548

Irish Historical Studies

biographical information about the correspondents. A short introduction to each document, with much more explanatory and biographical information, or the use of detailed footnotes would have greatly improved the utility of the book. Nonetheless, as an insight into McQuaid and the mindset of his correspondents, it is a satisfactory place to begin.

ROBERT MCNAMARA School of English and History, University of Ulster

COERCIVE CONFINEMENT IN IRELAND: PATIENTS, PRISONERS AND PENITENTS. Edited by Eoin O'Sullivan and Ian O'Donnell. Pp 288. Manchester: Manchester University Press. 2012. £60.

In 1946, Father Edward Flanagan, the founder of Boys Town in Nebraska, delivered a shocking indictment of the prison and juvenile justice systems in Ireland. His call for 'an impartial group of investigators' (pp 21–2) to probe these institutions and report back without fear or favour was not well-received in mid-twentieth-century Ireland. His remarks united the political system, government and opposition, along with the Roman Catholic Church to face down his criticism and resist calls for reform. Flanagan's encounter with the church–state alliance in 1940s Ireland merely scratches the surface of what became known about the various branches of coercive confinement in Ireland, many of which are described in this work.

Eoin O'Sullivan and Ian O'Donnell have assembled a significant collection of documents uncovering a lost, forgotten and not unknown history of coercive confinement in post-Independence Ireland. These documents explain the ways in which different categories of Irish citizens were detained, many for what were deemed moral rather than criminal transgressions. These groups are examined in three sections: patients, paupers and unmarried mothers; prisoners; troubled and troublesome children. Each chapter reproduces a contemporaneous document commentating or reporting on an aspect of detention within that section.

The first three chapters present documents rooted in the early to mid-1920s and all were written by Roman Catholic priests. All three examined the 'problem' of unmarried mothers and those who cared for them. The writing and tone from these three priests has much in common; all employed language of moral control and all equate being a good person with being a good Catholic, or vice versa. The first line of Humbert MacInerny's chapter on the subject is chillingly prophetic when he declared, 'here in Ireland we are too tolerant of abuses' (p. 59). By the end of the same chapter, however, one cannot help but wonder what the true source of his concern was. Was it for the welfare of the mother or the abundance of 'proselytising agencies' (p. 61)?

In the opening chapter of the second section on prisoners, the law professor and barrister, Edward Fahy, described how the progressive stage system, an influential post-Famine era penal initiative pioneered by Walter Crofton, was alive and well in 1940s Ireland where prisoners had 'too much time' for 'brooding and mental stagnation' (p. 124). Chapter thirteen, 'I did penal servitude' had a considerable impact when it was published in 1945. This extract not only serves to offer some vivid physical descriptions of life in an Irish prison but also to emphasise the rejection of the prisoners' voice. Even when that voice expressed articulate and educated thoughts, the political classes closed ranks and refused to listen.

The third section deals with troubled and troublesome children including an extract from one of the most brilliant and undiluted accounts of life in an Irish industrial school. Peter Tyrrell's *Founded on fear* (later edited and published as a full memoir by Diarmaid Whelan) opens with the hellish vision of a Christian Brother running riot and beating boys

Reviews and short notices

as young as six years old for no apparent reason. Tyrrell's writing is significant not only because it spells out the horrors of Letterfrack but also because it is vivid in its descriptions of life among the boys, their treatment of 'pets', and the hierarchies that existed. It is telling that Tyrrell had the courage to point out some of the few positives that he encountered in his life at the school.

It is a mark of his engagement with the issues of this book that the work of the journalist Michael Viney is reproduced no less than three times. The third of these extracts explored 'the dismal world of Daingean' reformatory school in 1966. Viney stated that while some recommended reforms did take place in the previous three decades, many did not and so change was inadequate. Many of his criticisms were laid at the door of government, from whom funding for the schools was poor and often late. Daingean, he claimed, was 'a world of overriding shabbiness and decrepitude' (p. 225).

In the preface to this book, O'Sullivan and O'Donnell appear almost apologetic for the fact that some readers might take issue with the overall selection of documents they have reproduced here. No apology is necessary. Among the many strengths of this book is that the authors have allowed the documents to speak for themselves apart from a necessary introduction to each one. Their analysis of the collection is saved for the insightful and typically well-informed introductory and concluding chapters. This book eloquently traces the heavy dependence on institutional punishment and 'care' by those charged with or self-appointed in the field of criminal justice and moral policing in twentieth-century Ireland. The book is strongly recommended for scholars, students or anybody concerned with understanding at first-hand, some of the thinking that under-pinned the many layers of institutional detention to which the Irish state was firmly wedded.

CONOR REIDY Department of History, University of Limerick

IRELAND IN THE NEWSREELS. By Ciara Chambers. Pp 314. Illus. Dublin & Portland, Oreg.: Irish Academic Press. 2012. €22.95/£19.95.

Ireland in the newsreels is a survey of international newsreel coverage of political events in Ireland from the 1900s to the 1950s. It is a descriptive and thoroughly researched work evincing its author's diligent viewing of thousands of newsreel items with particular focus on the reporting upon significant historical moments. Ciara Chambers's most compelling analytical premise is that these newsreels reflect the gradual entrenchment of partition within a representational frame beyond factual documentation of the circumstances. It must be borne in mind, as Chambers reminds us, that newsreels as a form were not exactly like other forms of journalism in their time. Generally produced weeks or months after the events they were concerned with, newsreels idiomatically editorialised and framed their stories in the light of subsequent developments around the events themselves. As such it is possible, and arguably necessary, to examine any particular newsreel with an eye for the representational conventions that make them more clearly interpretations rather than documents of history.

Chambers begins with some contextual introduction to the evolution of newsreels as a form in early twentieth-century cinema. She then proceeds to chart how twentieth-century Irish history was presented in newsreels produced primarily outside of the island of Ireland, beginning with the Home Rule debate and proceeding through the global and the local repercussions of the world wars. Irish Independence is a significant frame throughout this entire period, and Chambers focuses particularly on the ways in which first rebel, then taoiseach, then president, Éamon de Valera, was featured throughout the period as a literal spokesperson for Ireland's view of itself, a view increasingly defined by political autonomy and cultural separateness.