

chapters appear superficial. This is a shame, because the foundations are good, but the reader is never told exactly why the argument is important, or what wider implications the conclusions have for processes of conversion.

Despite these reservations, which will reduce its value for more casual readers and those who do not read it cover-to-cover, *Christianizing Asia Minor* is an impressive study that will amply reward those who devote to it the time and attention which it deserves.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

BEN KOLBECK

Beyond intolerance. The Milan meeting in AD 313 and the evolution of imperial religious policy from the age of the Tetrarchs to Julian the Apostate. Edited by Davide Dainese and Viola Gheller. (Studi e Testi Tardoantichi. Profane and Christian Culture in Late Antiquity.) Pp. 307. Turnhout: Brepols, 2018. €100 (paper). 978 2 503 57449 3; 2565 9030

JEH (71) 2020; doi:10.1017/S0022046920000184

This edited volume offers an interdisciplinary set of papers on tolerance in the early fourth century, with the wide range of contributions including on legal reform and imperial politics. The outcome of an early-career conference in 2013, it principally comprises perspectives from legal, political and religious history, generally addressed to textual sources, with some contributions addressing issues outside 'tolerance' narrowly conceived. Ulrico Agnati opens with a comparative overview examining fourth-century tolerance in relation to earlier Roman paradigms, the later development of modern ideas of toleration and finally the place of religion (particularly Islam) within European secularism, and attendant concerns over ethnic tensions and political participation. Here Agnati raises some interesting points, including the recognition that 'secular' values are substantially those of a 'secularised' European religious tradition, although the treatment here would benefit from engagement with some of the modern literature on these topics (in English, for example, Jose Casanova, *Public religions in the modern world*, Chicago 1994, and Jocelyne Cesari, *Why the West fears Islam: an exploration of Muslims in liberal democracies*, New York 2013). The volume's first papers proper offer analyses of Tetrarchic religious policy and its broader context. Valerio Massimo Minale discusses Maximinus Daia's policy toward Christians, intelligently exploring the progress of his persecutory measures as a result of dialogue and interaction with both local political stakeholders and his imperial colleagues. Daniela Borelli offers another close reading of the function of priests in the 'religious revivals' which took place in the reigns of Julian the Apostate and Maximinus Daia. She broadly following the model of comparison established by Oliver Nicholson ('The "pagan churches" of Maximinus Daia and Julian the Apostate', this JOURNAL xlv [1994], 1–10) though differing in viewing Daia's priestly caste as Neoplatonically-inspired, and noting the differences that the accounts of Lactantius and Eusebius present.

Moving into the reign of Constantine, Marco Rocco re-examines, from a legal perspective, the sources for the deaths of that emperor's son Crispus and wife

Fausta. Following an examination of Constantine's legislation on adultery (particularly the April 326 law on adultery, CTh 9.7.1) and the textual accounts, he argues that Crispus could not have been executed for that crime. Instead, he suggests that the only way to harmonise this with the narrative accounts (in Philostorgius, Eunapius, Pseudo-Aurelius Victor and Zonaras), which suggest that Fausta had him killed after he refused her advances, is by concluding that while there was sexual impropriety it was rather Crispus who attempted to rape Fausta, thus forcing Constantine to execute him. While an innovative and thought-provoking contribution it rests on two questionable assumptions, namely that the later historians had information about the existence of a sexual crime unavailable to their earlier counterparts (Eutropius and the real Aurelius), and that, in any case, Constantine would have followed legal procedure. Michele Giagnorio meanwhile offers a considered analysis of the political thought which lay behind the 311 and 313 measures for the toleration of Christians, emphasising how they differed both from each other and from other conceptions advanced by Christians like Tertullian.

Davide Dainese's close reading of Eusebius' political theology, on the other hand, moves away from questions of toleration to address the relation between emperor and Church more broadly, and perceptively highlights the differences between the respective positions of emperor and bishop. Dario Annunziata, meanwhile, provides a general overview of the legal and doctrinal implications of private and ecclesiastical property prior to 313. Alessia Spina argues for placing Constantine's reforms to slavery in a more gradual evolution of Roman legal practice (particularly concerning manumission), rather than as evincing specifically Christian concerns. Finally, Francesca Zanetti's paper returns to the theme of toleration and religious difference, providing a summary of Constantinian legal measures concerning the Jews. She emphasises the interplay between Christian identity formation and boundary creation with earlier precedents concerning Judaism as a *religio licita*.

This volume is strongest in the close attention paid by the contributors to the ancient sources, together with their extensive dual-language quotation; the analysis of their respective themes is often incisive. Despite the title, however, it does not really move 'beyond' traditional paradigms of intolerance and religious change, at least in the sense of offering a worked-out and consistently applied alternative throughout the volume. For a volume on this theme one might also expect more attention to have been paid (outside the introduction) to temple closures or Cesset *superstitio* (CTh. 16.10.2) as well as the policy of Constantine's sons. Some papers also feel only tangentially connected to the main theme (thus Rocco, Spina and Borelli). Two represent work elaborated at length elsewhere by the contributors (for example, in Dario Annunziata's *Opulenzia ecclesiae: alle origini della proprietà ecclesiastica*, Naples 2017, and Francesca Zanetti's *Gli ebrei nella Roma antica: storia e diritto nei secoli III–IV d.C.*, Naples 2016). One suspects that this is the result of the delay between the conference at which the papers were first presented (2013) and final publication. This delay, though perhaps unavoidable, has none the less inhibited consideration of some subsequent contributions and prevented these papers from informing scholarly discussions during intervening years (such as in Edward Siecienski [ed.], *Constantine: religious faith and religious policy*, London 2017). None the less, individual papers remain valuable and address concerns which are still relevant, such as Minale's discussion of how

Daia's persecutory measures arose out of interactions between that emperor, his city-based subjects and his peers, which recalls (or anticipates) Noel Lenski's analysis of Constantinian policy in his *Constantine and the cities: imperial authority and civic politics* (Philadelphia 2015).

The standard of English is, with some exceptions, generally good, with the occasional odd turn of phrase that one would expect in papers written in a second language (as is the case in all but two cases). There are however some consistent editorial problems, including the seemingly random occurrence of superscript numerals in some of the bibliographic entries. Overall, the papers in this volume will be of interest to scholars concerned with the specific issues that its contributors address in early fourth-century religious and political history, particularly those concerned with Roman legal practice. Taken as the sum of its parts, however, it is unlikely to revolutionise our understanding of intolerance in the early fourth century.

PETERHOUSE,
CAMBRIDGE

THOMAS LANGLEY

Ethiopian Christianity. History, theology, practice. By Philip F. Esler. Pp. xvi + 310 incl. 42 figs and 2 tables. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2019. \$39.95. 978 1 4813 0674 4
JEH (71) 2020; doi:10.1017/S0022046920000238

Christianity has flourished in the mountains of Ethiopia throughout its history. There are indications of a Christian presence from New Testament times; a bishop was consecrated in about 335; a Christian kingdom persisted in an area dominated by Islam until the fall of Haile Selassie in 1974; then there have been new Churches emerging in the period since then. Yet this Church developed a life, worship and culture largely isolated from and indifferent to the rest of the Christian world. Its position led to a culture shaped by its position between Europe, sub-Saharan Africa, the Middle East and south and east Asia. The resulting mix has fascinated and surprised visitors, but has also been unfamiliar and difficult to understand. So this book, with its broad description of the history and practice of Christianity in Ethiopia will be a guide which will be valued by those who encounter and are fascinated by the kind of faith that they find.

The first part of the book is a historical survey. It begins by assessing when and how Christianity arrived in Ethiopia. There is a full account of this earliest stage, with evidence from literary sources, coins and inscriptions to argue the date when the first bishop, Frumentius, was consecrated and the identity of the kings of the period. After that there is a more sketchy account of the sweep of history up to the present day. This traces the growth of a Christian culture, its close involvement with the king and court, its – usually harmonious – relationship with Islam and slow adjustment to the modern world.

Then there are three chapters which describe the practice and culture of the Church, and discuss some of the aspects of its life. First, there is a survey of the literary tradition of the Church. This starts with the Garima Gospels, now recognised