

REVIEWS

THE ANCIENT WORLD

TREVOR BRYCE:

Life and Society in the Hittite World.

xiv, 312 pp. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002. £45.

Trevor Bryce has already given us a valuable overview of Hittite history with his earlier book *The Kingdom of the Hittites* (Oxford, 1998) and his second book, *Life and Society in the Hittite World*, complements this earlier work. The author's focus has shifted from the political and military history of the Hittites to a broader study of Hittite life and culture in Anatolia from the seventeenth to the twelfth century BC. The people known as the Hittites were major political players in the Near East during the Late Bronze Age but for many centuries they were underestimated and little understood. This book is a welcome corrective and combines a scholarly approach with a tangible enthusiasm for the subject.

The author's methodology is to draw on a wide range of ancient sources, predominantly textual but some archaeological, in the light of modern scholarship, and to combine this material with personal speculation deemed to be 'within the bounds of possibility'. Although the book's aim is an overview of Hittite life and society, its scope is largely determined by the available written records. As the author points out, the limited range of texts and each text's original purpose are fundamental constraints.

The book is unusual in its avowed aim of communicating the essential experience of being an individual in ancient Hittite society. A vivid writing style suits this empathetic approach. The emotions projected by the author can occasionally be intrusive, as in the discussion of Hittite religion and in the emphasis on the tedium of scribal training, but the author successfully narrows the gap between the modern reader and the ancient Hittite by focusing on our common humanity.

The introductory material sets out the chronological and geographical framework and includes two maps. The problems of Hittite geography are still manifold but a more detailed map of ancient Anatolia would have been helpful, given the number of toponyms in the text. The main body of the book consists of fourteen chapters, each on a particular aspect of Hittite life and society: 'King, court, and royal officials'; 'The people and the law'; 'The scribe'; 'The farmer'; 'The merchant'; 'The warrior'; 'Marriage'; 'The gods'; 'The curers of disease'; 'Death, burial, and the afterlife'; 'Festivals and rituals'; 'Myth'; 'The capital'; and 'Links across the wine-dark sea'. A snapshot of a key incident or a pertinent quotation introduces each chapter. A useful bibliography and general index close the book.

The following selected notes include references to inconsistent renderings of Hittite cuneiform in Roman script.

pp. 16, 253–4: *hazannu* or *Hazannu* for *HAZANNU*.

p. 20: ^{GIŠ}*kalmuš* for ^{GIŠ}*kalmus*.

pp. 21–2: *MEŠEDI* for *MEŠĒDI*.

p. 23: *GAL* (*LÜ.MEŠ*) *GEŠTIN* for *GAL* (^{LÜ.MEŠ})*GEŠTIN*. The development of the role of this high official can be compared to that of the Assyrian *rab šaqê*, 'Chief of the Cupbearers'.

- p. 29: *esertu* for *ESERTU*; *naptartu* for *NAPṬARTU*.
- p. 38: *rābišu* for *rābišu*, literally 'lurker'. The full Akkadian equivalent of the official entitled ^{LÚ}MAŠKIM.URU^{KI} is *rābiš āli*. In the lexical text *Hh. II* 32 *maškim.uru^{KI}* and *MIN* (= *ra-bi-šu*) *a-li* are equated.
- p. 57: A syllabic cuneiform sign can represent a whole or part syllable.
- p. 58: While it is true that the Hittite cuneiform sign lexicon is relatively small, the advantages proposed by the author in comparison to an alphabetic script are invalid: Hittite cuneiform is not 'very economical in terms of space' and is not written 'with great rapidity'. The complexity of Hittite cuneiform is compounded by the regular use of Sumerograms and Akkadograms rather than syllabically written Hittite. Sign distinctions can be very small but in some periods the signs LA and AD are identical.
- p. 59: A scribal school (É.DUB.BA.A) is mentioned in a Hittite letter not from Hattusa, as noted by P. D. Gesche, *Schulunterricht in Babylonien im ersten Jahrtausend v. Chr.*, p. 27 (Münster, 2000).
- p. 69: Writing boards of walnut wood, as well as an ivory set, were recovered from well AB in the North West Palace at Nimrud (J. and D. Oates, *Nimrud: An Assyrian Imperial City Revealed*, pp. 97–9, 219–20 (London, 2001)). Traces of a mixture of beeswax and orpiment, which softened the wax, were still stuck to the keyed surfaces of the ivory boards and bore clear impressions of cuneiform signs. For a photograph see J. E. Curtis and J. E. Reade, *Art and Empire: Treasures from Assyria in the British Museum*, p. 191 (New York, 1995).
- p. 151: MUSH for MUŠ; MUSEN for MUŠEN.
- p. 188: Spring is between mid-March and mid-June and autumn between September and November, not vice versa.
- p. 194: The Hittite word *nuntarriyashas* is genitive singular, so the festival title should be rendered EZEN *nuntarriyashas*. The springtime AN.TAḪ.SUM or 'crocus' festival is so called because the spring crocus appears with the melting of the snow and symbolizes that season.
- p. 253: LÚ.MEŠ MAŠKIM.URU-LIM for ^{LÚ}.MEŠ MAŠKIM.URU-LIM.
- p. 274 n. 21: *ana ittišu* for *ana ittišu*.
- p. 287 n. 37: The Sumerian sign for woman is variously read SAL (p. 29: ^{SAL}SUHUR.LAL) and MUNUS (p. 287 n. 37: MUNUS.ŠU.GI). The basic meaning of ^{MUNUS}ŠU.GI is 'old woman', not simply 'old'. The use of this Sumerogram in Hittite to denote a woman with high ritual status and authority can be compared to the semantic range of Akkadian *šību*, 'old man, witness, city elder'.
- The author cites time travel as the only means of experiencing the ancient world but he has made considerable progress in bridging the inevitable gap with this informed and enjoyable book.

FRANCES S. REYNOLDS

RICHARD GOULET (ed.):

Dictionnaire des Philosophes Antiques. II, Babélica d'Argos à Dyscolius; 1018 pp., III, d'Eccélos à Juvenal, 1070 pp. Paris: CNRS Editions, 1996, and 2003. Supplément, 801 pp.

Volumes II and III continue the massive project (for a review of the first volume see *BSOAS* LIV/1, 1991, 234–5), in which every known ancient Greek, Latin and Syriac philosopher is dealt with, whether his name appears merely as

an undated graffito on a tomb (s.v. B[an]non), or he is so well known as to merit more than sixty pages of text (s.v. Démocrite d'Abdère). Some entries relate to the reception into Greek of more ancient traditions (the Babylonian tradition in Berossus, Egyptian in Bolos of Mendes, and Indian in *Barlaam and Josaphat* and Calanus). Others treat in detail the Arabic tradition of certain Greek works, such as those attributed to Calanus, Diagoras, 'Dimuqratis' (a conflation of 'Democrates' and 'Democritus'), Diogenes of Sinope, and the *Tablet* of Cebes, Euclid, Galen, Geminus, the Hermetica, Issos, and John of Damascus (Maroun Aouad, Dimitri Gutas and Ulrich Rudolph are the authors of subsections of entries on these topics). A particularly useful mini-article is that by Michel Tardieu on Chosroes (Xosro Anoservan), the Sassanian king (reigned 531–578/9) who provided a haven for several Greek philosophers, and established one of the major conduits by which Greek philosophy and science arrived in the Arabic world. Each entry includes a comprehensive bibliography, and references to portraits of the philosopher concerned, six of which are reproduced as a visual introduction to volume II (between pp. 10 and 11). No bibliography can ever be complete, but it may be of interest to Orientalists to add to the article on 'Iuba II, king of Mauritania' article, the material on 'Iorach' (with whom Iuba is plausibly identified), which arrived in Europe from an Arabic source, and has been brought together in an article by Isabelle Draelants: 'Le dossier des livres "sur les animaux et les planètes" de Iorach: traditions occidentale et orientale', in I. Draelants, A. Tihon and B. van den Abele (eds), *Occident et Proche-Orient: Contacts Scientifiques au Temps des Croisades*, Turnhout: Brepols, 2000, 199–276.

The 'Supplément' adds new notices or supplements to notices included in the first three volumes. Most of the volume, however, is taken up by Aristotle (pp. 109–654): the Syriac and Arabic traditions of Aristotle's *Ethics*, *Poetics*, *Rhetoric*, *Metaphysics*, *De caelo*, *De generatione et Corruptione*, *Meteorologica*, *De Animalibus*, *De Anima*, *Parva Naturalia*, and of Pseudo-Aristotle's *De Mundo*, *Physiognomica*, *De Plantis*, *Problemata Physica*, *Liber de Causis*, *Secretum Secretorum* and *De Lapidibus*. Nearly fifty pages (pp. 599–647) have been written by Cristina d'Ancona and Richard Taylor on the *Liber de Causis*, an Arabic compilation of extracts from Proclus's *Elements of Theology*. Also, new work on the Arabic tradition of Alexander of Aphrodisias has been added (by Silvia Fazzo).

The *Dictionnaire de Philosophes Antiques* is now the most up-to-date and complete source for bibliography and critical evaluation on the ancient philosophers, and would be a valuable asset in any academic library.

CHARLES BURNETT

THE NEAR AND MIDDLE EAST

B. HALLAQ, R. OSTLE and S. WILD (eds):

La Poétique de l'Espace dans la Littérature Arabe moderne.

216 pp. Saint Étienne: Presses Sorbonne Nouvelle, 2002. €19.80.

The title of this volume as explained by the blurb on its back cover promises the reader a stimulating survey of the concept of space in modern Arabic literature, focusing on one principal issue: '*l'espace palestinien*'. Upon opening the book, however, the reader is in for a surprise. Only one of the thirteen

articles it contains makes mention of Palestine, but five contributions, comprising nearly half of the volume, deal with the work of a single author who is, moreover, not of Arab origin. He is Ibrāhīm al-Kawnī, the Libyan Tuareg writer whose remarkable and prolific work is being discussed here in a number of pioneering studies which gain added interest by their appearing alongside a brief but highly significant contribution by the author himself.

That this volume should absorb al-Kawnī's work into the general 'literary space' of the Arab world without its cover providing even so much as a hint at the prominent position he occupies in its contents is strangely reminiscent of the fate of his people, whose separate identity has been submerged by the rise of Arab and African post-colonial nation-states in the vast territory over which they once held undisputed sway. This region, covering southern Algeria and south-western Libya as well as northern Mali and northern Niger, and thus including much of the central Sahara, is also the stage for the stories and epic novels of Ibrāhīm al-Kawnī. The latter, it could be said, is as much and as little Arab as Salman Rushdie is English. Al-Kawnī writes in Arabic, the language of the culture and religion that have long dominated the Tuareg region, but his work draws heavily on indigenous myths, legends, religious beliefs and rituals and frequently introduces words derived from Tamasheq (the Tuareg language). It thus provides a thoroughly distinct and unusual contribution to the orb of Arabic literature, as amply documented in the studies in this volume.

While very much Tuareg in origin and subject matter, al-Kawnī's literary world is anything but parochial. The universality of his vision is impressively captured by Luc-Willy Dehevels, author of the first contribution on al-Kawnī, who likens his creative dynamism to the interstellar cloud resulting from a supernova: it absorbs all it encounters and transforms it either into new stellar systems or into black holes 'in which time and space are annihilated, then inverted'. In al-Kawnī's case an 'enormous intertextual cloud' formed of elements Saharan, Arabo-Islamic, African, Greco-Roman and Western gives birth, by means of a process of 'reflection and inversion', to a new narrative universe in which the great desert is transformed into the centre of the world (p. 41).

Dehevel's main aim is to trace this process of reflection and inversion in the genesis of three locations of mythological import which recur in al-Kawnī's work: the heavenly city of Wāw, the myth of Atlantis and the motif of 'the mountain and the sage'. In each case he is able to identify significant echoes and allusions to a number of related texts. Thus the kingdom of Atlantis, equated by al-Kawnī with the ancient Saharan realm of the moon goddess Tānis, owes its existence to a miraculous irrigation of the desert; unlike the Platonic Atlantis, an island destroyed by submersion into the sea, the Saharan Atlantis meets its tragic end by being smothered in a dust storm lasting forty days. Dehevel's reflections on the multiple meanings of the heavenly city of Wāw, which marks both the beginning and the end of Time, lead him to trace analogies with comparable visionary cities in the tradition of Islamic mysticism; these, however, are located at the end of the world, while the city of Wāw is mysteriously present in the centre of the desert and, indeed, 'in the heart of every being' (p. 30). The mystical associations of Wāw posited by Dehevels may be seen to be confirmed by the significance given to the Arabic letter of the same name in the mystical system of Ibn 'Arabī: it 'alludes to the final degree of existence, the Perfect Man, in whom all ... preceding degrees of existence are summarized'. (See Ibn 'Arabī, *The Seven Days of the Heart—Prayers for the Nights and Days of the Week*, translated and presented by P. Beneito and S. Hirtenstein (Oxford, 2000) p. 13.)

The 'summarisation of all degrees of existence' in Wāw is the very subject matter of the story *Waṭan al-Ru'ā al-Samāwiyya* ('Homeland of the Heavenly Vision') analysed in the contribution of Rima Sleiman. A father and his son set out for the heart of the desert in search of Wāw, leaving behind the corrupt world of the oases and sedentary life; as they reach their goal the dying son's body merges with that of the father before he, too, succumbs. Sleiman impressively demonstrates how the stages of their journey can be interpreted as a return to the beginning of creation, indeed as a 'negation of creation' as stated in the title of her article: she concludes that 'al-Kawnī's text ends where the book of Genesis begins' (p. 49).

Next in line is the extensive contribution authored by Sabry Hafez. Though marred by an unfortunate number of editorial lapses (see below), it offers a profound reading of al-Kawnī's short but multi-layered novel *al-Fam* ('The Mouth') which also features a father and his son as protagonists. In this case the father is ultimately compelled to offer his son for sacrifice in expiation of his earlier infringement of *Anhī*, the law of the desert. Hafez shows that *Anhī* is intimately connected with the cosmic cycle and the four elements which make up the natural world, and posits an analogy between the desert universe as depicted by al-Kawnī and the 'chain of being' underlying the literature of Elizabethan England, including Shakespeare. Another analogy, perhaps closer at hand, might be to compare *Anhī* with the ancient Egyptian concept of *Maat*, the cosmic justice which regulates the balance of man and the universe. (See H. Frankfort, *Ancient Egyptian Religion* (New York, 1961), p. 53 ff.) The connection is brought to mind by al-Kawnī himself when, in his own contribution to the volume, he asserts that it was the Tuareg who created the civilization of ancient Egypt (see p. 97).

Hafez introduces his article with some observations on the desert as a theme in modern Arabic literature and draws some revealing parallels between the works of al-Kawnī and 'Abd al-Raḥmān Munif, the Saudi author whose quintet *Mudun al-Milḥ* (Cities of Salt) laments the passing of the desert culture of the Arabian peninsula under the onslaught of oil-driven modernity (Ashraf Eissa's contribution to the volume also compares the two authors (see pp. 90–91).) Without overtly stating the case he appears to link al-Kawnī's work with the genesis of a 'newly imagined "national self" in Libya' (p. 57), in parallel with the rise of similar 'imagined communities' in the works of other Arab novelists. As indicated above, however, the 'imagined community' to be found in al-Kawnī's work is not Arab and, moreover, goes far beyond the boundaries of the Libyan state. The postcolonial borders dissecting the desert are hardly mentioned by al-Kawnī, whose protagonists move freely between Timbuktu, Kano, Aghadez and Ghat, and in so doing convey an ill-disguised nostalgia for another age.

The unfamiliarity of al-Kawnī's voice to Arab ears is stressed in the contribution by Ashraf Eissa who notes that, notwithstanding some 'distant links with the Arab literary tradition', al-Kawnī's desert confronts his readers with 'curious and alien characteristics' (p. 86). Through analysis of one of his stories, *Nadhr al-Batūl* ('The Maiden's Vow' (For no clear reason Eissa's article carries the title 'The Maiden's Wāw', presumably a misspelling for 'Vow'.)), Eissa seeks to locate the author's unique style and vision by association with other contemporary and classical works of world literature and argues that his method of narrative representation is closest to 'magical realism'. (Hafez also compares al-Kawnī's work to 'magic realism' (see p. 60), though without arguing the case.) In *Nadhr al-Batūl* this technique is used to 'erase the conventional distinction between character and space' (p. 92), or between the

desert dwellers and the desert itself. Just as the son fuses back into the body of the father in the story analysed by Sleiman so the virgin Tazdirat becomes one with the desert by willingly offering her young body to one of its perennial floods instead of to a man. The negation of procreation implied in this act thereby parallels the 'negation of creation' in Sleiman's story and also evokes echoes of the 'sacrifice of the son' in the tale analysed by Hafez. Together the three contributions provide a telling insight into the immense and distinctly sombre world of this remarkable author, in which the desert does indeed appear to figure, in Deheuve's image, like a 'black hole': an all-consuming entry-point into a world beyond time and space, and hence a place of salvation from what al-Kawnī, in his contribution to this volume, calls '*l'enfer de cette vie*' (p. 100).

For anyone concerned with the work of this author the pages containing his personal testimony, though few in number, must be of greatest interest. They comprise an interview as well the text of a brief allocution to an international colloquium held in Paris in 1997 where al-Kawnī was the guest of honour and which provided the forum for the papers gathered in this volume. Considering al-Kawnī's great mastery of Arabic as an artistic medium it comes as a surprise to read that, having grown up in a remote region of southern Libya, he only spoke the Tuareg language until the age of twelve and had until then not benefited from any formal education.

However, even before becoming fully literate he had felt the urge to compose '*la parole du désert*' (p. 96) which, in his view, had yet to be uttered and would have to be novelistic and epic; mere poetry, such as that of pre-Islamic Arabia—or, indeed the prolific poetry of the Tuareg often mentioned in al-Kawnī's works—would not do. The urge to write was tantamount to a prophetic calling and, like Jonah and the Prophet Muḥammad, he had initially tried to abscond from it, in his case by immersing himself in other activities which led him to long sojourns abroad, especially in Poland and Russia. These were not, however, in vain: he learnt foreign languages, read widely, particularly in Russian, and developed a 'special and intimate relationship' with Dostoyevsky whom he considers to be his master. Finally he retired into the seclusion of a Swiss mountain retreat resembling his native landscape in order to fashion his personal vision of the desert, out of the vestiges of stories and myths stretching back 'some eleven thousand years' to the age of the Saharan rock inscriptions which adorn the covers of his books.

Al-Kawnī asserts that while the great desert 'has not known monotheism', the unity of the creator and his creation has always been a preoccupation of his. In what is perhaps a key phrase he asserts that 'God, man and beast are united in a single body called Sahara' (p. 98). Hence any destruction of its animals or plants, any violation of its landscape or its natural features is tantamount to self-destruction on the part of man. In a wider sense al-Kawnī's entire work is to be understood as a lament for the world of nature which human civilization has exposed to a well-nigh unstoppable process of destruction, driven by man's illusion that he may find happiness outside himself. The real treasure, the real paradise of peace, symbolized by the myth of Wāw, the legendary desert city, can only be found inside the soul.

The contrast between two types of space that runs through al-Kawnī's work—one external, natural or material, the other internal, spiritual or imaginary—is discussed in several of the other contributions in the second part of this volume, dedicated to studies on a range of modern Arab authors. Of similar importance is the notion of 'literary space', introduced by a number of contributors, which may be defined as the web of intertextual as well as

mythological associations evoked by the literary works in question. Tracing these varied notions of 'space' in a wide selection of texts, often with reference to Gaston Bachelard's seminal work *The Poetics of Space* (1994) which presumably inspired the title of the volume, brings the reader face to face with numerous facets of the profoundly conflictive cultural and political environment of the modern Arab world.

A number of major themes run through the entire collection, however. As one would have expected in a work dealing with the notion of space, chief among these is perhaps the theme of movement from one location to another, most notably from the rural to the urban world. In al-Kawnī's case the latter is manifest in the transition from desert to oasis. As documented in detail in Hafez's contribution, for al-Kawnī the oasis (and even more so the town) is synonymous with corruption and enslavement whereas the desert holds the promise of purity and freedom. The rural–urban dichotomy appears in a very different light in the autobiographical novel *al-Khubz al-Ḥāfī* ('For Bread Alone') by the Moroccan writer Muḥammad Shukrī where the countryside is a space of deprivation, hopelessness and ignorance; salvation is to be found in migration to the town and the acquisition of education through which the writer is able to emancipate himself from the nightmarish world of his rural childhood. In discussing this text Stefan Wild perceives in it a secular re-enactment of the Prophetic *Hijra*, leading from a stage of ignorance or *Jāhiliyya* to a stage of insight and understanding.

Yet another form of the rural–urban journey theme appears in Ghassān Kanafānī's short story *Kāna Yawma Dhāka Ṭiflan* ('That Day He Was a Child') discussed by Subhi Boustani, which portrays a bus trip between Haifa and Acre during the 1948 war that ends with the massacre of the passengers. Through a detailed stylistic analysis Boustani shows how the description of the Palestinian countryside viewed by the passengers evokes the profoundly nostalgic image of a poetic space, the cruel loss of which turns an innocent child into a warrior. Ḥanān al-Shaykh's story *Qūt al-Qulūb*, discussed by Catherine Cobham, presents a further variant on the theme. It is set in a Yemeni mountain village entirely devoid of men, who have migrated to Saudi Arabia and only return once a year. With its population consisting only of women, the remote village is portrayed as a 'felicitous space' (p. 136) and as such resembles the Upper Egyptian convent which figures in the second story by Ḥanān al-Shaykh analysed by Cobham. Both spaces, however, are shown to be ultimately penetrated by men, though in very different ways.

The notion of journey or transition is given an inner, symbolic, dimension in the contribution of Richard Van Leuwen, who analyses the spatial patterns in Gamāl al-Ghīṭānī's *Waqā'i' Ḥārat al-Za'farānī* ('Incidents of Za'farānī Alley') and Hudā Barakāt's *Ḥajar al-Ḍaḥik* ('The Laughing Stone') from the point of view of the rite of passage. In Ghīṭānī's novel, an initially secluded space, the Za'farānī alley, becomes the breeding ground of a peculiar social revolution which ends up transforming the outside world. The opposite process is observed in *Ḥajar al-Ḍaḥik* where the outside world, in the form of war-torn Beirut, gradually invades and corrupts a carefully preserved enclave of purity and peace. In both novels Van Leuwen sees mechanisms of power at work which ultimately determine the individual's 'personal and social space' and hence shape his identity (p. 171). *Ḥajar al-Ḍaḥik* is analysed from a psychological perspective with very similar findings in the contribution by Isabella Camera d'Aflitto, who focuses on the theme of space as a source of terror, through claustrophobia or agoraphobia, in a number of texts, most notably in *al-Ghuraf al-Ukhrā* ('The Other Rooms') by Jabrā Ibrāhīm Jabrā. The

nightmarish dimension of space in these writings, though a widespread feature in modern literature in general, can be seen to reflect the experiences of persecution, imprisonment and forced displacement which sadly are part of contemporary political reality in many parts of the Arab world.

The volume also includes two contributions on Arabic drama, which add a new and significant aspect to the notion of poetic space by focusing on the dramatist's use of theatrical space on stage. In analysing Mamdūh 'Udwān's play *Muḥākamat al-Rajul Alladhī Lam Yuhārib* ('The Trial of the Man Who Did not Fight') which portrays the court case of Abū Shukr, a deserter from the Syrian army, Rosella Dorigo-Ceccato shows how the division of the stage in two rigidly divided sections comes to represent the chasm between judge and accused and, ultimately, between ruler and ruled. As the play progresses the roles are reversed and the accusers gradually find themselves in the role of the guilty. The abolition of the divide on stage at the end of the play marks the release of Abū Shukr who, in being freed, recovers his sense of responsibility as a citizen and is now ready to face death in battle.

While Mamdūh 'Udwān's play makes use of the traditional theatrical space of Western drama, the modern North African plays discussed by Monica Ruocco aim to recreate the ambience of traditional Arab theatre by abolishing the division between stage and auditorium and allowing the spectators to participate spontaneously in the action. This attempt at what Ruocco calls 'cultural decolonisation' is both inspired by and oriented towards the countryside and ancient townships such as Marrakesh, which come to represent a treasured world of authentic and traditional values much at variance with the Westernized life-style of the modern cities. The confrontation with the legacy of Europe in North African theatre is but one aspect of the great encounter between Arab and European cultures discussed, with customary brilliance, in the contribution by Abdelfattah Kilito. It sets the scene for the volume by contrasting the closed, unified and homogeneous space of Arabo-Islamic culture as it appears in classical Arab *maqāma* literature with the emergence of the European 'Other' as a major theme in Arab writing from the nineteenth century onwards and with particular reference to the work of Aḥmad Fāris al-Shidiyāk.

The multiple manifestations of the notion of space in modern Arabic literature which appear in this volume are presented in an introductory survey by Boutros Hallaq and conclude with reflections by Yves Gonzales-Quijano on factors influencing the publication and dissemination of literary works in the Arab world. All in all, this is a rich and valuable collection of contributions in both English and French, produced by scholars from five European countries. It is all the more regrettable that the book has clearly suffered from an unusual degree of editorial neglect. Among the shortcomings in the overall design are, apart from the seriously misleading blurb on the back cover, the incidence of two chapters marked as XI (pp. 173, 187), the random instead of alphabetical order of two of the indexes, the lack of English summaries in the introductory and concluding chapters, and B. Hallaq's omission from the list of contributors; moreover Van Leuwen's contribution is, for no clear reason, entitled *Présentation*, like B. Hallaq's introduction.

Printing mistakes, inconsistencies and faulty transliterations are too numerous to mention and already begin with errors in the presentation of the transliteration system on p. 7. A sample of the type of problems to be found is provided by p. 59 which exhibits inconsistencies in spelling (Toareq / Tuareg), transliteration problems (*ṣahārā* instead of *sahāra*, an error repeated on p. 64, and *qafas* instead of *qafas*), inconsistencies in publication dates (e.g.

al-Kawnī's 'The Sorcerers' is noted as published in 1995 on p. 59, while p. 64 gives the publication date as 1994: similarly 'The Magus' is listed as published in 1991 while p. 64 gives 1990 and 1992) and inconsistencies in book titles (the title of *al-Fam* is translated as 'The Abyss' on p. 59 but on p. 60 it appears as 'The Mouth'). Similar problems are found in the remainder of this particular article and, indeed, throughout the book, though the French contributions appear to be rather more carefully edited than those in English. Sometimes these editorial problems present the reader with real difficulties, such as the error on p. 131 where the same abbreviation is given for two different book titles: 'hencefoth (sic!) PrS'.

While investigating 'poetic space' in a truly inspiring and insightful manner, the book's 'space on the page' has sadly been given short shrift.

STEFAN SPERL

AKIKO MOTOYOSHI SUMI:

Description in Classical Arabic Poetry: Wasf, Ekphrasis, and Interarts Theory.

(Brill Studies in Middle Eastern Literatures, Supplements to the Journal of Arabic Literature, 25.) xvii, 251 pp. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2004. €75.

The book brings together revised versions of six articles published between 1999 and 2003, one (the introduction) originally in Japanese and another (chapter 1) in Arabic. The main part of the book presents studies of poems: the *Bā'iyyas* of the pre-Islamic Imru' al-Qays and 'Alqama al-Fahl with their horse descriptions (ch. 1), poems with descriptions of honey-gathering by the Hudhalī poets Sā'ida ibn Ju'ayya and Abū Dhu'ayb (ch. 2), poems describing pre-Islamic Persian scenes, by Abū Nuwās in a bacchic poem and al-Buḥturī in his famous poem on Īwān Kisrā (ch. 3), a poem on a singing-girl by Ibn al-Rūmī (ch. 4) and Ibn Zamrak's ode that contains a description of the Alhambra (ch. 5). Full translations are provided; the Arabic texts are given in an appendix. The translations are, on the whole, reliable and readable. Some more philological commentary would have been useful at times. Reading, for instance, that 'my upset heart was thought to be mocking [dying]' (Ibn Zamrak, vs. 4), we are left to choose, oddly, between mocking and dying, the latter apparently taken from Monroe, who, unaware that *hāziyā* stands for what in prose would be *hāzi'an*, and finding that *hazā* means 'to depart', concluded that 'dying' was meant. In the same ode (vs. 19) it could have been explained that 'the sweet [saliva]/and flashing [teeth]' are puns on place names, al-'Udhayb and Bāriq.

In the introduction the author explains her method, arguing that the descriptive sections of Arabic poems are not, as thought by earlier generations of Arabists, detached, objective, superficial, repetitive, and conventional. More recent and more rewarding scholarship on Arabic descriptive poetry is hardly discussed and some important contributions are not mentioned at all, including some works in German (Thomas Bauer on onager descriptions and on love poetry, or J. Christoph Bürgel on al-Ma'mūnī's ekphrastic epigrams). A lack of familiarity with European scholarship also makes her believe that the 'oral-formulaism' theory of Arabic verse is unrefuted (pp. 31 f.). Nor is the author interested in how the pre-modern Arabic critics and theorists thought

about *wasf* and how it fitted, or did not fit, into their generic categorizations. We are only given a brief quotation from Ibn Rashīq's *Umda* and an equally brief definition of *wasf* from Lane's dictionary, stating that it has two synonyms, *ṣinf* and *ḥāl* (pp. 5 f.), which is neither helpful nor true. The overriding influences on the author's approach are the works of Suzanne and Jaroslav Stetkevych, and recent work on 'interarts theory'. Some valuable insights are derived from these, although I would object to the thesis (p. 6) that ekphrasis, according to 'modern understanding' is 'the verbal representation of non-verbal texts'. In literary studies dealing with texts one should not inflate the meaning of the term by speaking of non-verbal texts. Worse, though, is the artificial distinction made by restricting these non-verbal texts to 'culturally produced semiotic systems', excluding nature. The horses and bees of the Arabian poets are not 'texts', we are told, but Abū Nuwās's cup and Kisrā's Hall are. This distinction, relevant in some contexts, is not essential in discussing descriptive passages. In the minds of the early poets such a dichotomy was surely not present; it is doubtful whether 'horse' or 'camel' should be classified as 'nature', since in the context of Bedouin life and poetry they belong to human culture rather than nature. If the concept of 'text' has to be widened, then the old metaphor of the 'Book of Nature' is more fruitful: Nature as Text. This metaphor is derived from the Latin Middle Ages, says E. R. Curtius in his famous book, but it is hinted at in the Quran (18: 109, 31: 27) and may be traced further back.

This said, the actual analysis of the poems is generally illuminating and readable, not marred by too much jargon or theory, and if the author's book is not as inventive, erudite and exciting as the best of the Stetkevyches' works, she at least steers clear of excess, implausibility and far-fetchedness. She is able to demonstrate that *wasf* is more than a merely pictorial description of objects and conveys 'some larger concepts in a metaphorical, emblematic, metonymical, psychological, spiritual, or symbolic manner'. The reader will not be surprised to learn that the horse, in the poems by Imru' al-Qays and 'Alqama (nicknamed the Stallion), has much to do with virility and sexual prowess, and that the bees and honey in the Hudhali poems are associated not only with purity and healing but also with eroticism, fertility and sex. The author's interpretations are valid, but tilted towards the metaphorical rather than the technical, non-metaphorical aspects of the descriptions. One could argue that this is justified because the technicalities of horse description have already received much scholarly attention, from the early Arab philologists and commentators to modern scholars. As for the Hudhalite honey-gathering, it should be mentioned that the technical aspects have been studied recently in an article by Giovanni Canova, "'Cacciatori di Miele": dalla poesia hudalita alle pratiche tradizionali nel Dhofar (Oman)', *Quaderni di Studi Arabi* 20–21 (2002–2003), 185–206.

In the 'Persian' poems of Abū Nuwās and al-Buḥturī the description serves as a kind of panegyric; the former's 'objective' description is contrasted with al-Buḥturī's 'subjective' description. Ibn al-Rūmī's poem is striking, with its 'synaesthetic fusion', primarily of the visual and the aural but with suggestions of the other senses. The Alhambra ode, finally, is interesting in that it is itself partly incorporated in the palace's decoration, thus becoming a self-descriptive artefact that is at the same time an emblematic portrait of its builder, the poet's patron.

Some minor matters: *baṭī' al-ifāqa* does not mean 'slow to get an erection' (p. 28) but 'slow to recover (i.e. to get it up again)'; *mā huwa bi-ash'ar minnī* does not mean 'What is more poetic than I in him?' (ibid.) but 'He is not a

better poet than I'; *Fāris* (Abū Nuwās, vs. 6) is not 'a Persian' but 'Persia'; a *qumriyya* is not a 'canary' (p. 128) but a kind of turtle-dove. To say that 'According to the *sharḥ* of Aslīm, Ma'bad and Ibn Surayj were renowned singers' (p. 129) is like saying 'According to So-and-so, Haydn and Mozart were famous composers'. To think that a long poem (58 lines) such as Ibn al-Rūmī's ode was ever sung in its entirety (pp. 135, 139) is to mistake the nature of Arabic song lyrics, which normally do not exceed a few lines. In this poem (vs. 31) the quasi-blasphemous *mahlan 'an Wahīdin fa-haqquhā l-tawhīd* is not 'you will not distract / me from Wahīd' but, approximately, 'Do not try to make me leave Wahīd, because she is the only One deserving of adoration' (the paronomasia is untranslatable).

GEERT JAN VAN GELDER

JEAN-CLAUDE GARCIN (ed.):

Lectures du Roman de Baybars.

(Parcours Méditerranéens.) 320 pp. Marseille: Editions Parenthèses, 2003. €24.

The *Sirat Baybars* is a difficult work to discuss, as it is very long, of unknown authorship and unknown date and it exists in several versions of which there is no properly edited text. Furthermore, its literary merit is doubtful. For these reasons and others it has hitherto received little attention from Western academics. This relative neglect has also applied to the *Sirat 'Antar* and, until the last two decades at least, *The Thousand and One Nights* as well. However, there is a growing scholarly consensus that this sort of popular literature can be used for evidence about popular culture, social attitudes and linguistic usages (even if, in the case of the *siyar*, one is immediately obliged to ask evidence with respect to which society and when).

In France a multi-volume translation of the *Roman de Baïbars* (10 volumes, 1986–1998) by Georges Bohas and Jean-Patrick Guillaume, based on a nineteenth-century Aleppan manuscript, appears to have been a modern publishing success. (Ten volumes have appeared so far.) It is appropriate then that the first volume of essays ever devoted to the *Sirat al-Zahir* should be published in France. Jean-Claude Garcin has assembled a scholarly team to tackle such topics as the Arabic of the *siyar* in general (contributions by Pierre Larcher and Jérôme Lentin), the manuscript history of the *Sirat Baybars* (Thomas Herzog), the relationship of this *Sirah* to other Arabic romances (Jean-Patrick Guillaume), the image of the ruler in the *Sirah* (Yannick Lerible), and saints in the *Sirah* (Denis Gril). The *Sirat 'Antar* also receives close attention in some articles.

In 1936 H. Wangelin published *Das arabische Volksbuch von König az-Zahir Baibars*, an extended summary of one of the duller Egyptian manuscripts of the cycle. Otherwise, there was little to read about this epic, apart from Malcolm Lyons's analysis of its narrative and folklore motifs in *The Arabian Epic* (three volumes, Cambridge, 1995) and a handful of articles by Wolfdietrich Fischer, Thomas Herzog and others. Therefore *Lectures du Roman de Baybars* is the most substantial account of the historical context of this epic to have appeared so far. At least there now seems to be a growing consensus on the dating. It seems likely that the straggling epic first began to be stitched together around the end of the fourteenth or the beginning of the

fifteenth century. Various incidents in the stories dimly echo what was actually happening at the time. The Genoese and Catalan role as villainous pirates suggests this period. The capture of Genoa in the *Sirah* perhaps echoes Barsbay's successful invasion of Cyprus in the 1420s. The hostility to Qalawun in the *Sirah* might dimly reflect at a popular level the attempts of Circassian Sultans to disparage their Qalawunid successors. (For example, Qalawun's *Maristan*, or Hospital, is presented as a factory for manufacturing poisons.) Barsbay's brother, Baraka, may have furnished the model for Baybars's fictional sidekick, 'Uthman. However, it is worth noting that Thomas Herzog has argued in 'The first layer of the *Sirat Baybars*: popular romance and political propaganda', published in *Mamluk Studies Review* 7 (2003), that the original core of the *Sirah* dates back to the late thirteenth century, actually being composed not long after the death of the historical Mamluk Sultan Baybars. Even so, the Vatican manuscript, which dates from the seventeenth century, is the oldest version of the *Sirah* to have survived. In *Lectures du Roman de Baybars*, Herzog argues that there was no single mother text and that therefore it is not possible to create a stemma. Instead of trying to conjure up a family tree of manuscripts, it may be more helpful to think of their relationship as resembling a rhizomatic tangle of roots.

This *Sirat Baybars*, though only very sporadically and loosely based on historical events, is still more historical than any of the other *siyar*, such as those of 'Antar and Dhat al-Himma. It is also more urban in its setting and concerns. It is possible to detect an *esprit de clocher* in some Syrian manuscripts, whose copyists or compilers gave either Damascus or Aleppo special importance in the formation of the hero, Baybars. The *Sirah* has a pronounced anti-authoritarian tenor and, Baybars apart, the other Mamluk emirs are routinely abused and their imperfect Arabic parodied. Lentin is particularly interesting on the language of the *Sirah* and he has cogent things to say about Middle Arabic and, in particular what Middle Arabic was not. It was not a deformation or inferior form of classical Arabic, nor was it used by people who were incapable of using the *fusha* forms.

The French have pioneered the study of *Paralittérature*. In 1975 Marc Angenot published *Le Roman Populaire: Recherches en Paralittérature* (Montreal: Les Presses de l'Université du Québec.), a study of such popular yet marginal works as *Les Mystères de Paris* and *Fantômas*. Subsequently Georges May, in *Les Mille et une nuits d'Antoine Galland ou le Chef-d'Oeuvre Invisible* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France 1986), reapplied Angenot's insights and sought to place the French version of *The Thousand and One Nights* within the context of a somewhat trashy *paralittérature*. Éric Vial, the author of the penultimate paper in Garcin's volume, has been researching in the same field and his wide-ranging contribution, 'Entre Roman de Baybars et sagas occidentales contemporaines, parallèles et convergences' makes many stimulating comparisons between the medieval Arab epic and the modern Western literature of escapist entertainment. One turns back to the *Sirat Baybars* with renewed enthusiasm, once its similarities to *The Count of Monte Cristo*, *Tin-Tin* and *The X Files* have been pointed out, and this despite the fact that Vial is the only contributor to suggest that, for all the interest it may have for academics, the *Sirah* is not much good as literature, as its narrative is both breathless and repetitive and its characterization perfunctory. In a final essay, Garcin notes that the *Sirah* is now better known in France than it is in the Arab world.

ROBERT IRWIN

STEFANO CARBONI (with a contribution by Julian Henderson):
Mamluk Enamelled and Gilded Glass in the Museum of Islamic Art, Qatar.

English text 71 pages, Arabic translation 39 pages. London: The Islamic Art Society, 2003.

The Museum of Islamic Art in Qatar has acquired the objects published in this catalogue within the last few years. In the foreword, Sheikh Saud al-Thani states his intention 'to develop Mamluk glass as a tour-de-force within the collection', and the illustrations demonstrate how well he has succeeded in this aim. As Stefano Carboni points out, few museums outside Cairo can rival the collection of ten mosque lamps ranging from the early 14th century to mid-15th century. It is a particular joy that a pair of lamps made for Sultan al-Nasir Muhammad have now been reunited. Secular vessels are less well represented in the collection but include two magnificent examples of blue glass. The museum's enthusiastic acquisitions policy is matched by an energetic programme of short exhibitions previewing the treasures which will be displayed when the new museum opens in 2006. This book is one of the lavishly illustrated catalogues published to accompany these exhibitions (alongside *Gilded and Glazed: Mamluk Glass and Iznik Pottery*, held at the Sheraton Doha Hotel 2–13 March 2003).

Mosque lamps comprise the major part of the collection, and Carboni prefaces the individual catalogue entries with an essay on their development and production under the Mamluks. He maintains (p. 24) that the distinctive vase-shaped vessels developed as purely functional lighting devices within a domestic setting in the early Islamic period. Although the mosque lamp has become one of the best known visual symbols of Islam, there is material and visual evidence that hanging vase-lamps of this type had already acquired a symbolic holiness during the Byzantine period. Often produced in silver (and so obviously not intended as functional lighting devices) they are depicted hanging in significant positions such as above the dying virgin or Christ at the Last Supper.

Carboni rightly emphasizes that mosque lamps, which often bear the name of their patron, provide essential evidence for the development of enamelled glass under the Mamluks (although care should be taken to distinguish between lamps in the name of living individuals and those with the name of an emir described as deceased, which might have been commissioned some years later). Dating of secular vessels, which rarely bear the name of their patron, is much harder. While disagreement over the date of a major object such as the Cavour Vase (catalogue no 2) varies by more than 100 years, it is impossible even to attempt a discussion of these objects within their cultural context: was the Cavour vase made in the 13th century for Ayyubid or early Mamluk sultans or in the mid- to late-14th century for a European market? Carboni continues to support a 13th-century date. I would argue for the other end of the chronological spectrum, also on the basis of comparisons with inlaid brass vessels (amongst many other possible comparisons, the distinctive phoenix birds with splayed wings and long tails are regular features of metalwork from the mid to late 14th century, notably a series of trays with European shields).

The chronology of enamelled glass vessels is most likely to be resolved by further study of technical developments. Analyses of enamelled glass over the last ten years, by Julian Henderson, Ian Freestone, Mavis Bimson and Marco

Verità, have produced several important indicators for the development of this material. For example Bimson has established an increase in the percentage of silica in the body glass in later Venetian glass, and published analyses suggest that the silica levels of contemporary Islamic glasses follow a similar trajectory (the Cavour Vase being at the higher end of the range at 70.6 per cent further supports a later 14th-century date for this vessel). The problem is that institutions and collectors are understandably reluctant to risk damage to complete vessels by allowing samples to be taken from them, and so most of the samples have come from undated fragments. The analysis of the Qatar mosque lamps was a rare opportunity to put those scattered results into a chronological framework. This opportunity was recognized by Julian Henderson who states (p. 29) 'for the first time this has made it possible to compare the chemical compositions of both enamels and translucent body glasses for mosque lamps of specifically different dates'. Why then has he not shared the results with the rest of the scholarly community? Only the major constituents of the body glass are given and these are placed within each catalogue entry although their main interest is comparative and so they would have been easier to use within a table. The trace elements are not provided even though it is similar levels of two of these (manganese and iron oxides) which enable him to place the two Barquq lamps within the same technological tradition. The analytical results for the coloured enamels, usually the most interesting, are not published at all. The lack of published data undermines his discussion of the results in a chapter that is curiously situated between Carboni's discussion of mosque lamp production and the catalogue entries for them.

The design of the book is eccentric: printed sideways with a transparent cover in imitation of glass (presumably). The quality of the photographs is excellent and the number of views and details that accompany each object make this catalogue a wonderful record of a small but first-class collection. The Museum of Islamic Art in Qatar should be proud of its publication record, at this rate a large percentage of the collection will be published before the museum even opens. These beautiful and scholarly catalogues deserve much wider distribution.

RACHEL WARD

BARBARA BREND:

Perspectives on Persian Painting: Illustration to Amīr Khusrau's Khamsah.

xxvii, 324 pp. London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003. £60.

An independent scholar, Barbara Brend's main research has always been into Persian painting. She has published what has been described as 'the best introduction to Islamic art' (*Islamic Art*) and *The Emperor Akbar's Khamsa of Niẓāmī*, as well as many articles which have sought to illuminate the reader as to what lies behind the painted image. She has sought to show what can be gleaned from the form and the choice of subject, doing so by setting a book into its historical context. The current book is based on her doctoral thesis on which she has continued to work over the last quarter of a century. The result is a deeply informed study of the copies produced of one work of a man renowned as 'the greatest poet of the Persian language of the Indian

subcontinent', who lived from 651/1253 to 725/1325. His *Khamsah* ('Quintet') is a small part of the almost half a million couplets he claimed to have written; he also wrote prose, and verses in Hindi—he is even credited with innovations in Indian music. His *Khamsah* consists of a didactic work including a number of stories (*Maṭla' al-Anvār*) followed by four romances (*Shīrīn va Khusrau*, *Majnūn va Laylā*, *A'īnah-i Iskandarī*, and *Hasht Bihisht*) and was loosely based on the work of the same name by the famous Persian poet Nizāmī.

Barbara Brend has tackled the somewhat unusual task of following Amīr Khusrau's work through its various developments from the first surviving copy of the late 14th century to the 17th century, setting it into the context of other contemporary manuscripts. An extended summary of the narratives identifies some thirty-three subjects of the pictures, which were produced in Iran, Ottoman Turkey, the Sultanate and Mughal India. This is a worthy task in itself, because it allows the Western reader into the sometimes obscure images. The original owners would, of course, have known the stories from childhood, and would have had no such problem of identification of the subject matter. In addition, text and image would (presumably) have been physically close to each other in the manuscript. Brend looks at the dates of the various versions, their origin, the painters and their oeuvre and the question of patronage as well as speculating on the intended purpose of the books. There are two useful appendices: 'A' covers the subjects which have been illustrated, listing the manuscripts in which they appear; 'B' lists the manuscript cycles according to each chapter—in other words, the book is comprehensive in intent and in execution.

An illustrated manuscript is a frail object, shut away from general view, highly susceptible to damage, and to dispersal. Barbara Brend outlines the process of production from the initial selection of images to the final construction and decoration of the binding. Her book does not cover all of these processes, but is confined to the primary work of the author and illustrator. In some ways this is a pity; although there are occasional glimpses of the script at the edge of a painting, there is no illustration of a complete page. This means that the reader does not get an impression of how an illustration fitted into the written page—for example, how closely connected the relevant text was to the image illustrating it; lack of even a single full page of text and image also takes away any sense of scale. The effect is to treat a miniature almost as if it were a panel painting. But this is a quibble. So much information is packed between the hard covers of this book that any more would be indigestible. There is some sense in the way she has chosen to display the pictures in any case. As she points out, the original images would have been visited frequently, almost as if they were in a gallery.

Individual chapters deal with the different periods of the *Khamsah's* production. Each starts with a short outline of the historical events, and proceeds to describe in detail the various manuscripts produced at the time. The style of the individuals involved in illustrating the books is analysed, and this is where Barbara Brend's own style comes alive. She lectures in her own idiosyncratic way, and this charming, personal view sometimes illuminates her prose when she is describing what she sees. Expressions like 'swelling of the lower cheek suggestive of toothache' (p. 75), for example, or 'the script is rapid with a bounding rhythm which suggests impatience of niceties', 'leopard-like marking of rocks ... with gangling figures' (p. 76), 'a white veil hangs from the back of the head, and this is the only clothing of the lithe lady who has abandoned her clothing to cross the water to the Hindu' (p. 81), or 'two rather ratty felines'

(p. 81) immediately concentrate the reader's eye on the point she is making, and remain in the mind. It is where Brend's own eye and her deep knowledge come together that she is most illuminating. For example, she points out that the use of a particular blue pigment makes it likely that a particular manuscript is Indian rather than Persian (p. 80).

The 'Afterword' draws together her findings with subtitles such as 'the cycles', 'the web of traditions', 'patrons and purposes', 'artists and methods'. Under 'artists and methods', the author comes to the conclusion that 'the greatest unity of style is shown by nameless painters working in a period of tolerable stability on the Commercial Turkmān manuscripts' (p. 262), suggesting that the evidence points to a close relationship between pupil and master. This meshes well with contemporary metalwork, where a relationship seems to have been not only stylistic but also familial. It seems likely that the craft continued from father to son (Simone Sigoli, *Viaggio al Monte Sinai*, Parma, 1843). Brend believes that the painters were probably men rather than women although she concedes that the 'stability and independence of these workshops would have made it relatively easy for daughters to illustrate manuscripts at home'. This question lies at the heart of the book—so little is known about the painters apart from their names that their work must speak for them. To have as knowledgeable an interpreter as Barbara Brend to follow a specific work by analysing content and context is both a rare pleasure and a worthy compliment to the artists themselves.

SYLVIA AULD

NICOLAS VATIN and GILLES VEINSTEIN:

Le Sérail Ébranlé: Essais sur les Morts, Dépositions et Avènements des Sultans Ottomans XIV^e–XIX^e Siècle.

523 pp. Paris: Fayard, 2003. €26.

Le Sérail Ébranlé is something of a tour de force, indicated also by the length of the book. Basing themselves predominantly on Ottoman chronicles, the authors set out to trace and analyse the 'modalités de succession' (p. 454) of the Ottoman sultans over six centuries. They examine the evolution of the empire from semi-nomadic chiefdom, to a sedentary empire and to the 'désacralisation' of the sultan who, at the heart of a dynasty which had never been challenged because it was the 'unique ciment' of the empire, ends up a mere plaything in the hands of the true holders of power (p. 451). This investigation takes them through a detailed examination of the end of the reign, political crises, either God- or man-induced, the beginning of the reign and imperial funerals.

Noting the need to refute the image of the Ottoman empire as one of arbitrary violence and confusion, Vatin and Veinstein point out that 20 of the 32 sultans who reigned from the 14th to the 19th century, died while on the throne (p. 15). Succession, 'le talon d'Achille' of the Ottoman political system (p. 444), is discussed in considerable detail and the changes and vicissitudes in reaching power traced through the race for the throne, the result of the lack of an established law of succession, to the system of seniority and the *kafes* (the result of 'l'esprit désabusé, pragmatique et cynique' (p. 248)), a system which the authors argue weakened the sultanate as it could give rise to feebler sultans and shorter reigns (p. 207).

The changes in the position of the sultan are clearly shown in this study. From being a supreme ruler, 'un être hors normes' (p. 451), the 'altière figure sultanienne', in the first decades of the 17th century, 'retombe sur terre et descend même parfois au plus bas degré de l'humanité' (p. 218). The fact that succession crises were now provoked by elements external to the dynasty made possible, according to Veinstein and Vatin, the changes in the function of the monarchy and the perception of the monarch (p. 257). The murder of İbrahim in 1648 led 'à son paroxysme le processus de disqualification des princes et de mainmise des hauts responsables sur le fonctionnement de la monarchie. En même temps, ils [those who had had İbrahim murdered] rejettent avec brutalité ... toute notion d'une essence transcendante des princes' (pp. 246–7). While the sultan was indeed 'bien plus qu'un être humain interchangeable, bien plus qu'une simple pièce du système institutionnel' (p. 15), his importance as an individual changed over time. Even his death transmogrified from the glorious to the prosaic: 'd'Osman I^{er} au début du XIV^e siècle al Abü-l-Hamid I^{er} à la fin du XVIII^e, on est passé de la mort héroïque du *gâzî* à la mort bourgeoise' (p. 51).

The death of the sultan, who was not merely the shadow of God on earth but also the 'clef de voût' of the dynasty (p. 444), created a critical moment for the state. One response was concealment, but while it was possible to pretend that the sultan was still alive for a short time, particularly in view of the developing image of inaccessibility of the person of the sultan in Ottoman imperial ideology, a prolonged invisibility remained an abnormality (p. 136). One further factor in concealment was, Vatin and Veinstein suggest, fear of the enemy, who could seek to benefit from the weakness of the state brought on by the death of the sultan and the ensuing period of interregnum. This, not merely the desire to eliminate Yakub, lies behind the concealment of the death of Murad I at the battle of Kosovo (p. 145). Further, the authors argue that in fact this element of secrecy was in some ways more theoretical than practical. Even though the practice of secrecy appears to be based on 'nécessités concrètes', and the Ottoman chroniclers themselves explain it in terms of practical need, Veinstein and Vatin are struck by how long this practice continues to be used, even past the point at which the many depositions, the keeping of the princes in the *kafes* and the practice of seniority have rendered it obsolete (pp. 449–50). From an analysis of the events following the death of Süleyman in 1566, they conclude that, while the element of practical need was present and that the concealment was thus in part pragmatic, 'il n'en était pas moins largement théorique, bientôt percé à jour par la troupe qui mimait l'ignorance et feignait de se laisser prendre à des jeux de marionnettes: tout se passe comme si les *kapî koulou* avaient eux-mêmes intégré la crainte de leur propre mutinerie et se trouvaient pris de vertige devant l'absence d'un maître. Autrement dit, ils participaient à un rite politique qui permettait de nier l'inadmissible vacance du pouvoir' (p. 450).

Rites are indeed central to this book, as the authors note (p. 446), and much space is given to investigating the evolution and use of ceremonial surrounding the Ottoman sultan's accession. For the Ottomans 'ancient custom' was the touchstone of legitimacy, even if it was often only appealed to in order to conceal an innovation (p. 447).

For Vatin and Veinstein, the 'volonté d'islamisation' (p. 452) is evident in the political sphere. Fratricide, 'inséparable de cette réalité fondamentale de la dynastie ottomane', that is the lack of a law of succession, as well as the indivisibility of the state (p. 150), was only justifiable by arguing that it was the

way of preserving 'order in the world'. In place of the executioner of the innocent, the image of the sultan had to be that of a saviour 'tranchant les têtes de l'hydre hideuse de la division' (p. 170). What is important here for Veinstein and Vatin is that the 'law of fratricide' took the form of a *fetva*: 'cette règle abominable, dont le but est de préserver une conception proprement turque du pouvoir royal, se doit pour ses auteurs de s'inscrire dans la *cheri'at*, et non dans le simple *kânoun*' (p. 452).

This highly detailed study, centred round coming to and departing from power, represents a considerable contribution to the understanding of the position of the Ottoman sultan and of power in the Ottoman empire, and of the shifts in the balance of power and of perception which occurred through the six centuries of its existence.

KATE FLEET

SOUTH ASIA

HARALD FISCHER-TINÉ and MICHAEL MANN (eds):

Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India. vi, 360 pp. London: Anthem Press, 2004.

Thirty years ago a book with 'civilizing mission' in its title, unqualified by inverted commas, might well have been taken to endorse the idea that the British had a *mission civilisatrice* in India, and deservedly so. But not any more. It is clear from the outset that this book, far from being an endorsement of colonial ideology and self-legitimation, is concerned with problematizing the idea of a 'civilizing mission' and of exploring the meaning and assessing the impact of such a concept on both the British and their colonial subjects. Indeed, if one of the intellectual points of departure for this set of essays is T. B. Macaulay's now infamous claim in 1835 that the object of British rule and the promotion of Western education was to create a class of 'brown Englishmen', Indians who would be 'English in taste, in opinion, in morals and in intellect', the other is Thomas Metcalf's recent observation in a book dedicated to examining the ideologies of the Raj that 'the ideals sustaining the imperial enterprise in India were always shot through with contradiction and inconsistency'. But, as Michael Mann points out in his helpful introduction to this diverse collection of essays, the term 'civilizing mission' was not so often used by the British as an array of other expressions ranging from 'improvement' (itself the bearer of many meanings) in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries through 'moral and material progress' in the heyday of empire to 'development' in its lattermost phases. Not only did each of these terms possess a somewhat different connotation, but also, as the contributors effectively demonstrate, such ideas were often impracticable as imperial policy, unwise or unenforceable in the face of Indian dissent, or as striking in their internalization by Indians as in their formal enunciation by the British themselves.

The thirteen essays in the volume, grouped into four sections, appear in broadly chronological sequence. Michael Mann reviews British approaches (and frustrations) in relation to 'Oriental Despotism' as represented by jurisdiction and 'improvement' in late eighteenth-century Bengal, while

Margret Frenz considers the difficulties faced by the British at the same period in trying to impose their concepts of law and sovereignty on Malabar district in south India, and Jana Tschurenév revisits debates over sati, prior to its official abolition in 1829, to assess what these tell us about the nature and limitations of British interventionism in relation to what was seen as one of the most 'horrific' and intolerable of all Hindu practices. A second set of essays moves us forward into the high colonial period: with Kipling's 'Bridge-Builders' as a guide, Ravi Ahuja writes about railway construction and pilgrimage traffic as aspects of how one of the key 'civilizing' technologies of the Raj was made subject to Indian agency, Malavika Kasturi (in one of the most thorough discussions in the volume) examines the contradictions in British policy towards female infanticide among the Rajputs, and Melita Waligora (rather less impressively) considers ideas of caste and social classification as unfolding expressions of the British 'civilizing mission' across the nineteenth century. A third section takes us into the realms of 'body and mind', beginning with an essay by Paul Dimeo on the unusual but edifying subject of football and the racial typecasting and tensions it gave rise to in colonial Calcutta. Jim Mills writes about 'lunatic asylums' and psychiatric practice in late nineteenth-century India, Neils Brimnes examines the early British campaign against smallpox and the ways in which vaccination articulated ideas of colonial 'medical benevolence', and Mridula Ramanna similarly considers the nature and impact of British sanitary and medical policies in early twentieth-century Bombay. In the final section, aptly entitled 'The civilizing mission internalized' and containing some of the most interesting and original essays in the volume, Harald Fischer-Tiné examines the Arya Samaj's Gurukul at Kangri and assesses the ways in which an educational institution initially seen as hostile by the British in fact embodied many colonial ideas and presumptions, Benjamin Zachariah considers the Gandhian economist J. C. Kumarappa and his 'indigenous' approach to the issue of 'development', and Marcus Daeschel concludes with a discussion of the ideas of twentieth-century educationalist and publicist Ghulam Jilani Barq, whose often scathing critique of contemporary Islam and its followers echoed many Western ideas, including those relating to modernity, evolution, hygiene and dress.

As with any collection of essays around a broad theme of this kind, it would be easy enough to point to topics that might, with equal merit, have been included. Missionary ideas and their reception are one obvious example and their consideration might have helped establish the extent to which the colonial 'civilizing mission' was, as most of these essays imply, essentially a state-driven one or (as one might surmise) had far wider parameters. Equally, some of the essays revisit topics that are already familiar from recent scholarship and do not add much that is new by way of material or interpretation. Nevertheless, most of the contributors are commendably loyal to the volume's thematic and there are several striking case studies and some original topics and approaches that command attention. Although the nature and purpose of the British 'civilizing mission' in India clearly varied considerably over time and in line with its various manifestations, what emerges most strongly here are the limitations India imposed upon imperial grand designs, as well as the complexity of the responses the 'mission' evoked among Indians of various regions, faiths and classes. Taken overall, this collection of essays is a significant contribution to rethinking and refining the historical understanding of the intentions and effects of colonial rule in India.

DAVID ARNOLD

G. JAN MEULENBELD:

A History of Indian Medical Literature.

(Groningen Oriental Studies Volume XV/I–III.) Groningen: Egbert Forsten (Ia and Ib) 1999; (IIa and IIb) 2000; (III) 2002. Ia: 1 frontispiece, xvii, 699 pp.; Ib: 1 frontispiece, vi, 774 pp.; IIa: 1 frontispiece, viii, 839 pp. (in addition: reprint of 19 pages defective in Ia); IIb: 1 frontispiece, viii, 1018 pp.; III (Indexes): 1 frontispiece, ii, 549 pp. €600.

‘I never read a book before reviewing it; it prejudices a man so.’ This remark by the critic Sidney Smith is a great comfort when approaching the task of writing a review of G. Jan Meulenbeld’s gargantuan *A History of Indian Medical Literature*, published in five bound volumes totalling 4,020 pages, and including over 36,600 footnotes. This work is a unique survey of traditional Indian medical literature, born of a scholarly lifetime of reading the texts in the original languages, and noting the important features of their contents, their intellectual and medical innovations, the biographical details of their authors, and very much besides. Few other branches of Indian literature are served by a reference work of this completeness, substance and scope. Pingree’s labours on *vyatīhśāstra* and Kane’s on *dharma* are perhaps of the same order. And as with those works, one may turn to *HIML* for a wealth of literary and historical information ranging far beyond the medical. Meulenbeld’s *HIML* is truly a landmark work, not only for medical history, but also for Indology as a whole.

Volumes Ia (text) and Ib (footnotes) are dedicated to the foundation works of ayurveda, the *Carakasamhitā*, the *Suśrutasamhitā*, the *Aṣṭāṅgahṛdayasamhitā* and the *Aṣṭāṅgasamgraha*. The content of each of these major works is summarized in detail, with frequent notes giving points of interest and further reading. Full details are given of all the past discussions about the relationship of these works to each other, and of the dates of their layered parts and the identities of their authors. The identities and roles of the key contributors to the text of the *Carakasamhitā*, Ātreya, Agniveśa, Caraka and Dṛḍhabala, are discussed at length. The persons called Suśruta and their identities are examined, as well Dhanvantari, Divodāsa, and the problem of the later revision and expansion of the *Suśrutasamhitā*, including the role, if any, of a Nāgārjuna in this process, are all detailed. The relative chronology of these two works is discussed. As in many other topics, Meulenbeld presents the evidence and past argumentation comprehensively and fairly, and in doing so shows us that the evidence presently available does not warrant a firm conclusion on the matter. The over-confident pronouncements of past scholars, even great ones, are not conclusive. A full survey of the *Aṣṭāṅgasamgraha* is given in a manner which makes it simultaneously a verse-by-verse comparison with the *Hṛdaya*. Following this, Meulenbeld discusses the dates of these two works, the theories concerning their authorship, and the identity of Vāgbhaṭa. This discussion is extremely detailed, covering a mass of data from external sources such as the Chinese Buddhist monk I-ching, and internal ones such as the large number of common verses or ideas in the two works. Meulenbeld is certain that these works are not by the same author. He examines and rejects the opinion of Hilgenberg and Kirfel that the *Samgraha* is an enlarged version of the *Hṛdaya*, in which verse passages have been changed into prose. Meulenbeld carries the discussion of this problem forward decisively, showing that citations from

Niścala's *Ratnaprabhā* and Śivadāśasena's commentary on the *Hṛdaya* prove the existence of a *Madhyavāgbhāṭa*, a treatise intermediate between the *Samgraha* and the *Hṛdaya*. Meulenbeld notes that the surviving textual evidence makes it 'legitimate to have doubts about the authenticity of the text of the *Samgraha* as it has been transmitted'. (Ia, 655). To his cogent textual arguments about these works may be added the observation that few manuscripts of the *Samgraha* survive, and most of those are fragmentary. This fact inevitably raises questions about the history and textual security of the printed editions of the *Samgraha* on which today's scholars rely. The *Hṛdaya*, by contrast, is represented by hundreds if not thousands of manuscripts from all over South Asia: for centuries it has been the principal school text in Kerala, and in traditional centres it still is. On this complex topic, Meulenbeld concludes that the many problems about the texts and their authors are 'far from even approaching a solution' (Ia, 656).

The early compendia called 'the great triad (*bṛhatrayī*)'—those ascribed to Caraka, Suśruta and Vāgbhāṭa—are works that at least most Indologists have heard of, if not studied. But volumes IIa and IIb of *HIML* will reveal to many for the first time the staggering volume and diversity of scientific literary production in the post-classical period. They survey the thousands of Indian medical works written from about AD 600 up to the present. As far as is possible, each work is described under the following headings: contents, authors and works quoted in the work, its special features, the author and his date, and later authors and works that quote the work. The 'special features' sections deserve particular mention, since they give invaluable information about plants, diseases, or concepts that are mentioned uniquely in a work, or indeed that one would expect to find but are missing. It is especially this detailed analysis of positive and negative evidence, combined with the citations and testimonia, that enables Meulenbeld to place works in a chronological relationship to each other, and to solve innumerable arguments about priority and dating.

Volume II opens up a vast new arena for research. And while all periods produced unique and important works, it is particularly fascinating to see that the rate of literary production in no way diminished in the later periods. Authors in the sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries produced a rich and important crop of diverse medical treatises, often describing new diseases, new theories, new treatments, and new medicines. These facts decisively contradict the two common opinions that post-classical Indian medicine was static and unchanging, and that medical creativity entered a dark age after Vāgbhāṭa.

This volume also includes several chapters that will be of interest to a wide range of scholars beyond medical historians. These include the chapters about the pre-modern literature on cookery, on the specialist treatises about pulse diagnosis, on veterinary medicine, on several alchemical treatises, and on the study of gems. Amongst the appendices is a valuable collection of references to medicine found in non-medical literature. This is effectively a research bibliography arranged by title, covering 132 works and genres. Thus, headings such as 'Inscriptions', 'Jain literature', or 'Mahābhārata' give the researcher an immediate head start in studying the medical materials of these fields, and will be especially useful for teachers thinking of pointing their postgraduate students towards projects in medical history.

Volume IIa is completed by a bibliography, the most substantial ever published for ayurveda. This bibliography has also now appeared as a database available for consultation on the Internet. *An Annotated Bibliography of the*

History of Indian Medicine is (in 2003–04) at the address <http://www.ub.rug.nl/indianmedicine/>. It contains some 10,000 entries, and is due to be updated as new publications appear: submissions are invited. The online bibliography is searchable in various ways, including keyword, adding greatly to its value as a research tool.

The fifth and last part of *HIML*, vol. III, provides a comprehensive set of indexes, entirely necessary to provide access to the materials of the first four volumes, where information on related topics can sometimes be widely separated. It is important to read the ‘Directions for Use’ at the beginning of this volume, which explain some special features of the indexes.

HIML focuses primarily on Sanskrit literature, which is justifiable in view of the fact that the vast bulk of surviving literary material on Indian medicine is in that language. But medical literature in Tibetan, Arabic, Prakrit, Pali, Hindi and many of the other Indian vernaculars are also considered, though normally in the context of their relationship to the Sanskrit materials.

Meulenbeld’s rich appendices to his 1974 *Mādhavanidāna* had already to a large extent replaced Kashikar’s 1956 update and translation of Jolly’s 1901 *Medicin* as the basic survey and bibliography on medical literature. Other important surveys included P. V. Sharma’s *Āyurved kā Vaijñānik Itihās*, and Atrideva Vidyālaṅkāra’s *Āyurved kā Brhat Itihās*. *HIML* has now unquestionably become the foundational work on the subject. But its scope is so much greater than earlier works that it cannot sensibly be compared with them. The publication of *HIML* is a quantum leap in the study of Indian medical literature, and provides so much collateral information on other fields that it is already becoming a necessary reference for general work on Indian culture. A colleague working on tantric sources recently sent me an email that is typical of responses to *HIML*: ‘To say that it’s a goldmine, awesome, etc. is an understatement. I can hardly conceive of one person doing all that work in one lifetime’.

In his introduction (Ia, 4), Meulenbeld makes the point that *HIML* is not and does not seek to be a ‘continuous history of Indian medical literature’ in the sense of providing what one might call a ‘story’, having progressive and regressive lines of development, and offering the reader a global sense of the meaning and shape of Indian medical history and its literature. There is a great deal of information on these topics to be found scattered in *HIML*, and it provides the comprehensive and necessary foundation for such a narrative history. But Meulenbeld notes that with the publication of *HIML*, it is now possible for someone else to ‘take upon himself the duty of composing a readable, yet accurate and detached, history of Indian medicine and its literature’.

One area in which discoveries based on the leads given in *HIML* are especially likely to be fruitful are manuscript studies. *HIML* is primarily based on the evidence in published editions of texts, but it also takes careful account of a large amount of manuscript evidence. Inevitably there is much more to be done in this field, especially as new Indian manuscript collections are being catalogued all the time. Thus, a copy of Śaṅkarasena’s *Nāḍiprakāśa* was recently found in Wellcome MS Indic δ 80, a Kashmiri Śāradā manuscript datable to c. 1750–1850. This pushes the probable date of Śaṅkarasena’s activity back almost a century earlier than *HIML*’s tentative dating. Such additions to the evidence provided by *HIML* will doubtless gradually accumulate over the decades ahead, during which *HIML* will continue to provide the fundamental reference point for research.

Reciprocally, *HIML* will be a critically important aid to future cataloguers of Indian medical manuscripts.

Almost every page of *HIML* contains nuggets of cultural and historical gold. For example, when Meulenbeld is discussing the *Kalyānakāraka* by the Deccani Jaina author Ugrāditya he notes that ‘The developed state of alchemy in a [South Indian] treatise from the ninth century can only be explained by assuming that this science originated in Southern India and spread from here to the northern parts of the country much later’ (IIa, 155). Such incidental remarks, arising out of the close scrutiny of particular texts, can be expected gradually but profoundly to affect the alignment of many other aspects of Indian literary and cultural history.

The printing of the work is exemplary, and misprints are astonishingly few, which is just as well, given the many thousands of cross-references and citations throughout the text. The volumes are expensive, and this precludes their distribution in India beyond a very few well-funded libraries. This is regrettable, since the scholarship in these volumes will be slow to reach those whose medical tradition is so superbly explored.

DOMINIK WUJASTYK

RACHEL FELL MCDERMOTT and JEFFREY J. KRIPAL (eds):
Encountering Kālī—in the Margins, at the Center, in the West.
 xviii, 321 pp. Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: University of
 California Press, 2003. £15.95.

Could the hold that the Hindu goddess Kālī has taken over the Western imagination in recent times owe something to a false etymology? Any student of Hinduisim learns early on that we are currently living in the *Kaliyuga*, the last and the worst of the four Yugas or ages of the world—an age of vice and degeneracy. ‘Kali’ was primarily the name of the die or the side of the die marked with one dot—the losing die. We are in a losing age: hence the adoption of the term, which is probably Dravidian in origin. Durgā, wife of Śiva, in her manifestation as the terrifying goddess Kālī, takes her name from Sanskrit *kāla*, meaning ‘black’. It is terribly tempting to make a connection between Kālī and the Kaliyuga, especially if one dispenses with the diacritics that are such a bore to get right even with the best word-processing programs. Thus Keith E. McNeal, in his fascinating contribution to this excellent collection of essays on Kālī in the East and West, says of her devotees in Trinidad: ‘They are aware of the cruel hardships their ancestors endured in coming to the New World, and of the courage that survival through those times necessitated. And their own experiences vividly suggest that the worldly degeneration of the Kaliyug is here to stay. Thus it is clear to them that they should seek the protection and blessings of Mother Kali, for it is her mysterious *shakti*, or power, that liberates us from suffering in this turbulent age.’ The implied connection here is not explicit enough to secure a conviction in a court of law, but it does arouse suspicion... .

Yet the drift of the book as a whole, which has essays ranging from Patricia Dodd’s close study of ‘Kālī the terrific and her tests: Śākta devotionism in the *Mahābhāgavata Purāna*’ to Rachel Fell McDermott’s ‘Kālī’s new frontiers: a Hindu goddess on the Internet’, and from Hugh B. Urban’s ‘“India’s darkest heart”: Kālī in the colonial imagination’ to Patricia Lawrence’s harrowing piece on ‘Kālī in a context of terror: the tasks of a goddess in Sri Lanka’s civil war’, is that such a connection, whether

linguistically false or not, is a valid step in the ongoing, worldwide evolution of the goddess. Most of the book's contributors are careful with their diacritics, but why should such niceties bother her New Age, Internet-surfing devotees? And why should serious scholars of *Kālī-pūjā*, in its various forms, take it any less seriously when performed in California than in Benaras, Kerala, or in Calcutta, now officially spelt Kolkata (which may or may not underline to outsiders the probable connection between the name of that city and the awesome goddess of Kālighāt)?

One very good reason for this seriousness is that Western scholarly exploration of the tantric, sexual and violent aspects of the goddess has created a popular—sometimes salacious—interest that has clashed with the sanitized form that Kālī worship now takes in the Hindu heartlands. In their introduction, the editors of the volume write of how, 'when Westerners appropriate Kālī, they tend to turn to the very graphic and excessive features that indigenous cultures have rejected or tried to mollify: sexuality, social rage, and associations with battle'. Kālī as a feminist icon, Kālī as 'a symbol of the liberating powers of female sexuality', is in part a Western construct, and can outrage her homegrown devotees, to the extent of placing some of her Western interpreters at physical risk. The irony of this is that such perceptions were spawned by studies of Tantra by Sir John Woodroffe, Philip Rawson and Ajit Mookerjee that attempted to rescue Kālī not only from the moral condemnation of Christian missionaries but from the taint of her links with the Thuggees and with revolutionary terrorism.

Readers willing not to be offended by Western appropriations will be enriched by an essay such as Jeffrey Kripal's 'Why the Tāntrika is a hero: Kālī in the psychoanalytic tradition', and their impression of Kālī as 'powerful, dangerous, fascinating, and paradoxical' will be amply confirmed. But more unexpected will be the essays on Kālī as she is actually worshipped today. In Sanjukta Gupta's down-to-earth account of 'The domestication of a goddess' at the place—Kālighāt—where one might expect to be led to her murky heart, we are told of 'a conscious effort to incorporate local deities like Ṣaṣṭī, Śītalā, and Manasā, as well as Kṛṣṇa and Rādhā from Bengali Vaiṣṇavism, and to downplay Kālī's connection with blood sacrifice'. A different, though perhaps equal sentimentalization can be found in the annual Easter pilgrimage to the shrine of Siparee Mai in southern Trinidad, where, according to McNeal, the same statue represents the Virgin Mary on Holy Thursday, but on Good Friday—for thousands of Hindu pilgrims—is Durga, Lakshmi, Sita and above all 'Mother Kali' herself.

It is a tribute to the sensitivity of the book's editors that such a wide span of approaches to the goddess is accommodated. Is the overall effect unified or fragmented? Is there one Kālī, perceived in different ways, or a multiplicity of Kālīs? The techniques of religious studies that the book exemplifies may seem threatening to sectarians, but in its openness and receptivity it nails its colours firmly to the mast of intercultural tolerance. The emblems by Venantius J. Pinto that open each chapter, were—according to the artist's own note—inspired not by 'the Lolitaesque renditions of Kali as seen in Indian calendar art and popular posters', but by the eroticism of Martha Graham. As (appropriately black) silhouettes, they avoid any imagery that could cause offence to anyone, and give Kālī a unity for our age. The book invites us look at those silhouettes, and to 'see and understand' new things. 'Kālī studies' will be taken forward by it, but also perhaps her worship.

WILLIAM RADICE

PATRICK COLM HOGAN and LALITA PANDIT (eds):

Rabindranath Tagore: Universality and Tradition.

297 pp. Madison and Teaneck: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press; Cranbury (NJ), Mississauga (Ontario) and London: Associated University Presses, 2003. £42.

At last, a mature, sympathetic yet rigorous collection of essays on Rabindranath Tagore. Most collections hitherto have emanated from symposia on Tagore and have taken the form of a 'celebration'. This can be exhilarating for those who were present at the symposium, but to readers in the cold light of day such ventures can seem like an effort to boost the pride of Tagore's compatriots or to persuade sceptical outsiders that Tagore really was as great as Bengalis say he was. Well, Tagore was great, but it is never enough merely to keep shouting this out. A much more effective method is to show, as in this volume, that he is worthy of serious intellectual discussion. That means taking on board aspects of his writing, activity and thought that can arouse scepticism or derision, and patiently trying to understand them better so that they can command new respect. In his introduction to the volume, Patrick Colm Hogan boldly admits that 'at a first glance, Tagore's commitments appear rather a mess—beautifully expressed, perhaps, but still a mess. He seems to shift continually between opposites, especially between opposites that are linked (not always accurately) with the great colonial dichotomy between East and West...'. He then proceeds brilliantly to explain and justify these apparent contradictions by defining Tagore as a *sahṛdaya*—someone whom Sanskrit aesthetic theory would have recognized as able to listen 'with heart', have empathy, 'share a great breadth of feeling with a great diversity of persons'. He was thus a universalist who accepted and welcomed diversity, which is why he could appreciate so many different points of view—including those of the colonizers whom at the same time he passionately criticized.

A major obstacle to world-wide understanding of Tagore has always been ignorance among non-Bengalis of the Bengali language. At the height of his Nobel Prize-induced, globe-trotting fame, this was not felt as such an obstacle, which meant that a lot of nonsense was written about him, especially by his admirers. It appears that neither of the editors of the present volume knows Bengali. Even the Indian co-editor, Lalita Pandit, in her essay on 'The psychology and aesthetics of love' in *Gora*, says in a note that she used the '1910 translation ... by the author himself' (in fact it was translated by W. W. Pearson, assisted by Surendranath Tagore), the 1997 translation by Sujit Mukerjee, and the 1961 Hindi translation by Ajneya. But this does not necessarily matter if all such writers recognize the limitations of working on Tagore from the available translations. (Those who know another Indian language are in a stronger position, because the gulf between the original and the translation is often less wide: Lalita Pandit can justifiably write in such aesthetic detail about *Gora* because Ajneya spoke Bengali fluently, having lived with a Bengali family in Assam in the 1940s, and he translated *Gora* directly from the Bengali.) Writing about Tagore without Bengali becomes hardest and riskiest when it reaches to the heart of all his endeavours: his poetry and song. Wisely, the editors and most of the contributors avoid this, and even the one who does stray near—Purnima Mehta, in her essay on 'Childhood loss and mourning reaction in Tagore's poetry', just about gets away with it by using Tagore's own translations in *The Crescent Moon* (1913) as material for a Freudian discussion of bereavement rather than for literary criticism as such.

Of the sixteen essays in the book, five (all in its central section on ‘Complicating literary traditions’) are on Tagore’s novels, especially *The Home and The World* and *Gora*. This is safer territory than the poetry, for those who don’t know Bengali, though not without dangers, as anyone who has compared Surendranath’s translation of *The Home and the World* closely with the original (*Ghare Baire*) will know. The encouraging thing about these essays is that they all accept these two novels as great and complex works: unlike earlier generations of critics, they feel no need to apologize for Tagore, or to find incompetence in him as novelist. Especially interesting are Kathleen Koljian’s essay ‘Mythology, nationalism, and patriarchal ambivalence in *The Home and the World*’, which tellingly associates Sandip’s worship of Bimala with ‘the Bengali belief in women’s *sakti* [*sic*] as the motivating power behind nationalistic action, and with the worship of Durga [*sic*] and Kālī as representations of this force’; and Patrick Colm Hogan’s convincing concatenation of *Gora* with Jane Austen’s *Mansfield Park*.

Other essays that will be a useful resource for future writers on Tagore are Kathleen M. O’Connell’s lucid appraisal of Tagore’s educational theory and practice (derived from her full-length study of this subject, published in 2002 by Visva-Bharati), and Judith Plotz’s piece on the performance in the Warsaw Ghetto in 1942 of Tagore’s play *The Post Office* by Jewish orphans under the care of the famous paediatrician and writer Janusz Korczak. I am only sorry that in preparing this excellent essay she did not, it seems, come across my own translation of the play, which was done for a production in 1993 that incorporated the Korczak connection, and was published in 1996 by the Tagore Centre UK with beautiful photos of the young performers and extracts from Korczak’s diaries.

But the best and most seminal essays in the collection are those on Tagore and science—especially those by Jonathan Shear and Brian Josephson, who grapple profoundly with Tagore’s insistence in his probing conversations with Einstein that ‘the world apart from us does not exist; it is a relative world, depending for its reality upon our consciousness’. As with the ‘inconsistency’ of Tagore’s political ideas, what might initially seem preposterous solipsism becomes fully reconcilable with philosophic rigour if one understands what Tagore actually meant by his abstract terms. Why does mathematics work? Shear argues that the answer to this question must lie in the fact that both mind and matter are expressions of one underlying reality. That was what Tagore was saying—and his view was informed not just by his poetic and religious intuitions but by an interest in science and mathematics that he pursued throughout his life. This is not the only reason for taking Tagore seriously, but it is a strong one.

WILLIAM RADICE

CENTRAL AND INNER ASIA

IGOR DE RACHEWILTZ:

The Secret History of the Mongols.

A Mongolian Epic Chronicle of the Thirteenth Century.

Translated with a Historical and Philological Commentary.

(Brill’s Inner Asian Library, 7/1 and 7/2.) 2 volumes with continuous pagination. cxxvii, 1347 pp. 10 plates. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2004. €179.

This is the third English translation of the *Secret History of the Mongols* I have reviewed. I enter here my usual disclaimer: apart from some terminology, I do

not know Mongolian. Hence I am not competent to pass judgement on the vast amount of philological material presented here, nor indeed on the accuracy of the translation—though no one who is familiar with Dr de Rachewiltz's reputation will have any doubts about either. My standpoint is that of a historian of the Mongol Empire who works mainly on the basis of source material from western Asia, but who nevertheless is obliged to make substantial use of the *Secret History*, the unique major Mongolian source for the early history of the empire, and for whom therefore the availability of a wholly reliable, comprehensible and adequately annotated English translation is a desideratum. Such a version has, for one reason and another, been lacking until now: but no longer.

De Rachewiltz's translation and annotations are already well known to scholars of the Mongol Empire: they were first published as a series of articles in the Australian journal *Papers in Far Eastern History* (*PFEH*) (now *East Asian History*), between 1971 and 1986. He has long promised to republish in book form, and at last he has done so. This is not a mere reprint, however: the earlier translation has been revised, and the annotation substantially expanded. It should be added that Dr de Rachewiltz has also published an *Index to the Secret History of the Mongols* (Bloomington, 1972), which as it were incidentally also provided a romanized Mongolian text of the *Secret History* which seems to be the edition now most widely used (the volumes under review include some additions and corrections to this).

Earlier English translations, in order of publication, have been those by Arthur Waley (1963: a partial translation of the Chinese abridgement), Francis W. Cleaves (1982), Paul Kahn (1984: a version in verse, based on Cleaves), and Urgunge Onon (1990 and 2001: de Rachewiltz prefers to refer to the 1990 version rather than the 2001 revision since, he says, though the revision reads better, 'there is no longer any certainty as to what is the translation and what is Onon's commentary'). By general agreement it is the Cleaves version that is far and away the most valuable, though almost no one likes it, mainly because Cleaves chose to translate into what has struck most readers as a distinctly curious and unhelpful pastiche of the style of the Authorized Version of the Bible (see e.g. C. R. Bawden, 'Riding with the Khans', *TLS*, 24 June 1983, p. 669). De Rachewiltz, characteristically, is much more generous to Cleaves than the rest of us were, and in passing provides the solution (pp. cv–cvi, n. 312) to a long-standing mystery: why the Cleaves version, which was set up in type in 1957, remained unpublished for 25 years. This, according to Cleaves in a letter to de Rachewiltz, was because in 1951 his friend and mentor William Hung had published an article in which he dated the *Secret History* to 1264; and he forbade Cleaves from publishing 'anything that was contrary to his conclusions'. So Cleaves had to wait until Hung was dead (this was essentially the story which the late Joseph Fletcher told me many years ago).

Well, the Cleaves version will no doubt continue to be referred to by Mongolists. But most of those who are concerned with the *Secret History* will no longer need to concern themselves with it. It will surprise no one who has used the *PFEH* articles to know that de Rachewiltz sweeps the board in a most convincing way. The introduction tells us all we need to know about the text and its history, its dating (de Rachewiltz sticks to his view, now widely accepted, that this was 1228, the section on the reign of Ögödei having been added later, as well as there having been various even later tinkering with the text), earlier editions and translations in a wide variety of languages, and so on. Then follows the translation, with footnotes on the page dealing with immediate points of clarification. The massive commentary (arranged under

the conventional paragraphing of the *Secret History*) takes up the remainder of the first volume and most of the second. There follow several appendixes, bibliographies and indexes.

It is a joy to be able to read so clear, sensitive and comprehensible a version of the text. As for the commentary, it is by far the fullest and best-informed collection of material on the prehistory and early history of the Mongol Empire I have ever encountered. Space does not allow me to remark in detail on what I have learned from the commentary, whether on matters historical or topographical (de Rachewiltz really knows his Mongolia). His attitude towards the *Secret History*, considered as a historical source, is positive (not for him, for the most part, Waley's verdict that it is 'legendary storytelling not ... history'), but very far from uncritical. When he thinks we are reading epic, not to be taken as literal history, he says so; equally, he often draws attention to the unreliability of the *Secret History* in terms of chronology. Here there are numerous instances, as he points out, where the version of early Mongol history found in the writings of the Persian historian Rashīd al-Dīn (who had access to now lost Mongolian sources independent of the *Secret History*) is more reliable, factually. For this Persian material, de Rachewiltz uses the standard Russian editions and translations: it is perhaps a pity that he did not, apparently, have access to Professor Wheeler Thackston's English translation, Rashiduddin Fazlullah, *Jami'u't-Tawarikh. Compendium of Chronicles* (3 volumes, Harvard University, 1998/99): reference to this version would have been helpful, I think, to Mongolists who do not read Persian.

That is about the only criticism I can come up with. This is a major scholarly achievement, to be viewed with profound admiration, but also to be used—as I have no doubt it will be, for the foreseeable future—by all who are interested in the Mongol Empire and the career of Chinggis Khan. All serious scholarly libraries should have this book. But so, in my opinion, should all individual scholars of the subject, even, if necessary, at the cost of taking out a second mortgage.

D. O. MORGAN

BRYAN J. CUEVAS:

The Hidden History of the Tibetan Book of the Dead.
xi, 328 pp. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003. £40.

Ever since its publication in 1927, *The Tibetan Book of the Dead* has attracted wide interest among scholars, psychologists, spiritualists, and academic dilettantes. It was promptly followed by translations into other European languages, and by studies of its nature and purpose. Some scholars interpreted correctly its significance, but many intellectuals misconceived and distorted its teaching. The various misconceptions about this book are largely due to a lack of awareness of its textual and doctrinal history. It is this unawareness of its history that Cuevas dispels in his excellent and scholarly study.

The small set of funerary texts called *Bar do thos grol chen mo* / *Great Liberation upon Hearing in the Intermediate State* (immortalized as *The Tibetan Book of the Dead*) is derived from a larger collection of texts called *Self-liberated Wisdom of the Peaceful and Wrathful Deities*. The original authorship of the *Bar do thos grol* is attributed to the Indian teacher Padmasambhava who visited Tibet in the eighth century. He is said to have concealed it before returning to India. This concealment was discovered in the fourteenth century

by a Tibetan mystic named Karma Lingpa not as a single text but as a group of texts. Essentially, Cuevas pieces together the unwritten history of these texts and details how they were compiled, preserved and transmitted. These texts were not simply concealed and then neatly rediscovered, but have undergone a hazy process of formation for some four centuries. His book is indeed, as he rightly claims, the first historical study of the formation and transmission of Karma Lingpa's revelations. Using a wide range of sources, he traces, conjectures and reconstructs as far as possible the formative phases of these texts. He admits that although his reconstruction faithfully mirrors the studied texts, it remains uncertain whether it always corresponds to historical events.

Cuevas's findings may be summed up as follows. Padmasambhava visits the Buddha Amitābha and receives teachings on the rainbow body transference. He writes down these teachings, voices prophesies, and then conceals them in caskets on Gampodar Mountain in Dakpo. Around the beginning of the fourteenth century, a treasure revealer called Nyida Sangye finds this concealment and gives it to a serpent king. Then his son Karma Lingpa, aged fifteen, extracts a cluster of texts from Gampodar Mountain. It cannot be determined exactly which texts he excavated and which he wrote himself. It is probable that these texts contained some seminal material for its formation, but did not actually include the *Bar do thos grol* as it eventually became known. After Karma Lingpa's death there ensued a complex and fluid circulation of his texts. According to some sources, his manuscripts were divided between his father and his son, who may have recast and expanded some of the inherited texts. Then as these texts became more widely diffused, various people contributed new materials, inserted changes and made adaptations. Eventually these texts became institutionalized and preserved through different lineages in Eastern, Southern and Central Tibet. During this process of textual fluidity, the original manuscripts of Karma Lingpa have vanished, in the sense that none of the texts attributed to him can be dated prior to the seventeenth century. It was during this misty but creative process that the *Bar do thos grol* eventually surfaced as a distinct text. One person who made a decisive contribution to its final compilation was Rikdzin Nyima Drakpa, the recognized authority on teaching Karma Lingpa's revelations; he compiled, around the end of the seventeenth century, the version of the *Bar do thos grol* which was eventually block-printed in the second half of the eighteenth century. As his original version was lost, it is impossible to determine whether the known editions of the *Bar do thos grol* are copies or modified versions. Thus the precise history of this fascinating text, which Cuevas reconstructs as far as possible, is still overcast by mystery.

The doctrinal history of the *Bar do thos grol* is even more complex than its textual history. Initially Buddhism taught that the last thought at death gives rise to the first thought at rebirth. Then at some stage, during the early centuries of the common era, some Abhidharma works formulated the concept of an intermediate being/existence between death and rebirth. It is taught in these works that the intermediate being may persist for up to seven days, but at some stage this period was expanded to seven weeks. This intermediate being, a temporary replica of the eventually reborn being, is driven by the power of karma to new rebirth. Upon entering the womb, it dies and gives rise to the first moment of consciousness inside the fertilized ovum. Initially it was taught that the route of the intermediate being and the form of rebirth were karmically determined and could not be altered. Then there evolved new speculation in Mahāyāna and Vajrayāna which led to the formulation of the theory that it is

possible to interact with the intermediate being (or consciousness), change its course, and help it through rituals and other devices to gain a better rebirth. Yet another strand of speculation led to the theory that, upon death, the mind temporarily dissolves into the primordial luminosity understood as perfect buddhahood. If upon death one recognizes and unhesitatingly embraces this luminosity, the state of enlightenment is realized and further rebirth is severed. If one fails, the karmic force agitates and reverses the whole process towards rebirth. During this reversed process there appear visions of peaceful and wrathful deities to coerce visionarily one's return to luminosity. If one fails to recognize the significance of those deities, there follow further karmically determined visions, and then, as they fade away, the intermediate being is born and speeds for karmically determined rebirth. This dissolution into luminosity and various visions form the post-mortem imagery of the *Bar do thos grol*. The unprecedented and unique claim of this book is that upon mere hearing of its instructions at any point during the process of dissolution or return to existence, the dead can easily gain the ultimate liberation.

Cuevas soundly explains the Abhidharma teachings on the intermediate state, the mahāsiddha and tantra innovations on the post-mortem state, and some developments in Tibet which contributed to the doctrinal complexion of the *Bar do thos grol*. There are, however, some factual and conceptual lacunae in his linkage between the Abhidharma and tantra doctrines. Otherwise, his book is a major contribution in the field of Tibetan studies.

TADEUSZ SKORUPSKI

PETER MORAN:

Buddhism Observed: Travelers, Exiles and Tibetan Dharma in Kathmandu.

(Anthropology of Asia Series.) vii, 224 pp. London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2004. £65.

Westerners frequently confuse Nepal and Tibet, assuming that trips to Kathmandu involve cold nights on the Tibetan plateau. By contrast, for Nepalis themselves, Tibet is a faraway place, with a different and inferior culture, of which they know nothing and wish to know nothing. It is more than a little ironic, then, that the capital of Nepal, the Kathmandu Valley, has been turned into a mini Tibet over the past twenty years by a combination of political circumstances (Tibetan flight to Nepal and India after 1959 and the Chinese suppression of Buddhism in Tibet itself) and transnational religious forces (the ability of Tibetan lamas to set up global networks and to attract rich Asian donors). Today Western Buddhists can come to Kathmandu and it does indeed stand in for Tibet. Every available hillock is now topped by an impressive, expensive, and richly painted Tibetan gompa, housing dozens of monks from Tibet and the marshlands of Nepal.

At the centre of this world of the Western Buddhists (or dharma bums, to those who look down on them) stands the stupa or chorten of Bauddha (known as Jarungkhashor in Tibetan, Khasti in Newari, Bauddha or Bodhnath in Nepali; for some reason Moran refers to it as 'Bodhanath' throughout). Fifty years ago Bauddha was a pilgrimage site for Tibetans and for Nepali Buddhists, situated in fields with a few Tamang households nearby. The stupa itself was under the hereditary control of a Tamang, known as Chini

Lama, who had been granted this right by the Rana Prime Minister, Jang Bahadur, in 1859. Today Bauddha is a densely built-up suburb of Kathmandu, notable for the number of Tibetans and for the fact that there are perhaps thirty Tibetan monasteries there, some very large. A handful of these monasteries hold regular teachings for Westerners, some of whom fly to Nepal especially to attend them. Other Westerners live for years in Bauddha or other parts of Kathmandu in order to be close to their teachers and in a conducive environment for Buddhist practice.

Moran's ethnography is of this encounter between Western Buddhists and Tibetan teachers. Moran notes that the 'Newar and Tamang people..., though vitally present in the economic and political life of the community [around Bauddha] today, are largely invisible to Western observers in search of Bodhanath's "culture"' (p. 188)—and they remain largely invisible in this ethnography too. The only Nepali voice that is quoted is a local MP the author met, who protests against Westerners' obsession with Tibetans and their proclivity to sponsor Tibetan children when others in Nepal are far poorer. Nor would one know from this ethnography that there are non-Tibetan forms of Buddhism flourishing and organizing in the Kathmandu Valley, or even that some of the smaller gompas in the Valley have been built by Newars. Moran does note, however, that much of the sponsorship for the enormous gompa building programme in the Kathmandu Valley comes not, as one might expect, from North America, Europe or Australasia, but from Taiwan, Hong Kong and South-East Asia.

Where Moran's ethnography is strong is in quoting numerous Western, and quite a few Tibetan, voices on the encounter between them, on Buddhism, and on Tibetan culture. Western Buddhists have found a welcome reception from elite Tibetan Buddhist lamas; as Moran shows, both are committed to a combination of book study and spiritual practice—which is rarely the case for Tibetan lay people, and even for many monks. Tibetan lay people, with the exception of some highly educated members of the younger generation, still adhere to a hierarchical view of their own religion, in which study and meditation are the sphere of specialists. Tibetan lay people revere incarnate lamas and they approach them for blessings, but otherwise keep their distance. Western Buddhists, by contrast, are committed to what Moran calls 'a fetishization of meditation' (p. 99): if you don't meditate, you can't call yourself a Buddhist. They spend long hours at the feet of the lamas, and don't hesitate to call on them for all kinds of spiritual and worldly demands. Moran quotes some Tibetans who are quite shocked by this behaviour; and conversely, many Westerners who started out idealizing the simple faith of the Tibetan laity, but ended by despising it.

As the book progresses, it becomes clear that it is also an auto-ethnography. Moran admits that when he first arrived in 1984 'I was twenty; I was Catholic; I expected something Cistercian, but even more exotic. That is, I expected silence, severe discipline, and lots and lots of meditation. I asked one of my new monk friends about my age, "when do you meditate?" He looked a bit put off. "I don't meditate—but maybe I will learn later"' (p. 99). Moran has himself sat at the feet of the lamas and felt the romantic pull of Tibet that he describes and dissects in others.

The Tibetan lamas at the centre of this 'spiritual economy' appear by name occasionally, but more often as 'signs'. The role of the incarnate lama and his appeal to different audiences are discussed at length. From time to time the book descends into jargon, e.g. 'For just as Western travelers and expatriates have been interpellated by elite Tibetan discourses in their search "for what it

means to be a Buddhist,” so too have Tibetan exiles been hailed by the discursive practices of modernity with regard to nation, religion and identity’ (p. 156). But if you can swallow the occasional sentence like this, the book offers a valuable, well-organized, and persuasive picture of an important relationship in the history of modern Buddhism, one key part of the complex transnational nexus that has launched Tibetan Vajrayana as a global phenomenon.

DAVID N. GELLNER

PRATAPADITYA PAL (with contributions by Amy Heller, Oskar von Hinüber and Gautama V. Vajracharya):

Himalayas: An Aesthetic Adventure.

308 pp. Chicago, Berkeley and Ahmedabad: The Art Institute of Chicago in association with the University of California Press and Mapin Publishing, 2003. £27.95.

This book was published in conjunction with the exhibition of religious sculpture, painting and ritual objects entitled ‘Himalayas: An Aesthetic Adventure’ organized by the Art Institute of Chicago and presented in the museum from 5 April to 17 August 2003. The exhibition was also presented at the Smithsonian Institution, Washington DC, from 18 October 2003 to 11 January 2004.

As the title of the book and exhibition implies, the primary criterion for choosing the objects (many of which are well known and have been published before) is aesthetic. The author makes no bones about the fact that his purpose has been ‘to encourage the viewer first to look and enjoy the beauty of the objects and then to explore their spiritual import’ (p. 10). This concentration on aesthetics as an ‘entry point’ to Himalayan art, reflected by the preponderance in the exhibition of objects from private collections, of course runs counter to some earlier academic and curatorial attitudes which regard the majority of such objects as ‘certainly not works of art’ (P. H. Pott, in A. B. Griswold, *Art of the World 13: Burma, Korea, Tibet*, London, 1964, p. 154). Also at variance with the primarily aesthetic approach is the opinion of many of those from Himalayan cultures, including some artists: ‘[through] a deep understanding of the Buddha’s teaching ... one comes to distinguish clearly the uses served by a work of religious content, as distinct from a mere plaything or, for instance, a carving representing a monkey such as one might find decorating a table’ (L. S. Dargyab, *Tibetan Religious Art*, Wiesbaden, 1977, p. 25). Whatever stance one takes in this debate, which is briefly mentioned on page 18, it has to be admitted that the works selected for such an aesthetic blockbuster as this may be quite untypical of Himalayan art as a whole. Nor does the aesthetic criterion make it easy to display a sequence of works to develop any connected theme, whether religious, historical or even stylistic. This is perhaps why the objects are assembled into three groupings on regional lines: Nepalese; Western (Gilgit, Western Tibet and Himachal Pradesh); and Eastern (Central Tibet, Eastern Tibet and Bhutan). The first two groups include both Buddhist and Hindu (though no Islamic) objects; the third only Buddhist. Within each group, the order of objects is chronological, and each object, or sometimes a group of two or three, is treated largely on its own terms. Each group has a three- to five-page introduction. In three appendixes the inscriptions found on many of the objects from Nepal, Kashmir and Tibet, are

transcribed, translated and commented upon by G. V. Vajracharya, Oskar von Hinüber and Amy Heller respectively.

Production, including photography and reproduction, is sumptuous; bibliography and scholarly apparatus are admirably full and authoritative without being obtrusive. Leaving aside questions of the selection and arrangement of the pieces, one must admit that this publication presents and documents them magnificently.

Inevitably one could quibble over details, particularly in the dating of some of the pieces, where, however, certainty is not possible in the present state of knowledge. In a surprising lapse, the well-known Buddha sculpture of 715, usually ascribed to Gilgit (No. 64, p. 109), has been printed, complete with inscription, back to front. That this is not just a production blip is shown by the fact that right and left have been transposed in the accompanying description of the figures. The image is correctly displayed and described by Oskar von Hinüber in *Orientalia* 34/4, April 2003, pp. 37–9.

PHILIP DENWOOD

EAST ASIA

NICOLA DI COSMO:

Ancient China and Its Enemies: The Rise of Nomadic Power in East Asian History.

ix, 369 pp. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. £47.50.

The book is divided into four sections, each divided into two chapters. Section 1 traces the early evolution of the cultures facing the Chinese states on their northern frontier. It deals with the non-literary evidence, and does an excellent job of synthesizing known facts drawn from archaeology and geography with various theories on the emergence of nomadic steppe culture. Particularly valuable is the extensive use of Chinese-language archaeological reports, and the map on pp. 60–61 is an excellent aid, showing the locations of the various digs. From the ninth to the seventh centuries BC nomadism was not the general pattern, but there was a noticeable increase in horse-related materials amongst burial goods. These semi-nomadic pastoralists seem to have moved to full nomadism during the sixth to fourth centuries. From the third to first centuries there was a noticeable increase in luxury goods and a sharper differentiation in burial goods, pointing to the emergence of new social structures.

Section 2 examines evidence from Chinese literature. The various foreign peoples, such as the Rong and Di, were in many ways similar to their Chinese neighbours, and the sharp division between ‘us’ and ‘them’ was slow to emerge; Di Cosmo shows that various passages normally used to show such divisions are often ambiguous. By the fifth century, the Rong and the Di had been culturally and politically absorbed by the Chinese states. This expansion brought the Chinese into contact with a new kind of people whom they referred to as Hu: the classic nomad peoples who fought as mounted archers. The second chapter of the section explores the relatively late emergence of such peoples in Chinese literature, and their significant impact during the late Warring States period. Di Cosmo provides a brilliant analysis of Chinese wall building of the period, and shows that it was not part of a defensive policy against Hu attacks, but rather a means of seizing nomadic territory and

alienating it from its original owners. He rejects the simplistic (but often repeated) notion that the nomadic economy was dependent on Chinese production, and that they were compelled either to 'trade or raid' to meet this need. He shows clearly that farming was being practised in areas of the north outside of Chinese control (and perhaps in agricultural communities subservient to nomadic masters), and the evidence suggests that it was the Chinese who sought to develop trade in the north, not the Hu.

Section 3 seeks to explain the emergence of the Xiongnu empire, the Chinese response to it, and in particular the aggressive policy adopted by Han Wu-di. In typical nomadic cultures warfare was on a small scale, and tribal armies emerged only in times of crisis. Di Cosmo theorizes that it was the loss of the Ordos region and pressure from the Yuezhe and Eastern Hu that led to the emergence of a supra-tribal leadership under Maodun. With permanently mobilized armies and a supra-tribal administration, the new leadership required constant activity to acquire the means to reward its followers. He goes on to explain why Chinese attempts to deal with the Xiongnu by negotiation were doomed to failure. Treaty relations (*he-qin*) were first established by Gaozu, but despite the payment of tribute and the dispatch of a Chinese princess for each new Shanyu, Xiongnu raiding continued. This was largely due to the 'confederate' structure of the Xiongnu, which left the ruler essentially unable to command his subordinate kings not to raid. During the reign of Han Wu-di the Chinese shifted from a defensive to an offensive posture. The chapter contains a detailed analysis of the campaigns of this period, and it is shown that the scope of Chinese campaigns and expansion went far beyond anything that had been envisaged at the beginning of the war. All of it, including the expansion into the western regions, needs to be seen in the context of an all-out effort to destroy the economic and diplomatic base of the Xiongnu.

The shift from section three to four is abrupt. Chronologically, the chapter and the book end at this point, at the end of Han Wu-di's reign. From an historical point of view it seems an arbitrary point to finish, and the decision was clearly linked to the fact that Sima Qian's *Shiji* also finishes here. An additional chapter is needed, taking Di Cosmo's analysis down to (at least) the close of the Western Han period.

The final section deals with the historian Sima Qian and his motivations. There was no precedent for his extended description of the Xiongnu, and Di Cosmo explains this by an interesting means: it was chiefly his astronomical and astrological training that led to Sima Qian's careful collection of observations and records. The Xiongnu had clearly emerged as a major challenge to the Han Dynasty, and they needed to be rationalized into the flow of Chinese history.

This is an excellent book packed with information and insightful analysis, but occasional typos interfere with the material. For example, the peace treaty mentioned at p. 114 was made in 569, not 562 BC (compare *Zuo Zhuan*, Xiang 4 and 11); n. 74, p. 188 should read *Shiji* 5.207, not 6.207; at p. 165 articles by Meng Wen-t'ung and Huang Wen-pi are mentioned without footnote or reference in the bibliography; the Chinese character for the Di people does not appear in the character glossary at the back; p. 244 says that the commandery of Jiuquan was established before 110 BC, but p. 246 says it was in 104 BC. *Shiji* 30.1493 and 110.2913 appear to date it at c. 112 BC. At p. 269 it says that Zhonghang Yue 'fled to the Xiongnu', but this is not correct. The excellent map at pp. 60–61 is missing Yulungtai. It would have been better if Di Cosmo had provided some explanation of his use of the more correct (but less common) form *chanyü* instead of *shanyü* for the Xiongnu leader, particularly

when the form shanyü is reproduced within quotations at two points (p. 153 and n. 103, p. 194). The same applies to his use of 'Mo-dun' instead of the more common Maodun, especially since the book is presented with the Chinese transliterated in Wade-Giles style, and the form 'dun' would normally be written 'tun'. There seems no reason that CUP could not have included Chinese characters within the main body of the text, and in places constant referrals to the character glossary become tiresome, and the book seems oddly archaic in its use of Wade-Giles instead of the increasingly accepted pinyin forms.

JONATHAN MARKLEY

THOMAS A. WILSON (ed.):

On Sacred Grounds: Culture, Society, Politics, and the Formation of the Cult of Confucius.

(Harvard East Asian Monographs, 217.) xiv, 424 pp. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2003. £29.95.

This welcome collection of essays is a reaction to the perceived 'habit of modern studies' of subsuming the 'disparate parts of Confucian life' under the rubric of the 'world's great philosophies'. Its aim is to 'draw attention to Confucianism's corporeality and religiousness, its myths and cultic practices' and to 'return ritual ... to our thinking about Confucianism' (pp. 35–6). It adopts perspectives fresh to Confucian studies, including religious and art history, cultural history, as well as social history and postmodern theory. Its focus, however, remains on aspects of the religious cult of Confucius in China. Cumulatively, these essays and the broader research effort they reflect do indeed shed fresh light on aspects of Confucianism that have been rather neglected in Western research, arguably since John Shryock's pre-war monograph, *The Origin and Development of the State Cult of Confucius* (1932). This should prove to be a useful book for researchers and a valuable teaching resource for religious history as well as for Chinese studies. It has also been well produced to meet the expectations of sinologists, with Chinese characters supplied in the text following romanized Chinese words.

It has not, of course, always been agreed that Confucianism is a religion. Thomas Wilson's introductory essay sets the stage with a discursive discussion of the nature of Confucian religiosity and of the history of perception of the tradition as secular and Confucius as agnostic. Wilson deals also with Confucian theories of ritual, touching on the debate between Herbert Fingarette and Benjamin Schwartz concerning the 'inner subjectivity' of Confucianism. He quotes James Watson to the effect that the Chinese state was more concerned with 'orthopraxy' than with 'orthodoxy' (p. 19). In a second essay, his own main scholarly contribution, Wilson explores the two main procedures whereby the imperial state promoted the status of Confucius. The first was through government-sanctioned worship of the Sage, under various titles, in offices and schools in the form of the *shidian* ceremony. Wilson provides a narrative sketch of the history of the rite, including a brief account of the liturgy as observed during the Ming. Second, the biological descendants of Confucius were also granted special status and privileges. Here again, Wilson sketches the ramified and disputed genealogy of China's oldest hereditary noble family.

Both ceremony and descendants are further explored in essays in this book. The form of worship and ritual status of Confucius were contested. Wilson states that 'these debates need to be understood as a mode of negotiation that had implications for social relations within literati culture and for Chinese society as a whole, as well as relations between scholar officials and the sovereign' (p. 54). Two essays focus on a radical reform that took place in 1530. Through the intervention of the Jiajing emperor, the images of Confucius were, as Deborah Sommer puts it, literally 'liquidated', dissolved in water (p. 95). She sees this iconoclasm against the background of Chinese religious history, where images occupied a liminal status as intermediaries between the living and the dead. But she also documents an 'aniconic' reflex that Confucianism shares with other religious traditions. Not least, it seems, writers were worried that a sitting image of the Sage implied that he would suffer the indignity of crawling forward to receive offerings. Three-dimensional images, moreover, were sometimes seen as tainted by Buddhist influences. A complementary, political, perspective to Sommer's article is provided by Huang Chin-shing. Huang persuasively sees the iconoclasm politically, as reflecting an autocratic imperial suppression of bureaucratic autonomy, symbolized by the ritual exaltation of Confucius, in effect the patron saint of bureaucrats. There were other, less politically fraught, features of the cult that produced changes over time. Joseph Lam describes a tension between a standardized liturgy and the 'individualistic heart/minds of musical Confucians' (p. 136), who interpreted the musical aspects of the ceremony idiosyncratically. This tension produced significant variations in performance regionally and historically over the period from Ming to the Republic.

Aspects of Confucius's lineage and biological descendants are explored in the remainder of the book. In a bravura piece, Lionel Jensen writes of the matrix of myth and lore that surrounds the Sage's ancestry and immediate posterity. His view is sceptical. He sees Confucius as a 'figure produced by competitive systems of representation' (p. 176) and impugns his historicity: Confucius, he claims, is 'a symbolic rather than historic artifact' (p. 215), or even a 'free-floating signifier' (p. 214). Jensen provides a fascinating romp through the apocryphal traditions concerning the Sage, including his role as the object of a fertility cult. Yet this virtuosity smacks, too, of reduction and *parti pris*. What does Jensen mean by the claim that the 'sound and sense, graph and text' concerning Confucius are 'analyzable only by us' (pp. 215–6)? Much later, from mid-Ming times, again it is suggested under Buddhist influence, a genre of narrative pictures of Confucius's life came into being. These, according to Julia Murray, were exercises in moral education rather than works of art. They were intended to promote orthodox behaviour rather than to be artistic statements. Interestingly, women featured in domestic representations in the late Ming, though they subsequently largely disappear, reflecting an 'implicit rejection of the growing tendency to "familize" the official cult of Confucius in the late Ming' (p. 254). Murray sees the genre as a whole as 'a means of reaffirming ancient values and ethical codes in times of political turbulence or social change' (p. 257).

Confucius's more remote biological descendants are the subject of the last three articles. Abigail Lamberton shows how, though it produced neither statesman nor scholars (p. 300), the Kong clan of Qufu, Confucius's birthplace, possessed strategies for preserving its cultural pre-eminence that, unsurprisingly, exploited its descent from its famous ancestor. It also developed a monopoly of the office of county magistrate and tax exemptions based on a close and mutually beneficial relationship with the imperial house. The

final two articles bring the story into the Mao and post-Mao decades. Jun Jing is concerned with the activities of an extensive branch of the Kong kindred settled in Yongjing County, Gansu. Temples to Confucius in the two villages of Dachuan and Xiaochuan had been levelled or dismantled in 1961 and 1974 respectively. Against the background of the post-Mao religious revival, the Kong descendants planned to rebuild the two temples. But the 'symbolic capital' possessed by the two villages differed. In Dachuan, the poorer village, elders with cultural memory of the ceremony survived and were able to reconstruct the liturgy. In wealthier Xiaochuan, the revivalists belonged to a younger generation lacking such cultural knowledge. They were forced to rely on the elders of the Dachuan community. The final chapter of the book, by Wang Liang, a newspaper editor in Qufu, concerns the Cultural Revolution. It tells the stark and troubling story of the vandalization of the ancestral Kung family precincts by Red Guards under the name of destroying the 'Four Olds'.

This collection of papers is explicitly 'not a comprehensive account of the cult of Confucius' (p. 35); indeed, it suggests much for further study. Despite the preoccupation with central power in this book, one is left with a sense of a cult in something of a vacuum. How did the veneration of Confucius impinge on ordinary lives? According to the late Ching reformer Tan Sitong, 'only the officials and the gentry participate in these sacrifices; the rest are all not allowed in'. Yet when the Protestant missionary Justus Doolittle witnessed a provincial observance of the ceremony in the autumn of 1858, he noted the 'crowd of noisy youngsters' who gathered at the rehearsal; the following night a 'large number of idle spectators of the lower class and of literary men' attended the ceremony itself from 4 a.m. Did the cult of Confucius have a hold on the popular imagination? Who actually saw it? Further, Wilson mentions private performances of veneration 'outside the purview of the imperial bureaucracy' (p. 21). What did such observances mean? Could such religious acts assume a subversive meaning, like that claimed for the *shuyuan* in which they were staged? Finally, it might be noted that the cult of Confucius was an East Asian phenomenon. It spread to Korea, Vietnam and Japan, where the rite underwent interesting developments. But that is another story, beyond the scope of this book.

JAMES MCMULLEN

BERNARD FAURE (ed.):

Chan Buddhism in Ritual Context.

(Routledge Curzon Studies in Asian Religion.) ix, 320 pp.

London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003.

JOHN R. MCRAE:

Seeing through Zen: Encounter, Transformation, and Genealogy in Chinese Chan Buddhism. xx, 204 pp. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2003.

The first of these two new contributions to Zen studies, a collection put together by an acknowledged authority on the Chan/Zen tradition, comes as something of a surprise, since one might have expected a North American publisher to have snapped up a work of this nature long ago. Yet the rather out of date academic affiliations of some of the contributors, and the fact that

some of their contributions—certainly more than the single piece so acknowledged—have already appeared in journals, even if only in specialist journals based in East Asia, suggests on the contrary that a certain amount of time has passed since the publication of the ensemble in this form was first mooted. It is hard to see why. There are perhaps some problems in the balance of the contributions, though all are individually excellent. Many of the earlier pieces relate to the theme of Chan and the body, ranging from essays on Chan portraiture by Wendy Adamek, and Griffith Foulk and Robert Sharf, through a fascinating account of the theft of a mummified master by James Robson, on to a contribution by the editor himself concerning the robes of Zen masters, objects also at just one remove from being corporeal relics, as Taoist regulations on the disposal of priestly robes make clear.

But although the last two pieces, by William Bodiford on the interaction of Zen with local belief, and Duncan Williams on the connections between Zen and Japanese medical culture, do also help to break down the picture implied by earlier English-language writing on Zen of a tradition entirely unsullied by involvement with anything at all this-worldly, they do so in a rather different way. And a substantial essay by Carl Bielefeldt on medieval Japanese strategies for finding a place for Zen in contemporary schemes mapping the different varieties of Buddhism, placed in chronological order before both these two pieces and the editor's contribution, is markedly different in character from its companions. Yet within the confines of what might be taken for a somewhat old-fashioned discussion of doctrinal matters based solely on textual materials it offers a probing, detailed and ultimately surprisingly revealing account of an important era of religious thought made all the more interesting by the variety of forms of accommodation to novelty reflected therein. If, as the author of this piece indicates, his research represents but a part of a larger project, then I for one look forward to its completion.

But there is nothing published here that should have caused a moment's hesitation to any press to whom it may have been offered, especially given the magisterial introduction to the modern study of Zen, accompanied by a copious even if not definitive bibliography, that stands at the head of these contributions. This provides a clear statement, based not simply on wide reading but also on a distinguished research career, of the main issues affecting the study of Zen. As a means towards teaching the topic beyond the level of the textbook (and no satisfactory introduction to the history of Zen yet exists) it looks invaluable, and no doubt many teachers in North America will confound expectations by buying this British publication.

Some teachers, however, may like to complement its somewhat heterogeneous breadth of coverage with a much more tightly constructed collection of essays by a single author, one of the very few in Western academic circles who can compare with Bernard Faure in the long-term experience he has accumulated in Zen research. John McRae is not writing an introductory history, either, but his sequence of chapters, while chronological and equipped with a tacit narrative covering the development of Zen, at the same time asks at each point probing questions about underlying patterns manifested by our sources. His approach is indeed bluffly laid out on pp. xix–xx in a concise and striking credo, 'McRae's rules of Zen studies', covering four major theses: 'It's not true, and therefore it's more important'; 'Lineage assertions are as wrong as they are strong'; 'Precision implies inaccuracy'; and 'Romanticism breeds cynicism'. These are doubtless good rules for more than simply the study of Zen, but despite the explanatory glosses that accompany these dicta in loco, the chief value of the book is in seeing how these principles are put into practice in the string of research studies that follows.

Of course the disadvantage of this approach is that we only end up about half a dozen centuries or so from the time of Bodhidharma. And once one has abandoned an unquestioning acceptance of the established narrative for something more probing, even that span of time may be subject to a number of different interpretations at different points. In the seventh century, for example, I for one would see the overall backdrop of the Zen quest for an undeniable access to enlightenment, a shining transmission of the lamp amidst the encircling gloom, as being constituted by the staggering catastrophes of the sixth century, from the bloody fall of the Liang to the outright persecution of the Northern Zhou. And just as at that same time some established schools (such as Tiantai) were able to benefit from the state's need to find cross-regional religious links that might be useful in shoring up a China newly reunified after centuries of mutual hostility, so too would I interpret the concern for lineage in the late tenth to eleventh centuries and the triumphalism of the twelfth against larger political strategies. The points made in the fifth and sixth chapters of this study are of course valid, but one can see that lineages, as well as excluding (p. 149), could also be including, in that they also emphasized transregional linkages that had been maintained by Buddhism in the preceding late ninth to early tenth century period of political fragmentation. At the same time, the continued presence on Song China's northern borders of states committed to Chinese-language Buddhism of the traditional sort emphasizing the religion's pan-Asian heritage underlined a need for a type of Buddhism that found its heroes exclusively on Chinese soil. Even so, the author may well be right in ending his study pointing in another direction entirely ignored by the traditional narrative—that of the position of religion in local society, and the frequent citation of unpublished work gives a palpable feel of up-to-the-minute research, however long this volume has been in press. Zen Buddhism has certainly fulfilled the function sought of it by Japanese intellectuals of the Meiji period, in that it has indeed brought East Asia's religious traditions to the attention of the West. Some aspects of its presentation, however, we must now set aside as representing merely expedient levels of truth. But with research such as that exhibited in the books under review showing the way, we are surely destined to share in time a much more detailed and lively picture of what it was all about.

T. H. BARRETT

FA-TI FAN:

British Naturalists in Qing China: Science, Empire, and Cultural Encounter.

xii, 238 pp. Cambridge, Massachusetts and London: Harvard University Press, 2004. £32.95.

This is in one sense rather a timely book, should a reawakened interest in the history of plant collecting in China result from the simultaneous publication, in a print run no doubt much longer than that allotted to Fan's study, of a mass market novel by Elizabeth McGregor, *The Way through the Mountains* (London: Bantam, 2004), which has at its heart the researching of a biography of the famous collector E. H. Wilson (1876–1930)—in fact Fan's work reveals intriguingly (p. 239, n. 3) that such a biography was published by HMSO in 1993. But in another sense it is already long overdue: as the author points out (p. 169), his only predecessors specifically concerned with China have been E. Bretschneider (1833–1901) in 1898 and E. H. M. Cox, in 1945. Yet the former

composed his work in China itself, at some distance from British archival sources, while the latter, though claiming no doubt justifiably to have based every assertion on documentary evidence, explains in his Preface to *Plant-Hunting in China* that the provision of any footnotes has been eschewed on the grounds that it tends to interfere with the narrative flow of the story. This is fortunately not Fan's way, for not only has he made use of a fair number of archives, listed on p. 167, but he has also read widely in the current historiography of the period relating to both China and Britain—and, indeed, to wider questions of science and empire. The lack of any provision, therefore, of a bibliography is much to be regretted, for rapid access to Fan's broad reading would be a boon indeed.

In some respects, too, the focus of this study is somewhat narrower than its predecessors, since it is primarily concerned only, as the title indicates, with the British: there is little, therefore, concerning the Russians, on whom of course Bretschneider was well informed, and the Jesuit pioneers in the field are only treated in a summary fashion. In this case at least it is worth noting that a more detailed summary of our current understanding of the knowledge gained by the early missions has been provided by G. Metallié on pp. 803–8 of N. Standaert (ed.), *Handbook of Christianity in China: Volume One* (Leiden: Brill, 2001); one might add also that the forthcoming volume on botany in the series *Science and Civilisation in China* will be by the same author, since Fan clearly finds the treatment by Needham himself of Chinese learning about the natural world (p. 210, n. 51) insensitive in its imposition of modern categories on the Chinese past.

On its home territory, however, of discussing the evolving British knowledge of the natural world in China, this book is hard to beat, both on the early period during which all would-be naturalists were almost completely confined to Canton and Macao, and on the later years of the Qing when those bold enough to do so could wander much more freely. True, the tale is somewhat simplified by the fact that, as Fan observes, there was very little interaction with the learned Chinese tradition in this area—unlike, for example, the case of chemistry, recently discussed by David Wright, *Translating Science* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 2000). There was, perhaps, a self-confident feeling amongst the Englishmen of the day, if not all the British, that the countryside was a book that could be read without assistance from local interpreters. The glorious, sumptuously produced outcome of this approach, published just in time to squeeze inside Fan's chronological limits, was the second edition of H. T. Wade's compilation, *With Boat and Gun in the Yangtse Valley* (Shanghai, 1910), which does, as Fan notes (p. 223, n. 68), publish an article or two by Chinese contributors, but is overwhelmingly dominated by a veritable surfeit of contemporary Englishness, from learned topographical notes by an Anglican archdeacon to no-nonsense practical advice on dog parasites and how to deal with them. But whilst our gardens are still brightened by a host of imports from China, volumes like Wade's (with some exceptions, such as the 2001 reprinting by Kegan Paul of one of Robert Fortune's early collections of reports) may only be found in the deep shade of the more discriminating antiquarian bookshop. Fan has done an excellent job of throwing light once more on these writings and their authors, and has taken the very important further step of relating them to our current understanding of the imperialist enterprise of the times. If there is to be a broader revival of interest in this perennially fascinating area, one hopes that those writing with an eye to popular success will also take on board the considered and thought-provoking analysis made available here.

T. H. BARRETT

REBECCA E. KARL and PETER ZARROW (eds):

Rethinking the 1898 Reform Period: Political and Cultural Change in Late Qing China.

(Harvard East Asian Monographs.) x, 273 pp.

Cambridge, Massachusetts and London: Harvard University Asia Center, distributed by Harvard University Press, 2002.

China's military defeat by Japan in 1895 was followed by great agitation for reform among Chinese leaders and elites. Many had become convinced that China's polity was not working effectively to guarantee national security, political independence, and wealth-producing capabilities. Simply put, the Chinese did not know how to introduce reform without producing chaos. As a result, the radical reforms that followed did lead to revolution in 1911, and several years later, civil war.

Significant reforms of the political system required that the Chinese first change the dominant belief system, or ideas and values that elite and ordinary people shared, and then change society's incentive structures or institutions. Two categories of institutions influence society's incentive structure: formal institutions are defined as constitutions, rules, laws, etc., and informal institutions are the constraints (norms, cultural values, ideas, etc.) that influence human choices and behaviour. Therefore, to alter the beliefs and behaviour of China's leaders and elites, talented, experienced and informed people had to create a mixture of new institutions or incentive structures that could induce the Chinese people to adapt their behaviour to solve the country's fundamental problems.

But could just any reformers establish such an appropriate mixture of institutions to induce the elites and ordinary people to alter their behaviour without producing chaos? This wonderful book offers multiple insights and new explanations for why, in the first place, it was difficult to change the beliefs shared by China's elite and achieve a leadership consensus for undertaking reforms that were likely to succeed.

Peter Zarrow describes how reformers Kang Youwei and Liang Qichao tried to design a reform-oriented, enlightened, authoritarian state led by a dynamic, charismatic leader who could enlist political support for state reforms. But Kang and Liang were unable to transform the Confucian precept of 'sage king' into a modern monarch with the necessary leadership capabilities, especially charisma, worthy of eliciting official support for his reforms.

The chapters by Seungjoo Yoong, Tze-ki Hon, Timothy B. Weston and Richard Belsky discuss some important reasons for the failure of strategies for institutional change. According to these chapters, reformers' different mental models of reality competed for intellectual legitimacy and political support. Without broad consensus for reform from the throne, no mental model was persuasive and prevailed for long enough to promote an appropriate sequence of reforms.

Yoong describes Zhang Zhidong's state-backed newspaper as an instrument for instructing elites and winning their support for Zhang's mental model for reform. But Zhang had to expend considerable time and energy suppressing dissident voices demanding more radical reform than he believed appropriate. Moreover, these radical elements continually opposed Zhang (see Yoong's essay), even though his model for reform (see Hon's essay), which effectively combined the Confucian belief system with a Chinese application of Western science and technological knowledge, seemed to have resonated widely in official circles.

Weston examines how Zhang and others proposed integrating different kinds of knowledge through a new imperial university. Using Zhang's new concept of combining Confucian principles with Western science and technology, the Chinese were able to establish their first national university and train young people in the skills necessary to promote change throughout China. But Zhang's formula for combining elements of the Confucian belief system with the Western one did not sustain popular support and gain credibility.

Richard Belsky explains that the leadership model advanced by Kang Youwei and Liang Qichao received support from lower officials whose social and intellectual networks had been established in discrete sections of Beijing, but that this social base of support was still inadequate to deal with a strong conservative backlash from the throne.

The final essays, by Joan Judge, Hu Ying, Rebecca E. Karl and Xiaobing Tang, focus on culture and ideas, especially the debates on women's role in society and how poetry treated such new concepts as colonization and slavery.

In the tumultuous years after 1898 cries for fundamental change in women's status were heard for the first time in Chinese history. Females writing at that time inveighed against family injustices towards women and argued that women could not realize their full potential unless the family system was reformed.

Limited space prevents further comment on these splendid essays. These young authors represent a new generation of sinologists who have been well trained in using original Chinese sources and have read widely in the social sciences. Their essays illustrate why China's leaders and elite experienced great difficulty in agreeing on specific reforms. Many leaders adhered to an old belief system that was deeply entrenched and strongly supported by elite and common people, others tried to modify that beliefs system but were bitterly opposed for doing so, and still others offered radical reforms that many leaders and elite simply opposed.

RAMON H. MYERS

RICHARD E. STRASSBERG (ed. and trans.):

A Chinese Bestiary: Strange Creatures from the Guideways through Mountains and Seas.

xxii, 314 pp. Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: University of California Press, 2002.

The most innovative feature of the volume under review is to be found in the title; accepting a hypothesis set forth by the Ming commentator Wang Chongqing and supported by Yuan Ke (*Shanhai jing jiaozhu*, Shanghai, 1980, pp. 181–3), the author decided to translate the character *jing* not as 'classic' but as 'guideway'. The proposal sounds quite reasonable and is corroborated by sound arguments—such as the nature of the book, which can be viewed as a sort of travel guide, the appearance of the character *jing* in the heading of each section, and its verbal use ('go through') in a controversial passage appended to book V (see Yuan Ke, *Shanhai jing*, p. 179)—but its acceptance is far from being obligatory and seems bound to remain a matter of individual choice. I personally faced the question years ago, while working on my translation of the work, and in the end—considering that the *Shanhai jing* has undoubtedly become a classic and that the character *jing* was probably added in Han times to enhance its authority—decided to solve the problem by

adopting the neutral word ‘book’ in the title and by using the term ‘itinerary’ in the opening passage of each subsection (see R. Fracasso, *Libro dei monti e dei mari. Cosmografia e mitologia nella Cina antica*, Venice, 1996, p. xiii, note 2 and *passim*). The author also tries to interpret in a similar way the titles of later works (p. 239, n. 1), but the advisability of translating *Shui jing* (Classic of Rivers) as *Waterways*, and *Shenyi jing* (Classic of Spirits and Portents) as *Guideways to Gods and Anomalies*, is seriously questioned by the fact that ‘after the canonization of Confucian classics in the Western Han, it became fashionable to append *jing* meaning “classic” or “book” to a variety of texts for which special claims of authority were made’ (*ibid.*).

The Introduction (pp. 1–79, notes pp. 229–52), enriched by maps, drawings, blockprints and pictures, gives a brief outline of the text and of the historical and cultural milieu in which it took shape, and ends with a section, probably the most interesting of the whole book, devoted to ancient illustrations and illustrated editions of the *Shanhai jing* (pp. 57–79). In spite of the considerable length, and the broad range of topics it touches upon, this introductory section adds very little to our knowledge of the text and gives the impression of having been written for the general reader rather than for specialists, who will certainly regret the fact that the crucial and controversial question of the dating of the various textual layers is almost entirely neglected. Some specialists will probably also regret that more space is not allotted to Guo Pu (p. 15), who played a key role by establishing the transmitted text and compiling the earliest extant commentary (completed in the years 322–323 AD, as proved in R. Fracasso, ‘Guo Pu e lo *Shanhai jing*’, in *Studi in onore di L. Lanciotti*, Naples, 1996, vol. II, pp. 601–36; not listed in the bibliography).

In the following pages (83–228) the book presents reproductions of seventy-six blockprints by Jiang Yinghao taken from the 1597 edition of Wang Chongqing’s *Shanhai jing shiyi*, accompanied by the translation of related passages and a short commentary. The artistic level of these blockprints, defined as ‘a vulgar work for bookmarkets’ in the *Siku quanshu zongmu tiyao* (j. 144), is rather low, but their importance lies in their being the earliest illustrations still available today. In view of this and of the extreme rarity of the edition, we cannot but be grateful to the author for his divulgation.

RICCARDO FRACASSO

JAMES H. COLE:

Twentieth Century China: An Annotated Bibliography of Reference Works in Chinese, Japanese, and Western Languages.

2 vols. xxxii, 1427 pp. Armonk, New York: M. E. Sharpe, 2004.
£189.

This extraordinary feat of bibliographical scholarship, the result of well over a decade of individual effort, is surely destined to be welcomed by scholars and librarians everywhere, and to become in due course a standard work of reference consulted by every student of modern China. James Cole’s own scholarship on late imperial and modern China has been widely known for some time, while his interest in bibliography was already signalled by the publication of his *Updating Wilkinson: An Annotated Bibliography of Reference Works on Imperial China Published Since 1973* (New York: James H. Cole, 1991). The work under review is in fact designed to avoid any overlap with that earlier effort, and with the well-known guides to research on modern China by Andrew Nathan and by Peter Berton and Eugene Wu, though since

Cole's first venture was neither indexed nor well distributed it is perhaps fortunate that its somewhat different principal focus on late imperial China renders the problem of deciding which works may be absent as a result of the policy of avoiding overlap in this case a relatively minor one.

Indeed for the majority of users the problem is more likely to be one of choosing the most suitable research aids from amongst an intimidating plethora of references—over 12,200, we are told, even though some are simply cross-references to the same work under different categories. It is well worth reading carefully through the prefatory matter, however, in order to understand the scope and limitations of the work, and also well worth learning how to make good use of the author and title indexes at the back, after the character index—the bulk of the work has Chinese and Japanese in transcription only, but for the most part titles of reference works are stereotypical enough for consultation of this particular index of nearly two-hundred pages to be less of a priority. Not least of the lessons that need to be learned from the prefatory material is that this massive ensemble of information represents no more than a part of a larger project: all full consideration of reference works of a biographical or topographical nature has been deferred until the appearance of further volumes, following the scheme of organization already used in *Updating Wilkinson*, though in fact some works classifiable under these headings may be found in the volumes under review, in which the emphasis is by and large bibliographical.

And there are, of course, a number of errors and omissions. The former appear to be rare enough when the author is dealing with works that he has personally examined, and for which he duly indicates the library or libraries whose exemplar he consulted. He does admit to some uncertainties over the reading of Japanese names, though I cannot see why he has omitted the perfectly British co-author's name, Doreen M. Wainwright, from his account of Noel Matthews, *A Guide to Manuscripts and Documents in the British Isles Relating to the Far East*, on each of its appearances, on pp. 66, 704, and 964. In one case I checked he turned out to have been fooled by an individual in America whose Korean name (contrary to expectations) is recast in the conventional American order, namely Sung Yoon Cho, author of the bibliography of Japanese studies of Chinese law treated in entries 60–52 and 63.70–7. Here and throughout, the first element in these codes for entries indicates topic and (in the second case) sub-topic, the second the number of the work concerned in alphabetical sequence: since Cho's work is based on the holdings of one particular library, it appears both in the main topic of law and in the topic of library catalogues, as subdivided by institution, listed in alphabetical order. Very unfortunately, however, Cho is identified as the author's family name only on the verso of the title page of his catalogue.

One may expect more trouble in the rather large number of instances of publications that Cole was not able to examine in person. These may be distinguished not simply by the absence of any indication of a specific library copy consulted but also by duly cautious phrases such as 'said to contain' and the like. In at least one case, 89–32, a publisher's announcement must have been used, since that date '2001?' is supplied: unfortunately, the work in question was not published in that year and I have yet to see it, though when it does appear it will no doubt be every bit as excellent as its advance publicity claims. This particular example comes from the section on Religion, which to my eye is marked by a number of omissions for which the compiler certainly cannot be faulted—that would be a sign of gross ingratitude—but which he might like to consider for a supplementary listing; others with other interests will no doubt recommend their own selection of missing titles. For while there are certainly

many useful and less familiar works to be found under the heading of Religion, the coverage on Daoism might easily have been improved by inclusion of Livia Kohn (ed.), *Daoism Handbook* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 2000): pp. 778–80 of its very useful survey of ‘The study of Daoism in China today’ in itself gives a good account of a significantly greater number of reference works relevant to the twentieth century than Cole has managed to find, whilst the attached bibliography lists Japanese reference works in this area also. The two volumes of Wang Leiquan, *Zhongguo dalu zongjiao wenzhang suoyin* (Taipei: Dongchu chubanshe, 1995) would also have been a useful addition to this section of Cole’s work, covering as they do articles on all religions and also on state policy to religion from 1949 up to 1992.

Another topic that is explicitly given somewhat shorter shrift than would be ideal is Translation and Translators, where on p. 1055 we are advised to consult also the listing of references on translations from the Chinese in Harriet T. Zurndorfer’s *China Bibliography* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995), pp. 316–22. One notes, for example, no listing for Marina Miranda, *Bibliografia delle Opere Cinesi Tradotte in Italiano, (1900–1996)* (Napoli: Giannini, 1998), which contains several sections relevant to Chinese materials of the twentieth century. On a more parochial note, although the listings on libraries and their archives already mentioned contains a section on SOAS and reference 63.89–1 describes a very useful article by Rosemary Seton on our holdings, her mention of our published guides such as Elizabeth Hook, *A Guide to the Papers of John Swire and Sons Ltd.* (London: SOAS, 1977), and Margaret Harcourt Williams, *Catalogue of the Papers of Sir Charles Addis* (London: SOAS, 1986) does not lead to a separate entry for them here, despite the usefulness of their indexes of personal names—perhaps they will be mentioned in the biographical volume. Similarly useful but absent from the work under review is Alan Harfield, *British and Indian Armies of the China Coast, 1785–1985* (n.p.: A and J. Partnership, 1990), a work that is not easy to find, but even so might have been expected to appear in the Military section.

Finally, among the indexes to the contents of periodicals, it is possible to make a case for Roman Malek, SVD (ed.), *Monumenta Serica: Index to Volumes I–XXXV* (Sankt Augustin: Institut Monumenta Serica, 1993), for though twentieth-century China forms a relatively small proportion of the coverage of this journal, the index does turn up *inter alia* a lengthy article on Republican history by James H. Cole. While all catalogues and other such research aids are useful, it is the annotation of an experienced researcher addressing other researchers that adds the most value to a simple listing of titles. And while it takes a considerable period of use to determine the true value of such editorial remarks, my hunch is that the annotation to this bibliography and to its subsequent volumes will come to be widely appreciated as making a real contribution to the vast field of scholarship surveyed between its covers.

T. H. BARRETT

SIEW-YUE KILLINGLEY:

Usage of Pronouns, Address and Relationship Terms in Chinese.
(Second Edition.) 54 pp. Newcastle upon Tyne: Grevatt &
Grevatt, 2003. £10.

In my teaching experience, Chinese pronouns are never a big problem. The non-distinction between ‘he’ and ‘she’ in speech, both pronounced *tā*, can at

times be ambiguous both to learners of Chinese as well as to native speakers. Learners of Chinese may not be sure when to use *nín* (a polite form for you) and when to use *nǐ*, the standard form. But on this, you will find discrepancies between native speakers of Chinese themselves. However, the ubiquitous *it* in English and the almost non-existent equivalent in Chinese seems to be an area where difficulties may arise. Not quite so. This is because the differences between the respective pronouns in the two languages is so obvious that learners of Chinese are made aware of it from the very beginning of their study. On the other hand, textbooks and teachers tend to avoid complicated usages involving the non-person pronoun 它 *tā* in Chinese, according to Killingley in *Usage of Pronouns, Address and Relationship Terms in Chinese* (Second Edition) Grevatt & Grevatt, 2003. Also, according to Killingley in the same monograph, even some dictionaries fail to illustrate the use of 它 *tā* adequately (p. 9).

In Killingley's work, the complexity of Chinese pronouns and ways of addressing people are illustrated by a detailed, hence somewhat qualitative, analysis of how native speakers of Chinese responded to questions concerning the usages. Her subjects came from mainland China, Taiwan, and Malaysia, were of different gender and age groups, and, not surprisingly, they came up with varied responses to the questions the researcher posed. I, a middle-aged male from the PRC, found myself reacting to the researcher's questions as I read along. Thus, I became a subject as well as a reader. Such an exercise would be interesting and beneficial to any teacher of Chinese and those doing research on this subject.

Unfortunately, the number of subjects is far too small, at thirteen, to draw any firm conclusions. In spite of such a small number, I found the presentation of results rather difficult to follow: there are no tables or figures, but only descriptive statements, and details of the subjects are repeated almost every time their responses are cited and analysed. I would have found it much clearer if the subjects were introduced only once, on a separate page, for readers to refer to. It is also a pity that the pinyin in the book is not marked with tones above the letters but rather with numbers. It is more regrettable since this was published in 2003, and pinyin with tone marks on top has long been a common practice in publications. In addition, not all examples are given with Chinese characters, an inconsistency which could have been easily avoided.

SONG LIANYI

ANDREA LOUIE:

Chineseness across Borders: Renegotiating Chinese Identities in China and the United States.

x, 246 pp. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004.

Cloth £57, paper £16.95.

Those who have read and enjoyed the numerous works of fiction-cum-documentary which have come from the entertainingly talented pens of Chinese American men and women (but mostly it seems women) over the past twenty years will have deduced for themselves that roots-seeking is an occupation which does not necessarily assuage its own thirst for clarity and certainty. This book attempts to analyse the problems through examining the reactions of the author and her fellow members of a small group of ten young Chinese

Americans enrolled in a one-year 'In Search of Roots' programme which culminated in a two-week visit to the villages in China's Guangdong province from which their ancestors had emigrated up to three generations earlier. Most of the group could speak no Chinese and none could read or write it, but all had undergone a preliminary study period on Chinese culture and the history of Chinese migration to the States and had laboured to construct genealogies of their kin.

Probably most tellingly illustrative of the complexity of the process of root-seeking is that it was required that these genealogies should be bilaterally focused, that is that they should trace both paternal and maternal kin lines. Nothing could be more foreign to traditional Chinese thought or to the male bias which permeated Chinese genealogies, where statements such as 'Daughters have no concern with descent and need not be entered in the genealogy' abound, and where wives rate mention only as mothers of sons. The seekers, in short, were not culturally Chinese whatever other Americans and they themselves thought. Nor was it the case that they were all equally non-Chinese or equally committed to understanding their roots. Of course this should not surprise us, but what the book brings out nicely is the confusion and inaccuracies of perception on the part of the American and Chinese governments and even of the well-meaning sponsors of the programme. Received notions of the inherent superiority, wealth and high status of the emigrants over those left in China, of the backwardness of rural China, of the yearning desire of the emigrant to assist those who have not migrated and of the innate unity of those with shared ethnicity all are shown to be inappropriate or outdated. Nor do words like 'American' and 'Chinese' necessarily hold much significance in multi-ethnic and multi-partite societies.

The author does not make this an easy read. It is verbose, repetitive, overflowing with buzz-words and opaque in its organization. There is no Chinese character glossary, a lack which heightens the frustration caused by sloppy romanizations (*zong zu* for *zhong zu*, mixed Cantonese and Putonghua in the same phrase, etc.) and apparent mistranslations such as 'donations' for 'welfare' (*fuk lei*). Yet there is an honesty about the presentation which is convincing and the overall impression is clearer than the language which conveys it. It seems likely that few of the participants in the roots-seeking programmes will have gained much of great value, but the book throws useful light on the scope of complexity of multicultural life.

HUGH D. R. BAKER

INOUE NOBUTAKA (ed.), ITŌ SATOSHI, ENDŌ JUN and MORI MIZUE
(trans. Mark Teeuwen and John Breen):

Shinto—A Short History.

xvi, 223 pp. London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003.

This book is an important new contribution to the general study of Shinto written by four younger Japanese scholars who present new critical views about the origin, function and character of this religious tradition. Originally published in Japan in 1998, this work quickly made an impact in scholarly circles there, prompting its translation into English so that its ideas might reach a wider audience. The editor of the volume is the leading younger scholar Inoue Nobutaka, who contributed two chapters to the work including

an introduction. The book is chronological in layout and consists of five chapters including the introduction. The other four chapters are entitled 'Ancient and classical Japan: the dawn of Shinto', 'The medieval period: the kami merge with Buddhism', 'The early modern period: in search of a Shinto identity', and 'The modern age: Shinto confronts modernity'. There is an extensive bibliography and a comprehensive index.

Overall the chapters link together well chronologically and in terms of religious and historical criticism. The writing is, however, very concise in its coverage of many periods while at the same time being extremely dense in the presentation of facts, place names and personal names. This is useful for providing an overview of the subjects of individual chapters, but it would have been useful to have had a more detailed description of certain historical figures and events.

One of the interesting and useful features of this book are the numerous insets discussing in depth certain topics raised in the main text, or points relating to the general discussion which would not have been germane to the main flow of the chapter's narrative. This feature in part overcomes the objection mentioned above, but not entirely. A glossary providing a definition of terms would have been helpful.

There are certain places where the discussion by the authors should have been much more fully developed. I found in particular the discussion of the key early modern Shinto thinker Motoori Norinaga to have been weak. His thought should have been brought out more fully, and the relationship of his thought to Meiji modernizers should have been more extensively discussed. I also found the whole discussion of Shinto in the Meiji period, and the reworking of that tradition which took place at that time, to be particularly weak. This is especially disappointing because of the crucial importance of those developments in understanding subsequent Japanese political and religious history, and the rise of a Shinto nationalism which greatly affected the religious culture of surrounding nations such as Korea. To my mind, the first two chapters on Shinto in the ancient and medieval periods are the best in the book, providing a balanced presentation of their subjects, although one could criticize some of the discussions, which don't seem sufficiently analytical in places.

Aside from its concise survey of the history of the tradition called Shinto, the most important contribution of this book is its use of the concept of 'religious system' as a way of defining what Shinto is, and how and why it has developed and changed over the centuries. In the authors' definition, a religious system consists of three inter-related elements—constituents, network and substance. The constituents of a tradition are both the 'makers' and the 'users', that is, the founders and subsequent maintainers of the tradition such as priests, and the believers, seen collectively and individually. The network is the physical and social means by which the tradition maintains itself, such as shrines and pilgrimages. Substance refers to the beliefs characteristic of the tradition. Using the general concept and its constituent elements, the authors trace the origin of the Shinto tradition showing how socio-political circumstances in the various periods affected each of the three elements, and how these elements in turn affected each other. This analytical approach to looking at the history of the Shinto tradition is a novel and fruitful way of approaching a topic which has been a notoriously slippery subject to define.

As with any work, one has some quibbles. First is the practice by Japanese authors and scholars of Japanese studies to overuse specifically Japanese terms for subjects for which there is a perfectly acceptable English term. This practice

is fairly widespread in Japanese studies scholarship, but is not common to scholarly practice in Chinese or Korean studies. For example, on page 143 there is a discussion of the *Hakamagi* ceremony, with no explanation of what the *hakamagi* is. Is the belt the *hakamagi*, or is it something else? Further on, we are told that the *hakamagi* differs from what adults wear in that it lacks a *yubinuki*—but we are not told what it is. The whole description of the ceremony would have been much clearer if it weren't loaded with extraneous Japanese terms where general English ones would do.

There are a few points of view with which one could disagree. For example, in the introduction on page 10 Inoue states that 'the concept of the ancestors in Japan is more inclusive than in China or Korea, and the practice of paying reverence to the ancestors has consistently occupied a larger proportion of religious activity than in other parts of East Asia'. To take the Korean case alone, there are Confucian rites of a wide range of types, shamanistic ancestral rites, non-shamanistic ones, Buddhist ones, and Christian substitutes for Confucian rites. Has Japan had more than this? Surely, the role of ancestral rituals in all of East Asia has been extremely important, and it would be incorrect to state that they have been more important in one nation than another simply because the rituals take a different form in different cultures.

This book should have a wide appeal to teachers of East Asian religions as a detailed textbook for upper-level undergraduates and taught postgraduates, as well as being a useful resource for scholars. The use of the concept of 'religious tradition' as an analytical framework is an important contribution and gives much food for thought for all scholars of religious studies.

JAMES H. GRAYSON

SUSAN L. BURNS:

Before the Nation: Kokugaku and the Imagining of Community in Early Modern Japan.

(Asia-Pacific: Culture, Politics, and Society.) x, 282 pp. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2003.

In *Before the Nation: Kokugaku and the Imagining of Community in Early Modern Japan*, Susan L. Burns provides an excellent corrective to the impression that kokugaku scholarship of the eighteenth century led almost inevitably to the development of modern Shinto nationalism. Deliberately challenging the 'four great men' genealogy of kokugaku that draws a straight line from Kada no Azumamaro to Kamo Mabuchi, Motoori Norinaga, and Hirata Atsutane, Burns focuses instead on Norinaga's analysis of the Divine Age chapters of the *Kojiki*, and on the subsequent reactions of Ueda Akinari, Fujitani Mitsue and Tachibana Moribe to his work. She thus highlights the great variety of thought within kokugaku, emphasizing that Norinaga's insistence on Japanese uniqueness and superiority was by no means characteristic of the movement as a whole.

Burns pursues two goals in this book: 'rethinking both [kokugaku's] meaning for Tokugawa society and its relationship with modern conceptions of national identity in Japan' (p. 220). In the bulk of the book, Burns beautifully accomplishes the first goal. She provides a solid, indeed fascinating, treatment of the works of various kokugaku thinkers, delineating the theoretical significance of scholars' competing positions in their eighteenth-century context. The final two chapters—which shift the focus away from Motoori Norinaga and

his contemporaries to the work of scholars after Hirata Atsutane and, in the last chapter, in the 1890s—prove more problematic.

Burns begins her analysis by examining the ‘pervasive sense of crisis’ (p. 20) of the eighteenth century, highlighting the role of the growing publishing industry in encouraging widespread discussion of contemporary problems. She then turns to the intellectual world of scholars of the ancient texts, emphasizing the transcultural, transhistorical focus on ethicality that had characterized Neo-Confucian and Buddhist interpretations of the Divine Age narratives until the late seventeenth century. With the rise of historical thinking, Burns then sees a new awareness that the ancient texts and their language could ‘reveal a system of ideas and values fundamentally different from those of the present’ (p. 53). She also sees, with the work of Motoori Norinaga (1730–1801), the demise of ethical interpretations in favour of the study of how people formed communities—especially *Japanese* communities.

In the next four chapters, Burns analyses the work of Norinaga and three scholars who reacted to his work. She examines their attitudes toward language, orality, *kami*, and the relationship of Japan to China, Buddhism and Confucianism, in order to understand their ideas of community and, in particular, the boundaries they posited between the public and private realms—where she locates the political significance of their work in opposition to Tokugawa ideology. Burns shows how Norinaga found in the *Kojiki* depictions of an original, now lost, community, thus validating ‘natural’ emotions and desires that could resist (at least in private life) the rigid, hierarchical values of Tokugawa society. Ueda Akinari (1734–1809), in contrast, used the inconsistencies of the texts to question both Norinaga’s ideal Japanese past and the official narratives of his own day. Fujitani Mitsue (1767–1823) read the narratives of the Divine Age as instructions concerning the proper relationship between superiors and inferiors, while Tachibana Moribe (1781–1849) used the *Kojiki* to highlight the role of the emperor and imperial rites in maintaining the border between the hidden and revealed worlds.

As Burns explains, consensus on the meaning of the ancient texts was only created later, when ‘Japanese learning’ became part of the university curriculum in the 1890s. Whereas Tokugawa-era kokugakusha had set themselves against the established hierarchy, however, Burns emphasizes that the kokugakusha of the Meiji era were themselves part of the ruling elite. Thus, they not only redefined kokugaku for a ‘modernizing Japan’, but enshrined the Hirata schools’ ‘four great men’ genealogy of kokugaku, against which Burns organized her book.

Herein lies the main weakness of *Before the Nation*. The first five chapters of the book constitute a solid work in their own right, examining scholars’ diverse interpretations of the ancient texts in the context of eighteenth-century thought. However, because Burns deliberately eschews what became the mainstream of later kokugaku—in particular, the work of Hirata Atsutane—the absent Atsutane looms over the last two chapters of the book. While Burns devotes a few pages to Hirata’s work at the beginning of her chapter on Tachibana Moribe, relying heavily on the analysis of Harry Harootunian, the ensuing interpretations suffer without her own detailed treatment of Hirata’s writings.

Interestingly, Burns’ avoidance of the mainstream narrative in her final chapter—on developments during the Meiji era—highlights a significant scholarly lacuna: studies of the man whom Burns rightfully calls ‘the most prominent kokugaku scholar in the immediate Restoration era’, Yano

Harumichi (p. 189). Here again, however, Burns devotes only a few pages to the influential Yano as preface to abbreviated considerations of the work of Konakamura Kiyonori, Haga Yaichi, Muraoka Tsunetsugu, and others. For a self-proclaimed “‘case study’” of how a self-consciously modern nationalism was constructed by deploying existing culturalist notions of community’, (p. 225) such summaries of these later scholars’ work—as opposed to the delightfully nuanced interpretations of earlier scholars’ writings—fail to explain the development of kokugaku-based nationalism in the modern era.

Beautifully written for a specialized audience, the few scattered editorial oversights and misspellings (e.g. Yasuda Yoshio for the prominent historian Yasumaru Yoshio) can be jarring. In sum, however, *Before the Nation* provides provocative insights into the varied logic and concerns of eighteenth-century kokugaku, with welcome summaries of later, less renowned scholars’ works as well.

SARAH THAL

SOUTH-EAST ASIA

ANN R. KINNEY

Worshiping Siva and Buddha: The Temple Art of East Java.

303 pp. Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 2003. £60.

This volume focuses on the temples and sculpture of East Java dated between the tenth and sixteenth centuries. In addition to providing a much-needed survey of the art of the kingdoms of Kadiri, Singasari and Majapahit, the descriptions are set out in a manner that is accessible to the general reader. Section 1, ‘Introduction to the religion and art of East Java’, adds to the book’s utility in this regard with two extended essays. The first, entitled ‘Hinduism and Buddhism in Indonesia’, was written by Marijke J. Klokke and succinctly discusses the arrival and development of both Hindu and Buddhist teachings to Indonesia from the fifth century CE. The international orientation and documentation of the transmission of Buddhist teachings is contrasted to the difficulty in tracing the more localized adaptations typical of Hindu deities by Javanese rulers. This theme of localization is then carried further with an introduction to Buddhist and Hindu adherence in the context of East Javanese developments. These include the merging of Hinduism and Buddhism, the importance of asceticism and the cults of deified ancestors, mountain veneration and the production of sacred water. The second essay of section 1, ‘The architecture and art of Ancient East Java’ by Lydia Kieven, defines the various forms of architecture often subsumed under the term ‘*Candi*’, ranging from ritual bathing places to hermitages and gateways. Some of the iconography of the narrative reliefs is also described, such as the animals with long floppy ears illustrated later in the book (p. 217) in the description of the Majapahit commemorative temple of Candi Rimbi. The importance of place in the context of sculpture, such as images of Garuda and Ganesha, is noted, one example being a 1.9 metre statue of King Airlangga as Vishnu on his mount Garuda found at the mid-eleventh century Candi Belahan (p. 65).

The site descriptions make up much of the book: section 2, ‘A new beginning in East Java 929–1222’; section 3, ‘The Singasari period, 1222–1292’; and section four, ‘The Majapahit period, 1293–1519’. Each opens with a

historical introduction, followed by accounts of significant temples and caves. These are laid out in a way that complements the text, offering a balance of colour plates and drawings. The two final parts are appendices, one containing summary paragraphs on sixteen sites not detailed elsewhere, plus a note by the photographer about successfully photographing sites in East Java. Finally, there is a brief glossary, a useful bibliography and an index.

Some 300 photographs and diagrams illustrate the book. The pictures include photographs taken by Helmi and earlier ones by Bakker for the 1990 volume *The Sculpture of Indonesia* by Jan Fontein (New York: Harry Abrams). There are additional photographs of pieces held in Amsterdam and in Indonesia, along with architectural drawings by Jacques Dumarçay. Other drawings are used as well, such as the plans of Bosch for Candi Jolotundo (977 CE.), a bathing place built on the western slopes of Mount Penanggungan. This mountain, located midway between Suryabaya and Malang, figures as Mount Meru in Javanese legend, with more than eighty structures built on its slopes between the tenth and sixteenth centuries. The entry illustrates the approach of the book, both in its format and approach.

In terms of design, the photographs taken at Candi Jolotundo are usefully combined with the plans and sculpture now kept at Trowulan and Jakarta. The sculptures illustrated include a 1.19m high fountain made from nine *linga* circled by a snake, and what remains of a series of sixteen relief carvings depicting the story of Udayana and his harp. Other panels portray members of the Pandawa clan, thought to refer both to the place of the Pandawas in the legendary ancestry of Javanese kings, and also to connect the *Mahābhārata's* Udayana with the historic Balinese prince of the same name. In a compact and balanced way, Kinney makes use of the panels to emphasize the combined sanctity of site in the context of the importance of forest meditation, legitimizing the royal house, and catalyzing the participation of deified ancestors. Earlier funerary functions attributed to these monumental structures are not supported by Kinney, who uses the absence of funerary ashes or parallel practices to suggest that Candi Jolotundo was built to commemorate the betrothal of Udayana to the Javanese princess Mahendradatta.

The synthesis of many practices and the significance of place in understanding East Javanese art are noted in each section of this volume. Remains indicate alternating combinations of ancestral deification, various types of Buddhist practice and veneration of Siva. For instance during the Singasari period, the last ruler was enshrined as Siva and Buddha at Candi Jawi, with the presence of statues of Bhairava being possible to link to both Siva and to Bhairava's Buddhist counterpart, Mahakala. Stylistic traits are not ignored with, for example, the masterpiece carving of Prajnaparamita illustrated and discussed (p. 146), and the fine stone sculpture of Durga found at Candi Jawi (p. 131) compared to the somewhat larger (1.57 metre) and more regal statue of this goddess slaying the demon Mahisha from Candi Singosari (p. 140). In the final section of the book, devoted to the Majapahit period, the discussion of deification images of deceased rulers continues. For instance in the description of the commemorative Candi Rimbi, sculptures of Parvati and the use of innovative meditations, *mudras*, are discussed in this context. As noted above, the synergy of ancestral deification and localized veneration practices provides an underlying theme for the book, one complemented by highlighting the strong indigenous influence seen in the artistic style and selection of subject matter. Both the authors and the publishers have produced a welcome addition to the literature on the incorporation of Buddhist and Hindu practices into the early kingdoms of South-East Asia.

ELIZABETH MOORE

CLAUDINE BAUTZE-PICRON:

The Buddhist Murals of Pagan: Timeless Vistas of the Cosmos.
xiv, 242 pp. Bangkok: Orchid Press, 2003.

There are few books on the eleventh to fourteenth century AD wall paintings of Pagan, making this a welcome contribution. These paintings, on the interior walls of the city's many remaining temples, are unmatched elsewhere in South-East Asia, and provide a wealth of information on the legacy of Pagan. Bautze-Picron's volume is organized into seven chapters: 1. The murals of Pagan, presentation; 2. The miraculous life of the Buddha; 3. The previous lives of the Buddha; 4. Dipankara and the Buddhas of the past—Mettaya, Buddha of the future; 5. Iconographic ornamentation; 6. The ornamental decoration; and 7. The murals of Pagan, a guide. To give an idea of the range of topics, chapter 1 covers depictions of the life of the Buddha, the multiplication of images and the flamed and the cosmological Buddha. Also dealt with are some of the complexities introduced by scholars such as Luce and Ba Shin in focusing analysis of the murals on their ink glosses in Mon and Burmese. The guide in chapter 7 consists of descriptions of thirty-six temples. A number of these have only received brief mention in English-language sources such as Pichard's *Inventory of Monuments at Pagan* (Vols 1–8, Paris/Gartmore: Unesco/Kiscadale Ltd, 1992–2001). However, they unfortunately do not include the various temples at Sale (Hsale) that are such a useful part of Bautze-Picron's work. The descriptions are followed by a conclusion, endnotes, bibliography, glossary, index of monuments, and a general index.

The book (A4 in size) has 254 colour plates. None of these are full-page, but many are at least half a page and give good detail from the scenes. Sometimes the division of the text makes them less effective than they might have been had they been arranged by temple. For example, the plates from the Loka-hteik-pan are well lit, which is difficult in this temple; however, they are scattered throughout the book, so that when one comes to read the description of the temple, finding the references disrupts the author's aim of presenting the inner space 'globally' (p. xiii). The plus side of the plethora of examples is that a number of parallels incorporate paintings at smaller or lesser known temples. On the whole, the book is more useful in this regard, linking various details, than in its thematic aspects. For instance, the concept of a 'cosmological' Buddha is referred to in the foreword and conclusion, as a 'cosmological being' (p. xiii) and in the context of the 'cosmological nature of the Buddha' (p. 208). Both visual and textual evidence for this would have benefited from clarification. This 'cosmologic understanding' (p. 5) is placed within a Theravāda context although, as has been pointed out by Handlin elsewhere, cosmographic inquiries concerned not the Buddha's nature but soteriology.

Not only the emergence, but the flowering, of Pagan has yet to be fully documented and we lack much information about how the varied temple plans related to local sponsoring sects or to more international contemporary movements in Buddhist thinking. Bautze-Picron makes some reference especially to this second aspect in her repeated mention of contact with Bihar and Bengal, resisting the notion that this interchange also brought adherence to Vajrayāna practices then developing in north-east India. Here the author acknowledges the work of Frasnich in documenting the architectural links to the Bodhgaya pyramidal spire seen in the temples and votive tablets of Pagan. Bautze-Picron also discusses the 'Mon' temples and ink glosses at Pagan, along with the traditional bringing of Theravāda texts to Pagan from the Mon city of Thaton

in the late eleventh century. However, little else is said about the nature of the Buddhist legacy from Thaton, although the reviewer's research on the walled sites of the Mon State links many of these with the Asokan missionary tradition and the development of hierarchies from which the later reputation of Thaton could well have emerged. Another route of Buddhist influence discussed by Bautze-Picron is that of Sri Lanka, which despite the assistance of Anawratha in sending monks and other aid for the resuscitation of the monastic community, has provided little in the way of stylistic affinities to explain the wall paintings of Pagan. Inclusion of at least reference to these varied interchanges at Pagan is important, for in common with many of the region's other monumental cities, the contemporary texts are relatively scarce; with the material remain significant sources from which to try to reconstruct ancient practice.

It is easier to find fault with a volume of this sort than it is to put one together. At times the book reads as if it suffered from editing or perhaps translation, for Bautze-Picron is able to draw links from a wide range of the paintings at Pagan and would have found it difficult otherwise to devise the book's chapters. In the documenting of the subjects covered in the murals, therefore, Bautze-Picron's book offers much that has not previously been published. And to have this compressed within one volume, while compromised in certain respects, makes this book a very useful reference. It can only be hoped that it will encourage more scholars to address the many important facets of Pagan yet to be fully understood.

ELIZABETH MOORE

AFRICA

MICHAEL JACKSON:

In Sierra Leone.

xiv, 226 pp. Durham, NC: Duke University Press. 2004. £15.50.

The anthropologist Michael Jackson returned to Sierra Leone in 2002 in response to an invitation from the veteran politician S. B. Marah. His mission was to begin 'ghost writing' [p. 199] Marah's biography. Jackson's previous ethnographic work on Marah's people, the Kuranko, had initiated an earlier intimacy and Marah, now the leader of the majority party in Sierra Leone's legislature, turned to an old friend with a literary track-record to turn his memories into a book. Marah died in November 2003, aged 79, before this publication went to press. But this book is unlikely to be the biography that Marah hoped for. A considerable proportion of the work is taken up with extensive quotations from Marah, which appear to be transcripts of many hours of tape-recorded recollection. Whether those extensive passages within quotation marks have been edited or 'improved' by the author is never made clear; if the passages in quotation are indeed transcriptions of unmodified speech, then Marah's oral fluency was truly remarkable. The use of page after page of transcription raises some further uncomfortable questions. The late S. B. Marah is not, for example, formally credited with any share of the authorship of this book.

However it was processed and however it is presented, Marah's own understanding of his long political career is valuable. There is so little first-person recollection, so little serious memoir material generated by African politicians,

that any addition to that slight literature is welcome. And these memories span an exceptionally long and increasingly brutal era which begins in colonial Sierra Leone, takes in two extended periods in jail and another in exile in Conakry, and then takes us up to the cruel and unusual horrors of Sierra Leone's very bloody recent past. In common with most autobiographers, Marah presents himself as the virtually faultless centre of the universe. To Western eyes, the self-portrait might appear almost unremittingly harsh. He was an excellent if frightening example of a West African 'Big Man'. Like most such figures he was both a generous patron and a cruelly exploitative boss. His capacity pragmatically to forgive the seemingly unforgiveable was married to an unnerving vindictiveness. And his definitions of corruption do not include his own naked nepotism and regional favouritism. His patriarchal power to reward or punish was drawn in equal measure from wider understandings of traditional and kinship authority and from sheer economic clout. And it is a weakness of the book that there is no exploration of his history of wealth creation—and loss. For example Jackson recalls meeting 'S.B.' in London in 1985 when, after a visit to Harrods, Marah proceeds to Brixton where a 'Nigerian customs agent' arranges the shipment of *two* Mercedes sedans to Sierra Leone (p. 126). And those readers who would like to learn more about S. B. Marah's close relationship with the very successful Lebanese businessman Tony Yazbeck will learn little from this book. On far too many occasions Jackson's role as interviewer appears to be timid at best and it is an unexplained reticence. None the less the embedded autobiography—or maybe biography—is not a flattering portrait. But thankfully this is not an account crafted by Marah to accord with the expectations of a Western audience looking for selfless, democratic men-of-the-people. Consequently it has far more explanatory force than hagiography.

The core material for this book was collected against an especially wretched background. Marah's own account allows us a personal view of Sierra Leone's descent into almost unimaginable horror. The excesses of the civil war following the coup in 1997 included amputation along with random killing and rape. Marah's political generation must bear some blame for the construction of a state so weak that it could not hold the ring against extremely violent opportunism. Jackson sees the tragic human consequences of all of this on a daily basis and as a manifestly sensitive human being clearly feels bound to comment upon the human condition. This would have been a much better book if he had resisted that temptation. All too often his numerous digressions slide into mawkishness, pretentiousness, cliché and statements of the obvious. And all too frequently these embarrassing passages are buttressed by unnecessary citations of Hannah Arendt, Nietzsche or Walter Benjamin as though that makes it all right. For example he writes on the biographical imperative

...this urge to retrace one's steps into the past arises neither from nostalgia nor from one's needs to tell one's story to the world. It is a way of cheating death. An instinct for life in the face of oblivion. For to recollect the innocence of childhood or the vigor of youth in a moment of peril is to retrieve a sense of life's infinite possibility, to conjure a period in our life when the world seemed ours for the taking, and we thought we would never die. It is, in essence, to recapture a sense of our capacity to act and initiate something new for as Hannah Arendt notes, action is synonymous with our capacity to bring new life into the world. Mortality is thus countermanded by natality, and it is this unquenchable desire for renewal, this refusal to go

gently into that good night, that explains why we go back, stumbling through the darkness, in search of the light that flooded and filled our first conscious years. The days of wine and roses. When our lives stretched before us like a field of dreams... (p. 64).

If only that were a one-off; but examples of redundant, space-consuming over-writing abound here. This journal's word limit allows me only one more quotation but that must be:

That I found consolation in Epictetus says something about the mood of disenchantment that gripped me at that time (p. 129).

The late S.B Marah wins hands-down when it comes to being straightforward and, by so doing, rescues this book.

RICHARD RATHBONE

SIBEL BARUT KUSIMBA:

African Foragers: Environment, Technology, Interactions.

xxi, 284 pp. Walnut Creek, CA: Altamira Press, 2003. £24.95.

Dr Kusimba's ambitious aim in this book is to provide a comprehensive account of African foragers from their first appearance to recent times. She provides many valuable insights but the endeavour is marred both in concept and in execution. There appears to be some uncertainty as to whether and to what extent hominids prior to *Homo sapiens* should be included. Kusimba classes these hominids as 'Early Foragers', states that they are not her prime concern (pp. xviii–xix), and then devotes much space to a survey of their archaeology. Later populations are discussed in more detail, being designated 'Advanced Foragers' or 'hunter-gatherers': it is not clear whether Kusimba regards these terms as synonymous or wishes to imply a distinction. The behavioural distinction between her 'Early Foragers' and 'Advanced Foragers' is likewise not made wholly clear. It is refreshing, however, to receive a book which treats foragers and foraging as integral components of the African cultural mosaic both in prehistory and in recent times. Such an approach can, if widely heeded, contribute much both to archaeological studies and to inter-cultural understanding.

The book is a somewhat unsatisfactory amalgam of detail and generalization. Useful data are presented on a small collection of 'Middle Stone Age' artefacts excavated from Nelson Bay Cave in South Africa and now held at the Field Museum in Chicago, and on the results of excavations in two areas of Kenya, at Lukenya Hill and Kisio Rockshelter. These presentations are welded into a wide-ranging and thought-provoking synthesis but are not in themselves adequate to support the overall narrative. Your reviewer suspects that the book has developed through several changes of plan and that inadequate attention has been paid to its general structure.

A larger number of specific examples would have provided a firmer basis for Kusimba's narrative. There is very little from West Africa and virtually nothing from the extensive terrain which lies between her Kenyan and South African examples. It is particularly surprising to see no reference to volume III of the Kalambo Falls report, or to Barham's work at Mumbwa, which has such important implications for the early development of microlithic technology.

A strength of the book is the attention paid to relations and interactions between populations having different economic bases, although such matters

have in fact received more attention from some previous writers than Dr Kusimba's citations imply. The discussion would have been clearer if confusion over use of the term 'pastoralist' had been avoided: as in much current archaeological writing the word is used without distinction both in the social anthropological sense of someone whose life-style is dominated by herding, and to refer to anyone who owns some domestic animals. It is surprising, too, that more use is not made of linguistic studies to illustrate interactions between peoples.

Neither author nor publisher has been sufficiently assiduous during the final stages of producing this book. Proofreading and checking have both been incomplete. The terms 'Oromo' and 'Galla' are inconsistently applied, likewise '!Kung' and 'Ju/'hoansi', the latter pair being similarly confused in the index. Geography is sometimes erroneous, as in placement of the Mbuti in Gabon and Torralba in the Pyrenees; several sites are misplaced on the maps at figs. 1.1, 5.1 and 7.4. The index appears to have been compiled by a person or computer with little if any knowledge of the book's subject matter. The maps of vegetation patterns at different periods are excellent, as are some of the illustrations of artefacts; others, however, are of mediocre quality and there has been little attempt to standardize style or scale.

DAVID W. PHILLIPSON

GENERAL

MICHAEL PEARSON:

The Indian Ocean.

(Seas in History.) xi, 330 pp. London and New York: Routledge, 2003. £50.

Reflecting the growing interest in entangled histories in general and the Indian Ocean in particular, Michael Pearson has now written a story of the Indian Ocean since the beginning of history. His work is the latest in a series of monographs on this ocean, and is particularly remarkable for the scope of themes it covers in addition to its time span. Pearson contrasts this ocean with the (North) Atlantic, which was dominated by the Europeans, and the Pacific, which he considers to be a Euro-American creation. According to Pearson the Indian Ocean, by contrast, boasts a long history of contacts between its various shores through travel, trade and the exchange of peoples and ideas. As for the Europeans, he argues that their dominance is mainly a phenomenon of the past 200 years, i.e. only a fraction of 6,000 years of history. This places the Indian Ocean closer to the Mediterranean in the Braudelian sense, even if Pearson cautions the reader against any easy comparison. He points to the different sizes of these seas, adding, however, that this may be 'a difference of scale, not a generic difference' (p. 4). Furthermore, Pearson dramatically limits the extension of the connections between the different countries bordering the Indian Ocean, or indeed any sea, by arguing that only narrow strips of the littoral, in addition to the port cities, formed part of any oceanic system. He thus claims to 'look from the sea to the land' (p. 5), a topic he takes up again in his second chapter which discusses people who live on and by the sea. Thus, Pearson accepts that the main orientation of Africa, the Arabian Peninsula and India was inland. South-East Asian differences are noted, but

then present-day Indonesia is already considered to be 'outside the Indian Ocean proper' (p. 16).

Following the Braudelian attention to deep structure, the first chapter features not only the geological genesis of the ocean and its extensions but explains such issues as climate change, tides and waves. This includes the currents and winds, most notably the monsoon winds, which for so long were crucial for the human interaction that dominates the remainder of this book.

Pearson's coverage of the early myths pertaining to the ocean as well as early travel experiences (chapter 3) commences his impressive *tour de force* through human history. The frequently heard notion of the Indian Ocean as a 'Muslim lake' (p. 95) is confirmed, but Pearson surpasses earlier discussions of Muslim networks by engaging with questions as diverse as navigation techniques, conversion and marriage policies, all the while including Chinese trade almost *en passant*. The European introduction into the Indian Ocean system in the sixteenth century, which turned into outright domination from the eighteenth century, is discussed in chapter 5. While structural continuities are presented in the following chapter, a certain bias towards the last 500 years, i.e. the period since the Europeans first appeared in the area, cannot be denied. But then again, it is European archives which provide the bulk of the material available on the Indian Ocean.

None the less, even after the appearance of Europeans, the topics covered by Pearson differ substantially from the standard accounts of the European expansion. He not only explains the increased British dominance after the Seven Years' War (1756–63) and Britain's strategy of monopolizing Indian cloth production (chapter 7), he also discusses the development of a world economy in the nineteenth century by arguing with the dramatic increase in trade volume, integrating these developments not just in world economic issues but the technological revolution from sail to container between the mid-nineteenth and mid-twentieth centuries. Rather than subscribing to the more common view of technological superiority, Pearson argues that heavy subsidies and access to political power helped Europeans to gain a quasi-monopoly in the new technology. One of the most interesting parts of the book is his section on travellers and travel conditions, as well as on maritime labour.

Integration into the world economy also meant increasingly that the history of the Indian Ocean could no longer be written in isolation from wider developments. Thus, it becomes history 'in' the ocean and as such closely linked to global developments. Pearson exemplifies this in his last chapter by discussing the impact of the container revolution in terms of an increasing dissociation between maritime labour, bound by passport laws, visa requirements and the like to their ships, and the various ports which increasingly grew outside cities into mere entrepôts. He introduces the growth industry of pleasure cruises and tourism, as well as completely new ways of farming pearls, to show how the relationship between man and the sea has changed. Territorial claims to the ocean (the 200 miles exclusive economic zone) have narrowed the common space, the latter being additionally threatened by over-exploitation and ecological disaster.

Pearson not only covers a remarkably wide range of topics, he also writes very well. One gets a sense of the ocean, its fish and waves, the missionaries, merchants and slaves crossing it, as well as of those who worked the ships, docks and fisheries. The lengthy quotations from archives and travel reports enhance the readability of his work. In addition, he refers to many of the debates that have exercised historians during the past decades. Perhaps this is one of the book's few weaknesses: Pearson alludes to these debates, but he

seldom takes a clear position or even presents a thesis of his own. Rather, he provides the reader with well-balanced arguments only to move to the next topic. Arguably, however, a rather short work of synthesis (given the topic it covers) can do no more. Moreover, Pearson's select bibliography and footnotes offer the hopefully many readers whose appetite has been whetted much food for further reading and investigation. The book will certainly become the standard account for the history of the Indian Ocean for some time, appealing to students and scholars as well to a broader interested audience.

ULRIKE FREITAG

ULRIKE FREITAG

Indian Ocean Migrants and State Formation in Hadhramaut: Reforming the Homeland.

(Social, Economic and Political Studies of the Middle East and Asia, 87.) xv, 589 pp. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2003. €150.

Freya Stark, exploring 'the southern gates of Arabia' in 1935, remarked that one could as easily get about in the castellated towns of the Wadi Hadhramaut speaking Malay as Arabic. By the early twentieth century some 25 per cent of Hadhramis lived outside Arabia around the Indian Ocean littoral, much the largest proportion in the Netherlands East Indies and British Malaya. There they traded, moved back and forth to the homeland, became wealthy, sent remittances—and new ideas—home, helped establish mosques, schools and newspapers for their Muslim co-religionists, and, as few Hadhrami women travelled, established local families. It is the significance for the homeland of this diaspora, along with other imperial connections, that provide the main focus of Ulrike Freitag's important and remarkably well-documented study of modernization and state formation in the Hadramaut proper between about 1850 and 1950.

There is a considerable range of earlier and more recent literature on the modern history of the Hadhramaut and its complex social organization to which Freitag has already contributed, notably as co-organizer (with William G. Clarence-Smith) of a major international conference at SOAS in 1995, whose proceedings were published as *Hadrami Traders, Scholars and Statesmen in the Indian Ocean 1750s–1960s* (Leiden: Brill, 1997). Three of the participants in that conference have since published monographs bearing on the subject of the present book, Natalie Mobini-Kesheh's *The Hadrami Awakening: Community and Identity in the Netherlands East Indies, 1914–1942* (Ithaca, NY, 1999), Linda Boxberger's *On the Edge of Empire: Hadramawt, Emigration and the Indian Ocean, 1880s–1930s* (Albany, NY, 2002), and Friedhelm Hartwig's *Hadramaut und das indische Fürstentum van Hyderabad. Hadramitische Sultanatsgrundungen und Migration im 19. Jahrhundert* (Würzburg, 2000) which looks at the role played in the homeland by Hyderabadi Hadhramis. Freitag's study, magisterial in scope and execution, draws this and much other material together and utilizes a wide range of additional published and unpublished Hadhrami sources, along with fieldwork in Yemen and South-East Asia, for what must be, for the time being at least, the definitive account of twentieth century Hadhrami experience.

Central to Freitag's careful historical account of the intricate processes by which the Hadhramaut made the transition from a rivalrous, segmentary tribal

society to something close to a stable unitary polity and then to absorption in the Republic of South Yemen (later enlarged in combination with North Yemen as the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen) is, as her title indicates, the matter of 'reform'. This term (along with its Arabic original *'islah*) has many interpretations, and it might be argued that Freitag, in emphasizing the forms taken by political, institutional and educational innovation, rather short-changes an underlying Islamic reform derived from *salafi* perturbations originating in Egypt and echoed in the Indies. None the less, her analysis of social change in the Hadhramaut and its effects is penetrating.

A distinguishing characteristic of Hadhrami society in the homeland was the social and moral ascendancy of the *sayyids*, families claiming descent from the Prophet Muhammad through his daughter Fatima and her husband 'Ali, who enjoyed unchallenged status and prestige, as well as a considerable command of material resources. In the diaspora, however, and especially in South-East Asia, this came seriously into question on religious grounds, as broader Hadhrami migrant groups shared in forming 'an emergent bourgeoisie of portfolio capitalists' (p. 9), that had a strong economic interest in pressing for political as well as social reform in the homeland. A pivotal chapter on 'The Hadrami renaissance in South East Asia' deals in detail with these developments, and their embodiment in modern schools, new kinds of voluntary associations, and the establishment of a lively press. Though Freitag is necessarily indebted to Mobini-Kesheh in particular for some of her material here, this is supplemented by additional fieldwork in Java and Singapore, and by a number of vividly recounted family histories.

Direct British imperial involvement in Hadhrami affairs, from its base in the Aden protectorate, was reluctant at first, but grew in the late 1930s, when the Qu'ayti sultanate in 1937 accepted a Resident Adviser, W. H. Ingrams. The resulting 'Ingram's peace' between warring Hadhrami factions, along with British encouragement to progressive elements in society, produced a situation somewhat conducive to both political stability and social reform, though the latter remained contested. Freitag details these developments with careful attention to a wide range of Hadhrami voices on the issues. The final two chapters of the book delineate the growth of nationalist politics amidst Marxist upheavals in the region, and take the story up to the evacuation of the British from Aden in the late 1960s and the accession of the Hadhramaut to the South Yemen republic.

The book has annexed to it chronological lists of Hadrami voluntary associations and newspapers, and has a 28-page bibliography, an excellent analytical index, four useful maps and a modest number of in-text photographs. It is produced to the high standards we have come to expect of Brill, but at a price that is likely to put it beyond the reach of all but specialist libraries.

WILLIAM R. ROFF

PETER SMITH (ed.):

Bahá'is in the West.

(Studies in the Bábí and Bahá'í Religions, 14.) xii, 307 pp. Los Angeles: Kalimát Press, 2004. \$32.50.

The Bahá'í faith belongs to the few 'old' new religious movements which have managed to establish themselves permanently in the religious scene. Having its origins within the confines of messianic Shiism in nineteenth-century Iran, it

has now spread around the globe with about 7 million adherents worldwide. While the very few scholars of the Bahā'ī faith paid particular attention to its origins in the nineteenth-century Middle East, little research has been undertaken into its spread to the West. In terms of numbers, the Bahā'ī faith can be considered to be a 'Third-World religion', with the vast majority of its followers living in South America, Africa and Asia. However, because of the dominant role of the Western world, the relatively small Bahā'ī communities in North America and Europe have played a vital role in the construction and expansion of the Bahā'ī faith as a new religious movement. The articles in this volume, edited by Peter Smith, present different episodes in the history of the Bahā'īs in the West.

Smith begins with a sociological survey of Western Bahā'ī communities. He distinguishes different phases in the religion's development, starting with the establishment of the first communities in North America from 1894 onwards, and its gradual expansion into Europe in the early twentieth century. Of particular importance is the organizational transformation of the community which began in the 1920s. Until then, the Bahā'ī community was characterized by charismatic forms of leadership. Head of the entire community was 'Abdu'l-Bahā' (1844–1921), son of the prophet-founder of the Bahā'ī faith Bahā'ullāh (1817–1892). His charismatic style of leadership was replaced by more institutionalized forms when his grandson Shawqī Effendī Rabbānī (1897–1957) succeeded him as head of the community. He initiated a large-scale institutionalization of the Bahā'ī community with the establishment of local and national 'spiritual assemblies'. One encounters a textbook example of what Max Weber described as the 'routinization of charisma'. Despite their small numbers, Western Bahā'ī communities established the model for the structure, administration and organization of the Bahā'ī community worldwide. Peter Smith concludes the general survey with information on the numerical spread of Bahā'īs in the West; class, age and gender distribution and religious backgrounds. This information is substantiated with tables comparing the numerical growth and geographical expansion of the Bahā'īs in different countries of the Western world.

In the second article Moojan Momen has collected and edited written accounts of several Bahā'ī communities from 1919–20. John E. Esslemont, an early Bahā'ī convert from Scotland, wrote one of the earliest introductions to the Bahā'ī faith, *Bahá'u'lláh and the New Era* (first edition, London, 1923). In this book, he intended to include short surveys on different Bahā'ī communities and asked leading representatives from various parts of the Bahā'ī world to send him reports on their communities. However, these reports were never included in his book and were kept in his own handwriting in the national archive of the British Bahā'ī community. Moojan Momen collected them and has published them for the first time.

Three articles deal with specific episodes in the early history of the Western Bahā'īs. György Lederer examines 'Abdu'l-Bahā's visit to Budapest in 1913. From 1912–13, 'Abdu'l-Bahā' undertook extensive journeys to Europe and North America to visit the recently established new communities and to raise public awareness of the new faith in the West. Lederer provides a diary of 'Abdu'l-Bahā's stay in Budapest.

R. Jackson Armstrong-Ingram looks at 'a bit of extraneous matter' (p. 129) which occurred at a Bahā'ī convention in Chicago in 1910. One Chicago Bahā'ī, Henry Clayton Thompson, who chaired the convention, suddenly made messianic claims during the meeting. Armstrong-Ingram provides the background to the events which led to Thompson's claims and provides interesting insights into the religious milieu in which the Bahā'ī faith was

established in North America. According to Armstrong-Ingram, 'Thompson was not simply an isolated madman or deluded fool. Rather he exemplified several strands of development and ideology in the American Bahá'í community at that time' (p. 143).

Loni Bramson, in her article on the first two plans of the National Spiritual Assembly of the Bahá'ís in North America (1926–34), provides a paradigmatic case study of the routinization of charisma in the early American Bahá'í community. These plans constituted the first systematic efforts for the expansion and development of the community and centralized authority under the auspices of the National Spiritual Assembly. As part of the plans, a central budget was established and communal meetings were formalized. These institutional changes were later to be adopted by other Bahá'í communities around the world and characterize the communal life of the Bahá'ís until today. Bramson's description of the relationship between the American National Spiritual Assembly and the head of the international Bahá'í community Shawqí Effendi provides new insights into the way these organizational changes were introduced. While Bahá'í accounts of Shawqí Effendi's ministry portray him as the driving force behind the institutionalization of the community, Bramson perceives a far more subtle interaction between him and the leaders of the different national communities. American Bahá'ís developed many administrative models which found Shawqí Effendi's approval, and he then prescribed their adoption in other Bahá'í communities around the world.

The three accounts of the beginnings of the Bahá'í communities in Australia (Graham Hassall), Denmark (Margit Warburg) and Scotland (Ismael Velasco) basically follow the same patterns. They provide historical and sociological surveys on these communities from the arrival and conversion of the first Bahá'ís to the establishment of the first local and national administrative institutions.

The articles collected in this volume illustrate various aspects of the history and development of Bahá'í communities in the West, particularly looking at their early history in the first half of the twentieth century. The common motif of these articles is the gradual institutionalization of the Bahá'í community as part of the process of establishing it as a distinct religious organization. Given the survey nature of most articles, the presentation is very informative and insightful. However, many of the articles lack analytical depth. By providing mere information, they fail to address vital questions regarding the first Western Bahá'í communities: how did the religious milieu from which the first converts came shape community life? What tensions arose between those Bahá'ís who considered the Bahá'í faith to be an inclusive interfaith movement and those with a more exclusivist understanding? What problems did the early Western Bahá'ís face during the institutionalization process? All of the articles touch upon these questions but do not deliver a rigorous examination. One exception is Jackson Armstrong-Ingram's article on the Thompson case. Thompson's messianic revelations delivered at one of the early Bahá'í conventions in Chicago offers a good example of the religious milieu of the early American Bahá'ís. Apparently, in such a milieu it was not uncommon to make charismatic claims to authority. Loni Bramson also addresses more profound questions by looking at the emergence of institutionalized leadership in the American Bahá'í community and of formalized communal organization. Nevertheless, all the articles are original pieces of research and are meant to prepare the ground for further studies. In concluding his survey article, Peter Smith puts forward this intention: 'I would hope that the present summary has the value of alerting the readers to some of the research questions that need to

be addressed, and of encouraging other researchers to take up the work of examining them' (p. 52).

OLIVER SCHARBRODT

ROZINA VISRAM:

Asians in Britain: 400 Years of History.

xii, 488 pp. London and Sterling, Virginia: Pluto Press, 2002.

£14.99.

Following her pioneering *Ayahs, Lascars and Princes: Indians in Britain 1700–1947* (London Pluto Press, 1986), a much-needed study which established her reputation in the field, the author, working throughout as an independent scholar, has now expanded her coverage beyond these three major groups of Indian immigrants and into earlier periods. The present work, again painstakingly produced and elaborately documented with copious notes, as is appropriate for a historical study of this kind, traces the trajectories of South Asian people in Britain from 1600, a time when trading contact between Britain and India first began, with the founding of the East India Company. Very soon thereafter, the first Indians were brought to Britain, often to be baptized (we know from church records that they existed) and equally often to disappear without trace thereafter. Thus, the first Indian that we encounter in Britain from Visram's researches is a youth by the name of Peter, baptized in London on 22 December 1616 in the presence of 'the Privy Council, the Lord Mayor and Aldermen, and the Governors of the East India Company' (p. 1). Match that with Prince Charles attending the first new citizenship ceremony in London in 2004!

Amazingly, we also learn that Peter had been brought to London in 1614 by a priest, who had taught him to read and write and found him able to learn fast. He then accompanied the priest back to India in 1617, and wrote some letters from there in Latin. Then this transient, as Visram calls him (p. 2), vanishes from the radar and others appear, to settle and eventually die in the UK, where the author seems to have roamed many old graveyards, enlisting the help of private researchers by drawing attention to her work in local newspapers.

A snippet is often all we get, as the majority of early Indians in Britain led an anonymous existence (p. 8). But one cannot blame the author, and should instead admire her method of trawling through these old records and dragging to light all kinds of quaint detail that might be (and are indeed) of interest to certain people. This book is clearly a labour of love, and the reviewer learnt a lot about too many fascinating little things to record here. One of our multi-racial students at SOAS found her great-grandmother, married to a man from Peshawar, in the pages of this book and has been able to start a personal journey of discovery that helps to explain her unusual family name. Such snippets are often highly intriguing, making this book a potentially delightful feast for a very wide and varied readership. There is something for every taste, not least the culinary details. We learn that by 1784 'curry and rice had become house specialities in some fashionable restaurants in London's Piccadilly, the Norris Street Coffee House advertising it as such as early as 1773' (p. 6). And Madhur Jaffrey and other queens of spicy foods had an early predecessor in Hannah Glasse and her 1747 cookbook, which 'contained a recipe "to make a curry the Indian way" as well as for making "a pellow" (*pilau*)' (p. 6).

As a finely painted historical documentation of the Asian presence in the UK, this is the most comprehensive and authoritative treatise to date. It is a lively account of how people of Indian origin came to Britain in all kinds of capacities, not only as servants and sailors, but later as curious sojourners, students, businessmen, political campaigners, exiled leaders or deposed royalty, not to mention pioneers of medicine and women's rights. Ultimately, South Asians came in gradually increasing numbers as workers and settlers whose descendants largely make up the millions of Asians in the UK today. The coverage in this book rightly finishes in 1947, since there is a huge literature on various post-1947 developments of the Asian presence in Britain. Visram is entirely right to argue repeatedly that there is still much historical material to be researched, for the more recent period as well, and that especially local resources will prove to be immensely fertile. Hopefully, the author will have enough energy for more work along her present lines. No one researcher could ever dare to hope for a complete record of everything that exists to document the long and richly varied Asian presence all over Britain.

One could pick up a number of issues to discuss the various contexts of the book, grouped into chapters like 'Early arrivals, 1600–1830', 'A community in the making, 1830s to 1914', 'Parliamentarians, revolutionaries and suffragettes' and the final 'Contributions in the Second World War', but a brief review cannot replace reading this resourceful book. I noted specifically that more recent historical patterns of Asian settlement were being set in those early days, starting from the major port cities, including London, and then gradually fanning inland through pedlars and other pioneers. It is correctly reflected that the Midlands was not initially a major area of South Asian settlement and became so only after 1947, mainly due to East African Asian migration.

The study, and its faithful reports from copious documents, is interspersed with social comment by the author, who demonstrates special sensitivity to socio-political issues such as changes in race relations over time. If earlier it had been possible to buy African slaves (p. 4), later times found an abundance of employment opportunities for domestic servants from India, some of whom were left stranded in Britain and many of whom perished in the cold, it seems. Visram's particular interest in the Lascars, mainly South Asian seamen, of whom there were already 10–12,000 by the 1850s (p. 33) and 51,000 by 1914 (p. 54) results in detailed accounts also of their legal position as subjects of the Empire, yet they were treated as second-class citizens and deprived of rights that should have been officially theirs. It is not surprising to read that the rhetoric of equality of status for all the Crown's subjects was not borne out in practice, and that various forms of discrimination, both overt and subtle, affected Indian and other non-white colonials. Differential treatment by officials, coupled with much private discrimination, did not make life easy for many Asians and probably taught them that full-scale assimilation was not going to be a viable option. Other reviewers of this book have been better placed to comment on the effects this has had on the life histories of the predecessors (the term 'ancestors' is studiously avoided) of the present-day British Asians and on the current population.

Calls for repatriation have reverberated since the amazing, disastrous Sierra Leone episode of 1786–87 and it is evident from Visram's study that many individuals must have left Britain more or less voluntarily over time. But others came, and from an earlier small population dominated by Ayahs, Lascars and Princes, gradually a more complete picture emerges of an immensely varied (and thus entirely normal and human) large collection of people for whom we find it difficult today to agree on a common label. Whatever this commonality may be called, Visram deserves abundant praise for having produced this wonderful book on Asians in Britain. It is at the same

time an intriguing read and a challenging reassessment, in the light of historical sources, documented in the copious notes and select bibliography at the end, of the economic, political, social and cultural lives of Asians in Britain, within the context of colonialism, race, gender and class.

WERNER MENSKI

SHORT NOTICES

MATHIEU TILLIER:

Vies des Cadis de Miṣr 237/851–366/976. Extrait du Raḥ al-iṣr ‘an quḍāt Miṣr d’Ibn Ḥaḡar al-‘Asqalānī. (Preface by Thierry Bianquis.)

(Cahier des Annales islamologiques 24.) xviii, 212 pp. Cairo: Institut Français d’archéologie orientale, 2002.

Extracts from Ibn Ḥajar (d. Cairo, 852/1449), *Raḥ al-iṣr ‘an quḍāt Miṣr*, were first published by Rhuvon Guest as an appendix to his edition of *The Governors and Judges of Egypt* by al-Kindī (d. Old Cairo, 350/961), E. J. W. Gibb Memorial Series 19 (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1912). Tillier has translated most of them with introduction and notes. The whole of *Raḥ al-iṣr*, rearranged alphabetically with some additions by a disciple to Ibn Ḥajar, is at last available as edited by ‘Alī Muḥammad ‘Umar (Cairo: Maktabat al-Khānjī, 1418/1998).

Tillier’s introduction and notes are efficient, with a certain stress on administrative history (as opposed to, *inter alia*, the history of Islamic law). The translation seems unexceptionable. I regret only that Tillier cites nothing in German. Three outstanding works occur to me: Heinz Halm, *Die Ausbreitung der šāfi’itischen Rechtsschule von den Anfängen bis zum 8./14. Jahrhundert*, Beihefte zum tübinger Atlas des vorderen Orients, B (Geisteswissenschaften), 4 (Wiesbaden: Ludwig Reichert, 1974), replete with lists of qadis; Gerhard Conrad, *Die Quḍāt Dimašq und der madhhab al-Auzā’i*, Beirut Texte und Studien 46 (Beirut: Franz Steiner, 1994), largely concerned with the literary history of qadi lists but also with important remarks on the Awzā’i school to which one of Tillier’s qadis allegedly adhered; and Baber Johansen, ‘Wahrheit und Geltungsanspruch: zur Begründung und Begrenzung der Autorität des Qadi-Urteils im islamischen Recht’, *La Giustizia nell’Alto Medioevo*, Settimane di Studio del Centro italiano di studi sull’Alto Medioevo, 44, 2 vols. (Spoleto: Presso la sede del Centro, 1997), pp. 975–1074, with important comments on Egypt in particular, although especially just before Tillier’s period.

CHRISTOPHER MELCHERT

JÉRÔME LENTIN and ANTOINE LONNET (eds):

Mélanges David Cohen: Études sur le langage, les langues, les dialectes, les littératures, offertes par ses élèves, ses collègues, ses amis, présentées à l’occasion de son quatre-vingtième anniversaire. liii, 764 pp. Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose, 2003. €52.

This volume, originally planned to commemorate the seventieth birthday of the great French linguist and Semiticist, David Cohen, contains contributions

from seventy of his students and colleagues. It begins with an account and a bibliography of his extensive works together with reviews of his books. The contributions include letters from Maxime Rodinson, Laurence Lentin and Michel Gauthier-Darley, and articles on a huge range of topics. Articles deal with aspects of several varieties of Arabic, including Classical Arabic, the Semitic and the Indo-European language families, and on the following extant and extinct languages: Zway, Ge'ez, Amharic, Tigrinya, Afar, Akkadian, Aramaic, Sabaeen, Biblical Hebrew, Berber, Beja, Thai, Modern South Arabian languages, French, German, Greek, English. The topics dealt with include: lexicography, diglossia, dialectology, historical linguistics, phonology, morphology, syntax, semantics, sociolinguistics, literature, and mathematics.

The huge diversity within this set of articles reflects the vital diversity of David Cohen's own research interests, interests which themselves celebrate diversity not only in subject matter and language variety, but also in linguistic approach and application.

JANET C. E. WATSON

GREGOR BENTON and HONG LIU (eds):

Diasporic Chinese Ventures: The Life and Work of Wang Gungwu. (Chinese Worlds.) ix, 246 pp. London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2004. £65.

It is strange that, having noted in their introduction Professor Wang's 'passionate objection' to the term *Chinese diaspora*, the editors should light upon the word *diasporic* in their title, but then this is rather a strange compilation, a mixture of reprinted articles by the subject and interviews with him, appraisals of him by others, (occasionally pedestrian) translations from Chinese originals, and wide-ranging surveys of the position and role of the Chinese overseas by Wang printed here for the first time. Some of the items included would have been better left out, notably the text of an interview given to one of the co-editors (it could have served to supply material to bolster the introduction), a sycophantic piece translated from a Chinese journal profile by Te-Kong Tong, and Wang's first published article, an enthusiastic eulogy on 'Confucius the Sage'. Indeed, the book would have benefited from the exclusion of almost all of the ragbag *Encounters* section which forms the first of the three parts into which it is divided.

Four of the seven papers in Part II have already appeared elsewhere, but the other three and the five papers of Part III are where the meat is to be found. These are for the most part texts of some of Professor Wang's recent keynote speeches and lectures previously unpublished, and they nicely bring out his mature scholarship on Chinese culture, the Chinese overseas, migration, religion and the nature of secular society, delivered with the balance and depth which have come from long experience in studying the history and contemporary problems of East and South-East Asia. These thoughtful contributions are worth having.

The editors have contributed a short and not very informative introduction and have presented the material in loosely topical a-chronological sections. There is no listing of Wang's writings and no Chinese character glossary. He and his work deserve better treatment than this.

HUGH D. R. BAKER

JOUNI FILIP MAHO and BONNY SANDS (eds.):
The Languages of Tanzania: A Bibliography,
(Orientalia et Africana Gothoburgensia 17.) iv, 428 pp.
Gothenburg: Acta Universitatis Gothoburgensis, 2002. SEK 300.

Tanzania is the only African country where all of the continent's four linguistic phyla are represented: alongside around 100 Bantu languages (of the Niger-Congo phylum), there are Cushitic (Afro-Asiatic), Nilotic (Nilo-Saharan), and Khoi-San languages, in addition to a number of Asian and European languages. This linguistic complexity has long attracted researchers in linguistics and associated disciplines, and a fairly large body of works on Tanzanian languages is currently available. The present volume aims to provide the interested researcher with up-to-date bibliographical information about published and unpublished linguistic research on Tanzanian languages—with the exception of Swahili, which provides a research tradition of its own, and for which separate if somewhat dated bibliographical information is available (Marcel van Spaandonck, *Practical and Systematical Swahili Bibliography: Linguistics 1850–1963*, Leiden: Brill, 1965). In addition to linguistic works, the bibliography includes related studies mainly from anthropology and history, but no attempt to be comprehensive is made. The book is divided according to linguistic phyla, with an additional chapter on general reference works. The layout is pleasing and easy on the eye, with each new entry beginning on a separate page with a small map indicating where the language is spoken. The introduction sets out the editorial principles and explains how Maho and Sands have dealt with more problematic cases, such as cross-border languages, which are spoken only partly in Tanzania. This is a very useful reference work for anyone with an interest in the area.

L. MARTEN