

## Correspondence

*To the Editorial Board,*

Joseph M. Siracusa's review (Sept. 1976) of my *Indo-China and the Roosevelt Years, 1937–1945* requires a response. First, he asserts that "Thorpe has no doubt that had the President lived, he would have kept the French to their word, in one form or another." Nowhere did I state or even imply this. Second, he asserts that the Truman administration's concern for the Indo-Chinese is "nowhere hinted at." Siracusa does not (and probably cannot) cite any statement by Truman on this, but cites a State Department document. Nevertheless, I did not impute bad motives to Truman. In my conclusion I stated that "the U.S. modified its policy after the Roosevelt years — but only gradually and reluctantly" (p. 75). This concern was more than hinted at; it was stressed. The reader could have judged these points for himself had it not been for another careless aspect of the review: the city and country where the book was published (Superior, Wis., U.S.A. 54880) curiously were not given. Finally, Siracusa's assertion that identical Gravel and Defense Department versions of the *Pentagon Papers* (PP) negates the need for my book is doubtful. My book covers the years 1937–1941 as well as the years 1941–1945 found in PP. It has 84 pages compared to the 8 page coverage in PP ("close attention" to FDR?). It is also more concise than PP, which consists of long excerpts from a small number of documents. PP has 19 footnote numbers, but the footnotes themselves were not published. My book has 114 key documents cited separately from the 113 footnotes on other documents and serves as an inexpensive monograph and as an annotated index to the *Foreign Relations* documents for 1937–1945 (prior to 1945 when an Indo-China category was started these documents were scattered about in various volumes). Virtually all of the pertinent documents used but not identified in PP may be identified by consulting my book, a process which will also reveal the vast number of documents not covered in PP but used in my book. If Siracusa thought the book unworthy of a scholarly journal, one wonders why he wrote the review. Since it was reviewed, this response is necessary to correct some of the careless aspects of that review.

705 Redland Drive  
Madison, Wisconsin 53714, U.S.A.

James A. Thorpe