

Child Marriage in a Village in West Java (Indonesia): Compromises between Legal Obligations and Religious Concerns

Mies GRIJNS*

Van Vollenhoven Institute, Leiden Law School, Leiden University, The Netherlands

Hoko HORII**

Van Vollenhoven Institute, Leiden Law School, Leiden University; and Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asian and Caribbean Studies (KITLV), Leiden, The Netherlands

Abstract

This article addresses the dilemmas and compromises in legal practice around the issue of child marriage in Indonesia. Although the government set development goals that include ending child marriage and complying with human rights standard, it is facing considerable resistance. We researched the state legal system and law in practice to understand this resistance, finding that: (1) law-making in family law involves conflict between progressive and conservative ideas; (2) consequently there is friction within current family law and laws regarding human rights; (3) judges use their discretion to achieve compromises between state laws and local norms; and (4) state law is creatively interpreted and applied at village level. The resistance at all these levels, arising from the religious concerns of conservative Muslims in a rapidly modernizing Indonesian society, is a formidable obstacle for the government to achieve its development goals. Adolescent sexuality is at the heart of these tensions.

Keywords: child marriage, Indonesia, Sustainable Development Goals, human rights, local governance, adolescent sexuality

1. INTRODUCTION

With an earnest look, Siti¹ followed the handshake between her father and her groom. She had not seen her father for ages, but here he was, as her guardian, stating that he agreed to marry off his daughter for a dower (*mahr*) of 2 grams of gold, her wedding ring. Wawan, her groom, replied—without stammering, she noticed—that he accepted this offer and the core of their

* Mies Grijns is an external PhD candidate at Van Vollenhoven Institute, Leiden Law School, Leiden University, The Netherlands.

** Hoko Horii is a PhD candidate at Van Vollenhoven Institute, Leiden Law School, Leiden University and the Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asian and Caribbean Studies (KITLV) in Leiden. The authors are very grateful to Adriaan Bedner, two anonymous reviewers, and the editors for their meticulous and insightful comments. They also thank their research assistants for their help: Sherlywati Limijaya, Aminah Agustinah, Navita Hani Restuningrum, Iqna Hilmi Fathurrohman, Vina Rizky Damayanti, and Ricky Ardian Harahap. Correspondence to Mies Grijns and Hoko Horii, Van Vollenhoven Institute, Steenschuur 25, 2311 ES Leiden, The Netherlands. E-mail addresses: m.grijns@law.leidenuniv.nl and h.horii@law.leidenuniv.nl.

1. To protect their privacy, we use pseudonyms for all our respondents.

religious marriage (*ijab kabul*) was over. The assistant marriage registrar (*amil*) led in prayer and then it was her turn, after her husband, to sign the papers. Her guardian and the two witnesses signed too and both Wawan and she received their marriage certificates. The ring! Yes, she smiled, 17, married ...!²

Marrying at a tender age has long been common in many parts of the world. With increasing life expectancy, prolonged adolescence became an option and marriage age changed. Today, marrying before 18 is defined by international organizations as “child marriage,” which should preferably end within a generation.³ Child marriage is considered a global problem that cuts across countries, cultures, religions, and ethnicities.⁴ In the developing world, one in three girls is now a child bride and the actual numbers are rising with population growth.⁵ It is considered both a developmental problem and a question of human rights.

This article addresses the dilemmas and compromises in legal practices around the issue of child marriage in Indonesia, where the minimum age for marriage under state law is 16 for girls and 19 for boys.⁶ This means that, in Indonesia, there is a category of married girls aged 16 or 17—like Siti—that, according to international conventions, is “child marriage” but, in Indonesian law, is still considered as a standard marriage.⁷ The Indonesian government is actively involved in international conventions and has set development goals that include the aim to end child marriage and to comply with human rights standards, but at the same time it faces social resistance and a complex reality.

The methods we use are analysis of legal texts and their historical conception, analysis of the structure of legal institutions, interviews, and case analysis at religious courts, and ethnographic research in a village in West Java. Our main findings are: (1) law-making in family law is a negotiation process between progressive and conservative ideas, leading to compromises; (2) consequently there is friction within current family law and laws related to human rights; (3) judges use their discretion to achieve compromises between state laws and local norms; and (4) legal implementation is creatively applied at village level by key actors.

This article contributes to socio-legal studies on Indonesian family law. While there is significant knowledge on the issues of divorce,⁸ polygamy and mixed-marriage cases,⁹ and disputes over inheritance,¹⁰ child marriage remains an underexplored area of study. There is a growing body of academic work on child marriage elsewhere, such as in Honduras, Uganda, Nigeria, and Iran.¹¹ But there is still a void in the literature on child marriage in Indonesia. Reports of international and local organizations¹² on child marriage in Indonesia

2. Observation at the Office of Religious Affairs, Sukaraja, 14 October 2016.

3. The current definition of child marriage is any formal marriage or informal union where one or both of the parties are under 18 years of age; see *Girls Not Brides* (2017b). *Girls Not Brides* is a global partnership of over 800 civil society organizations committed to ending child marriage.

4. *Ibid.*

5. *Ibid.*

6. We use “underage marriage” for marriages under this minimum age for marriage.

7. There are boys who marry before 18, but boys’ marriage is not as frequent as girls’ marriage, and is still under researched.

8. van Huis (2015); O’Shaughnessy (2009).

9. Butt (2008).

10. Von Benda-Beckmann (1984); Bowen (2003).

11. Murphy-Graham & Leal (2015); Wodon et al. (2016); Bunting (2005); Asghari (2017).

12. Organizations such as the International Center for Research on Women, Plan Indonesia, UNICEF, and Rumah Kitab.

commonly present such marriage as a harmful practice, but we maintain some distance from this global development/human rights framework, allowing us to reveal the tensions arising from the religious concerns of conservative Muslims regarding adolescent sexuality in a rapidly modernizing society.

Following this introduction, Section 2 analyses state policies and law-making concerning child marriage. This analysis shows that, while trying to achieve its development goals, the Indonesian government faces dilemmas because of the need to accommodate religious concerns around child marriage. In Section 3, we explain the legal practices of child marriage: first the role of institutions in the registration of marriage, then marriage-registration practices at the state courts' level. We then present the diversity of child-marriage practices at village level in Section 4. Section 5 addresses illegal underage marriage, including procedures and reasons, and the role of intermediary figures that facilitate such practices. In the concluding remarks, we explain how child marriage is sustained by conflicting values and resistance at all these levels, notwithstanding the legal efforts to curb it.

2. STATE POLICIES AND LAW-MAKING CONCERNING CHILD MARRIAGE: DILEMMAS, COMPROMISE, AND CONTRADICTIONS

Indonesia ranks seventh in the global top ten with the highest absolute numbers of child marriage.¹³ UNICEF Indonesia reports that, in 2012, roughly 1,349,000 girls married before the age of 18. Some 300,000 of them married before turning 16. Surprisingly, after decades of steady decrease, the average child-marriage rate plateaued at around 25% between 2010 and 2013.¹⁴

In global discourse, child marriage is considered a harmful tradition that violates human rights.¹⁵ The main negative consequences for girls are reduced education opportunities, reproductive health hazards (difficult deliveries and a higher risk of HIV/AIDS; premature babies with disabilities), and increased risk of mother and child mortality. Child marriage is also a source of psychological trauma as well as domestic and sexual violence. In its worst form, it leads to exploitation of child brides as domestic servants or as victims of sex trafficking, either within their marriage or after, when they are left divorced or abandoned.¹⁶ Child brides in Indonesia struggle with these phenomena too.¹⁷

Besides the problems for individuals, there are also negative consequences of child marriage for society. Maternal mortality, low levels of education, and high divorce rates have a negative impact on people's livelihood. Child marriage gives rise to intergenerational poverty.¹⁸ Indonesia has a large young population but, to realize their economic potential, the younger generations must have access to quality education, adequate nutrition, and health care (including sexual and reproductive health). This is where child marriage comes in as a disturbing factor. Child marriage in Indonesia caused a loss of at least 1.7% of

13. UNICEF Indonesia (2016), p. 1.

14. *Ibid.*, p. 2.

15. Sustainable Development Knowledge Platform (2015).

16. Turner (2013), p. 30; Equality Now (2014), p. 7.

17. Kartikasari (2016), pp. 22–5; UNICEF Indonesia, *supra* note 13, p. 7.

18. *Ibid.*, p. 8.

GDP in 2014.¹⁹ This explains the urgency of ending child marriage from an economic developmental perspective.

The Indonesian government acknowledges the damaging impact of child marriage and it supports the new Sustainable Development Goals for the period 2015–30. Ending child marriage is one of the targets. SDG 5.3 reads: “Eliminate all harmful practices, such as child, early, and forced marriage and female genital mutilation.”²⁰ The Indonesian government is also actively involved in international conventions, having ratified the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) in 1984 and the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) in 1990.

President Joko Widodo’s government recently got praise for its national strategy to eliminate violence against children, including innovative endeavours to alleviate poverty through social protection schemes.²¹ The Smart Indonesia Card subsidizes primary and secondary students from lower socioeconomic backgrounds, supporting the policy target of 12-year compulsory education instead of the present nine years. A new national health insurance scheme has been introduced to improve health care for all. These are important steps that also help prevent child marriage. Behind the scenes, a programme to eliminate child marriage is already included in the Government Work Plan 2017–18.²² The president also requested the Ministry of Empowerment for Women and Protection of Children to prepare a proposal for a *Perppu* (Government Regulation In lieu of Law) on the elimination of child marriage, which was drafted in 2016 in co-operation with civil society organizations.²³ So, in principle, the government supports measures to prevent child marriage in line with the SDGs. One of the instruments to achieve this goal is law.

In the quest for legal unification in Indonesia, there have been constant struggles to accommodate diverse ideologies and norms, often resulting in dilemmas, compromises, and contradictions. The Marriage Law 1974²⁴ is a good illustration of such a compromise. In this section, we first discuss the controversy arising out of the enactment of the Marriage Law and then introduce some state laws on the definition of children and the minimum age for marriage.

When, in 1973, the government submitted the draft Bill of the Marriage Law to the Parliament, one of its intentions was to enhance women’s rights in marriage.²⁵ However, some Muslim organizations and the Islamist party PPP (*Partai Persatuan Pembangunan*) strongly opposed the Bill, arguing that it was too “modern.” They staged walk-outs from parliamentary sessions, which led the government to conclude that the potential cost of pushing through its proposal would be too high.²⁶ The government understood that the law needed to accommodate the diversity in marriage practices and the normative notions underlying them.²⁷ As a result, the government changed several articles in the draft,

19. UNICEF Indonesia, *supra* note 13, p. 1.

20. Sustainable Development Knowledge Platform, *supra* note 15.

21. Tempo.co (2017).

22. Interview with Sylvana Apituley, chief expert staff at Deputy V of the Presidential Staff, 11 March 2017.

23. Kartikasari, *supra* note 17.

24. UU Nomor 1 Tahun 1974 tentang Perkawinan.

25. Pompe & Otto (1990), p. 419.

26. Cammack et al. (1996), p. 62.

27. Bedner & van Huis (2010), p. 180.

including the article on marriageable age. The initial draft proposed the minimum marriageable age to be 18 for women and 21 for men.²⁸ However, after facing strong opposition from conservative Muslims, the government lowered the age to 16 for girls and 19 for boys.

A recent judicial review of the 1974 Marriage Law at the Constitutional Court, instigated by women's and youth organizations, in order to raise the minimum age for marriage, was rejected. During the hearings, all major religious organizations' opinions were presented. The judges seemed to ignore the views of moderate Islam and non-Muslim experts on the negative consequences of child marriage for girls and referred only to the Muslim standard of *akil baligh* (mental and physical maturity) as a measure of marriageability.²⁹ The only dissenting opinion amongst nine judges, which was referring to human rights and development, came from the sole female judge (and non-Muslim), Maria Farida Indrati.³⁰ Diverging opinions are also present within Islamic organizations. A particular example is the recent congress of female Islamic clerics: their edicts support raising the marriageable age to 18, calling child marriage "harmful" and prevention of it mandatory.³¹

Although Article 7(1) of the Marriage Law limits marriage to 16 for girls and 19 for boys, technically anyone can marry below that age if the court gives its consent, as Article 7(2) allows the parents of underage parties to petition for a dispensation to the court. The Law on Human Rights of 1999³² defines children as *all unmarried* persons under the age of 18, which makes all married children, regardless of their age, fall outside its scope of protection. Consequently, they lose their rights ensured by the Law on Human Rights, such as rights to education, information, to rest, and to mix with children of their own age. This problematic definition also clashes with the Child Protection Law of 2002,³³ which defines a child differently, namely as a person of less than 18 years of age, including unborn children.

3. LEGAL PRACTICES OF CHILD MARRIAGE: MARRIAGE REGISTRATION AND MARRIAGE DISPENSATION

In registering marriages in Indonesia, several institutions play their roles: the civil court holds jurisdiction over marriage and divorce of non-Muslims, while the religious court has jurisdiction over Muslim marriage and divorce.³⁴ To register marriages and divorces, couples also go to different offices at their subdistrict: non-Muslims to the Civil Registration Office (KCS, *Kantor Catatan Sipil*) and Muslims to the Office of Religious Affairs (KUA, *Kantor Urusan Agama*).

Both religious and civil courts can authorize underage marriages by granting marriage dispensation. When granted dispensation, the letter from the court allows petitioners to

28. The Draft Marriage Law of 1973, Art. 7(1): "marriage is permitted only if the male has reached the age of 21 years and the female has reached the age of 18 years."

29. Ecpat Indonesia (2015).

30. She stated that the original Marriage Law was a compromise 41 years ago, and that Indonesian society since then had developed a much more advanced understanding of human rights. She also argued that the continuing use of the age of 16 for marriage for girls produces legal uncertainty vis-à-vis other laws that are based on the understanding of the age of 18 marking the end of childhood (CC judgment No. 30-74/PUU-XII/2014: 237, 239).

31. BBC NEWS (2017).

32. UU Nomor 39 Tahun 1999 Tentang Hak Asasi Manusia.

33. UU Nomor 23 Tahun 2002 Tentang Perlindungan Anak.

34. Cammack & Feener (2012), p. 27.

register their marriages even when the marrying spouse is under the official minimum age for marriage (16 for girls, 19 for boys).³⁵ As our research area is a Muslim-majority area, we focus on religious courts and KUA.

Article 2 of the Regulation on Marriage Registration issued by the Ministry of Religious Affairs³⁶ clarifies the role of marriage registrars (PPN, *Pegawai Pencacat Nikah*) as the employees of KUA, the Office of Religious Affairs, who examine the requirements as well as monitor and record Muslim marriage and divorce. In Article 15, the regulation indicates that, in case the requirements to marry are not fulfilled, PPN are forbidden to register such marriages.³⁷ The Civil Registration Law No. 23 of 2006 further sets various penalties for fraud or failure to register a marriage.³⁸ Nurlaelawati describes the KUA as placed at the intermediary level between “*ulama*” (traditional religious clerics) and the religious courts, and finds KUA officials considering themselves more as guardians of the *shari’a* and of the interpretations of the *ulama* than as state officials.³⁹ She further emphasizes KUA’s insight into marital problems because KUA officials themselves are firmly rooted in local society.⁴⁰

Besides KUA staff at the Office of Religious Affairs, local leaders such as the village head (*kepala desa*) and *amil* play an important role in preparing marriage registration. The *amil* is an assistant marriage registrar at village level (P3N, *Pembantu Pegawai Pencacat Nikah*), who supports the PPN at subdistrict level. In practice, they register marriages at KUA in co-operation with PPN, so that people in the village almost never need to go to KUA and leave all the dealings to their *amil*. The detailed practice will be explained later in this article.

As explained earlier, Article 7(2) of the Marriage Law 1974 allows marriage dispensation to be issued by courts. As the article does not set any condition or requirement for judges to grant dispensation, it gives significant discretion to judges. Both Horii’s research on religious courts in West Java (including our research area) and a report from Plan International found that more than 90% of the marriage-dispensation cases brought to courts are approved.⁴¹ Horii’s analysis on court decisions indicates that fear for *zinah* (the sin of pre-marital sexual relations) is the most influential factor for judges to grant dispensations, and that they do so to protect girls from social stigma if they may have already engaged in sexual intercourse.⁴² Thus, judges seek to protect girls through granting marriage to allow them to escape the emotional stress resulting from social pressure, as well as to protect their unborn children who might otherwise be labelled as illegitimate.⁴³ Her analysis of the court decisions also mentioned that judges cite Islamic laws based on *Quran* and *Sunnah*⁴⁴ as often as state laws, while they never applied any aspect of the Indonesian Child Protection Law, or referred to international human rights.

35. Art. 6 of the PP Nomor 9 Tahun 1975 tentang Pelaksanaan UU Nomor 1 Tahun 1974 tentang Perkawinan.

36. Peraturan Menteri Agama Republik Indonesia Nomor 11 Tahun 2007 tentang Pencatatan Nikah.

37. “Marriage registrars are prohibited from assisting implementation and registration of marriages if: (1) the requirements referred to in Article 5 (2) are not met and, (2) knowing of violation of the terms or conditions of marriage” (authors’ translation).

38. van Huis & Wirastri (2012), p. 10.

39. Nurlaelawati (2010), p. 189.

40. *Ibid.*, p. 189.

41. Horii (2015), p. 24; Evenhuis & Burn (2014), p. 27.

42. Horii, *supra* note 41, p. 24.

43. *Ibid.*, p. 24.

44. Sayings and deeds of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH).

So, judges at religious courts facilitate legal underage marriages. However, dispensations are roughly estimated to account for only 8% of child-marriage cases.⁴⁵ What happens with the other cases?

4. HETEROGENEITY OF CHILD MARRIAGE AT VILLAGE LEVEL

To understand why the court is not more often involved in cases of underage marriage, we use the findings of an ethnographic study at village level, in the northern part of the Sukabumi district in West Java. The roughly 8,000 inhabitants are originally migrants from other regions of West Java, attracted over a century by the large tea plantation that dominated the local economy until about 20 years ago. Most households have a modest income: around 40% of the population is considered poor according to local standards. Sundanese culture and Islam are the shared elements in this village, but there is a range of Islamic orientations, from traditionalist syncretism, Islamic modernism, to a *Persis* group from Bandung and a puritan Salafist community.⁴⁶

This heterogeneity is reflected in the different types of child marriage that we found during our fieldwork. The two main types are love matches of young people choosing their own partners and marriages inspired by orthodox beliefs that encourage early matrimony.⁴⁷ The driving force behind most child marriage is the fear of *zinah*. Marriage is the only accepted solution in cases of teenage pregnancy, as abortion is forbidden by law and access to contraception is very limited for unmarried couples. But marriage is also used as a defence to pernicious slander when a dating couple is considered getting too intimate. Aulia was pushed to marry at 15. “It took my mother a month to persuade me to get married,” Aulia says. “She kept saying: ‘Don’t embarrass me’.” They had just started dating and had certainly no marriage in mind. But “There was all this shaming,” her husband recalls. “I hadn’t actually kissed her and everybody gossiped about her being pregnant.”⁴⁸

In general, girls today have more agency⁴⁹ in the *choice of a partner* than their mothers. This is helped by increased mobility: education outside the village and mobile phones.⁵⁰ However, refusing a marriage proposal is considered to bring bad luck to the girl. So girls must keep their dates out of sight of their parents if they are not ready to marry them. Parents, on the other hand, still have a big say in the *timing of the marriage*. When gossip about *zinah* gets unbearable, instant marriage is arranged to secure the honour of the girl and her family.⁵¹ Aulia is a good example. But sometimes adolescents use the *zinah* argument themselves to push unwilling parents into arranging a marriage for them.

The minimum age for marriage here is not counted in years. People refer to the Muslim concept of *akil baligh* (mental and physical maturity) as a sign of marriageability. For boys,

45. The number of dispensations granted in Indonesia in 2012 is about 8,500. This figure is calculated by multiplying the approval rate of marriage dispensation in religious court (90%) by the total number of dispensations submitted to courts in 2012 (9,632 cases). Additionally, the estimated numbers of girls that marry under age 15 each year is about 110,000; see UNICEF Indonesia, *supra* note 13, p. 1.

46. For an explanation of the different doctrinal orientations, see Shepard (2014), pp. 235–46. *Persis* is a doctrine from the 1920s that accepts only teachings from the Quran and Hadith, opposing heresy, myth, and superstition.

47. For the complete typology, based on agency of the girls and their reasons for marriage, see Grijns et al. (2016).

48. Topsfield & Rosa (2017).

49. Agency is an important aspect of research on child marriage. In another paper-in-progress on child marriage, we consider autonomy as a spectrum and explore its relation with social structures.

50. See also van der Kooij (2016), who did research in the same area.

51. Honour is less of an issue for men but, in principle, a man must marry the girl whom he made pregnant, except in the case of incest.

Table 1. Distribution of age at first marriage for men and women aged 20–24 years of age

Age	Ever married											Total	Never married		
	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24		–	%	Total
Male		1	1		2	11	9	6	8	4	4	46	138	75%	184
Female	2	7	9	25	22	20	21	9	5	3		123	61	33%	184
Total	2	8	10	25	24	31	30	15	13	7	4	169	199	54%	368

Source: 2014 survey in village.

“*kuat gawe*” (able to work) is a local benchmark.⁵² For girls, the onset of puberty means they are ready for marriage, since they are in the first place destined to become mothers and (house) wives. Teenage marriage is widely accepted, although there is a simultaneous trend towards later marriages.

Child marriage is not necessarily considered bad. On the one hand, there are outcomes that are appreciated by adolescents, such as the preservation of their honour, the right to sexual relationships, and their increased status as adults, which give them a say in community life. On the other hand, there is regret. Girls are deprived of further education; they miss their old friends and live in social isolation, with heavy domestic work and responsibility for their husband and children. It is said that 50% of child marriages end in divorce after one or two years⁵³ because of incompatibility and the struggle to run a household together. In Siti’s case, love evaporated faster than it took to flourish. They divorced after Wawan lost his job. Girls who have children will remain responsible for them and, if they left their parental home upon marriage, often return to live with their parents.⁵⁴

To establish the local prevalence of child marriage, we conducted a survey amongst all families with sons and daughters aged 20–24 years old. Table 1 shows that teenagers already marry at age 14 or 15. From the age of 17, the frequency of marriage jumps for women in this age-group, followed by the men at age 19.⁵⁵

We found that, amongst ever-married women in our survey, 35% experienced a child marriage (<18). For men, it was 4.3%. Nine girls (7.3%) reported underage marriage (<16), as did four boys (8.7% <19). These figures are higher than the average in this district. But, when analyzing qualitative case-studies of early marriages, we discovered that there was even more hidden underage marriage. There actually appeared to be a whole repertoire of illegal practices.

5. ILLEGAL PRACTICES OF UNDERAGE MARRIAGE: FACILITATORS, PROCEDURES, AND REASONS

When people in the village need a solution for unwanted situations, they do not go to court for marriage dispensation, but turn to local solutions. A court case is assumed to be costly⁵⁶

52. Kartikasari (2016), *supra* note 17, p. 14.

53. Koalisi Perempuan Indonesia (2016), p. 3.

54. See also similar findings in neighbouring Cianjur by Huis, *supra* note 8, pp. 151–2, 169.

55. The figures for marriage at the age of 20–4 are not fixed yet, because the respondents are between 20 and 24 years old so, in the following years, they might still get married before they are 25.

56. Huis, *supra* note 8, p. 154.

and scary (some associating the court with criminal cases).⁵⁷ The community prefers the safest, fastest, affordable way, which is outside the state legal scheme.

Marriage starts with a religious ceremony, *ijab kabul* being the core for Muslims.⁵⁸ This is a sufficient step for solving problems of dishonour caused by unwanted pregnancy or too-intimate dating. But, without registration, such a marriage is not legal per state law; also, it means no access for the new household to welfare support from the state.⁵⁹ And any children born from the couple will only be registered in the name of the mother (bringing the shame of being considered an illegitimate child and loss of inheritance rights).⁶⁰

The trick thus is how and when to register underage religious marriage to make it legal. Depending on the reasons behind a child marriage, there are three local procedures⁶¹:

1. Raising the age of the bride or groom by changing the birth date in the required documents, thereby enabling them to receive their official marriage certificates right after the religious ceremony. This is facilitated by the village head (or lower staff) and the *amil*. It is a fast solution for girls who are already pregnant and want to protect their honour and that of their unborn child. But it is also used to let the bride “jump” to 17, the minimum age for an identity and family card,⁶² which opens doors to factory work and welfare support. When Nenen was going to get married at 15, her father just went to the *amil* with IDR 50,000 (€ 3.50), as her mom said, “from her heart.” The *amil* accepted this and came to their house to marry them. In her marriage certificate, Nenen found herself 17 years old.⁶³
2. *Isbath nikah*, or having a marriage recognized retroactively by the court, is quite a common and pragmatic procedure.⁶⁴ But, in the case of an underage child, parents cannot arrange *isbath nikah* at court, because it is at the same court that they should have applied for dispensation first. So they resort to a local version of *isbath nikah*. This often happens when adolescents are pressured to get married early for moral reasons. They will not register their marriage for a while, so that they may split up again easily if the relationship does not work out well. If a pregnancy follows, the marriage can still be registered via the local *isbath nikah* route. Bedner and van Huis observe that this “allows adolescents in rural areas more sexual liberty than they would otherwise be likely to enjoy.”⁶⁵

The *amil* deals with two variants of backdating, depending on his attendance at the religious ceremony. If he attends, he will not issue a marriage certificate, but he just notes the marriage in his register, without assigning an official number yet. Only when

57. People’s reluctance to go to courts is not just related to underage marriages, but also to divorces. According to the *amil*, it was not before 2014 that, for the first time, he handled two divorce cases that went to the religious court and, until now, there had been no cases from the village that went for marriage dispensation.

58. On the religious nature of the marriage as its core, see Bedner & van Huis, *supra* note 27, p. 179.

59. Marriage Law 1974, Art. 2(1)(2).

60. On registration of polygamy cases and a Constitutional Court judgment on children born out of wedlock, which might give them inheritance rights, see Huis, *supra* note 8, pp. 232–4.

61. Interviews with village head on 26 May 2016 at his home, and with *amil* on 27 May and 26 June 2016 at his home.

62. A list of various minimum ages in laws and regulations ranging from 17 to 21 was collected by Ifdhal Kasim. The low minimum age for marriage for girls (16) is a notable exception. See Kasim et al. (2015), pp. 43–5.

63. Interview with Nenen and her mother on 24 May 2016 at their home. This is a poor family, her mother earning only IDR 125,000 a month.

64. Bedner & van Huis, *supra* note 27, p. 188.

65. *Ibid.*, p. 188.

the couple has reached the proper age will they go to KUA, pretending it is a new wedding. Their marriage will be registered with an official number in the archives of the KUA and they will receive their backdated marriage certificate. This is a cheaper procedure, because it involves only the *amil*, so there are fewer people who need a “gift” for their services.

The second option for backdating a wedding date is more complicated. The religious ceremony would have only been attended by a religious leader, so it takes the *amil* extra effort to get such a marriage registered via a backdoor route. Some young girls from an orthodox background marry, divorce, and re-marry quite quickly and only apply to register their second or third marriage, when the relationship seems more stable and the couple seriously plans a family.

3. Arranging a so-called “secret” religious marriage (*nikah siri*) that will remain unregistered. *Nikah siri* is not very common. It is only facilitated by some conservative religious leaders in a private setting, with no involvement of the *amil* or any other authority. The cases we encountered were of girls that were handpicked at ages below 15 by religious leaders from outside the village who took them as second or third wives. This way, their husbands avoid asking a permission letter from the first wife, a legal obligation for polygamy. The girls and their children have no inheritance rights, nor do the girls have the right of female-petitioned divorce.

The do-it-yourself approach to underage marriage at the village level is a solution for (parents of) couples that experience pre-marital pregnancy or are accused of too-intimate dating. In general, brides-to-be are not told what marriage entails and they are usually also ignorant about the illegal preparations behind underage marriage. If marital problems arise, parents or other relatives arrange divorce⁶⁶ by settling the issue between the two families or with help of village bureaucrats. But the system offers little protection in cases of forced or violent unregistered child marriages. If the wife does not dare to complain about the violence or assumes that violence is a husband’s right, it is difficult for her to escape.

The *amil* and the village head (or lower village bureaucrats) are central actors⁶⁷: they not only arrange underage child marriage, but are often also involved in mediating the divorces that regularly happen after child marriage, handing out divorce papers, arranging “customized” birth certificates, and smoothing cases of adultery. The *amil* can help people marry, even when they come to him to ask for a wedding on the next day (instead of waiting for the legally prescribed ten days). The creative solutions for circumventing procedural rules on underage marriage lead to a chain of other violations of rules. In a recent case of rape, the young victim was forced by her father to marry her violator to prevent loss of honour. She missed her final (elementary!) school exam and had to move in with her husband. When her mother, who worked as a domestic helper in Jakarta, heard about this, she implored the school teachers and the *amil* to find another solution. In the end, the marriage was annulled, the girl was declared “never-married” and allowed to sit for her final exams,⁶⁸ so that her mother could take her to school in Jakarta.

66. There is no big taboo on divorce in Sundanese culture.

67. There is a parallel with what Lipsky called street-level bureaucrats. He mentions the relatively high degrees of discretion and regular interaction with citizens as notable features of jobs at the lowest level of public services. See Lipsky (1980), p. 27.

68. Although there is no official rule that those girls who are married or get pregnant cannot continue their education, ever-married girls with or without babies, divorced or not, seldom go back to school.

The local community, in particular fathers as legal guardians of their girls together with the village bureaucracy, The *amil* and KUA create their own support system to solve legal issues, which resonate with local cultural and religious norms and values. At the KUA, marriages need to be registered, but most weddings are still held at home, officiated by the *penghulu*. When the *penghulus* are too busy to officiate all weddings in the various villages of their district, the *amils* are asked to stand in at weddings in their own village. *Amils* as assistant marriage registrars and *penghulus* (marriage registrars) work closely together on the registration of marriages: they have monthly meetings, where *penghulus* sign the official letters to register marriages that the *amils* prepared already in their village, in co-operation with the village staff. In other words, the *penghulu*, as an official of KUA, simply registers cases prepared by the *amil* and relies on his role as assistant to deal with all the work in his village. This division of roles between *amil* and *penghulu* allows villagers just to deal with their own *amil* without ever having to go to the KUA. So, at the KUA, all documents are considered “clean” and the employees do not need to fear sanctions.

As an intermediary between the state institution and the people, the *amil* is in a difficult position. He understands why people need underage marriage as a solution for shameful situations, and considers the rules of the society. He faces a dilemma—state law cannot always meet people’s needs, so he must be flexible. There is great pressure from the community on the *amil* to perform according to their expectations. The *amil* told us, grinningly: “The village head is aware of this. If the community is not being served maybe this house and the village office would be attacked.”⁶⁹ On top of that, the *amil* is the only unpaid official⁷⁰: he is not on the payroll of the KUA, nor of the village administration, but depends on the proceeds of his own land, the gifts of people who come for his help,⁷¹ and his share of the payments for marriages that he officiated.

Penghulus are in a similar dilemma—they might be aware of the negative impact of underage marriage on girls, but they feel they cannot do much because traditional norms are still very strong and they will meet serious opposition from the community. According to one of the *penghulus*, law in the village is a combination of religious, cultural, and state values that regulate the community.⁷² Religious law in villages is interpreted and explained by local religious leaders who each teach their version of Islamic theology and laws, including the legal validity of Islam. *Penghulus*, as state representatives, are themselves religious authorities and are more influenced by local norms than by their superiors, because they are part of the community and share the same values.

6. CONCLUSION

Our findings indicate that child marriage is sustained based on conservative Muslim interpretations of how to deal with adolescent sexuality, which is to control immorality through marriage. Although the Indonesian government officially agrees with international goals and

69. Interview with *amil* on 27 May 2016 at his home.

70. Huis and Wirastrri argue that an assistant marriage registrar should be made into a civil servant and be paid, to avoid fraud in marriage registration. See van Huis & Wirastrri, *supra* note 38, p. 15.

71. It is a common custom to pay people like traditional midwives, Quran teachers, and religious leaders for their services in gifts (in cash or in kind). There is no fixed tariff, but it is up to people’s capacity what they give. We heard of gifts from IDR 50,000 to IDR 200,000.

72. Interview with *Penghulu* A, 30 May 2016, Sukaraja.

policies aiming at elimination of child marriage, and despite the efforts of human rights bodies and civil society organizations, national discourse on this issue is dominated by a conservative Islamic perspective. Moderate religious voices, including female clerics and women and children's rights practitioners, are currently not powerful enough to shift the dominant discourse. The recent judicial review (mentioned in Section 2) is a good example of the strong political power of conservative Islamic discourse in Indonesia.

The tension between how the Indonesian government presents itself and this dominant discourse is visible in both the law-making process and existing laws. The initial drafters of the Marriage Law 1974 had to compromise because of resistance from an Islamist party. Within existing state laws, such as the Marriage Law 1974, the Law on Human Rights of 1999, and the Child Protection Law of 2002, contradictions come to the fore. Judges, within their discretion given by a set of state laws, at times reach judicial decisions to permit underage marriages. They do so by referring to both state laws and Islamic laws.

At the local level, village bureaucrats create their semi-autonomous social field, which sustains customs, rules, and symbols internally but is also vulnerable to rules and decisions from outside the field.⁷³ They use their unofficial support system to solve legal issues in accordance with local cultural and religious norms and values. Such a system is created to meet the needs of their local community. Villagers almost always resort to this unofficial system without any involvement of state institutions.

Child marriage is a common phenomenon throughout Indonesia. Practices such as covering the shame of extra-marital sexual relations, manipulating age and wedding dates, marriage dispensation, as well as handling teenage pregnancy by arranging child marriage are found elsewhere in Indonesia, including in non-Muslim areas. The main differences with West Java are related to customs around kinship (bilineal in Java versus patri- or matrilineal in other areas) and the impact of dower or bride prices (which are relatively modest in our research area).⁷⁴

We consider the dilemmas and compromises seen at each level of society as the results of continuous struggles with the diversity of values on marriage, family, and adolescent sexuality. The question is whether law is effective in supporting the government's developmental policy that aims to end child marriage. On the one hand, formal law can create an "enabling environment"⁷⁵ and strengthen those who seek the elimination of child marriage. But, for those who are against a fixed marriage age (whether it is 16 or 18), it will only stimulate underground practices of child marriage. The solution proposed by the Girls Not Brides civil society platform is "not to condemn all traditions, but to work with communities to change traditions from within."⁷⁶ Not an easy solution, but unavoidable, as we have seen.

To protect women's and children's rights, the government could focus more on supporting laws and policies on gender equality, on education, and on sexual and reproductive

73. Moore (1973), p. 720.

74. Research done by Rumah Kitab and CPPS GMU & Plan Indonesia demonstrates similar practices in other Muslim areas; see Marcoes & Putri (2016); CPPS GMU & Plan Indonesia (2011). A report by Koalisi 18+ proves that marriage dispensation is widely practised. In several workshops that we organized in Indonesia, discussions on child marriage in areas such as Lombok, Bali, Aceh, Sumatra, Sulawesi, and other parts of Java supported our findings; see Eddyono et al. (2016).

75. See the parallels with the efforts to eliminate female genital cutting in Senegal in the research of Shell-Duncan et al. (2013), pp. 804–12.

76. Girls Not Brides (2017a).

health rights. But, in the end, it is unavoidable for the government, to achieve its human rights and development goals, to also deal with cultural and religious concerns on adolescent sexuality.

REFERENCES

- Asghari, Shamin (2017) "Early Marriage in Iran: An Interplay between Culture and Law." Master's diss., Leiden University.
- BBC NEWS (2017) "Female Islamic Clerics in Indonesia Issue Rare Child Marriage Fatwa," 28 April, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-39741891> (accessed 24 November 2017).
- Bedner, Adriaan, & Stijn Cornelis van Huis (2010) "Plurality of Marriage Law and Marriage Registration for Muslims in Indonesia: A Plea for Pragmatism." 6 *Utrecht Law Review* 175–91.
- Bowen, John R. (2003) *Islam, Law, and Equality in Indonesia: An Anthropology of Public Reasoning*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bunting, Annie (2005) "Stages of Development: Marriage of Girls and Teens as an International Human Rights Issue." 14 *Social & Legal Studies* 17–38.
- Butt, Simon (2008) "Polygamy and Mixed Marriage in Indonesia: Islam and the Marriage Law in the Courts," in T. Lindsey, ed., *Indonesia: Law and Society*, Sydney: The Federation Press.
- Cammack, Mark, & Michael R. Feener (2012) "The Islamic Legal System in Indonesia." 21 *Pacific Rim Law & Policy Journal* 13–42.
- Cammack, Mark, Lawrence Young, & Tim B. Heaton (1996) "Legislating Social Change in an Islamic Society-Indonesia's Marriage Law." 44 *The American Journal of Comparative Law* 45–73.
- CPPS GMU & Plan Indonesia (2011) *Child Marriage in Indonesia: Final Report*, Jakarta: Gadjah Mada University.
- Ecpat Indonesia (2015) "Pernyataan Sikap Koalisi 18+ atas Keputusan MK," <http://www.ypha.or.id/web/?p=1608> (accessed 4 February 2017).
- Eddyono, Supriyadi Widodo, Anggara, Robert Fajar Sidaurok, Erasmus A. T. Napitupulu, & Ajeng Gandini Kamilah (2016) *Menyingkap Tabir Dispensasi Perkawinan: Analisis Terhadap Praktik Perkawinan Anak di Kab Tuban, Kab Bogor, dan Kab Mamuju*, Jakarta: Koalisi 18+.
- Equality Now (2014) "Protecting the Girl Child: Using the Law to End Child, Early and Forced Marriage and Related Human Rights Violations," *Report*, 7.
- Evenhuis, Mark, & Jeniffer Burn (2014) "Just Married, Just a Child: Child Marriage in the Indo-Pacific Region," *Report*, Melbourne: Plan International Australia.
- Girls Not Brides (2017a) "8 Child Marriage Myths to Bust on International Women's Day 2017," 18 December, <https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/8-child-marriage-myths-bust-international-womens-day-2017/> (accessed 14 March 2017).
- Girls Not Brides (2017b) "Child Marriage around the World," <https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/where-does-it-happen/> (accessed 14 March 2017).
- Grijs, Mies, Sherlywati Limijaya, Navita Hani Restuningrum, Iqna Hilmi Fathurrohman, Vina Rizky Damayanti, & Ricky Ardian Harahap (2016) "Pernikahan Anak di Sukabumi Jawa Barat: Diri dan Agensi Anak Perempuan." 88 *Jurnal Perempuan* 9–33.
- Horii, Hoko (2015) "Uncovering Difficulties in the Implementation of International Human Rights Laws in the Indonesian Pluralistic Legal System: Issue of Child Marriage in West Java." Master's diss., Nagoya University.
- Kartikasari, Dian (2016) *Kearah Perppu Anti Perkawinan Anak*, Jakarta: Koalisi Perempuan Indonesia.
- Kasim, Ifdhal, Abdul Haris Semendawai, Lili Pintauli Siregar, Magdaiena Sitorus, Ratna Batara Munti, Indriaswati Dyah Saptaningrum, Rafendi Djamin, Sri Nurherwati, Ninik Maksoem, Chloryne Isana Dewi, Alissa Qotrunnada Munawaroh Wahid, Okky Setiarso, Wiyarni Pambudi, Emmy Lucy Smith, Hesti Kristina Tobing, Brian Sriprahastuti, Pingkan C. B. Rumondor, Anna Surti Nina, Wulan Ayu Ramadhani, & Dirga Sakti Rambe (2015) *Amicus Curiae: Selamatkan Anak-anak Indonesia Dari Perkawinan di Usia Anak*, Jakarta: Koalisi 18+ and Institute for Criminal Justice Reform.

- Koalisi Perempuan Indonesia (2016) *Lembar Informasi: Stop Perkawinan Anak*, Jakarta: Koalisi Perempuan Indonesia.
- Lipsky, Micheal (1980) *Street-Level Bureaucracy: The Dilemmas of the Individual in Public Service*, New York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Marcoes, Lies, & Fadilla Dwianti Putri (2016) *Kesaksian Pengantin Bocah*, Jakarta: Rumah Kitab.
- Moore, Sally Falk (1973) "Law and Social Change: The Semi-Autonomous Social Field as an Appropriate Subject of Study." 7 *Law & Society Review* 719–46.
- Murphy-Graham, Erin, & Graciela Leal (2015) "Child Marriage, Agency, and Schooling in Rural Honduras." 59 *Comparative Education Review* 24–49.
- Nurlaelawati, Euis (2010) *Modernization, Tradition and Identity*, Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- O'Shaughnessy, Kate (2009) *Gender, State and Social Power in Contemporary Indonesia: Divorce and Marriage Law*, New York: Routledge.
- Pompe, Sebastiaan, & Jan Michiel Otto (1990) "Some Comments on Recent Developments in the Indonesian Marriage Law with Particular Respect to the Rights of Women." 23 *Verfassung und Recht in Übersee—Law and Politics in Africa, Asia and Latin America* 415–33.
- Shell Duncan, Bettina, Katherine Wander, Ylva Hernlund, & Amadou Moreau (2013) "Legislating Change? Responses to Criminalizing Female Genital Cutting in Senegal." 47 *Law & Society Review* 803–33.
- Shepard, William E. (2014) *Introducing Islam, World Religion Series*, 2nd edn, New York: Routledge.
- Sustainable Development Knowledge Platform (2015) "Transforming Our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development," <https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/post2015/transformingourworld> (accessed 27 February 2017).
- Tempo.co (2017) "UN's Praises for Indonesia's Efforts to Prevent Child Violence," 27 February, <https://en.tempo.co/read/news/2017/02/27/074850809/UNs-Praises-Indonesias-Efforts-to-Prevent-Child-Violence> (accessed 11 March 2017).
- Topsfield, Jewel, & Amilia Rosa (2017) "Child Brides: Why Underage Girls Are Marrying in Indonesia," 15 September, <http://www.smh.com.au/world/child-brides-why-underage-girls-are-marrying-in-indonesia-20170912-gyg6p8.html> (accessed 15 September 2017).
- Turner, Catherine (2013) *Out of the Shadows: Child Marriage and Slavery*, London: Anti-Slavery International.
- UNICEF Indonesia (2016) "Child Marriage in Indonesia: Progress on Pause," *Research Brief*, Jakarta: UNICEF Indonesia.
- van der Kooij, Yvonne (2016) "Early Marriage in West Java: Understanding Girls' Agency in the Context of 'Traditional' and Changing Norms Regarding Gender and Sexuality." Master's diss., University of Amsterdam.
- van Huis, Stijn Cornelis (2015) "Islamic Courts and Women's Divorce Rights in Indonesia: The Cases of Cianjur and Bulukumba." PhD diss., Van Vollenhoven Institute, Faculty of Law, Leiden University.
- van Huis, Stijn Cornelis, & Theresia Dyah Wirastrri (2012) "Muslim Marriage Registration in Indonesia: Revised Marriage Registration Laws Cannot Overcome Compliance Flaws." 13 *Australian Journal of Asian Law* 1–17.
- Von Benda-Beckmann, Keebet (1984) *The Broken Stairways to Consensus: Village Justice and State Courts in Minangkabau*, Dordrecht: Foris Publication.
- Wodon, Quentin, Minh Cong Nguyen, & Clarence Tsimpo (2016) "Child Marriage, Education, and Agency in Uganda." 22 *Feminist Economics* 54–79.