

Notes

Introduction

- 1 Another epitaph is: HE BADE POETRY RESOUND AND MUSIC SPEAK, and the sketchier: HE GAVE TO POESY (ART OF POETRY) TONES (SOUNDS) AND LANGUAGE (SPEECH) TO MUSIC. NEITHER SPOUSE NOR MAIDEN, IT IS AS SISTERS THAT THE TWO EMBRACE ABOVE SCHUBERT'S HEAD (GRAVE) (SDB 899).
- 2 "Aus Franz Schubert's Nachlass," *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 8 (1838), 179; my translation.
- 3 Heinrich Kreissle von Hellborn, *Franz Schubert* (Vienna, 1865), 463–64; translation modified from Arthur Duke Coleridge, *The Life of Franz Schubert* (London, 1869; rpt. New York, 1972), II: 150.
- 4 See, for example, SDB 698, 723; this was the phrase used in the English journal the *Harmonicon* as well (SDB 602).
- 5 See John Reed's appendix, "How Many Schubert Songs?" in *The Schubert Song Companion* (Manchester, 1985), 483–84. The question might be more precisely phrased as "How many Schubert songs survive?" since some are known to be lost, and songs have continued to surface in this century. See also Maurice J. E. Brown, "The Therese Grob Collection of Songs by Schubert," *Music and Letters* 49 (1968), 122–34; and his "The Posthumous Publication of the Songs," in *Essays on Schubert* (London, 1966), 267–90.
- 6 SDB lists most of the contemporaneous performances and publications, and gives many of the reviews that appeared during Schubert's lifetime. See also the informative articles by Otto Biba, archivist of the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde in Vienna: "Schubert's Position in Viennese Musical Life," *19th-Century Music* 3 (1979), 106–13; "Franz Schubert in den musikalischen Abendunterhaltungen der Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde," in *Schubert-Studien: Festgabe der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften zum Schubert-Jahr 1978*, ed. Franz Grasberger and Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1978), 7–31; and "Franz Schubert und die Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde in Wien," in *Schubert-Kongreß: Wien 1978: Bericht*, ed. Otto Brusatti (Graz, 1979), 23–36.
- 7 Attempts to salvage some of Schubert's four-hand masterpieces came from arrangers, such as Liszt for dances, Joseph Joachim for the "Grand Duo" (D812), and Felix Mottl for the F Minor Fantasy (D940).
- 8 Although over a hundred opus numbers were published during Schubert's lifetime (or shortly afterward with numbers assigned by him), many more works than this appeared because Lieder, partsongs, and dances were often issued in sets. (Moreover, some works, mainly songs and dances, were published without opus numbers.) Otto Erich Deutsch places the total

number of contemporaneously published works at 472 (*Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens* in NSA [Kassel, 1964], VIII/5, 601), but that figure depends on what he decided constitutes an individual piece. Is equal weight to be given to a one-page dance as to a multi-movement sonata? Does *Winterreise* count as one work or twenty-four? As Deutsch considers each individual variation an individual work, three of Schubert's four-hand compositions (D624, 813, 908) therefore count as twenty-four pieces among the total of 472.

- 9 For a fascinating discussion of small-scale forms, their generic designations, and relationships to a hierarchy of genres, see Jeffrey Kallberg, "Small Forms: In Defence of the Prelude," in *The Cambridge Companion to Chopin*, ed. Jim Samson (Cambridge, 1992), 124–44.
- 10 The mixture of genres is a hallmark of early Romanticism; see Jeffrey Kallberg, "The Rhetoric of Genre: Chopin's Nocturne in G Minor," *19th-Century Music* 11 (1988), 238–61.
- 11 Schubert's self-borrowing is well known, but the obvious examples of instrumental works based on Lieder – the "Trout" Quintet, the "Death and the Maiden" Quartet – are only a small sample of a far more extensive and significant network of stylistic and thematic interconnections, cross-references, allusions, and reworkings in his work; many examples are listed in Appendix 3 "Thematic and stylistic links between the songs and the instrumental works," in Reed, *The Schubert Song Companion*, 494–98.
- 12 *The Classical Style: Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven* (New York, 1971), 460.
- 13 *Geschichte der europäisch-abendländischen oder unserer heutigen Musik* (Leipzig, 1834).
- 14 See Herfrid Kier, *Raphael Georg Kiesewetter (1773–1850): Wegbereiter des musikalischen Historismus* (Regensburg, 1968), 91–95.
- 15 *Geschichte des Concertwesens in Wien* (Vienna, 1869), 139ff.
- 16 In a more recent discussion of the eventful first decades of the nineteenth century, the German music historian Carl Dahlhaus explicitly takes up Kiesewetter's historiography that pairs Beethoven and Rossini and argues that in the "twin styles" of instrumental and operatic music, Beethoven claimed a new role for the art of music. Beethoven's compositions are texts requiring exegesis; a performer must plumb their depths in order to interpret their riches. A listener may not understand the work at first; appreciation comes with time and study. The Italian opera tradition, epitomized by Rossini, represents a different kind of relation between music as "text" and its actualization. Rossini's scores were more a recipe realized in the opera house, where performance "forms the crucial aesthetic arbiter as the realization of a draft rather than an exegesis of a text"; see *Nineteenth-Century Music*, trans. J. Bradford Robinson (Berkeley, 1989), 8–15.
- 17 *The Frontiers of Meaning: Three Informal Lectures on Music* (New York, 1994), 56; Scott Burnham explores how the musical values associated with Beethoven have informed ways of looking at music in *Beethoven Hero* (Princeton, 1995).
- 18 Dahlhaus, *Nineteenth-Century Music*, 79.
- 19 Inconsistent and confusing categorizing of these works further indicates the

state of flux in the Lied repertory at the turn of the century: although Mozart called *Das Veilchen* a “Lied,” it was published by Artaria in 1789 as one of “two arias”; *Adelaide* first appeared in 1797 as a “cantata.”

- 20 The editor, theorist, and critic Johann Christian Lobe wrote, “High above all composers who have come after Beethoven stands the original healthy creative power of Franz Schubert, who, like Mozart, went to his grave so early. While Beethoven was still alive and holding the position of master in the greatest brilliance of his fame, the younger composer not merely competed with him, but even won a victory over him. In his Lieder he surpassed everyone, even Beethoven”; see *Musikalische Briefe: Wahrheit über Tonkunst und Tonkünstler von einem Wohlbekannten* (Leipzig, 1852), II: 73; my translation.
- 21 C. D., “Die Lied- und Gesangskomposition: Das Schubertsche Lied,” *Signale für die musikalische Welt* 17 (1859), 33; my translation.
- 22 Solomon first raised the issue in “Franz Schubert’s ‘Mein Traum,’” *American Imago* 38 (1981), 137–54. His case only achieved wide notoriety with public lectures and the article “Franz Schubert and the Peacocks of Benvenuto Cellini,” *19th-Century Music* 12 (1989), 193–206; see also “Schubert: Music, Sexuality, Culture,” *19th-Century Music* 17 (1993), a special issue devoted to Schubert.
- 23 James Webster discusses some recent examples of criticism that place Schubert “under the sign of neurosis” by relating his life to his music (see “Music, Pathology, Sexuality, Beethoven, Schubert,” *19th-Century Music* 17 [1993], 89–93).
- 24 The “double” transcendence of works of art is explored by Charles Rosen in his elucidation of Walter Benjamin’s conception of a work’s “afterlife”; see “The Ruins of Walter Benjamin,” in *On Walter Benjamin: Critical Essays and Recollections*, ed. Gary Smith (Cambridge, Mass., 1988), 129–75.

1 *Franz Schubert and Vienna*

This essay draws upon two lectures given at two *Schubertiades* sponsored by the 92nd Street Y of New York City in 1992 and 1994. I am particularly grateful to Christopher Gibbs for excellent substantive and editorial suggestions.

- 1 Adalbert Stifter, *Aus dem alten Wien: Zwölf Studien*, ed. Otto Erich Deutsch (Leipzig, 1909), 111.
- 2 Friedrich Schreyvogel, “Ferdinand Raimund Leben und Werk,” in *Ferdinand Raimund: Sämtliche Werke* (Munich, 1960), 721. Schubert certainly knew of this play, performed with music by Joseph Drechsler (1782–1852). The fifteen-year-old Schubert used a textbook by Drechsler (*SDB* 24 and 580).
- 3 See Robert Waissenberger, “Adalbert Stifters Ethik des Biedermeier,” in *Bürgersinn und Aufbegehren: Biedermeiers und Vormärz in Wien 1815–1848* (hereafter cited as *BuA*) (Vienna, 1988), 442–45.
- 4 See Maynard Solomon, “Franz Schubert and the Peacocks of Benvenuto Cellini,” *19th-Century Music* 12 (1989), 193–206; and a special issue of the same journal (17 [1993]), edited by Lawrence Kramer, entitled “Schubert: Music, Sexuality, Culture.”

- 5 These two terms refer to the era 1815–48. “Pre-March” (*Vormärz*) is used to identify the years before the March Revolution of 1848, often back to 1815. *Biedermeier* refers to the same period, but more specifically to the emergence of a distinct middle-class urban style. Both terms are used here merely to refer to the general time period, not to evoke any specific generalizations about the era. In the case of Schubert, only the first fifteen years are relevant, making the use of either term somewhat irrelevant.
- 6 The reader is encouraged to examine *BuA*, whose extensive materials and commentary covering the wide range of life and culture during this period are excellent. See also a slightly different version, Robert Waissenberger, ed., *Wien 1815–1848. Bürgersinn und Aufbegehren: Die Zeit des Biedermeier und Vormärz* (Vienna, 1986).
- 7 See Robert Schumann, “Franz Schuberts letzte Kompositionen,” in *Gesammelte Schriften*, 2 vols. (Leipzig, 1914), I: 327–31.
- 8 See the two volumes of *Neue Dokumente zum Schubert-Kreis*, ed. Walburga Litschauer (Vienna, 1986 and 1993), and the publications of the Internationales Franz Schubert Institut, especially its journal *Schubert durch die Brille*.
- 9 Anton Weiss, ed., *Fünfzig Jahre Schubertbund* (Vienna, 1913).
- 10 The Society began raising money for the monument in the early 1860s; a plaque had already been put on his birthplace in 1858. The Society even traveled to Stuttgart to help dedicate a Schubert monument there in 1878.
- 11 Two ideal sources for both the Männergesangverein’s attitude and the late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century right-wing political appropriation are: Karl Adametz, *Franz Schubert in der Geschichte des Wiener Männergesangvereines* (Vienna, 1938), and Anton Weiss, *Jahresbericht des Schubertbundes in Wien 1896–1897* (Vienna, 1897).
- 12 See for example Alfred Orel, “Musikstadt Wien,” in *Wien: Geschichte, Kunst, Leben*, ed. Anton Haasbauer (Vienna, 1942), 57. See also Leon Botstein, *Music and its Public* (PhD diss., Harvard University, 1985) and the liner notes to *Schubert Orchestrated* (Koch Schwann CD, 3 7307 2 [1995]). An interesting Viennese effort to merge the universal and the local was Robert Lach’s *Das Ethos in der Musik Schuberts* (Vienna, 1928), a lecture held at the university centenary celebration.
- 13 See Otto Brusatti, ed., *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz: Dokumente 1829–1848* (Graz, 1978); and Otto Erich Deutsch, ed., *Schubert: Die Erinnerungen seiner Freunde* (Wiesbaden, 1983).
- 14 The protagonist – Jakob – of the story (first begun by Grillparzer in 1831) can be seen as a mixture of Grillparzer’s images of Beethoven and Schubert. What is crucial in this context is the close detailed connection created between the music-making and the life and culture of the city.
- 15 See Ernst Hilmar, *Franz Schubert in his Time* (Portland, Oreg., 1988). I am referring, of course, to the work of Clifford Geertz in his two books *The Interpretation of Cultures* (New York, 1973) and *Local Knowledge* (New York, 1983).
- 16 La Mara, *Musikalische Studienköpfe Vol I: Romantiker*, 7th edn. (Leipzig,

- 1896), 71–136. This volume went into at least twelve editions.
- 17 See Richard Traubner, *Operetta: A Theatrical History* (New York, 1983), 424–26.
- 18 The exception from this paradigm now being made in Schubert’s case concerns sexuality, construed perhaps a bit too ahistorically. See the suggestive works by Niklas Luhmann, *Die Ausbreitung des Kunstsystems* (Bern, 1994), 7–55; and *Unbeobachtbare Welt: Über Kunst und Architektur* (Bielefeld, 1990), 7–45.
- 19 See the sections on design in *BuA* and Paul and Stefan Asenbaum, eds., *Moderne Vergangenheit 1800–1900* (Vienna, 1981).
- 20 A nearly contemporary view of Nussdorf, from where Stifter looked out onto the city, can be seen in Jakob Alt’s 1822 watercolor (*BuA* 481).
- 21 As Bruno Grimschitz observed in 1927, from the early nineteenth century on it was understood that the aesthetic greatness of Austria had culminated in the Baroque. Through Baroque architecture, the Austrian had become “European” (see *Die österreichische Zeichnung im 19. Jahrhundert* [Zurich, 1928], 3–5). In turn, for Schwind and Stifter’s contemporaries throughout the Habsburg Empire, the Baroque represented the Austrian. The representational public architecture built in Vienna during Schubert’s lifetime, in its adaptation of neoclassicism, never shed its evident debt to the Viennese Baroque architecture of the eighteenth century that dominated the city’s landscape; see the section “Baukunst” in *BuA*, 498–531.
- 22 Karl Kobald, *Franz Schubert und seine Zeit* (Zurich, 1935), 247–65; also his *Schubert und Schwind* (Vienna, 1921).
- 23 See Peter Gülke, *Franz Schubert und seine Zeit* (Laaber, 1991), 47–64.
- 24 For example, the significance of the medieval was mirrored in lithographs from 1823 and an 1826 oil painting *Das Käthchen von Heilbronn*, all by Schwind. Schwind’s 1823 sketches on death and graves possess clear allusions to the Gothic. Religious art in the 1820s was as much an evocation of history as a matter of piety. See Otto Weigmann, ed., *Schwind: Des Meisters Werke* (Stuttgart, 1906); see also Friedrich Haack, *Moritz von Schwind* (Bielefeld, 1923).
- 25 See Charles Sealsfield-Karl Postl, *Austria as it is*, ed. Primus Heinz Kucher (Vienna, 1994).
- 26 Eduard von Bauernfeld, *Erinnerungen aus Alt Wien* (Vienna, 1923), 371.
- 27 He was arrested, spent fourteen months in jail, then was released and exiled to the Tyrol. His career was destroyed, however (*SDB* 128–30). See also John Reed, *The Schubert Song Companion* (Manchester, 1985), 479.
- 28 Reed, *The Schubert Song Companion*, 470.
- 29 Following Bauernfeld’s cue, one might say that the modern reader must refer to the pre-1989 states of Eastern Europe, to Romania for example, to appreciate the political and psychic costs of autocracies with extensive secret police networks and censorship authority. Steblin makes a similar point. See below, note 33.

- 30 See the outstanding monograph by Waltraud Heindl, *Gehorsame Rebellen: Bürokratie und Beamte in Österreich 1780 bis 1848* (Vienna, 1991). One clear link between this sector of society and Schubert was the Pratobevera family.
- 31 See Schubert's observation about a bad performance in the Theater an der Wien in May 1826 (SBD 528).
- 32 Johann Nestroy, who had made his theatrical debut in 1822 at the Kärntnertor Theater as Sarastro, used *The Magic Flute* overtly and indirectly in two farces that focused not only on the external politics but on the consequences of the many forms of rationalized adaptation developed by the Viennese. *Der Zerrissene* from 1844 and the 1845 *Das Gewürzkrämerkleblatt oder Der unschuldigen Schuldigen* take apart the conceits and habits of the full range of the Viennese middle class, particularly its civil servants and men of commerce.
- 33 Rita Steblin, "The Peacock's Tale: Schubert's Sexuality Reconsidered," *19th-Century Music* 17 (1993), 11.
- 34 In this satire, Sarastro has become a discontent middle-class civil servant who longs for the past and calls in sick on his birthday. Tamino has lost the magic flute and goes daily to the office. Pamina cooks breakfast, bringing in soup instead of the milk and coffee of bygone times. Papageno has been bribed. Monastatos, now the lover of the Queen of the Night, has become the Director of the "Bureau of Light Extinguishing." He is about to be ennobled as "Edler von Schneeweiss" (Earl of White Snow). He is upset that Tamino fails to doff his hat when he sees him on the street. The Queen of the Night is in charge. She has taken the light of wisdom and turned it into an artificial means of lighting tobacco. She is obsessed with cologne, her upset stomach, and making sure that she walks in public affecting a proper and respectable style. The three boys have been sent as apprentices to a cabinet maker. The Queen admonishes Monastatos to make sure that her civil servants remain too busy to read; Franz Grillparzer, *Sämtliche Werke*, ed. August Sauer, vol. XIII (Stuttgart, n.d.), 121–29.
- 35 See Alice M. Hanson, *Musical Life in Biedermeier Vienna* (Cambridge, 1985); the German edition of this book contains many minor but crucial corrections, see *Die zensurierte Muse: Musikleben im Wiener Biedermeier* (Vienna, 1987).
- 36 Consider the recurrent uses of the image of the knight in the work of Schwind and comparable subject matter in Schubert. See Weigmann, ed., *Schwind*, 8 and 34; and Schubert's early Romanze D114, and late Sir Walter Scott songs (e.g. D837 from 1825).
- 37 Much of the discussion owes a debt to three seminal works on the public realm in the late eighteenth century and the early nineteenth century: Jürgen Habermas, *Strukturwandel der Öffentlichkeit: Untersuchungen zu einer Kategorie der bürgerlichen Gesellschaft* (Darmstadt, 1962); Reinhart Koselleck, *Critique and Crisis: Enlightenment and the Pathogenesis of Modern Society* (Cambridge, Mass., 1988); and Peter Uwe Hohendahl, *Literarische Kultur im Zeitalter des Liberalismus 1830–1870* (Munich, 1985).

- 38 On the aristocracy see Hannes Stekl, *Österreichs Aristokratie im Vormärz* (Vienna, 1973); the memoirs of J. F. Castelli and Karoline Pichler are indispensable sources for this period in Vienna.
- 39 So did fashion and style. The new Viennese middle-class public embraced a freer and distinct and expressive clothes style for both men and women. See Max von Boehn, *Die Mode im XIX. Jahrhundert* (Munich, 1907), plate 28.
- 40 Genre painting became popular in part as a reaction. It rivaled landscape painting as the emblematic visual medium of the era. Genre scenes sought to depict the individual in a realistic and naturalistic setting, as if to assert that the simple person, betraying no lineage, placed in ordinary circumstances, and engaged in daily life, was sufficient as an image to communicate unique worth and humanity. The direct and often sentimentalized depiction of the everyday, inside and outside the home, was an act of self-assertion that only seemed innocent, politically speaking; see the section on “Bildend Kunst” in *BuA*.
- 41 See Weigmann, ed., *Schwind*, 2–4.
- 42 In this regard, the case of the poet Nikolaus Lenau is most instructive. Lenau, like Stifter, came to Vienna to study. He lived there, with some interruptions, from 1823 to 1830. After inheriting a small fortune from his grandmother he emigrated to America in the early 1830s, only to return later in the decade. In his early poems, the theme of the conflict between reality and hope is central. In his 1826 “Die Jugendträume,” the human comes of age sensing that he himself is a God; his expectations are bolstered by a pristine nature. The reality of human existence, of societal facts in the man-made world (e.g. the city), dash these sensibilities and inspire the individual to flee away from the world further and further, to retain the capacity for fantasy and to escape. In the longer “allegorical dream” entitled “Glauben, Wissen, Handeln” from 1830, Lenau uses the idea of memory to express the sense of life as a labyrinth, a hopeless and pointless experience without respite. What is remarkable in this longer poem are the explicit references to Greece, Rome, and the “Germania” of a past age. Psychic despair is deepened by historical nostalgia and pessimism. “Forgetting,” the creation of art, and the capacity to dream become associated with one another as sources of solace; see Nikolaus Lenau, *Sämtliche Werke*, ed. Eduard Castle (Leipzig), 22 and 43.
- 43 See Dagmar C. G. Lorenz, *Grillparzer: Dichter des sozialen Konflikts* (Vienna, 1986).
- 44 This essay does not discuss Schubert’s efforts to write for the Viennese stage. Clearly he recognized the unique character and significance of theater in Vienna after 1815. On the Viennese theater see Roger Bauer, *La Réalité Royaume de Dieu: Études sur l’originalité du théâtre viennois dans la première moitié du XIXe siècle* (Munich, 1965); and Josef Mayerhofer, ed., *Wiener Theater des Biedermeier und Vormärz* (Vienna, 1978). See also the more systematic chronicle account of all the theaters in Schubert’s day in Franz Hadamowsky, *Wien: Theater Geschichte* (Vienna and Munich, 1988).
- 45 Consider the 1820 series of sixteen erotic scenes done by Peter Fendi (1796–1824), an artist best known for his portraits of the aristocracy and his

sentimental genre paintings. The Vienna of Schubert's day produced such items as pornographic meerschaum pipes depicting females masturbating. Pornography from Paris made its way east to German-speaking cities. One example that reached southern Germany linked the rage for music-making with sexual exploits by depicting the black and white keys of the piano as a series of legs and vaginas; see Hans Ottomeyer and Ulrike Laufer, eds., *Biedermeiers Glück und Ende. . . die gestörte Idylle 1815–1848* (Munich, 1987), 594–96; see also *BuA* 618. A far more respectable and less lurid vehicle for private fantasy was reading. Moritz von Schwind completed a successful and popular set of illustrations for an 1825 edition of *A Thousand and One Nights*. In Vienna, the mundane and externally conventional holders of such fantasies were themselves ripe for satire. The more fantastic one's mental life, the more grotesque ordinary existence and the docile acceptance of lack of freedom seemed. Nestroy exploited this. So did Schwind. In 1826, he executed his satirical drawings of "Gotham" life, termed *Krähwinkeliaden* (a parallel to Schubertiades). Here the pretensions, idiocies, and hypocrisy of the educated Viennese come into full view. Likewise, Schwind's 1824 series "Embarrassment," the subjects of which are seduction and deceit, focus on the corruption of language and manners in Vienna, the clash between the claims of overt speech and behavior and actual meaning (Weigmann, ed., *Schwind*, 27–31, 45–47, and 52–53).

- 46 D. Z. Wertheim, *Versuch einer medicinischen Topographie von Wien* (Vienna, 1810), 72, quoted in Wolfgang Pircher and Andreas Pribersky, "Die Gesundheit, die Polizei und die Cholera" in the collection *Wien im Vormärz* by Renate B. Banitz-Schweizer, Andreas B. Baryli, et al. (Vienna, 1980) (hereafter cited as *WiV*), 203.
- 47 *WiV*, 209.
- 48 In this discussion Vienna is defined by the greater Vienna to the line around the suburban districts outside the inner city. The sources for this section include A. Hickmann, *Wien im XIX Jahrhundert* (Vienna, 1903), Maren Seliger and Karl Ucakar, *Wien: Politische Geschichte Vol. I 1740–1895* (Vienna, 1985), and *BuA*.
- 49 Hickmann, *Wien im XIX Jahrhundert*, Chart Nos. 20 and 21.
- 50 The statistical material comes in part from Maren Seliger and Karl Ucakar, *Wien: Politische Geschichte Vol. I 1740–1895*, 125–64.
- 51 See *BuA*, 460–545.
- 52 See B. R. Mitchell, *European Historical Statistics 1750–1975*, 2nd edn (New York, 1980) and Hickmann, *Wien im XIX Jahrhundert*.
- 53 See also the articles by Andreas B. Baryli, Wolfgang Häusler, Peter F. Feldbauer, and Renate B. Banik-Schweitzer in *WiV*; and Gustav Otruba, "Entstehung und soziale Entwicklung der Arbeiterschaft und der Angestellten bis zum Ersten Weltkrieg," in *Österreichs Sozialstrukturen in historischer Sicht*, ed. Erich Zöllner (Vienna, 1980), 128–30.
- 54 Roman Sandgruber's article in *BuA*, 596, and his "Indikatoren des Lebensstandards in Wien in der ersten Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts," in *WiV*, 57–74.

- 55 See Hickmann, *Wien im XIX Jahrhundert*, Tables 32–33 and *BuA*, 568–72; see also Eugen Guglia, *Das Theresianum in Wien: Vergangenheit und Gegenwart* (Vienna, 1912), 96–132, for a sense of the character and role of education beyond the elementary level.
- 56 See Pirchler and Pribersky, “Die Gesundheit,” in *WiV*, 205–06; and Felix Czeike, *Historisches Lexikon Wien* (Vienna, 1993), II: 355.
- 57 Stifter, *Aus dem alten Wien*, 283–87.
- 58 This section is intended to be speculative and does not pretend to serve as a surrogate for close analysis of specific works by Schubert.
- 59 It should be noted that the Viennese world in which Schubert lived was decidedly distinct from the Vienna inhabited by Beethoven during the 1820s. The difference was generational, compounded by the fact that Beethoven was isolated by deafness and fame. There has been a consistent effort to link Beethoven and Schubert, but the gulf remained, made more complicated by Beethoven’s dependence on and association with a milieu of aristocrats to whom Schubert had limited access. See Leon Botstein, “The Patrons and Publics of the Quartets: Music, Culture and Society in Beethoven’s Vienna,” in *The Beethoven Quartet Companion*, ed. Robert Martin and Robert Winter, (Berkeley, 1994), 77–110.
- 60 Here was music-making alone, primarily at the piano. See Leo Grunstein, *Das Alt-Wiener Antlitz: Bildnisse und Menschen aus der ersten Hälfte des XIX Jahrhunderts*, 2 vols. (Gilhofer and Ranschburg, 1931), Plate 71. The image is of the composer and pianist Leopoldine Blahetka (1809–85) whose path first crossed with Schubert when she was a child, in 1818, when she played in a concert that also contained the first public performance of a work by Schubert (*SBD* 87). Deutsch says she was seven but she was really just over eight years old.
- 61 See Franz Mailer, “Die Walzer des Biedermeier,” and Reingard Witzmann, “Wiener Walzer und Wiener Ballkultur: Von der Tanzekstase zum Walzertraum,” in *BuA*, 126–37.
- 62 See David Brodbeck, “Dance Music as High Art: Schubert’s Twelve Ländler, Op. 171 (D790),” in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln, Nebr., 1986), 31–47.
- 63 Leo Strauss, *Persecution and the Art of Writing* (Chicago, 1952).
- 64 The great cycles of Wilhelm Müller’s settings of *Die schöne Müllerin* and *Winterreise* would make plausible objects for this analysis. The settings in three of Schubert’s most famous songs – Schiller’s *Gruppe aus dem Tartarus* (D583); Goethe’s *Geheimnis* (D719); and *Du bist die Ruh* (D776) – are other potential cases in point. So too is his early and popular Goethe setting *Gretchen am Spinnrade* (D118). See for example the analysis in a recent textbook dealing with *Der Wanderer* (D489) in Walter Dürr, *Sprache und Musik* (Kassel, 1994), 216–39.
- 65 See Arnold Feil, *Franz Schubert: Die schöne Müllerin. Winterreise* (Portland, Oreg., 1988), 11–28; and Susan Youens, *Retracing a Winter’s Journey: Schubert’s Winterreise* (Ithaca, 1991). One might also read *An mein Klavier* (D342) in this manner.

- 66 On the guitar in the early nineteenth century in Vienna, see Lenau's "An meine Gitarre" from 1832 in Lenau, *Sämtliche Werke*, 24; "Schubert's Guitar" in *BuA*, 108; and *SDB* 177, 225, 291, 509. Many of Schubert's songs and his partsongs were first published with guitar accompaniments by Cappi & Diabelli.
- 67 See, for example, the Dresden *Abendzeitung* (*SDB* 418). Robert Schumann referred to Schubert's mastery in "genre painting" in his review of Berlioz's *Symphonie fantastique* in Schumann, *Gesammelte Schriften*, I: 85.
- 68 See *SDB* 352–55 (June 25, 1824).
- 69 See, for example, Friedrich von Hentl's 1822 review in the *Wiener Zeitschrift für Kunst* (*SDB* 214–19).
- 70 See the Leipzig *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, March 1, 1827 (*SDB* 512–15); see also Leo Balet, *Die Verbürgerlichung der Deutschen Kunst, Literatur und Musik im 18. Jahrhundert* (Strassburg and Leiden, 1936), 498–508.
- 71 *SDB* 269, and also the review from the Vienna *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, *SDB* 277.
- 72 *SDB* 151 and 121. See the text of Schober's *An die Musik* (D547).
- 73 Nowhere is this awareness more clear than in Franz von Schober's New Year's Eve poem from 1823 (*SDB* 257–79; and 257, 279, and 336–37).
- 74 From a text dedicated to Schubert by Mayrhofer (*SDB* 190–91).

2 Images and legends of the composer

- 1 The phrase "armer Schubert" was often used by his friends; see, for example, *SMF* 14, 116, 132, 139, 202, 229, 233, 252, 254.
- 2 See, for example, *SDB* 441, 828; *SMF* 24, 34, 35, 62, 69, 185, 314, 319; Gerhard von Breuning even refers to "our poor Schubert" (*unser armer Schubert*) (*SMF* 254).
- 3 The best iconographical sources for Schubert are: Otto Erich Deutsch, *Sein Leben in Bildern* (Munich and Leipzig, 1913); Ernst Hilmar and Otto Brusatti, *Franz Schubert: Ausstellung der Wiener Stadt- und Landesbibliothek zum 150. Todestag der Komponisten* (Vienna, 1978); and Ernst Hilmar, *Schubert* (Graz, 1990).
- 4 In 1825 the Cappi & Co. publishing house advertised a copper engraving of Rieder's portrait as "the extremely good likeness of the composer Franz Schubert" (*SDB* 477–78; cf. 417).
- 5 Schubert referred to "my littleness" (*SDB* 433 and 435). A military conscription form places Schubert's height at 157 centimeters (*SDB* 83–84; cf. 926).
- 6 Almost all are included in *SDB*; for a different translation see *Franz Schubert Letters and Other Writings*, ed. Otto Erich Deutsch, trans. Venetia Savile (London, 1928).
- 7 Because of the enormous fame of *Erlkönig*, there were many stories about its fate: the difficulty Schubert encountered getting it published; how one publisher returned it to the wrong Franz Schubert (another composer of the same name working in Dresden) who pronounced it trash; how Schubert

- played it on a comb, and so forth; see Christopher H. Gibbs, *The Presence of Erlkönig: Reception and Reworkings of a Schubert Lied* (PhD diss., Columbia University, New York, 1992), 86–159.
- 8 See Carl Dahlhaus, *Ludwig van Beethoven: Approaches to his Music*, trans. Mary Whittall (Oxford, 1991), 1.
 - 9 Although the story is found in most biographies of the two composers, Maynard Solomon has provided good reasons to be skeptical, see “Schubert and Beethoven,” *19th-Century Music* 3 (1979), 114–25.
 - 10 The bodies of Schubert and Beethoven were exhumed twice, in 1863 and 1888.
 - 11 Although *Erlkönig* was Schubert’s official Op. 1, three Lieder – *Erlafsee* (D586), *Widerschein* (D639), and *Die Forelle* (D550) – were released in the less-assuming venues of periodicals and almanacs; see NSA, IV/1a/xv-xvi; and Ewan West, “The Musenalmanach and Viennese Song, 1770–1830,” *Music and Letters* 67 (1986), 37–49.
 - 12 Josef von Spaun was later (1858) to recount a similar astonished benediction dating from Schubert’s school days. He says that after only two lessons, the teacher and organist Wenzel Ruzicka told him: “I can teach him nothing, he has learnt it from God himself” (*SMF* 128, cf. 35, 145, 362).
 - 13 Most of the reviews are found in *Franz Schubert: Dokumente 1817–1830*, ed. Till Gerrit Waidelich, vol. I, (Tutzing, 1993), and many are translated in *SDB*.
 - 14 In addition to David Gramit’s chapter in this volume, see his *The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert’s Circle* (PhD diss., Duke University, 1987).
 - 15 *Franz Schubert: Jahre der Krise 1818–1823*, ed. Werner Aderhold, Walther Dürr, and Walburga Litschauer (Kassel, 1985).
 - 16 The same rigorous self-criticism emerged shortly before his death when, informing the influential publisher Schott about his compositions, Schubert did not acknowledge most of his symphonies, dramatic music, and chamber works (*SDB* 739–40).
 - 17 For a discussion of Schubert’s illness see Eric Sams, “Schubert’s Illness Re-examined,” *Musical Times* 121 (1980), 15–22.
 - 18 See *SDB* 824–925; as this collection contains only a few reviews written after Schubert’s death, the best source for documents from the 1830s and 1840s is Otto Brusatti, ed. *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz: Dokumente 1829–1848* (Graz, 1978).
 - 19 Schubert left a large number of unfinished works that date from all stages of his career. Not many projects were unfinished because of his early death.
 - 20 See Hans Lenneberg, “The Myth of the Unappreciated (Musical) Genius,” *Musical Quarterly* 66 (1980), 222–24.
 - 21 *Geschichte des Concertwesens in Wien* (Vienna, 1869), I: 283; my translation.
 - 22 Otto Biba, “Schubert’s Position in Viennese Musical Life,” *19th-Century Music* 3 (1979), 106–13.
 - 23 Gustav Nottebohm, *Thematisches Verzeichniss der im Druck erschienenen Werke von Franz Schubert* (Vienna, 1874); the complete edition, admirably edited by Eusebius Mandyczewski, was not really complete, and not only

because some pieces turned up later. Largely, it seems, at the urging of Johannes Brahms, who edited the volume of symphonies, various early works were omitted entirely; see Otto Erich Deutsch, “Schubert: the Collected Works,” *Music and Letters* 32 (1951), 226–34.

- 24 See Alice M. Hanson, *Musical Life in Biedermeier Vienna* (Cambridge, 1985).
- 25 A question recently posed by the critic David Cairns in fact demonstrates what it declares: “Is there a comparable case of a great composer – one that many would unhesitatingly place among the half-dozen supreme creators, a junior member [*sic*] of the company of Mozart, Beethoven, Bach, Handel, and Haydn – whom commentators feel so free to patronize: a master who is so often approached in the expectation of finding weaknesses, whether for censure or indulgent forgiveness?” *Responses: Musical Essays and Reviews* (New York, 1973), 195.
- 26 “Schubert chose scarcely a single musical artist for his closest and most intimate relationships, but for the most part only artist practitioners in other branches, who could indeed pay homage to his genius, but were incapable of leading it. An excellent, experienced composer would probably have guided Schubert towards even more works of the larger kind and have stood by him as adviser in matters of outward form, well-planned disposition and large-scale effect” (*SDB* 856). Compare Sonnleithner’s later statement (1857) that Schubert “had no friend who stood to him in the relation of master, who might have been able to guide him in such undertakings [i.e. large-scale works] by advising, warning, and correcting him” (*SMF* 112).
- 27 *Conversation-Lexicon der neuesten Zeit und Literatur* (1834); my translation.
- 28 *Musikalisches Conversations-Lexicon, Encyclopädie der gesammten Musik-Wissenschaft* (Leipzig, 1835), 300, my translation; see Christopher H. Gibbs, “Schubert in deutschsprachigen Lexica nach 1830,” *Schubert durch die Brille* 13 (June 1994), 70–78.
- 29 See *SMF* 10, 13; later comments include *SDB* 853, 858–59.
- 30 Albert Stadler quoted this letter from Vogl, and commented on it, in 1858 (*SMF* 146); Vogl’s ideas, expressed in a lost diary, were also quoted in Bauernfeld’s obituary for Vogl in 1841 (*SMF* 226). A particularly revealing observation is found in a letter to Spaun from his brother-in-law Anton Ottenwalt when Schubert visited Linz in 1825. Ottenwalt’s defense of Schubert’s intellect and his insistence on Schubert’s personal convictions seem both to confirm and contradict Vogl’s notion of the composer’s unmediated inspirations: “Of Schubert – I might almost say of our Schubert – there is much I should like to tell you. . . . He talked of art, of poetry, of his youth, of friends and other people who matter, of the relationship of ideals to life, and so forth. I was more and more amazed at such a mind, of which it has been said that its artistic achievement is so unconscious [*seine Kunstleistung sei so unbewusst*], hardly revealed to and understood by himself, and so on. Yet how simple was all this! – I cannot tell you of the extent and the unity of his convictions – but there were glimpses of a world-view that is not merely acquired, and the share which worthy friends may have in it by no means distracts from the individuality shown by all this” (*SDB* 442). Four years later,

Ottenwalt added a similar passage to Spaun's Schubert obituary (SDB 878). Eduard Bauernfeld made a similar observation (and tellingly invokes Mozart as a comparable phenomenon): "There are people who regarded the author of such songs, who was at the same time able to deliver them so tenderly and feelingly, as a kind of musical machine that had only to be wound up to grind out the most beautiful Mozartian (or Schubertian) melodies without itself feeling anything" (SMF 33).

- 31 The depiction of an effeminate Schubert in nineteenth-century English writings is examined by David Gramit in a fascinating article, "Constructing a Victorian Schubert: Music, Biography, and Cultural Values," *19th-Century Music* 17 (1993), 65–78.
- 32 *Schumann on Music: A Selection from his Writings*, ed. and trans. Henry Pleasants (New York, 1988), 142.
- 33 The comparisons were duly published as *Actenmässige Darstellung der Ausgrabung und Wiederbeisetzung der irdischen Reste von Beethoven und Schubert* (Vienna, 1863).
- 34 *Memories of Beethoven: From the House of the Black-Robed Spaniards*, ed. Maynard Solomon, trans. Henry Mins and Maynard Solomon (Cambridge, 1992), 116.
- 35 Heinrich Kreissle von Hellborn, *Franz Schubert* (Vienna 1865), 466; translated by Arthur Coleridge as *The Life of Franz Schubert* (London, 1869), II: 152.
- 36 *Franz Schubert*, 260; *The Life of Franz Schubert*, I: 262.
- 37 Best known is Leopold Kupelwieser's *Party Game of the Schubertians* which shows the Schubert circle at play. Painted for Franz von Schober in 1821, it depicts a scene at the Atzenbrugg Castle, owned by an uncle of Schober's, where Schubert and his friends gathered every year from 1817 to 1823. The friends play charades, while Schubert sits at the piano, which may suggest that he provided improvised incidental music; see SMF 214.
- 38 Schwind made sketches, an unfinished oil painting, and a sepia drawing; see Hilmar, *Schubert*, 55, 61–62; and SDB 784.
- 39 Maurice J. E. Brown, *Essays on Schubert* (London, 1966, rpt. 1978), 161; a key to the individuals is given in SDB 784.
- 40 Brown speculates that this was the song, *Essays on Schubert*, 161.
- 41 See SMF 7–39; Ferdinand Schubert's valuable essay was written around this time and consulted by Spaun and Bauernfeld, but only appeared when Schumann published it in the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* in 1839 (SMF 34–39).
- 42 An early Schubert story by Elise Polko is in her extremely popular *Musikalische Märchen, Phantasien und Skizzen* (Leipzig, 1852), a book that had many editions and was translated into a number of languages; two English translations appeared, one by Fanny Fuller (Philadelphia and New York, 1864) and another by Mary P. Maudslay (London, 1876). See also Ottfried (i.e. Gottfried Jolsdorf), *Schubert-Novellen: Sechs Blätter aus dem Liederkränze des unsterblichen Meistersängers* (Innsbruck, 1862).
- 43 The incorporation of Schubert's music into theater pieces began as early as 1834 with Adolf Müller's *Der Erenkönig*. Franz von Suppé's one-act operetta *Franz Schubert* (1864) tells the story of Schubert's flight from Vienna to the

- suburbs where he encounters the “schöne Müllerin” who inspires his song cycle. The most famous Schubert operetta was Heinrich Berté’s *Das Dreimäderlhaus*, discussed below; see Gibbs, *The Presence of Erlkönig*, 337–43.
- 44 There are four film versions alone of *Das Dreimäderlhaus* (see Gänzl’s *Book of the Musical Theatre*, ed. Kurt Gänzl and Andrew Lamb [London, 1988], 1045), as well as other movies about Schubert’s life; see Robert Werba, *Schubert und die Wiener: Der volkstümliche Unbekannte* (Vienna, 1978).
- 45 According to Ernst Hilmar, *Das Dreimäderlhaus* has been translated into some twenty languages and there have been over 100,000 performances in at least sixty countries (Hilmar, “The Trivialized Schubert,” lecture presented at the fourth *Schubertiade* symposium at the 92nd Street Y in New York City, February 2, 1992). It was known in French as *Chanson d’amour*, in Italian as *La Casa delle Tre Ragazze*, and in English as *Lilac Time* (arranged by G. H. Clutsam for the Lyric Theatre, London, in 1922) and *Blossom Time* (arranged by Sigmund Romberg for the Ambassador Theater in New York in 1921); see Richard Traubner, *Operetta: A Theatrical History* (New York, 1983), 425.
- 46 *Ein unbekanntes frühes Schubert-Porträt? Franz Schubert und der Maler Josef Abel* (Tutzing, 1992); see also Elmar Worgull, “Ein repräsentives Jugendbildnis Schuberts,” *Schubert durch die Brille* 12 (1994), 54–89.
- 47 See Albi Rosenthal, “Zum ‘Schubert-Porträt’ von Abel,” *Schubert durch die Brille* 12 (1994), 90–91.
- 48 The portrait is included at the beginning of the chapter on Schubert in *The Romantic Era*, vol. II of the *Heritage of Music*, ed. Michael Raeburn and Alan Kendall (Oxford, 1989), 74; and in Yehudi Menuhin and Curtis W. Davis, *The Music of Man* (New York, 1979), 157.
- 49 The film was released in theater and television versions, the former under the title “Notturmo.” See Walburga Litschauer, “Zu Fritz Lehnert’s Schubert-Film *Notturmo*,” *Schubert durch die Brille* 2 (1989), 26–29.
- 50 See Solomon, “Franz Schubert’s ‘Mein Traum,’” *American Imago* 38 (1981), 137–54; “Franz Schubert and the Peacocks of Benvenuto Cellini,” *19th-Century Music* 12 (1989), 193–206; and “Schubert: Some Consequences of Nostalgia,” *19th-Century Music* 17 (1993), 34–46.
- 51 See the special issue of *19th-Century Music*: “Schubert: Music, Sexuality, Culture,” 17 (Summer 1993). The final commentary is by Robert Winter (“Whose Schubert?”), and traces various appropriations of “our Schubert” over the course of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

3 *Music, cultivation, and identity in Schubert’s circle*

- 1 To name only two relatively recent such publications, see Appendix C, “Personalia,” in John Reed, *Schubert* (London, 1987), 268–86, and Ernst Hilmar’s richly illustrated *Franz Schubert* (Graz, 1989), 49–86.
- 2 The title of Peter Clive, *Mozart and his Circle: A Biographical Dictionary* (London, 1993), is a case in point: not only is the formulation unusual in the field, it refers not to a particular group of close friends, but to everyone with whom Mozart had significant contact during his life.

- 3 Newman Flower, *Franz Schubert: The Man and his Circle* (New York, 1928), 50.
- 4 Stadler's memoirs were written in response to biographical inquiries by Ferdinand Luib, and are cited and translated in *SMF* 144–45. Deutsch's own more extensive list of Schubert's friends (*SME*, 1–5) is similar in nature. Note that the orchestra composed primarily of officials-in-training supplemented with a few choirboy-students (Schubert and Randhartinger) is a youthful parallel to the typical orchestra of the time consisting primarily of gentleman amateurs supplemented by a few professional musicians. On this structure and its subsequent professionalization, see William Weber, "Mass Culture and the Reshaping of European Musical Taste, 1770–1870," *International Review of the Aesthetics and the Sociology of Music* 8 (1977), 5–21.
- 5 See the discussion by Leon Botstein in "The Patrons and Public of the Quartets: Music, Culture, and Society in Beethoven's Vienna," in *The Beethoven Quartet Companion*, ed. Robert Winter and Robert Martin (Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1994), 77–109, esp. 83–93. For further discussion of the demographic, social, and musical context, see Alice M. Hanson, *Musical Life in Biedermeier Vienna* (Cambridge, 1985).
- 6 From a document written by Humboldt in 1809; cited in Wilhelm Dilthey and Alfred Heubaum, "Ein Gutachten Wilhelm von Humboldts über die Staatsprüfung des höheren Verwaltungsbeamten," *Jahrbuch für Gesetzgebung, Verwaltung und Volkswirtschaft im Deutschen Reich* 23 (1899), 253; translation from Friedrich A. Kittler, *Discourse Networks 1800/1900*, trans. Michael Metteer, with Chris Cullens (Stanford, 1990), 59. For a more extensive discussion of this culture in relation to the Lied in particular, see David Gramit, "Schubert's Wanderers and the Autonomous Lied," *Journal of Musicological Research* 14 (1995), 147–68.
- 7 Heinrich Kreissle von Hellborn, *Franz Schubert* (Vienna, 1865; rpt. Hildesheim and New York, 1978).
- 8 Flower, *Franz Schubert*, 115.
- 9 For the complete German text of this 1849 document (excerpted in *SMF*), see David Gramit, *The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert's Circle* (PhD diss., Duke University, 1987), 381–82.
- 10 From "On Franz Schubert," Bauernfeld's obituary article of 1829 (*SMF* 32).
- 11 For a closer examination of this relationship, see David Gramit, "Schubert and the Biedermeier: the Aesthetics of Johann Mayrhofer's 'Heliopolis,'" *Music and Letters* 74 (1993), 355–82.
- 12 For a more detailed account of this group, see Helga Prosl, *Der Freundeskreis um Anton von Spaun: Ein Beitrag zur Geistesgeschichte von Linz in der Biedermeierzeit (1811–1827)* (PhD diss., Leopold Franzens Universität, Innsbruck, 1951).
- 13 On the Austrian school curriculum, see Georg Jäger, "Zur literarischen Gymnasialbildung in Österreich von der Aufklärung bis zum Vormärz," in *Die österreichische Literatur: Ihr Profil an der Wende vom 18. bis zum 19. Jahrhundert (1750–1830)*, ed. Herbert Zeman, 2 vols. (Graz, 1979), I: 85–118.
- 14 From undated letters in the manuscript collection of the Stadt- und

Landesbibliothek, Vienna, Inventory Nos. 36662 and 36659, respectively. The context of the letters and their content date them to the second decade of the century. For the German texts, see Gramit, *Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets*, 376–78.

- 15 From a letter on the nature of poetry written by Anton von Spaun to Franz von Schober, February 16, 1813, Stadtbibliothek Inv. No. 36272. For the German text, see Gramit, *Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets*, 383–84.
- 16 Mayrhofer's comments appear in a dialogue, "Raphael," that he contributed to the second volume of the *Beyträge* (Vienna, 1818), 305–06; he wrote of the "Verzeichnungen und Verirrungen der deutschen Schule" and the "Canon des Schönen und Wahrhaften, mit einem Worte des Classischen." On Mayrhofer's authorship of the article, see Gramit, *Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets*, 71n. Spaun's letter to Schober of May 15, 1817, is Stadtbibliothek Inv. No. 36654: "die völlig unbestimmte, chaotische Sehnsucht des Herzens." Ottenwalt wrote to Schober on July 28, 1817 (Stadtbibliothek Inv. No. 36529): "führen häufig ein kleines, vielleicht verkehrtes Leben, lassen Geschichte nichts gelten, wissen von nichts als öder Nacht der absoluten All-und-Nichts Lehre, über der die Irrlichter und Gespenster der Romantik schweben."
- 17 Walther Dürr, "Der Linzer Schubert-Kreis und seine 'Beiträge zur Bildung für Jünglinge,'" *Historisches Jahrbuch der Stadt Linz* (1985), 51–59, argues that the Linz circle around Spaun had a fundamentally more political, action-oriented stance than the later, aestheticizing circle around Schubert. While the differences between the two groups should not be overlooked, to summarize them in this way not only minimizes a significant overlap of personnel, but also undervalues the level of aesthetic interest in the earlier group and the political awareness of the later; as the quotation from Spaun's letter given above suggests (p. 61), in neither group did political awareness carry with it expectations of political activity.
- 18 For further discussion of literary taste, see Gramit, *Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets*, 170–85 and 253–60.
- 19 See, for example, Josef von Spaun's letter to Bauernfeld of early 1829: "In spite of the admiration I have felt for my dear friend, for years, I am of the opinion that, in the field of instrumental and church music, we shall never make a Mozart or a Haydn out of him . . ." (*SMF* 30).
- 20 On Vogl, see Andreas Liess, *Johann Michael Vogl: Hofoperist und Schubertsänger* (Graz and Cologne, 1954).
- 21 (*SDB* 248); translation slightly emended.
- 22 For further discussion of elite culture in this context, see Kittler, *Discourse Networks*, esp. 143–44; Wolfgang Kaschuba, "Deutsche Bürgerlichkeit nach 1800: Kultur als symbolische Praxis," in *Bürgertum im 19. Jahrhundert: Deutschland im europäischen Vergleich*, ed. Jürgen Kocka, 3 vols. (Munich, 1988), III: 9–44; and Martha Woodmansee, "The Interest in Disinterestedness: Karl Philipp Moritz and the Emergence of the Theory of Aesthetic Autonomy in Eighteenth-Century Germany," *Modern Language Quarterly* 45 (1984), 22–47. In relation to music, my ideas have been influenced by Andreas Maier, who was kind enough to share his paper, "'Gluck'sches Gestöhn' und 'welsches

Larifari': Anna Milder, Franz Schubert und der deutsch-italienische Opernkrieg," *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 52 (1995), 171–204, before its publication.

- 23 Cited in Paul Bornstein, ed., *Der Briefwechsel des Grafen August von Platen*, 4 vols. (Munich and Leipzig, 1914), III: 101.
- 24 The first quotation is from Spaun's "On Schubert" (1829), the second from his "Notes on my Association with Franz Schubert" (1858) (*SMF* 24 and 140).
- 25 Maynard Solomon, "Franz Schubert's 'Mein Traum,'" *American Imago* 38 (1981), 137–54; and "Franz Schubert and the Peacocks of Benvenuto Cellini," *19th-Century Music* 12 (1989), 193–206. For an overview of public responses to Solomon's work, as well as scholarly debate over it, see "Schubert: Music, Sexuality, Culture," *19th-Century Music* 17 (1993).
- 26 Solomon, "Peacocks," 202.
- 27 For a rebuttal, see Rita Steblin, "The Peacock's Tale: Schubert's Sexuality Reconsidered," *19th-Century Music* 17 (1993), 5–33. For responses, see Solomon, "Schubert: Some Consequences of Nostalgia," *ibid.*, 34–46; Kristina Muxfeldt, "Political Crimes and Liberty, or Why Would Schubert eat a Peacock?" *ibid.*, 47–64; and Robert S. Winter, "Whose Schubert?" *ibid.*, 94–101.
- 28 Mayer, who later visited Vienna and met Schubert and other members of the circle, was writing from Breslau, where Schober had lived from 1823 to 1825. Stadt- und Landesbibliothek Inv. No. 36477: "Ich bin der glücklichste der Menschen . . . – ich habe einen dreifarbigen Katz! . . . Ich habe mich seitdem du weg bist noch viel mehr auf die Katzen gelegt; es ist immer besser als wenn ich auf den Hund gekommen wäre. – Ich habe mit zwei schlanken, einem imposanten, einem schnurrigen, und zwei fleißigen Katzen Bekanntschaft gemacht. Ich könnte dir viel darüber erzählen, da ich aber nicht weiß ob meine Freunde auch die deinigen sind, so wäre es doppelt indiskret davon zu reden, erstens weil es dich ennuyiren könnte u zweitens weil ich meine Katzen compromittiren könnte."

Another association – Franz von Bruchmann's close relationship to the poet August, Graf von Platen, whose homosexuality has long been common knowledge among literary scholars, and whose ideals of intense male friendship have much in common with those of Schubert's friends – has also been overlooked in the controversy.

- 29 Kenner's remarks are discussed in Solomon, "Peacocks," 194 and 197.
- 30 Stadtbibliothek Inv. No. 36525: "Anton saß am Clavier im Zimmer der Fr. v. Brandt, und spielte während der einbrechenden Dämmerung, seine Variationen über das Almerlied, die neuen über das russische Volkslied, wovon ich das Thema schon so liebe, weil es in Moll ist – und den schwermüthigen Traunerlieder, und noch einiges. Die Töne zogen mich mit sich fort. . . . Auf einmal besann ich mich, daß die Kremsmünsterer morgen fort müssen, es zog mich zu ihnen. . . . Dann blieb ich dort zwischen ihnen stehen, gab dem freundlichen Kahl die rechte Hand und legte die linke um unsern guten Ferdinand, der Arm in Arm mit Kenner dasaß. Er zog mich mit seinem rechten Arm näher an sich, und wie so die Töne recht in die Seele

redeten, fühlte ich den leisen, innigen Druck ihrer Hände, und ich musste ihnen wechselweise ins Gesicht schauen und in die lieben Augen. Wie sie still da sassen, angenehm bewegt von der Musik, und doch so friedlich und heiter, und ich sie so ansah, da dacht' ich: Ihr Guten, Ihr seid wohl glücklich in eurer Unschuld. Euch macht die Musik weicher, aber nicht traurig, nicht unruhig; was euer Herz verlangt, das faßt Ihr in der Hand eines Freundes, und andere Wünsche kennt Ihr nicht, denen die Melodie nur höhere Wellen gibt."

- 31 Prosl, *Freundeskreis*, 47.
- 32 The correspondence of Kupelwieser and Lutz is preserved in a twentieth-century manuscript copy in the Niederösterreichisches Landesmuseum in Vienna. Some of the letters are excerpted in *SDB*, and more extensively in Rupert Feuchtmüller, *Leopold Kupelwieser und die Kunst der österreichischen Spätromantik* (Vienna, 1970); Feuchtmüller also includes an index to the letters.
- 33 The concept of homosocial bonding as crucial to nineteenth-century society is developed by Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick, *Between Men: English Literature and Male Homosocial Desire* (New York, 1985).
- 34 Solomon, "Peacocks," 205.
- 35 Muxfeldt, "Political Crimes," 61–64.
- 36 Reed, *Schubert*, 81.
- 37 Virgil Nemoianu, *The Taming of Romanticism: European Literature and the Age of Biedermeier* (Harvard Studies in Comparative Literature, XXXVII) (Cambridge, Mass., and London, 1984), 40. Compare Schubert's own poem, "Klage an das Volk!", from his letter to Schober of September 21, 1824, which, after bemoaning the inactive and powerless present, concludes, "only to you, O sacred art, is it still granted to depict in images the time of power and deeds, to soften a little the great pain that can never reconcile that time with our fate." My translation. For the German text, see Deutsch, ed., *Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens in NSA* (Kassel, 1964), VIII/5, 258–59. For a comprehensive survey of the Biedermeier and the associated literature, see Friedrich Sengle, *Biedermeierzeit: deutsche Literatur im Spannungsfeld zwischen Restauration und Revolution, 1815–1848*, 3 vols. (Stuttgart, 1971–80).
- 38 For further discussion of the Biedermeier in relation to Schubert, see Gramit, "Schubert and the Biedermeier" and the literature cited there.
- 39 See Gramit, *Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets*, 151–54.
- 40 For the German text, see Walburga Litschauer, ed., *Neue Dokumente zum Schubert-Kreis: Aus Briefen und Tagebüchern seiner Freunde* (Vienna, 1986), 54.
- 41 This interpretation draws on the ideas of Michel de Certeau, *The Practice of Everyday Life*, trans. Steven F. Rendall (Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1984), see, in particular, pp. 37–38 on the tactical use of wit.

4 Schubert's inflections of Classical form

- 1 In fact, the poet Johann Chrysostomus Senn, known for his liberal views, was arrested along with Schubert two years before Schubert set his text. Senn was

deported after fourteen months' imprisonment. See John Reed, *The Schubert Song Companion* (Manchester, 1985), 384 and 479.

- 2 See my *Sonata Forms* (New York, 2nd edn 1988), 256–57.
- 3 For discussion of this development section see *ibid.*, 360–62. The second subject of this movement also begins with two phrases of five bars, but only by prolonging the last chord of each phrase for a full bar: this functions not like a five-bar rhythm, but like four bars with a fermata or pause.
- 4 I have given other examples in *The Frontiers of Meaning: Three Informal Lectures on Music* (New York, 1994).

5 Schubert and his poets

- 1 See Dietrich Berke, “Zu einigen anonymen Texten Schubertscher Lieder,” *Die Musikforschung* 22 (1969), 485–89; Walther Dürr, “Schubert's Songs and their Poetry: Reflections on the Poetic Aspects of Song Composition,” in *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe (Cambridge, 1982), 1–24; Hans Joachim Kreutzer, “Schubert und die literarische Situation seiner Zeit,” in *Franz Schubert: Jahre der Krise 1818–1823 (Arnold Feil zum 60. Geburtstag)*, ed. Werner Aderhold, Walther Dürr, and Walburga Litschauer (Kassel, 1985), 29–38; and Herbert Zeman, “Franz Schuberts Teilhabe an der österreichischen literarischen Kultur seiner Zeit,” in *Schubert-Kongreß Wien 1978: Bericht*, ed. Otto Brusatti (Graz, 1979).
- 2 Heinrich Kreissle von Hellborn, *Franz Schubert* (Vienna, 1865), 496.
- 3 See the fourth and final chapter of my *Schubert's Poets and the Making of Lieder* (Cambridge, 1996) for more on the Schulze songs.
- 4 Schubert would surely have known of Heinrich Josef Edler von Collin's (1722–1811) connection to Beethoven, who admired Heinrich's verse-tragedies on classical themes and wrote an overture (Op. 62) for the poet's drama *Coriolan* in 1807.
- 5 Ewan West, *Schubert's Lieder in Context: Aspects of Song in Vienna 1778–1828* (PhD diss., Oxford University, 1989), 262.
- 6 There is considerable useful information about Schubert's poets (and much else pertaining to his Lieder), albeit necessarily presented in capsule form, in section II, “The authors,” of John Reed's *The Schubert Song Companion* (Manchester, 1985), 461–81.
- 7 See Helena Jansen, *Karoline Pichlers Schaffen und Weltanschauung im Rahmen ihrer Zeit* (Graz, 1936), and Gertrude Prohaska, *Der literarische Salon der Karoline Pichler* (PhD diss., University of Vienna, 1946).
- 8 SMF 182–83. See also Ludwig Landshoff, *Johann Rudolph Zumsteeg (1750–1802): Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte des Liedes und der Ballade* (Berlin 1902); Günther Maier, *Die Lieder Johann Rudolf Zumsteegs und ihr Verhältnis zu Schubert* (Göppingen, 1971); Franz Szymichowski, *Johann Rudolf Zumsteeg als Komponist von Balladen und Monodien* (PhD diss., University of Frankfurt am Main, 1932); Jürgen Mainka, *Das Liedschaffen Franz Schuberts in den Jahren 1815 und 1816: Auseinandersetzung mit der Liedtradition des 18. Jahrhunderts* (PhD diss., Berlin Technische Universität, 1958); Edith

- Schnapper, *Die Gesänge des jungen Schubert vor dem Durchbruch des romantischen Liedprinzips* (Bern and Leipzig, 1937); and Willy Spilling, *Die Problematik des Schubertschen Liedes um das Jahr 1815* (PhD diss., University of Prague, 1931). See also Herbert Zeman, “Dichtung und Musik: Zur Entwicklung des österreichischen Kunstliedes vom 18. bis zum 19. Jahrhundert,” in *Musik und Dichtung: Festschrift Anton Dermota zum 70. Geburtstag*, ed. H. Zeman (Vienna, 1980), 20–34, and the same author’s *Die Österreichische Literatur: Ihr Profil an der Wende von 18. zum 19. Jahrhundert (1750–1830)* (Graz, 1979).
- 9 See my “Memory, Identity, and the Uses of the Past: Schubert and Luciano Berio’s Recital I (for Cathy),” in *Franz Schubert – Der Fortschrittliche? Analysen–Perspektiven–Fakten*, ed. Erich Wolfgang Partsch (Tutzing, 1989), 231–48. Berio quotes *Der Jüngling an der Quelle*, and both Salis-Seewis’s poem and Schubert’s setting are discussed in this article.
 - 10 See Barbara Kinsey, “Schubert and the Poems of Ossian,” *Music Review* 34 (1973), 22–29.
 - 11 David Gramit, *The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert’s Circle* (PhD diss., Duke University, 1987), 54–55.
 - 12 See Richard Kramer, “Der Jüngling am Bache: Schubert at the Source,” in *Distant Cycles: Schubert and the Conceiving of Song* (Chicago, 1994), 25–46.
 - 13 An early example of Schubert’s discomfiture with Schiller’s “Denk-Poesie,” or “thought poetry” (versified philosophy), and the reasons for that discomfiture can be found in the setting of *Hoffnung* (D251), composed on August 7, 1815. The poem is a miniature philosophical meditation to the effect that the world waxes old and then young, while humanity is born to strive for betterment. Hope, Youth, the World, Mankind, etc. appear in this tiny didactic work, but no “I,” no one poetic speaker. Schubert strives for some sort of profundity by setting the tiny song in the unusual key of G flat major, but that is hardly sufficient to create by itself a musical analogue to philosophical musings. Schubert returned to the same poem, possibly in 1817, and adopted an entirely different approach (D637).
 - 14 The two most recent biographical studies of Goethe are Nicholas Boyle, *Goethe: The Poet and the Age*, vol. I, *The Poetry of Desire (1749–1790)* (Oxford, 1991), and Karl Otto Conrady, *Goethe: Leben und Werk* (Frankfurt am Main, 1987). The second volume of Boyle’s biography, entitled *The Age of Renunciation 1790–1832*, is forthcoming.
 - 15 The existing bibliography on Schubert and Goethe includes: Friedrich Blume, “Goethes *Mondlied* in Schuberts Kompositionen,” *Der Bär: Jahrbuch von Breitkopf & Härtel* (1928), 31–58, reprinted in *Syntagma Musicologicum*, ed. Martin Ruhnke (Kassel, 1963), 813–33; Marius Flothuis, “Franz Schubert’s Compositions to Poems from Goethe’s ‘Wilhelm Meister’s Lehrjahre,’” in *Notes on Notes: Selected Essays by Marius Flothuis*, ed. Sylvia Broere-Moore (Amsterdam, 1974), 87–138; Walter Frisch, “Schubert’s *Nähe des Geliebten* (D162): Transformation of the *Volkston*,” in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln, Nebr., 1986), 175–99; Joseph Müller-Blattau, “Franz Schubert, der Sänger Goethes,” in *Goethe und die Meister der*

- Musik* (Stuttgart, 1969), 62–80; Walther Dürr, “Aus Schuberts erstem Publikationsplan: Zwei Hefte mit Liedern von Goethe,” in *Schubert-Studien: Festgabe der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften zum Schubert-Jahr 1978*, ed. Franz Grasberger and Othmar Wesseley (Vienna, 1978), 43–56.
- 16 Robert S. Winter makes this observation in “Whose Schubert?,” *19th-Century Music* 17 (1993), 101.
- 17 Rita Steblin, “Wilhelm Müllers Aufenthalt in Wien im Jahre 1817: Eine Verbindung zu Schubert durch Schlechta,” *Vom Pasqualatihaus: Musikwissenschaftliche Perspektiven aus Wien* 4 (Fall 1994), 19–26. Steblin observes that Müller and Schubert might have been in the same place at the same time on at least one occasion: a performance of Müller’s poem “Der Glockenguß zu Breslau” on December 22, 1817, at the Leopoldstadt theatre along with the tale “Der Gang zum Hochgerichte” by Schubert’s friend Franz von Schlechta, whose “Auf einen Kirchhof” Schubert had already set to music (D151). See also my *Retracing a Winter’s Journey: Schubert’s Winterreise* (Ithaca, 1991) and *Schubert: Die schöne Müllerin* (Cambridge, 1992) for more on Müller.
- 18 *Musen-Almanach für das Jahr 1814* (Vienna), 244.
- 19 Kristina Muxfeldt, *Schubert Song Studies* (PhD diss., State University of New York at Stony Brook, 1991), chapter 3, “Interpretation and Revision of the Poetic Model,” 75–126; see her chapter in the present volume in which she offers a detailed discussion of the alterations to *Nachtviolen*.
- 20 See chapter 4 of my *Schubert, Müller and Die schöne Müllerin* (Cambridge, forthcoming) for a more complete discussion of these omissions.
- 21 Maurice J. E. Brown, *Essays on Schubert*, (New York, 1966), 268. The NSA similarly distinguishes between “Fassung” and “Bearbeitung.”
- 22 Marius Flothuis, “Schubert Revises Schubert,” in *Schubert Studies*, 61–84, and Hans Holländer, “Franz Schubert’s Repeated Settings of the Same Song-Texts,” *Musical Quarterly* 14 (1928), 563–74.
- 23 See my forthcoming study “Cupid Revised: an erotic borrowing in Schubert’s Early Songs.”

6 Schubert’s songs

- 1 The importance of these arrangements is suggested by Joseph Kerman “*An die ferne Geliebte*,” in *Beethoven Studies* 1, ed. Alan Tyson (New York, 1973), 133.
- 2 Robert Schumann, *Gesammelte Schriften über Musik und Musiker*, ed. Martin Kreissig, 2 vols. (Leipzig, 1914), II: 147.
- 3 The phenomenon is discussed, among other places, in Susan Youens’s *Schubert: Die schöne Müllerin* (Cambridge, 1992), 22–30.
- 4 As valuable as the NSA is in many other respects, the editorial decision to abandon any effort at refining the chronology of the songs in favor of highlighting their publication groupings ensures that the ASA will remain an indispensable tool for scholars for a long time to come. The new edition reserves the first five volumes for songs that Schubert saw through to

publication, relegating the remaining songs (in what is left of the chronologically based order of their presentation in the new *Deutsch Verzeichnis*) to nine subsequent volumes. With the roughly two hundred published songs pulled out of any chronology, it is extremely difficult to gain a sense of compositional context for any of them by referring only to the new edition.

- 5 The remarkably close relationship between the tight motivic development in *Dass sie hier gewesen* and the development of images in the poem has been admired by various critics. In Charles Rosen's recent account of this and several other Schubert songs in a lecture entitled "Explaining the Obvious," the method by which this is accomplished is recognized as one instance of a more general mode of developing the contour and range of the motivic material found with great frequency in Schubert. See Charles Rosen's *The Frontiers of Meaning: Three Informal Lectures on Music* (New York, 1994), 72–126.
- 6 Richard Kramer offers a compelling rehearing of the harmonic underpinning of the opening measures of *Nähe des Geliebten* (and much else in the song, including provocative speculations on the significance of G flat as its key) in his *Distant Cycles: Schubert and the Conceiving of Song* (Chicago, 1994), 13–16. An earlier essay by Walter Frisch, "Schubert's 'Nähe des Geliebten' (D162): Transformation of the *Volkston*," in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln, Nebr., 1986), 175–99, offers much insight into Schubert's relation to earlier traditions.
- 7 In Reichardt's music these rarely go beyond mechanical accompanimental figurations which establish a general mood (as in his *Musensohn*, or *Euphrosyne*). Schubert uses such figures as a stable "identity" which can be made to undergo change and development to stimulate an analogy with the physical or mental motions suggested by the poem.
- 8 The review in the Leipzig *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* of June 24, 1824 is among the most damning (SDB 478–79).
- 9 Donald Francis Tovey, "Franz Schubert," in *The Main Stream of Music and Other Essays* (New York, 1959), 109–10.
- 10 In his diary on June 13, 1816, Schubert modestly ascribed the success of *Rastlose Liebe* to the musicality of Goethe's poetic genius (SDB 86). "Musical poetry" is defined by Schiller in the essay "On Naïve and Sentimental Poetry" (1795–96) as poetry which, like music, produces a given state of mind without relying on the imitation of a specific object, as do the plastic arts. This resonates well with the abstract imagery Goethe's poetic persona conjures in "Rastlose Liebe." Musical poetry, according to Schiller, "does not refer principally to the actual and material elements of music in poetry, but more generally, to all those effects which poetry is able to produce without subordinating the imagination to a specific object." The remark arises in a note on Klopstock; see Friedrich Schiller, "Naïve and Sentimental Poetry" and "On the Sublime." *Two Essays*, Trans. with introduction and notes by Julius A. Elias (New York, 1966), 133.

- 11 A comparison with settings of the same text by other composers is instructive. The settings by Zelter and Reichardt – conveniently reprinted and discussed in Thrasybulos Georgiades’s *Musik und Lyrik* (Göttingen, 1967), 63–69 – are both much more concerned with matching each change in poetic voice with a comparable musical articulation. An incomplete, but substantial, draft by Beethoven also survives. A comparison of Schubert’s treatment of a small detail, the fleeting, but powerful, harmonic inflection on the “eigen” of “Ach, wie so eigen schaffet es Schmerzen,” with Beethoven’s protracted stress of the same word through multiple repetition is immensely revealing of the radical difference in their approaches. The best published transcription of the sketch is in Douglas Johnson’s *Beethoven’s Early Sketches in the Fischhoff Miscellany* (PhD diss., Berkeley, 1977), 456–59.
- 12 The manuscript is today split in two and housed half in the University library in Oslo, and half at the Austrian National Library. Together with *Nachtviolen*, which is divided between the two halves of the manuscript, the autograph originally contained at least two other Mayrhofer songs, *Heliopolis I* and *Heliopolis II*, of which only the former was published while Schubert was still alive.
- 13 The manuscript of the poems is currently housed in the *Handschriftensammlung* of the Vienna Stadtbibliothek.
- 14 David Gramit offers a more explicit biographical interpretation of the textual alterations in his “Schubert and the Biedermeier: the Aesthetics of Johann Mayrhofer’s *Heliopolis*,” *Music and Letters* 74 (1993), 355–82. I too have discussed this and other similar revisions before both in my dissertation (*Schubert Song Studies*, State University of New York at Stony Brook, 1991) and in a paper entitled “Schubert’s Poetic Revisions,” delivered at the American Musicological Society meeting in Pittsburgh in 1992. Among the most impressive additional examples are the revisions to *Versunken* (D715), on a poem by Goethe, and the Rückert song *Greisengesang* (D778).

7 Schubert’s social music

I would like to thank Bryan Gilliam for many helpful comments on an earlier draft of this chapter.

- 1 Alfred Einstein, *Schubert: A Musical Portrait* (New York, 1951), 29.
- 2 For a discussion of this abstract hierarchy, see Carl Dahlhaus, “Was ist eine musikalische Gattung?,” *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 135 (1974), 620–25.
- 3 Einstein, *Schubert*, 254 and 246.
- 4 Alice M. Hanson, *Musical Life in Biedermeier Vienna* (Cambridge, 1985), 121.
- 5 *Ibid.* In other words, Schubert’s audiences were for the most part not connoisseurs but rather discriminating amateurs.
- 6 *Ibid.*, 86.
- 7 Otto Biba, “Franz Schubert in den musikalischen Abendunterhaltungen der Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde,” in *Schubert-Studien: Festgabe der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften zum Schubert-Jahr 1978*, ed. Franz Grasberger and Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1978), 8.

- 8 The other published collections were *Walzer, Ländler und Ecossaissen*, Op. 18 (1823); *Deutsche Tänze und Ecossaissen*, Op. 33 (1825); *Galoppe [sic] et Ecossaisses*, Op. 49 (1825); *Valses sentimentales*, Op. 50 (1825); *Hommage aux belles Viennoises. Wiener Damen-Ländler (und Ecossaissen)*, Op. 67 (1826); *Valses nobles*, Op. 77 (1827); *Grätzer Walzer*, Op. 91 (1828). For a discussion of the anthologies, see Walburga Litschauer, *NSA* (Kassel, 1990), VII/ii/6, *Vorwort*.
- 9 Maurice J. E. Brown, “The Dance-Music Manuscripts,” in his *Essays on Schubert* (New York, 1966), 242. Walburga Litschauer notes that Schubert’s friends made no distinction between the German dance and the waltz. See Litschauer, *NSA* VII/ii/6, *Vorwort*.
- 10 Walburga Litschauer, “Franz Schuberts Tänze – zwischen Improvisation und Werk,” *Musiktheorie* 10 (1995), 3–9.
- 11 Brown, “The Story of the ‘Trauerwalzer,’” in *Essays on Schubert*, 291.
- 12 Brown, *Schubert: A Critical Biography* (New York, 1978), 229–30.
- 13 Brown, “The Dance-Music Manuscripts.” Litschauer identifies the composition of “chains” of dances, especially Ländler, in the same key as a folk practice. See Litschauer, “Franz Schuberts Tänze,” 6.
- 14 Schubert thus wrote them down the day after the first public performance of his works. Did he perhaps improvise them at a party after the concert?
- 15 A number of dances seem to begin in one key, only to have the second section open and close in its relative major or minor. See, for example, the following écossaisses from MS 37: D977, numbers 5 and 8; and D145 (Op. 18), number 2.
- 16 For discussions of periods and sentences, see Arnold Schoenberg, *Fundamentals of Musical Composition*, ed. Gerald Strang and Leonard Stein (London, 1967), and Erwin Ratz, *Einführung in die musikalische Formenlehre* (Vienna, 1973).
- 17 Litschauer, “Franz Schuberts Tänze,” 6.
- 18 David Brodbeck, “Dance Music as High Art: Schubert’s Twelve Ländler, Op. 171 (D790),” in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln, Nebr., 1986), 44.
- 19 Einstein, *Schubert*, 199 and 216. Brown uses these Ländler several times in his biography to illustrate fine points of Schubert’s style. See Brown, *Schubert*, 129, 213, and 221.
- 20 David Brodbeck, “Brahms’s Edition of Twenty Schubert Ländler: an Essay in Criticism,” in *Brahms Studies: Analytical and Historical Perspectives. Papers Delivered at the International Brahms Conference, Washington, D.C., 5–8 May 1983*, ed. George S. Bozarth (London, 1990), 229–50.
- 21 Robert Schumann, *On Music and Musicians*, ed. Konrad Wolff, trans. Paul Rosenfeld (New York, 1969), 125.
- 22 Hanson, *Musical Life*, 118.
- 23 Dahlhaus, “Was ist eine musikalische Gattung?,” 620–21.
- 24 Einstein, *Schubert*, 241. For discussions of the “Grand Duo” and the great F Minor Fantasy (D940) in the present volume, see the chapters by Charles Rosen and William Kinderman, respectively.

- 25 Einstein, *Schubert*, 282.
- 26 The marches appeared as Opp. 27 (D602), 40 (D819), 51 (D733), 55 (D859), 63 No. 1 (D823), 66 (D885); the variations as Opp. 10 (D624), 35 (D813), 82 No. 1 (D908), and 84 No. 1 (D823); the polonaises as Opp. 61 (D824) and 75 (D599). The remaining works are the *Rondeau brillant* (Op. 84 No. 2, D823), the Rondo in A (Op. 107, D951), the Overture in F (Op. 34, D675), and the *Divertissement à l'hongroise* (Op. 54, D818).
- 27 Jonathan Bellman, "Toward a Lexicon for the *Style hongrois*," *Journal of Musicology* 9 (1991), 214–37.
- 28 Einstein, *Schubert*, 77, 133, 244–45, 280.
- 29 Schubert modeled his "Trout" Quintet on Hummel's arrangement for the same ensemble of his own Septet. See Basil Smallman, *The Piano Quartet and Quintet: Style, Structure, and Scoring* (Oxford, 1994), 29. Hummel's quintet, however, makes almost no use of the texture characteristic of Schubert's work.
- 30 Dietrich Berke, *NSA* (Kassel, 1974), III/4, *Vorwort*.
- 31 The one female partsong to appear in print during Schubert's lifetime was *Coronach* (Op. 52 No. 4, D836); see below.
- 32 Biba, "Schubert in den musikalischen Abendunterhaltungen," 10.
- 33 Berke, *NSA*, III/4, *Vorwort*.
- 34 Schubert had first attempted to set Goethe's poem as a Lied in September 1816, but he did not complete that setting. His work with the text culminated in the final partsong version discussed below.
- 35 Lawrence Kramer writes of the "sudden extravagance of Mignon's rhetoric" at these lines in "Decadence and Desire: The *Wilhelm Meister* Songs of Wolf and Schubert," *19th-Century Music* 10 (1987), 239.
- 36 Schubert composed *Gott in der Natur* (D757), *Ständchen* (D920), and *Mirjams Siegesgesang* (D942) for Anna Fröhlich.
- 37 For an account of the male partsongs, see Maurice J. E. Brown, "The Part-Songs for Male Voices," in his *Essays on Schubert*, 59–84.
- 38 Walter Dürr, "Zwischen Liedertafel und Männergesang-Verein: Schuberts mehrstimmige Gesänge," in *Logos Musicae: Festschrift für Albert Palm*, ed. Rüdiger Görner (Wiesbaden, 1982), 36–54; Dietrich Berke, "'Gesang der Geister über den Wassern': Die mehrstimmigen Gesänge," in *Franz Schubert: Jahre der Krise 1818–1823 (Arnold Feil zum 60. Geburtstag)*, ed. Werner Aderhold, Walther Dürr, and Walburga Litschauer (Kassel, 1985), 39–47.
- 39 These partsongs were Opp. 11 (*Das Dörfchen*, *Die Nachtigall*, and *Geist der Liebe*), 16 (*Frühlingsgesang* and *Naturgenuss*), and 17 (*Jünglingswonne*, *Liebe*, *Zum Rundetanz*, and *Die Nacht*).
- 40 Not all of the partsongs described here as being in three sections, however, are ternary forms.

8 Schubert's piano music

- 1 See Theodor W. Adorno, "Schubert," in *Moments musicaux* (Frankfurt, 1964), 18–36. This essay originally dates from 1928.
- 2 For recent discussions of the problems of assessing Schubert's total output of

- sonatas, including fragmentary works, see Eva Badura-Skoda, “The Piano Works of Schubert,” in *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, ed. R. Larry Todd (New York, 1990), 100–02; and Andreas Krause, *Die Klaviersonaten Franz Schuberts: Form – Gattung – Ästhetik* (Kassel and New York, 1992), 13–15.
- 3 *Franz Schubert: Klaviersonaten Band III. Frühe und unvollendete Sonaten*, ed. Paul Badura-Skoda (Munich, 1976). See also the edition prepared by Howard Ferguson of the complete piano sonatas including the unfinished works, 3 vols. (London, 1979).
 - 4 Krause, for instance, has questioned the association of the A major movement (D604) with the F sharp Minor Sonata (D571/570), as well as the inclusion of four movements in the F Minor Sonata fragment (D625), arguing that the D flat Adagio (D505) is replaced by the scherzo, and that the work exists in two different, three-movement versions.
 - 5 “Playing Schubert’s Piano Sonatas,” liner notes to the 1994 recording of the sonatas in A flat Major (D557), B flat Major (D575) and G Major (D894); London 440 307–2.
 - 6 Peter Szondi, “Friedrich Schlegel und die romantische Ironie,” in *Friedrich Schlegel und die Kunsttheorie seiner Zeit*, ed. Helmut Schanze (Darmstadt, 1985), 151, cited in Krause, *Die Klaviersonaten Franz Schuberts*, 114.
 - 7 See in this regard the chapter “Unvollendetes,” in Hans Gal, *Franz Schubert oder Die Melodie* (Frankfurt, 1970), 184–215; Eng. trans. as *Franz Schubert and the Essence of Melody* (London, 1974), 152–77.
 - 8 See Schnebel, “Klangräume – Zeitklänge: Zweiter Versuch über Schubert,” in *Musik-Konzepte Franz Schubert*, ed. Heinz-Klaus Metzger and Rainer Riehn (Munich, 1979), 95–96.
 - 9 This relationship has been noted by various authors, including Hans Költzsch, *Franz Schubert in seinen Klaviersonaten* (Leipzig, 1927; rpt. Hildesheim and New York, 1976), 95; and Krause, *Die Klaviersonaten*, 131, 138. Geoffrey Saba has recorded the F Minor Sonata in a four-movement version completed by the late Prussian/Australian scholar W. A. Dullo: *Schubert Recital*, Innovative Music Productions Ltd. (1991), PCD 950. Wilhelm Kempff and many others played Erwin Ratz’s completion of the F Minor Sonata (Universal Edition).
 - 10 *Schubert*, trans. David Ascoli (London, 1951), 245.
 - 11 *Schubert* (London, 1987), 137.
 - 12 See *On Music and Musicians*, ed. Konrad Wolff, trans. Paul Rosenfeld (New York, 1969), 113.
 - 13 Tobias Haslinger published the sonata in 1827 with the title “Fantasie, Andante, Menuetto und Allegretto”; critics responded to this title in the first reviews (*SDB* 674, 685, 693–94).
 - 14 “Schubert’s Last Sonatas,” in *Music Sounded Out* (New York, 1990), 72–141. Brendel’s most recent recordings of the later sonatas and other piano works have appeared with Philips Classics Productions.
 - 15 Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen, *Untersuchungen zur Entwicklung der Sonatenform in der Instrumentalmusik Franz Schuberts* (Tutzing, 1994), 323–25.
 - 16 Edward T. Cone, “Schubert’s Beethoven,” *The Musical Quarterly* 56 (1970), 779–93; Charles Rosen, *The Classical Style* (New York, 1971), 456–58.

- 17 Charles Fisk, “Schubert’s Last Finales,” unpublished paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Musicological Society, Oakland, 1990.
- 18 Tovey, “Schubert,” in *Essays and Lectures on Music* (London, 1949), 119.
- 19 See Thomas Kabisch, *Liszt und Schubert* (Munich, 1984).
- 20 Einstein, *Schubert*, 324.
- 21 *On Music and Musicians*, 118–19.
- 22 *Schubert: The Final Years* (New York, 1972), 228.
- 23 For a more detailed discussion of the form of this work see Arthur Godel, “Zum Eigengesetz der Schubertschen Fantasien,” in *Schubert-Kongreß: Wien 1978: Bericht*, ed. Otto Brusatti (Graz, 1979), 202–04; and my essay, “Schubert’s Tragic Perspective,” in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln, Nebr., 1986), 75–82, from which some of the present discussion is drawn.
- 24 “Schubert’s Piano Duets,” *Musical Times* 117 (1976), 121.

9 Schubert’s chamber music

- 1 Exceptions that prove the rule include the Variations for Flute and Piano on *Trockne Blumen* (D802), written for the flute virtuoso Ferdinand Bogner, and both the Rondo for Violin and Piano (D895) and the Fantasy for Violin and Piano (D934), written for the violinist Josef Slavjk. All three compositions, though composed late in his life, are among the least successful works of their period.
- 2 See “From Franz Schubert’s Life” by his brother Ferdinand (*SDB* 912–13).
- 3 *SDB* 91, notes about Josef Doppler, and “On the Musical Evenings at Schubert’s and his Father’s Homes” by Leopold Sonnleithner, *SMF* 342.
- 4 Verbal communication in February 1974.
- 5 I have photocopies of parts for two overtures. Neither has a title, but I recognized one as the overture to Salieri’s opera *Palmyra*.
- 6 See Martin Chusid, “Schubert’s Overture for String Quintet and Cherubini’s Overture to *Faniska*,” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 15 (1961), 78–84.
- 7 “Revisionsbericht,” *ASA* 52.
- 8 Martin Chusid, *The Chamber Music of Schubert* (PhD diss., Univ. of California, Berkeley, 1961), 303–05 and 320–21. See also my article “Concerning Orchestral Style in Schubert’s Earliest Chamber Music for Strings,” in *Music in Performance and Society: Essays in Honor of Roland Jackson* (Warren, Mich., 1996).
- 9 Alfred Orel, *Der junge Schubert* (Vienna and Leipzig, 1941), 18.
- 10 According to Orel the fragmentary manuscript of a string quartet first movement in C minor (D103) was probably complete at one time. He completed the movement and it was published (score by Philharmonia of Vienna, 1939; parts by Robitschek, also of Vienna and the same year).
- 11 The sketching as a string trio allowed Schubert to compose the first movement of the quartet version in the incredibly short time of four and a half hours, as he noted on the autograph.

- 12 Carl Czerny, *School of Practical Composition* (London, 1848), I: 33. According to William Newman, *The Sonata Since Beethoven* (Chapel Hill, 1969), 787, the English translation was made from a German version dating from c. 1840. He points out, however, that the first German edition of this book was published by Simrock of Bonn in 1849–50, after the English edition.
- 13 *Franz Schubert: Jahre der Krise 1818–1823*, ed. Werner Aderhold, Walther Dürr, and Walburga Litschauer (Kassel, 1985).
- 14 “Revisionsbericht,” ASA 82.
- 15 See Martin Chusid, “Schubert’s Cyclic Compositions of 1824,” *Acta Musicologica* 36 (1964), 37–45.
- 16 For more on Schubert’s variations, see Maurice J. E. Brown, *Schubert’s Variations* (London, 1954).
- 17 See note 15.
- 18 Schubert was to use the theme again for a set of variations, the Impromptu for Piano in B flat (D935, Op. 142 No. 3). As justification for multiple usage of a well-known theme of his own, Schubert may have had in mind Beethoven’s employment of his Orchestral Contredanse No. 7 in the *Prometheus* music, as well as for two sets of themes and variations, Op. 35 for Piano, and the finale of the “Eroica” Symphony.
- 19 See also the beginning of the second part of the Ländler, mm. 9–16, and the beginning of the second part of the Scherzo, mm. 23–32.
- 20 Martin Chusid, *The Chamber Music of Schubert*, 293.
- 21 See the letter to his brother Ferdinand in SDB 363.
- 22 See Martin Chusid, “A Suggested Redating for the E-flat Piano Sonata,” in *Schubert-Kongreß: Wien 1978: Bericht*, ed. Otto Brusatti (Graz, 1979), 37–44.
- 23 Schubert’s early String Quartet in C Major (D32) and Haydn’s String Quartet in C Major (Op. 76 No. 3, the “Emperor”) also have minor finales. This is not a common phenomenon and it is of some interest that all three pieces mentioned are in the same key.
- 24 There are several “Tutti” and “Solo” indications in the autograph and a number of measures of the cello part have either noteheads with two stems or additional notes calling for a second part. Schubert seems to have had in mind performances with contrabass added, as in the “Trout” Quintet, or small string orchestra. See Arnold Feil, “Preface” to NSA VI/7, xiv.
- 25 The title no doubt refers to the origin of the piano trio from the accompanied piano sonata in which the cello part in particular tended to duplicate the bass of the keyboard part. See, for example, the piano trios of Haydn.
- 26 See Robert Winter, “Paper Studies and Schubert Research,” in *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe (Cambridge, 1982), 248–49.
- 27 With rare exception, the many piano trios by Haydn are in two or three movements; those by Mozart are all in three. Only Beethoven wrote his piano trios most often in four movements.
- 28 Schuppanzigh had played with Beethoven at the keyboard for the first performance of the “Archduke” Trio on April 11, 1814. See Anton Schindler, *Beethoven as I Knew Him* (Chapel Hill, c. 1968), 171. He also led the group

- performing one or both of Schubert's piano trios at their first performances. See SDB 698 (E flat Trio) and SDB 724–25 (B flat Trio?).
- 29 The premiere took place April 2, 1800. Elliot Forbes, ed. *Thayer's Life of Beethoven* (Princeton, rev. edn. 1967), 255.
 - 30 The clarinetist in 1827 may have been George Klein (SDB 628).
 - 31 Schubert also wrote an Octet for Winds in F Major (D72, 1813) of which a fragment of the first movement as well as the Minuet and finale survive.
 - 32 Chusid, *The Chamber Music of Schubert*, 234–41.
 - 33 As he was to do later in the first movement of the Piano Sonata in the same key (D960), also with tonal consequences later in the movement.
 - 34 See diagram no. 8 in Chusid, "A Suggested Redating," 44.

10 Schubert's orchestral music

This essay is based on an article I wrote for *Thesis*, the magazine of the Graduate School and University Center of the City University of New York. "The Symphonies of Schubert: Pieces of a Puzzle" appeared in *Thesis* 3/2 (Fall 1989), 22–29. I should like to thank Jim Holt, editor, and Jerry Kisslinger, managing editor, for permission to draw from that article in this essay.

- 1 See Leonard Michael Griffel, *Schubert's Approach to the Symphony* (PhD diss., Columbia University, 1975), 11–13.
- 2 For a discussion of this issue, see Mi-Sook Han Hur, *Irregular Recapitulation in Schubert's Instrumental Works* (PhD diss., The City University of New York, 1992), 18–20, 26–28. On the related issue of the influence of overture style on Schubert's large-scale instrumental works, see two articles by Martin Chusid: "Schubert's Overture for String Quintet and Cherubini's Overture to *Faniska*," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 15 (1962), 78–84; and "Das 'Orchester-mässige' in Schuberts früher Streicher-kammermusik," in *Zur Aufführungspraxis der Werke Franz Schuberts*, ed. Vera Schwarz (Munich, 1981), 77–86.
- 3 See an excellent discussion of Schubert's choice of D major in Brian Newbould, *Schubert and the Symphony: A New Perspective* (London and Exeter, 1992), 33–34.
- 4 Young Schubert would have known symphonies by not only the Viennese masters but also by a number of lesser composers in or near Vienna around the turn of the century, such as Ignaz Umlauf (1746–96), Franz Süssmayr (1766–1803), Anton Eberl (1765–1807), Joseph Wölfl (1773–1812), Leopold Kozeluch (1747–1818), Anton Wranitzky (1761–1820), Andreas Romberg (1767–1821), Franz Krommer (1759–1831), Friedrich Witt (1770–1836), Bernhard Romberg (1767–1841), and Adalbert Gyrowetz (1763–1850). Stylistic traits of the symphonies of the time include irregular phrasing, bold modulations, syncopated rhythms, episodes in minor keys, chromaticism, folk melodies, sudden changes of harmony, and lyrical passages – all of which became an integral part of Schubert's symphonic style.
- 5 See Josef von Spaun's obituary of Schubert, as revised by Anton Ottenwalt, SDB 866.

- 6 See Griffel, *Schubert's Approach*, 25–30.
- 7 For example, Schubert himself deleted twenty-four highly repetitious measures from the closing section of the exposition of the First Symphony's opening movement. Would that he had revised the Sixth Symphony's first development section, a boring series of statements of the exposition's closing material.
- 8 Leopold von Sonnleithner (1797–1873), author of several accounts of the history of music in Vienna during the first half of the nineteenth century, was an ardent admirer of Schubert's music. His recollections of both the Frischling and Hatwig orchestras are presented in "Musikalische Skizzen aus Alt-Wien," *Recensionen und Mittheilungen über Theater, Musik und bildende Kunst* (March 23, 1862), 177–80.
- 9 A facsimile edition of these sketches (and also D708A and D936A, discussed below) was published by Bärenreiter in 1978; the German conductor and musicologist Peter Gülke published both a transcription of these sketches and his own orchestral completions of them in 1982 (Edition Peters). These fragments were orchestrated also by the British scholar Brian Newbould in 1979–81. Recorded in London in 1982 and 1983, Newbould's versions may be heard in the complete set of Schubert symphonies issued by Philips in 1984: 412 176–2.
- 10 Gerald Abraham suggested that the *entr'acte* in B minor from the *Rosamunde* music (D797, 1823) is actually the finale to the "Unfinished" and should be performed as such. See "Finishing the Unfinished," *Musical Times* 112 (June 1971), 547–48. I remain unconvinced.
- 11 Program notes for the Crystal Palace Season, 1880–81, 576.
- 12 Maynard Solomon, "Schubert and Beethoven," *19th-Century Music* 3 (1979), 115.
- 13 We know very well how Brahms much later put off completing a first symphony for at least fifteen years because he felt oppressed by the shadow of Beethoven. And we may also recall that Beethoven himself was not up to finishing his first symphony until the year 1800, when he was almost thirty, conceivably because he, too, feared comparison with the master who had preceded him, Joseph Haydn, whose last London Symphonies had been completed in 1795. (Probably for the same reason, Beethoven had not allowed the publication of any of his string quartets until 1801.)
- 14 Newbould, *Schubert and the Symphony*, 298–99, suggests that the D936A sketches represent the "Last" (and, therefore, the "Lost") Symphony of Schubert, the one that Eduard von Bauernfeld had in mind when he spoke of an 1828 symphony.
- 15 See Robert Winter, "Paper Studies and the Future of Schubert Research," in *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe (Cambridge, 1982), 209–75.
- 16 There is no clear record of an attempt by Schubert to sell this work to a publisher, but only his reference to "a symphony" in the letter to B. Schott's Söhne cited above (see *SDB* 739–40).

- 17 See Otto Biba, “Schubert’s Position in Viennese Musical Life,” *19th-Century Music* 3 (1979), 107–08.

11 Schubert’s religious and choral music

- 1 The hymn is certainly *Ellens Gesang III*, “Hymne an die Jungfrau” (D839), better known as *Ave Maria*. Schubert composed songs on religious texts throughout his career; among them are masterpieces such as the four “Hymns” on Novalis texts (D659–62). They do not constitute an independent sub-genre within the entire corpus of Schubert’s songs, but rather draw on various song styles. For this reason, as well as for limitations of space, they cannot be considered in this essay.
- 2 See Alice M. Hanson, *Musical Life in Biedermeier Vienna* (Cambridge, 1985), 127ff., for a description of the cynical attitudes toward the clergy and quotations from contemporary observers about the misuse of church services for social interaction and display of fashionable clothing.
- 3 The principal study in English is Ronald Stringham’s unpublished PhD dissertation, *The Masses of Franz Schubert* (Cornell University, 1964). It has been largely superseded by Hans Jaskulsky’s book, *Die lateinischen Messen Franz Schuberts* (Mainz, 1986). Significant topical essays which are not later cited include Kurt von Fischer, “Bemerkungen zu Schuberts As-dur-Messe,” in *Franz Schubert: Jahre der Krise 1818–1823*, ed. Werner Aderhold, Walther Dürr, and Walburga Litschauer (Kassel, 1985), 121–29; and Hans Jancik, “Franz Schubert und die Wiener Kirchenmusik seiner Zeit,” in *Franz Schubert und die Pfarrkirche Lichtental* (Vienna, 1978), 28–31.
- 4 See Jaskulsky, *Messen*, 52–73, for a review of the literature and his own view that the omissions were not coincidental; were not undertaken for purely musical reasons; nor are they attributable only to a faulty copy of the Mass text, an argument advanced by Paul Badura-Skoda in his essay “On Schubert’s Mass Texts,” *American Choral Review* 32 (Winter–Spring 1990), 5–7. See also Leopold Nowak, “Franz Schuberts Kirchenmusik,” in *Bericht über den Internationalen Kongress für Schubertforschung Wien 25. bis 29. November 1928* (Augsburg, 1929), 183–87; and Reinhard van Hoorickx, “Textänderungen in Schuberts Messen,” in *Schubert-Kongreß: Wien 1978: Bericht*, ed. Otto Brusatti (Graz, 1979), 249–54.
- 5 See Talia Pecker Berio in the foreword to the first volume of the *Messes*: *Messen I* in *NSA* (Kassel, 1990), I/1, ix, who views Mass No. 6 as a “confrontation with faith and with the liturgical text as well as an opening to new [musical] paths, which death abruptly ended.”
- 6 Stringham, *Messes*, 89–91.
- 7 See Jaskulsky, *Messen*, 20–31. In 1827 the Hofkapellmeister Joseph Eybler justified his denial of Schubert’s request for a court performance of the Mass in A flat with the argument that it is not in the style that the Kaiser “loves,” but Jaskulsky contends that Eybler invented this reason because he favored the court composer Josef Weigl and wanted to avoid paying the honorarium due Schubert if his Mass was accepted for performance.

- 8 There is a wealth of material on formal organization. Important English-language contributions include Stringham's dissertation (see n. 3) and Bruce MacIntyre's book, *The Viennese Concerted Mass of the Early Classic Period* (Ann Arbor, 1986). Among German authors, Jaskulsky treats formal problems in Schubert's Masses against the backdrop of Austrian convention, and, in her recent dissertation (*Das Gloria in Beethovens Missa Solemnis* [University of Munich, 1994], 9–27), Birgit Lodes presents an in-depth discussion of the tradition of Gloria settings.
- 9 A decree of the Hofkanzlei of December 19, 1806, forbade women singing in church unless they were related to the choir director or teacher of the school associated with the church at which they were to sing. The decree was intended to prevent operatic styles in liturgical music and thus ensure that the music preserved a "contemplative" rather than "entertaining" character; see Otto Biba, "Besetzungsverhältnisse in der Wiener Kirchenmusik," in *Zur Aufführungspraxis der Werke Franz Schuberts*, ed. Vera Schwarz (Munich, 1978), 180–87. In 1833 Archbishop Mulde, the highest officer of the Austrian Catholic church, forbade the performance of any non-liturgical works in churches, even including oratorios; see Frank Frederick Mueller Jr., *The Austrian Mass between Schubert and Bruckner* (DMA thesis, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1973), 8.
- 10 The Mass in F was first performed in October 1814; Schubert conducted and friends and members of his family participated, as they did for later religious music. It is likely that the church hired additional players (and perhaps singers) for the performance, for the ensemble requirements exceeded the normal resources of a small suburban church. Salieri, with whom Schubert had studied at the Stadtkonvikt, attended the Mass and probably helped to arrange a performance in Vienna shortly thereafter. These performances were the first public hearings of Schubert's music.
- 11 See Otto Biba, "Kirchenmusikalische Praxis zu Schuberts Zeit," in *Franz Schubert: Jahre der Krise 1818–1823*, 113–21, and "Besetzungsverhältnisse," 180–87. According to Biba, the consistently high solo and choral soprano parts in Schubert's Masses represent a departure from the practice forbidding women singers in liturgical performance (see n. 9). Biba has not provided documentary evidence that women sang in the choruses performing Schubert's Masses in his lifetime.
- 12 See Leopold M. Kantner, "Franz Schuberts Kirchenmusik auf dem Hintergrund stilistischer Zusammenhänge und persönlicher Einstellung," in *Schubert-Studien: Festgabe der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften zum Schubert-Jahr 1978*, ed. Franz Grasberger and Othmar Wessely (Vienna, 1978), 131–41.
- 13 Jaskulsky, *Messen*, 117.
- 14 The canon for solo voices in the Benedictus is clearly modeled after the quintet in the first act of *Fidelio*, but no ideological implications are evident here. Other references to Beethoven's works include Nathanael's aria in the second act of *Lazarus*, whose heroism is reminiscent of Florestan's in *Fidelio*, Maria's first aria in the first act of the same work that cites the first song in *An*

die ferne Geliebte, and the “Dona nobis pacem” of the Mass in A Flat, which owes a debt to the first movement of the violin concerto.

- 15 Jaskulsky, *Messen*, 140.
- 16 For the publication of the Mass in 1825 (with a dedication to Holzer) Schubert composed two oboe (or clarinet) parts, two trumpet parts and a timpani part for the first edition by Diabelli in 1825. It appears in this form in both editions of the complete works. Ferdinand Schubert composed parts for trumpets and timpani to the Mass in G while his brother still lived and in 1847 added oboes and bassoons, at which time he published the Mass under his own name. These additions were doubtlessly undertaken as a concession to contemporary preference for large orchestral ensembles. Schubert recomposed movements in several Masses: a more monumental “Dona nobis pacem” for the Mass in F (1815), a Benedictus with a much simpler soprano solo part for the Mass in G (1828? the original part had been composed for Therese Grob), and made numerous revisions to the Credo of the Mass in A flat including a new, much stricter fugue for “cum sancto spiritu.”
- 17 Jaskulsky, *Messen*, 117.
- 18 Schubert planned to publish the three choral works as a group; this plan was realized by Carl Czerny in 1829.
- 19 See Einstein, *Schubert: A Musical Portrait* (New York, 1951), p. 91.
- 20 The libretto of 1778, when the original setting by Rolle was performed, designates the three parts as “Handlungen,” the German equivalent of act.
- 21 Schubert might also have taken the underlying key scheme, F minor moving to F major, from Pergolesi’s setting.
- 22 While the models for the overall ensemble and the melodic style could only be found in Bach’s sacred music, Schubert might well have encountered this technique – one of Bach’s most idiosyncratic and powerful – in his keyboard music, for example the B flat Minor Prelude from the second book of the *Well-Tempered Clavier*. See Einstein (*Schubert*, 298) for borrowings in Mass No. 6 from both books of the *Well-Tempered Clavier*.
- 23 Schubert attended private concerts of historical music at the home of Raphael Georg Kiesewetter, at which Bach’s motet *Jesu meine Freude* was sung in 1818 and 1823 and the *Magnificat* setting was regularly performed. The *Magnificat* contains several arias with an obbligato instrumental part; the oboe part and the chromatic, minor-mode pathos of No. 3 “Quia respexit humilitatem,” place it in a close stylistic and expressive relationship to “Ach was hätten wir empfunden.” Whether the former served as a direct model for the latter cannot be determined on the basis of the available evidence. See Herfrid Kier, *Raphael Georg Kiesewetter, 1773–1850: Wegbereiter des musikalischen Historismus* (Regensburg, 1968), 57–73.
- 24 Maynard Solomon holds this view and in a personal communication to the author pointed out that such a motivation would be consistent with the pattern of work dedications to members of the Austrian nobility.
- 25 On the vocal style see Kubik, “Die Ambivalenz als Gestaltungsprinzip. Untersuchungen zur Deklamation in Schubert’s *Lazarus*,” and for the

orchestral writing see Maurice J. E. Brown, *The New Grove Schubert* (New York and London, 1983), 85.

- 26 See Kubik, foreword to *Lazarus oder die Feier der Auferstehung*, NSA (Kassel, 1987), II/2, ix–xiii.
- 27 These reviews represent the only significant critical response to the Masses when first performed, after which they remained obscure for decades. Mass No. 4 was the only one published while Schubert lived, and the others awaited decades for performance and publication. Schumann briefly mentioned the Masses in the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* (1839); in 1874 Brahms performed parts of Mass No. 4. By the middle of the century Mass No. 2 had gained wide currency for liturgical use, and the late Masses were (and remain) acknowledged as among the finest of their time.
- 28 With the exception of this Mass, Schubert observes convention and follows Michael Haydn and other Austrian composers in setting “Et incarnatus est” for solo voices. Jaskulsky finds precedents for the historicisms in Antonio Caldara’s *Missa dolorosa* and J. J. Fux’s *Missa Purificationis*.

12 Schubert’s operas

- 1 The review by Gerhard R. Koch, dated May 10, appeared on May 14, 1988. Enthusiastic reviews greeted the opera in numerous papers throughout Germany and Austria. Even the opera’s detractors, notably Wilhelm Sinkovicz, who wrote the negative reviews in Vienna’s *Die Presse* for both the 1988 and 1990 performances, acknowledged implicitly in his reviews that the audience and other critics found the work convincing.
- 2 Reinhard van Hoorickx, in his sympathetic “Les Opéras de Schubert,” *Revue Belge de Musicologie* 28–30 (1974–76), 238–59, summarized the general view: “Certes, on ne cesse de répéter que Schubert n’avait pas un tempérament dramatique, qu’il avait mal choisi ses livrets, etc. . . . C’est partiellement vrai, mais ce n’est pas toute la vérité” (p. 238). Brown argued in many places of the need to experience Schubert’s operas in the theater, most concentratedly in his “Schubert’s Two Major Operas: a consideration of the Possibility of Actual Stage Production,” *Music Review* 20 (1959), 104–18. McKay has devoted much of her career to the study of Schubert’s operas (see her “Schubert as a Composer of Operas,” in *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe [Cambridge, 1982], 85–104; and *Schubert’s Music for the Theater* [Tutzing, 1991]).
- 3 *Die Verschworenen* (1823), sometimes known as *Der häusliche Krieg*, the title the censors gave it, became Schubert’s most popular Singspiel. Although it was not performed during Schubert’s lifetime, *Die Verschworenen* became somewhat of a repertory piece in late nineteenth-century Vienna, with runs during the seasons of 1861–62, 1872–73, 1877–81 inclusive, and 1897 (see Franz Hadamowsky, *Die Wiener Hoftheater [Staatstheater] 1776–1966*, 2 vols. [Vienna, 1966]).
- 4 In February 1977, the Reading University Opera Club (England) gave the first

fully staged performance, albeit in English translation, of the complete *Alfonso und Estrella*. The first performance of the complete opera in its original language took place in Graz on September 28, 1991.

Felix Mottl conducted a shortened version of *Fierrabras* in its stage production at Karlsruhe in 1897. This same version, in French translation, was staged in Brussels in 1928. Several concert presentations of the opera occurred during the 1970s. Around 1980, interest in staging *Fierrabras* increased, with staged performances taking place in Philadelphia (1980), at Hermance Castle in Geneva (1981), in Augsburg (1982), and in a semi-professional production at Oxford (1986). Claudio Abbado conducted the May 1988 Theater an der Wien performances as well as the June 1990 Staatsoper performances of the same production. More recently, Wuppertal has mounted a production.

- 5 See Till Gerrit Waidelich, *Franz Schubert: Alfonso und Estrella* (Tutzing, 1991), esp. 55–71, for a discussion of the early history of the through-composed German opera.
- 6 For the complete texts of Schubert's operas, see Christian Pollack, *Franz Schubert: Bühnenwerke: Kritische Gesamtausgabe der Texte* (Tutzing, 1988). For scores of Schubert's operas, we must rely chiefly on the new complete works edition (NSA), although not all the operas have been published at this time, and on the old complete works edition (ASA), a project whose usefulness has always been limited by J. N. Fuchs' editorial decision to retain the old vocal clefs.
- 7 Otto Biba, "Schubert's Position in Viennese Musical Life," *19th-Century Music* 3 (1979), 112.
- 8 For Hüttenbrenner's accounting, see *SDB* 260. For the correspondence regarding possible performances, see *SDB* 238, 240, and 273.
- 9 See the undated letter to Bäumel (*SDB* 264–65) regarding orchestral works, the July 1824 letter to Ferdinand stating that "there is nothing about" his early quartets (*SDB* 362), and even the recycling and salvaging of sections or movements from early piano works in later works such as D568 in E flat and D958/IV.
- 10 Franz Schober writing to Heinrich Schubert on November 2, 1876 (*SMF* 208).
- 11 For further discussion of this unsuccessful mixture, see Waidelich, *Alfonso und Estrella*, 28, and Thomas A. Denny, "Archaic and Contemporary Aspects of Schubert's *Alfonso und Estrella*: Issues of Influence, Originality, and Maturation," in *Eighteenth-Century Music in Theory and Practice: Essays in Honor of Alfred Mann*, ed. Mary Ann Parker (New York, 1994), 241–61.
- 12 *The New Yorker*, December 11, 1978, 65.
- 13 See George R. Cunningham's dissertation, *Franz Schubert als Theaterkomponist* (Freiburg, 1974) for the most extended presentation of this line of thinking. Conjecture regarding Mosel's role reached a wider audience through record liner notes written by Walther Dürr, including those for *Alfonso und Estrella* (Angel record SCL-3878 [1978]) and *Lazarus* (Orfeo, C011101A).
- 14 Letter to Schober, August 14, 1823 (*SDB* 286).

- 15 More than one reviewer and observer of Schubert's comic *Die Zwillingsbrüder* had already suggested that the tragic, or heroic, mode seemed more suited to Schubert than the farcical (SDB 134–141, esp. 134, 136, 139).
- 16 For a photographic reproduction of the autograph draft of this opera, see Ernst Hilmar, ed., *Franz Schubert: Der Graf von Gleichen* (Tutzing, 1988). Richard Kramer provided a quite detailed review of this publication, including considerable summary of the nature of the composition itself, in *19th-Century Music* 14 (1990), 197–216.
- 17 See notices in the *Zeitung für die elegante Welt* (Leipzig), No. 95, col. 760, May 16, 1822 and the *Wiener allgemeine Theaterzeitung*, No. 122, p. 488, October 11, 1823 (SDB 219 and 291, respectively).

13 German reception

- 1 *On Music and Musicians*, ed. Konrad Wolff, trans. Paul Rosenfeld (New York, 1969), 108.
- 2 Heinrich Kreissle von Hellborn, *Franz Schubert* (Vienna, 1865), 580; translation modified from Arthur Duke Coleridge, *The Life of Franz Schubert* (London, 1869; rpt. New York, 1972), II: 255.
- 3 See Christopher H. Gibbs, *The Presence of Erlkönig: Reception and Reworkings of a Schubert Lied* (PhD diss., Columbia University, 1992).
- 4 Of the initial reviews of part one of *Winterreise*, two were unqualified raves (SDB 758, 781) and two more cautious (786, 795).
- 5 A study of Schubert criticism, comparable to Robin Wallace's *Beethoven's Critics: Aesthetic Dilemmas and Resolutions During the Composer's Lifetime* (Cambridge, 1986), would not yield much because of the paucity of reviews; a collection of reviews of Schubert's music would have little to offer in comparison with Stefan Kunze's *Beethoven im Spiegel seiner Zeit* (Laaber, 1987).
- 6 There has been relatively little study of Schubert's critical reception; see Herbert Biehle, *Schuberts Lieder: In Kritik und Literatur* (Berlin, 1928); and Christoph-Hellmut Mahling, "Zur Rezeption von Werken Franz Schuberts," in *Zur Aufführungspraxis der Werke Franz Schuberts*, ed. Vera Schwarz (Munich, 1981), 12–33.
- 7 January 19, 1822, in the Vienna *AmZ* (SDB 206–8). Although unsigned, the critique was probably the impressive Friedrich August Kanne, himself a composer, friend, and champion of Beethoven; the article refers to the earlier review (May 12) of *Erlkönig* in the same journal (*Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens* in NSA [Kassel, 1964], VIII/5, 126–27).
- 8 March 23, 1822, in the *Wiener Zeitschrift für Kunst, Literatur, Theater und Mode*. For background on Hentl, see Clemens Höslinger, "Ein Vergessener aus Schuberts Umkreis: Friedrich v. Hentl," *Schubert durch die Brille* 4 (1990), 13–16.
- 9 SDB 543; cf. 353, 603; SMF 23. The critic may have been Gottfried Wilhelm Fink, who eventually became the journal's editor and often wrote about Schubert; see Reinhold Schmitt-Thomas, *Die Entwicklung der deutschen*

- Konzerkritik im Spiegel der Leipziger Allgemeinen Musikalischen Zeitung* (1798–1848) (Frankfurt, 1969), 97–101.
- 10 See Christopher H. Gibbs, “Schubert in deutschsprachigen Lexica nach 1830,” *Schubert durch die Brille* 13 (June 1994), 70–78.
 - 11 See the section “The neglected Schubert?” in chapter 2 pp. 46–48.
 - 12 Quoted by Otto Erich Deutsch in “The Reception of Schubert’s Works in England,” *Monthly Musical Record* 81 (1951), 202–03. Compare Carl Engel’s remark: “So far as new works were concerned, Schubert did not die in 1828 at the age of 31, but lived to be well over eighty” in *Musical Quarterly* 14 (1928), 470.
 - 13 Deutsch, “The Reception of Schubert’s Works,” 202.
 - 14 See Gibbs, *The Presence of Erlkönig*, chapters 4, 5, and 6.
 - 15 See Edward Kravitt, “The Orchestral Lied: an Inquiry into its Style and Unexpected Flowering around 1900,” *Music Review* 37 (1976), 209–26; Hermann Danuser, “Der Orchestergesang des Fin de siècle: Eine historische and ästhetische Skizze,” *Die Musikforschung* 30 (1977), 425–52.
 - 16 See Alan Walker, “Liszt and the Schubert Song Transcriptions,” *Musical Quarterly* 67 (1981), 50–63; Thomas Kabisch, *Liszt und Schubert* (Munich, 1984); and Gibbs, *The Presence of Erlkönig*, chapter 4. The popular critical reception of his reworkings is also found in Dezső Legány, ed., *Franz Liszt: Unbekannte Presse und Briefe aus Wien 1822–1886* (Vienna, 1984); and Otto Brusatti, *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz* (Graz, 1978).
 - 17 For their 1839 release, Diabelli dedicated the final three piano sonatas to Robert Schumann (D958–60).
 - 18 A fascinating selection of the Viennese criticism from these years is found in Brusatti, *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz*; other sources are listed in Willi Kahl, *Verzeichnis des Schrifttums über Franz Schubert 1828–1928* (Regensburg, 1938).
 - 19 *On Music and Musicians*, 107–12.
 - 20 See Leon B. Plantinga, *Schumann as Critic* (New Haven, 1967).
 - 21 See Ares Rolf, “Schubert in der Neuen Zeitschrift für Musik (1834–1844),” *Schubert durch die Brille* 15 (June 1995), 75–94.
 - 22 See Kabisch, *Liszt und Schubert*, and Gibbs, *The Presence of Erlkönig*, 212–18.
 - 23 See Robert Pascall, “Brahms and Schubert,” *Musical Times* 124 (1983), 289; James Webster, “Brahms First Maturity,” *19th-Century Music* 2 (1978), 18–35, and 3 (1979), 52–71; David Brodbeck, “Dance Music as High Art: Schubert’s Twelve Ländler, Op. 171 (D. 790),” in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln, Nebr., 1986), 31–47; and Brodbeck, “Brahms’s Edition of Twenty Schubert Ländler: an Essay in Criticism,” in *Brahms Studies: Analytical and Historical Perspectives. Papers Delivered at the International Brahms Conference, Washington, D.C., 5–8 May 1983*, ed. George S. Bozarth (Oxford, 1990), 229–50.
 - 24 This topic has not received the attention it merits. In addition to Webster’s article cited in the previous note, see Eugen Schmitz, *Schuberts Auswirkung auf die deutsche Musik bis zu Hugo Wolf und Bruckner* (Leipzig, 1954).
 - 25 See the Introduction, pages 8–9.

- 26 See Edward F. Kravitt, “The Lied in 19th-Century Concert Life,” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 18 (1965), 207–18.
- 27 *Hanslick’s Musical Criticisms*, ed. and trans. Henry Pleasants (New York, 1978), 102.
- 28 Vol. III, p. 513; see Gibbs, “Schubert in deutschsprachigen Lexica.”
- 29 *Actenmäßige Darstellung der Ausgrabung und Wiederbeisetzung der irdischen Reste von Beethoven und Schubert* (Vienna, 1863).
- 30 See Willi Kahl, “Wege des Schubert Schrifttums,” *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 11 (1928), 79–95.
- 31 The longest tribute came from Schubert’s oldest friend, Josef von Spaun (1788–1865). The length of the article necessitated its abridgement when three installments were published anonymously in the Linz periodical *Oesterreichisches Bürgerblatt für Verstand, Herz und gute Laune* (March and April 1829; SDB 865–79). It was abridged by the editor Anton Ottenwalt, Spaun’s brother-in-law. (For the original version, see Georg Schünemann, ed., *Erinnerungen an Schubert: Josef von Spauns erste Lebensbeschreibung* [Berlin and Zurich, 1936] and partly translated in SMF 18–29.) Schubert’s older brother Ferdinand apparently wrote his tribute in the late 1820s, although it remained unpublished until 1839, when Robert Schumann printed it in the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* (SDB 912–25).
- 32 The book actually appeared in Vienna late in 1864 (the preface is signed November 7), but is dated 1865; for information about Kreissle’s life and his biographical work on Schubert, see Maurice J. E. Brown, *Essays on Schubert* (London, 1966), 170–76.
- 33 This work was preceded in 1861 by his much shorter *Franz Schubert: Eine biografische Skizze*, also published in Vienna.
- 34 Not only was Kreissle’s book serialized in the *Niederrheinische Musik-Zeitung für Kunstfreunde und Künstler* and *Signale für die musikalische Welt*, twice translated into English and reworked into French, but it also served as the primary basis for numerous shorter biographies, essays, and articles. Edward Wilberforce’s reworked condensation (London, 1866) was superseded by Arthur Duke Coleridge’s complete translation (London, 1869), which also included a useful catalogue of works by Sir George Grove. Other early studies rely primarily on Kreissle: George Lowell Austin’s *The Life of Franz Schubert* (Boston, 1873); Agathe Audley, *Franz Schubert: sa vie et ses œuvres* (Paris, 1871); and the chapter in Félix Clément, *Les Musiciens célèbres* (Paris, 1868), 455–67. There were a few relatively independent biographical studies, such as Hippolyte Barbedette, *Franz Schubert: sa vie, ses œuvres, son temps* (Paris, 1865). August Reissmann’s book *Franz Schubert: Sein Leben und seine Werke* (Berlin, 1873) concentrated more on Schubert’s music than his biography. Another valuable source, Constant von Wurzbach’s monumental *Biographisches Lexikon des Kaiserthums Oesterreich*, provided information about many crucial individuals in Schubert’s life and included an eighty-page entry on Schubert (1876) with detailed catalogues and appendices (vol. xxxii: 30–110).
- 35 Guido Adler’s 1885 article “Umfang, Methode und Ziel der

Musikwissenschaft” in the inaugural issue of the *Vierteljahrsschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 1 (1885), 5–20, is widely viewed as having set the program for modern musicology.

- 36 *Thematisches Verzeichniss der im Druck erschienenen Werke von Franz Schubert* (Vienna, 1874).
- 37 *Beiträge zur Biographie Franz Schubert's* (Berlin, 1889).
- 38 Otto Erich Deutsch, “Schubert: the Collected Works,” *Music and Letters* 32 (1951), 226–34.
- 39 Deutsch’s original plan was to release the documentation of Schubert’s life in four parts (SDB xiv): a revised and translated edition of Grove’s biography, together with a Schubert bibliography (later done by Willi Kahl); documents of Schubert’s life (*Franz Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens und Schaffens* vol. II/1 [Munich and Leipzig, 1914]), and a second part, not released, devoted to obituaries and reminiscences; an iconography volume (*Franz Schubert: Sein Leben in Bildern*, vol. III ([Munich and Leipzig, 1913])); and a thematic catalogue. Before the war only the two volumes appeared. The former was revised, augmented, and translated as *Schubert: A Documentary Biography*, trans. Eric Blom (London, 1946) and most recently revised as *Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens* in NSA (Kassel, 1964), VIII/5. The reminiscences by those who knew Schubert are collected in *Schubert: Die Erinnerungen seiner Freunde*, 3rd edn (Leipzig, 1974) and translated by Rosamond Ley and John Nowell as *Schubert: Memoirs by His Friends* (London, 1958). Deutsch’s thematic catalogue first appeared in English as *Schubert: Thematic Catalogue of All His Works* (London, 1951), and was revised as *Franz Schubert: Thematisches Verzeichniss seiner Werke in chronologischer Folge* in NSA (Kassel, 1978), VIII/4.
- 40 Willi Kahl’s remarkably comprehensive, if inevitably incomplete, *Verzeichnis des Schrifttums über Franz Schubert 1828–1928* (published in 1938), lists 3,122 items he had identified concerning Schubert and his music. More recently, Otto Brusatti assembled a valuable collection of Viennese reviews written between 1829 and 1848, see *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz*.
- 41 See Anton Weiss, *Fünfzig Jahre Schubertbund* (Vienna, 1913); Karl Adametz, *Franz Schubert in der Geschichte des Wiener Männergesang-Vereines* (Vienna, n.d. [1939?]). Viennese Schubert celebrations are complicated by the nationalist and political motivations behind much of the promotion of Schubert by the Wiener Männergesangverein and the Schubertbund; see Leon Botstein, *Music and its Public: Habits of Listening and the Crisis of Musical Modernism in Vienna, 1870–1914* (PhD diss., Harvard University, 1985), 361–82; as well as his chapter in the present volume.
- 42 Another image, “Schubertfeier im Elysium,” shows Schubert accompanying Mozart and Haydn in a celestial performance of the “Trout” Quintet before an audience that includes Beethoven.
- 43 The foreword to the book promises the “purpose is twofold: one scholarly, the other practical.”
- 44 For a discussion of Schubert research since 1928 see Ernst Hilmar, “Die Schubert-Forschung seit 1978,” in *Schubert durch die Brille* 16/17 (1996), 5–19.
- 45 Heuberger, *Franz Schubert* (Berlin, 1902); and Dahms, *Schubert* (Leipzig, 1912).

14 Schubert's reception history in nineteenth-century England

- 1 *Harmonicon*, 10 (1832), 14 and 280; 9 (1831), 40. Deutsch mistakenly gives 1831 as the date of Schröder-Devrient's visit to London ("The Reception of Schubert's Works in England," *Monthly Musical Record* 81 [1951], 202).
- 2 For the discovery of this important first public performance, and for much other help in researching this essay, I am indebted to Patricia Troop, of the Schubert Institute (UK). The original program of the von zur Mühlen recital on June 17, 1904, survives in the Wigmore Hall archive.
- 3 *Musical World*, June 13, 1844. On the supposed performance of the C Major Symphony by the Queen's Band at Windsor Castle at the instigation of the Prince Consort, see my article "The Prince Consort and the 'Great' C Major: a Dubious Scenario Examined," *Music and Letters* 74 (1993), 558–61.
- 4 See *Musical World*, June 3, 1836; and the *Times*, May 29, 1836.
- 5 See *Life and Letters of Sir Charles Hallé* (London, 1896), 107ff.
- 6 The eleven sonatas played by Hallé in his 1868 series of recitals and published by Chappell 1867–68 were as follows: in order of publication: (1) Grand Sonata in A Minor, Op. 42 (D845); (2) Grand Sonata in D Major, Op. 53 (D850); (3) Fantasia Sonata in G Major, Op. 78 (D894); (4) Grand Sonata in A Major, Op. 120 (D664); (5) Grand Sonata in E flat, Op. 122 (D568); (6) Grand Sonata in A Minor, Op. 143 (D784); (7) Grand Sonata in B Major, Op. 147 (D575); (8) Grand Sonata in A Minor, Op. 164 (D537); (9) Grand Sonata in C Minor (D958); (10) Grand Sonata in A Major (D959); (11) Grand Sonata in B flat (D960). Hallé also included in his 1868 series the C Major unfinished sonata (D840), the "Reliquie," and the so-called "Five Pieces" (D459/459A) of 1816.
- 7 See Hermann Klein, *Thirty Years of Musical Life in London* (London, 1903), 305; A. M. Diehl (Alice Mangold), *Musical Memories* (London, 1897), 109; Joseph Bennett, *Forty Years of Music 1865–1905* (London, 1908), 170.
- 8 *Daily Telegraph*, January 20, 1863.
- 9 Edward Wilberforce's abridged English translation had appeared a few years earlier; see *Franz Schubert: A Musical Biography* (London, 1866).
- 10 Bennett, *Forty Years of Music*, 337.
- 11 There is no evidence to support the supposition of Deutsch ("The Reception of Schubert's Music," 237) that the "Great" C Major was played by the Queen's Band at Buckingham Palace; see note 3 above.
- 12 See F. G. Shinn, *Forty Seasons of Saturday Concerts* (Crystal Palace Co., Sydenham, 1896), 11–13.

15 Schubert's reception in France: a chronology (1828–1928)

- 1 Théophile-Alexandre, violinist (1789–1878), and Alexandre, cellist (1808–80). "Mlle Malzel" refers perhaps to Hélène Robert-Mazel.
- 2 One is based on the songs *Ständchen* (D889) and *Das Wandern* (D795, 1). Jacques-Gabriel Prod'homme ("Schubert's Works in France," *Musical Quarterly* 14 [1928], 494–95) claims that in 1829 the *Bibliographie de [la] France* had registered the publication, by Richault, of "two favorite melodies, Op. 62, nos. 1 and 2, for piano, by Czerny."

- 3 *La Poste* (*Die Post* D911, 13); *la Sérénade* (*Ständchen* D957, 4); *Au bord de la mer* (*Am Meer* D957, 12); *la Fille du pêcheur* (*Das Fischermädchen* D957, 10); *la Jeune Fille et la Mort* (*Der Tod und das Mädchen* D531); *Berceuse* (*Schlaflied* D527).
- 4 This oft-quoted story is told by Louis Quicherat in his *Adolphe Nourrit, sa vie, son talent, son caractère* (Paris, 1867), II: 30.
- 5 “Société des Concerts du conservatoire: Premier concert,” *Journal des Débats politiques et littéraires* (January 25, 1835), 2. This excerpt, as well as the following, are reproduced in the *Cahiers F. Schubert* 1, 2, 6 (October 1992, April 1993–95), 27–46, 49–67, and 25–70.
- 6 “Feuilleton. – 20 janvier 1835: Variétés musicales,” *Le Temps: Journal des Progrès* 1920 (January 20, 1835), 1–2.
- 7 The violinist-violist Chrétien Urhan [Auerhan] (1790–1845) played a prominent role in the revelation of Schubert’s music to the French public. He wrote a certain number of transcriptions after Schubert, notably a “Quintet for three violas, cello, double-bass and timpani *ad lib.*”
- 8 It is somehow revealing that Schlesinger began precisely with Schubert’s Italian songs rather than German *Lieder*.
- 9 See Christopher H. Gibbs, *The Presence of Erlkönig: Reception and Reworkings of a Schubert Lied* (PhD diss., Columbia University, 1992), chapters 4 and 6.
- 10 *Ibid.*, 221; 327–36.
- 11 It has to be remembered that, in French, the word “romance” is feminine, whereas “Lied” is masculine.
- 12 *La Romance*
Je suis éminemment française, et je viens vous prier de me protéger, de prendre mon parti.
1841
Contre qui?
Le Lied
Parplé! contre moi qui fiens prendre sa blace. Ché suis fapoureux comme elle et plis qu’elle; ché plis te naifeté qu’elle. Ché été le Binchamin de Schubert et ché lé suis à présent té Proch et té Dessauer.
“Le premier de l’an musical,” *Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris* 77 (December 31, 1840), 648.
- 13 “Nouvelles diverses,” *Le Ménestrel* 53 (November 30, 1851), 3.
- 14 The “Great” C Major was not to be heard again until it was played in 1908 by Charles Lamoureux.
- 15 Charles Bannelier, “Revue musicale de l’année 1879,” *Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris* 1 (January 4, 1880), 3.
- 16 And not 1873, as it is wrongly assumed by Prod’homme (see n. 2).
- 17 Gaston Dubreuilh, “Concerts et soirées,” *Le Ménestrel* 7 (January 14, 1883), 54.
- 18 See notably: G. Olivier de la Marche, “Archives musicales: Etat actuel de la musique en Allemagne et en Italie,” *Le Pianiste* 6 (January 20, 1835), 44–45; Joseph d’Ortigue, *Le Temps* (1835), and “Revue du monde musical: Schubert,” *Revue de Paris* 30 (June 1836), 271–75; Ernest Legouvé, “Revue critique: Mélodies de Schubert,” *Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris* 3 (January 15,

- 1837), 26–27; Léon Escudier, “Mélodies de François Schubert,” *La France musicale* 12 (March 18, 1838), 3–4; and Henri Panofka, “Biographie: François Schubert,” *Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris* 41 (October 14, 1838), 406–09.
- 19 Hippolyte Barbedette, *Franz Schubert: Sa vie, ses œuvres, son temps* (Paris, 1866), originally issued in *Le Ménestrel* (1864–65); Agathe (Périer) Audley, *Franz Schubert, Sa vie et ses œuvres* (Paris, 1871); also worth mentioning is Félix Clément, *Les Musiciens célèbres* (Paris, 1868), 455–67.

16 Franz Schubert’s music in performance

- 1 David Montgomery, *Historical Information for Musicians: Sourcebooks for the Study of Performance Practices in European Classical music. Vol. I, Musical Tutors, Methods and Related Sources: c.1650–1995* (Huntingdon: 1997) (Hamburg, forthcoming).
- 2 To date it has not achieved this goal. For example, on the only “historically informed” recording of the Quintet available at the time of this writing (L’Archibudelli & Smithsonian Players, Vivarte SK 46669, 1991) such gestures, including the one above, have merely been transferred to period instruments.
- 3 Schwind to Schober, March 14, 1824, *Schubert, Die Dokumente seines Lebens*, ed. Otto Erich Deutsch, NSA (Kassel, 1964), VIII/ 5, 230 (translation by Jean R. Dane).
- 4 September 12, 1825. *Dokumente*, 314. This and further translations mine.
- 5 See Walter Dürr, “Schubert and Johann Michael Vogl: a Reappraisal,” *19th-Century Music* 3 (1979), 126–40.
- 6 See NSA IV/2a/2b (Kassel, 1975) for full versions of these examples. *Franz Schuberts Werke in Abschriften* (Kassel, 1975), (under “Volume 80”) lists five other songs altered by Vogl: *Antigone und Oedip* (D542), *Der Fischer* (D225), *An Emma* (D113), *Jägers Abendlied* (D215), and *Gebet während der Schlacht* (D171). Echoing Kreissle von Hellborn, John Reed lists two others, *Wer sich der Einsamkeit ergibt* (D478) and *Blondel zu Marien* (D626), whose embellishments may have come from Vogl; see *The Schubert Song Companion* (Manchester, 1985), 68, 434. Also see Robert Schollum, “Die Diabelli Ausgabe der ‘Schönen Müllerin,’” in *Zur Aufführungspraxis der Werke Franz Schuberts*, ed. Vera Schwarz (Munich and Salzburg, 1981), 140–61. For further examples in Schubert’s music, see Walter Dürr’s article in the same volume, “‘Manier’ und ‘Veränderung’ in Kompositionen Franz Schuberts,” 124–39.
- 7 Andreas Liess, *Johann Michael Vogl: Hofoperist und Schubertsänger* (Graz and Cologne, 1954), 135–36; see SMF 112.
- 8 Otto Erich Deutsch, ed., *Schubert: Die Erinnerungen seiner Freunde* (Leipzig, 1957), 98.
- 9 “Die Tonkunst in Wien während der letzten fünf Decennien,” *Allgemeine Wiener Musik-Zeitung* (1843), 566; cited in Liess, *Vogl*, 129.
- 10 *Tagebücher*, chapter XIV, no. 2, cited in Liess, *Vogl*, 129.
- 11 *Dokumente*, 289.
- 12 See Liess, *Vogl*, chapter XI (“Vogl, der Schubertinterpret”).
- 13 Deutsch, ed., *Erinnerungen*, 117.

- 14 *Dokumente*, 537–38.
- 15 Deutsch's unflattering remark that Schubert's "voix de compositeur" was not suited to performance was a commentary on a letter from Anton von Doblhoff to Franz von Schober of April 2, 1824 (*Dokumente*, 237). Doblhoff's report reads, "Schubert himself cannot sing," which meant only that Schubert was not feeling well. See successive entries by Schwind.
- 16 *Dokumente*, 326.
- 17 *Ibid.*, 390. These two songs are among the most discussed of the "embellished and altered" publications; Heinrich Kreissle von Hellborn suggests that the changes in *Der Einsame* are the worst of all, probably in reference to the high G's added in the 1827 Diabelli edition; *Franz Schubert* (Vienna, 1865), 121n. But one would like to know, as Agatha Christie might have put it, if any crime was committed in the first place. Schubert was still alive in 1827 and might even have approved this publication.
- 18 Otto Brusatti suggests that she sang Schubert's songs far more often than the sources report, see *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz: Dokumente 1829–1848* (Graz, 1978), 71. Her most celebrated contribution to Schubert's recognition was to convince the aging Goethe (in a private concert, April 1830) of the greatness of Schubert's *Erlkönig* setting. In 1832, Schröder-Devrient sang "Erlkönig" in London with great success, prompting the firm of Wessel & Co. to publish a "Series of German Songs," including, by 1839, thirty-eight Schubert songs.
- 19 Brusatti, *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz*, 85.
- 20 *Ibid.*, 85.
- 21 Sophie Müller mentions, in addition to Bocklet and Schubert, Leopoldine Blahetka (pupil of Joseph Czerny) and Antonie Oster (a prodigy who died in 1828 at the age of seventeen) as "our most outstanding pianists," *Dokumente*, 508; *SDB* 761. Of the major pianists active in Vienna, Carl Czerny, Johann Nepomuk Hummel, Ferdinand Hiller, and Ignaz Moscheles met Schubert, but to what extent they played his music has not been researched. See Vera Schwarz, "Die ersten Interpreten Schubertscher Klaviermusik," in *Aufführungspraxis*, 105–10.
- 22 5 (February 1836), col. 76.
- 23 Letter to his parents, July 25, 1825; *Dokumente*, 299; *SDB* 436.
- 24 Deutsch, ed., *Erinnerungen*, 124.
- 25 *Ibid.*, 98. On the subject of personae, read Stadler's account of the *Erlkönig* experiment with multiple voices (*Erinnerungen*, 130), plus Edward Cone's thoughts in *The Composer's Voice* (Berkeley, 1974); and compare George Thill's 1930 recording (rereleased on EMI RLS 766), on which Thill sings the narrator and the Erlking, Henri Etcheverry sings the father, and a boy soprano named C. Pascal sings the child.
- 26 *AmZ* 30/3 (January 16, 1828), col. 42.
- 27 *AmZ* 39/14 (April 1837), col. 226.
- 28 Reichold gave the German premiere of the "Trout" Quintet in Leipzig on November 23, 1829, shortly after its initial publication.
- 29 Richard Heuberger, *Erinnerungen an Johannes Brahms*, ed. Kurt Hofmann (Tutzing, 1971), 115.

- 30 *Johannes Brahms in seiner Familie: Der Briefwechsel*, ed. Kurt Stephenson (Hamburg, 1973), 99.
- 31 Kurt Stephenson, *Hundert Jahre Philharmonische Gesellschaft in Hamburg* (Hamburg, 1928), 120.
- 32 *Gesangstechnik* (Leipzig, 1884).
- 33 See Renate and Kurt Hofmann, *Johannes Brahms: Zeittafel zu Leben und Werk* (Tutzing, 1983), *passim*. Among the works Brahms played in public are the F Minor Impromptu (D935, 1), *Die schöne Müllerin*, the C Major Violin Fantasy, and the “Trout” Quintet.
- 34 Heuberger, *Erinnerungen an Johannes Brahms*, 120.
- 35 See Marianne Kroemer, “Geiger der Schubertzeit in Wien,” in *Aufführungspraxis*, 97–104.
- 36 This was the second “Schuppanzigh Quartet,” with Karl Holz, Franz Weiß, and Josef Linke.
- 37 The original quartet consisted of Joseph Hellmesberger, Sr., M. Durst, C. Heissler, and C. Schlesinger. A few years later, Brahms made his Viennese debut with this ensemble.
- 38 *AmZ* 43.6 (February 1841), col. 142. Also see *Der Courier*, 4 (1841), 4 and 4/7 (1841), 3, cited in Walter Serauky, *Musikgeschichte der Stadt Halle, Beiträge zur Musikforschung*, vol. III (Halle, 1939; rpt. Hildesheim, 1971).
- 39 *AmZ* 43/13 (March 1841), col. 278.
- 40 *Ibid.*
- 41 See *Der Freischütz* XIV, 222ff.
- 42 Kate Mueller, *Twenty Seven Major American Symphony Orchestras* (Bloomington, 1973). Also see “Schubert in America: First Publications and Performances,” *Inter American Music Review* 1 (1978/79), 5–28.
- 43 See Christoph Hellmut Mahling, “Zur Rezeption von Werken Franz Schuberts,” in *Aufführungspraxis*, 12–23.
- 44 See Stephenson, *Hundert Jahre*, 143.
- 45 All of the recordings mentioned above have been rereleased on an EMI collection entitled *Schubert Lieder on Record* (EMI RLS 766).
- 46 *The Schubert Song Cycles, with Thoughts on Performance* (London, 1975).
- 47 See Desmond Shawe-Taylor, “Schubert as Written and Played,” *London Sunday Times* (June 30, 1963); continued as “Schubert as Written and As Performed: a Symposium,” *Musical Times*, 104, (1963), 626–28.
- 48 Schnabel is often credited with the first complete cyclic programs of Schubert’s sonatas, but that distinction actually goes to Johann Ernst Perabo, a pupil of Moscheles who was active in Boston in the 1860s and 1870s.
- 49 “Tempo et caractère dans les symphonies de Schubert,” in *Le Compositeur et son double: essais sur l’interprétation musicale* (Paris, 1971), 140.
- 50 Giulini and Mackerras retain the traditional opening tempo, forcing the 2:1 ratio to be expressed through laboriously slow tempos for the Allegro – a case, proportionally speaking, of the tail wagging the dog. For the history of this problem, see Jürgen Neubacher, “Zur Interpretationsgeschichte der Andante Einleitung aus Schuberts großer C Dur Sinfonie (D944),” *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 150 (1989), 15–21.

- 51 For details about period instruments, voices, and overall sound, the reader may wish to consult the Norton Handbooks, where proper space has been allotted to the subject: *Performance Practice: Vol. II, Music after 1600*, ed. H. M. Brown and Stanley Sadie (New York, 1989).
- 52 See the article “Eduard Strauss” by Mosco Carner and Max Schönherr in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. S. Sadie (London, 1980), xviii: 215.
- 53 See Roger Fiske, preface to the 1981 reprint of the Eulenburg score (E.E. 1115), ed. Max Hochkofler (London, 1970).
- 54 See David Montgomery, “Triplet Assimilation in Schubert: Challenging the Ideal,” *Historical Performance* 4 (1993), 79.
- 55 For example, the Stern–Rose–Istomin recording (CBS, MPK 45697, 1965).
- 56 See Claudio Abbado/Stefano Mollo, recording notes to Symphonies 3 and 4 (DG 423 653 2, 1988). Review by Denis Stevens, “How to do the Right Thing Musically,” *New York Times* (Sunday, January 13, 1991).
- 57 VI:2 (BA 5508).
- 58 Notes to Schubert’s Octet on period instruments (Virgin 7 91120 2).
- 59 Abbado/Mollo, recording notes; see note 56 above.
- 60 “Tempo and Character in Beethoven’s Music,” *Musical Quarterly* 24 (1943), 169ff. and 291ff.
- 61 Hartmut Krones began this work, but limited his findings to *Winterreise*. See “. . .Nicht die leiseste Abweichung im Zeitmasse,” *Österreichische Musikzeitschrift* 45 (1990), 680–90.
- 62 See William Newman, “Freedom of Tempo in Schubert’s Instrumental Music,” *Musical Quarterly* 61 (1975), 528–45.