Israel, where they were thrown into a whirlwind of unaccustomed hard labour and treated as inferiors by their Ashkenazi Jewish bosses. Shimon's suffering is palpable, and Rosen's visit with him in "the land of redemption" is the saddest episode in the book. Still deeply Moroccan in their customs and values, sharing an ingrained sense of reciprocity and interdependence that characterizes Moroccan social relations – the you-scratch-my-back-and-I'll-scratch-yours mentality still intact – the Benizri family was truly lost in the maelstrom of the new state of Israel.

The departure of the Jews was an incalculable loss for Morocco – for both its Muslims and its Jews. While market *raconteurs*, Islamist teachers, and Berber farmers go on and on, the Jews are gone, and unlikely ever to return. Rosen speaks of a concert held in Los Angeles in 2007, arranged by UCLA anthropologist Susan Slyomovics, finale of a conference celebrating Clifford Geertz's life and work in Morocco, where both this writer and Larry Rosen were present. Muslim and Jewish musicians filled the auditorium with the strains of Moroccan music, holding the audience captive. This experience was repeated for me in Casablanca in March 2016, in a vast hall filled with tables laden with food and drink; onstage performers entertained a mixed audience of Moroccan Jews and Muslims for hours. It was impossible to tell who was who, everyone was caught in the spell of the music. After all the words are gone, the sound of music is all that remains.

Susan Gilson Miller
University of California, Davis

GENERAL

G.N. DEVY, GEOFFREY V. DAVIS and K.K. CHAKRAVATY (eds):
The Language Loss of the Indigenous.
(A Routledge India Original.) xvii, 312 pp. New York and London: Routledge, 2016. £95. ISBN 978 1 138 12082 2.
doi:10.1017/S0041977X17000726

In his introduction to *The Language Loss of the Indigenous* G.N. Devy explains that the contributions to the book, "...are not essays in linguistics [or] language teaching [nor] ... philosophical or historical essays on language or philology", but instead, "...describe the voice of the communities for whom language loss has come to be the very condition of their own survival" (p. 3). *The Language Loss of the Indigenous* is not, therefore, a study of the loss of indigenous languages.

The contributions to the volume cover a wide range of topics, including literary theory, museology, media studies, oral literature, as well as language endangerment and loss. Of the 19 chapters, eight discuss language in some way, though two of them deal with descriptive linguistics rather than language endangerment and loss, and a third is a study of language use on Nigerian radio, repackaged as a study of the endangerment of Igbo. This leaves us, then, with five chapters that deal with language loss, two of which are general theoretical discussions, the other three being case studies of individual endangered languages: Waddar, Urhobo and Itsekiri.

In addition to Devy's explanatory note in the introduction, the reason for the volume's eclectic nature is further elucidated in chapter 11, where we read that the contribution was presented at a conference on the theme of "Imagining the intangible". *The Language Loss of the Indigenous* is, in fact, one of six volumes produced from a series of conferences held in India between 2008 and 2012 – the

Chotro conferences – which focused broadly on the predicaments of vulnerable indigenous peoples globally. Other volumes in the series appear to be similarly mixed bags of offerings, as suggested by their broad titles: *Narrating Nomadism*, *Knowing Differently*, and *Performing Identities*.

Regarding the conferences and the ensuing volumes, G.N. Devy, who organized the conferences and edited all the volumes, says, "If one were to draw any single conclusion from these volumes, it would be that the culture and the imaginative expression of the indigenous communities all over the world are in a phase of rapid depletion. . ." (p. 1). This framing sense of loss and decline amongst Indigenous peoples is what appears to hold the contributions of this volume together.

It is important to understand that this loss is real. On a global scale, political and economic conditions are stacked against Indigenous peoples everywhere. Colonization is ongoing. This is not a single planetary or human tragedy, it is a host of calamities, each unfolding in individual Indigenous communities around the world. The justification for works focusing on this loss, and how it manifests in different Indigenous communities, is clear.

However, a focus purely on loss can have a number of unfortunate side-effects. For one, it draws attention away from positive efforts within Indigenous communities aimed at survival, revitalization and resurgence. Leanne Betasamosake Simpson, speaking in 2013 about her book *Dancing on our Turtle's Back*, said of such efforts, that "It's crucial to see all the good work that's going on, because colonialism [works] to obfuscate that, and to keep us in this place where we perpetually feel like we're drowning" (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=28u7BOx0_9k).

So although well-intended, without a sense of balance, or lacking any attempt to intervene practically in the power imbalances that indigenous peoples face, a focus on loss, decline, and domination can contribute to further disempowerment of indigenous people.

Furthermore, such a focus can also create a "state of emergency" whereby regular standards of judgement are abandoned in light of the urgency and severity of the problem being confronted. This, at least, is the only explanation I can imagine for the inclusion of troubling characterological descriptions of indigenous peoples as "versatile and charming" (p. 91) or "graceful and charming" (p. 222), or the repeated indulging of Orientalist obsessions with origins. These and other tropes found in some of the volume's contributions repeat with uncanny felicity the colonial discourses the book aims to critique.

The best contributions are those that focus on the structures of domination that indigenous people face, and how they respond. Hebrom (chapter 1), for example, looks at the state's creation and reinforcement of language hierarchies in India and how indigenous language movements have emerged in response. Sharma (chapter 4) examines the development of Canadian indigenous media within the context of ongoing misrepresentation in mainstream media. Crentsil (chapter 19) looks at the development of "mobile phone language" amongst Akan-speakers in Ghana, situating local language practice at the intersection of national policies and globalization. The value of these contributions lies in their treatment of indigenous peoples as active parts of national and global systems, rather than isolated pockets of human difference threatened by contact.

On the whole, then, the volume serves equally well as discussion and exemplar of the complex challenges facing indigenous peoples today.

Gerald Roche
University of Melbourne

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0041977X17000726 Published online by Cambridge University Press