

Book Reviews

AMERICAN PSYCHIATRY?

The Practice of Sociotherapy. By MARSHALL EDELSON. Yale University Press. 1970. Pp. 345. Price £1.65.

The Theory and Practice of Mental Health Consultation. By GERALD CAPLAN. Tavistock Publications. 1970. Pp. 397. Price £3.25.

These two books are both of interest because of the light they throw on the current American scene. The first, however, does not throw any fresh light on the subjects it discusses, and indeed readers in this country who are familiar with the topics discussed will feel that in this respect experience and practice in the United States may be behind that in this country. On the other hand the second book describes some developments in the practice of psychiatry which will be new ground for many readers.

There are considerable differences in the style of the two books. In *The Practice of Sociotherapy* Dr. Edelson begins by developing some theoretical concepts and later gives a more detailed description of their application in one particular psychiatric hospital.

Later in the book there is a description of a particular therapeutic community, but it is important for the uninitiated to make it clear that this would be a very atypical community by English standards. The patients are able to afford in-patient care with an individual analyst for four sessions a week and, as the writer puts it 'the patients are wealthier than the therapists and are used to luxuries and services most staff members cannot afford'. It becomes apparent that, in some measure, decisions to admit, continue treatment or transfer to out-patient care, could be determined by economic facts rather than treatment needs. At one point it was made clear that there is a considerable problem in that the nurses are afraid of the patients. I find it difficult to recommend this book to any group of readers.

Dr. Caplan describes his own experience and his own theory in developing mental health consultation in settings outside the traditional mental hospital or out-patient clinic. This is a field of considerable importance to all psychiatrists. A very elementary calculation will show that to those patients in touch with the psychiatric services, either as in-patients or out-patients, the average consultant psychiatrist

can only give about one hour of his time in the course of a year. Moreover, it is very well known that those patients in touch with the psychiatric services represent only a very small part of the total psychiatric morbidity. This point is well made in Sir Denis Hill's Rock Carling Monograph for 1969 *Psychiatry in Medicine*. This means that many psychiatric patients get their help from general practitioners, district nurses, health visitors, probation officers and others. It is essential, therefore, that the psychiatrist should consider how he can ensure that his skills are made available, not only in his own doctor/patient relationship but through the extended relationships of the other therapeutic staff. Dr. Caplan describes a variety of situations in which a consultant can help individuals, groups of workers, community organizations, or indeed rival factions within a community with their problems. Many readers will disagree with the concept of a psychiatrist taking his role so far into the community, particularly when there is ample evidence that the patients in hospitals are not always receiving the level of medical care they need.

Community psychiatry has become a very mis-used term. Its initial value lay in encouraging psychiatrists to consider developing services in the community. More recently, however, community psychiatry has become almost a term of abuse, as it has become apparent that some community resources are not yet available, and in many areas the geographical gap between hospitals and communities frustrates the most determined efforts to provide links. In this field, however, Dr. Caplan does help to clarify and expand our understanding of the situation, and his book is to be recommended to all psychiatrists who wish to use their skills to the full in the total pattern of care available to their patients.

A. A. BAKER.

Training Tomorrow's Psychiatrist: The Crisis in Curriculum. Edited by T. LIDZ and M. EDELSON. Yale University Press. 1970. Pp. xiv + 94 (paperbacked) Price \$1.95.

This book consists of four papers selected from those delivered at the Sectional meeting of North-eastern Professors of Psychiatry held in New Haven for their 'overview of issues concerning the whole of

psychiatric education as it is affected by the increase of psychiatrists; the scope of psychiatry; and the demand for psychiatric services'. The response at Yale is to introduce 'behavioural' sciences in the pre-clinical years of the medical curriculum, allowing a choice directed towards a specialty in the third year. The clinical years for intending psychiatrists would then be devoted to psychiatry and related studies in 'semiautonomous' schools of psychiatry. The content of training is heavily weighted with esoteric sociological theorizing in which basic science applied in psychiatry is viewed as 'the body of knowledge concerned with symbolic process'; and 'psychiatry, as one of the healing arts, . . . as the treatment . . . through symbolic means of symbolic impairments'. Tests recommended for typical seminars are represented by Durkheim's 'Division of Labor in Society'; and 'The Elementary Forms of Religious Life'; Etzioni's 'A Comparative Analysis of Complex Organizations', etc.

Although no medical curriculum in Britain has yet appeared which displaces practically all clinical practice other than psychiatry of a 'non-medical' kind, some current proposals clearly adumbrate it. This book is a cautionary tale to those who contemplate changes of this kind.

DAVID C. WATT.

'A Physician in the General Practice of Psychiatry.' Selected papers of Leo H. Bartemeier. Edited by PETER A. MARTIN, A. W. R. SIPE and G. L. USDIN. Brunner/Mazel. New York. 1970. Pp. 451. Price \$15.00.

'Hope—Psychiatry's Commitment.' Papers presented to LEO H. BARTEMEIER. Edited by A. W. R. SIPE. Brunner/Mazel. New York. 1970. Pp. 395. Price \$10.00.

In the 'Personal View' essay in the *British Medical Journal* for 16 January last, Patrick Trevor-Roper discusses medical myths and superstitions, past and present. He wonders whether Freudianism may be also one of these, and might in fifty years time 'seem just as preposterous as the sex/blindness (masturbation) story and the paraphernalia of witchcraft today'.

This thought comes to mind in reviewing the first of these two books (which come together in a card-board case with a photograph of Leo Bartemeier on the outside), because Leo Bartemeier has invested a good deal in the psycho-analytical approach to psychiatry. The influences in his professional life have been mainly Roman Catholicism and psycho-analysis; not such uneasy bedfellows as one might suppose. The papers herein collected range from the

1920's to the 1960's. The author has been a prolific writer. The book is divided into papers on Physicians, Children, Psychiatry, Community and Psycho-analysis—in that order. Not all the papers are of equal interest, and some of the earlier ones discuss ideas which the reader in 1971 might find dated or even out of date. But one receives the impression of a wise and humane person and 'a physician in the practice of psychiatry', who is firm in his basic ideologies but not excessively doctrinaire. There is a development of thought over the years, but within the main tenets of the psycho-analytic orientation.

Bartemeier's abiding interest in child welfare is apparent, and it is interesting to read of his part in the founding of a movement called 'Cornelian Corner' in the 1940's. This was a contribution towards preventive psychiatry in the form of promoting more natural and traditional ways of infant nurturing, arising out of the Freudian view about the importance and pitfalls of cradle life and early infancy for later mental health.

The second book is a 'Festschrift' in honour of Leo Bartemeier on his seventy-fifth birthday. It is divided into four aspects of the theme of psychiatry's commitment—to the individual, in the Laboratory, in the Community and in the World. This extensive area gives one a depressing feeling of inflation; of an era of psychiatric expansion that is or should be passing away: the mid-twentieth century error that 'the All is psychiatry', which began with a kind of Hitlerian 'today the asylum, tomorrow the World'. Psychiatry should now be publishing a new-found humility, a return to its true nature as a branch of clinical medicine instead of an effort to overcome existence or effect cosmic transformations.

These are general essays—e.g. 'Loneliness—Man's Universal Plight' by Francis J. Braceland; 'Maternal Feelings towards the Newborn' by David M. Levy; 'The Authority Crisis in Catholicism' by Walter J. Burghardt S. J.; 'Sensitivity Training for the Religious' by Joseph J. Reidy; 'Project HOPE—a Pragmatic Endeavour' by Eugene Brody; 'Man's Biological Potential' by Jonas Salk—this catalogue of some of the headings indicates the general tone of the book. Nevertheless it is a tribute to an obviously likeable and well-liked American psychiatrist rather than a hard-core work of psychiatry.

H. M. FLANAGAN.

The Paranoid. By DAVID W. SWANSON, PHILIP J. BOHNERT and JACKSON, A. SMITH. London: J. & A. Churchill Ltd. for Little, Brown & Co., Boston, Massachusetts, 1970. Pp. ix + 523. Price £6.25.

The title of this book by three psychiatrists might