

VOLUME 22

NUMBER 1

JANUARY 2013

CQ

Cambridge

Quarterly of

Healthcare

Ethics

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to
Engaging a World Community
of Bioethicists*

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Cambridge
Quarterly of
Healthcare
Ethics

A Quarterly
Journal Devoted
to Engaging a
World Community
of Bioethicists

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

The International Bioethics Retreat
<http://www.cpmc.org/services/ethics/retreat.html>

Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education
<http://cambridgebioethics.com/>

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*
Arthur Caplan, *Division of Medical Ethics, NYU Lagone Medical Center, New York*
John Coggon, *School of Law, University of Southampton, England*
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*
Denise Dudzinski, *Department of Bioethics and Humanities, University of Washington School of Medicine*
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center for Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University*
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*
Annon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Albert Jonsen, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Bioethics, University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine, Philadelphia*
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*
Doris Schroeder, *Centre for Professional Ethics, University of Central Lancashire, England*
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*
Mark R. Wicclair, *West Virginia University & University of Pittsburgh*

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to TKushner@aol.com. Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, Midwestern University, Glendale Campus, Bioethics Program, 19555 N. 59th Ave., Glendale, AZ 85308.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 22 (2013) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$389/£243; online only: \$315/£197; print only: \$382/£239. Individual rates, print only: \$103/£63. Single part: \$105/£66. Students and retirees: \$93/£58. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: \$78/£47. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2012. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 22, Number 1, January 2013

CONTENTS

Contributors 1

Special Section: Consent and Organ Donation

Guest Editorial: A Complex Web of Questions

SHEELAGH MCGUINNESS, TOM WALKER,

AND STEPHEN WILKINSON

4

Reflections on the Nature of Public Ethics

JONATHAN MONTGOMERY

9

Supporting Controlled Non-Heart-Beating Donation:
An Ethical Justification

DAVID PRICE AND JO SAMANTA

22

Normative Consent Is Not Consent

NEIL C. MANSON

33

Is Consent of the Donor Enough to Justify the Removal
of Living Organs?

GOVERT DEN HARTOGH

45

“Keeping Her Whole”: Bereaved Families’ Accounts of
Declining a Request for Organ Donation

MAGI SQUE AND DARIUSZ GALASINSKI

55

Organ Transplantation, the Criminal Law, and the Health
Tourist: A Case for Extraterritorial Jurisdiction?

JEAN V. MCHALE

64

Departments and Columns

Responses and Dialogue

Intention, Foresight, and Ending Life

ANDREW MCGEE

77

A response to “The Double Effect Effect” by

Charles Foster, Jonathan Herring, Karen Melham,
and Tony Hope (CQ 20(1))

Intention and Foresight—From Ethics to Law and Back
Again: A Reply to McGee

CHARLES FOSTER, JONATHAN HERRING, KAREN MELHAM,
AND TONY HOPE

86

Contents continued

Contents continued

Bioethics and Defense

Military Medical Ethics: A Review of the Literature
and a Call to Arms
MICHAEL L. GROSS 92

Bioethics Education

Role of E-Learning in Teaching Health Research Ethics
and Good Clinical Practice in Africa and Beyond
R. CHILENGI, A. NYIKA, G. B. TANGWA, R. A. NOOR,
S. W. RAMADHANI, S. BOSOMPRAH, AND W. L. KILAMA 110

Addendum

Addendum to CQ 21(3) Contributors 120