

VETERANS OF CHRIST: *SOLDIER REINTEGRATION AND THE SEVENTH-DAY ADVENTIST EXPERIENCE IN THE ANDEAN PLATEAU, 1900–1925*

ABSTRACT: This article recounts the story of the Seventh-day Adventists' success in Puno, Peru, between 1900 and 1925, from a grassroots perspective. Retracing the footsteps of prominent indigenous converts, the article presents the discovery that most of the church's native leaders were army veterans. These men had spent years away from their communities and, upon their return, discovered the numerous challenges of reintegration into rural society. In almost every aspect of communal life, veterans encountered obstacles to their reintegration: their lands had been usurped, they lacked the necessary social and political outreach, and they were ridiculed and marginalized because of the cultural—apparently mestizo—habits and practices they had adopted while away. In their quest for alternatives, these veterans left the Catholic Church and converted to Seventh-day Adventism. Conversion, I argue, offered an answer to the difficulties of their reintegration. It provided new opportunities for social and economic mobility and possibilities for veterans to reinterpret their Indian racial identity in a way that would include the seemingly mestizo traits they had adopted while in the barracks and on the coast. Thus, this paper sheds light on how religious conversion served to ameliorate some of the difficulties that veterans faced as they attempted to re-enter rural life.

KEYWORDS: Evangelicals, Peru, Veterans, Race, Seventh-day Adventist

In August 1920, a congressional commission was dispatched to the departments of Puno and Cusco, at the heart of Peru's indigenous populations. The commission was led by Erasmo Roca, at the time head of the labor department in Augusto Leguía's new administration, and its purpose was to study the social conditions in which the Indians lived.¹ As the delegates traveled through the Indian communities in the highlands and

I give special thanks to Prof. Steven Kaplan, Hebrew University, Prof. Erick Langer, Georgetown University, and Prof. Gerardo Leibner, Tel Aviv University and the faculty and students at the Sverdlin Institute for Latin American History and Culture at Tel Aviv University for their valuable comments, support, and encouragement during the PhD research that forms the basis for this article. I have also benefited from the insightful suggestions of two anonymous reviewers for *The Americas*.

1. Erasmo Roca, *Por la clase indígena* (Lima: Compañía de Impresiones y Publicidad, 1935), 189, 247; Steven Pent, "Bridging the Rural-Urban Divide: Mobilization and Citizenship of a Peruvian Peasant Organization" (MA thesis: University of California-Santa Barbara, 2007), 82.

witnessed indigenous life firsthand, they found, for the most part, what they were seeking: a supposedly ignorant population, living in dire conditions under the oppressive hand of local *gamonales*.²

Yet not everything, or everyone, was as expected. During their time in Puno, the members of the commission came across what they believed to be Indians of a very different sort: men and women who were literate, clean, and filled with national pride. Interestingly, these Indians were all members of the Seventh-day Adventist Church, which had been active in the area since 1910. By 1925, the church had already established 11 mission stations, built at least 43 Sabbath schools, and baptized close to 7000 Indians. For the first decade of its existence, the church's native leadership were local Aymara-speaking Indians, many of whom were army veterans who had returned to their native communities after spending years in the barracks and on the coast.³ These men are the focus of this article.

Internal and external wars were waged in Peru for most of the nineteenth century. During the second half of that century, thousands of men were mobilized, first against Chile during the War of the Pacific (1879–84) and then in a series of internal conflicts and civil wars.⁴ Even after Nicolás de Piérola's victory over Andrés Cáceres in 1895, and the 30 years of political stability that followed it, military service was still mandatory for Indians. Considering this history, it is not surprising that the part that Indians played in the region's conflicts and wars has been a central topic of scholarly interest and has also provoked some heated debates.⁵

By contrast, what happened to the soldiers themselves, now veterans, in the aftermath of the fighting has received much less attention.⁶ In a sense, the

2. *Gamonales* is a term used throughout the Andes to describe large landowners and district authorities who exploited indigenous populations.

3. Roca, *Por la clase indígena*, 205. Around 1924 or 1925, the Aymara Adventist leaders left the church because of a deteriorating relationship with the missionaries. See Luis Gallegos, *Manuel Z. Camacho: biografía de un Aymara* (Puno: Editorial Universitaria, 1984), 59. There is also mention of Juan Huanca leaving the church around the same time. See Queja de Juan Huanca y Pedro, indígenas originarios del aillo Pallalla, 1922, Archivo Regional de Puno [hereafter AGN], Prefectura, caja 266.

4. On the professionalization of the Peruvian military and the reforms to the military implemented under Piérola, see Daniel Masterson, *Militarism and Politics in Latin America: Peru from Sánchez Cerro to Sendero Luminoso* (New York: Greenwood Press, 1991), 27; and Frederick Nunn, "Professional Militarism in Twentieth-Century Peru: Historical and Theoretical Background to the Golpe de Estado of 1968," *Hispanic American Historical Review* 59:3 (August 1979): 399–405.

5. Florencia Mallon, *Peasant and Nation: The Making of Postcolonial Mexico and Peru* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995); Nelson Manrique, *Tawar Mayu: sociedades terratenientes serranas, 1879–1910* (Lima: Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos, 2014), also found at <http://books.openedition.org/ifea/1821> (accessed January 23, 2020); Heraclio Bonilla, "El problema nacional y colonial del Perú en el contexto de la Guerra del Pacífico," *Histórica* 3:2 (December 1979): 1–34.

6. Among the scholars who have addressed various aspects of military demobilization and reintegration in Latin America, see Patricio Ibarra, "Veteranos y prensa satírica: desmovilizados e inválidos en los periódicos chilenos de caricaturas durante la Guerra del Pacífico (1879–1884)," *Universum* 28:2 (2013): 59–81; Thomas Rath, *Myths of*

silencing of the cannons also quieted the historiographical clamor around the social roles and identifications of Indian soldiers.

However, it is not likely that Indians simply returned to their land and animals as if they had never left them. Scholarship on other periods and geographical areas has demonstrated that the reintegration of former soldiers into their homelands and native communities has often caused social unrest.⁷ After all, one does not need a fertile imagination to understand why thousands of Red Army veterans were resentful of an establishment that did not grant them the social and economic privileges they were promised.⁸ Nor does one have to be especially insightful to figure out why thousands of Nigerian soldiers who served in the British colonial army were viewed as oppressors by their former villagers.⁹

Perhaps soldiers' reintegration into Andean rural society has been overlooked in part because of the difficulty of estimating the extent of this phenomenon. Since there is no exact data on the number of enlisted Indian soldiers in the Peruvian army, it is obviously hard to assess how many of them were discharged.¹⁰ Furthermore, even if we did possess information about enlistment, we would still have to figure how many soldiers returned home and how many pursued opportunities elsewhere. Considering the fact that the military did not keep track of veterans, this is an extremely complicated task, if at all possible. These shortcomings have clear implications for this case study: it is impossible to know how many veterans returned to the department of Puno, and how many among them joined the Adventist Church. Furthermore, I was unable to locate the Adventist Church's local archive from these years, which may have held documents with information on converts' backgrounds, possibly including details on their military service.

Demilitarization in Postrevolutionary Mexico, 1920–1960 (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2013); and Carlos Méndez, *Desierto de esperanzas. De la gloria al abandono. Los veteranos chilenos y peruanos de la Guerra del 79* (Santiago de Chile: Centro de Estudios Bicentenario, 2009).

7. See for example Mark D. Van Ells, *To Hear Only Thunder Again: America's World War II Veterans Come Home* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2001); and Laura McEnaney, "Nightmares on Elm Street: Demobilizing in Chicago, 1945–1953," *Journal of American History* 92:4 (March 2006): 1265–1291.

8. Robert Dale, "Rats and Resentment: The Demobilization of the Red Army in Postwar Leningrad, 1945–50," *Journal of Contemporary History* 45:1 (January 2010): 113–133.

9. James Matthews, "Clock Towers for the Colonized: Demobilization of the Nigerian Military and the Readjustment of Its Veterans to Civilian Life, 1918–1925," *International Journal of African Studies* 14:2 (January 1981): 254–271.

10. Scholars have offered various estimates of the military's size at different points throughout the nineteenth century. For example, the estimate of enlisted soldiers during the War of the Pacific ranges from 4500 to 9000, and the highest number of soldiers allowed by the Peruvian congress was 30,000, during the Chinca Island War (1864–66). See William F. Sater, *Andean Tragedy: Fighting the War of the Pacific, 1879–1884* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2007), 47; and Christine Hunefeldt, *Power Constellations in Peru: Military Recruitment Around the War of the Pacific in Puno*, in *Power, Culture and Violence in the Andes*, Christine Hunefeldt and Misha Kokotovic, eds. (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2009), 53.

Despite these drawbacks, evidence does support the arguments that some army veterans did return to their communities and that many, if not the vast majority, of the Adventist Church's native Indian leaders in Puno were veterans. As to the first argument, a number of contemporaries, such as the *indigenista* intellectual Luis Valcárcel observed that "of the millions of Indians who have completed their military service, there are roughly a few thousands who have not returned to their place of origin; all the others returned, not only in body, but also in soul, to their traditional place."¹¹ Valcárcel's remark is clearly an exaggeration, since the Peruvian army as a whole never numbered millions. Nonetheless, his comment indicates that a significant cohort of Indian soldiers returned home once they were discharged. Attesting specifically to Seventh-day Adventists, Erasmo Roca observed that "most of the (Adventist) teachers that we have met are army veterans."¹² Moreover, I have been able to confirm that at least 15 converts were veterans. I reached this conclusion by juxtaposing documents from the Seventh-day Adventist General Conference archive and petitions submitted by Indians found in Puno's regional archive. The first series of documents occasionally includes names of converts, and the second series sporadically mentions plaintiffs' previous military service. Altogether, we are presented with a useful picture of veterans' presence in Puno, and more importantly, in the Seventh-day Adventist Church.

In a country where Catholicism was an integral part of the national identity, how is it that a group of former soldiers, supposedly standard-bearers of nationalism, became the autochthonous leaders of a Protestant church? Some might argue that this has to do with the dilapidated state of the Catholic Church, which lacked priests and had increased fees for the administration of its sacraments. However, these problems were not particular to veterans, nor were they new.¹³ The Catholic Church in Peru, as in other places across Latin America, had been struggling politically and economically since independence. In rural areas, locals had been conducting their religious affairs without priests for decades and had even found ways to cope with the surging cost of sacraments. Notwithstanding the deficient state of the Catholic Church in Puno, natives of the district of Chucuito, where Adventism flourished, had relatively good access to Catholic religious services. From Platería, where the Adventists established their first mission, to the city of Puno, the department's capital and bishop's seat, it was about a five-and-half hour walk, and less on horseback or by boat. The church

11. Luis Valcárcel, *Ruta cultural del Perú* (Mexico City: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1945), 101.

12. Roca, *Por la clase indígena*, 207. Converts' military service was also mentioned in the press. See "Distrito de Chucuito," *La Unión*, March 17, 1913, Archivo Pedro Zulen [hereafter APZ] Documentación Administrativa de La Asociación Pro Indígena, Subseries Queja, 1914–1916, código 2000027183.

13. See Jeffrey L. Klaiber, *The Catholic Church in Peru, 1821–1985: A Social History* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1992); and Fernando Armas Asín, comp., *La construcción de la iglesia en los Andes* (Lima: Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú, 1999).

in the nearby town of Chucuito, the Iglesia de la Asunción, was active, and Father Benigno Pinazo conducted services there.¹⁴ Thus, while the lack of religious services may have contributed to the expansion of Seventh-day Adventism, this factor alone cannot explain the Adventists' success. Nor does it account for why army veterans were especially dominant in the Adventist indigenous leadership.

The fact was that for many veterans reintegration into rural society proved to be a complicated task that included economic, political, and cultural challenges. In the following pages, I argue that veterans' decision to convert was intimately tied to these challenges. Joining the Adventist Church provided new paths for social mobility and new ways to accumulate political authority. Additionally, conversion offered a new paradigm through which veterans could reinterpret their racial identity and redefine the meaning of "Indian-ness." In fact, it was a way to resist notions of *mestizaje* that connected upward social mobility with disassociation from indigenous culture and the Indian community.

ARMY VETERANS AND CONFLICTS OVER NATURAL RESOURCES

Around the year 1900, Manuel Camacho, a former soldier in Nicolás de Piérola's rebel army, decided to return home to the department of Puno.¹⁵ Reaching the highlands, he discovered that his father had died and that what had used be to the family's *estancia* was now part of the nearby hacienda.¹⁶ His mother had remarried and was living with her husband and children on an estancia in the district of Chucuito, located near Lake Titicaca. Camacho's stepfather agreed to take him in, since he was part of the extended family.¹⁷ Yet, because of his position as a stepson, his status within the family was precarious and he stood little chance of inheriting land; this made him, in effect, a landless peasant.¹⁸

Camacho was not the only man to discover that what he had left behind no longer existed or had significantly changed. During the final decades of the nineteenth century came construction of the railroad from the port city of Matarani to Juliaca and Puno and other improvements in infrastructure, and Puno, once a

14. Queja de Vicente Leutipa y Mariano Achocalla, 1909, ARP, Prefectura, caja 225.

15. There are various, and often contradicting, biographies for Manuel Camacho. He left his community as a boy and spent a few years with relatives on the coast before joining Piérola's army. David Chambi, "Sección Pedagógica: la labor cultural y educativa del Amauta moderno indígena," *Platería*: (1961): 5; Gallegos, *Manuel Z. Camacho*, 18–19.

16. In the Andes the term '*estancia*' is used to refer to a small landholding, usually owned by Indians. 'Hacienda' refers to a large estate owned by mestizos.

17. Gallegos, *Manuel Z. Camacho*, 36.

18. For a short description of the difficulties embedded in inheritance for adopted children, illegal children, or landless families living in the estancias belonging to richer peasants, see Hans and Judith Maria Buechler, *The Bolivian Aymara* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1971), 41–42.

remote area, became much more accessible. As in other places across the globe, technology accelerated the region's integration into the world economy. International houses of commerce that exported wool and had formerly conducted business from Arequipa branched out and established permanent representatives in Puno. In doing so, they connected the region directly to the international market, bypassing local trade circuits, cutting out Indian middlemen, and making competition harder for local, especially Indian, producers.¹⁹ As the demand for wool grew and its price soared, competition over natural resources accelerated. Endless quarrels over grasslands, reservoirs, and cultivated land erupted between Indians and local hacienda owners, among family members, and within the same community.²⁰

In such a tense and competitive environment, military conscription was a means of “getting rid” of opponents.²¹ During the nineteenth century, conscription was accomplished mainly through personal ties and patronage networks. Attempting to end these practices and modernize the military, Piérola initiated a military reform in 1898 that included new methods and institutions for drafting men into the armed forces.²² The idea was to bureaucratize the draft and thus eliminate the personal ties and individual negotiations that had characterized recruitment in the past. Furthermore, as a result of these steps, regional elites were to lose an essential part of their power to Lima.²³ Put differently, the military reform can also be seen as part of the government's centralization efforts.

Nevertheless, similar to the situation in neighboring Bolivia, in practice Lima continued to rely on regional elites to implement its orders.²⁴ Accordingly, the people seated at the district conscription councils were usually local governors, judges, and other men who could be easily considered gamonales. In fact, according to Daniel Masterson, the practice of recruiting through personal

19. On the wool trade and the way in which wool entered the market, see Benjamin Orlove, *Alpacas, Sheep, and Men: The Wool Export Economy and Regional Society in Southern Peru* (New York: Academic Press, 1977), 45–50.

20. See Karen Spalding, “Class Structures in the Southern Peruvian Highlands, 1750–1920,” *Radical Left History* (Fall/Winter 1975): 5–27; Michael J. Gonzales, “Neo-Colonialism and Indian Unrest in Southern Peru, 1867–1898,” *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 6:1 (January 1987): 1–26; and Peter Blanchard, “Indian Unrest in the Peruvian Sierra in the Late Nineteenth Century,” *The Americas* 38:4 (April 1982): 449–462.

21. On forced military recruitment in the Andes, see Nelson Manrique, *Campesinado y nación. Las guerrillas indígenas en la Guerra con Chile* (Lima: Centro de Investigación y Capacitación, 1981), 56–60.

22. David Víctor Velásquez Silva, “Indios, soldados sin patria: la conscripción militar en el Perú durante el siglo XIX,” *Historia* 1:2 (2018): 56–72.

23. On the power struggles between Lima and regional elites, see Ascensión Martínez Rianza, “Política regional y gobierno de la Amazonia peruana. Loreto (1883–1914),” *Histórica* 23:2 (1999): 393–462; and David Nugent, “Building the State, Making the Nation: The Bases and Limits of State Centralization in ‘Modern’ Peru,” *American Anthropologist* 96:2 (June 1994): 333–369.

24. On the Bolivian case, see Elizabeth Shesko, “Mobilizing Manpower for War: Toward a New History of Bolivia's Chaco Conflict 1932–1935,” *Hispanic American Historical Review* 95:2 (May 2015): 319.

influence and favor would disappear completely from Peru's military management only in the 1950s.²⁵ Hence, despite the changes, hacienda owners and other strongmen were still able to target Indians who refused to obey their demands and send them to the barracks as they had done in the past.²⁶

Because power was delegated along vertical lines in the Andes, community authorities were usually the ones in charge of rounding up recruits. In some cases these men used their power to influence recruiting procedures to the disadvantage of their opponents.²⁷ Indeed, anyone could exert whatever leverage they had to secure the recruitment of men who posed a "problem" for them.²⁸ Obviously, the stronger and more extensive one's social networks were, the better the chances of achieving one's goal. Yet, recruitment was not accomplished strictly by force. Cecilia Méndez, for instance, argues that recruiting Indians as soldiers involved both "sticks and carrots" and was often done within the traditional reciprocal relationships characteristic of Andean societies.²⁹ Exemption from taxes was one possible reward for Indians who agreed to serve in the army and had enough power to negotiate their terms of service.³⁰ For many others, however, limited access to natural resources and the inability to secure a livelihood meant emigration from their communities in pursuit of work, mainly heading for plantations on the coast.

25. Masterson, *Militarism and Politics in Latin America*, 18.

26. Christine Hunefeldt, "Power Constellations in Peru," 70. Although this topic is in need of further research, one could argue that the power of regional elites in military conscription actually grew as a result of the military reform and the political stability of the first decades of the twentieth century. The fact is that only a small percentage of men were drafted into the regular army (Ejército Regular). In 1904, for example, the authorities in Puno were requested to fill a quota of 101 men to be drafted into the army. Clearly, the number of Punoño men who met the criteria for military service was much larger than this, and it appears that the men who ended up serving were chosen rather arbitrarily and according to personal relationships. Moreover, new recruits were usually sent to the provincial capital and from there were transferred either to the closest battalion in need of men, or to Lima, where most of the military units were concentrated. Thus, we should also consider the possibility that some men were able to use patronage networks to secure service near, or relatively near, their home areas. See David Víctor Velásquez Silva, "La reforma militar y el gobierno de Nicolás de Piérola: el ejército moderno y la construcción del estado peruano" (MA thesis: Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos, 2013), 342, 491.

27. Hunefeldt, "Power Constellations in Peru," 76.

28. Similarly, Thomas Rath argues that local authorities in Mexico used conscription and military instruction to intimidate members of labor unions and cope with labor unrest. See Thomas Rath, "'Que el cielo un soldado en cada hijo te dio . . .': Conscription, Recalcitrance, and Resistance in Mexico in the 1940s," *Journal of Latin American Studies* 37 (August 2005): 515. One could also try to use social networks to avoid conscription. In fact, Christine Hunefeldt demonstrates that Indian communal authorities advocated against the conscription of certain members of their communities. See Hunefeldt, "Power Constellations in Peru," 61, 63.

29. Cecilia Méndez, "Militares populistas: ejército, etnicidad y ciudadanía en el Perú," in *Repensando la subalternidad: miradas críticas desde/sobre América Latina*, Pablo Sandoval, ed. (Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, 2009), 575–577. Elizabeth Shesko also points to the various strategies used to recruit Indians into the Bolivian army and discusses the limitation of written sources in this regard. See Shesko, "Mobilizing Manpower for War," 314.

30. Méndez, "Militares populistas," 576; Florencia Mallon, *The Defense of Community in Peru's Central Highlands: Peasant Struggle and Capitalist Transition, 1860–1940* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983), 103; Nicola Foote, "Experiences of Military Struggle in Liberal Ecuador, 1895–1930," in *Military Struggle and Identity Formation in Latin America: Race, Nation, and Community during the Liberal Period*, Nicola Foote et al., eds. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2010), 86.

However, rather than heading for Lima or to a large estate, some chose to join the army.³¹

Because the terms under which Indians were conscripted varied greatly, veterans returned home to different realities. Those who had enough negotiating power in the first place to ensure “carrots” were obviously better off than Indians who were “pushed” from their lands and into the barracks. Yet, at least to an extent, all veterans would have to deal with changes in the status quo that took shape during their absence, and often at their expense. For example, Juan Huanca and Pedro Pauro, who would join the Adventist Church around 1912, were recruited into the Third Battalion, leaving behind an estancia in the district of Chucuito. When they returned home, sometime around the year 1900, they found that other family members had taken over pasturelands they had formerly used. Furthermore, not only did these relatives privatize what had been common resources, but they also helped themselves to parts of Huanca’s estancia.³²

There is nothing surprising in the fact that Huanca and Pauro came home to find themselves in a quarrel with their own families. Intra-familial conflicts over property were commonplace in the rural Andes, especially after Ramón Castilla enacted a new civil code in 1852. The 1852 code canceled the *mayorazgo*, a traditional inheritance system based on primogeniture whose main function was to safeguard the integrity of the estate, and replaced it with a system premised on partible inheritance.³³ Estates were now divided among spouses and children, weakening ties and economic commitments among members of the same descendant group. Where no will was stipulated, or in cases of contradicting claims over property, conflict erupted easily. Moreover, since various notions of land tenure existed in Indian communities, disputes could break out over the nature of tenure even when the title to a given land parcel was not contested. Extended family might recognize an individual’s title without recognizing his right to sell the land.³⁴

31. Olinda Celestino, *Migración y cambio: la comunidad de Lampián* (Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, 1972), 35; Lesley Gill, “Creating Citizens, Making Men: The Military and Masculinity in Bolivia,” *Cultural Anthropology* 12:4 (November 1997): 530.

32. Queja de Pedro Pauro, Juan Huanca y otros, 1912, ARP, Prefectura, caja 254.

33. Nils Jacobsen, *Mirages in Transition: The Peruvian Altiplano, 1780–1930* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), 244. According to Ted Lewellen, the changes in inheritance began in 1825, at a time when population was still small and there was enough land to go around. See Ted Lewellen, *Peasants in Transition: The Changing Economy of the Peruvian Aymara. A General Systems Approach* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1978), 38.

34. Jacobsen, *Mirages in Transition*, 267.

Such family conflicts were widespread, especially at the turn of the century when wool was in high demand.³⁵ While this problem was not specific to veterans, the returning soldiers were particularly vulnerable to these sorts of disputes. The Peruvian state offered meager programs and funds for demobilization and reintegration. Therefore, aside from their own ability to negotiate terms of recruitment and secure future benefits, veterans depended on kin to help them find their way back into communal life after service. Those who did not have anyone to advocate on their behalf or safeguard their possessions, or those whose families were deeply torn by internal conflict, had few sources of support and social outreach. In fact, the return of veterans often further aggravated conflicts, as there were now additional demands and needs to consider.

In some cases, disputes within the family and weak familial cohesion facilitated external interventions.³⁶ Such appears to be the case of Candelaria Mamani and veteran Lucas Mamani.³⁷ According to the latter, Candelaria had taken over lands that were part of his estancia and had been cultivating them together with *colonos* from a nearby hacienda owned by Jorge Pinazo.³⁸ The fact that Pinazo's peons were working on an estancia in the nearby community could have been a part of a planned initiative on Pinazo's part to expand the hacienda. However, it also could very well have been that Pinazo was unaware of the skirmishes going on in his backyard and that his potential involvement was a result of dynamics among Indians.

As a woman landowner, it made sense for Candelaria Mamani to seek powerful allies. This would be especially important if she knew that the land that she had inherited, or land that was currently at her disposal, was subject to a dispute. One option Candelaria had was to sell her land to Jorge Pinazo, who owned haciendas in that area; by selling her land and becoming a peon, she would enjoy Pinazo's protection and political outreach. As a result, Lucas Mamani would have to deal with a mestizo landowner rather than an Indian woman. Yet, if Candelaria did not want to sell her land, and wished to preserve her independence, she could marry a peon or forge some sort of reciprocal relationship with Pinazo's peons.³⁹ She would not enjoy direct protection from

35. Quarrels over inheritance were also prevalent among mestizos. See Harry Tschopik, *The Aymara of Chucuito, Peru: [Part 1] Magic*, Anthropological Papers of the American Museum of Natural History 44:2 (New York: American Museum of Natural History, 1951), 161.

36. Annalyda Álvarez-Calderón, "Pilgrimages through Mountains, Deserts, and Ocean: The Quest for Indian Citizenship, Puno (1900–1930)" (PhD diss.: Stony Brook University, 2009), 15.

37. It is not known exactly how Candelaria Mamani and Lucas Mamani were related. However, we know that they had the same surname, that they lived in the same ayllu, and that their estancias were close to one another. Thus, at the very least, they were part of the same extended family.

38. Queja de Simón León y Lucas Mamani, indígenas del Distrito de Chucuito, 1912, ARP, Prefectura, caja 238.

39. Mallon, *The Defense of Community*, 77–78. On the relationship between hacienda Indians and the larger Indian community, see Andrés Guerrero, *La semántica de la dominación* (Quito: Ediciones Libri Mundi, 1991).

Pinazo but would have allies inside the hacienda who could advocate on her behalf.

Lucas Mamani, on the other side, did not have the same kind of social ties. Reciprocal relationships were established over time and depended on daily interactions and mutual, even if unequal, commitments between Indians, communal authorities, and local mestizos. Veterans who had spent years away from the community, cut away from its social fabric, did not have the same opportunities to forge these crucial social networks and were not necessarily well integrated into the local patronage networks that were crucial in quarrels over resources. Indians used social and political leverage to “pressure” men like Pinazo into helping them, or “played” hacienda owners against each other, using one to serve as a counterforce to the other.⁴⁰ Veterans were therefore left without strong allies to protect their interests or intervene on their behalf.⁴¹

Veterans’ distance from communal social life also had important political implications, particularly in Puno. In the central sierra, Indians protected their own lands and communities from outside invaders and “inside” traitors.⁴² Veterans’ achievements in the battlefield may have been an asset in local politics and a way to establish political authority, but in Puno things were a bit different. Although the department had contributed to war efforts, it was not in the eye of the storm, and success in the battlefield did not confer the same social esteem as it may have in other places. Simply put, respect, or other forms of symbolic capital veterans accumulated in the barracks, did not necessarily translate into social status or political authority in Puno. In fact, they could have meant the opposite, since returning veterans had to start on accumulating prestige and status at a relatively advanced age. Although some men, like Camacho, had reached rank in the army, they could not transform this into political power in the community and were asked to perform tasks at the lower end of the indigenous community’s prestige system, such as that of *portapliogo*, or mail carrier.⁴³ Moreover, even if they were able to avoid laborious demands, their precarious economic situation was still a barrier to leadership positions within the politico-religious hierarchy

40. Jacobsen, *Mirages in Transition*, 234–235

41. Obviously, this was not the experience of all veterans, and some were rather successful in establishing or maintaining relationships with local mestizos. Justo Condori, an Indian army veteran forged alliances with local mestizos and hacienda owners and assisted them against the Indian rebels in Wancho. José Luis Ayala, *Yo fui camillita de José Carlos Mariátegui: (auto) biografía de Mariano Larico Yurja* (Kollao: Editorial Periodística S. C. R., 1990), 85.

42. Mallon, *The Defense of Community*, 85–90.

43. Queja de Pedro Puro, indígena de Chucuito, 1912, ARP, Prefectura, caja 238. An additional source includes Adventists’ complaints against the cargo system (although it is unknown if the plaintiffs were veterans): Queja de Maximo Nacca, Manuel Yupanqui, Eugenio Flores . . . indígenas del Distrito de Chucuito, 1912, ARP, Prefectura, caja 238.

Owning land was often a prerequisite for the higher-level positions in the prestige system, which required the capital to sponsor religious festivities.⁴⁴ Veterans who were either completely pushed off their lands, or were busy fighting over them, did not have the necessary resources. Additionally, formal marriage within the Catholic Church was also a precondition for upward mobility in the communal hierarchy.⁴⁵ Nevertheless, the price of the sacrament had been increasing steadily since the middle of the nineteenth century, and the high cost had often led couples to choose cohabitation over marriage.⁴⁶ As a result, young men were unable to formalize their relationships, which in turn affected their social and political mobility.

To sum up thus far, the incorporation of Puno into the global market unleashed fierce competition over natural resources. Thousands of Indians lost their lands during this period, and communities and families were torn apart because of endless conflicts over land and water. Although these problems and challenges were commonplace, veterans, having been absent for a long time, were in a particularly delicate situation, since they depended on their families' economic resources and social and political outreach for successful reintegration. Familial fractures, therefore, debilitated this safety net and made it unreliable, which eventually burdened or hindered veterans' reintegration efforts, economically and politically.

In some cases, veterans were even perceived by their families or communities as a direct threat. During their absence, new equilibriums were reached between disparate parts of society, sometimes at the expense of these veterans. That being the case, once the former soldiers returned home, demanding what used to be theirs, or that to which they believed they were entitled, they disturbed the fragile balance and added pressure to an already strained situation. Hence, neighbors, family members, communal authorities, and hacienda owners often shared the desire to prevent the reintegration of veterans, pushing them to the community's margins or expelling them from it. Nonetheless, the struggle over economic and political resources was not the only hurdle for veterans. Other barriers stood in the way of successful reintegration. Cultural ones.

44. Billie Jean Isbell, *To Defend Ourselves: Ecology and Ritual in an Andean Village* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1978).

45. Isbell, *To Defend Ourselves*, 117.

46. There is much dispute among scholars over the nature of trial marriage in the Andes, See Inge Bolin, *Rituals of Respect: The Secret of Survival in the High Peruvian Andes* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2002), 112.

CULTURAL BARRIERS

The young soldiers' departure from the Indian community to spend an extended period of time in a distant location had important implications for them. Most significantly, it provided them an opportunity to observe and to absorb life in other parts of the nation. For those who descended from the Andean plateau toward the lower regions or the coast, this was of particular importance. As Sarah Radcliffe and Sallie Westwood have argued, in the Andes "race is regionalized and region racialized."⁴⁷ In other words, geography was intimately tied to racial identity: certain regions were considered "Indian," while others were "mestizo." In the Peruvian case, it has been common to differentiate the "mestizo" coast and cities from the "Indian" highlands and rural areas. The higher one climbed, the more Indian the landscape became.

It was not, of course, that Indians, even those living in the remote parts of the highlands, were isolated from outside influences. They often encountered mestizos from nearby towns, and were aware of mestizos' way of life, even adopting specific practices and commodities.⁴⁸ However, this was not the same as living in an area dominated by mestizo culture and directly under its influence. Moreover, leaving the community also meant leaving behind a familiar social environment and established networks. While we should not assume that the army's social structure did not resemble or rely on traditional communal networks, military service entailed a significant rupture for *puneño* soldiers who were sent to other regions. Soldiers were now free from the community's internal hierarchies and social pressures, making it easier for them to cross social and cultural borders. Away from the prying eyes of their neighbors, these young Indian men had adopted—voluntarily, by force, or a little of both—new habits and practices. Once discharged, veterans took this new cultural baggage with them. In an oral testimony about events in the 1920s, Mariano Larico, an Aymara Indian who became a political activist, witnessed veterans' attempts to reintegrate into his community in the province of Huancané. He recalled that former soldiers had gone through major personal changes, changes that were visible to all when they left the army "with a blanket, shoes, uniform and a cap." Larico noted, "They have become accustomed to underwear; they keep their uniforms so they can wear them while dancing in the fiesta."⁴⁹

47. Sarah Radcliffe and Sallie Westwood, *Remaking the Nation: Identity and Politics in Latin America* (London: Routledge, 1996), 111.

48. Olivia Harris and Brooke Larson, eds., *Ethnicity, Market, and Migration in the Andes: At the Crossroads of Anthropology and History* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1995).

49. Ayala, *Yo fui canillita*, 186. The Peruvian scholar José Luis Ayala interviewed Mariano Larico in the 1980s about his life and his work with his cousin Carlos Condorena, one of the main leaders of the Huancané rebellion (1924).

Why was it that possessing a blanket or a pair of shoes indicated a profound personal transformation? As leading scholars such as Mary Weismantel and Marisol de la Cadena have demonstrated, race in the Andes was constructed through cultural characteristics rather than physiological properties.⁵⁰ In other words, Indians differed from mestizos in the way they dressed, what they ate, where they lived, and how they spent their time. Clothing, in this sense, was especially important because of its visibility, and people often distinguished mestizos from Indians by referring to specific items they wore.⁵¹ Benjamin Orlove, for example, delves into the significance of shoes as a distinctive feature that differentiated mestizos from Indians.⁵² Accordingly, when Larico viewed veterans who used to walk barefoot, as Indians do, now wearing shoes, as mestizos do, he interpreted this as a sign of radical change in their racial identity. In his mind, they were breaking away from their past as Indians and were slowly transforming into mestizos.

What made this change even more plausible was the fact that veterans returned to the community with another important and presumably mestizo asset: Spanish. One could rightfully argue that their knowledge of the language, at least in terms of literacy, was quite basic.⁵³ As part of its “civilizing mission,” the Peruvian army launched literacy initiatives for Indians. Access to these programs, however, was limited and their success highly debatable.⁵⁴ Even so, being in the barracks and near coastal cities provided informal opportunities for veterans to learn at least some Spanish. In an interview with anthropologists Ricardo Valderrama Fernández and Carmen Escalante Gutiérrez, Gregorio Mamani described his own attempt to learn Spanish while in service in the early 1930s. “You were unable to speak [Spanish] when you entered [the barracks] and still unable to speak when you left, Spanish barely dribbling from your tongue. There in the army those lieutenants and captains did not want us speaking the *runa* tongue. They would say: ‘Damn it, Indians! Spanish!’ So the noncommissioned officers would beat Spanish into us.”⁵⁵

50. Marisol de la Cadena, *Indigenous Mestizos: The Politics of Race and Culture in Cuzco, Peru, 1919–1991* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2000); Mary Weismantel, *Cholas and Pishtacos: Stories of Race and Sex in the Andes* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001); Deborah Poole, *Vision, Race, and Modernity: A Visual Economy of the Andean Image World* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997).

51. De la Cadena, *Indigenous Mestizos*, 220.

52. Benjamin Orlove, “Down to Earth: Race and Substance in the Andes,” *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 17:2 (May 1998): 214.

53. Frederick M. Nunn, “Professional Militarism in Twentieth-Century Peru: Historical and Theoretical Background to the Golpe de Estado of 1968,” *Hispanic American Historical Review* 59:3 (August 1979): 400.

54. Nunn, “Professional Militarism,” 400.

55. Gregorio Condori Mamani was born in an Indian community in the district of Acopía, Cusco, probably circa 1910. According to his testimony, he was an orphan and was raised by his godmother until she decided to send him to earn his own keep. He then spent years wandering between communities, often returning to his native home just to leave again. He was recruited during one of his sojourns in Acopía, and following his discharge settled in the shantytowns of Cusco.

On one hand, Mamani declares that Indian soldiers did not learn a thing. On the other hand, Spanish had become a part of the Indian soldiers in the most physical way possible: it had been violently imprinted into them through the daily brutality of training.⁵⁶ Where the classroom had failed, ruthlessness prevailed. In other words, it was through these daily experiences that Indian soldiers learned basic Spanish. From the city's point of view, to use Efraín Kristal's terms, veterans' knowledge of Spanish may have seemed insufficient. However, back in the home community, "a little" became "a lot." In this context Marisol de la Cadena offers a dynamic view of race, which changes according to the locale and the participants involved. "Indians and mestizos" she argues "emerge from interaction, not from evolution."⁵⁷ Consequently, the perception of a veteran as mestizo or Indian was premised less on the objective quality of his spoken Spanish than on his fluency in comparison to other interlocutors, who on average knew less than the returning soldier did. It was the context that turned an Indian into a mestizo, and reactions to this apparent change came swiftly.⁵⁸

RACE AND LOCAL REACTIONS TOWARD VETERANS

"When I was discharged from the army, I didn't want to go back to my hometown wearing soldier's clothes," related Gregorio Mamani during his testimony in *Andean Lives*. "Your fellow villagers see army clothes and say: 'He'll be a little *misti* only as long as those state clothes last him.'"⁵⁹ Mamani's description exemplifies the ambivalent attitudes with which veterans were faced on their return to the community. On one hand, the term "little *misti*" implies that returning veterans were viewed by other Indians as racially and socially superior.⁶⁰ Despite the historical upheavals of the nineteenth century, and although all Peruvian citizens were de jure considered equal before the law, Andean social structure remained highly stratified along racial lines.⁶¹ In other words, the more mestizo one was, the higher up he was on the social ladder.

See Ricardo Valderrama Fernández and Carmen Escalante Gutiérrez, *Andean Lives: Gregorio Condori Mamani and Asunta Quispe Huamán* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1998), 21–28, 47, 52.

56. In many Latin American nations, violence against conscripts during this period seems to have been widespread and to have targeted rookies, especially those from the popular classes. See Jonathan Ablard, "The Barracks Receives Spoiled Children and Returns Men": Debating Military Service, Masculinity and Nation-Building in Argentina, 1901–1930," *The Americas* 74:3 (July 2017): 317; and Peter Beattie, *The Tribute of Blood: Army, Honor, Race and Nation in Brazil, 1864–1945* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2001).

57. De la Cadena, *Indigenous Mestizos*, 6.

58. De la Cadena, *Indigenous Mestizos*, 6.

59. Gutiérrez, *Gregorio Mamani*, 54.

60. '*Misti*' is a variant of the word 'mestizo' meaning "powerful other." See Weismantel, *Cholas and Pishtacos*, xxxvii.

61. Indians remained "equal" before the law until the mid 1920s, at which time a new penal code was enacted, reintroducing "Indian" as a legal category, and addressing Indians' special social circumstances. See Lior Ben David,

Cultural adaptations, in this regard, also amounted to upward social mobility. On the other hand, being called a little *misti* was hardly a compliment. First, it marked one as an outsider, a person who was no longer considered by his peers to be an Indian and therefore no longer a part of the community. In this regard, the term demarcated social boundaries and informed members as to how they should act if they wished to be part of the group. Second, the use of this term ridiculed veterans who were perceived as attempting to imitate others rather than being true to their “authentic” selves. Without the costume, that is, without the *mestizo* clothing, the charade would end and veterans, the little *mistis*, would return to being what they truly are—Indians.

To complicate things even more, it appears that time frames it could be socially acceptable to act like a *mestizo*. As Mariano Larico testified, some veterans kept their uniforms “so they [could] wear them while dancing in the fiesta.” Although Larico seems to perceive such behavior as pretentious, he does not discredit veterans for it, nor does he claim that they were no longer Indians because of it. It was clearly hard to argue that one was becoming a *misti* while he was engaged in doing something so “Indian” as dancing in an Indian festival. Furthermore, wearing a uniform during religious celebration, which lasted a few days, was not the same as dressing in European clothes regularly. The fiesta was a special occasion and it was relatively common for participants to dress differently for its duration.⁶²

The veterans who returned to Larico’s community were, therefore, acting within the community’s social and racial norms. In this sense, the logic behind their decisions on how to dress for a specific occasion was similar to the logic that guided Gregorio Mamani, who would not be seen in his community in uniform. Both adhered to similar racial notions and social conventions that dictated how Indians were normally supposed to dress if they wanted to be accepted in the community. Nevertheless, at the same time, Larico frames this ephemeral change in dress as part of a wider and perpetual transformation in veterans’ character: they had “changed a lot.” Consequently, Larico manifests a sense of ambiguity towards veterans’ racial identity, an ambiguity similar to the one expressed in the term “little *misti*.”

“Indians and Indigenistas in the Field of Criminal Law: The Cases of Mexico and Peru, 1910s–1960s” (PhD diss.: Tel Aviv University, 2011). On colonial racial hierarchies and their implications, see Robert Jackson, *Race, Caste, and Status: Indians in Colonial Spanish America* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1999), 118–120.

62. Clothing serves as an important role in fiestas in both Mesoamerica and the Andes, and it is common for people to wear costumes or to dress in their best clothes on these occasions. See Peggy Barlett, “Reciprocity and the San Juan Fiesta,” *Journal of Anthropological Research* 36:1 (April 1980): 116–130; Vera Kandt, “Fiesta in Cuetzalan,” *Artes de México* 115 (January 1972): 104–107; and Lynn Meisch, “We are Sons of Atahualpa and We Will Win: Traditional Dress in Otavalo and Saraguro, Ecuador,” in *Textile Traditions of Mesoamerica and the Andes: An Anthropology*, Margot Blum Achévil et al., eds. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1991).

Hence, presumed attempts to cross racial borders were not easily accepted.⁶³ Indians and mestizos who were familiar with veterans' personal histories and genealogies had a difficult time reconciling their past identities with their present appearance, thus implicitly suggesting that they were imposters. In this regard, scholarly conceptualizations of hybridity or the fluidity of racial and ethnic identities in the Andes underestimate the psychological dissonances that the process of mestizaje creates, particularly in situations where the protagonists were previously acquainted with each other. Psychological uneasiness, however, was not the entire story. The veterans' "unsettled racial identity," to use Mary Weismantel's expression, had important practical ramifications.⁶⁴

Rooted in the colonial legal system, racial identification was initially implemented by the crown in order to distinguish between disparate segments of the population (Indians, mestizos, and creoles) and to judge them differently. Each racial category entailed a different set of duties and privileges, as well as differing legal consequences.⁶⁵ After independence, Peru adopted liberal legislation that emphasized ideas of citizenship and equality before the law. However, de facto the colonial social stratification remained intact and Indians de jure were still obligated to pay a head tax and provide labor upon the request of local authorities.⁶⁶ Consequently, if one's racial identity was in question, as was the case with veterans, so was the nature of his commitments and obligations.⁶⁷

Obviously, local mestizos, who were the prime benefactors of Indian labor, had the most to lose from veterans' supposed transformation into mestizos. Veterans' unclear racial identity also posed a problem for traditional communal authorities. Part of the power of communal authorities stemmed precisely from their ability to recruit Indian labor and collect taxes from community members. Veterans who no longer contributed to these ends compromised the success of these authorities and were a burden for the rest of the community. Moreover, how could the traditional communal authorities exercise power over men whose racial identity was ambiguous and unsettled? What would be their source

63. Laura Gotkowitz, for example, demonstrates how attempts to cross racial boundaries provoked strong, insulting reactions. See Laura Gotkowitz, "Trading Insults: Honor, Violence, and the Gendered Culture of Commerce in Cochabamba, Bolivia, 1870s–1950s," *Hispanic American Historical Review* 83:1 (February 2003): 83–118.

64. Weismantel, *Cholas and Pishtacos*, 45.

65. Robert Jackson, *Race, Caste and Status: Indians in Colonial Spanish America* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1999), 118–120.

66. Thomas Davis, "Indian Integration in Peru, 1820–1948: An Overview," *The Americas* 30:2 (October 1973): 184–186.

67. Scholars have demonstrated that Indians had attempted to "pass" as mestizos to avoid paying taxes. In certain cases mestizos also tried to present themselves as Indians to escape the Inquisition. Jackson, *Race, Caste and Status*, 5–6; Alberro Solange, *La actividad del Santo Oficio de la inquisición en Nueva España, 1571–1700* (México: Instituto Nacional de Antropología e Historia, 1981).

of authority over those who adhered to new values, displayed new habits, possessed a new set of skills, and were unwilling to act the ways Indians were supposed to act? The inability to place veterans in a neat racial category disturbed the racial order and exposed the system's vulnerabilities. As a result, it became crucial to police racial boundaries in an effort to keep individuals in the "right" place.

In this regard, insults or mockery served as disciplinary methods aimed at regulating behavior and punishing deviation. In fact, when these tools failed, harsher ones were implemented. Manuel Camacho, together with two recently converted Adventist Indians, Santos Valdéz and Mariano Chahuaris, were beaten by local mestizos and carried off to prison for wearing European clothing in the nearby town of Chucuito. Whether or not Valdéz and Chuhuaris were veterans is unknown; however, they did spend several years in Arequipa where they came into close contact with mestizo culture and adopted some of its cultural traits.⁶⁸ These men were effectively presented with a choice: either succumb to the hegemonic notions of race and act as "Indians" were supposed to act, or leave the community for good.

Some, like Gregorio Mamani, who opted not to return to his community, accepted these social demands. Instead of returning home, he settled on the outskirts of Cusco where he could continue to dress in European clothing without suffering the social sanctions that would ensue from doing so in a rural setting. But others, like Camacho, did not. On one hand, these veterans refused to give up the habits and tastes to which they had become accustomed while away. On the other hand, they returned to their communities and would not leave, even under extreme pressure. Moreover, although Adventist veterans were constantly accused of being racial imposters, they themselves never claimed to be anything but Indians. In fact, in their correspondence with local or national authorities, or even with international Adventist Church representatives, they repeatedly stated that they were "Indians from the district of Chucuito," or an "Indian from the community of . . .," or an "Indian named . . .," rarely, if ever, claiming another racial identity.⁶⁹

At least *de jure*, Indians were not obligated to address their race and could simply state their place of residence.⁷⁰ Of course, one could argue that this notion was the official version and that it is therefore hard to learn about people's "actual" racial

68. Queja de Santos Valdéz y Mariano Chahuaris, indígenas del Distrito de Chucuito, March 1913), APZ, Correspondencias. Cartas Recibidas.

69. See for example Camacho's self-reference in Queja de Santos Valdéz y Mariano Chahuaris; Queja de los indígenas de Chucuito, 1912, ARP, Prefectura, caja 238; and Queja de Máximo Naca, Manuel Yupanqui y otros, 1912, ARP, Prefectura, caja 238.

70. It is important to note that the veterans who made up the indigenous leadership of the Adventist Church were literate. Manuel Camacho and Juan Huanca wrote their own petitions and did not depend on notaries to choose their words for them.

identifications from them. However, people did not use terms that followed legal formalities simply because this was the convention. They did so because they wanted to receive official recognition of whatever it was they were claiming.⁷¹ An important part of *mestizaje* took place between the fine lines of bureaucratic paperwork.⁷² It was not uncommon for Indians to present themselves as mestizos when approaching authorities; when these claims went uncontested, it served to validate their *mestizo*-ness.⁷³ Consequently, it made little sense for anyone who sought social recognition as a *mestizo* to define himself as an Indian in official correspondence. If, in fact, veterans were engaged in *mestizaje*, it would have made much more sense for them to present themselves as mestizos in correspondence to assert their new identity rather than to proclaim the exact opposite.

Veterans also affirmed their Indian identity by joining the they called “The Indian Mission to Lake Titicaca.” This name stands out among Seventh-day Adventist missions worldwide, as it is rather unusual.⁷⁴ Missions were usually named in accordance with their geographical location—the Peruvian Mission, or the Upper Paraná Mission, and so on, giving no indication of ethnic or racial characteristics.⁷⁵ In the Andean context specifically, it is hard to see how any self-proclaimed *mestizo* would want to identify with such an institution. The Adventist Church in this sense was like any other Indian community in the region: it did not include mestizos. Therefore, veterans who were “*mistis*” were engaging in racial transformation mostly in the eyes of others. In their own eyes, they remained Indians despite their new, apparently *mestizo*, habits. Coupled with conflicts over natural resources, tensions over former soldiers’ racial identity quickly exploded, leading to constant clashes with mestizos and other Indians. Ostracized, they searched for an alternative, finding it in the pews of the Seventh-day Adventist Church.

THE REGENERATED INDIAN AND SEVENTH-DAY ADVENTISM

The Seventh-day Adventist Church was born in mid nineteenth-century New York out of the Millerite movement. Distinguished by the observance of

71. On the importance of legal forms of writing, see Kathryn Burns, *Into the Archive: Writing and Power in Colonial Peru* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2010).

72. In fact, during the colonial period whiteness could be purchased. See Ann Twinam, *Purchasing Whiteness: Pardos, Mulattos, and the Quest for Social Mobility in the Spanish Indies* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2015).

73. See for example Laura Gotkowitz, “Trading Insults,” 83–118, esp. N6, N11, and N20.

74. Another exception was the “Negro mission,” which formed a part of the Southern Union Conference and was probably an outcome of US segregation laws.

75. See for example the lists of missions, conferences, and unions in the Seventh-Day Adventist yearbooks for 1908, 1915, and 1919, published by the Review & Herald Publishing Association, Takoma Park, MD, <http://documents.adventistarchives.org/Yearbooks/Forms/AllItems.aspx>, accessed January 24, 2020.

Saturday as the Sabbath and by the belief in the imminent advent of Christ, the church began its overseas expansion rather late, the first ordained minister arriving in Latin America in 1894. The Peruvian mission was officially established about a decade later, in 1906. At the time, Roman Catholicism was the official religion of the country and the only one allowed for public practice under Article 4 of the Peruvian constitution. In short, Adventists, like other Protestant denominations, began their venture in Peru illegally. Even so, they did enjoy the support of some liberal intellectuals and were able to gain a few converts, one of whom was Manuel Camacho.

Where exactly Camacho came across Adventism and how he converted is subject to debate. However, it is clear that about a year after returning to Puno, he turned his home into an improvised classroom for local Indians.⁷⁶ Between 1902 and 1905, at least 25 students recited the alphabet and learned to add and subtract under Camacho's guidance. Some were grown men, among whom five are confirmed veterans, and others were young boys.⁷⁷ Camacho's educational initiatives irritated local authorities, which was probably one of the reasons that he was so eager for Adventist support.⁷⁸ For a few years, he appealed to the Adventist headquarters in Lima, asking them to send permanent assistance. Help would come later, in 1911, when Ferdinand Stahl, an Adventist missionary stationed in La Paz, moved to La Platería and, together with Camacho, began preaching among Aymara Indians and opening schools to serve both adults and children.⁷⁹ The pair's religious activities, and especially their relative success, aggravated local authorities even further and eventually culminated in an organized attack on the Adventist school and mission in La Platería. On March 3, 1913, a group of local hacienda owners and Indians helmed by the bishop of Puno, Monseñor Valentín Ampuero, set out from the village of Chucuito for the Seventh-day Adventist mission in La Platería. When they arrived at the

76. On the different, and sometimes contradicting, versions of Camacho's conversion, see Héctor Elías Núñez, "Presencia Protestante en el Altiplano peruano, Puno 1898–1915: el caso de los Adventistas del Séptimo Día," (Licenciado thesis: Universidad Nacional de Mayor de San Marcos, 2008).

77. Chambi, "Sección Pedagógica," 6. Comparing the names Chambi mentions in these pages with other sources has led to the confirmation of five students as veterans. Considering the difficulty in finding such information, it is likely that more were veterans.

78. According to one letter, local authorities had been harassing Camacho before the missionaries arrived. See Manuel Camacho al Presidente de la República, "Impetran protección oficial para sus escuelas particulares," in Wilfredo Kapsoli, *El pensamiento de la Asociación Pro Indígena* (Cusco: Centro Bartolomé de Las Casas, 1980), 138.

79. Initially, the Adventists were unsuccessful in Bolivia, and their missionary efforts yielded few converts. The situation changed in the 1920s when local Aymara leaders, among them Santos Marka T'ula and Gregorio Titiriku, contacted the church and asked for its help in establishing rural schools for Indian children. See Taller de Historia Oral Andina (THOA), "The Indian Santos Marka T'ula, Chief of the ayllus of Qallapa and General Representative of the Indian Communities of Bolivia," *History Workshop Journal* 34 (October 1992): 116; and Waskar Ari-Chachaki, "Between Indian Law and Qullasuyu Nationalism: Gregorio Titiriku and the Making of AMP Indigenous Activists, 1921–1964," *Bolivian Studies Journal* 15–17 (2008–2010): 100.

mission, they broke into the main house, stole property, and took five Indian converts, among them Camacho, as prisoners.⁸⁰

The incident fell like ripe fruit into the hands of anticlerical liberals, who were themselves in the midst of a heated debate with conservatives over Article 4 of the constitution. For many liberals, freedom of religion was one of the cornerstones of the modern nation and, accordingly, altering Article 4 was a necessary step if Peru was to move forward. Moreover, although they rarely converted, many liberals believed that Protestantism was much more compatible with modernity.⁸¹ After all, it was the religion of the progressive nations of Northern Europe and North America. Therefore, they looked positively upon missionaries' work among the Indians, especially their educational efforts, seeing them as a way to "civilize" the Indians and push their nation forward.⁸² From this perspective, the attack on the Adventist mission was another piece of evidence of Catholic brutality, executed by narrow-minded men who were guided more by self-interest than by the greater good. If Indians were not freed from the claws of the Catholic priests and the highland gamonales, these intellectuals believed, Peru would never advance.⁸³

The political clamor caused by the incident made it inevitable for departmental authorities to investigate it, and while it does seem that none of the authorities who participated in the episode were punished, all of those involved were called in for questioning.⁸⁴ As the police reports included numerous testimonies from both converts and local authorities, they provide a glimpse into the tense relationship between the parties and also reveal the self-perceptions of the Seventh-day Adventist neophyte. Camacho explains:

The acts of hate and vengeance committed against us . . . in all their naked truth, absolutely, do not have any other reason than the fact that we have become Evangelicals or Protestants, that is, abjuring the celebrations of Catholic

80. "Criminal Sumario: denuncia de Manuel Z. Camacho y compartes por el delito de sedición y otros", 1914, ARP, Expedientes criminales, Folio 98, Libro 14 n. 671.

Denuncia de Manuel Z. Camacho y compartes, 1.

81. Juan Fonseca Ariza, *Misioneros y civilizadores. Protestantismo y modernización en el Perú (1915–1930)*, (Lima: Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú, 2002), 42. Monica Orozco has noted a similar tendency among Mexican liberal elites who "retained nominal allegiance to Catholicism" and "were actually most enthusiastic about the ideas of . . . Auguste Comte." See Monica Orozco, "Not to be Called Christian?: Protestant Perceptions of Catholicism in Nineteenth-Century Latin America," in *Religion and Society in Latin America: Interpretive Essays from Conquest to Present*, Lee Penyak et al., eds. (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2009), 182.

82. Fernando Armas Asín, *Liberales, protestantes y masones: modernidad y tolerancia religiosa, Perú siglo XIX* (Lima: Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú, 1998).

83. "No es ya prisión arbitraria," *La Unión*, March 10, 1913, APZ, *La Unión-1913*, Recortes Encuadernado; "¡Los detenidos siguen presos! Es inaudito lo que pasa. Una prueba de que acá las autoridades son peligro y nunca una garantía . . . ¿Habrá justicia?" *El Día*, March 10, 1913, APZ, *El Día-1913*, Recortes Encuadernado.

84. Denuncia de Manuel Z. Camacho y compartes, 1.

festivals, which have been reduced among the Indians to the payment of large sums to the priests and to the worship of an invented God. That is, beginning our personal regeneration. . . praising Jesus, our Savior. . . studying and putting into practice the teaching of the Gospel that brings harmony and well-being into our homes, keeping us away from vices, especially from alcohol and coca. We have begun to see the advantages of hygiene.⁸⁵

Camacho spoke those words during the interrogation, drawing a portrait of converted Indians: they abjure Catholic festivals and worship a true God, they study the Gospel, refrain from coca and alcohol, adopt new medical and hygienic practices, and undergo personal regeneration. Becoming a Seventh-day Adventist, therefore, involved what one no longer did at least as much as it did what one had begun to practice.

One of the most important indicators of personal regeneration may well have been converts' abstention from the consumption of coca and alcohol, and from participation in local fiestas. Coca and alcohol had a history that stretched back to pre-Inca times, often serving as offerings to the gods (or later to God and the saints) and functioning as a gateway to the supernatural world.⁸⁶ They also had important earthly functions and were essential in the formation of social networks and reciprocal relationships. As anthropologist Catherine Allen has written, "*Hallpay* (coca chewing), carries a way of life with it. To do *hallpay* properly, according to traditional ceremony, is to be *Runa* [indigenous, rural and *Quechua*-speaking]. . . To chew coca leaves is to affirm the attitudes and values . . . that are characteristic of indigenous Andean culture."⁸⁷

By refraining from these practices, Adventist converts chose to exclude themselves from a significant part of indigenous culture, which in turn prompts a question. If chewing coca or dancing drunk in a fiesta was among the parameters that defined an Indian as such, how could someone avoiding these practices still be considered an Indian?⁸⁸ It is for this reason that Camacho goes beyond simply stating that Adventists "abjure fiestas" and deprecates fiestas by adding that they "have been reduced among Indians to the payment of large sums to the priests and to the

85. Denuncia de Manuel Z. Camacho y compartes, 2–3.

86. Thomas A. Abercrombie, *Pathways of Memory and Power: Ethnography and History among an Andean People* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1998), 355; Thierry Saignes, "‘Estar en otra cabeza’: tomar en los Andes," in *Borrachera y memoria: la experiencia de lo sagrado en los Andes*, Thierry Saignes, ed. (Lima: Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos, 1993), 17.

87. Catherine Allen, *The Hold Life Has: Coca and Cultural Identity in an Andean Community* (Washington, DC: Smithsonian Books, 2002), 22.

88. Also in question were practices involving food and drink. See Mary Weismantel, "Maize Beer and Andean Social Transformation: Drunken Indians, Bread Babies and Chosen Women," *Modern Language Notes* 106:4 (September 1991): 861–879.

worship of an invented God.” From his perspective, fiestas have been drained of their deep cultural meaning and their varied and extensive social functions, becoming an empty mechanism implemented by greedy priests who had invented a god with the sole purpose of exploiting Indians and profiting from them. In this context, coca and alcohol lost their function as methods to approach divinity or extend social connections, and thus their sacred meanings. Instead, the consumption of coca and alcohol had turned into vices that stood in the way of harmony with God and with other men. Therefore, rejecting coca and alcohol—and the context in which they were consumed—did not amount to a rejection of indigenous culture but became a way to resist exploitation.

Similarly, the Adventist Church fostered alternative discourses that helped to mitigate tensions arising from contradictions between the veterans’ self-proclaimed Indian identity and the mestizo characteristics they had adopted. The issue of veterans’ clothing speaks to this point. Influenced by the health reform movement in the United States, the Adventist Church vigorously promoted ideas about health and healthy living.⁸⁹ Missionaries, believing that Indians knew little about personal hygiene, taught them how to wash their faces with soap in the first school session.⁹⁰ Endless comments were made about the filth in which Indians lived. Even converts themselves pointed to cleanliness as one of the qualities that separated them from their surroundings.⁹¹

Yet, hygiene turned out to be more than a way to distinguish between converts and their neighbors: it became an alternative discourse that emphasized qualities such as cleanliness over style of dress. Rather than having a clear dress code for services, missionaries emphasized Adventists’ hygienic state, turning the cleanliness of clothing into a rule by which to abide. One missionary reported that “when they came to meeting on the Sabbath, many were dressed in clean or new clothes, while others were careful to tell us that they too would soon have new clothes, but they had not finished making them.”⁹²

The Adventists’ attitude should not be taken for granted or seen as an obvious or singular method to attract converts. Missions across the world often had an established policy towards indigenous clothing. In some places, missionaries encouraged natives to adopt European clothing, since they saw it as part of

89. Ruth C. Engs, *Clean Living Movements: American Cycle of Health Reform* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group, 2000), 30.

90. Ferdinand A. Stahl, *Land of the Incas* (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Publishing Association, 1920), 128, 131.

91. For missionaries’ comments, see Stahl, *Land of the Incas*, 86; F. A. Stahl to W. A. Spicer, January 20, 1914, GCA, Incoming Letters, location 3277, RG 21; and E. H. Wilcox, *In Perils Off* (Nashville: Southern Publishing Association, 1961), 40, 105. For reports on Indians’ comments, see Stahl, *Land of the Incas*, 140.

92. J. W. Westphalw, “The Message among the Aymara Indians of Peru,” *Advent Review and Herald* 88:32 (August 10, 1911): 12.

their larger “civilizing mission.” In other places missionaries aimed to construct clear and always visible boundaries between themselves and the natives they had come to convert. As a result, in these missions, natives were forbidden to dress in European clothes.⁹³ The Adventists in Puno, however, played down differences in wardrobe, diminishing their importance as a racial marker.

It was not that the Adventist Church was free of prejudice or US-centric attitudes with regard to indigenous traditional clothing. For example, in describing converts’ traditional Indian attire, missionaries were inclined to emphasize that their traditional clothes were spotless, a quality that was not mentioned with regard to Western clothing.⁹⁴ In other words, it seems that European clothes were in themselves imbued with the quality of cleanliness, while indigenous dress, and the Indians who wore these clothes, were in need of purification. Yet, once “purification” took place and clothes met the necessary standard, indigenous dress was considered appropriate. Notwithstanding the obvious European/North American attitude of superiority, hygiene had become a way of discussing and judging appearances without invoking the strict racial implications that usually accompanied dress in the Andes.

Similarly, within the walls of Adventist churches, neophytes and missionaries were slowly disentangling the strong bonds between language and race. First, the Adventists provided translations to Aymara or Quechua, turning indigenous languages into an integral part of the church’s formal life. In fact, missionaries took pride in their ability to speak these languages, boasting about disseminating the church’s message in the vernacular.⁹⁵ Accordingly, the Aymara and Quechua languages received an official recognition never granted to them by the Catholic Church or state institutions. Second, the meaning of the Spanish language as a social marker changed: rather than distinguishing mestizos from Indians as it did in Andean society at large, it helped determine which followers were ready for baptism. As was the case in other Protestant denominations, conversion to Seventh-day Adventism required the ability to

93. In his study of the Franciscan mission among the Chiriguano in southeastern Bolivia, Erick Langer notes that missionaries dressed neophytes in clothing that was associated with working-class cholos in small towns in Bolivia and Peru, indicating the future they envisioned for the neophytes. Erick Langer, “The Franciscan Missionary Enterprise in Nineteenth-Century Latin America,” *The Americas* 68:2 (October 2011), 173–174. Klaus Fiedler pointed out that converts in Zambia were encouraged to wear Western clothing. Klaus Fiedler, *Christianity and African Culture: Conservative German Protestant Missionaries in Tanzania, 1900–1940* (Leiden: Brill, 1996), 8. In another case, African mission employees of the Anglican Church in Kenya were forbidden to wear Western clothes. See Colin Reed, *Pastors, Partners and Paternalists: African Church Leaders and Western Missionaries in the Anglican Church in Kenya, 1850–1900* (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 143; and John Comaroff and Jean Comaroff, “Fashioning the Colonial Subject,” in *The Dialects of Modernity on a South African Frontier*, John Comaroff and Jean Comaroff, eds. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997), 218–273.

94. See for example the description in Wilcox, *In Perils Off*, 147.

95. E. L. Maxwell to W. A. Spicer, November 13, 1917, GCA, General Files 21, 1917-Maxwell, location 3295, RG 21; C. V. Achenbach, “Experiences at the Lake Titicaca Mission,” *Advent Review and Herald* 93:11 (March 2, 1916): 10.

read the Scriptures. Learning Spanish became a religious requirement and was associated with the long process of conversion rather than one of racial transformation. Instead of turning Indians into mestizos, the Spanish language helped turn Catholics into Seventh-day Adventists.

In this context, it is important to note that the racial reconstruction that was taking place under the auspices of the Adventists was conditioned by gender. Methodological restraints, most conspicuously those inherent in primary sources, make it extremely difficult to study women converts in the Adventist Church's early years.⁹⁶ Yet, the few testimonies that I have been able to locate indicate, unsurprisingly, that Adventist women did not have the same options and opportunities as men. More specifically, while men were busy reshaping the meaning of Indian-ness, women were confined to much more traditional and hegemonic racial notions. For example, in a 1922 article published in the Adventist journal *Youth Instructor*, Gussie Field-Colburn, a missionary's wife laboring in Puno, reported that boys were "quick to acquire 'white dress and manners'" but that girls accepted these changes at a much slower pace, if at all.⁹⁷ Colburn is also explicit about why this might be, bluntly stating that "while the man has been in slavery to a conquering nation, his wife has been in slavery to him." Notwithstanding the implicit US or Eurocentric attitude tainting Colburn's vision of native women, her observation accurately reflects the connection between race and gender in the Andes.⁹⁸ Indian women were, as Marisol de la Cadena argues, "the last link in the chain of social subordination," since they were subordinated to their husbands who were themselves subordinated to both male and female mestizos.⁹⁹ Consequently, for indigenous men to sustain their dominance over women in the household and

96. It is very difficult to find sources on indigenous women converts, especially for the very early years of the mission. The most obvious reason for this has to do with literacy. When Manuel Camacho opened his school about 1900, all of his students were men. This situation appears to have lasted until around 1915, four years after Ferdinand Stahl officially established the mission, when Ana Stahl began to pay attention to women. Second, patriarchal conceptions often prevented even literate women from making official statements and signing documents. Dealing with authorities, including Adventist Church authorities, was considered a male domain. Thus, for example, only a few women signed the 1920 petition to the Adventist Church headquarters requesting that Ferdinand Stahl remain in Titicaca. It appears that these women were widows or not yet married. Third, missionaries took relatively little interest in native women, and their wives, who are often an important source for scholars studying these topics, published relatively little on the topic in Adventist newspapers and magazines.

97. Gussie Field-Colburn, "Aymara Indian Girls," *Youth Instructor* 70:12 (March 21 1922): 4. Gussie Field-Colburn arrived with her husband H. M. Colburn in Puno around 1920. There, they served as missionaries among the Aymara for several years.

98. On the relationship between female missionaries and the native women they met in the field, see Mara Patessio, "Western Women Missionaries and their Japanese Female Charges, 1870–1890," *Women's History Review* 16:1 (2007): 59–77; Patricia Grimshaw, *Paths of Duty: American Missionary Wives in Nineteenth-Century Hawaii* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1989); and Judith Rowbotham, "Hear an Indian Sister's Plea: Reporting the Work of Nineteenth-Century British Female Missionaries," *Women's Studies International Forum* 21:3 (May 1998): 247–261.

99. Marisol de la Cadena, "Women are More Indian": Ethnicity and Gender in a Community near Cuzco," in *Ethnicity, Markets, and Migration in the Andes*, Larson and Harris, eds. (Durham: Duke University Press, 1995), 332–333. To put it in another light, the ideological justifications of patriarchy were embedded in women's racial inferiority.

the community, those women had to be racially inferior, or “more Indian,” than themselves.¹⁰⁰

Conversion did not bring about a sudden or quick change in patriarchal ideologies. Veterans who joined the Adventist Church may have been vocal about their right to acquire the “mestizo” intellectual and cultural capital that enabled social mobility, but they were not necessarily willing to give up their own privileges and areas of dominance. Hence, Adventist women not only continued to wear traditional “Indian” clothing, but they were also much less educated. In schools with 50 to 100 students, only a handful of the students were girls and they were often ignored by male Indian teachers.¹⁰¹ Other testimonies describe how, during sermons or other church meetings, male converts would sit on benches or stones while the women sat on the ground.¹⁰² Distance from the earth, Benjamin Orlove notes, was an important factor in the “making” of Indians or mestizos. Indians, in this context, were those who were physically closer to the earth.¹⁰³

Furthermore, through female Indian-ness, male converts were able to manifest their connection to the community and affirm an Indian identity despite their apparent mestizo appearance. Indian men could confront the idea that they no longer fully belonged to an Indian community by having Indian wives—in the traditional and hegemonic sense of the word “Indian”—and raising Indian daughters. As these women manifested their connection to the Indian community and the indigenous past, they relieved men in part of the need to do so. Consequently, a man could be an Indian without paying the full cost of Indian-ness (that is, Spanish illiteracy or the lack of cultural capital that enabled social mobility).

Sources provide little insight about veterans’ perceptions of their own conversions. Yet there are a few moments when Manuel Camacho, together with a few other converts, addresses the topic, mentioning that they had adopted the “path to redemption” or were engaged in “regeneration.”¹⁰⁴ Redemption and regeneration have long been central ideas in both Catholic

The opposite is also true, as the subordination of Indians and rural communities was often justified through their feminine qualities.

100. De la Cadena, “Women are More Indian,” 343.

101. Field-Colburn, “Aymara Indian Girls,” 4. Colburn also briefly mentions the issue of women’s literacy here: Gussie Field-Colburn, “Indian Courting,” *Youth Instructor* 72:5 (January 29 1924): 10.

102. Elder and Mrs. Achenbach, “New Central Mission Station,” *Field Tidings* 8:34 (November 1 1916): 2.

103. Benjamin Orlove, “Down to Earth: Race and Substance in the Andes,” *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 17:2 (May 1998): 207–222.

104. Manuel Camacho to Presidente de la República, “Impetran protección oficial para sus escuelas particulares,” 138; Denuncia de Manuel Z. Camacho y compartes, 3; Chambi, “Sección Pedagógica,” 3.

and Protestant Christian theologies of salvation, and their meanings vary according to time and place.¹⁰⁵ Specifically, for the Adventist Aymara in Puno, these terms became synonymous with a group of practices that included alphabetization, new hygienic practices, abstention from coca and alcohol, and even the use of modern medicine.¹⁰⁶ In fact, it appears that the term had become part of the converts' daily discourse and that they used it against Catholic Indians, calling them "degenerate," because they had not undergone the same changes.¹⁰⁷

Regeneration, therefore, pointed to the very same cultural practices associated at the time with *mestizaje*. In this sense Adventism was an alternative discourse to that of *mestizaje* and a way to resist it. In fact, even the semiotics and morphology of terms such as "regeneration," "redemption," and "rehabilitation" contrasted with the idea of evolutionary *mestizaje*. Beginning with the prefix "re-" these concepts signify 'restoration,' that is the bringing back of something or someone to its former state, rather than a gradual development from a low stage to a higher one. From this perspective, the answer to the Indians' dire state should not be sought in the future, looking toward their transformation into *mestizos* (as some *indigenista* intellectuals may have thought), but in the past, as they would return to being what they had once been. In this regard, these concepts also contrast with the modernist idea of linear development.

Such a discourse corresponded to deep millenarian and utopian currents prevalent in the Andes and was far from being a unique feature of the Seventh-day Adventist Church.¹⁰⁸ However, it had an important advantage for converts, as it allowed them to embed new habits within a traditional framework, presenting them as continuity rather than as novelty. From the Adventists' perspective, the Catholic Church and Catholic Indians had broken away from the past by following the degenerate Catholic customs.¹⁰⁹ By converting to Adventism, veterans were

105. Francis Fiorenza, "Redemption," *New Dictionary of Theology*, Joseph Komonchak, et al., eds. (Goldenbridge [Dublin]: Gill and Macmillan, 1987), 836–851; Quentin Quesnell, "Grace," *New Dictionary of Theology*, 437–450; Carl J. Peter, "Justification," *New Dictionary of Theology*, 553–555, and "Regeneration," *New Dictionary of Theology*, 851. On the meanings and social functions of regeneration in the United States, see Richard Slotkin, *The Mythology of the American Frontier, 1600–1860* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000); John Foubert, et al., "Explaining the Wind: How Self-Identified Born-Again Christians Define What Born Again Means to Them," *Journal of Psychology and Christianity* 31:3 (2012): 215–222.

106. Carta de Manuel Camacho, 138; Denuncia de Manuel Z. Camacho y compartes, 3.

107. Queja de Pedro, Santiago y Juan de Dios Quispe y otros al Obispo de Puno," 3 de abril 1920, Archivo Obispado de Puno, 3.

108. Alberto Flores Galindo, *In Search of an Inca: Identity and Utopia in the Andes* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 5. Burga's notion of an Andean utopia differs from Galindo's, particularly in its perspective: While Galindo focuses mostly on elites, Burga concentrates on popular versions of the Andean utopia. Manuel Burga, *Nacimiento de una utopía. Muerte y resurrección de los incas*, Prefacio, 16, http://sisbib.unmsm.edu.pe/bibvirtual/libros/2006/nacimien_utop/contenido.htm, accessed January 25, 2020.

109. Queja de Pedro, Santiago y Juan de Dios Quispe y otros al Obispo de Puno.

simply purifying Christianity of contamination, reviving the Indian who had fallen into decline, and restoring his pride and past glory. Paradoxically, returning to an authentic, unimpaired state of Indian grandeur involved learning Spanish and dressing in European clothing.

Conversion, therefore, was an interpretative paradigm that altered meanings, rearranged priorities, and changed the focus of attention. It gave veterans a way out of the conundrum in which they were entangled: how to act like a mestizo while remaining an Indian. Or, to put it differently, how to incorporate certain cultural traits that were associated with mestizos and also essential for upward mobility, without delegitimizing themselves as Indians. Through the interpretative paradigm of conversion, veterans were able to resist the view according to which learning Spanish stood in direct contrast to being an Indian, since an Indian was necessarily illiterate, rural, and traditional. It also allowed them to resist the notion that obtaining cultural capital, which enabled social mobility, alienated them from their social, cultural, and genealogical roots by turning them into mestizos. However, redefining the meaning of “Indian-ness,” and proposing a new way to conceptualize and discuss these changes, were not in and of themselves sufficient to achieve social and political mobility. To achieve that goal, veterans had to find ways of exchanging their cultural capital for economic viability and political power. The Seventh-day Adventist Church helped them do so.

POLITICAL AND ECONOMIC ASPECTS OF CONVERSION

Under the auspices of the missionaries, and based on their knowledge of the mestizo world, converts established new paths for economic and political mobility. In this regard, conversion also offered a solution, albeit partial, to the economic and political difficulties that plagued veterans’ efforts to reintegrate and left them at the margins of the community. In the Indian communities, politics was essentially “done” through reciprocal relationships, and one’s political influence extended as far as his social networks carried him. Such relationships were built over time and through various daily interactions. For some veterans, the long absence from the community also resulted in a lack of social and political patronage and clientele.

Missionaries stepped into this void, offering veterans an alternative means of social and political outreach that could serve as a counterforce to the local authorities. As aforementioned, Adventist missionaries enjoyed the support of liberal elites in Lima who believed that Protestantism was much more progressive than Catholicism. Specifically, Seventh-day Adventists were able to

recruit some important allies from various social and political arenas. Among them were men such as the Puno indigenista José Antonio Encinas, the Cusco intellectual Luis Valcárcel, and numerous politicians and journalists who believed that these missionaries offered a solution to the “Indian question.” Missionaries were not shy about enlisting supporters to promote and protect the missions’ interests and those of their converts. Therefore, by converting and forging relationships with missionaries, veterans were able to create alternative social networks and to compensate, at least to a degree, for relationships they did not have.

To be clear, it was not that Indians were completely dependent on missionaries, or that they were incapable of forging long-term relationships or strategic alliances without them. For years, Indians had been advocating for accessible education and demanding better treatment from local authorities; they had commissioned the help of liberal politicians and intellectuals long before the Adventists arrived in Puno.¹¹⁰ Nevertheless, the missionaries were foreign white men who lived among Indians and intervened on their behalf regularly. Considering Andean racial politics, this was an important advantage, and a rare one. After all, even the most progressive indigenista did not consider moving into an Indian’s home—as US-born Adventist missionary Ferdinand Stahl had done.¹¹¹ Stahl often used the advantages ensuing from his race and nationality to protect and promote the interests of converts. For example, on occasion he threatened to involve the US embassy if Adventist Indians were not given their rights.¹¹² In this sense, Stahl negotiated and intervened on behalf of “his” converts in the same manner that hacienda owners did for “their” Indians.

Similarly, the Adventist Church enabled veterans to create and maintain new patronage networks. The Adventist classroom was the main space in which these reciprocal relationships were established. In exchange for the teacher’s knowledge and education, students and their families were expected to build a school and home for the teacher, as well as show respect and contribute to various church activities.¹¹³ Personal relationships between teachers and students seemed at times to resemble *compadrazgo* as students entered into a lifelong commitment towards their teachers.¹¹⁴ For example, Luciano Chambi,

110. Álvarez-Calderón, “Pilgrimages through Mountains.”

111. Ferdinand Stahl was not the only Adventist missionary to live in an Indian home, Clinton Achenbach would do the same in latter years when he was sent to open a new mission station in the peninsula. See Elder and Mrs. C. V. Achenbach, “New Central Mission Station Opened in Lake Titicaca Region,” *Field Tidings* 8:34 (November 1, 1916): 2.

112. E. L. Maxwell to W. A. Spicer, June 15, 1916, GCA, Incoming Letters-Maxwell, location 3286, RG 21.

113. See for example E. H. Wilcox to J. L. Shaw, August 31 1920, GCA, Incoming Letters, location 3330, RG 21; and Wilcox, *In Perils Oft*, 61–63.

114. On the institution of *compadrazgo* in the Andes, see Juan Ossio, “Cultural Continuity, Structure and Context: Some Peculiarities of the Andean *Compadrazgo*,” *Kinship Ideology and Practice in Latin America*, Raymond Smith, ed.

who would become a leading missionary, describes the various ways in which he expressed his gratitude toward Manuel Camacho, who had taught him to read and write.¹¹⁵ Interestingly, in the same testimony Chambi recalls that his father paid Camacho for these lessons. Chambi's testimony highlights how an economy based on paid services did not supplant traditional forms of reciprocity. Respect, and the social ties that were embedded in these relationships, were still a crucial part of how one established authority.

The fact that these relationships were forged within a religious framework was also significant. Reciprocal relationships were legitimated through a series of Catholic rites. The Seventh-day Adventist Church, in this regard, served as an alternative source of legitimation in a social and cultural environment where religion and politics were tenaciously tied to each other. By the same token, Adventism offered an alternative to the politico-religious system that governed Indian communities—in Adventism's social hierarchy, greater fluency in Spanish and the ability to “move” between worlds also translated into positions of leadership. In this sense, veterans were able to turn the cultural capital they had already accumulated on the coast into political capital in their communities, without performing the onerous duties that were required for entry into the Indian politico-religious system. Thus, conversion offered a solution for those who aspired to leadership positions but found themselves marginalized.

Finally, the fact that the church offered access to new kinds of careers should not be overlooked. As I have argued, reintegration into the rural economy, in the apogee of capitalist penetration and competition over natural resources, was one of the greatest challenges that veterans faced. However, it was also during this period that Indians were demanding education in increasing numbers. Indian delegations from across the Andes had set out for the nation's capital to petition that schools be built in local communities.¹¹⁶ In 1903, the *civilista* government launched an educational reform to centralize the educational system under the auspices of a ministry of education. This centralization aimed to bring about a more balanced and equal allocation of resources that would provide education for larger sectors of the population.

(Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1984); and Jorge Gascón, “Compadrazgo y cambio en el Altiplano peruano,” *Revista Española de Antropología Americana* 35 (June 2005): 191–206.

115. *Platería*, 12. Luciano Chambi joined Manuel Camacho and Ferdinand Stahl as a young boy. He received a relatively extensive education for an Aymara Indian at the time. His sons went on to study in institutions of higher education and became prominent members of the Peruvian Adventist community. It should be noted that Chambi was called to serve in the military, but it is not known if he was in fact recruited.

116. See for example Laura Gotkowitz, *A Revolution for Our Rights: Indigenous Struggle for Land and Justice in Bolivia, 1880–1952* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007), 49–51.

Nevertheless, its success was partial at best, as Peru's educational system remained highly unequal and inaccessible to Indians.¹¹⁷ The fact was that the progressive elements within the government did not have the power to overcome objection from the ranks of the conservatives or the sierra landlords. The state's incompetence opened the door for individual, extra-official initiatives to satisfy some of the demand for education. Yet, without strong institutional support these schools had little chance of surviving, and ended up closing their doors due to the inability to secure teachers' salaries, the lack of educational materials, and further pedagogical training for teachers.¹¹⁸

The Seventh-day Adventist Church filled part of the vacuum left by the state. It provided Indian teachers with training, supplies, a steady salary, and considerable protection. Furthermore, the church offered additional opportunities for social mobility in opening positions for translators and, eventually even for missionaries and heads of mission stations, schools, and clinics.¹¹⁹ Adventism thus opened opportunities for a "professionalized" career in which income and social status did not depend on ownership of natural resources, or access to them. In this sense, it contributed to dissociating the condition of being "peasant" and from being "Indian" in the same way that it disassociated the Spanish language from other cultural traits linked to mestizo-ness. If, as Marisol de la Cadena demonstrates, mestizos could be "indigenous," then within the boundaries of the church, Indians could be "mestizo-ized" without actually becoming mestizos.¹²⁰ At the same time, conversion also emphasized the strength of Christianity. One Christian ideology, as it appears, could be replaced only with another Christian ideology. Hence, rather than completely breaking from the past, conversion to Seventh-day Adventism manifested both change and continuity, as it brought about important changes that were linked to an existing Christian world view.

Tel Aviv University
Sverdlin Institute for Latin American History and Culture
Tel Aviv, Israel
yaelmabat@gmail.com

YAEL MABAT

117. Calderón, "Pilgrimages through Mountains," 136.

118. Calderón, "Pilgrimages through Mountains," 114.

119. Juan Huanca, Mateo Urbina, and Luciano Chambi are examples of local Aymara-speaking Indians who ascended the Seventh-day Adventist hierarchy. The Chambi family, in particular, became prominent Adventists, filling positions in the Puno church and then using the church's transnational networks to immigrate to the United States.

120. De la Cadena has developed the idea of the "Indigenous mestizo" in her book *Indigenous Mestizos: The Politics of Race and Culture in Cuzco, Peru, 1919–1991*.