Ponsford). (CBA Research Report, 110.) Pp. xix + 251 incl. 77 figs, 26 plates and 13 tables. York: Council for British Archaeology, 1998. £28 (paper). 1 872414 81 8

The hospital of St Bartholomew, Bristol, was founded c. 1231–4, probably for non-leprous infirm poor of both sexes, by Sir John de la Warre. His family seems to have originated in Bristol, perhaps as merchants, before acquiring land elsewhere and knightly status. The hospital, like so many others, lay outside its city in the suburbs near the River Frome, and was poorly endowed, resulting in a chequered history. A succession of male religious priors or masters up to the mid fourteenth century gave way to female prioresses between about 1340 and 1389. It is noteworthy that the authors of this volume see the period of female government as one of positive growth. Later, however, male authority was restored, and an attempt by the women to regain it in 1412 was firmly rebutted

by a local jury on the grounds that the hospital had ‘always been ruled by men’! In 1445 there was a refoundation for a fraternity of infirm mariners, who may have deserted the site by the end of the century, but there were still inmates *c.* 1532 when the de la Warre patron granted the site to Robert Thorne for his newly endowed Bristol Grammar School. This peaceful dissolution, just anticipating Henry VIII, allowed the surviving almsfolk to hold their lodgings until they died, and the hospital chapel remained in use for a time. The excavations of 1976–8, here meticulously recorded, help to flesh out the history of the institution beyond the limitations of the documentary sources. The hospital chapel and infirmary occupied a stone Norman building, which had apparently been the town house of the de la Warres before their interests moved from Bristol. Later structures on the site seem to have included a master’s lodging, dormitories for both men and women, kitchen, granary, bakehouse and latrines. Burials took place in both the chapel and an outdoor cemetery, and forty-four bodies have been identified: two children, two teenagers and the rest adults comprising both sexes more or less equally. The burials give the impression of a community consisting mainly of older men and women, who suffered from dental decay and degenerative diseases of the joints. As usual in such reports there is a detailed account of the locational context, the buildings and the finds (especially pottery and metal objects). The later use of the site as a grammar school is also covered. A final, wider-ranging section reviews current knowledge about all the medieval hospitals of Bristol, including their layout, constitutions, water supplies, sanitation, diet, medical care, maladministration and the impact of the Reformation. This usefully updates the accounts in the *Victoria County History of Gloucestershire*, and (like the work as a whole) provides a valuable and illuminating contribution to the history of the subject.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER

NICHOLAS ORME

*Le Codex B du Monastère Saint-Jean-Prodrôme (Serrès), A: XIIIe – XVe siècles; B: XVe – XIXe siècles.* By Lisa Bénou (A) and Paolo Odorico (B). (Textes, Documents, Études sur le monde Byzantin, Néohellénique et Balkanique, 2.) Pp. xii + 578, 288 incl. map. Paris: Association Pierre Belon, 1998. 2 910860 05 1

The recent history of Codex B has followed the fortunes of wars in the Balkans during the twentieth century. It is today kept in the Centre for Slavo-Byzantine Studies ‘Ivan Dujčev’ in Sofia. It was first studied by A. Guillou, L. Mavrommatis, L. Benou and P. Odorico and initially presented in the form of ‘Regestes’ (A. Guillou and others, *Byzantion* lxx [1995], 196–239). The work under view is a diplomatic edition of the same codex. Although useful, it suffers from hastiness and weak methodology. The first volume (Lisa Benou) contains no introduction at all. Issues such as geography, chronology, property relations, economic and political power, in spite of the fact that they are often mentioned in the documents, are ignored by the editor. There is no diplomatic analysis of the texts. By that I mean a brief text, which is neither translation nor summary of the documents contained in the codex, but a hybrid form in which the case narrated in the document is analysed, placed in time, associated with other documents and their scribes referred to in the text, and examined against other

preceding or subsequent documents – published or unpublished. Such analysis should also deal with the history of the place-names and with economic and social information given in the document. In contrast, what the editors of the volumes under review have done is produce a rather poor summary which gives only a rather crude outline of the documents. Finally, and perhaps more importantly, the editors have not tried to date those documents which are not dated in the text. The scribes of Codex B obviously had their reasons for choosing to follow a particular classification. Its editors, however, seem to assume that historians at the end of the twentieth century should for the same reasons follow the scribes' suggestions. It may be remembered that in the *Collection Archives de l' Athos* (Paris) dating was attempted first and then the original sequence of the documents was maintained; whereas in the case of the *Patmos Archives* (Athens), documents were classified and published by the editors as (a) imperial documents; (b) documents of functionaries; and (c) private records. Although other methods of rational classification undoubtedly exist, the simple presentation of documents as they appear in the codex is largely useless to the modern researcher. Finally, the index is unreliable, the researcher having to refer directly to the documents for names, titles or offices which have been omitted or wrongly listed. The second volume (Paolo Odorico) follows the same 'logic'. Unlike the first volume, it does include an historico-literary introduction which, however, raises questions that are not answered. The 'analysis' of documents is of a literary character, for example the deduction of missing words, a usual tactic for literary sources but rather dangerous for documents in which 'errors' are invaluable because they are not real 'errors'. As for the *longue durée* (p. 9), this is certainly not how Fernand Braudel conceived it. In conclusion, the editors of Codex B, have delivered to historians important, certainly, yet unprocessed material that still awaits its proper elaboration.

INSTITUTE OF BYZANTINE RESEARCH,  
NATIONAL SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH FOUNDATION,  
ATHENS

LENOS MAVROMMATIS

*Exordium magnum cisterciense. Sive narratio de initio cisterciensis ordinis.* Edited by Bruno Griesser. (Corpus Christianorum, Continuatio Mediaevalis, 138.) Pp. iv + 456. Turnhout: Brepols, 1997 (1994?). B.Fr. 7,500. 2 503 04381 X; 2 503 04382 8; 2 503 03000 0

Conrad of Eberbach, *Le Grand Exorde de Cîteaux ou Récit des débuts de l'ordre cistercien.* Translated by Anthelme Piébourg, introduction by Brian P. McGuire. (Commentarii cistercienses, Cîteaux, Studia et documenta, 7.) Pp. xxxv + 556 + 12 black-and-white and 5 colour plates. Turnhout: Brepols, 1998. B.Fr. 2,800. 2 503 50677 1

The edition of Conrad of Eberbach's *Exordium magnum* published in the *Corpus Christianorum* series in 1994 brings into wider circulation (and into the CD-ROM database of Latin texts of CETEDOC) the edition of Conrad made by Bruno Griesser and published in Rome in 1960; it is updated in that it incorporates corrections by Griesser. Griesser's 1960 edition was based on a group of thirteenth- and fourteenth-century manuscripts as described by him in the German introduction. It is vastly superior to that of the *Patrologia Latina* which

had not only omitted a number of chapters of Conrad's text, but did not note a major bifurcation in the early manuscript tradition centering on the treatment of Robert of Molesme in the first book of Conrad's text, which shows how much Conrad was part of the polemical Cistercian/Cluniac literature. In addition to incorporating Griesser's corrections, new pagination in the *Corpus Christianorum* edition has marginal references to Griesser's earlier pagination. The new version includes new indices (some apparently available on microfiche as well as in the database), but there is no attempt to update the apparatus from the 1960 edition. So in this sense the notes to the Latin edition of 1994 are sometimes inferior to those for the French translation (discussed below) of 1998.

Although Griesser discusses Conrad's sources in the introduction and occasionally in the notes, the discussion is perfunctory, often leaving mistaken impressions. For instance, he notes that Conrad incorporated large chunks of the earlier *Exordium parvum*, but it is not always clear at what point such sources end and Conrad's editorialising begins. While Griesser comments on Conrad's omission of an important chapter of the *Exordium parvum* (chapter vii in which Robert of Molesme is ordered back to Molesme by his bishop), the editor does not explicitly note other places at which Conrad has changed the meaning of the earlier text; for instance, there is no indication that Conrad has elided a letter found in *Exordium parvum* purporting to be from Pope Paschal II with a wholly different passage of the *Exordium parvum* describing early Cistercian practices. This is a common problem with regard to bk I in which Conrad often switches sources, as for instance when he incorporates bits of the *Vita prima* of Bernard of Clairvaux into the middle of a passage taken from the *Exordium parvum* – the latter a source which significantly never mentions Bernard of Clairvaux at all. There are places where it would have been appropriate to cite the *Exordium parvum* text in full for purposes of comparison. There are also places where a comparison with the *Exordium parvum* text would have brought into question the edition; for instance, whether the expansion of an abbreviation in a papal letter should be 'ergo' or 'igitur'. Such problems of comparison between editions of the two most often cited Cistercian foundation narratives brings us to the French edition of Conrad's text.

The daunting task of translating Conrad's *Exordium magnum* (from Griesser's edition) into French was undertaken by the late Anthelme Piébourg, nun at Boulaur in the Gers, an early twelfth-century foundation for religious women near Auch in south-western France which attached itself at that time to Fontévrault, but which is today a house of Cistercian nuns. In general, the translation is adequate, although perhaps gliding over some of the difficulties of the Latin; for instance in a story in which Stephen Harding sends a brother off to the market at Vézelay to bring back food, the number of horses is far from clear in the Latin text.

Instigated by Jean-François Holthof, the publication of the French edition was brought to completion by Jacques Berlioz who contributed much recent material to the notes of the French edition, making its critical apparatus superior to that of the new printing of Griesser's Latin edition. Thus, if one is really interested in knowing how much of the *Exordium parvum* has been incorporated by Conrad, one must compare word for word the *Corpus Christianorum* Latin edition with that of the *Exordium parvum* produced in *Les Plus Anciens Textes de Cîteaux: sources, textes, et*



*notes historiques*, edited by Jean de la Croix Bouton and Jean Baptiste Van Damme as vol. ii of *Cîteaux, commentarii cisterciensis: studia et documenta* (Achel, Abbaye Cistercienne 1974). But, one can most easily find the exact passages in *Les Plus Anciens Textes* by reference to the notes in *Le Grand Exorde de Cîteaux*. Thus, it is necessary to consult the two volumes reviewed here in concert. In terms of quickly searching out people, places or topics, moreover, the indices of the French edition are also more useful. In addition to notes and indices, the French edition has incorporated a shell of commentary and other material. First is an introduction by Brian Patrick McGuire who brings an extensive knowledge of the twelfth-century narratives on which Conrad drew, placing Conrad's account into the wider history of the Church. Topics treated within the text are examined in a series of articles on penitence and confession (Jacques Berlioz), the notion of merit (P. Y. Emery), meditation (Claude Carozzi) and the afterlife (M.-G. Dubois). The diverse audience intended is indicated by the inclusion of a series of plates incorporated into the centre of the volume (four of them in colour) which illustrate Cistercian art, architecture and sites. These photos, in addition to a glossary of monastic terms, an account of life in Cistercian communities and a very brief summary of the sources on which Conrad drew, all compiled by Placid Vernet, suggest the diverse audience for which this work is intended.

There is much more work to be done on the *Exordium magnum*, on both its sources and its impact. In support of that work, the two volumes discussed, and the possibility of word searches on databases provided by the *Corpus Christianorum* series will be invaluable. Although the discussion in Vernet's account of sources of the *Exordium parvum* and *Exordium cistercii* as earlier sources for Conrad's work is mistaken in its assumptions about the dating of the Trent 1711 manuscript and that the *Exordium Cistercii* is a summary of an earlier, now lost work, those errors suggest the significance of this work. Both turn on the idea that the Cistercian Order was invented before 1119 (a notion with which I take issue in my forthcoming book, *The Cistercian evolution* (Philadelphia, 1999). That the precocity of the invention of the order is a Cistercian myth, but one that we have thought to be true since the thirteenth century, however, is primarily a result of the wide influence of the *Exordium magnum* of Conrad of Eberbach. It quickly entered the literature of monastic history to provide the standard accounts of not only the twelfth-century Cistercians, but the twelfth-century Cluniacs as well. Many of its stories are very familiar to modern readers because they have been incorporated wholesale into most monastic history. The *Exordium magnum* is a text which will now be more accessible to those who can read only French or only Latin; it should be read alongside the accounts of Caesarius of Heisterbach and Jacques de Vitry; comparison of passages between the two editions is a fruitful exercise.

UNIVERSITY OF IOWA

CONSTANCE H. BERMAN

*Handling sin. Confession in the Middle Ages*. Edited by Peter Biller and A. J. Minnis. (York Studies in Medieval Theology, 2.) Pp. x + 209. York: York Medieval Press, 1998. £35. 0 95297 3413; 1366 9656

The papers that comprise this book originated in a 1996 conference on 'Confession in Medieval Culture and Society' at the Centre for Medieval Studies

at the University of York. Six chapters began as papers presented at the conference; to these the editors have added a further study by Rob Meens on 'The frequency and nature of early medieval penance', an edition by Michael Haren of selected passages from the fourteenth-century *Memoriale presbiterorum* and John Baldwin's 'Quodlibet lecture' on medieval theology at York.

Rob Meens's chapter is the only one in the volume that centres on the administration of penance in the period prior to 1215. In it he argues that confession was often a communal act during the early Middle Ages and that ordinary Christians routinely confessed their sins on several occasions during the liturgical year. Alexander Murray's paper on counselling in medieval confessional practice makes the important point that the confessors' manuals on which scholars habitually rely for information about penitential practices almost certainly present only a small part of the interaction between confessor and penitent, while Jacqueline Murray investigates the different approaches that confessors adopted toward sins perpetrated by men and those that women committed. Lesley Smith's study of William of Auvergne's treatment of the sacrament of penance analyses William's two short treatises on this subject and points out that they were closely connected with practice: William regularly heard confessions, including those of Blanche of Castile, which must have been an awesome experience. Michael Haren's two contributions to this volume both centre on the *Memoriale presbiterorum*, an English pastoral manual whose author, Haren believes, was Master William Doune (d. 1361). His first paper examines the *Memoriale* as an instrument of social discipline, while his second paper presents an edition of the questions that the author of the *Memoriale* advised confessors to address to various classes of people, including judges, lawyers, knights, merchants, servants, sailors, children and others. The avoidance of offspring and the treatment of this topic in confessors' manuals furnishes the theme for Peter Biller's contribution to this volume. Biller takes issue with John Noonan's magisterial treatment of the subject on three points: he argues that Noonan focused too heavily on the notion that opposition to contraception was largely connected with the Catharist heresy, that he paid too little attention to the issue of abortion, and that he relied more on the learned doctrines of theologians and jurists, than on the teachings that ordinary Christians received. Finally John Baldwin investigates the connection between the discrediting of the judicial ordeal and the new emphasis on confession and interior penance that appears in the early thirteenth century. Scholars interested in medieval religious and spiritual life, especially among the laity, will find this volume uncommonly useful and stimulating.

UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS

JAMES A. BRUNDAGE

*The arguments for the immortality of the soul in the first half of the thirteenth century.* By J. Obi Oguejiofor. (Recherches de Théologie Ancienne et Médiévale. Supplementa, 5.) Pp. xiii + 425. Louvain: Peeters, 1995. B.Fr. 2,400. 90 683 1 759 8

As J. Obi Oguejiofor observes, although many theologians and philosophers of the period 1200–50 were especially concerned to argue for the immortality of the

soul, these arguments have not been carefully studied by modern historians. Most of the second half of Oguejiofor's book is devoted to filling the gap. He gives detailed, precise accounts of the positions and reasoning of John Blund, Alexander Nequam, Philip the Chancellor, William of Auvergne, Alexander of Hales, John of La Rochelle, Odo Rigaud and Albert the Great, keeping close to their own terms. These analyses, although unambitious, are certainly valuable, and the very considerable worth of this part of the book is not too much undermined by the extraordinarily low standard of proof-reading, mistakes in spelling and English usage, and an index where almost all the page numbers are wrong. Unfortunately, the first half of the study, though carefully composed, is less useful. It sets out the background to the detailed studies in the second half by tracing arguments for the immortality of the soul from Plato, through Aristotle, Alexander of Aphrodisias, Plotinus, Augustine and Avicenna, to the Latin thinkers of the twelfth century. Oguejiofor has certainly been diligent in reading the primary and secondary sources in this large area, but his ponderous survey gives no new insights about these earlier thinkers. Perhaps, though, that is not its aim. One of Oguejiofor's most interesting contentions is that the question of immortality was 'not only a preoccupation' in the early thirteenth century, but 'a significantly new preoccupation'. The first half of the book could be seen as an attempt to explain why this problem began to preoccupy medieval thinkers from c. 1200 onwards, when it had not done so earlier. The answer it gives, however, is very unsatisfactory. Oguejiofor claims that, before the thirteenth century, medieval thought was so dominated by theology that little need was felt to devise arguments for positions, such as the immortality of the soul, which are clearly part of Christian doctrine. Modern research on twelfth-century thinkers such as Peter Abelard, William of Conches and Gilbert of Poitiers shows that this view – often held by an earlier generation of neo-Thomist historians of philosophy – cannot be sustained. A far more plausible reason why early thirteenth-century thinkers became worried about the immortality of the soul is the extreme difficulty – played down by Oguejiofor – of reconciling Aristotle's newly available *De anima* with the doctrine of immortality. Had Oguejiofor devoted more attention to placing this theory of the soul as form of the body within Aristotle's wider metaphysics of form and matter, he might have been better able to bring out and develop this point. Earlier scholars may have been unwarranted in their neglect of early thirteenth-century arguments for the immortality of the soul, but perhaps they were wise not to have treated them as if they formed a discrete topic.

TRINITY COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JOHN MARENBN

*John Duns Scotus (1265/6–1308). Renewal of philosophy. Acts of the third symposium organised by the Dutch Society for Medieval Philosophy Medium Aevum (May 23 and 24, 1996).* Edited by E. P. Bos. (Elementa. Schriften zur Philosophie und ihrer Problemgeschichte, 72.) Pp. xiv + 237. Amsterdam–Atlanta, GA: Rodopi, 1998. Nlg 80 (paper). 90 420 0081 3

This book contains the acts of the third symposium organised by the Dutch Society for Medieval Philosophy, held in Leiden and Utrecht in 1996. As the

critical edition of the works of Duns Scotus proceeds on its stately course, interest in his philosophy has grown not only among medievalists, but also among systematic philosophers who have noticed an affinity between his thinking and some currents in contemporary fashion. Scotus did indeed bring about what L. Honnefelder, in a phrase echoed in this volume's subtitle, called 'the second beginning of metaphysics'. When he gave his Oxford lectures it was only a few years since Thomas Aquinas died; but the difference in philosophy between the two thinkers is enormous – far greater than that, say, between Plato and Aristotle. Whether Scotus' philosophical innovations were a great advance or a great mistake is, of course, a matter of controversy; but whichever side you take in that debate, this book will have much to tell you about the contrast between the two metaphysical systems. Three of the fourteen papers here collected deal with topics which have been the staple of treatments of Scotus in traditional manuals of philosophy: the nature of the transcendentals, the relation between Being and beings, the different conceptions of the categories. Most of the papers, however, are devoted to questions of modality: the radical importance of contingency in Scotus' metaphysics, and the relationship of this system to the necessitarianism of Aristotle and to modern logics of possible worlds. Naturally, several papers treat of the way in which the primacy of contingency affects Scotus' account of the will, both human and divine. It is noteworthy that with the exception of an invited guest, W. Kluxen of Bonn, all the contributors to this rich collection of essays are engaged in philosophical teaching or research in Dutch universities. The book is testimony not only to the resurgent influence of Scotus but also to the remarkable flowering of medieval studies in the Netherlands in recent years.

RHODES HOUSE,  
OXFORD

ANTHONY KENNY

*Clement V*. By Sophia Menache. (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought. 4th ser., 36.) Pp. xiv + 351 inc. 4 maps. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £45. 0 521 59219 4

The appearance of a book in English on an Avignon pope is always welcome. *Clement V* is, necessarily, a wide-ranging study: the seven chapters, including one covering Bertrand de Got's early career, personality and election, examine curial policy and relations with France and England, crusading enterprises, political relations with Italy, France and England, and the Council of Vienne and the *Clementines*. There are many good things in it, and interesting observations are made (some of them in the footnotes). Its strength lies in its meticulous examination of papal and royal documents and of narrative sources, and in the sections on 'Crusade and Mission' and the trial of the Templars. But sometimes detailed narrative is achieved at the expense of historical analysis and an appreciation of the theory of papal monarchy. The final chapter, for example, which should have drawn conclusions, instead summarises decretals in the *Clementines*, something better suited to an appendix. Moreover, a historian of the medieval papacy who writes in terms of the 'the Church of England' and the

'Roman Catholic Church' must invite accusations of anachronism. One of Sophia Menache's aims is to show how Clement tackled the problem of the emerging national sovereign rulers, gaining their favour and maintaining peace by making concessions, especially to the kings of France and England. She does not, however, examine the other side of the problem, the decrease in the universal authority of the emperor (when there was one), nor the full significance of Clement's decree *Pastoralis cura* (1313). This gave legal expression to the idea of national territorial sovereignty and denied the universality of imperial rule, thus making the emperor into just another national king. It destroyed one of the fundamental tenets of papal theory, that the universal Empire was merely the secular aspect of the universal Church, and that the emperor existed to act as the pope's obedient son and to fight his physical battles for him. Another aim is to show that Clement was not subservient to the French king, Philip the Fair – virtually impossible in view of both the composition of the Sacred College and the affair of the Templars. His one real show of independence was the approval of Henry VII of Luxemburg as emperor in preference to Charles of Valois, Philip's brother. More might have been made of this, and some discussion of the theory attempted (what, for example, was the 'king of the Romans', or the significance of the coronation with the iron crown at Milan?). A third aim is to show that Clement did not inaugurate the 'Babylonian captivity' of the papacy. Nevertheless, many of the traits which characterised the later Avignon popes were foreshadowed during Clement's pontificate – passionate professions of intent to launch a crusade to the Holy Land, subservience to French interests, increasing use of provisions and taxation, nepotism, extravagant, and predominantly French, cardinals, even patronage of arts and learning. It cannot be said that the book wholly succeeds in its aims, nor is its written style particularly engaging.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

DIANA WOOD

*Urban V (1362–1370). Kirchenreform zwischen Kardinalkollegium, Kurie und Klientel.* By Ludwig Vones. (Päpste und Papsttum, 28.) Pp. xii + 719. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 1998. DM 340. 3 7772 9826 3

This enormous blockbuster began as a *Habilitationschrift* for the University of Cologne. It sticks very carefully to reform; other aspects are discussed, but are not central nor considered in detail. It therefore begins by considering the cult of Urban, his reputation as a saintly reformer and what 'reform' implied in 1362. Discussion covers various reform/spiritual movements and prophetic ideals which probably influenced him. That he was a Benedictine abbot but never a cardinal nor a career-member of the Curia is stressed.

A very significant section discusses the Grimoard family and its ramifications (genealogical trees at pp. 546–7). Guillaume I Grimoard of Gévaudan had three sons, the eldest Guillaume II. Guillaume II acquired the family seat at Grisac, where Urban V was born in 1309, and was responsible for the family's future material prosperity. He died aged nearly 100 in 1366. With him died the male line. The two remaining sons were clerics; Étienne, the third, had died without

living heir. Urban v therefore settled the family property on Raymond, son of his sister Delphine, with the proviso that the family took the name and arms of Grimoard and that if Raymond died before Urban without male heir the property reverted to Urban. Raymond outlived the pope but died without direct heirs. He left the inheritance to a niece's family, the Senhorets, again with the proviso of taking the family name and arms and with as executor Cardinal Anglic, Urban's brother. The Senhorets carried the Grimoards into the future and Vones traces the line. This part has a section on Urban's career before his election. This impressive prosopographical study is firmly based on earlier printed work and many local archives. The result reveals wide-reaching papal kin.

The second part discusses the conclave, including the power-blocs in place. Elie Talleyrand opposed Guy de Boulogne, both wishing to be pope. A further important figure was Hugues Roger (brother of Clement vi), centre of a 'Roger' group of five papal cardinal nephews. Another constellation centred on Audoin Aubert, nephew of Innocent vi. Vones discusses the voting and concludes that because these factions could not agree they decided on the Benedictine abbot of St Victor in Marseilles, Urban, not a cardinal but known as an academic and sent by the papacy to Naples.

At page 200 we reach the pontificate. Urban had no power-base in the Curia nor the sacred college and the rest of the work reveals the result. Vones shows him following his own line, though taking his family into account. The creation of new cardinals, all discussed here, reveals this. Most important was Anglic his brother, upon whom he relied totally and whom he also made bishop of Avignon. Probably only in his third creation (of 1368) did he truly introduce his 'own' party, replacing three dead cardinals with eight new ones. They included Simon Langham, whose appointment and that of Jean de Dormans, former chancellor of France and probably the most important person in the French court, provided links to the kings of France and England. The qualifications and affiliations of the cardinals show that appointments were seldom solely political. Urban made only three cardinals from his own area or from his kin: Anglic Grimoard, Pierre d'Estaing and d'Aigrefeuille, but the last two had other important qualities. Out of four creations he only slightly honoured his own order, though his three Benedictines were more than usual. The best qualification for a cardinal seems to have been that the man's career should already have revealed determination to reform the Church by fairly conservative, orthodox means.

Urban's policy towards the supplications by cardinals shows that, though the pope did not scrutinise all these himself, the number of restrictive replies was very high. Papal reservation policy was developed also. Urban's determination to limit plurality showed when he often insisted that, if a benefice involved cure of souls, residence must be fulfilled. He treated his own familiars traditionally, letting them have many privileges, but the conditions became stricter. *Rotuli* from the cardinals continued to be accepted but the modifications increased; more often familiars of cardinals were given benefices in their home areas.

A study of personnel shows how closely Urban relied on a small network of collaborators, often brought with him from his earlier career or from his home area. The familiars of his brother Anglic were equally important for carrying out papal policy, especially in the city and bishopric of Avignon. In preparation for

the return of the papacy to Rome Vones describes an enormous work of registration, including tax lists, inventories of treasure and possessions, lists of the members of the Curia and inventories of the archives and library. Some of those closest to the pope had posts only in the 'second' rank and his ability to change the curial bureaucracy was limited; much of what he could do had to depend on changing the chancery rules.

Urban's reforming ideals appear in his attitude to religious orders. He made himself abbot of several convents, in order to introduce a subordinate to carry through reform. The aim was local, not global, the basic intention spiritual renewal. He distrusted cardinals as priors (the house would almost certainly be neglected), obliging them to exchange priories for sinecures. He encouraged monastic study, both in the local house and by setting up *studia*. There is an account of his work for Montecassino, where he also, characteristically, tried to restore its financial health. The final section discusses the pope's encouragement of clerical education, the building of libraries (with books from *spolia* for this), the encouragement of university scholars and the attack on learned heresy.

Urban was an old-fashioned reformer, with backward-looking ideals, essentially a Benedictine abbot relying on spiritual renewal, obedience and personal reform, rather than on global plans and broad schemes.

This interesting, good book contains a wealth of solid research (the bibliography more than 100 pages), full of well-based conclusions. My only reservation is its very solidity. Who, except a rare specialist, will plough through it? Who reads footnotes covering almost a page? Do even specialists need quite this detail? Perhaps the question simply reveals the lighter-weight Englishness of the reviewer.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

MARGARET HARVEY

*The magnificent ride. The first Reformation in Hussite Bohemia.* By Thomas A. Fudge.

(St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. ix + 315 incl. 5 figs and 18 plates. Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998. £49.95. 1 85928 372 1

The key to this book is not in the main title, which hints at a military history of the Hussite movement, but in the subtitle. Other historians have approached the Hussites as an early example of major social upheaval or of national mobilisation, but Fudge's principal concern is to locate the movement within a tradition of religious reform and renewal, as western Europe's 'first Reformation' (or, seemingly more tentatively, 'reformation': both forms are used). The book has a dual character, combining a broad history of Hussitism from its origins to 1437 (the first two of the book's four main chapters) with a much more specialised study of Hussite iconography, propaganda and popular culture. Of these two projects, the second is by far the more successfully accomplished. Fudge's book is Hussite history in more ways than one. Its author marches in spirit with Žižka's brethren, and the whole work reads like a kind of extended Taborite manifesto. That is not wholly a weakness, given that understanding the languages of radical Hussitism from within is central to his purpose. His chapters on Hussite images and songs, and on the cult of 'St' Jan Hus, offer much that is interesting,

important and, at least to non-Czech readers, new. They are rooted in formidable research – although primary sources, including the unfamiliar visual material, should have been more fully and clearly referenced. Problems arise, however, when Fudge attempts to make the complex, fractured and multiple histories of the Hussites fit within an explanatory framework built from their (and his own) reforming polemic. Political, social and economic factors get short shrift, and Fudge is only really engaged by those aspects of Hussitism which enable him to pit ‘the Czech reform movement’ against a two-dimensionally corrupt and reactionary ‘official church’, or (a favourite shorthand) ‘Rome’. The result is an unbalanced and distorted account of the Hussite era. Although Fudge registers the deep social and religious fissures within Hussitism, he does not give them nearly enough weight: the radicals are made the bearers of the movement’s soul (or, as Fudge would have it, its ‘myth’); the Bohemian nobility largely disappears from view; and a mantle of ideal religious purpose is cast over the various factions, rendering the Utraquist victory over the radicals at Lipany in 1434 not merely ‘disastrous’ but ‘fratricidal’ (p. 176). Retrospective Czech nationalism casts its shadow too, conflating ‘Bohemian’, ‘Czech’ and ‘Hussite’ into a single progressive element, in a drastic ethnic simplification of the Bohemian reform tradition. Even the Bohemian ‘nation’ at the University of Prague becomes, misleadingly, a ‘Czech nation’ (p. 69). Most alarmingly, Fudge celebrates Hussitism’s contribution to the early history of European ethnic cleansing, counting among the era’s ‘gains’, ‘the expulsion of dominant foreign [i.e. German] influence’ from Bohemian life (p. 276). Fudge does not write elegantly, or even always clearly, and the publisher has done him and his readers no favours in allowing the manuscript to proceed to press in its present condition. There is much of value in this book, but it is not what it appears to be, and it needs handling with great care. It offers no challenge to Kaminsky’s monumental, thirty-two-year-old study as the standard English-language account.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

LEN SCALES

*Vested angels. Eucharistic allusions in early Netherlandish paintings.* By Maurice McNamee SJ (Liturgia Condenda, 6.) Pp. xiii + 385 incl. 114 black-and-white and 6 colour plates. Louvain: Peeters, 1998. B.Fr. 1,470 (paper). 90 429 0007 5

Maurice B. McNamee aims at a two-staged interpretation of late medieval Netherlandish religious art: he emphasises the presence of ‘vested angels’ – angels garbed as priests and presented with various liturgical objects – in the best known works of that period, and presents these figures as bearers of clear eucharistic meaning. McNamee argues that ‘The Byzantine iconographic tradition has particular relevance to this study because...it was the most important source of the vested angel as a eucharistic symbol in Early Netherlandish painting’ (p. 4). He also highlights the importance of acting, moving, speaking angels in the religious drama of the later Middle Ages, be it in the liturgically grounded *Quem quaeritis* Easter plays tradition (in which Christ sometimes appeared vested in a chasuble), or the vernacular plays in which they



witness, announce and assist at crucial moments in the history of salvation ('they actually were transferred into the visual arts after enjoying a long career in medieval, Latin, liturgical drama', p. 53). Works such as the Portinari altarpiece, the Communion of the Apostles by Joos van Ghent, Rogier van der Weyden's Last Judgement and the Ghent Altarpiece are analysed through the presence of vested angels, and the iconographic schemes of the Annunciation, Christ's Nativity, Baptism and Epiphany, as well as the Last Judgement, are similarly made to reveal less than obvious eucharistic overtones. Attended by angels the Christ of the Netherlandish painters is made into a priest, a celebrant. And the overwhelming and ubiquitous sacerdotal function of Christ, even in his infancy, is presented by McNamee as a wondrous thing, as is the religious content of the paintings, shown to be the result of the artists' willingness to incorporate religious dogma into their works. The book concludes with two appendices; Appendix A is a useful description of vestments, the apparel of the vested angels and other figures to which they relate.

PEMBROKE COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

MIRI RUBIN

*Florence and its university during the early Renaissance.* By Jonathan Davies. (Education and Society in the Middle Ages and Renaissance, 8.) Pp. xi + 232. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 1998. Nlg 138. 90 04 11003 8; 0926 6070

This book is a meticulous study that makes a substantial contribution to our knowledge and understanding of the University of Florence and Florentine society between 1385 and 1473. There is here much new material relating to the internal administrative mechanisms of the university and to the careers of administrators, teaching staff and students. Of particular value are the payments of salaries to teachers and the records of the doctorates awarded. Throughout, the evidence is analysed in a rigorous and critical manner and, where relevant, illuminating statistical data are provided. There are five valuable appendices which include lists of the known administrators, doctorands and members of the colleges of doctors at the university between 1385 and 1473, as well as the known payments made to teachers at the *Studio fiorentino* between 1450 and 1473. The dimensions of the appendices, constituting as they do just under half of the size of the main text, may at first sight seem to be excessive. Their length is in fact fully justified because the information contained therein, which is appropriately discussed in the text, furnishes very important primary material for historians of Italian and other groups of universities. Jonathan Davies has effectively shown the extent to which the University of Florence was closely interwoven with the social and political fabric of Florentine life, cemented by the fact that a significant number of high status Florentines served as administrators of the university. This phenomenon reached its climax in the 1470s when Lorenzo de' Medici 'transformed the *Studio* into a political powerbase within the Florentine Republic' (p. 90). The university also served as an important centre of learning for members of elevated Florentine families who aspired to senior ecclesiastical positions. It is interesting that Davies concludes that the powers of the student

rectors at Florence in the late fourteenth and fifteenth centuries were more than nominal, a salutary response to those historians who too easily dismiss the tenacious nature of student controls in the universities of southern Europe. The author raises the matter of academic corruption at the University of Florence and shows convincingly that some doctorates were awarded without due process of examination. Indeed, one doctorate was awarded to a candidate only ten years old. The issue of academic corruption, which has been detected at Bologna in the thirteenth century and was a matter of contemporary criticism, is an important subject for further research. In sum, this book is a significant addition to the field of university history. The quality of the analysis, the breadth of the issues it covers and the professionalism of the presentation indicate that this is a monograph that historians of universities cannot afford to overlook.

UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL

ALAN B. COBBAN

*Clerical discourse and lay audience in late medieval England.* By Fiona Somerset. (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature, 37.) Pp. ix + 243. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £40. 0 521 62154 2

The years between 1370 and 1420 mark a pivotal moment in English cultural life, when a crisis in the clerical establishment coincided with the emergence of a vigorous vernacular literature. In seeking to understand this confrontation, scholars have tended to focus upon Wycliffite and Lollard texts, their production, publication and reception. In this study, Fiona Somerset identifies another corpus of texts that emerged in this period which were not openly heretical but which contested clerical authority in similarly controversial ways. These were texts which aimed to translate and transmit clerical knowledge (and knowledge about the clergy) to a wider, and essentially lay audience. Their defining characteristic was the 'extra-clerical' position they adopted in relation to their clerical subject matter, developing an authorial voice or voices which appeared to come from and were addressed to those outside the clerical community, but which at the same time employed, often very skilfully, the very terminologies, techniques and themes which belonged to that community. Somerset develops her argument through an analysis of five particular texts or groups of texts in this mould, including *Piers Plowman*, the translations of John Trevisa, Roger Dymmok's *Liber contra errores Lollardorum* and its source-text, the Upland Cycle and William Thorpe's *Testimony*. Drawing on recent reassessments of the manuscript evidence as well her own close textual analysis, she examines the form, function and impact of this 'extra-clerical' discourse.

Recent scholarship has tended to fragment *Piers Plowman*. Somerset challenges this, offering a reading of the whole text as an 'extra-clerical' discussion of the dissemination of 'clergie' and its dangers, which develops through the dreamer's successive encounters with Ymaginatif, Anima and other figures and which becomes increasingly focused with each redaction. Somerset's analysis of Trevisa's work incorporates not only the well-known translations of the *Polychronicon* and *De proprietatibus rerum*, but also his less familiar renderings of Fitzralph's *De pauperie*, Giles of Rome and the *Ps. Ockham*, *Dialogus inter militem et clericum*. These

texts transmitted the kind of clerical knowledge that in the 1380s and 90s could have proved explosive in the hands of a wider audience, and in the *Dialogus Trevisa* appears to be drawn towards the transformative possibilities of publication. However, Somerset argues that in fact Trevisa projected a narrower audience centred on the nobles in the circle of his own patron, Thomas, Lord Berkeley. In this context she suggests his translations offered counsel to those who in turn aimed to counsel (or at least influence) Richard II. The problems of publishing clerical knowledge are also the key to understanding Roger Dymmock's response to the Lollard *Twelve conclusions*. Somerset suggests that Dymmock's primary aim is to contest the 'extra-clerical' position adopted by the authors of the *Conclusions*. Dymmock argues that the substance of the *Conclusions* belongs to the clergy and that for those outside the clergy to possess it is to usurp the status of public persons that is exclusively that of the clergy, schoolmen and the higher nobility. Somerset similarly reinterprets the Upland Cycle as an 'extra-clerical' text. Suggesting a substantially earlier date for its composition, she argues that the cycle is best understood against the background of public, scholarly and political debates over the limits of royal authority and the nature of secular and spiritual dominion between the Peasants' Revolt and the death of Henry IV. Finally, Somerset examines Thorpe's *Testimony*, suggesting that although Thorpe projects for himself a position beyond the clergy, throughout the text he employs terms and techniques redolent of the Oxford schools and certainly from the very heart of the clerical establishment. In doing so, she suggests, Thorpe formulates what might be described as an alternative, Wycliffite 'clergie'.

Somerset's analysis of these texts is penetrating and, largely, persuasive. She offers new insights into some very familiar texts and breaks new grounds with those, such as Dymmock's *Liber contra errores*, which deserve to be better known. Her arguments might be further strengthened by a more detailed investigation of the intellectual landscape of the Oxford schools, the methods and preoccupations of which underpin all of these texts. It would also be worthwhile to continue her exploration of the 'extra-clerical' in Dymmock, with some of the more influential Latin writers of the period, such as Thomas Walsingham and William Woodford, who at present feature only marginally. None the less, as with recent work by Steven Justice and Paul Strohm, Somerset successfully demonstrates that even after decades of scholarship, the literature of this revolutionary period – both Latin and vernacular – will still repay further study.

BRASENOSE COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

JAMES G. CLARK

*Nachbarschaft, Pfarrei und Gemeinde in Graubünden 1400–1600.* By Immacolata Saulle Hippenmeyer. (Quellen und Forschungen zur Bündner Geschichte, 7.) Pp. ix + 366 incl. 6 tables. Chur: Bündner Monatsblatt/Desertina, 1997. DM 49.50. 3 905 241 73 0

Hippenmeyer's study, which is accompanied in the same series by a matching volume of documents coedited with Ursus Brunold, examines local church

institutions in the Grisons both before and after the Reformation. The exceptional autonomy enjoyed by local communities in this region allowed them to gain substantial control over parish churches and chapels even before the Reformation. As Hippenmeyer shows, creating endowments for clerical services was a favoured tactic. Carefully negotiating canon law guidelines, some communes used their funds to pay for altars, masses or even the salaries of local clergy. In such cases the community often gained the right of presentation to the position involved. Other villages gathered endowments in order to pursue dismembration from parish centres outside the local settlement, often building or upgrading their churches at the same time. The late Middle Ages in the Grisons consequently saw a burst of parish formation that resulted from lay initiatives: by 1520 over a quarter of the parish priests and a larger proportion of chaplains were presented by local communities. The Reformation, while divisive doctrinally, accelerated the tendency to local control among both Catholic and Reformed villages. The Ilanz Articles of 1526 allowed each village to choose between the Catholic and Reformed Churches by mandating local appointment and dismissal of clergy and by prohibiting appeals to ecclesiastical courts. Hippenmeyer documents the slow pace of conversions to Protestantism after 1526, with splendid detail concerning local majority decisions. Secular courts also began dividing parishes and appropriating church property. By mid century, the Grisons possessed many small poor parishes of both confessions, which were often unable to retain a qualified clergyman. Confessional tension slowly replaced easy coexistence and blurred boundaries after 1560, though the autonomy of village communities in religious affairs continued well into the seventeenth century. Working with intractable and scattered sources, Hippenmeyer's meticulously researched book lends support to Peter Blickle's theses about a 'communal Reformation' in this region, while also providing a vivid if narrow glimpse into the religious life of the central alpine region before and after the Reformation.

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA,  
RIVERSIDE

RANDOLPH C. HEAD

*The earlier version of the Wycliffite Bible, VIII: The Epistles etc. edited from MS Christ Church 145.* By Conrad Lindberg. (Stockholm Studies in English 87.) Pp. 376. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1997. 91 22 01745 3

The present volume completes Lindberg's edition of the 'earlier version' of the Wycliffite Bible; it also forms part of an ever-expanding, lifelong project. Begun some forty years ago, this project originally aimed to resolve arguments that had grown up around ms Bodley 959, thought to be the translator's original by the Wycliffite Bible's nineteenth-century editors but merely scribal by Sven L. Fristedt in 1953. Lindberg accordingly provided a close reproduction of this manuscript, arguing that, while indeed scribal, it remains close enough to the original to contain translator's alterations. But he did not abandon the project when, some ten years later, he reached Baruch 3.20, where Bodley 959 abruptly breaks off. Instead, he turned it into an edition of the whole 'earlier version' looking to ms Christ Church 145 for the rest of his text. Moreover, it does not seem

that he will abandon his project with the completion of this edition. For, as indicated by the present volume's many references to the 'later version' of the Wycliffite Bible, he has been working with an eye to the edition recording all the major variants of both the 'earlier' and the 'later versions' that he has been experimenting with since 1978. It is a part of his project that even he will surely never complete.

Lindberg has increasingly isolated himself from recent scholarly conversations about the Wycliffites. But over the years he has reliably provided us with a vast amount of textual and linguistic information. For this he deserves our admiration and thanks.

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

CHRISTINA VON NOLCKEN

*Registres de sentences de l'officialité de Cambrai (1438–1453)*. (Recueil de l'ancienne jurisprudence de la Belgique, Septième Série.) Edited by Cyriel Vleeschouwers and Monique Van Melkebeek. Pp. xvii + 545 incl. map; 546–996. Brussels: Ministère de la Justice, 1998.

A handy map (p. xvii) shows how the diocese of Cambrai cut across secular boundaries in the fifteenth century. It included not only the county of Hainault and the Cambrésis (where the bishop was also secular ruler), but also a large part of the duchy of Brabant, and a small part of the county of Flanders. In 1424 the bishop split the diocese into two for judicial purposes. One Official in Brussels judged cases from the archdeaconries of Antwerp, Brussels and Brabant, and another in Cambrai gave sentence for cases from the archdeaconries of Hainault, Valenciennes and Cambrai itself. In 1982 the editors produced two volumes covering the surviving fifteenth-century act books of the Official of Brussels. They have now done the same for the Official of Cambrai. The discontinuous series of seven annual registers, and a fragment, from the period between 1438 and 1453 (150 folios altogether), are all that survive before 1543. The editors provide an introduction which, besides giving details of the manuscripts, includes a prosopography of the officers of the court. They have found out a reasonable amount about the lawyers whom the bishops appointed as their Officials, but rather less about the prosecutors of office cases, and the other offices of the court. What they did not attempt to do was to make any analysis of the nature of the 1455 cases which they print. However, as well as an ordinary index of names and places, they have also provided extraordinarily exhaustive indices of Latin words and of the subject matter of the cases, which make it possible for readers to find their own way about the cases very easily. What is clear is that this was predominantly a 'bawdy' court, with the overwhelming number of office cases devoted to seduction, fornication, adultery, incest, bigamy and marriage despite known impediments. Cases of clerical concubinage, brothel-haunting clergy, and those engaging in the multiple seduction of married parishioners or of nuns, add to the *News of the World* atmosphere of the proceedings. Many of the instance cases were of the same sort, with parties asking to have their promises of marriage annulled, or asking for judicial separation from errant spouses. After so much business of that type it is a relief to come across the occasional presentations of

clergy for unlicensed absence from benefices, or for playing at bowls or dice for money, or of laymen for assault on and imprisonment of clergy, and for theft of the Easter collection from a church, besides a number of disputes over rights of presentation. Unlike English church courts, in which testamentary cases frequently rivalled sexual cases in number, this court had only half a dozen will cases amongst over 1,400, and these involved clergy. It is a useful addition to the limited corpus of published ecclesiastical court material from the fifteenth century.

QUEENS' COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

PETER SPUFFORD

*Life, death and art. The medieval stained glass of Fairford parish church. A multimedia exploration.* Edited by Sarah Brown and Lindsay MacDonald, foreword Joanna Trollope. Pp. xvi + 175 incl. 74 black-and-white plates + 36 colour plates + CD ROM. Stroud: Sutton Publishing/Cheltenham & Gloucester College of Higher Education, 1997. £40. 0 7509 1523 4

Tell me, you anti-saints, why brass  
With you is shorter lived than glass?  
And why the saints have scap't their falls  
Better from windows than from walles?  
    ...then, Faireford, boast  
Thy church hath kept what all have lost;  
And is preserved from the bane  
Of either warr, or puritane

The seventeenth-century poem 'Upon Fairford Windows' by Richard Corbet opens a long and sometimes distinguished tradition of writing on the magnificent early sixteenth-century stained glass windows of Fairford parish church. The most recent book was Dr Hilary Wayment's, published in 1984, on which the present work, comprising seven chapters (and five appendices) by six different contributors, draws heavily. Major new contributions are the excellent colour photographs taken by Peter Goodrum and Barley Studio during the ongoing conservation campaign (seventeen windows of the total of twenty-eight had been conserved between 1988 and 1997), a chapter on the conservation and restoration of the glass by Keith Barley whose studio has been responsible for its modern conservation, and a CD-ROM accompanying the book which includes, *inter alia*, a full database of colour images of all twenty-eight windows, video clips of their restoration and an interview with Hilary Wayment. (The CD-ROM really deserves a review of its own: it is well designed and an excellent advertisement for scholarly use of the medium but it often overlaps rather than supplements information in the book and brings some problems of its own. Still, its inclusion makes the book a bargain at £40.)

Colin Platt's opening chapter discusses the context of the rebuilding of Fairford church. His characteristically succinct survey precedes Sally Annesley's study of John and Edmund Thame – who were between them probably responsible for

the rebuilding and glazing of the church – and of the Cotswolds wool and cloth trade which provided their wealth. Anna Eavis next provides a thorough analysis of the architecture of the church, full of interesting observations. Sarah Brown's chapters on the windows (ch. iv) and on the stained-glass artists and their craft between about 1480 and 1530 (ch. vi) are the heart of the book and give a judicious summary of the church's unique stained-glass programme. Brown demonstrates how the windows' subject matter reflects their physical position in the 'geography' of the religious interior (p. 50) and highlights the sources of many compositions. Her second chapter provides a useful overview of the visual arts in England at the turn of the century and on pp. 108–9 fascinatingly demonstrates that guidelines were temporarily painted on the exterior of the glass to guide the glass-painter in his modelling of figures. Framed between her chapters is an account by Kenneth Munn of the historiography of the glass and of 'hidden portraits' within the windows. Finally, Keith Barley describes the sophisticated techniques he has employed to restore legibility to key areas of the glazing without physically altering the original glass: Barley also provides a detailed post-Reformation history of the glazing, which some of the other contributors should have read before they wrote their own essays. This raises the issue of the poor construction and uneven editing of the whole book: there is a great deal of repetition of material by different contributors (and, occasionally, within single contributions) and yet significant information – for instance, on the patronage of the church rebuilding and glazing scheme – is sometimes discussed only after chapters which take the reader's knowledge of that information for granted. On other occasions there are minor factual contradictions between authors or between text and captions (for example the date of John Thame's death is 1500 on p. 18 and 1501 on p. 28). The index is also very poor.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER

PHILLIP LINDLEY

*The garden, the ark, the tower, the temple. Biblical metaphors of knowledge in early modern Europe.* By Jim Bennett and Scott Mandelbrote. Pp. 199 incl. 71 figs. Oxford: Museum of the History of Science (in association with the Bodleian Library), 1998. £12.50 (paper). 0 903364 09 3

This exhibition catalogue illustrates the central role of biblical metaphors of knowledge for developing new ways of understanding the natural world in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. It focuses on the works of Samuel Hartlib and his circle of correspondents who devised and proposed projects for restoring knowledge of nature after models found in the Old Testament. The book begins with a selection of various editions of the English Bible in which seventeenth-century readers read the stories of the Garden, the Ark, the Tower of Babel and the Temple of Solomon. These form the four themes around which the exhibition items are arranged. The story of the Garden of Eden offered a glimpse of the prelapsarian state of nature and human knowledge to early modern readers: authors such as John Evelyn and Sir Hugh Plat advocated agricultural reforms in order to restore the lost fertility of the earth; Joseph Glanvill and Robert Hooke advocated the use of instruments to restore the sensory knowledge that Adam had

had. Noah, on the other hand, was the supreme natural historian, and his Ark a museum in which all of God's creatures were included. The figure of Noah inspired Ulisse Aldrovandi to acquire knowledge about the nature and habits of all animals and to classify and arrange them in order, whilst Jean Buteo and Athanasius Kircher expended much effort in figuring out the exact dimension and design of the Ark. The arrangement of early modern museums and gardens were often inspired by such ideas about the Ark. The demise of the Tower of Babel was a reminder of God's punishment of human pride which resulted in the dispersion of peoples and confusion of languages. John Wilkins, John Amos Comenius and Sir Thomas Browne sought to establish a universal language as a means of recovery from the ill effects of Babel. Solomon's Temple was considered to be the ultimate model of sacred architecture. Hieronymus Prado and most famously Isaac Newton studied the history of weights and measurements in order to work out the dimensions of this Temple. It is in such a Temple that Francis Bacon had advocated that knowledge of nature should be advanced through co-operative research. The book ends with a survey of biblical commentaries which illustrate various positions on the role of knowledge derived from nature. As an exhibition catalogue, this book is refreshingly satisfying: biographical accounts of authors are concise and relevant; descriptions of the content of the book and its significance are set out clearly in relation to the theme of each section; and cross references are made to works which instigated or inspired the work. As a book on early modern biblical metaphors, each section reads coherently with ample illustrations. The four themes effectively demonstrate how biblical understanding of knowledge underpinned, inspired and directed the study of nature in this period. Indeed these were much more than metaphors or expedient excuses for new ways of investigating nature. Protestant emphasis on literal and historical readings of the Bible meant that the Bible had become the most fundamental source for making sense of the present state of human knowledge and for finding models by which to guide future action. This, then, is the important intellectual context of John Milton, Isaac Newton, John Wilkins, Christopher Wren and the Royal Society. Much work has gone into this slim volume, and particularly welcome are the relevant, full and up-to-date references for each entry. It is a visually attractive and informative book, and at £12.50 an affordable one which should be found on the bookshelf of every student of seventeenth-century English literature, the Hartlib Circle and biblical hermeneutics. But the findings of this book should be taken most seriously by historians of early modern science who have all too often ignored the central role of biblical knowledge amongst the heroes of the Scientific Revolution.

TRINITY COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

S. KUSAKAWA

*Death, religion, and the family in England, 1480–1750.* By Ralph Houlbrooke. (Oxford Studies in Social History.) Pp. xiv + 435. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998. £55. 0 19 821761 7

In this extremely wide-ranging study Ralph Houlbrooke has set out to write a social history of death in early modern England. By linking death, the family and



religion he brings together three factors of which the first remained constant, the second with the loss of lay fraternities and religious guilds perhaps increasing in importance during the period, but only the third, with the transition from late medieval Catholicism to state Protestantism in the sixteenth century, subjected to profound disruption. Luther made his initial protest over the abuse of indulgences which claimed to reduce the pains of souls in the afterlife, and on his ensuing denial of the very existence of purgatory Catholics and Protestants adopted totally opposed theologies of death. Yet despite this dichotomy, a reader of this book can come away with the impression that over the course of the 300 years continuities in the history of death in England may well have outweighed change.

Mortality rates scarcely altered between 1480 and 1750. Many babies died in infancy or during the first years of their lives; childbirth caused the deaths of many mothers; the plague and other epidemics periodically decimated whole populations. Death in consequence was ever present. Yet familiarity, if it did not breed contempt, seems to have brought about a certain sense of indifference and there is little evidence that the majority of the population lived in terror of their final end, Catholic and Protestant moralists alike bewailing the fact that the mass of the people paid all too little attention to preparing for their death.

In the late medieval system individuals and their relatives and friends considered that by endowing chantries in perpetuity or commissioning the celebration of masses at a month's or a year's end they could accelerate a soul's progress through purgatory. Protestants first began questioning this comfortable doctrine in the reign of Henry VIII and from the 1540s onwards, with the brief exception of the restoration of Catholicism under Mary, taught that after death a soul proceeded immediately to heaven or hell. Since God from eternity had predestined the fate of all, no Christians possessed any power to help themselves. Perhaps only the charitable assumption made by most pastors that the souls of the penitent to whom they ministered were destined for heaven, and the conviction of the generality of lay people that hell was for other people and not themselves, can explain why such an absolute reversal in belief met with so muted a reaction.

Theological differences apart, English Protestant handbooks on the craft of dying evolved almost seamlessly from the late medieval *ars moriendi* with biblical assurance strengthening the repentant sinner in his final combat in place of the sacraments. Both traditions emphasised the importance of settling earthly responsibilities so that the dying could concentrate on spiritual matters at the last. Apart from the exclusion of the Virgin and Saints in the preamble the form of wills altered very little with the establishment of Protestantism: testators as they had always done concentrated primarily upon providing for their families, only those with no close heirs making spectacular donations to charity. The Reformation, however, brought about a change in the type of benefactions, with bequests for sermons, and schemes for the foundation of schools and for ameliorating the condition of the poor replacing masses for the dead and indiscriminate doles.

Even in Catholic times the cost of clerical services and generous if unsystematic poor relief constituted a minor part of the vast expense of noble funerals when families spent literally hundreds of pounds on black cloth for hangings and

mourning clothes. The Reformation in the sixteenth century affected such funerals surprisingly little, with the College of Arms insisting on the continuation of secular pomp, though after the Civil War and the decline of the powers of the heralds the aristocracy at last succeeded in cutting back on ostentatious display.

At least at the funerals of the powerful in the late Middle Ages the sermon had included some mention of the virtues of the deceased. Such funeral sermons increased in popularity after the acceptance of Protestantism with the godly held up as patterns of how to live and particularly how to die. Funeral sermons appeared in print in increasing numbers under the early Stuarts, very tentatively being supplanted by less exclusively religious obituaries in the mid eighteenth century.

In the same way as funeral ceremonies at the top of society gradually became less lavish, more private commemorative sculpture also reflected a similar fluctuation in taste. Artistically little distinguished the table tomb of a Catholic gentleman and his wife with attendant children from that of his late Elizabethan Protestant descendant, such family groups giving way by the eighteenth century to individual busts and more restrained epitaphs.

Consistently interesting and challenging, often very moving, this book explores the English way of death in the early modern period in a wealth of detail which can only be hinted at in a short review. It will also supply an invaluable source for future work on the subject for many years to come.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

CLAIRE CROSS

*Erasmus, the Anabaptists, and the Great Commission.* By Abraham Friesen. Pp. xi + 196. Grand Rapids, Minn.–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 1998. £12.99 (paper). 0 8028 4448 0

Abraham Friesen revisits a significant and perennial theme in Anabaptist studies, the relationship between Erasmian humanism and the origins of Anabaptism. Friesen's particular concern is with Erasmus' understanding of the Great Commission contained in Matthew xxviii, its integration with statements about baptism in the Acts of the Apostles, and the influence of this interpretation on the early Anabaptists. But this is not simply an exposé on debates over correct baptismal formula – whether correct apostolic practice conformed to baptism in the name of the Trinity as in the Matthean Great Commission, or rather in the name of the Son, as in Acts. Rather, Friesen argues, Erasmus' understanding of the Great Commission, and following it that of the early Anabaptists, departed from established and subsequent church practice in emphasising the teaching aspect of the command in Christ's 'last testament': 'Go therefore and make disciples of all nations, baptising them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, *teaching them to observe all that I have commanded you*' (Matt. xxviii. 19–20).

According to Friesen, Erasmus' treatment of the Great Commission was not an esoteric teaching on the fringes of the Anabaptist movement; rather it amounts to its central defining moment – it is the key not only to the intellectual origins of Anabaptism, but to understanding the movement as a whole (p. 98). Friesen is

well aware that his interpretation goes against the grain of much contemporary scholarship. Consequently he carefully locates his thesis within the context of existing interpretations of this topic and he explains clearly what he perceives to be its broader implications. The first two chapters of his book survey in some detail historical writing on early Anabaptism, Renaissance humanism and the relationship between them. Chapter iii addresses the central question of Erasmus' distinct interpretation of the Great Commission and its echoes among the Anabaptists. The broader significance of the Erasmian rendering of the Great Commission is examined in chapter iv which details Catholic and Protestant responses to it and in chapter v, which investigates the impact of this teaching on the 'form and content of Anabaptist thought'. Friesen concludes by looking at the issue in the wider context of the Reformation, arguing that the possibility of a common ground among sixteenth-century religious reformers based on the Erasmian treatment of the Great Commission was ultimately ruptured by the imperial edict issued at Nuremberg on 6 March 1523 which 'in effect permanently turned religious affairs over to the political authorities' (p. 113). Appended to the conclusion is an epilogue, in which Friesen examines the wider implications of this theme for the history of Christianity and contemporary attempts at ecumenical dialogue.

Friesen claims with this study to be moving beyond earlier, myopic interpretations of Anabaptism and its relationship to Renaissance humanism. He dismisses with disdain the confessional polemics underlying the historical interpretations presented by the enemies of the Anabaptists and their heirs. Less dismissive, but no less critical, is his treatment of the work of Mennonite historians which, Friesen claims, has been dictated by twentieth-century Mennonite concerns. The work of 'secular' historians, too, comes under sharp and critical scrutiny. Anyone familiar with Friesen's earlier work on Marxist historical writing on the Reformation will find no surprises in his treatment of that tradition here. And the work of liberal historians fares little better. In fact, all the above interpretive traditions are gathered together under the rubric of 'Whig' history. Professor Friesen's own approach is explicitly post-revisionist and he rejects out of hand the polygenetic interpretation of the origins of Anabaptism which sees the movement arising out of three distinct traditions and social contexts. The campaign against the reigning interpretation of Anabaptism reaches a crescendo in the author's attack on social history which, in a classic case of guilt by association, becomes 'the bourgeois cousin to the Marxist interpretation of history' (p. 18).

Professor Friesen's response to the polygenetic emphasis on the importance of social context for the beginnings of the distinct strands of early Anabaptism is to describe variations within the early movement as the result of individual responses to a common, central message: the Erasmian rendering of the Great Commission. In fact, adherence to this teaching becomes the litmus test for inclusion in the Anabaptist family. And this criterion yields results which may be predictable, but are surprising in the extremes to which they are taken. Not only are non-rebaptising Reformation Radicals clearly demarcated from the early Anabaptist movement, but even some of those who actively baptised adults. The implications of the use of these criteria for defining Anabaptism are clearest in Professor Friesen's treatment of Dutch Anabaptism which, it is claimed, was so

fundamentally reformed by Menno Simons as to be a movement distinct not only from the Münster Anabaptist kingdom but also from the entire Melchiorite tradition. One cannot help but feel that we have here a return to a distinct 'Evangelical Anabaptism' under a new guise. Certainly, the polygenetic argument for the origins of Anabaptism is beginning to show its age. Scholars like Arnold Snyder and John Roth, and even two of the authors of the original polygenesis article, James Stayer and Werner Packull, are increasingly drawing attention to the interaction between early Anabaptist groups and their shared features. Post-revisionist interpretations of the origins and early development of Anabaptism are steadily opening up new and exciting vistas into the religious history of the sixteenth century. But to reject the polygenesis argument by denying the importance of social forces on human decisions and human activities, and to return to strictly theological criteria to define and understand the history of Christianity hardly seems less myopic than the interpretation it claims to replace.

AUGUSTANA COLLEGE,  
SIOUX FALLS,  
SOUTH DAKOTA

GEOFFREY DIPPLE

*Selected works of Erasmus, LXIII: Expositions of the Psalms. Enarratio in primum psalmum, 'Beatus vir'; Commentarius in psalmum 2, 'Quare fremuerunt gentes'; Paraphrasis in tertium psalmum, 'Domine quid multiplatici'; In psalmum quartum concio.* Edited by Dominic Baker-Smith, translated and annotated by Michael J. Heath. Pp. lxxii + 306 incl. frontispiece. Toronto–Buffalo–London: University of Toronto Press, 1997. £75. 0 8020 4308 9

*Collected works of Erasmus, LXXXIII: Controversies. Apologia ad Fabrum; Appendix de scriptis Clithovei; Dilutio; Responsio ad disputationem de divortio.* Edited by Guy Bedouelle. Pp. lvii + 200. Toronto–Buffalo–London: University of Toronto Press, 1998. £70. 0 8020 4310 0

These two volumes from the *Collected Works of Erasmus* are a welcome addition to the Toronto series. Volume lxxiii, containing Erasmus' commentaries on Psalms i through iv, lets us observe Erasmus trying out a variety of forms as he casts about for the best way to comment on the Psalms. For Psalm i, he chooses an exposition, or *enarratio*, for Psalm ii a commentary, for Psalm iii a paraphrase and for Psalm iv a sermon or *concio*. The works vary greatly in length and approach, with Psalm iv being the longest, Psalm iii the shortest. Baker-Smith's excellent and detailed introduction reviews the history of the Psalms in liturgy and interpretation, and the place of Erasmus' work in that history. In the texts themselves Erasmus spars with former commentators Augustine, Jerome and others as he delves into the various levels of meaning: literal, allegorical, tropological and anagogical. The exposition on Psalm i, which predates the *Novum instrumentum*, stakes out a position in opposition to scholastic interpretation, while the latter three, written during the period of Luther's revolt, place more emphasis on themes of unity. Michael Heath's work as translator and annotator is lively and refreshing.

Volume lxxxiii includes the *Apology against Jacques Lefevre d'Étaples* (trans. Howard Jones, annot. Guy Bedouelle), the *Appendix on the writings of Josse Clichtove* (trans. and annot. Charles Fantazzi), the *Refutation of the accusations of Josse Clichtove against the Suasoria of Desiderius Erasmus of Rotterdam in praise of marriage* (trans. and annot. Charles Fantazzi) and *The reply of Erasmus to the disputation of a certain Phimostomus on divorce* (trans. and annot. Ann Dalzell). While these works vary in subject matter, they are united in that they all represent disputes with Catholic critics. The quarrel with friend and fellow humanist Lefevre d'Étaples involved an issue of interpretation: in his 1516 edition of the *Novum instrumentum* Erasmus took issue with Lefevre's reading of Hebrews ii.7, which quotes Psalm viii.6 ('You have made him a little lower than the angels'). Lefevre replied in an annotation of his own, accusing Erasmus of impiety. The quarrel was deeply painful to Erasmus, who was torn between his feelings of friendship with the older Lefevre and his need to defend himself against such a charge. The other three controversies concern questions relating to marriage and divorce. Josse Clichtove, a Paris theologian, rebuked Erasmus in print following the 1522 reissuing of *In praise of marriage*, for undermining chastity by praising marriage so highly. Erasmus' reply includes a detailed examination of the terms chastity, celibacy and continence. His dispute with Dominican Johann Dietenberger, whom he names 'Phimostomus' ('bit' or 'bridle') after the latter's title for his own work chastising Erasmus for his views on divorce, delves into Old Testament law, its appropriation by St Paul, and the tradition of interpretation represented by the Fathers. Bedouelle's introduction and the annotators' notes provide excellent background and support for navigating the intricacies of these various conflicts, while the work of the translators makes the edition a joy to read.

ST OLAF COLLEGE

LAUREL CARRINGTON

*Churchwardens' accounts of St Michael, Spurriergate, York, 1518–1548*, I: 1518–1537; II: 1538–1548. By C. C. Webb. (Borthwick Texts and Calendars, 20.) Pp. v + 190; 191–379. York: Borthwick Institute of Historical Research, University of York, 1997. £17.50 + £2.30 post and packing from the Borthwick Institute, St Anthony's Hall, York YO1 2PW. 0305 8506

The accounts of St Michael, Spurriergate, are the only set of continuous parish accounts to survive from pre-Reformation York and their appearance in this excellent edition by Christopher Webb both confirms and challenges insights into early sixteenth-century parish life that have developed over the past decade. St Michael's was a prosperous city parish with an average income of £35 *per annum* drawn primarily from the rents of the parish estate, providing work for four or five clerics (occasionally as many as nine) and both regular and occasional work for as many as fifteen labourers and craftsmen. The accounts end in the years of reformation when the carefully regulated and technologically advanced world of penitential piety was brought to an end as the wall paintings of the devil and St Christopher were sloppily covered with whitewash (a labourer was hired to clean up the mess) and the mechanisms that allowed the Lenten veil to be raised and moved or that operated an image of Christ rising from the grave in the Easter sepulchre were dismantled. Here are the familiar features of the conforming and

canny responses of Tudor churchwardens, more socially diverse in this parish than elsewhere, seeking to obey the crown's directives but unwilling to destroy when plate, images, stone and wood might be saved or sold and the parish reimbursed. It is no small regret that the accounts end in 1548 when Edward's reformation quickened its pace but that we know anything at all of the decades prior is owed to the labours of Thomas Wyrral, priest and fishmonger's son, who inscribed these accounts for more than thirty years. Technical terms, aphetic forms and phonetic spelling abound from the pen of this York native writing in the vernacular but Webb has helpfully countered all these difficulties with the aid of an excellent glossary, introduction and index.

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY,  
BRITISH COLUMBIA

JOHN CRAIG

*Godliness and governance in Tudor Colchester.* By Laquita M. Higgs. (Studies in Medieval and Early Modern Civilization.) Pp. xiii + 434 incl. 5 figs and 10 tables. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1998. \$54.50. 0 472 10890 5

In this book, Laquita Higgs examines the progress of the Reformation in Colchester, discussing how the late medieval piety of the inhabitants was transformed into Protestantism by the end of the sixteenth century. The religious changes are set against political developments in the town, as it was the bailiffs, aldermen and councillors who were largely instrumental in fostering Puritanism, especially in the first thirty years of Elizabeth's reign. Colchester enjoyed commercial and cultural links with London and Cambridge, and for much of the sixteenth century had close connections with those in power in government: Thomas Audley was town clerk between 1514 and 1532, Richard Rich recorder between 1532 and 1544, while Francis Walsingham acted as recorder from 1578 until his death in 1590. Crown policy and developments outside Colchester undoubtedly influenced the course of the Reformation in the town, yet the speed and nature of religious change very much depended on what was going on in the town itself; other urban studies have pointed to local variations in the progress of the Reformation. Laquita Higgs shows how in the early sixteenth century Lollardy was present in Colchester, not only among artisans and craftsmen, but also among the elite, and argues that this prepared the way for the acceptance of Protestantism. Protestantism was growing from the 1530s, but it is significant that the town authorities pursued a policy of close co-operation with the crown under Henry VIII, Edward VI and Mary. Higgs shows clearly that it was in the early years of Elizabeth's reign that the governing body set itself up as a godly magistracy in order to spread Protestantism throughout Colchester, a policy probably encouraged by the poor state of both the clergy and the parish churches. The policy involved the appointment of a town preacher, on a permanent basis from 1575, while the town authorities placed increasing emphasis on church attendance and moral behaviour. Higgs considers that most of the inhabitants were Protestant by the late 1580s. By then there was among the elite less fervour and more readiness to compromise with the Established Church, the result possibly of Whitgift's policies as archbishop of Canterbury, as well as of higher standards in the Colchester churches. Laquita Higgs's survey will be

useful to both Reformation and regional historians; it is valuable to have this addition to sixteenth-century urban studies.

GOLDSMITHS COLLEGE,  
UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

JENNIFER C. WARD

*A kingdom in two parishes. Lancashire religious writers and the English monarchy, 1521–1689.* By Malcolm Hardman. Pp. 364 incl. frontispiece and 20 ills. Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1998. £40. 0 8386 3667 5

This is a group biography of a diaspora of religious writers who happened to be born in the Lancashire parishes of Bolton and Deane. Most of them went off to Cambridge in their teens, and pursued careers elsewhere. Henry Bradshaw was a monk in Chester, Thomas Lever was archdeacon of Coventry, George Marsh was a Leicestershire curate, James Pilkington became bishop of Durham, Oliver Heywood was a preacher in Halifax, Lawrence Fogg was dean of Chester, and Robert Ainsworth taught in Hackney – only the Catholic recusant James Anderton stayed at home. Probably most of them went to Bolton Grammar School, but we usually know nothing of their lives before they left Lancashire. So it is hard to see them as ‘the Bolton “school”’, or to find anything much that their writings have in common. Hardman’s attempt to link some of them by relating ideas on the eucharist to conceptions of monarchy mystified this reviewer. Catholicism was ‘wafer worship’, opposed at the Reformation by ‘Anglo-Zwinglians’. The break with Rome was ‘beneficial as well as inevitable’, Stephen Gardiner was ‘an instrument of the Hapsburg [*sic*] world ideal’, and Whitgift and Laud were ‘martinets of limited brain’. The book’s structure is wandering and wayward, its bibliography selective and dated, and its assertions idiosyncratic or incomprehensible. It is a strange piece of work. But all historians of Bolton religion should read it.

CHRIST CHURCH,  
OXFORD

CHRISTOPHER HAIGH

*Henry VIII's divorce. Literature and the politics of the printing press.* By Christopher J. Warner. Pp. ix + 163. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1998. £40. 0 85115 642 8

This book has a bold thesis. The gist is that the propaganda campaign for Henry VIII’s first divorce triggered a political and literary rivalry between Thomas Berthelet, the king’s printer, and John and William Rastell, Thomas More’s kinsmen, who printed More’s polemical works. Both ‘sides’, according to Warner, laid claim to ‘speaking for the king’. By drawing on Foucault’s theory of the formation of ‘discursive strategies’, an interpretation is contrived according to which all these texts contributed towards, and were governed by, a ‘strategically crafted’ image of Henry VIII. This public ‘image’ or ‘representation’ depicted a humanistic scholar and philosopher-king, who sought the ‘counsel’ of wise men assembled at his court, in the universities and in parliament. The Rastells, like Berthelet, conformed to this discursive model in order to capture Henry’s

attention and remould his monarchy according to the values represented by his 'official' image. In this way, More and the Rastells could legitimately seek to redirect the king's actions towards their own political and religious agenda. This battle to appropriate Henry's image ended in 1534 when William Rastell was summoned by Cromwell to justify his printing of More's *Answer to a poisoned book*. Thereafter, the Act of Supremacy achieved a 'discursive reformation' whereby Henry VIII abandoned the philosopher-king image for that of supreme head of Church and State in England, which abridged the debate predicated on 'wise counsel' and prescribed a narrower set of rules. Some aspects of Warner's argument have merit. The model of 'good counsel' was fundamental to the Tudor theory of kingship, since the crux of monarchy was the concept of the sovereign ruler who was obliged to rule in the interests of the *respublica* and who therefore needed 'counsel' and advice. 'Counsel' made the exercise of sovereign power legitimate, but how and in what forum it was articulated were not constitutionally prescribed. For the leading authors of this period, who included John Skelton, Thomas Heywood, Sir Thomas Elyot, Thomas Starkey, Christopher St German and More himself, this was a paradigm easily moulded to political and religious ends. As Francis Bacon later noted, 'counsel' was the spouse of *imperium*, and it was *imperium* in Church and State which was the cornerstone of Henry VIII's royal supremacy from 1531 onwards. Where Warner's analysis collapses is in the proof that it was the printers, and not the authors, who were orchestrating this rhetorical game. Equally dubious is the assumption that Berthelet's printed books (including Elyot's) were primarily 'official' publications whereas the books published by the Rastells were essentially 'opposition' writings. Although Warner avoids the term 'opposition', which is too closely linked to the interpretation of More and the 1530s most closely associated with Sir Geoffrey Elton, his use of the term 'sides' in discussing Berthelet and the Rastells means that the effect of his argument is the same. Warner inherits several of Sir Geoffrey's misconceptions of 'propaganda' and 'official' printing in this decade. The result is an ambitious but ultimately unconvincing study.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

JOHN GUY

*Biografisch Lexicon voor de Geschiedenis van het Nederlandse Protestantisme*, IV. By J. van den Berg and others. Pp. 494. Kampen: Kok, 1998. Nlg 89. 90 242 9269 7  
It is twenty years since vol. i of this work appeared, ten since vol. iii. Editors change, but vol. iv is as admirably executed as its predecessors: reliable, balanced and authoritative. To maintain consistency over twenty years is itself a form of excellence. With one more volume the *Lexicon* will be complete. Its shape and comprehensiveness are already established. While it will doubtless be used mainly by those referring to a single article, the whole of Dutch Protestant church history from the early martyrs to the 1950s is laid out before us as personified both by those who jealously guarded its central orthodoxies and by the Remonstrants and Socinians, Collegiants and Moravians, and others making up its coat of many colours. Possession of the whole *Lexicon* is to be prized. For instance: much controversy revolved between the two poles, Voetius and Cocceius; the article on Cocceius is in this volume, that on Voetius in vol. ii, and each benefits if read



alongside the other. Or again: many here are described as Labadists, including Antoinette de Bourignon, ‘the leader of a sort of ecumenical congregation avant-la-lettre’; those desiring further enlightenment should likewise turn to vol. ii for the superb article on de Labadie by the late Professor Nauta. Bibliographies are as full and illuminating as ever; translations into Dutch of works in English or German, or into those languages, are noted. English Puritans were much translated, as part of what Dr De Groot goes so far as to term a *puritanisierungssoffensief* (p. 29). The current also ran the other way. Herman Witsius (1636–1708) so much impressed the Baptist divine John Collett Ryland (1723–92) that Ryland called one of his sons after him, and in 1763 two other notable Baptists, Gill and Brine, lent their support to an English version of Witsius’ *De oeconomia foederum* (1677). The time-lag here suggests that periodisation may sometimes mislead: when conservatives put the clock back, they do it within a perceived continuum.

BOURNVILLE

GEOFFREY F. NUTTALL

*The first Jesuits.* By John O’Malley. Pp. xii+457 incl. 5 ills. Cambridge, Mass.–London: Harvard University Press, 1993. \$35. 0 674 30312 1

*The first Jesuits* is now six years old and will last a lot longer. It is an account of the early history of the Society which manages to keep in touch with the hagiographical narratives of the past, while transcending them in the direction of real historical understanding. This is partly because it is an analytical description of the Society as a collectivity, not a string of biographies. The Society itself is the focus, and O’Malley’s aims have been to expound its understanding of itself, and the context in which it emerged and developed. He has certainly achieved the first of these aims by the digestion and structured presentation of the mass of Jesuit sources: a boon for students and a handbook for researchers. On the context he is less comprehensive: there is almost no politics in the book. What there is, is a very careful description of changes in the Society’s character and objectives, up to the death of the second general, Laínez, in 1565, which offers a great deal of scope for contextual thoughts.

Two motto-phrases recur constantly: that the purpose of the Society’s doings, collectively, was the ‘helping’ of ‘souls’; and that it had a particular angle on how, collectively, it was to be undertaken, described as ‘our way of proceeding’. Most of the book is an account of the Jesuits’ external ministry, the various kinds of *consueta ministeria* by which souls were to be helped. The last chapters, which O’Malley describes as dealing with Jesuit ‘culture’, are more internal: about its intellectual and spiritual character, its situation in the Counter-Reformation Church, its rules and domestic structure. With other institutions, one might think that this was putting the cart before the horse: hardly with the Jesuits.

Three of O’Malley’s points seem particularly fruitful for historians to think about. The first is a point about the original Jesuit inspiration, which does not get distinct treatment in the book but is strongly conveyed all the same. It explains why Ignatius was thought an *alumbrado*. He and his followers came from a background in fifteenth-century devotion, and posited and stimulated a direct

and immediate relation between the soul (and heart) and God: the relation came via the 'spirit', and was in principle non-ecclesiastical, non-liturgical and non-social. Jesuits were 'apostles', that is, they were sent out to preach the gospel, heal the sick, etc.; they were not, as such, priests. According to the Society's chief ideologist, Jerónimo Nadal, the apostolic ministry was historically prior to the Christian priesthood: he must have meant that it was in some sense more important. To the contrary of George Herbert, for Jesuits private prayer was nearer the heart of things than public; the mass, says O'Malley, was only just not 'one among many forms of prayer in which the individual might engage'. They excluded themselves from the ordinary pastoral ministry, and included in their own catalogue of ministries no sacraments except confession and communion, both of which they saw as aids to individual conversion or spiritual progress.

Where the individualism in this came from is clear enough: roughly, the *Imitation of Christ*. Where the 'apostolic' activism came from is not so clear. O'Malley takes it to come out of the late medieval cultivation, notably in Spain and Italy, of the 'works of mercy', and that seems a good idea. But this is a dark subject, in which at least two problems arise. One is that there were two sets of works of mercy, the corporal and the spiritual, of which the history of the second, which is not scriptural and was in the end more important for the Society than the first, is very obscure. The other question is whether works of mercy are the same thing as works of charity, which is how they are described in the Jesuit mission statement, the *Formula Instituti*.

On the Society's progress after 1540, what comes over most strongly is the degree to which its character as a mature institution differed more or less radically from what had originally been envisaged. This entailed something more than the effects of a galloping expansion of numbers, or a Weberian routinisation and reduction of everything to rules. The most striking example was the multiplication of schools and colleges, which had nothing to do with the original programme and drastically changed the Society's objectives and *modus vivendi*: its relation to poverty, mobility and community, and its engagement with secular culture. O'Malley holds, I am sure with justice, that Ignatius and his successors never really thought properly about its consequences. But a number of other examples emerge: the fateful addition of the 'defence' to the 'propagation' of the faith, inspired by experience in Germany and embodied in the transition from Favre to the ultra-dogmatic Canisius; the writing of books, which was not in the original remit and thought contrary to it by some of the early Jesuits; the adoption as a 'ministry' of peacemaking in rural communities, which occurred in Italy and meant a considerable accommodation to traditional ideas of the function of the preacher and pastor. Finally there is the relation of Jesuits to the pope, where we meet one theoretical departure, the passage from the availability of individual Jesuits for 'missions' at the nod of the pope to the control of collective missionary operations by the General subject to broad papal approval; and a series of practical crises with two individual popes, the well-known difficulty with Paul IV who wanted to turn the Society into a conventional religious Order, and the less well-known problems with the unzealous Pius IV. Pius disapproved of the effect of the Spiritual Exercises on his nephew Carlo Borromeo; Jesuits obstructed his wish to assist Catholicism in Germany by permitting the administration of communion in both kinds. O'Malley very

properly cites Brian Tierney on the origins of papal infallibility in the Franciscan doctrine that a pope could not undo what a previous pope had done, and shows that it was held equally by Jesuits.

The last point is perhaps the most fundamental: O'Malley takes quite seriously the complaint of such founding fathers as Rodrigues and Bobadilla that the constitutional development of the Society into an Ignatian absolutism was a violation of its primitive spirit. We ought to take it seriously too; if we do, we may find that something like an earthquake has occurred beneath the familiar crust of early Jesuit history.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

JOHN BOSSY

*Humanist taste and Franciscan values. Cornelio Musso and Catholic preaching in sixteenth-century Italy.* By Corrie E. Norman. (Renaissance and Baroque Studies and Texts, 24.) Pp. ix + 189. New York: Peter Lang, 1998. £27. 0 8204 3871 5; 0897 7836

Cornelio Musso (1511–74), whose preaching is the subject of this study, compared his colleagues to ‘trumpets’ and roaring lions who would bring Rome to repentance with the force of their sermons (pp. 37, 50). In this study Corrie E. Norman shows how Musso’s preaching, as revealed in several printed collections of his sermons, was faithful to a traditional Franciscan emphasis upon vices and virtues, and the need for penitence and the reform of personal habits. However, while some preachers may have wished to have taken on the mantle of a new Jeremiah, Norman rejects the view of Jean Delumeau in his *Sin and fear: the emergence of a western guilt culture 13–18th centuries* (New York 1990) that Musso contributed to an unhealthy preoccupation with sin in the medieval and early modern periods, and she presents a more balanced and a sometimes surprising picture of his preaching in the period 1530–63. Despite his personal inhibitions and prickliness Musso was a highly effective and popular preacher whose audiences ranged from popes to ex-prostitutes. He preached in most of the major cities of northern Italy and is known today for his sermon in classical Latin at the inaugural session of the Council of Trent (an event curiously neglected by Norman). As well as blasting on the trumpet, Musso could soothe his audiences with the ‘harp’ as well as employ theatrical devices – he compared the Church to a theatre (p. 77) – such as a falsetto voice in a sermon where he played the role of ‘mid-wife’ to a group of new nuns. Norman carefully redresses the balance of previous scholarship by demonstrating that Musso sought to encourage virtuous behaviour in his audiences by playing equally on the themes of fear and hope. Moreover, she gives Musso’s ‘humanist taste’ a more positive assessment. The classical examples and allegories in his sermons which drew the fire of Francesco Panigarola, as well as his eloquence (an accomplishment which St Francis had distrusted) are viewed by Norman as being fully consonant with Franciscan values and tradition. While her final chapter is an impressive summary of this argument, nevertheless it is a shame that the contribution of Franciscanism to sixteenth-century humanism and *vice-versa* is hardly considered. Moreover, she fails to live up to the subtitle of her book in that the nature of preaching among Musso’s Italian contemporaries is also neglected. Considering his varied

audiences one would have liked to have known if Musso adapted his complex structure, style or gestures to suite the social and geographical variations in his audiences (Norman seems to suggest that he didn't – p. 67). Her conclusions do seem, however, to support the thesis of Frederick J. McGinness in his *Right thinking and sacred oratory in Counter-Reformation Rome* (Princeton, NJ 1995) that there was a greater emphasis upon compartmentality in sixteenth-century sermons than in the fifteenth century, and she does establish, albeit in a style which is rather flat for a study of Franciscan eloquence, the importance of Musso and his preaching to our understanding of Counter-Reformation Italy.

MANCHESTER METROPOLITAN UNIVERSITY

STEPHEN D. BOWD

*Popular religion in sixteenth-century England. Holding their peace.* By Christopher Marsh. (Social History in Perspective.) Pp. x + 258. Basingstoke–London: Macmillan Press, 1998. £40 (cloth), £12.99 (paper). 0 333 61990 0; 0 333 61991 9

Michael Sherbrook, Elizabethan rector of Wickersley in Yorkshire, did not much like the Reformation, and could not understand how it had happened. He asked his father, who had joined in the looting of Roche Abbey, 'How came it to pass that you were so ready to destroy and spoil the thing you thought well of?' Christopher Marsh quotes Sherbrook's question as an epigraph, and tries to answer it. Bluntly, his conclusion is that Catholicism wasn't quite so good and Protestantism wasn't quite so bad as some of us are thought to have supposed. The book is a thematic comparison of popular religion before and after the Reformation – religion inside, religion alongside and religion beyond the official Church. Marsh finds plenty of continuity: in personnel, in forms of service, in celebrations, in the consolations of conventional religion. Where there was change, it was limited (from confession to catechism, from pilgrimages to sermon-gadding, from gilds to conventicles), or from the worse (fear and compulsion) to the better (congregational singing and vernacular responses). The old ways succumbed easily to the Reformation, so there must have been something wrong with them; the new ways proved acceptable, so they must have had something to offer – and the claims of communal peace and obedience to authority made even the unpleasant bearable. There is a robust common sense about all this, much that is borrowed, much that is easily agreed to, and there are helpful insights and interesting comparisons. The book is energetic, intelligent, fluent, systematic and interesting. But it is historiographical rather than historical: the index names twenty-eight historical characters, seventy-four historians and one football-manager. The argument is a knockabout polemic, packed with bouncy metaphors, slick debating-points, sneering caricatures and sleight-of-hand misrepresentations – wrapped up as the middle-of-the-road detachment of an aloof social historian (though the dedication to Margaret Spufford and Patrick Collinson betrays the stable and the sympathies). Annoyingly, for a victim, it is very skilfully done. And, in the end, though it smartens things up it doesn't quite wash. Establishing the similarities between A and B does not explain how we got from A to B, nor how B came to be the B it was. It certainly does not show that the journey was uneventful, without accident or incident. There was much that

formal English religion in the 1590s shared with formal English religion in the 1520s, as others have argued before. But the parishioners of Wolsey's Church did not look at Whitgift's Church and think 'We can live with that': Whitgift's Church was not on offer, it was negotiated over decades, nationally and locally. And in the meantime there were generational turnovers, incremental adjustments, awkward compromises, unhappy confusions, painful choices and sometimes cruelty and slaughter. As Geoffrey Dickens pointed out, England did not have wars of religion – but it had some pretty messy skirmishes, moral and military: people got hurt.

CHRIST CHURCH,  
OXFORD

CHRISTOPHER HAIGH

*Local responses to the English Reformation.* By Robert Whiting. Pp. viii + 269 incl. 2 maps. Basingstoke: Macmillan/New York: St Martins Press, 1998. £47.50. o 333 64244 9; o 333 64245 7; o 312 21185 6

*The Reformation and the towns in England. Politics and political culture, c. 1540–1640.* By Robert Tittler. Pp. x + 395. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998. £48. o 19 820718 2

Both these books are noteworthy contributions to debates about the nature of the English Reformation, though in fact they engage with rather different historiographies. Robert Whiting is usually considered a 'revisionist' historian of the Reformation, though his perspective is markedly different from that of other leading revisionists such as J. J. Scarisbrick, Christopher Haigh or Eamon Duffy. His previous book was an influential monograph on the impact of the Reformation on the Tudor south-west, and *Local responses* represents the argument of that book writ large, or on a less charitable reading, spread thin (much of the evidence continues to be drawn from the south-west). The thesis is that over the period 1530–70 popular support for all facets of 'traditional religion' suffered precipitous and irreversible decline. The Marian restoration evoked little response in the localities, and even the rebellions of 1536 and 1549 fail to provide trustworthy evidence of widespread enthusiasm for the old religious regime. An impressive array of evidence, both anecdotal and quantifiable, is produced to support these positions, but significant question marks hang over the way some of this evidence is marshalled and deployed. There is, for example, a very positivist reading of the statistical patterns drawn from wills, which pays little regard to the sophisticated deconstruction of these documents in recent scholarship. There is also much reliance on the accumulation of 'contemporary observations', but these are inserted completely decontextualised from the rhetorical modes and discursive strategies in which they were formulated. Thus, for example, when Simon Fish tells us in 1528 that many men no longer believe in Purgatory, or the Venetian ambassador in 1557 attributes the advance of heresy to a desire for 'licence and liberty', these assessments are accepted at face value. As the book progresses, an ostensibly inexorable rise of anticlerical sentiment is found to draw on a cast of increasingly familiar characters: twenty-three index entries for the Devon Protestant, Philip Nicols; eleven for his countrywoman, Agnes Priest. Evidence inconvenient for the thesis is sometimes

‘spun’ in an enterprising way: with respect to the 1564 survey of JPs we are assured that ‘in none of the 17 adequately recorded dioceses were over 74 per cent of justices unfavourable’ to the new regime (p. 104); opposition to the Elizabethan settlement in the Lords is dismissed on the grounds that ‘peers and bishops constituted only a minute percentage of the English people’ (p. 106). Whiting has produced a lively and student-friendly text, and the thesis he proposes is of considerable heuristic value, but its somewhat procrustean methodology and unsource-critical approach render it unconvincing overall.

While Whiting’s Reformation is the work of a single generation, Robert Tittler’s *The Reformation and the English towns* follows its subject across a century, taking as its starting point the relative neglect of the Reformation in the recent historiography of early modern towns. The aim is to provide a comprehensive answer to the question posed to urban historians by Patrick Collinson a decade ago – ‘What did the Reformation do to or for the English towns?’ Yet while Collinson has pointed a whole generation of researchers towards seeing the English Reformation as something which belongs quintessentially to the reigns of Elizabeth and James I, Tittler reverts to a more traditional timescale in arguing that, for the towns at least, the 1530s and 40s were the crucial decades. In the first place, the mid Tudor repudiation of Catholic penitential doctrine and eucharistic piety dismantled the traditional ideological underpinning of civic order and threatened the unravelling of what Tittler, despite the appropriate *caveats*, is not embarrassed to call ‘community’. In the second, the Henrician and Edwardian dissolutions released from ecclesiastical control a vast amount of urban property which represented a huge opportunity for municipal authorities. Thereafter, the response of English provincial towns to the Reformation ran along a twin-track: the drive to acquire and retain material resources, and the search for a new civic political culture to articulate and justify the distribution of power. In both respects, Tittler argues, towns were remarkably successful over the longer term. He shows that while many found themselves ill-prepared for the initial race to purchase monastic and chantry lands, they were often able to do so when these came onto the market a second or third time. Meanwhile the process served to focus ‘local strategies of enablement’ – litigation, the establishment of trusts and particularly the pursuit of incorporation by charter, which is shown to have accelerated rapidly in the decades after 1540. Accompanying these developments was increasing formalisation of office-holding and record-keeping, and (a theme Tittler has explored in previous work) the growing practical and symbolic importance of the town hall. Furthermore, we discover how towns learned to generate new forms of civic memory to reconstitute the local collective memory which in the pre-Reformation period had depended upon the imperatives of intercessionary prayer. This involved the production of urban histories and the appeal to local founding myths, the development of civic portraiture and the increasing elaboration of civic regalia – seals, swords of maintenance, and particularly maces. The end result was a synthetic but sturdy ‘urbanism’, epitomised perhaps by the town of Faversham unselfconsciously placing an order for ‘a new ancient staff’. Tittler makes a convincing case against those historians who date the emergence of a distinctive provincial urban culture only from the later seventeenth century, and who characterise it in terms of the appropriation of cultural models from the metropolis. There was a price to be paid: a central

theme of the book is the passage from ‘community’ to ‘oligarchy’, a narrowing of the ruling group and a growing distance between governors and governed that became increasingly apparent from the 1570s. But Tittler is relatively sanguine about this: not all oligarchies corresponded to the corrupt Aristotelian type, and restrictive governance could be exercised in the common interest.

Readers of this JOURNAL might feel that for a book on the Reformation Tittler’s study displays a surprising lack of interest in religion. Despite the conjunction in the title, the subject is emphatically the effect of the Reformation on English towns, rather than the working-out of the Reformation in English towns. Though there is some limited discussion of Puritanism and cultural conflict in the late sixteenth century, one gets no sense that religion was a divisive issue in towns before this date. The conclusion that post-Reformation civic culture was overwhelmingly secular must surely involve a degree of selective vision. None the less, as a result of this study our understanding of the dynamics of early modern urban governance has been significantly enriched.

UNIVERSITY OF WARWICK

PETER MARSHALL

*Gräfin Anna von Ostfriesland – eine hochadelige Frau der späten Reformationszeit (1540/42–1575). Ein Beitrag zu den Anfängen der reformierten Konfessionalisierung im Reich.* By Heiko Ebbel Janssen. (Reformationsgeschichtliche Studien und Texte, 138.) Pp. viii + 290. Munich: Aschendorff, 1988. DM 112 (paper).  
3 402 03802 1; 0171 3469

In the middle of the sixteenth century, a female ruler pursued a policy which Janssen describes as a *via media*. Countess Anna of East Friesland was the ruler; her policy was one of political neutrality and religious tolerance. After the death of her husband, Count Enno II, in 1540, she laboured successfully to become guardian of the realm until her sons should come of age. Rather than continue the Lutheran alignment that her husband had pursued or return to the region’s traditional deference to the imperial court in nearby Brussels, she adhered to the advice of her brother, Count Christoph of Oldenburg, and actively sought alliances with neutral powers. In 1542 she appointed the irenic reformer John à Lasco of Poland to serve as the first superintendent of the Church in her realm, until conditions during the Augsburg Interim forced him to move to London. She managed to navigate through the hazardous period surrounding the Interim and the Peace of Augsburg while maintaining a conciliatory orientation politically and religiously. Although her hope in pursuing this policy had been to secure the dynastic future of her children, fraternal strife among them resulted eventually in the breakdown of territorial unity and inhibited the emergence of an early modern state. Janssen’s primary interest in this book, written as his dissertation for the University of Osnabrück, is analysis of the development of political-religious policy. The work’s principal value accrues from the wide range of archival sources he has employed. Readers hoping for new insight on issues related to women and power will be disappointed. Only four works concerning women in the Reformation period are included in the forty-six page bibliography, and the author makes no more than passing reference to them in his text. The book will be of greatest use to scholars investigating the unusual confluence of

religious and political interests which occurred in this border region during the middle and later years of the Reformation and contributed, among other things, to the emergence of German and Dutch Reformed Churches.

SEABURY-WESTERN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY,  
EVANSTON,  
ILLINOIS

PAULA S. D. BARKER

*Islam in Britain, 1558–1685*. By Nabil Matar. Pp. xi + 226. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £37.50. 0 521 62233 6

In *Islam in Britain*, Nabil Matar elucidates for the first time what he rightly argues has been a neglected topic: the influence of Islam on the life and imagination of the early modern English. For many in seventeenth century England the ‘Moors’ were all too real a presence as pirates who destabilised commerce, captured English ships and enslaved their crews. Worse still, many of those captured converted to Islam and, seduced by the power and wealth of the Ottoman empire, opted to ‘turn Turk’. Though the numbers were not large, their impact was great, as is evidenced by the figure of the renegade, ‘the new villain in England’s conflict with the AntiChrist’, who appeared regularly on the early modern stage as a symbol of depravity. In more elite circles the attitude to Islam was more ambiguous. Though in eschatological thought there was a strand of anti-Moslem racism, the Koran was translated, purchased and read by Anglican and Puritan gentry; and Arab texts were acknowledged by the learned to be important repositories of alchemical, astrological and scientific knowledge. Indeed during the 1640s and 1650s thinkers influential with the English republic, Comenius for example, zealously anticipated the conversion of the Moslem. After 1660, while popular anxiety mounted over the new Turkish invasion – the coffee houses where some proprietors wore turbans and, it was feared, sought to seduce Christians with their new ‘Turkish spell’ – other developments eased the fears of Islam. Indeed some Anglican rationalists believed that their religion could be accommodated to the Church, even that the Moors might be allies in the battle against atheism. By the end of the seventeenth century, with the legendary Janissaries defeated at the siege of Vienna, with English commerce to Turkey expanding and Turks frequent visitors to London, the Moors ceased to be universally demonised. But for the century that preceded 1683, the Turk stood as a symbol and locus of anxiety – anxiety about sex and masculinity, about national security, the fate of Christianity and the nature of English identity. In arguing for the Moor as defining ‘other’, Matar at times pushes his case too hard. On the other hand he needed to analyse more fully the various histories of the Turk from Richard Knolles to Paul Rycaut, Joseph Grelot and Joseph Pitts, as texts of indigenous anxieties as well as observations of the Ottoman. But if this short book is not the last word on England and Islam, it opens not only that important subject but new chapters in the histories of national identity and empire which await exploration.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

KEVIN SHARPE



*Prayer book and people in Elizabethan and early Stuart England.* By Judith Maltby. (Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.) Pp. xvii + 313 incl. 6 plates, 12 figs and 28 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £40. 0 521 45313 5

*The private life of an Elizabethan lady. The diary of Lady Margaret Hoby, 1599–1605.* Edited by Joanna Moody. Pp. lvii + 254 incl. frontispiece and 30 ills. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 1998. £25. 0 7509 1349 5

*Religion and society in early Stuart England.* By Darren Oldridge. Pp. viii + 172. Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998. £35. 1 85928 312 8

Here are three very different works exploring the broad spectrum of religious experience in early modern England. One book offers a courageous attempt to chart the perceptions of hitherto neglected ‘conformists’; one seeks to revive interest in Puritanism as a cause of the Civil War; the third supplies us with the diary of a godly lady. While the first two are heavily embroiled in modern debates about the effects of the Reformation, the concepts of Arminianism and Laudianism and religious causes of the Civil War, the last eschews controversy in favour of a scholarly edition of the text.

The book which attempts most has achieved most. Judith Maltby has produced a pioneering work; if it has flaws, they stem chiefly from the difficulties of moving in largely uncharted, difficult territory. She is working in a veritable minefield, both in terms of the sources at her disposal, and the vested interests of many who wish to argue differently about her topic. The book seeks to explore the culture of conformity to the Church of England and its liturgy in the period after the Reformation and before the outbreak of the Civil War. Primarily through use of church court material, and parliamentary petitions of the early 1640s, Maltby seeks to reveal people who were neither Puritans nor ‘Laudians’; she is searching for genuine middle ground – possibly occupied by many – which we would refer to after the Restoration as the bedrock of an ‘Anglican’ Church. She is at pains to argue that this group should not be confused with ‘church papists’, nor were they a body of ‘spiritual leftovers’ who waited to provide Laud with tacit support in the 1630s; these people were sincere believers in the liturgy who also saw value in episcopacy.

Maltby is very honest about her sources and methods. Church court material is notoriously difficult to handle and has been largely mined for arguments about dissent. She explores a number of cunning ways in which to extract evidence of conformists using these courts for their own ends to put pressure on clerical and lay nonconformists. Where she is on stronger ground, however, is with the petitions which she analyses systematically to reveal support for both Church and bishops in the 1640s, support which she shows to have been fairly widespread across social groupings for her chosen Cheshire sample. Maltby makes particularly good use of her unrivalled knowledge of the career of Sir Thomas Aston to probe motives behind, and the organisation of, these petitions. It may be argued that too much of the evidence is gleaned from cases showing lay reaction to clerical nonconformity, that some of that evidence relates to chapelries where non-residence rather than nonconformity was the issue, and that the petitions reveal social cohesion brought about by the very chaos of the early 1640s, which does not really tie neatly with cases observed over a longer period. Yet Maltby bravely exposes these tensions in her argument and should be

congratulated for attempting to place her topic within a long timescale, despite the fact that her best evidence comes from the end of the period.

Darren Oldridge should also be congratulated for attempting to provide a fresh angle on religion and society in this period. In a rather idiosyncratic fashion, he tries to chart a ‘third way’ between historians who have argued for and against the significance of Arminianism, provides evidence that major changes did, however, occur in the 1630s under William Laud, but resurrects material which also blames Puritans in their own right – rather than simply reactivated by Laudian bishops – for the origins of the Civil War. Oldridge sets a clear course throughout, well-illustrated by material drawn from record offices in the Midlands and East Anglia, but readers should be wary of some of his claims for much of this work is carried out in an historiographical vacuum. His nods in the direction of modern debates are made in rather simplistic, black-and-white fashion. Nicholas Tyacke is painted into a corner which ignores his own contribution to our knowledge of Puritanism made in a memorable lecture to the Friends of Dr Williams’s Library published in 1990. The work of notable scholars like Peter Lake, Kenneth Fincham and Anthony Milton scarcely receives mention in this book, and there is little engagement with the seminal work of Ann Hughes on Warwickshire.

Oldridge has produced a ‘curate’s egg’ of a book. It is clear and readable, yet lacks real context; more could have been said about the sources upon which the book is based, yet rich case studies do work well, particularly on his strong suit, revealing the complexity of Puritanism in this region. The book is strong on the 1630s, and does not succumb to the current revisionist fad of attempting to explain the Civil War without reference to the Jacobean period. Fascinating material on that period is in fact buried within useful tables of church court cases. Useful insights are offered on the work of Bishop Wright and Bishop Overall, even if Nicholas Tyacke would argue with the classification of Christopher Potter as a sound Calvinist. Excellent material is revealed on the campaigns to repair and beautify churches. Like Maltby, Oldridge reveals an interesting spectrum of religious beliefs in his communities, which he surely correctly identifies as having many connections and overlaps, even if the argument for Puritan ‘mutations’ seems a little far-fetched. In sum, a valuable work, but all is not necessarily as simple as it seems.

Joanna Moody has produced an excellent edition of a diary kept by Lady Margaret Hoby between 1599 and 1605. It reveals a godly lady passing her days earnestly at prayer, regularly reading her Bible, attending and discussing sermons, and keeping up with theological controversy, aided largely in all this, not mainly by her husband, but by the household chaplain, Mr Rhodes. The diary shows how godly Puritans also kept up with works produced by Catholic controversialists, in order to be ever ready to convert any Catholics with whom they came into contact; quite a few in Lady Hoby’s case as she lived for the most part in Yorkshire. Maltby would no doubt appreciate the fact that Lady Hoby attended quite a variety of church services in different locations, invariably took communion, and seems to have been generally satisfied with the services. The diary is a useful source of information about current medical practice and gardening; it reveals how Lady Hoby travelled frequently to London and also had opportunity to visit York regularly. Joanna Moody has written a valuable

introduction which extracts much meat from what is in fact a rather repetitive diary in which very little of note occurs.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,  
CHICHESTER

ANDREW FOSTER

*Robert Persons S.J. The Christian directory (1582). The first booke of the Christian exercise, appertayning to resolution.* Edited by Victor Houliston. (Studies in the History of Christian Thought, 84.) Pp. lx + 403. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 1998. Nlg 270. 90 04 11009; 0081 8607

As Victor Houliston, the editor of this new edition of the Jesuit Robert Persons's famous *Christian directory*, points out, Persons's book was 'probably the most popular devotional work to appear in English before 1650'. It is mentioned in many contemporary sources as having had a crucial determining influence on many people, many of whom were not Catholics, for example Richard Baxter. Some scholars have already dealt with the issue of the book's origins, and the extent to which Persons relied on the work of others. Yet it has probably not attracted the attention which it deserves. Houliston's admirable edition will help to rectify this. It is significant, in fact, that this edition has come from a scholar of English literature, a specialist in rhetoric who has understood the power of Persons's writing as a form of discourse and has not limited his textual treatment of it to the sometimes narrow canons of 'Catholic' history. Houliston stresses, however, that the text is relevant both to deciphering Persons's extraordinary character, and the impact of the Counter-Reformation in England, since its composition began as a result of the Jesuit mission to England in 1580. So it will be of interest to historians as well as theologians and students of spirituality. The introduction explains concisely how the book came to be written, and how the writing intersected with Persons's other activities. It describes the process of revision, how Protestant editions emerged, and what, exactly, were the sources which Persons used for the book. (This clears up a lot of previous confusion.) There is an excellent account of the printing history of the work. The extensive critical apparatus is also very welcome.

HORLEY,  
SURREY

MICHAEL QUESTIER

*European universities in the age of Reformation and Counter Reformation.* Edited by Helga Robinson-Hammerstein. Pp. x + 203 incl. 4 ill. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1998. £30. 1 85182 318 2

This volume contains nine essays on universities in the early modern period. No fewer than five relate to the foundation and early history of Trinity College, Dublin. Of the remaining essays, Mordechai Feingold is concerned with the role of Aristotelian learning in the English universities in the seventeenth century, Willem Frijhoff highlights a conflict between Leiden and Amsterdam in 1631 to illustrate the varying forms of advanced education that arose to challenge the traditional university, and Gernot Heiss and Gian Paolo Brizzi explore the involvement of the Jesuits in education, the former in Austrian lands and the

latter in the Italian universities. One common theme that is detectable in a number of the essays is the idea that universities of the early modern period understood one of their tasks to be the ‘civilising of manners’ as a means of improving the social order and inculcating a greater level of obedience to the constituted government. Another common theme is the degree to which universities were losing their cosmopolitan character and were becoming prestigious symbols of national or regional political power, designed to enhance the standing of kings, princes or municipalities, and sometimes used to advance a particular religious persuasion. As mentioned, the five essays on Ireland give a detailed insight into the establishment and early history of Trinity College, Dublin, founded in 1592. James Murray discusses the complex political, religious, educational and ‘civilising’ motives that underlay the series of attempts to launch a university in Ireland from the reign of Edward VI to the late sixteenth century. That a university was not founded until 1592 meant that many Irish youths received their education in Catholic universities or colleges on the continent, so impeding the cause of Protestantism in Ireland. Helga Robinson-Hammerstein argues that Archbishop Adam Loftus, the first Provost of Trinity College, had advocated a humanist brand of education for Trinity and had helped to make it into a ‘Puritan’ elitist university, ‘the ideological counterpart of the Irish colleges abroad’ (p. 52). Alan Ford’s analysis of the students who matriculated at Trinity in its first half-century corrects previous flaws and misconceptions in the available evidence. Elizabethanne Boran surveys the crucial contributions made by Luke Challoner and James Ussher to building up Trinity’s early library and giving it a ‘Puritan’ emphasis, and she points out that when Ussher was archbishop of Armagh he appointed Puritans to academic posts at Trinity. Of the non-Irish essays, that by Gian Paolo Brizzi on the Jesuits and Italian universities has an unfinished air about it and is the least satisfactory in the volume. Given the expansive title of this book, there is perhaps an undue weighting towards Ireland. Nevertheless, this is a scholarly group of essays which merits the serious attention of all students of university history.

UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL

ALAN B. COBBAN

*Regulating the people. The Catholic Reformation in seventeenth-century Spain.* By Allyson M. Poska. (Cultures, Beliefs & Traditions. Medieval and Early Modern Peoples, 5.) Pp. ix + 179 incl. 4 figs, 8 tables and 3 maps. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 1998. Nlg 140. 90 04 11036 4; 1382 5364

*Valets de Dieu, Suppôts du Diable. Ermites et réforme catholique dans l’Espagne des Habsbourg (1550–1700).* By Alain Saint-Saëns. (First edition. Iberian Studies, 31.) Pp. 279 incl. 3 colour plates and 12 ills. New Orleans: Presses Universitaires du Nouveau Monde, 1998. 1 889431 26 5

Despite the existence of a number of local studies on the religious life of Christian Spain in early modern times, we continue to know very little about the subject. The two relatively short books under review illustrate avenues that can profitably be explored. Allyson M. Poska’s study of just over 150 pages is devoted to the north-west province of Spain, Galicia, and is based exclusively on the documentation of the bishopric and town of Ourense. It is a careful and

sympathetic analysis of Galician religion, looking closely at parish structures, the state of the clergy, the evolution of confraternities and the practice of religion. The greater part of her exposition centres on using the parish records to define structures of birth, marriage and death; this is done with appropriate diagrams. Scholars who know the field will find few surprises, for Poska's work brings Galicia into line with work that has been done by researchers for other parts of Catholic Europe and is in that sense a fine, solid achievement. I have a serious doubt only on one, not unimportant, point. On no secure evidence she states that Galicia had a 'relaxed rural morality' (p. 104), and seems to consider illegitimate all children born of pre-nuptial intercourse, a definition of illegitimacy not normally employed by demographic historians. This is a lucidly written and intelligent study that makes one wish the author had extended the scope of her researches to other related aspects of Galician culture.

Alain Saint-Saëns is the author of several valuable studies on aspects of Golden Age culture, and on his present theme – hermits – has already published a study on *La nostalgie du désert: l'idéal érémitique en Castille au Siècle d'Or* (1993). The present book takes the form of an extended essay of 120 pages (the notes account for 140 pages more) on the place of the hermits in the structure of the official Church. The author has done substantial work in the diocesan archives of six leading Spanish dioceses, and has read all the relevant secondary literature; with this, he has produced a fascinating and very detailed incursion into the personal world of the hermits – who they were, what they did, why they did it and in what context. His theme is revealed in the section headings he has chosen. The first part of the book describes the role of the hermit in society, the second part discusses the hostility of society to the hermit. He shows brilliantly how the hermit represented in traditional Spain both a widely accepted Christian ideal and an important feature of everyday religion (hermits were often caretakers of the many shrines that dotted the countryside). There were even women hermits. However, as he points out in his conclusion, 'in Habsburg Spain the hermit personifies the end of a world and the slow agony of a way of life that had endured for centuries'. The new, reforming Church simply had no place for hermits, and they were phased out. This is a delightful, learned and suggestive piece of work.

HIGHER COUNCIL FOR SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH,  
BARCELONA

HENRY KAMEN

*The French-speaking reformed community and their church in Southampton, 1567–c. 1620.*

By Andrew Spicer. (Southampton Records Series, 39.) Southampton:

University of Southampton, 1997. 0 85432 647 2

Refugees from Valenciennes, Tournai and Armentières, fleeing the Dutch Revolt, founded the reformed community of Southampton in 1567. In this they were supported by Archbishop Grindal, Bishop Horne of Winchester and – with qualifications – Sir William Cecil. They were joined by Huguenots from northern France, following the Massacre of St Bartholomew. Walloon religious usages continued to dominate, however. Spicer explains in detail the small community's early economic success, attributable to good commercial relations between the Low Countries, France and Southampton, special skills in the vigorous

production of 'new drapery' cloth, and easy communications with the francophone Calvinists of the Channel Islands' entrepôts. The industry and attitudes characteristic of refugee communities may also have been significant. He goes on to describe the church's decline in the period before the Revocation of the Edict of Nantes, to be accounted for by returns to the continent, the migration of economically successful members to London, intermarriage and the disastrous effects of plague in 1604. Relations with the burghers of Southampton were peaceable and mutually advantageous, even if the most successful French-speaking merchants were excluded from the social elite until the early seventeenth century. The book contributes to strands in the recent historiography of the Reformation period in England, in particular illustrating the diversity of sixteenth-century religious practice, and its accommodation by local communities.

ISLAND ARCHIVES SERVICE,  
GUERNSEY

DARRYL OGIER

*Le Verbe et la voix. La manifestation vocale dans le culte en France au XVIIe siècle.* By Monique Brulin. (Théologie Historique, 106.) Pp. vii + 507. Paris: Beauchesne, 1998. 2 7010 1375 5

In the efflorescence of writings on spirituality in France in the second half of the seventeenth century and the early eighteenth, there was a tendency to elevate the interior experience above the exterior manifestation of Christian devotion. Monique Brulin shows that the dangers of this preference were appreciated by contemporaries, and a search was being made for a judicious balance. First, she goes to the catechisms. Trent assumes interior prayer to be the higher form, but Clermont and Bourges change the emphasis: spoken words define an inspiration and fix it in the mind, while providing the means for mutual edification; the usage of the Church follows that of Christ, who provided the definitive formula of prayer, while 'la nature de la chose en elle-Même' conforms with his divine injunction. Among the liturgiologists, the Oratorian Louis Thomassin (1686) assures us that in the mass, through the spoken word, we join the priest in offering the sacrifice, and join the whole host of heaven in praising God. Of the spiritual writers, Nicole (1679) considers prayer should be offered in conjunction with the prayers of the whole Church, for the religious mind working in isolation is in danger of being taken over by self-satisfaction. Though Duguet (1705–6) holds that interior prayer is higher, he urges us to appropriate to ourselves, from hymns and psalms, the sentiments which we cannot formulate unaided; therefore, he proposes reforms to ensure that public worship is accessible and understandable to all. These three writers were Jansenists. By contrast, the Quietists, despite all Brulin's efforts to show otherwise, seem to pay only an unenthusiastic tribute to the external cult. Next, Brulin offers a remarkable study of 'Soupirs, gémissement, jubilation', the emotions identified by the seventeenth-century writers as most suitable to be expressed in public worship, and here, the citation of literary examples moves on to musical ones. There is a splendid example of the 'gémissement' in *Les Ô de l'Avent* (1681) – the nine anthems *O Sapientia, O Radix*

*Jesse* and so on. The rest of the volume, 200 pages, concerns music exclusively, and shows, by references to actual compositions as well as to the musicological writings of the day, that a sophisticated effort was being made to offer the laity a more harmonious and expressive way of singing with which they could identify – all the while insisting, however, on the classical virtue of *bienséance*. Between Dom Jumilhac's *La Science et la pratique du plain-chant* (1673) and Le Cerf de la Viéville's *Discours sur la musique d'Église* (1706) comes the brilliant contribution of Guillaume-Gabriel Nivers, organist of the royal chapel, his collection of seventy motets exemplifying the new musical style he had tried out earlier in his *Antiphonaire monastique* (1677), and recommended in his theoretical *Dissertation sur le chant grégorien* (1683). Throughout the volume, the somewhat disillusioning routines of churchgoing practice are set in contrast to the ideals of the spiritual writers, liturgiologists and musicologists. There is also some analysis of the answers given by these writers to practical problems concerning public worship: what is the best tone of voice and technique for saying the offices? Why use Latin rather than the vernacular? Why is the eucharistic prayer offered in secret? Why can't women play a full part in the singing of choirs? This gives the book a rich texture and wider relevance, but the essential achievement is the study of music and spirituality in alliance; so often they are treated in isolation from each other and only integrated with the general history of the church in a perfunctory fashion.

ALL SOULS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

JOHN McMANNERS

*The fire of tongues. António Vieira and the missionary Church in Brazil and Portugal.* By Thomas M. Cohen. Pp. xi + 264. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1998. £30 (\$49.50). 0 8047 2907 7

This book examines the career and thought of António Vieira (1608–97), colonial Brazil's most celebrated Jesuit. A brief account is given of Vieira's early life: the move with his family to Brazil at the age of six, admission there to the Society of Jesus, the distinction achieved through his eloquence and literary gifts, and his return in 1641 to Portugal where he served as advisor and court preacher to King João IV. More detailed coverage begins with his period of mission leadership in Amazonia (1653–61), when he tried to establish amicable relations with the local colonists, avoiding the friction over the issue of Indian enslavement which had previously brought Jesuit work to an end in some other parts of Brazil. Nevertheless Vieira and his colleagues were expelled from the Amazon region as a result of the colonists' hostility, after losing royal support. He responded by developing a more radical anti-settler doctrine of missionary enterprise, bound up with prophetic writing in the *Bandarra* tradition, and calling for an unshakable Jesuit partnership with the Portuguese crown. Vieira now stressed the personal insights gained through his experience on the colonial frontier, and their superiority to orthodox metropolitan scholarship. Consequently he was recalled to Portugal and placed under arrest for a time by the Inquisition. Vieira's last years were spent back in Brazil, elaborating on the historic

evangelical role among the Amerindians to be fulfilled by the Jesuits through their linguistic skills ('the fire of tongues'). Cohen is most effective in his detailed analysis of Vieira's sermons and literary work. Interesting comparisons are made with Franciscan thought and Spanish America. However, fuller attention might usefully have been given to elucidating the seventeenth-century historical background, especially the tensions in Portuguese royal policy between its reliance as a matter of practical necessity on settler enterprise to secure Amazonia against rival European powers, and official concern over the resulting maltreatment of the native peoples. These tensions decisively influenced Vieira's later career.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

J. R. WARD

*The Kongolesse Saint Anthony. Dona Beatriz Kimpa Vita and the Antonian movement, 1684-1706.* By John K. Thornton. Pp. vii+228 incl. 5 ills and 2 maps. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £35 (cloth), £12.95 (paper). 0 521 59370 0; 0 521 59659 2

The subject of this study was a woman of the kingdom of Kongo in Central Africa, whose ruling elite had been converted to Christianity at the end of the fifteenth century. Dona Beatriz was executed by the local authorities in 1706, after leading a popular movement, on the basis of her claim to be possessed by St Anthony. The central purpose of this Antonian movement was to restore the unity of the Kongo kingdom, which had been riven by civil war through much of the seventeenth century; a project symbolised by her reoccupation of the former capital city São Salvador (Mbanza Kongo), which had been sacked and abandoned in 1678. To the extent that many of the captives taken in the Kongo civil wars were sold to European traders at the coast, the movement can also be understood as, by implication, one of protest against the damaging social impact of the trans-Atlantic slave trade. It also involved a challenge to the claim of the European (Spanish Capuchin) missionaries to be the sole authoritative interpreters of Christianity, not only through its claim to autonomous revelation, but also in seeking in some degree to reinterpret Christianity in terms of indigenous Kongolesse religious understanding. The interpretation of the Antonian movement offered in this book is not new, having also been outlined in Thornton's earlier book, *The kingdom of Kongo* (1983); its purpose, apart from detailed elaboration, is rather to provide a narrative account accessible to non-specialist readers, in which it succeeds admirably. That such a popular movement should take a specifically Christian form illustrates the degree to which Christianity had become absorbed and naturalised within Kongo society; and, given that large numbers of Kongolesse were sold into the trans-Atlantic slave trade, this African tradition of Christianity is relevant, as Thornton stresses, to understanding the evolution of religious culture in the slave societies of the Americas also. The Antonian movement can also be thought of as an early (indeed, presumably the earliest) instance in tropical Africa of the formation of 'independent' Christian churches, a phenomenon better known and more usually studied in the context of the period of European colonial rule from the



late nineteenth century onwards; however, Thornton makes no attempt to link his analysis with this wider literature on African independency.

UNIVERSITY OF STIRLING

ROBIN LAW

*Ancient faith and modern freedom in John Dryden's. The Hind and the Panther.* By Anne Barbeau Gardiner. Pp. xiii + 266. Washington, DC: Catholic University of American Press, 1998. £55.95. 0 8132 0898 X

This book is an impassioned and scholarly argument for the coherence and intelligence of Dryden's often under-rated and even despised poem in defence of his new Roman Catholic faith. In the first part Gardiner argues that the poem is extensively indebted to the biblical Song of Songs both for its imagery and its structure; her case is often illuminating but also on occasions pressed too far, producing some quite unconvincing readings. The second part charts points of contact between Dryden's poem and contemporary arguments about the political position of Catholics; again, the discussion repeatedly clarifies the text, but sometimes imposes strained interpretations on the poem. The second half will be particularly useful for ecclesiastical historians for its accounts of debates over the Test Acts and other legislation, though both historians and literary scholars should note that the poem engages with other important aspects of religious belief and ecclesiastical practice which are more scantily dealt with, or passed over in silence, so that the book, for all its scholarship and commitment, delivers an overall impression of the poem and its contexts which is rather uneven.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

PAUL HAMMOND

*Krise der Leiblichkeit. Die Sozietät der Mutter Eva (Buttlarsche Rotte) und der radikale Pietismus um 1700.* By Willi Timme. (Arbeiten zur Geschichte des Pietismus, 35.) Pp. 486. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1998. DM 158, 3 525 53819 8

*Deutsche Spätaufklärung und Pietismus. Ihr Verhältnis im Rahmen kirchlich-bürgerlicher Reform bei Johann Ludwig Ewald (1748–1822).* By Hans-Martin Kirn. (Arbeiten zur Geschichte des Pietismus, 34.) Pp. 616. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1998. DM 1998. 3 525 55818 x

These two blockbusters, recent additions to the series of *Arbeiten zur Geschichte des Pietismus* based on doctoral dissertations, show both that the quality and quantity of work in the field of Pietism grow no less, and that one of the drawbacks of the German system of subsidised publication is that scholars, spared the intense pressure to economise on space which is applied in Britain, may be tempted to luxuriate self-indulgently. In the case of Willi Timme's volume this may be in the long run an advantage. The Buttlar Gang was gathered by Evan Buttlar who was descended from the Lutheran line of a well-known Hessian family. Her mother was fifty-two when she was born, and her father died soon afterwards. Sent away to the corrupt Eisenach court, she married a shady character, the French-Reformed court dancing-master. In 1697 she resolved to live as a holy woman and eventually left her husband, gathering a philadelphian society. She

now gave it out that her lover, a theologian called Winter, and a medical student from Jena were God the Father and God the Son while she was God the Holy Spirit. Thus a familial view of the Godhead and holy family was established and promiscuity (somewhat squashily practised four to a bed, but nattily performed in nightshirts and woollen caps) was a route not to pleasure but to purification, and in the case of initiates who got to sleep with Eva herself (she being the Second Eve who undid the damage of the first) to the New Birth. Their names were recorded in a book like that of Don Giovanni but on a smaller scale. Should any critic (and of course they were legion) still believe that recreational motives were supreme, the group also practised what was called female circumcision, which satisfied symbolic demands for blood but proved an unreliable method of contraception; failure here could be rectified by murder of the offspring. In the last century there were only three attempts to write the history of this group, the best of them by the admirable Max Goebel; Timme, an apt pupil of his master Hans Schneider in dredging up every conceivable crumb of information, has surely spared us any more. He also labours valiantly to make sense of it all. His crisis of *Leiblichkeit* is what happened in an atmosphere of intense apocalyptic expectation at the end of considerable series of ecstatic pronouncements by servant girls and other ladies. Not only nature and Scripture but also the body was a vehicle of revelation; and in the case of the Buttlar Gang a Trinitarian one at that. Their nearest spiritual relative was Antoinette Bourignon.

Hans-Martin Kirn's huge offering is a concession made to the demand for the recognition of late Pietism as a distinct period of inquiry made by his master, Martin Brecht; and it is of exceptional interest to British readers. Kirn perceives towards the end of the eighteenth century a division of spirits not merely within Pietism but within the Enlightenment also, and it was Ewald's achievement to grasp the possibility of an alliance between a reasonable Pietism and the more anti-intellectual kind of Enlightenment against the religiously desiccated views of thinkers like Kant. In this respect he has much in common with Schleiermacher, and as a working churchman he was able to implement his views over a wide range of practical issues. On the psychological side he gained a good deal of assistance from Lavater and his Zurich circle, but the key to what he was aiming at was the conviction that Pietism had successfully plundered mysticism from the leisure industry and rooted it in a democratic workaday world. Mysticism seemed to him a defence not merely against unfeeling rationalism, but against an orthodoxy which maintained the doctrine of the Trinity but could not defend it; and it was worth defending mysticism against charges of enthusiasm and world-denying Quietism. In short Ewald came back to the position with which the English evangelicals had begun, and which by the end of the eighteenth century they were abandoning. The aged Wesley purging his brother's hymns of mysticism is a telling picture. Whether Ewald or his English counterparts took the more fruitful turn is a question well worth going into. At any rate Ewald's side of the matter is here admirably worked out.

PETERSFIELD

W. R. WARD

*A history of the Church of Ireland, 1691–1996.* By Alan Acheson. Pp. 295 incl. 1 map and 1 ill. + 16 plates. Dublin: The Columba Press/APCK, 1997. £25. 1 85607 210 X

Since Richard Mant's two-volume *History of the Church of Ireland* (1840), there has been a steady stream of works attempting to document the oscillating fortunes of Irish Anglicanism. In recent times the pace of publication has quickened: notable offerings have been made by Donald Harman Akenson, Desmond Bowen, Alan Ford and Kenneth Milne, among others. However important these contributions, readers did not have access to a one-volume history of the Anglican Church in Ireland. That omission now has been remedied by Alan Acheson, writing with all the insights – and some of the limitations – of an informed insider, Acheson has produced a useful and clear account which for some time will be regarded by both lay and clerical readers as the standard history of the Church of Ireland. By necessity the author paints with large brush strokes across a wide canvas, though he occasionally fills in the spaces with precise and detailed markings. Much of the strength of the work lies in its assessment of the High Church tradition of the Caroline divines, especially concerning the career of Archbishop William King, and in its treatment of the abiding contribution of the evangelical revival of the nineteenth century. In the intervening period, although the clergy were often too subservient to the 'English interest', the Church was sustained at the parochial level by faithful adherence to the catholic and apostolic teachings of the previous century. Acheson's detailed treatment of the evangelical revival warrants special consideration. Unlike the lost Reformation of a previous generation, the revival prospered primarily 'because it won the allegiance, and harnessed the energy, wealth and authority, of significant numbers of laity' (p. 124). It permeated many spheres of Irish society, benefiting from a close association with the intellectual cradle of Irish Anglicanism, Trinity College, Dublin. Its numerous clerical associations provided opportunities for theological investigation and for mutual support, while its extensive network of voluntary societies advanced the gospel, provided charitable and emergency relief (especially during the various famines), and supported overseas missions with both capital and manpower. Moreover, it provided a number of the Church's most influential parochial clergy, bishops and archbishops. But the revival also provoked disquiet: episcopal opposition to 'serious religion' persisted for some time; more importantly (and largely ignored in the narrative), a number of prominent lay and clerical evangelicals seceded outright from the Church, forming small independent sects or (in the case of John Nelson Darby and his allies) setting in motion one of the most influential new Protestant movements of the nineteenth century, the Plymouth Brethren. Acheson's assessment of the Church during the twentieth century, which naturally concentrates on political and social issues, is less successful. While Robin Eames's influence on the peace process receives extensive treatment, the ecumenical contributions of Henry McAdoo are entirely overlooked. Overall, this portrayal of the recent history of the Church would appear very different if viewed from the vantage point of the twenty-six southern counties. An additional quibble is that, though the contributions of women are mentioned from time to time, a thorough assessment of their role in the life of the Church has not been attempted. Scholars and general readers alike are much indebted to Alan Acheson for producing this splendid and very readable book.

It is to be hoped that this valuable survey will point the way toward more specialist studies which will fill in some of the remaining gaps in the history of the Church of Ireland.

METHODIST COLLEGE,  
FAYETTEVILLE,  
NC

GRAYSON CARTER

*German and Scandinavian Protestantism, 1700–1918.* By Nicholas Hope. (Oxford History of The Christian Church.) Pp. xxviii + 685. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995. £75. 0 19 826923 4

This is a capacious, meandering book, broad in scope, meticulous and sensitive in its judgements and illuminated by an affection for the traditional usages of Protestant parochial Christianity. As Hope recognises, a history of ‘Protestantism’ in Germany and Scandinavia must be at once a history of church architectures, of sermon and literature, of university faculties, of clergymen and their stipends, of networks of patronage, of music both sacred and profane, of popular spirituality and prayer, of bourgeois lay voluntarism, of kingship, of the state and its modernising incursions upon the locality, of policy, and politics and constitutions, of charity and missions and, not least, of theology. And a history of these interdependent spheres of activity must somehow almost make sense of the profound transformations wrought over two centuries by war, Enlightenment, revolution and the rise of the post-Napoleonic state. In aiming for maximum comprehensiveness, Hope’s book confronts head-on the fundamental and intrinsic difficulty of the ‘history of religion’, namely that its subject matter is so deeply and widely woven into the fabric of life. This is not a text that marches across its appointed terrain confirming certitudes and verifying theories. It is not, as Hope concedes in his preface, a *libre à thèse* that attempts a ‘definitive view’, but rather a ‘long exploratory essay’. Herein lie both the merits and the frustrations of the book.

Throughout the first half of the volume, the central focus is on the enormous variety of formal and informal arrangements that shaped the customary usages of Protestants in the parishes of early modern northern Europe. Although developments in state theory and jurisprudence foreshadowed the later growth of state intervention in church affairs and the gradual imposition of liturgical uniformity, the reality in eighteenth-century Europe was an enormous diversity of liturgies and customary practices that defied the homogenising prescriptions of theologians and government officials. Hope sees in this diversity evidence of the tenacity with which parochial Christians clung on to the observances of their forebears; hence, for example, the extraordinary persistence of Catholic rites among parishioners from Württemberg to Pomerania and Sweden. In some Danish Lutheran parishes visitation reports continued into the nineteenth century to note the observance of saints’ days, pilgrimages to holy wells and prayers for saintly intercession. Hope cautions us against under-estimating the forces of inertia in Protestant parochial churchmanship and its resistance to incursions from above. ‘Memory, a sense of belonging to the home parish, habit, seem always to have proven stronger than the political intervention or

enlightenment. Frederick the Great and his like passed one church statute after another to little avail.'

Emphasising the long-term continuities in local usage, Hope relativises the impact of the celebrated watershed movements – Pietism, Enlightenment, Awakening. He deflates the claims that have been made for the novelty of Pietism, for example, siding with those scholars who have stressed the diversity and vitality of the orthodox Lutheran theological tradition and setting the advent of Pietism within the context of a growing Lutheran preoccupation with the pastoral and ethical dimensions of faith. The foremost achievement of the Pietists, he implies, was not theological or spiritual, but organisational: it was above all the creation of a far-flung network of Pietist helpers (enjoying royal patronage in Prussia and Denmark) that enabled the movement to have such a transformative impact on clerical practice throughout Germany and Scandinavia. Hope's accounts of Enlightenment and Awakening are formulated in a similarly minor key. Until 1800 and beyond, he reminds us, religious life in most parish churches and homes continued to be shaped by the language and rites of sixteenth-century reform. 'Orthodoxy, Pietism and Enlightenment are useful perhaps for describing theological tendencies, but otherwise too convenient.'

Hope's accounts of the broader cultural dimension of his story are among the best in the book. There are engaging reflections, for example, on the ways in which the growing centrality of the sermon and an emphasis on the performative aspects of clerical office coincided with a trend in church architecture that set pulpits at the centre of churches and did away with pillars and vaulting to create unbroken blocks of space, in a style borrowed from the assembly houses of the Dutch Calvinists. And there is a fascinating chapter on what Hope calls 'rediscovery' – the nineteenth-century co-option of history and tradition in support of neo-confessional identities. The Bach revival, the beginnings of a canonical history of church music, and the ascendance of church history as an academic discipline were all part of a crystallisation of confessional and cultural allegiances in which the quest for authentic 'roots' blended with a heightened sense of the authority of history. Hope astutely links these developments with the Unionist project launched by Frederick William III after 1817.

The social and political history of the nineteenth-century Churches is less well handled. It is in the latter half of the book that the drawbacks to Hope's open-ended approach to narrative structure are most in evidence. He touches on most of the key transformations – the upheavals of the Napoleonic era, the emergence of a more confessionally aggressive state determined to supervise church finances, liturgical practice and clerical training, the Social Question of the 1830s and 1840s, the impact of rapid urbanisation on the traditional structures of charitable care, the endless debates and negotiations over the legal status and constitutional autonomy of ecclesiastical bodies. These developments are juxtaposed with endogenous impulses for change – the growth of missionary voluntarism, the modernisation of the pastorate, the advent of 'moral statistics', the formation of new and untested strategies for the evangelisation of the urban proletariat and the late nineteenth century's new flowering in church musicianship. But the handling of specific issues is more compressed and sketchy, the relationships between them less clearly implied, the narrative as a whole less coherent. Certain themes that have loomed large in recent scholarship are unaccountably absent: there is no

substantial discussion of antisemitism within and beyond the Churches, for example, or of the role of women.

The best passages of this book are those that set out to convey the diverse flavour of what Hope calls the ‘parishscape’ – the emotional intensity and cultural narrowness of rural parochial life, the cultural wealth of the great musical centres and the routines of worship and clerical office as the practical distillations of theology. This is, as Hope puts it in a telling metaphor, the ‘thorough bass’ of his narrative, and he renders it with empathy and real authority.

ST CATHARINE’S COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

CHRISTOPHER CLARK

*Strangers and pilgrims. Female preaching in America, 1740–1835.* By Catherine A. Brekus. (Gender and American Culture.) Pp. 466 incl. 23 ills. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1998. \$49.95 (cloth), \$17.95 (paper).  
o 8078 2441 0; o 8078 4745 3

In a long-awaited study that does not disappoint, Catherine Brekus offers a stunning example of ‘recovering voices’: she turned up more than a hundred exhorters and preachers in early America, women whose names and stories were heretofore unfamiliar to historians – and to proponents of women’s ordination. *Strangers and pilgrims* relies very heavily on the wider historiography, especially in the discussions of the Great Awakenings and in her analysis of the ways women used the market to spread the Gospel. But Brekus does score two important historiographical points: first, sawing away at Ann Douglas’s feminisation thesis, Brekus notes that ante-bellum women continued to ‘identif[y] with the demanding, all-powerful God of the Old Testament’, something Douglas’s view of ‘feminised’ faith does not recognise; second, arguing with a more recent plank of the feminisation platform, Brekus contends that Susan Juster’s notion of feminised sin is not ultimately compelling. Juster argued that Baptist women in New England during the Age of Revolution were accused of sexual misconduct more frequently than men because Baptists thought of women as licentious Eves scheming to lead men down the path of transgression. Brekus, however, suggests that evangelicals in this era did not think of women as lustful and depraved, but as “‘naturally’ pure and virtuous’, thus ‘they may have been especially shocked by “ungodly” women and hence more likely’ to punish them. (This observation is unfortunately buried in the footnotes.) On the whole, *Strangers and pilgrims* offers a compelling analysis of the vicissitudes of women’s preaching, a story that, Brekus asserts, is too complicated to be labelled ‘triumph’ or ‘decline’. In the revivals of the 1700s, Brekus argues, some women were allowed to preach; these eighteenth-century women ‘could exhort despite their sex, not because of it... [T]hey implied they had transcended the limits of their gender’. But by the Revolutionary era, women preachers were fewer. In fact, Brekus found so little evidence of evangelical women’s preaching in the Revolutionary Era that she is forced to discuss Jemima Wilkinson, a Quaker, and Ann Lee, the founder of the Shakers. By the early nineteenth century, however, evangelical women were preaching in ever increasing numbers. Brekus offers several reasons for the rise of

female preaching. First, Americans increasingly saw women, rather than men, as the guardians of civic virtue. Practical reasons also played a role into women's preaching: in the dissenting sects where women found greatest access to the pulpit, there were not enough male preachers and exhorters to go around. Theology figured in two ways. Offering the pulpit to women was one way sectarian churches could evince their self-conscious opposition to the world. Second, evangelicals who were firmly convinced that the apocalypse was at hand took literally Joel's proclamation that 'your...daughters shall prophesy' at the end times. By the 1830s, women's preaching was in decline. Evangelical men had begun to associate women preachers with radical women's rights advocates, although the female preachers and women's rights activists like Frances Wright were, in fact, antagonistic towards one another. Demographic and theological shifts were also central to the decline of female preaching: male preachers proliferated, so evangelicals were no longer compelled to rely on female preachers, and the apocalyptic rhetoric that had shaped theological space for women's 'prophesying' was tempered. Perhaps most importantly, the evangelicals who were once so counter-cultural were, by 1840, upwardly mobile and entrenched in the middle class – they no longer wanted women in the pulpit, but in respectable, domestic roles that bolstered the overall decorum of the movement. In the early 1840s, one group still welcomed women – the apocalyptic Millerites, who believed that Jesus would return on 22 October 1844. Like earlier evangelicals, the Millerites allowed women to preach for both practical and theological reasons: they needed as many preachers as they could get their hands on, and, most important, they took at face value Joel's declaration about women prophesying. After the Great Disappointment – that is, when Christ didn't show at the appointed time – female Millerite preachers drifted: some followed Ellen White into the Seventh-Day Adventists, others joined up with the Shakers or the Mormons. The Great Disappointment heralded not only the collapse of the Millerites, but also the end of one stage in the development of women's preaching in America. *Strangers and pilgrims* is necessary reading for students of American religion and any women preachers today who are interested in the rich tradition of which they, perhaps unknowingly, are a part.

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

LAUREN F. WINNER

*Methodism and the Southern mind, 1770–1810.* By Cynthia Lynn Lyerly. (Religion in America Series.) Pp. ix + 251. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998. £36. 0 19 511429 9

It is only during the last few years that scholars have come fully to appreciate the extent to which the era of the American Revolution was a pivotal phase in the history of slavery and race relations in the American South. Beginning in the mid eighteenth century, and accelerating during the years immediately following the War of American Independence, the relationship between owners and slaves, as well as between enslaved people themselves, would be fundamentally reshaped by the phenomenal growth of evangelical Protestantism. The Methodist and Baptist churches that sprang up everywhere in the Post-Revolutionary South comprised highly significant new institutional contexts for the voluntary

interaction of white and black, free and enslaved, coreligionists. Moreover, and as Cynthia Lyerly so eloquently relates in her splendid study, the expansion of the Methodist faith also had crucial implications for gender relations in the early National South. White women, from all social ranks in an increasingly patriarchal society, as well as enslaved people, were attracted to Methodism for many reasons. As Lyerly explains, those reasons included what was perceived as the promise of a spiritual equality that cut across divisions of race, rank and gender as well as an empowerment that derived from lay participation in every facet of their congregation's proceedings. White women and enslaved people overtly challenged the right traditionally claimed by white men, usually by elite white men, to be the sole founts of religious authority within their churches. The story that Lyerly tells in what is the first modern study of Methodism in the Revolutionary and early National South, focuses on the frustration of women's and enslaved people's struggle to assert themselves; to have their voices heard. Their claims threatened in the most fundamental way the elite white male ideal of an ordered and orderly society. Elite white men were not choosy in the means they employed to crush this dissent. Women, including some socially eminent women, who claimed the right to preach, were denounced as insane; it became increasingly difficult for enslaved people, men and women, to obtain licences to preach and those that ignored their church's attempts to silence them could find themselves being viciously beaten. Simultaneously, in an attempt to assert their respectability, church leaders abandoned their earlier opposition to chattel slavery. By the early nineteenth century the South's Methodist churches were characterised by the exercise of traditional patterns of male ecclesiastical authority. Lyerly's thoroughly researched and eminently readable book sheds entirely new light on the racial, class and gender dimensions of Methodism in the late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century American South. Most deservedly, it will remain the standard work on the subject for many years to come.

GIRTON COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

BETTY WOOD

*Jane Austen. The parson's daughter.* By Irene Collins. Pp. xxii + 282 incl. 21 ills + 21 plates. London: Hambledon Press, 1998. £20. 1 85285 172 4

In many ways this is a companion volume to Irene Collins's earlier work, *Jane Austen and the clergy*. That volume used Austen's life and writings to construct a portrait of the late Georgian clergy. This volume, by contrast, looks at Austen herself from a clerical perspective, emphasising the fact that she was the daughter of a clergyman, educated by her father and brought up in a world where many of her relations and acquaintances were also members of the clerical profession. Essentially, Collins has written a biography, concentrating on the years from Jane Austen's birth in 1775 to the retirement of her father, George, in 1801 and the family's departure from the parsonage at Steventon. There is no doubt that Collins's work provides some valuable new perspectives on Austen's life and attitudes. She highlights the significance of her early catechetical education, the importance of her access to her father's library, and the ambiguities of the social position and marriage possibilities of a clergyman's daughter. One is left in no



doubt that Austen was a deeply religious woman. What is equally clear is that her belief was characteristic of the mainstream of eighteenth-century Anglicanism, revealing little sympathy for evangelicalism, but instead treating Christianity as a reasonable and practical religion finding its expression in moral conduct and practice. Moreover, sensitive references to Austen's novels reveal the extent to which these principles informed her writings, and Collins concludes by quoting approvingly Archbishop Richard Whateley's opinion that they were clearly the work of 'a Christian writer'. Collins's study does, therefore, provide an interesting account of the Anglicanism of one particular lay woman at the end of the eighteenth century, but it offers little to specialists in the religious history of the period. She relies heavily on secondary works to provide the historical context, and these do sometimes lead her into error. The assertion that the clergy abandoned catechising in the first half of the eighteenth century will find little support in Ian Green's recent monograph, while few scholars will feel comfortable with the statement that the Anglican clergy believed that the sacraments were 'in themselves a sufficient means of salvation'. None the less, Collins does well what she sets out to do. Her emphasis on the religious context of Jane Austen's life is overdue and welcome. Anyone interested in the novels will find this a readable, stimulating and illuminating book.

UNIVERSITY OF READING

STEPHEN TAYLOR

*Providence and the Raj. Imperial mission and missionary imperialism.* By Gerald Studdert-Kennedy. Pp. 274. New Delhi–Thousand Oaks–London: Sage Publications, 1998. £35. 0 7619 9277 4; 81 7036 736 0

In this new study, Gerald Studdert-Kennedy builds on his *British Christians, Indian nationalists and the Raj* (1991). The theme of the present volume is providence, specifically the development of ways of interpreting the British Raj as a stage, or even the culmination of a divinely ordered historical development such that the agents of imperialism no less than the missionaries could see themselves as tools in the purposes of God, assisting in an historical progression towards the Kingdom of God. It was, on the whole, popular rather than critical history and theology which influenced the way generations of imperialists thought about their responsibilities, and we are much in Studdert-Kennedy's debt for demonstrating the deep significance of this kind of literature. There was, of course, much disagreement among missionaries and Christian administrators about the place of the Raj in the divine providential ordering. A heady vision was sustained and developed in Christian colleges and among the abler and more influential missionaries. Studdert-Kennedy studies in detail one of these colleges, Madras Christian College, which under William Millar had prodigious influence, particularly in imbuing generations of students who went into public life with a vision of national renewal in which British rule had a necessary, but temporary, place. In fascinating detail Studdert-Kennedy documents the raising up of a South Indian elite deeply shaped by the personalities and thought of a number of remarkable missionaries. This fascinating book deals in meticulous detail with dimensions of modern Indian history and their ramifications in Britain which in their time were of great importance but are commonly forgotten for a whole

range of reasons today. We are grateful to Dr Studdert-Kennedy for a significant work of historical retrieval which is important in itself and also a useful corrective to some fashionable emphases in recent Indian historiography.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

DUNCAN B. FORRESTER

*Anglikaner und Protestanten im Heiligen Land. Das gemeinsame Bistum Jerusalem (1841–1886)*. By Martin Lückhoff. (Abhandlungen des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins, 24.) Pp. xiv + 357. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1998. DM 98. 3 447 04011 4; 0173 1904

This Marburg dissertation offers a fairly comprehensive narrative history of the joint Anglo-Prussian bishopric in Jerusalem. Ease of travel, coupled with a revival of apocalyptic hopes for the restoration of the Jews, made Jerusalem a centre of pilgrimage and made a Protestant presence especially pressing. Drawing from a wide range of archival sources, and locating his study in the wider context of the struggle for political influence in the collapsing Ottoman empire, the author dispels many of the myths surrounding the endeavour. The guiding hand was the impetuous Bunsen, who was able to persuade Friedrich Wilhelm IV, as well as senior English churchmen, of the importance of having a common protector of Protestant Christians in Palestine. This required very little ecumenical agreement: the bishop, who was always to be in Anglican orders, merely served as leader to two communities of divergent belief and practice. There is no evidence to suggest (contrary to Pusey's belief) that the Prussian king sought to gain apostolic succession for his own Church by the back door. However, from the beginnings of the enterprise under Alexander there were tensions, particularly over a German-speaking parish. Missionary work among the indigenous Christians was a constant source of disagreement. Under the long-serving Gobat (the Prussian king's nomination), the diocese took on many German characteristics, especially in diaconal and educational work. Eventually, political developments and the growth of the German presence in Palestine made the renewal of the bishopric impossible in 1886. Overall, this is a workmanlike account which is strong on detail, particularly from the German side, but weaker in its assessment of the historical importance of the venture for both Church and State.

RIPON COLLEGE,  
CUDDESDON,  
OXFORD

MARK D. CHAPMAN

*‘Wem wollt ihr glauben?’ Bischof Berning im Dritten Reich*. 2nd edn. By Klemens-August Recker. Pp. 528 + 38 plates. Paderborn: Schöningh, 1998. DM 68. 3 506 77055 1

This makes a weighty contribution to understanding the Churches during Nazi rule. Among Catholic bishops of those years there is almost a class list, with courage at the top (Galen and Preysing) and feebleness at the bottom (Cardinal Bertram); and not far above Bertram, Berning of Osnabrück. He won the

reputation of being 'the Nazi bishop'. During 1933 he shared in the Gadarene rush which swept the German people and persuaded so many of them that Hitler was wonderful. In consequence Goering invited him to be a member of the Prussian cabinet, and he accepted; and though this cabinet became powerless after three years, even the Vatican believed that from his seat he could influence Nazis. Then in June 1936 he went to a prison camp in his diocese and made a speech to prisoners and another to warders of the 'Splendid work you do' variety of episcopal utterance. Outside Germany it was believed that he blessed the system of concentration camps. The Nazi press used his visit to full effect. For this he was not forgiven. Excellently based on archives, this book is revealing. The heart bleeds, watching someone with moral standards who thinks the Versailles Treaty wicked, and is fierce against Bolshevism, and is willing to talk of blood and soil, and believes that this movement may rescue Germany, and accepts that race is a fact of life and Germans ought to be proud; and realises, from 1937 onwards, that the only thing left is to save vestiges of moral life and do what he can for individuals persecuted; and perceives that if he talks too loud it is not he who will suffer but his clergy – a number in concentration camps but fewer than from the diocese of the bolder Galen. One priest said 'bishops can be heroes but it is we who take the consequences'. In 1938–9 Berning could thank God and the Führer that Austria and the Sudetens were reunited to their fatherland without the shedding of blood, in 1940 he could thank soldiers and Führer for victory in France, and then back invading Russia, citing the pope's condemnation of Bolshevism, in the year when churchmen fought the Nazis over euthanasia. Yet the reader comes, not to like Berning, but to feel warmth for a troubled man trying to do right in impossible circumstances. There are sidelights: more evidence of the brutality of a regime which enjoyed killing innocent Germans. The stories of the Lübeck curates, and of Berning's efforts to save the life of Julius Leber, are painful in the extreme. Here is new evidence about Cardinal Bertram, which makes him ever feebler; though other bishops took too easy a shelter under his refusal to act. And there is an important date. The Vatican had no sure knowledge of what happened to Jews in the east until the last days of September 1942. Berning received clear evidence from a reliable witness eight months earlier, on 5 February 1942.

SELWYN COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK

*Die evangelische Kinderpflege und die Innere Mission in der Zeit des Nationalsozialismus. Mobilmachung der Gemeinden, I: 1933 bis 1937.* By Rainer Bookhagen. (Arbeiten zur kirchlichen Zeitgeschichte. Reihe B, Darstellungen, 29.) Pp. 647. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1998. DM 148. 3 525 55729 9

This is the first volume of an exhaustive and timely study of Protestant childcare under National Socialism. It was seen as a primary task of the voluntary charitable agencies run by the Innere Mission to win back Christian stragglers, especially the young in a new 'secular' world after 1918. Figures for 1935 show 2,855 *Kindergarten* run by 4,278 nursery teachers with 178,572 places (p. 261) centered (1,622) in south-western Germany (Württemberg 468, Baden 327,

Rhineland 319, Nassau 257, Westphalia 251); in the rest of Germany only Berlin (165) with its urban hinterland – Brandenburg (176), Prussian Saxony (104) and Silesia (285) – and Bavaria (149) maintained over a hundred nurseries each. Bookhagen takes the reader straight into a hot debate about voluntary or public sector welfare, mixing the two, and the strained relationship between a national Innere Mission framework and the historic Protestant German plurality of provincial Churches. A brief introduction to these two key issues in the context of disruption by war, revolution and a new republican order would have been a helpful guide to the very disturbing development thereafter which Bookhagen records here. There was, it seems, no end of debate, resolutions, programmatic statements and institutional reorganisation. One might indeed label the 1920s and 1930s as the dawn of the Protestant German institutional acronym (listed in ten pages of abbreviations). What is clear is that following a child's development as Oberlin or Fröbel wished, came always second to a nationalistic childcare politics dominated by men and women who were more concerned with ventilating their prejudices against the Weimar Republic and its alleged pagan order, and in pinning their hopes in a national and *völkisch* German revival as the best vehicle for their Protestant mission to the young. William Temple's notion of 'service' to a democratic and plural Christian community takes on a quite different tone here. This Protestant German popular mission meant embracing Nazi 'positive Christianity', a shortlived Nazi *Reichskirche*, and the new Nazi welfare agency (NSV) which ran 1,700 nurseries already in 1935 (p. 312). It was, therefore, too late in the following spring, when provincial Innere Mission agencies rang the alarm bells for the first time (pp. 317f.) about an imperative need to return to serving the Christian community. A stormtrooper garrison facing a local Innere Mission nursery on the opposite bank of the Wupper river did its work evidently only too well with its brass band and its rousing singing of 'Die Fahne hoch': 'the children click their heels together, raise their right arms and march as if they were themselves SA', so the nursery activity report (p. 259). Aryan or non-Aryan, the exclusion of the weak and handicapped – all of this followed inevitably in the Protestant German nursery. And not from a lack of debate on the politics of childcare.

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

NICHOLAS HOPE

*Ronald Jasper. His life, his work and the ASB.* By Donald Gray. Pp. x + 154. London: SPCK, 1997, £30. 0 281 04976 9

Ronald Jasper will be remembered as the architect of the 1980 Alternative Service Book. This biography was written by one of his long-serving colleagues on the Liturgical Commission which produced that liturgy. Neither the papers, the Jasper family, nor Gray's researches have brought to light what first triggered in him the interest in liturgical studies. Possibly it was his interest as a historian in a liturgist, Walter Howard Frere. Whatever the catalyst, it was to lead to his appointment to the Liturgical Commission in 1955, and subsequently to being its chair until 1980. His ecumenical work, particularly with JLG and the founding of *Societas Liturgica* is recorded, as also his time as canon of Westminster, and then dean of York. But we also have an interesting insight into his childhood, his

studies at Leeds University, ordination and curacies in County Durham, as chaplain of Hatfield College, Durham, as well as retirement at Ripon. Even in retirement he came to the rescue of Durham University, teaching liturgy when no one else was available. His unexpected death in 1990 while undergoing an operation parallels that of his former Liturgical Commission colleague, Geoffrey Cuming. Though shorter than might have been expected, this biography captures for us the very human and patient churchman who did so much for twentieth-century liturgical revision.

YALE UNIVERSITY

BRYAN D. SPINKS

*A global faith. Essays on evangelicalism and globalization.* Edited by M. Hutchinson and O. Kalu. Pp. iv + 264. Sydney: Centre for the Study of Australian Christianity, 1998. \$24.90. 1 86408 395 6

This mixed bag of essays arises from group reflection on the theme of the evangelical message in a world of globalising cultures. The book itself could hardly exist without access to the Internet, which has enabled the formation of a global community of evangelical scholars. The coming into being of this virtual fellowship is, however, just the climax to a long process whereby the evangelical movement has thrown up all kinds of voluntary, interdenominational and co-operative institutions. So an international gathering of scholars, not all of them strictly evangelical, was able to meet in Sydney in July 1997 to carry on this tradition. Historical questions that arise for this group centre upon the link between evangelicalism and mercantilism and, later, capitalism and the mix-up, godly or ungodly, of evangelical views of world mission and globalising political forms such as empire. More contemporary issues concern the ability of evangelicals to handle the phenomenology of a shrinking planet, and therefore its function as a counterforce to, and critic of, globalisation theory in its prediction of 'high levels of differentiation, multicentricity and chaos'. The project itself has the two-fold aim of developing a paradigm for the study of these issues and of helping to inform leaders and policymakers in the Church, particularly in those areas, like mission agencies, most directly affected by the super-nationality of global trends. The collection of essays is to be seen as very much work in progress, and must be judged as such. In this brief review perhaps all that can be done helpfully is to indicate the nature of the various contributions. Two scholars from Canada, Donald M. Lewis and David Lyon, church historian and sociologist respectively, helpfully address questions of definition and bias in discussions of globalism, globalisation and 'glocalisation'. Paul Freston, writing from Brazil, and John Wolffe of the Open University have fascinating papers reflecting on methodology and historiography. Then W. R. Ward, David Bebbington, R. V. Pierre and Erich Geldbach address the historical roots of globalising evangelicalism with stimulating essays on missionary activity in the eighteenth and nineteenth century and of denominational histories in terms of globalisation. Geldbach has a particularly useful discussion of the German terms 'evangelisch' and 'evangelikal' as he treats German Pietism and contemporary German movements. Four case studies complete the volume, two from Africa and two from Asia. I count nine nationalities among the contributors of this book, a

manifestation of global co-operation in itself, and I warmly commend the project to the attention of all concerned with the globality of the Christian community.

BRITE DIVINITY SCHOOL,  
TEXAS CHRISTIAN UNIVERSITY,  
FORT WORTH,  
TEXAS

KENNETH CRACKNELL