explicit explanation of this procedure.) It may also be suggested that the effective exclusion of non-CMS missionary activity has the effect of foreclosing on some comparative perspectives of considerable potential interest. In particular, the Roman Catholic missionaries in Yorubaland (of the French Société des missions africaines), although they did not employ 'native agents' in the manner of the CMS, otherwise developed a somewhat similar relationship with the community of ex-slave 'repatriates' from Brazil settled in Lagos and other coastal towns as the CMS did with the Sierra Leonians. Moreover, since a sense of pan-Yoruba identity had emerged also (indeed, earlier) among enslaved and transported Yoruba in Brazil, and was evidently carried back to the homeland by Brazilian 'repatriates', it is likely that the reverse diaspora from Brazil, as well as that from Sierra Leone, played a significant role in the nineteenth-century 'making of the Yoruba'.

ROBIN LAW
University of Stirling

BARRY HALLEN, *The Good, the Bad, and the Beautiful: Discourse about Values in Yoruba Culture*. Bloomington IN: Indiana University Press, 2001, 256 pp., US39.95, ISBN 0 253 33806 9 hard covers, US$17.95 (£12.95), 0 253 21416 5 paperback.

Knowing about knowing marks the philosophical sub-field of epistemology. This is the starting point of Barry Hallen's new book, the central assumption being that, in Yoruba discourse, 'the epistemic becomes a kind of master key, a *passe partout*, to the value system' (p. 65). This provides the starting point and overall structure of his book. Culturally specific epistemological frameworks, Hallen argues, are the basis of normative discourse on morality and aesthetics, two further sub-fields of philosophy. Hallen shows us why and how this is so for the Yoruba context from the perspective of ordinary language philosophy. In doing so he expands his long-standing contribution to the development of an analytical school within African philosophy.

The Good, the Bad, and the Beautiful is a sequel to *Knowledge, Belief and Witchcraft*, co-authored with J. O. Sodipo and recently reprinted in an expanded edition. Here the 'analytic experiments in African philosophy', as announced in the subtitle of the first work, are continued, i.e. 'to apply techniques derived from mainstream linguistic philosophy to a non-western language'. As the subtitle states, this book deals with 'discourse about values in Yoruba culture' and it is more accessible than its predecessor, at least to an Africanist audience without academic training in philosophy. Hallen avoids some of the difficulties of the earlier book while at the same time building on it and going beyond it.

As throughout his long-standing works on the Yoruba, Hallen continues to build a basis for 'an African analytic philosophy that would warrant comparison with its Western counterpart' (p. 125). He succeeds in the important task of formulating methodological requirements, insisting on clarity of concepts and comparability of approaches, and rejecting any double standards as to the status of rationality or philosophy in Africa. He also provides a clear and consistent approach within ordinary language philosophy to the analysis of normative discourse in an African culture. His exploration of moral and aesthetic deliberations in the Yoruba context is insightful. Most impressively, he works out how the moral and the aesthetic are rooted in the basic epistemological framework of the Yoruba language, which, as he conclusively shows, is used in a more critical and less assuming manner than English. On

the other hand, he builds up the argument within a rather abstract sphere, almost completely disjointed from the social contexts in which ordinary discourse among Yoruba speakers actually occurs.

Hallen's is one of the few works that pay truly systematic and detailed attention to language, and it is a rare example of fieldwork-based research by an academic philosopher. Hallen collected his material, with the assistance of a philosophically trained Yoruba-speaker, from interviews and discussions with the *onisegun*, the 'master healers', a sub-group of local intellectuals whom he regards as fellow philosophers who like him 'enjoyed analysing and explaining their language in detail' (p. 7). The *onisegun* are highly qualified specialists in matters of language use and cultural knowledge. Their combined collected statements provide the authoritative texts that Hallen relies upon to develop his characterisation of Yoruba discourse: nearly 300 of them are used in English translation, and listed completely in the Yoruba original in the appendix. Such integration of African language is a *novum* in African philosophy (as far as easily accessible publications go), to be welcomed and developed further. However, the way in which the numbered statements are quoted and referred to in the main text sometimes seriously impedes the reading and hampers the flow of the argument.

Hallen describes his own 'inadequate fluency in speaking the Yoruba language . . . as a methodological key' (p. 6), as his questions to the *onisegun* provide the starting point for a well documented analysis of language use in relation to the key concepts explored. The thoroughness of analysis, and the meticulous formulation of an overall argument, are impressive. Nevertheless, in two respects that have been critical to the debate on African philosophy, Hallen's methodology is likely to attract criticism. First, no individual thinker is presented or portrayed with the philosophical statements. This may, yet again, cause a misleading impression of collectivity and anonymity in African thought: the quotations seemingly represent '*onisegun* knowledge' as an objectified category. Second, the authoritative Yoruba texts clearly emerged as a response to external 'provocation', to questions that a cultural insider would not usually have raised. They are not really documentation of an internal philosophical discourse that would have taken place without the outsider's instigation—and Hallen does not suggest they are. But this shows that his 'methodological key' can be seen from another perspective as obstructive. The late Kenyan philosopher Henry Odera Oruka, in his sage philosophy project, was confronted with the same criticism.

While clarifying the foundations of his endeavour Hallen emphasises two main features of Yoruba epistemology: (1) its *subjective basis*, i.e. true knowledge is always (and strictly) linked with the experience of an 'I' or a 'self'; (2) its *critical nature*, in contrast to 'propositional' knowledge in the (more naive) English language usage. The former is investigated further with the focus on the Yoruba notion of *emi* ('self'), and particularly the relation between 'conscious self' and 'moral character' (p. 44). Hallen highlights the considerable rational deliberations over standards of morality. He points at the 'ample evidence that Yoruba discourse makes explicit reference to conscious states and experiences that could only be named on the basis of explicit introspective reference, and that are also regarded as important prerequisites to moral or immoral behaviour' (p. 51). Consciousness of self (knowledge of self-knowledge) is presented as the basis of moral deliberations. However, personal lives are also described as predetermined. We encounter significant tension between the moral agency of the self and a given metaphysical determinism, related to the notion of destiny, both in a personalised sense (*ori*, lit. 'the inner

head') and a general sense (*ipin*). As the Yoruba believe in reincarnation, the self 'is said to choose its destiny', which is granted by the supreme deity, before being reborn in a different bodily existence as a human being. The task, then, is to fulfil one's destiny within the given conditions and constraints of society (p. 63).

The next chapter ('The good and the bad') determines the Yoruba criteria for morality. Hallen argues that this is again linked back with Yoruba epistemology: 'how others come to define me as a moral person, and I them, involves a further set of epistemological criteria' (p. 64). The central point for Hallen is to present the epistemic as 'master key to the value system' (p. 65). The highly rated and socially acknowledged qualities of *speaking and listening well* (including reliability, being sensitive, truthful and trustworthy in social interaction) provide the basis for moral judgement in Yoruba society. Hallen qualifies them as '*epistemological virtues* [and not conventional moral values] because of their *instrumental value* for ensuring the accuracy of information' on the basis of which moral judgements are then cast (p. 70).

Hallen's reflections on 'special personality types' within Yoruba society are remarkable. They review the prejudiced perceptions about the *aje* and the *alujanun*, people thought to be gifted with special intellectual powers. English translation since colonial times has commonly taken them to mean 'witch' and 'evil spirits' respectively—derogatory and highly problematic terms—and Hallen makes the case that it is high time for revision. Using information gained from the *onisegun*, Hallen states, 'being *aje* and being *alujanun* mean that a person's intellect and abilities are of the highest calibre' (p. 111). Thus a wholly different picture of *aje* and *alujanun* emerges, especially for those (like myself) who are reliant on translation for the understanding of Yoruba terms.

Being in no position to adjudicate on matters of Yoruba language and culture, I appreciate what Hallen does here in terms of approach and agenda. The careful conceptual reconsideration of culturally specific key terms, and categories of persons in African language use, assists in clarifying our understanding of local knowledge. Beyond that, as in this case, they could also assist in directing or orienting further research on philosophical traditions and intellectual practice. If Hallen's reformulation of being *aje* and *alujanun* is appropriate, people in these categories belong to the group of Africa's indigenous intellectuals. Hallen's overall argument, of how the epistemological framework leads to moral and finally aesthetic considerations, is completed in chapter 5 ('The beautiful'). He describes the transition from the moral to the aesthetic sphere to be just as systematic, natural and coherent as the previous one from epistemological to moral (pp. 113–15).

In terms of general conclusion, Hallen places his project within the wider framework of current developments in African philosophy. He reiterates concern about prejudiced notions of African societies as 'pre-rational' or less rational than Western, and he insists: 'An African system of cognition, or system of values, must be described and analysed as something that is intellectually credible *ab initio* in its own right'—just like systems of cognition or values anywhere else (p. 35). Hallen argues against the assumption of the Western epistemological framework as universal. Even (Western) academic philosophy has to be seen as a 'cultural statement in its own right' (p. 35), no more and no less.

But Hallen also offers some appropriate criticisms of problematic tendencies in African philosophy today. Let me mention his concern about simplistic depictions of Africa, raised in relation to the somewhat romanticised ideal of a 'communal identity' being representative of African societies. Hallen reminds

us that other perspectives, worked out from particular observations, are probably more appropriate. This book is a convincing example of high-quality work on African philosophy, based on fieldwork on and in African languages, yet fully framed within the standards of a methodological paradigm of the recent Western tradition, namely ordinary language philosophy. The choice of framework offers the possibility of comparing Hallen's results with similarly oriented research on other cultures. It also allows easier integration and acceptance into mainstream philosophy than fieldwork-based studies are otherwise likely to.

On the other hand, owing to his approach, Hallen offers few insights into the living dynamics of Yoruba philosophical discourse in social context, no portrayals of individual thinkers and no in-depth discussion and interpretation of their specific fundamental insights into human life in their (written or oral) texts. I would also have appreciated more assessment of their social value, e.g. as guides on questions of basic theoretical and practical orientation in life. In the investigation of philosophy in Africa today these fields are equally important and relevant. Research on them would have offered different and complementary insights into philosophy in the Yoruba context, and particularly its 'discourse about values'.

To my mind, such complementarity is desirable for the future of African philosophy, a field which has seen embittered ideological battles over the possibilities of its existence, and which continues to be afflicted by various claims to exclusive rights to, and ways of, research. This does not mean that anything goes. But every source that can shed some light on the issue should be switched on. Hallen's book, from a particular perspective, offers us clear and bright light on the Yoruba epistemological framework and its normative links with moral and aesthetic discourse. Spot on.

KAI KRESSE
University of St Andrews

HOLGER B. HANSEN and MICHAEL TWADDLE (eds), *Christian Missionaries and the State in the Third World*. Oxford: James Currey, 2002, 307 pp., £19.95, ISBN 0 85255 783 3 paperback.

This book covers an enormous geographical range, and a similarly lengthy historical period. It is organised in eight parts. In Part I Michael Twaddle outlines the scope and range of the essays, providing an encompassing framework. Part II is devoted to 'The Caribbean diaspora at the end of the slave era', with studies by Mary Turner on Jamaica and Donald Wood on Guiana. Part III, entitled 'Mission and state in West and East Africa in the pre-colonial era', contains studies by Daniel Antwi and Paul Jenkins of Ghana, and John Rowe of Buganda. Part IV deals with missions and the early colonial state in Southern Africa, with articles by Doug Stuart, Roger Beck and Torstein Jorgensen. Part V deals with missions and education, with chapters by Deborah Gaitskell on South Africa and Jonathan Miran on Eritrea. Part VI covers mainstream missions and the colonial state, with chapters by Niels Kastfelt on Northern Nigeria, Jarle Simensen on Ghana, Holger Bernt Hansen on Uganda, John McCracken on Malawi and John Lonsdale on the settler colonies of Kenya and Southern Rhodesia. Part VII is entitled 'Complications with non-mainstream missionaries in Central and Southern Africa', with articles by Harry Langworthy on Joseph Booth in Nyasaland, James Campbell on the African Methodist Episcopal missionaries in South Africa and Michael O. West on the African Orthodox Church in Zimbabwe. Part VIII is devoted to the