

*Protestanten ohne Protest. Die evangelische Kirche der Pfalz im Nationalsozialismus*, I: *Sachbeiträge*; II: *Kurzbiographien Anhang*. Edited by Christoph Picker, Gabriele Stüber, Klaus Bümlein and Frank-Matthias Hofmann. Pp. 911 incl. 276 ills, 2 tables and 1 map. Leipzig: Verlagshaus Speyer, 2016. €59.60. 978 3 374 04412 2

*JEH* (69) 2018; doi:10.1017/S0022046918001070

On 5 March 1934 the *Landessynode* of the Protestant Church of the Palatinate (Evangelische Kirche der Pfalz) passed a unanimous motion declaring its support ‘openly and joyfully’ for the newly constituted Evangelical Church of Germany and its leader, *Reichsbischof* Müller, and affirming its willingness to use the Church’s resources to support the National Socialist state ‘fully and completely’. Led by its bishop, Ludwig Diehl, who since April 1927 had been a committed member of the NSDAP, the Church of the Palatinate thus aligned itself with the National Socialist state and the ‘German Christians’. Only a small minority of the Palatine clergy associated themselves with the Confessing Church, and the members of the Pastors League (*Pfarrerbruderschaft*) in the Palatinate worked closely with the German Christians. Despite these historical realities, the post-war narrative tended to place the *Pfälzische Landeskirche* in the context of resistance to National Socialism. This substantial collection of essays and resources seeks to correct the previous narrative by presenting a systematic and complete account of the history of the Protestant Church of the Palatinate under National Socialism. It does so in the form of thirty-six thematic essays, complemented by seventy-nine biographical sketches of key figures (seventy-four men and five women). This is a significant collection, extensively illustrated and integrating research by more than sixty contributors, to which it is not possible to do full justice in this review.

The volume opens with Harry Oelke’s overview of relationships between the Church of the Palatinate and the other *Landeskirchen* during 1933–45. The first section of the volume then presents in greater detail the situation in the *Pfälzische Landeskirche*. Erich Schunk discusses the experience of the Church during the Weimar Republic, and in particular the constitutional changes which removed it from the jurisdiction of the (Catholic) king of Bavaria and gave it a *Landesbischof* and a *Landessynode* which proved politically divided and largely ineffective. Caroline Klausing explores the conversion of the Palatine electorate from predominantly liberal in 1920 to strong support for the NSDAP by 1932, showing that the Protestant areas of the Palatinate early became National Socialist strongholds. Pia Nordblom focuses on 1933, analysing voting patterns and the underlying concerns that drove them, including the (misguided) hope that National Socialism represented a new Christianising energy which would benefit the Churches. The new regime brought rapid change: church youth groups were integrated with the *Hitlerjugend* and the *Bund Deutscher Mädel*, and by the end of November 1933 over half the active pastors in the Palatinate had declared themselves as German Christians, who were seen as offering a middle way in the political divisions that split the Church’s leadership. Joachim Conrad traces the decision of the *Pfälzische Landeskirche* to integrate with the newly-established *Reichskirche*, which – in contrast to the situation of other *Landeskirchen*, such as that of the Rhineland – met with little resistance; the reordering of the

*Landessynode* was one consequence of this move. Erich Schunk outlines developments between 1934 and 1939, and particularly the ongoing struggles over the role of the *Landessynode* which reveal the underlying debates regarding the role of democracy in church government. A particular challenge was the annexation of the Saar: Jörg Rauber considers the interplay between political and ecclesiastical interests in the area's reintegration into Germany in 1935. Walter Rummel investigates the situation of the Church, and particularly of local congregations, during the Second World War, showing how church services, and especially funerals, witnessed to conflicts between Christian and National Socialist world views, for instance when the regime sought to forbid the reading of the names of the fallen in church services. After the annexation of Alsace-Lorraine in 1940, the Protestant Churches of Lorraine fell under the jurisdiction of the Church of the Palatinate. Siegfried Hermle shows the complexities of this process, which brought together Churches with different confessions and different financial systems. Finally, Gabriele Strüber addresses the engagement of the *Pfälzische Landeskirche* with – or its suppression of – its National Socialist past between 1945 and 1949, at the same time highlighting the important role of the Churches in post-war reconstruction.

The second section turns to church structures, organisations and groups. The Church of the Palatinate was early integrated into the *Reichskirche*, and the *Landesbischof* was a member of its Central Board; Franz Maier explores the resulting structures and relationships. Hannes Ziegler outlines the ways in which the *Landeskirche* related to the political infrastructure of the National Socialist state. The role of church councils is described by Helge Müller (Neustadt and Winzingen), Friedhelm Borggrefe (Ludwigshafen Nord) and Ingo Holzapfel (Kusel). All show the declining influence of the traditional church parties; these parties are the subject of Klaus Blümlein's essay. Thomas Fandel presents the rise of the German Christians and the national church movement. The confessional movement and the *Pfarrerbruderschaft* were less significant in the Palatinate than in other *Landeskirchen*; Michael Martin offers a brief assessment of their impact, including a list of those pastors known to have been involved (it would have been helpful to include here cross-references to those whose biographies are in volume ii). Martin Schuck considers the role of Protestant societies: the *Evangelischer Bund*, which positioned itself against the National Socialist focus on Germanic culture; the Society for Palatine Church History, which remained unpolitical in its publications, although its leaders included convinced National Socialists; and the *Pfarrerverein*, which sought to maintain a neutral position between German Christians and the Confessing Church, being much helped in this endeavour by the fact that membership in the *Pfarrerverein* remained a requirement for membership of the pastors' health insurance scheme.

The Church's compliance with state violence is the subject of the third section. Evidence of anti-semitism can be found in the Church of the Palatinate long before 1933, but so too can evidence of integration of Jews in the community, as Roland Paul shows. Protestant societies supported the boycott of Jewish businesses, and although the *Pfälzische Landeskirche* did not officially introduce the *Arierparagraph*, it none the less excluded pastors who could not prove their Aryan heritage. Similarly, Christof Beyer finds that Protestant hospitals and care homes in the

Palatinate approved forcible sterilisation of disabled people as early as 1931; there is no indication that the Church protested against the National Socialist euthanasia programme. Karlheinz Lipp highlights the role of anti-Communism in destabilising the Weimar Republic and exacerbating anxiety about democratic systems: a 'No' to communism was seen as a 'Yes' to National Socialism. Frank-Matthias Hofmann demonstrates the ways in which the Church, its diaconal institutions and its individual members benefitted from forced labour. However, as Markus Sasse observes, even in the Palatinate, where the Protestant Church was largely supportive of the regime, the Church and its pastors were still subject to state measures taken against them which significantly weakened the Church's position.

The final section considers the impact of National Socialism on different areas of church life in fourteen (mostly quite short) thematic essays: church services and church music (Ulrich Loschky), including the introduction of national festivals and the exclusion of 'Jewish' music; art and church buildings (Monika Storm), showing the continuation of earlier architectural trends, but also the integration of National Socialist imagery in windows and frescos; youth work (Ingo Holzappel) and the integration of Protestant youth work into the state provision; academic theology and training for ministry (Karl-Heinz Fix), with attempts to restructure the Heidelberg theology faculty and the Protestant seminary in Speyer; mission (Eberhard Cherdron) and its integration in the national movement, with a counter movement offered by the establishment of bible study weeks by members of the Confessing Church; schools and religious education (Michael Landgraf), including conflicts about teaching the Old Testament, which despite opposition from representatives of the National Socialist regime remained part of the curriculum; diaconal institutions and inner mission (Norbert Friedrich) and women's work (Friedhelm Borggreffe), which grappled with the practical consequences both of the regime's policies in these areas and of the *Landeskirche's* integration into the *Reichskirche*; pastors' wives (Siegrun Wipfler-Pohl and Gabriele Stuber), who during the war found themselves responsible for areas for which they had received no training, such as pastoral work, bible study or leading services; the complex question of the Protestant press, with its multitude of regional publications, some of which were decidedly critical of the regime (Traudel Himminhöfer); relationships between Protestants and Catholics, and the respective positions of their Churches within the National Socialist state (Klaus Fitschen); mission and ecumenism (Frank Biebinger and Friedhelm Borggreffe); church finances (Karin Kessel), which were significantly influenced both by the reduction of the state's contribution in 1934 and 1939, and by changes to the church tax in 1935, 1939 and 1942; and, finally, pastoral care in the border zone (Frank-Matthias Hoffmann and Christine Lauer), where the population was subject to large scale evacuations and often left heavily dependent on the local clergy for support.

The biographies presented in the second volume show the many different ways in which individuals engaged with, supported or resisted the National Socialist regime. Members of the NSDAP; members of the *Pfarrerbruderschaft*; SS-leaders; opposition politicians; leaders of the Church's women's work and of the National Socialist women's organisation; a woman excluded from the synod when women were forbidden to be members; the *Landesbischof*; and many more:

this is a rich collection which illustrates the personal realities of the events and issues discussed in the essays. The striking number of death-dates which lie in or after the 1970s also indicates the long influence of this generation in the post-war Church.

These two volumes represent an important contribution to the exploration of the German Churches under National Socialism. The *Evangelische Kirche der Pfalz* is to be congratulated on its commitment to the exploration of a difficult chapter in its history. The decision to do so has resulted in an impressive collection of resources which deserves to be widely used, and which has also identified significant areas in need of further study.

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

CHARLOTTE METHUEN

*Labour and the Gulag. Russia and the seduction of the British Left.* By Giles Udy. Pp. xxvii + 660 incl. 12 ills and 1 map. London: Biteback Publishing, 2017. £30. 978 1 78590 204 8

*JEH* (69) 2018; doi:10.1017/S0022046918000519

In an essay in 1946 on ‘The prevention of literature’, George Orwell wrote that ‘There can be no question about the poisonous effects of the Russian *mythos* on English intellectual life. Because of it, known facts are suppressed and distorted to such an extent as to make it doubtful whether a true history of our times can ever be written.’ Happily, Orwell’s fears were exaggerated. But for a long time many people on the Left in British politics regarded criticism of the Soviet Union as unacceptable. Stories of atrocities were ignored, dismissed as anti-Soviet inventions, or explained away as inevitable collateral damage in the building of socialism.

Giles Udy’s book is about this ‘seduction of the British Left’. Interestingly, he originally intended to write a very different book. He began researching the history of the labour camps in Norilsk, in the Soviet Arctic. He discovered that many of the prisoners there had been transferred from the White Sea labour camps. The White Sea region’s only resource was timber, large quantities of which, cut by gulag labourers, were exported to Britain in the early 1930s. Many of the labourers were so-called kulaks (‘rich peasants’), deported from agricultural areas in the south as part of the process of forced collectivisation.

There was a campaign to persuade the Labour government of 1929–31 to end the trade, on the grounds that the timber was being produced by slave labour, but the government refused, despite all the evidence which was produced. Giles Udy quotes tellingly from the minutes of a Cabinet discussion in February 1931, which decided against the appointment of a committee to enquire into the conditions of labour in the Russian timber trade, on the grounds that ‘there was little doubt that an investigation would show that Russian timber was handled by forced labour’. This chapter of the book is entitled ‘The Cabinet admits the truth and does nothing’. It seems a fair summary. When the matter was debated in the Commons a month later, George Strauss, giving the opening speech for the government, said that it had not been proved ‘that this labour is used for export and that these appalling conditions really do exist’, and claimed that the stories of brutality had been put forward ‘on political grounds with political