*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38**, 859–910 © 2006 Cambridge University Press
Printed in the United Kingdom 

# Reviews

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06211933

Alan Knight and Wil Pansters (eds.), *Caciquismo in Twentieth-Century Mexico* (London: Institute for the Study of the Americas, University of London, 2006), pp. x + 409, £35.00, £17.95 pb; €45.00, €24.95 pb; $65.00, $28.95 pb.

When President Vicente Fox promised in 2000 to stomp any '*tepocatas* or spotted vipers' who tried to keep him out of Los Pinos, most Mexicans understood that to be a typically folksy reference to caciques, petty bosses who have long been a plague on Mexico – and a fixture of its historiography. Bringing together fourteen different perspectives (too many to be given their due here), Knight and Pansters's bestiary of bosses takes as its departure point D. A. Brading's venerable *Caudillo and Peasant in the Mexican Revolution*. By embracing the sweep of the entire twentieth century, it demonstrates how caciques refused to wither away with the maturity of the institutionalised revolution. Maldonado Aranda and Pansters (among others) show why neoliberalism and democratisation do not cure *caciquismo*. Rather they provoked its metastasis to universities and Mexico City's mushrooming suburbs – among other places.

Perhaps *Cacique*'s greatest value lies in the systematic conceptualisation of its slippery subject. Alan Knight would replace the *caudillo/cacique* dichotomy in favour of a more nuanced five tiers, ranging from national to sub-local. Turnover at the national (one) and state (two) levels often left the next three relatively undisturbed. Indeed, Jennie Purnell reveals how the early revolutionary Oaxacan *cacicazgo* of Ché Gómez had Porfirian roots. Socially and politically, Knight suggests, the violent factionalism so typical of *caciquismo* can be explained by four rationales: class, ethnicity, natives vs. newcomers and conservatives against progressives (pp. 35–36). This last category is especially intriguing, as it includes the religious. Matthew Butler's chapter on *caciquismo* in Coalcomán, Michoacan, shows how 'God's caciques' survived the end of the Cristero War to subsequently blunt revolutionary change – and also keep the ecclesiastical authority at bay.

Economics puts in a welcome appearance; both Knight and Pansters argue that successful caciques have to stay in tune with national politics but also to keep time to the beat of 'market booms' (p. 43). Entrepreneurial pursuits, Steve Lewis reminds us with a study of alcohol in Chiapas, are often an integral part of *caciquismo*, and he hints that *caciquismo* can be a business strategy.

Boss rule is a question not just of pesos but also of pistols. Brewster documents how Gabriel Barrios Cabrera offered security in troubled times, a Hobbesian alternative to revolutionary chaos. Pansters adds that caciques often promote the very violence that justifies their *cacicazgo* (p. 303) – the best salesman makes his own market. But the Achilles Heel of these types of *cacicazgo* was often violence itself. Knight notes that the Figueroas, a long-lived clan in Guerrero, met its Waterloo in Aguas Blanca, an ugly massacre that forced their reluctant *compadre*, President Ernesto Zedillo, to finally oust them (p. 32). Are the Figueroas outliers? Knight's precise definition of *cacical* violence as 'low-key, sporadic, even surgical' (p. 16)

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

serves as a needed corrective to countless local black legends of bloodthirsty bosses. But should an unusually violent cacique persist over time – and Knight's level four (municipal) and five (sub-local) seem particularly durable – their cumulative violence can border on the sanguine, as work by José de Jesús Montoya Briones on Honorato Austria in the Hidalgan Huasteca, and Antonio Santoyo on the Mano Negra in Veracruz, shows. Knight' larger point, that most caciques rule hegemonically, through persuasion as well as coercion, is well taken. As Pieter de Vries demonstrates, a certain Lopéz of western Jalisco built his *cacicazgo* largely by personally cooking barbecued meat and serving it to his guests (p. 337).

Some of the most provocative contributions closely read the language of *caciquismo*, a form of 'bossism as text'. Indeed, the cacique has become something of a literary trope as evidenced in the fiction of Carlos Fuentes, Martín Luis Guzmán and Graham Greene, amongst others, as well as in biography – above all Gonzalo Santos's exceptionally revealing and colourful memoirs. Knight argues that the growth of national bureaucracy, specifically the Ministry of the Interior's, and official attempts to gather information on provincial goings-on, spawned a sub-genre of political literature: the accusation of *caciquismo* hurled against enemies. Given this context, Hernández Rodríguez questions the utility of the term cacique, which he sees as bracketing a rather arbitrarily defined range of behaviour. The term is for him more one of discursive denunciation than description or analysis (pp. 250–251). Still, it is difficult to believe that Carlos Hank González's power was mythical in the sense of fiction. Pansters view of *caciquismo* as a complex bundle of 'cultural repertoires and practices, styles, memories, and histories' (p. 371) alerts us to the need for a closer look at the way that certain key terms delineate *cacicazgos*. For instance, the notion of *aglutinar* (p. 303), in which would-be caciques posit themselves as a common point of articulation in the competition for social, political and economic capital.

Several contributors challenge the way caciques are usually mapped as rural and rooted to definite places. Fernández Aceves, Maldonado Aranda and Pansters consider varieties of urban caciques. The latter two suggest ways of thinking about the way the power of caciques is territorialized (pp. 242–247) and re-territorialized (p. 359). Several years ago, Chris Boyer made a distinction between caciques who sunk down deep roots in one area – cacti – and those that roved over many areas – coyotes. De Vries describes how Jaliscan strongman Zuno Arce dispatched a client to the El Grullo-Autlán region in order to displace a foe (p. 335). This suggests that middling caciques' territorialization can be related to changes occurring higher up the political food chain. I would argue that many of the outsider caciques laying claim to a particular area are in fact coyotes sent by presidents and governors into an area. Moreover, the Sonoran rulers and Lázaro Cárdenas, just like Porfirio Díaz before them, used the regional Army commanders as their eyes, ears and if need be fists in the provinces. While presidents moved the generals around in games of *ajedrez político*, the generals were not pawns. Often a general would be returned to his home or adopted state, typically to get rid of a troublesome governor, and in return use the coercive potential of the military to create a *cacicazgo*. For example, Zárate Hernández mentions how Cárdenas sent Marcelino García Barragán to '[get] the revolutionary project underway' on the coast of Jalisco (p. 279).

We tend to see caciques in terms of vertical relationships, as with the pyramid of Knight and Pansters's last collaboration. But horizontal relations among caciques

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

matter too – particularly on the regional level. Knight suggests one of the variant forms of the *cacicazgo* is a confederation, like the mythical Altacomulco Group (located in Mexico state).

Seen as a whole, this formidable collection reflects two important strengths of Mexican Studies: first, its interdisciplinarity and, second, its willingness to look at subtle connections between state and society. Key chapters relate *caciquismo* to important themes such as gender (Fernández Aceves), ethnicity (Rus) and campesino identity (Boyer). But the volume is also marked by some asymmetries. One is a 20th century defined by revolution and reconstruction (1910–40) and crisis (1968-) but with comparatively little on the so-called Golden Age of the PRI from Avila Camacho to Tlatelolco. It also reproduces the scholarly geography of Mexico: heavy on Michoacan, Chiapas, Jalisco, Mexico state and Puebla, with some reference to work on Yucatan and Hidalgo. These larger trends are of course not the responsibility of the volume, but do represent opportunities for future research.

Fox's failure to rid Mexico of caciques suggests that they are not yet endangered. Students of Mexico should be reading *Caciquismo in Twentieth-Century Mexico* well into this century.

*Colby College* BEN W. FALLAW

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X0622193X

Javier Santiso, *Latin America's Political Economy of the Possible: Beyond Good Revolutionaries and Free-Marketeers* (Cambridge, MS and London: Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 2006), pp. xix + 250, £18.95, hb.

Ricardo Ffrench-Davis (ed.), *Seeking Growth under Financial Volatility* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006), pp. xix + 227, £55.00, hb.

These two books endeavour to capture important changes that have taken place in the Latin American economic environment in the last ten years. During that time Latin America has seen the end, in 1997, of one boom period based on capital inflows, a 'lost half decade' (1998–2003) in which the net capital inflow collapsed and a three-year boom (2004–6) based on high commodity prices, low world interest rates and reduced risk. Not surprisingly, all three episodes have underlined the overwhelming importance of the external environment and the need for Latin American economies to adjust flexibly to changes in it. Both books are concerned with this process of adjustment. Santiso, who consciously writes in the tradition of Albert Hirschman, believes that Latin America has now gone beyond simplistic paradigms based on ideology. Instead, he argues, regional policy makers have now developed a strongly pragmatic streak that makes it much easier to develop the flexibility needed to adjust to external shocks:

> 'More pragmatic, less reliant on paradigms, more modest in their agendas for reform, and detached from the illusions of yesterday, Latin American leaders are now moving forward. From Chile to Brazil, including Mexico …, 'possibilist' trajectories are being invented in which, as in all murky waters, pragmatic flows meet and mix, while the prevailing currents of the Good Neo-Liberals and the Good Revolutionaries fade away.' (pp. 94–5)

Santiso has an unusual style of writing. He eschews footnotes (there are only 23 in the whole book), but makes full use of graphs and tables that convey a vast amount of very interesting material. These are often derived from sources that academics

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

typically ignore or are not able to access. The book also benefits from a relatively short time lag between completion of the manuscript and publication.

In order to make his case for regional pragmatism, Santiso concentrates heavily on three case studies: Brazil, Chile and Mexico. In each case, he argues convincingly that policy has moved beyond the strictures of neo-liberalism and is now driven by what works. He has followed these countries in great detail in recent years and has much of interest to say. He does not deny that neo-liberalism was in the past a driving force in Latin America and uses the example of Menemismo in Argentina to illustrate his argument. However, he believes that it is no longer a factor in economic policy-making and that the neoliberal ideologues have been driven from office.

Where he is on weaker ground is his assumption that the Good Revolutionaries are also on the decline. He recognizes that Venezuela under Chávez does not fit his description of an increasingly pragmatic Latin America, but argues that this is an isolated case that looks increasingly out of kilter with the rest of the region. Perhaps he is correct, but the turn of events in Bolivia and recent election results in other countries suggest that the appeal of the Good Revolutionary is far from over.

Like his mentor, Albert Hirschman, Santiso is proud to declare a bias for hope in his vision of Latin America. In doing so, he has to sidestep a number of deep-seated structural problems – notably income inequality and corruption – as well as newer issues, such as organised crime and social violence. Yet he is surely right to draw our attention to the changes in the quality of economic governance in Latin America in recent years, changes that regularly deliver low inflation, fiscal balance and – when external conditions permit – modest growth in income per head.

Ricardo Ffrench-Davis, a prominent economist at the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC), tackles a long-standing concern in this edited collection: the problem of adapting to financial volatility in Latin America. The net inflow of foreign resources to Latin America swings dramatically from surplus to deficit and this swing often has little or nothing to do with the quality of economic management in each country. The region's governments therefore need to find ways to live with volatility, rather than hoping it will disappear.

As it does in Santiso's book, Chile figures prominently in this volume as the country that has gone furthest to try and minimise the disruption associated with financial volatility. This is a topic on which Ffrench-Davis has written extensively in the Latin American context, but wisely he draws our attention to experience outside the region by including case studies from South Korea, Malaysia and South Africa. The Malaysian experience is particularly interesting; the government was widely condemned for imposing capital controls after the Asian financial crisis in 1997 and yet the economy recovered very quickly and suffered no long term damage.

These are two interesting books written in very different styles. As often happens with edited books, the time between completion and publication of the Ffrench-Davis volume means that it has not been able to take into account recent developments, namely the recovery of the Latin American economies in the last three years, while the Santiso book has to some extent been caught out by events in Bolivia. Yet the interested reader will find much to enjoy in both books as well as new ideas and new approaches to our thinking about long-established issues.

*Chatham House* VICTOR BULMER-THOMAS

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

J. Lat. Amer. Stud. 38 (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06231936

Carmelo Mesa-Lago and Jorge F. Pérez-López, *Cuba's Aborted Reform: Socioeconomic Effects, International Comparisons and Transition Policies* (Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida, 2005), pp. xx + 223, $59.95, hb.

Jorge F. Pérez-López and José Alvarez (eds.), *Reiventing the Cuban Sugar Agroindustry* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2005), pp. xxv + 323, £17.99, pb.

Archibald R. M. Ritter (ed.), *The Cuban Economy* (Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2004), pp. xi + 248, $49.95, hb.

During the last decade most of the literature on Cuban economic and social development has focussed on (1) the dramatic impact of the demise of the Soviet Union on the economic and social situation in the country; (2) on the urgent need for reform and transition to a market economy as the only viable survival strategy, and; (3) on the perennial question of what is going to happen when Fidel Castro dies.

Three highly interesting books address the two first issues. However, they leave the last question unanswered: apparently no-one has a clear idea about what a post-Castro Cuba might look like. The book by Carmelo Mesa-Lago and Jorge Pérez-López on the reform process (or rather insufficient reforms) in Cuba after the Soviet collapse, provides us, in my view, with the best collection of scenarios of what might happen (or perhaps rather what in their view *should* happen) that has been produced of late. Mesa-Lago and Pérez-López both have a long trajectory of monitoring and analyses of the Cuban economy. Some of the chapters that appear in this volume have been published in some form before, but most of the contributions are new. In one of the chapters they suggest, following the same arguments as featured in many of Mesa-Lago's past writings, that Cuban economic policies have followed a cyclical pattern, with ideological cycles followed by pragmatist (and more economically successful) cycles. The pattern seems to be that a crisis pressures Castro for reforms he actually does not care for, and after a period of recovery with healthy growth, he vows to get the country back on the idealist socialist track. This hypothesis about economic and ideological cycles in Cuba is also the theme in Mesa-Lago's chapter in the book on the Cuban Economy edited by Archibald Ritter.

It is an appealing hypothesis and one which makes a lot of sense for analysing the policies and the performance of the Cuban economy after the Soviet collapse. After a deep crisis between 1990 and 1993, the government was forced to implement a series of reforms that were clearly market oriented. These were quite successful at the outset and economic growth picked up. On the negative side was the impact that some of these reforms had on the well-being of the people and the increase in income inequalities, especially as a result of the so-called dollarization of the economy, discussed at length in the Ritter book. Then, when success was in sight, the government (read Castro) again changed course and a process of recentralisation commenced, meaning that idealism (with poor growth rates) was then back on track.

So far I am in agreement with Mesa-Lago and Pérez-López. This ideological cyclical pattern has, indeed, been a characteristic of the Cuban Revolution. But what are the implications for the current situation and Cuba's future prospects? In 2005 and 2006 the economy seems to have fared rather well, to the extent that Fidel Castro has officially announced the end of the 'Special Period in Time of Peace'. Applying the Mesa-Lago theorem, this would then mean that we are heading for a period with slow – or no – reforms and, consequently, with slow growth prospects ahead.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

In one of the essays in the Ritter book, Mesa-Lago discusses the limitations of the current (socialist) model. This, he posits, cannot survive because of internal contradictions and external pressure for change. There is no longer a superpower to support (or rather subsidize) the model and popular support of the regime will dwindle if living standards continue to stagnate, or even fall in many sectors. Mesa-Lago mentions three additional external constraints: (1) that US policy will not change as long as Castro is alive, which implies that the embargo is subject to the status of his health; (2) China could come to the rescue (being interested in 'seeing their model of market–oriented reform implemented on the island'), though Mesa-Lago thinks this unlikely, considering that 'Sino-Cuban trade has been stagnant or declining in the past decade'; (3) the Cuban economy relies heavily on imports of oil for its survival, and while subsidised oil supplies from Venezuela have played a role for Cuba in the past, such supplies ceased after the 2002 coup attempt against Chavez, writes Mesa-Lago.

However, events have overtaken this analysis. Today both China and Venezuela, contrary to just a few years ago, do play important roles in the Cuban economy and the government's growth strategies. Furthermore, the appearance of new political trends in Latin America could offer new opportunities for Cuban economic and social development.

I would argue that there are at least three reasons why a revised (upgraded) model could be workable at least for the next three to five years: (1) the incorporation of Cuba into a Venezuelan scheme of Latin American economic integration (ALBA, Alternativa Bolivariana para las Américas),without US and World Bank/IMF participation; (2) recent Chinese economic interest in Latin America, particularly in terms of raw material imports (with dramatically rising prices) and huge investments in mines and oil; (3) booming sugar and nickel prices that will provide these industries with incentives for restructuring and upgrading.

However, if this could be a possible scenario, it is not necessarily the only one. The present trend could be reversed for a number of reasons. For instance, what would happen if Hugo Chávez is not re-elected in December 2006? Another matter of concern is the future development of raw material prices. High oil prices are good for Cuba as long as it can continue to be a partner under the Venezuelan umbrella. The dramatic increases since 2004, not only of oil prices but of raw materials in general, have as a rule been a blessing for Cuba (especially, of course, sugar and nickel). The raw material price boom is primarily triggered by surging demand in China. But what will happen when the Chinese market becomes saturated? This may take some time, but it is clear that Chinese raw material imports will at some point slow down with a resulting decrease in global market prices for raw materials.

On balance, there could be some reason for cautious optimism in Cuba today. Economic growth is picking up, with an officially proclaimed historical record, two digit growth rate for 2005 (although this has been questioned by many observers, including ECLAC), and with an even higher growth projection for 2006. Even if these reports turn out to be exaggerated and/or over-optimistic, they do point at a new mood in Havana and interesting developments in many sectors. This is also the case with the sugar sector, historically a backbone of the Cuban economy.

The new book on the Cuban sugar industry, edited by Jorge Pérez-López and José Alvarez, is an impressive collection of analytical essays by some of the most well-known experts in the field, such as Hagelberg and Pollitt, in addition to Pérez-López and Álvarez themselves. The book provides fascinating reading about the history of

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Cuban sugar, analysing its lack of modernisation (primarily during its period of dependency on the Soviet market), and the current prospects for restructuring, or rather for *reinvention* of the whole sector, by looking at sugar as the centre of a cluster involving a series of industries, such as food, bio-industry and energy.

As pointed out by all of the authors in this volume, the sugar sector has been heavily overstaffed in the past – at some point accounting for more than 12 per cent of the labour force – and extremely cost inefficient. Some corrections have been made and modernisation of the industry has started, although at a rather slow a pace to date. Therefore, now perhaps is the time for the Cuban government to grasp the opportunity, backed by a sugar price windfall, to radically rethink the whole concept of the 'sugar industry' and follow some of the wise advice in this book about how to reinvent it.

*Lund University* CLAES BRUNDENIUS

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06241932

Kirwin R. Shaffer, *Anarchism and Countercultural Politics in Early Twentieth-Century Cuba* (Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida, 2005), pp. xi + 279, $59.95, hb.

Building on his 1998 PhD thesis *Purifying the Environment of the Coming New Dawn: Anarchism and Counter-Cultural Politics in Cuba, 1898–1925* (UMI, Ann Arbor, MI, 1998), Kirwin Shaffer's new book continues to fill the void in early twentieth century Cuban leftist historiography. In this thorough study of the Cuban anarchist movement, Shaffer details how that movement helped shape the Cuban left in the years following the 1898 War of Independence.

As the title suggests, Shaffer focuses on the cultural war that took place during a thirty year period and on the challenge of anarchists to the dominant culture of the day. In his introduction, Shaffer maintains that 'three sites of cultural conflict' existed: nationalism and internationalism', 'health and nature' and 'education and gender', and it is these three conflictive 'sites' that form the focal points of his work. Although anarchists never possessed the power to topple the governments of early twentieth century Cuba (according to Shaffer, 'they never directly tried' [p. 228]), they offered an alternative way of living and thinking, a counter-culture, and it is on this challenge that Shaffer's work concentrates. Adopting a layered approach, the subsequent chapters take each of the 'sites' on their own merits, first explaining what the dominant culture was, then analysing anarchist fiction through literature, plays and worker periodicals in order to ascertain exactly how anarchism created a challenge to the triumvirate of Capitalism, Christianity and electoral politics.

Part One of the book is concerned with the struggle between nationalism and internationalism, at a time when definitions of both were being redefined, due to the idiosyncratic nature (in Latin American terms) of Cuba's newly gained independence from Spain and the island's move towards neo-colonial domination by the USA. As was the case with the dominant culture, anarchism in Cuba was a fusion of varying strands of thought (Cuban, Spanish and anarchist traditions combined to forge a Cuban reality), crossing ethnic and sectarian boundaries and forming a localised and authentic strand of anarchism that considered the legacy of colonialism and slavery and the reality of immigration and racial tensions. Cuban anarchists hoped to unite the whole of the country's working class, regardless of colour, race, provenance, age or gender.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

The politics of gender is a recurring theme throughout this book which touches on the government's attempt to whiten the island, female prostitution, anarchist views on abortion and woman as educator, nurturer and worker. Rather than exclude women from the debate, as was the norm in anarchist circles in many other Latin American countries, Cuban anarchists saw the role of women as tantamount to the progression of a counter-cultural society. Not only did women form the backbone of the family (and so the next generation of revolutionaries), but they were also beginning to make up an important part of the workforce. For this reason, it was imperative that both women and children be educated in the purifying benefits of anarcho-naturism, in particular.

Part two investigates how some Cuban anarchists embraced alternative health therapies such as naturism, yoga, vegetarianism, sun-therapy and hydrotherapy as a means of cleansing the body and mind, while creating another tool with which they hoped to challenge the dominant society. The individualistic naturism that aimed to improve the physical and mental health of each adherent was espoused by a socialist element (a healthier person, free of the constraints of capitalism and greed, could help in the struggle for collective betterment). Furthermore, illnesses could be cured without the need for expensive, mainstream medicine and anarcho-naturists looked towards preventative measures through a healthy lifestyle as opposed to the cure offered by conventional remedies. Costly meat could be replaced by health-promoting vegetables and pulses, while fresh air and sun were free, it was reasoned.

Shaffer has analysed the writings of two prominent anarchist writers in particular, both 'key framers of Cuban anarchism' (p. 225). These were Adrían del Valle, a Catalonian intellectual living in Cuba, and Antonio Penichet, a Cuban printer. Their novels, pamphlets and articles published in the working-class press aimed to educate readers in the benefits of anarchism and the evils of the society in which they lived and toiled, advising how each person might overcome poverty and social displacement. Education was supplied not only through such literature, Shaffer observes, but in the union halls, through *veladas* (social gatherings) that offered leftist plays, songs, poetry and speeches to all members of the family, and in the rationalist schools set up by anarchists. Funds were raised among the workers to provide alternative education for workers' children, thus leading them away from public schooling, which pushed a nationalist agenda or private, often religious, education, while simultaneously delivering adult education to the workers themselves. Part three of the book delves into this educational drive by Cuban anarchists, where the author's research helps us remember the 'nearly forgotten monuments to Cuba's leftist heritages that emphasised the rise of communist mass educational reforms after 1959' (p. 194).

Thus, while anarchists never exercised any real power in Cuba, they did offer an alternative model for social justice before the birth of the island's first communist party in 1925. This Cubanised anarchism was dual-edged in that it offered the masses not only an immediate solution to the inequalities they faced, but also proposed a more just, healthier future. Within and outside the workplace workers were encouraged to challenge the dominant culture at every turn and Shaffer has finely detailed how and why Cuban anarchists believed this should be achieved. A localised but international approach existed to educate all workers in the quest for a more natural way of life through a 'counter-hegemonic resistance movement.'

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

In his book, Shaffer has offered a comprehensive account of a group of people often overlooked in Cuban history and he has provided the reader with a sense of what life was like for anarchists (and indeed for those who did not adhere to their anti-political stance). Anarchists in Cuba, seeking to offer another reality rather than forcing all-out revolution, gained the support of thousands of workers and, through careful analysis of contemporary literature, Shaffer has displayed how and why they aimed to do so.

*University of Wolverhampton* REBECCA CONDRON

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06251939

Lydia Chávez (ed.), *Capitalism, God, and a Good Cigar: Cuba Enters the Twenty-First Century* (Durham, NC, and London: Duke University Press, 2005), pp. x + 253, £14.95, pb.

This book is a very mixed and somewhat disappointing collection. Designed largely as an album of 13 written 'snapshots' (plus photographs) of life in Cuba in 2004–5, largely by US-based or Latin American journalists and filmmakers, it boasts some of the strengths of such an enterprise but also a regrettably high number of the predictable weaknesses.

The strengths are indeed considerable, not least Chávez's introductory chapter which is refreshingly honest, balanced, ambivalent and aware of complexity. This opening tone is then followed by some of the better sketches which acknowledge the contradictions of contemporary Cuba, notably Juliana Barbassa's picture of 'The New Cuban Capitalist', which recognises the blurring of the borders between the formal and the informal; or Julian Foley's nuanced account of a Trinidad *jinetero*, highlighting the subtleties of many Cubans' attitudes, here mixing an emergent individualism with a sense of national pride. Other notable pieces include Annelise Wunderlich's brief study of Cuban hip-hop ('Hip Hop Pushes the Limits'), which succeeds in going beyond stereotypes to depict the mutually profitable relationship between a seemingly rebellious form of youth culture and a system which has both tolerated and collaborated with it for its own purposes. Daniela Mohor ('Socialism and the Cigar') addresses the differences between a somewhat jaded capital and the depth of political loyalty in the countryside; while Archana Pyati's piece on the changing nature of the Miami migrant community ('The New Immigrants Don't Hate Fidel') distinguishes well between the implacable anti-Castro postures of the 'historic' 1960s migrants and the more ambivalent recent, essentially economic, migrants.

So there is much to recommend. However, beyond these strengths and despite the tenor of the introduction, many of the other pieces and, it must be said, the book's overall purpose and message, are in a different vein. In part this is reflected by the book's unclear division into four sections: while 'Inventing' produces a logical focus on the familiar daily need to *inventar* to survive, 'Breathing' (largely about culture) never explains quite what 'breathing' refers to; equally, while 'Surviving' is largely about the relics of the old faith, 'Searching' mixes pictures of religion, migration and Spanish influence in a grouping that has no obvious cohesion yet supposedly refers to the overall search of ordinary Cubans for another reality.

This indeed reflects a wider problem with the book, which is much more partisan than it likes to suggest; while it is ambivalent in places, the whole tends to be driven

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

by all too familiar preconceptions and assumptions. Indeed, Chávez's otherwise admirable introduction sets that tone, with its mixture of nostalgic sympathy for ordinary Cubans and familiar accusations, here, notably the reference to 'Castro's irrational clampdown' of 2003 (p. 12) – when the reality was that, for all it might be criticised, it was anything but irrational. Indeed, the assumption underlying that assertion – that the Cuban system hangs on a thin thread which is Castro's personal and increasingly outmoded control – is one that recurs throughout the pieces.

A number of preconceptions underlie the collection. First, that the antiquated revolution is now on its last legs (not least corrupted by the almighty dollar and tourism) and has few if any supporters left. Second, that there is in Cuba (as everywhere), an inherent conflict between an always repressive state apparatus and an always marginalised but struggling and resistant civil society, the latter being largely the focus of the pieces. Coming from journalists and writers from within the 'subaltern resistance' school of cultural studies and ethnography, this is not surprising, but it does mean that some of the pieces are somewhat wide of the mark. Disappointingly, this approach also makes the overall picture of contemporary Cuba a largely black-and-white depiction. In fact, anyone familiar with the country is aware that the reality is anything but clear-cut; that society, political attitudes, popular involvement and so on are varying shades of grey, and this reality underlies the system's ability to survive for so long – something which, to their credit, some of the better studies here acknowledge.

One especially disappointing piece is Ezequiel Minaya's article on writers and dissidence ('Authors Who Know or Knew the Limits'), which recounts the 1968–71 *caso Padilla* in order to set the scene, though without any real explanation of the context within which that conflict occurred. Minaya then proceeds to examine a series of case studies of other writers who have fallen foul of the regime or learned to adapt. The problem with such a focus is not that it is inaccurate, but rather that it is one-dimensional, missing a range of other adaptations, spaces, ambiguous and unambiguous loyalties, and assuming that art is always individual (against the flow and the state) rather than collective. Likewise, Olga Rodríguez's 'True Believers' displays a curiously narrow focus on former – and now largely disenchanted – foreign sympathisers living in Cuba, now either clinging to outdated beliefs or trapped, again reinforcing the overall picture of a moribund revolution. Even Ana Campoy's interesting study of ballet ('Dancers Who Stretch the Limits') has an underlying message of talent as much in spite of the system as because of it, and omits from the biography of Alicia Alonso her long pre-1959 association with Communism, so integral to her art and her commitment. There is also Megan Larnder's anachronistic reference to the teaching of Stalinist theory (p. 203), which in fact no-one can find in contemporary Cuba.

Where then does the collection stand as a contribution to our knowledge of Cuba today? Overall, its 'snapshot' approach does succeed in bringing out the daily human struggles of a materially harsh environment, but lends itself all too easily to the superficial, the anecdotal, the preconceived and the stereotypical. One senses an opportunity missed rather than a significant addition to our understanding.

*University of Nottingham* ANTONI KAPCIA

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06261935

Consuelo Cruz, *Political Culture and Institutional Development in Costa Rica and Nicaragua: World Making in the Tropics* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005), pp. xvii + 281, $80.00; £45.00

Despite their many similarities, the countries of Central America have followed remarkably different paths of political development. And for generations now historians and social scientists have attempted to unravel the puzzle of political differences among the Central American countries. With this book, Consuelo Cruz adds a new voice to this discussion by offering a political-cultural explanation of divergent historical developments in Costa Rica and Nicaragua. She argues that the particular forms of rhetorical politics that have governed the two countries were sharply divergent, eventually causing Costa Rica to become a brilliant success case with a long standing and robust democracy, while leading Nicaragua to languish with serial regime variation and mostly authoritarianism.

Cruz's argument draws theoretical inspiration from understandings of culture that emphasize rhetoric and that view political actors as creators of subjective understandings of what is possible and appropriate. In her words, 'political culture is best defined as a system for normative scheming embedded in a field of imaginable possibilities' (p. 3). Central attention is focused on political elites and their world views as expressed in explicit language. Contradictions inherent to these world views provide a basis for the transformation of political rhetoric and thus changes in political culture itself.

With this theoretical orientation at hand, Cruz proceeds to analyse the contrasting forms of rhetorical politics and 'normative scheming' that occurred throughout the history of Costa Rica and Nicaragua. It is argued that the 'multivocality'of the Spanish colonial regime yielded a 'Manichean' rhetorical strategy in both cases, but its specific form differed. In Costa Rica, political elites 'produced the image of a Manichean ideal: a seemingly harmonious community of Spaniards who, obedient to the Crown and dedicated to Christian labor, managed to 'persuade' the heathen into the virtuous fold' (p. 57). But in Nicaragua, rhetorical politics fostered a field of imaginable possibilities 'in which the Crown figured as the ultimate guarantor of good' (p. 63).

From the sixteenth century, Cruz moves quickly to the nineteenth, when national identities were forged, and then to twentieth, when regime outcomes sharply diverged. Despite some battles with each other, she says, elites in Costa Rica consolidated a national identity that portrayed Costa Ricans as peaceful, civil, diligent and distinct from the rest of the hostile region. With such a culture, the idea of creating a fair electoral regime seemed quite logical. In Nicaragua, by contrast, no stable national identity of a harmonious and naturally peaceful people was produced in the nineteenth century. Instead, with the failure of the Conservative Republic in the mid-nineteenth century, various subsequent political leaderships – Zelaya, the Somoza family, the Sandinistas – shaped and were shaped by a system of Manichean normative scheming in which the use of elections as a basis for legitimation was subordinated to collective narratives and fields of imaginable possibilities that, among other things, saw 'paternal' and 'fraternal' governments as solutions to anarchy.

In some respects, this book resembles earlier efforts at developing cultural explanations of Central American politics and especially Costa Rican exceptionalism. Although it sees culture more in terms of narratives and possibilities than values, it

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

shares with the older works a belief that Costa Rican identity emphasizes toleration and a repudiation of extremes, and that these normative and empirical commitments are what best explains its exceptional political institutions. Yet, whereas previous cultural analysts emphasized non-elite group orientations, Cruz argues that it is the political elites who are the real agents and ultimate history makers.

The study makes an empirical contribution in its use of historical documents and interviews with political leaders. Experts of Central American history will find especially interesting those portions of the narrative that draw on rarely consulted newspapers and books to describe elite politics across historical epochs. At the same time, however, some readers will find the prose of the book hard to understand. Social scientists in particular may have difficulty drawing out the specific causal claims of the book from the narrative. The fact that the book contains no tables or figures may also be troubling to readers who wish for a summary of the complex arguments.

The arguments can be criticized in various ways; all the familiar problems with cultural explanation arise with this book. For instance, one can assert that elite discourse and collective narratives are epiphenomenal – a mere reflection of more fundamental structural conditions. Cruz does not directly address this concern, for the book says little about differences among the countries that concern their socioeconomic conditions and the organisation of their state apparatuses. Alternative structural explanations are briefly mentioned in Chapter One, but they are never returned to in the empirical analysis. Hence, readers cannot help but wonder if the cultural dynamics described are mere by-products of socioeconomic forces. To cite only the most obvious example: the possible implications for political culture of the dramatically different patterns of landholding in Nicaragua and Costa Rica are not carefully discussed.

Another problem is that one can question the descriptions of the political cultures of these two nations. The book relies on a small number of relatively specific statements from elites and party documents to draw large inferences about the collective identities of whole nations. Hence, one could argue that Cruz sometimes reduces very major political changes to cultural shifts that are demonstrated by the words of one or a few elite actors who may not necessarily be representative of the wider universe.

These concerns should be put into context. This book seeks to contribute to the constructivist and interpretive literature. From the standpoint of this literature, the rich descriptions of elite culture presented in the narrative may be precisely the pay-off, as opposed to the scientific rigor of the causal explanation.

*Northwestern University* JAMES MAHONEY

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06271931

Kevin Casas-Zamora, *Paying For Democracy: Political Finance And State Funding For Parties* (Colchester, ECPR Press, 2005), pp. xii + 290, €31.00, pb.

Political finance is a crossroads for politics, economic and private interests, and an evident vehicle for corruption – drug cartels funding presidential elections in Panama and Colombia in the 1990s are but one extreme example – . It is without doubt, one of the crucial issues for political reform in Latin America. In fact, it is the subject of abundant legal reforms and related initiatives currently being discussed

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

by legislative powers in the majority of countries in the region. Unfortunately, the question of political financing has frequently been the subject of a pseudo-moralistic discourse that masks its essentially institutional and political nature. If there is an area in contemporary politics where black and white analysis is ineffective it is political finance, since transparency rules are weak and reliable information scarce. At least that is the message you get after reading Kevin Casas-Zamora's book. In a thoroughly researched text (based on a doctoral thesis which was awarded a prize by the European Consortium for Political Research in 2004), the author proves his assertion that 'there is hardly an institution of state funding that can be readily advocated or criticized in the abstract, but a myriad of schemes with vastly different levels of generosity, recipients, allocation procedures and disbursement modes'.

The scope of the book is wide-ranging, since it is based on a large data set on political financing in more than forty democracies, and thoroughly analyses two specific cases: Costa Rica and Uruguay. In so doing, Casas-Zamora offers the reader an illuminating comparative study of the fundamentals of party subsidies. As the author clearly states, in Latin America the topic is still shrouded in secrecy and most academics adhere to normative prescriptions when writing about it. Casas-Zamora has certainly succeeded in avoiding that peril as he carefully leads us through the evidence to prove three main propositions. First, that state funding systems are extraordinarily heterogeneous and their effects contingent on both the design of the subsidy and the political and institutional environment in which they are introduced. Second, that to the extent that the effects of state funding can be ascertained, they point towards a mixed picture that offers only partial vindication of the claims made by advocates and critics of subsidies. And last but not least, that direct state funding is a far less influential instrument for shaping parties, party systems and even political finance practices than is frequently alleged by those on both sides of the debate.

Casas-Zamora confesses a 'profound skepticism with respect to universal, one-dimensional, *a priori* explanations of political behavior, typically exemplified by rational choice approaches', and offers a pluralistic view of comparative methods. Why Costa Rica and Uruguay?, the potential reader may ask. The author anticipates the question and explains his powerful reasons. Those two countries are uniquely suited to this research project because they have long been recognised as two of the most long-standing democracies in the region and in the entire developing world. Both countries reveal a similar long-term approach to political finance, with a prolonged tradition of direct state support to parties and a liberal attitude towards private contributions.

Casas-Zamora privileges the analysis of campaign finance topics over party finance ones, allegedly for reasons of space. Yet the truth is that parties in both countries have for a long time ceased to be anything other than electoral machines. As the author gracefully formulates it, 'they remain largely dormant between electoral tournaments'. For policy makers, this is a topic which calls for modest objectives, particularly given that the means at hand are definitely limited. That might be the reason why Casas-Zamora gives an unambiguous warning to the reader when he writes that 'this book will not offer conclusive validation or refutation of any hypothesis regarding the effects of state funding systems', and moreover offers an empirical critique of the available hypotheses, aiming 'at attaining heuristic rather than theoretical value'. Not surprisingly, in so doing the author actually manages to do both things and surpasses his own objectives.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

One key aim should be to devise a means to overcome the tendency towards oligarchic control of party financing, in order to limit the possibilities for political corruption and democratise political parties. But, in Casas-Zamora's words, 'as with the construction of democracy itself, the configuration of an effective political finance system is a dynamic process, a never-ending journey in which preciously few stations are likely to be an unqualified success. Whatever lofty ambitions we may harbor, political finance reform is no more than an exercise in damage limitation'.

After reading this book, one concludes that as long as there is no strict and effective combination between limits on campaign expenditure, public access to information on origin and destination of political finances and enforced sanctions (including the cancellation of election credentials to those candidates that contravene the law), no profound change will occur.

*CIAPA, Costa Rica* RODOLFO CERDAS

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06281938

Marshall C. Eakin and Paulo Roberto de Almeida (eds.), *Envisioning Brazil: A Guide to Brazilian Studies in the United States* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2005), pp. xvi + 215, $65.00, hb.

This book will be welcomed by Brazilian studies scholars based in the United States – who are most often isolated in their departments, working day to day with only one or two colleagues, or none, who share their specific interests. The essays, taken together, offer a panoramic overview of the history of such studies and their current state, mainly in the academic setting of higher education. The time span focuses on the post-World War II years, when Brazilian studies first became an established presence, and continues up to 2003. As the editors state, '[o]ur principal objective has been to assemble the most comprehensive and sweeping assessment ever attempted of the patterns and characteristics of Brazilian studies in the US' (p. xiii). Despite its title, the book is not so much a guide to Brazilian studies as a history of what has been done, where, by whom, under what circumstances or against what odds. From it one can, with patience, extract a guide, in the sense that an awareness of where we have been permits us to envision where we might go.

This book, part of an effort by Ambassador Rubens Barbosa to promote Brazilian studies in the USA, contains commissioned essays under the editorship of the diplomat Paulo Roberto de Almeida and the historian Marshall C. Eakin. The Portuguese language edition (*O Brasil dos brasilianistas: um guia de estudos sobre o Brasil nos Estados Unidos, 1945–2000*; São Paulo: Paz e Terra, 2000) was followed in 2003 by the updated English–language volume under review. In Part 1, 'Development of Brazilian Studies in the United States,' three essays focus on overall trends and patterns in research and teaching of Brazil in the USA, and also touch on the repercussions of such studies in Brazil. In Part 2, 'Perspectives from the Disciplines,' nine essays target specific areas of research and teaching. In the two essays of part 3, 'Counterpoints: Brazilian Studies in Britain and France,' Leslie Bethell and Edward A. Riedinger offer concise and comprehensive surveys of scholarship and teaching in two nations whose interest and influence reach back to Brazil's earliest days. The book closes with Part 4, three essays on 'Bibliographic and Reference Sources'.

In the first essay of Part 1, Paulo Roberto de Almeida places Brazilian studies in the context of US-Brazil political relations and includes consideration of the origin

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

of the term '*Brazilianist*'. Designating foreigners who study Brazil from abroad, it was first used in the 1960s by US scholars to distinguish their own specialisation from those of other Latin Americanists. Despite its inexact applicability since there are Brazilian-born scholars working abroad, foreign scholars based in Brazil and other such blurring of distinctions, the term also caught on in Brazil, attesting to its usefulness as Brazilian scholarship (especially in the social sciences) came to interact significantly with the work of Brazilianists. The essay by the late historian Robert Levine, himself an eminent and prolific US Brazilianist, addresses research conducted mainly by US historians and social scientists on and in Brazil. It discusses patterns of funding and institutional support, as well as the shifts in the – at times problematic – insertion of Brazilianists and their work in the political and intellectual context of Brazil since the 1960s. In the final essay of Part 1, Theodore Young offers an overview of the teaching of Brazil in US universities which often takes place in institutional frameworks dominated by Latin America rather than alongside the study of Portugal and the Portuguese-speaking world (Brown University's Department of Portuguese and Brazilian Studies and the University of Massachusetts at Dartmouth's Portuguese Department are notable exceptions). This situation presents the danger that '[w]ithout efforts to coordinate a core of courses on Brazil, Brazil studies will remain an all-too-often neglected subset of Latin American studies' (Young, p. 66). Young mentions the successful efforts at several universities – and here's a pointer for readers looking for a guide – to establish inter-departmental programmes, or Brazil studies faculty groups, that coordinate advising and course offerings on Brazil, Portugal and the Portuguese-speaking world scattered throughout a university.

If, as this book makes clear, the US-based study of Brazil has been driven in large part by the persistent effort of dynamic and productive individual scholars and the doctoral students they trained, it has also been shaped significantly by political forces. The competition for global hegemony between the United States and the Soviet Union and the triumph of the Cuban Revolution led the United States to finance a wide variety of programmes targeting Latin America and provided an important stimulus for the growth of Latin American studies in the second half of the twentieth century (Almeida, p. 11). Especially important for the study of the Portuguese language and of Brazil was the National Defence Education Act of 1958. Its Title VI continues to provide generous funding for area studies centres. Since 1962, Latin American centres have also encompassed Brazil (Jackson, p. 98) and have contributed to increased interest and enrolments in all areas of Brazilian studies. Title VI has also fostered Portuguese language study. Universities competing for funding for such centre were (and still are) encouraged to offer Portuguese, designated as one of several 'critical languages.' Grant funds may be used to expand language programmes and federal funds also provide graduate student fellowships for Portuguese language study.

Part 2 of the book, 'Perspectives from the Disciplines,' opens, suitably enough, with an essay on 'Brazilian Portuguese Language and Linguistics.' As the basic first step in the formation of many Brazilianists, the study of Portuguese nevertheless 'has yet to establish a strong foothold in American universities', as Carmen Tesser recognizes from the start. She also points out that 'the puzzle of why the fifth most commonly spoken language in the world seems to be of relatively little interest to the US academy still remains to be solved' (p. 73). Her essay offers a fascinating account of the ups and downs of Portuguese language study in the USA: its fluctuating

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

enrolments, its involvement with different language teaching methodologies, its struggles with scarce or out-of-date materials. Since the 1990s, Portuguese enrolments have had small steady increases in US universities, though the total numbers remain rather small.

Other essays in part 2 offer fine-grained accounts of the fortunes of Brazilian studies in various disciplines and endeavours: literature and culture, translation of literary works, arts and music, history, sociology, anthropology of Amazonia, political science, international relations and geography. One of the strengths of this book as a whole, quite evident in this part, is that the essays are most often written by accomplished scholars who have themselves made significant contributions to the processes they describe and evaluate. It's impossible to comment here on these essays separately, all of which provide a wealth of example and detail, mentioning professional organisations, notable scholars, books, programmes, even doctoral dissertations, putting whole areas into perspective. The essays make clear that Brazilian studies in various disciplines have followed quite distinct paths. As Levine points out, 'scholarship on Brazil, like scholarship conducted in most 'area studies',' usually follows 'trends in individual disciplines rather than having a life of its own' (p. 33). Steady and cumulative growth is seldom in evidence. Rather, we see trajectories marked by periods of increase and decrease in interest, scholarly production and student enrolments that are uneven across the disciplines, each bolstered or hampered by pressures specific to it, such as the political interests of the United States (which translates into funding for research or its lack) and by the vicissitude of trends in specific disciplines, to or away from regional studies. The latter is the now case, for instance, in disciplines currently privileging theoretical or cross-regional perspectives, such as economics, political science, sociology and geography.

The editors recognise that gaps remain in the disciplines selected for overviews, mentioning urban anthropology and performing arts as important absences (p. xiv). In terms of broader perspectives, it would have been pertinent to include a discussion of the increased legal and illegal immigration from Brazil to the USA since the 1980s, and its impact, current and projected, on Brazilian studies. While more remains to be said in this and other areas, *Envisioning Brazil* makes a substantial and needed contribution of fundamental interest to anyone engaged, or considering engagement, in the study of Brazil from abroad.

*New York University* MARTA PEIXOTO

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06291934

Willem Assies, Marco A. Calderón and Ton Salman (eds.), *Citizenship, Political Culture and State Transformation in Latin America* (Amsterdam: Dutch University Press and Zamora, Mexico: El Colegio de Michoacán, 2005), pp. vii+453, €36.50, pb.

The chapters in this multi-disciplinary and wide-ranging volume were first presented at a colloquium held at the Colegio de Michoacán, Mexico, in October 2001 and were subsequently published in Spanish in early 2003. For this publication, the twenty-two chapters have been revised and updated. Latin America (as a region) and Mexico get the most attention (eight and seven chapters respectively), while Bolivia, Peru, Brazil, and Argentina are featured prominently in two chapters each respectively. The book is divided into five parts broken up by theme, with an

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

introductory and concluding chapter. Each of the five sections is introduced with a brief framing essay, and scholars and students alike will be able to use all or parts of the volume with ease. The authors, all of whom live and work in Europe and/or Latin America, are anthropologists, political scientists, sociologists, historians and development scholars. Given the diversity of its offerings, as well as its broad scope and substantial length, this volume will be of interest to both generalists and specialists.

In the book's introduction, the editors propose two 'transversal' themes that serve to frame and loosely structure the volume: (1) globalization's effects on the nation-state and what that means for citizenship; and (2) the use of an anthropological perspective on citizenship, or 'citizenship from below.' These larger themes organise the discussion of two additional ones: a critical examination of Marshall's triad of rights (that is, civil, political and social) and the politics of recognition, or 'ethnic citizenship' (p. 25).

While the breadth of the volume makes it difficult to generalise, the authors start from the basic premise that the formal transitions to democracy in Latin America are not sufficient to establish a full experience of citizenship. In different ways, all of the chapters examine how changing social, political and cultural contexts in Latin America have shaped and formed the understandings and practices of citizenship rights in the region. Given the large number of essays included in this volume, I do not refer separately to each one. After briefly summarising a general theme in each section, I refer specifically to the contributions that highlight or exemplify that theme.

In Part I, The Formation of Citizenships, the authors focus on moments of transition between shifting citizenship 'regimes.' While they examine different historical periods (and emphasize the role of the state and citizens in the process of citizenship formation to differing degrees), they all show that hierarchical and clientelistic understandings and practices of citizenship have co-existed with more liberal, democratic and plural ones. Rossana Barragán ('Absent Equality: Infamy, *Patria Potestad*, Legitimized Violence and its Continuities in Twentieth Century Bolivia') and Fiona Wilson ('Indian Citizenship and the Discourses of Hygiene/Disease in Nineteenth-century Peru') examine the transition from the colonial to the liberal period (in Bolivia and Peru respectively) as periods of rupture *and* of continuity. Barragán argues that in the newly independent Bolivia, inequality and hierarchy were fundamental elements of the constitution and legal codes, contradicting the 'juridical equality normally associated with 'modernity' and intrinsic to any citizenship project' (p. 31). Marco Calderón ('Citizens and Indigenous Peoples in the Populist State'), Ton Salman ('Citizenship between Polymorphy and Universality: The Globalocal Features of a Phenomenon in Turmoil') and Willem Assies ('Some Notes on Citizenship, Civil Society, and Social Movements') all look at some dimension of Latin American populism and citizenship formation in their chapters. They note that during the populist period, resources distributed by the state came to be perceived by citizens as concessions granted to them and not as social rights, even while they sought new forms of democratising the state and exercising citizenship rights.

In Part II, Citizenship, Adjustment and Reform, several authors address the growth of informal sector in the region and the increasing levels of socio-economic precariousness. Lúcio Kowarick's chapter ('Living at Risk: On Vulnerability in Urban Brazil') is particularly graphic in its description of life for working people

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

in São Paulo: 'a vast uprooting process is taking place in the world of labor, as work becomes informal, unstable, and unpredictable' (p. 132). Tom Kruse's description of the Bolivian labor sector ('Political Transition and Trade Union Restructuring: Reflections on the Bolivian Case') is strikingly similar. As formal employment in large industries has decreased, Kruse argues that eight of every ten new jobs created over the last decade have been created in the micro-business sector in areas of agriculture, commerce and artisan production (p. 158). Concomitantly, union membership is down. Kruse observes a 'growing ineffectiveness of existing unions and enormous difficulties in setting up new ones' (p. 161). What union activism that persists, Kruse notes, is characterised by its improvisational quality.

The articles in Part III, Democracy and Political Cultures, are all based on the assertion that Latin American democracies are incomplete and that the process of democratisation does not end with the formal transition to democracy. Examining the Mexican transition, Jacqueline Peschard ('Citizenship and the Democratic Transition in Mexico') argues that the exercise of full political rights is not guaranteed by the transition, but requires 'certain protective rights, such as prior conditions of public security, judicial probity and respect for human rights,' conditions that 'are far from being established in Mexico' (p. 238). In 'The Democratic State and Human Rights in Argentina and Brazil,' Laura Tedesco notes that although the social contract in Argentina and Brazil was re-written during the transition to democracy, this 'did not produce a transformation of the state institution: both the security forces and the judicial system failed to modify in any dramatic way their values and practices' (p. 226). Wil Pansters ('Values, Traditions and Practices: Reflections on the Concept of Political Culture [and the Mexican Case]') suggests that we cannot talk about transitions to democracy or the quality of democracy without discussing political culture. While the state may be the focus of scholars who study democratic transitions, Pansters argues that citizens' political practices are vitally important in examining and understanding a country's political cultures.

One of the main themes in Part IV, Re-imagining Communities: Ethnicity and Citizenship, is the relationship between individual and collective rights. Bartolomé Clavero ('The Pluricultural State, International Law, Electoral Observation and Postcolonial Citizenship: Peru, 2001) insists that there is a mutually constitutive relationship between individual and collective rights. According to Clavero, individuals are constituted, that is, they have rights, as members of groups and communities other than that of the nation. Leticia Santín ('Federalism and Local Governments: Political Integration and Multicultural Citizenship in Oaxaca and Chiapas, Mexico') also sees individual and collective rights working together, yet is more optimistic than Clavero about the possibilities of harmonising demands for individual and collective rights within existing political structures. Turning specifically to the Mexican case and of indigenous demands for autonomy, Santín argues that there is no incompatibility between multiculturalism and liberalism. She goes on to argue that the federalism 'includes sufficient possibilities to recognise and respect political pluralism, cultures, territorial spaces, diverse ethnic and linguistic attributes of individuals and groups … the right of indigenous peoples to self-determination should find its expression in the existing federal state' (p. 294). Aída Hernández ('Gender and Differentiated Citizenship in Mexico: Indigenous Women and Men Re-invent Culture and Redefine the Nation') takes a close look at the debates over indigenous autonomy occurring *within* indigenous communities, specifically among indigenous women. Hernández argues since the Zapatista

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

uprising and the emergence of autonomy as a central demand of the indigenous movement, thousands of indigenous women across Mexico have actively supported the struggle for indigenous autonomy and rights. At the same time, these women have demanded the 'right to change those cultural practices that infringe [on] their human rights' (p. 329). According to Hernández, in the struggle over Indian rights and autonomy in Mexico, indigenous women in Mexico are fighting 'not for the recognition of an essentialized culture, but for the right to reconstruct, confront, and reproduce that culture, not on the terms stipulated by the state, but on those established by the indigenous people themselves in the context of their own internal plurality' (p. 335).

In Part V, Globalisms and Localisms, two of the three chapters in this section address the relationship between the politics of recognition and the politics of redistribution. Martín Hopenhayn ('Decentered Citizenship in Times of Globalization') and Patricia Safa ('Cultural Diversity and Popular Traditions in large Mexican Cities') start from the premise that in contemporary societies the culture industry becomes a significant form of access to public spaces for sectors that have traditionally been barred from expressing themselves there. Hopenhayn is centrally concerned with the relationship between the politics of recognition and the politics of redistribution. He lays out what he calls a 'new utopia of de-centered citizenship': 'to promote equality at the juncture between a just distribution of the possibilities to affirm difference and autonomy and the just distribution of goods and services to satisfy basic needs and realize social rights' (p. 349). Like other authors in the volume he is concerned that nation-states are recognising cultural difference as a substitute for engaging in a politics of redistribution. Hopenhayn suggests that social and cultural rights are and should be firmly tied to socio-economic well-being. Safa also connects social and cultural rights, arguing that social inequalities are the foundation upon which cultural differences are built (p. 370).

In what is arguably the most optimistic essay in the volume, Benjamin Arditi ('From Globalism to Globalization: the Politics of Resistance') differentiates between globalism (neoliberalism) and globalisation. While globalism 'may undermine Westphalian sovereignty and deepen inequality,' it 'also has at least the potential for political innovation as the resistance to globalism opens the doors for an expansion of collective action beyond its conventional enclosure within national borders' (p. 351). In his chapter, Arditi lays out six types of activism that are widely practiced within the context of globalism, and argues that elections are not the only (and maybe not the most important) form of political participation and accountability for citizens in the global setting. Arditi does not view these new forms of global activism as a replacement for liberal democracy, but sees the liberal format of electoral politics and partisan competition within the nation state co-existing with a second tier of social movements and supranational organizations (p. 365).

Finally, I would like to highlight an additional theme that appears throughout the volume, which is not explicitly flagged in the introduction: clientelism and its continued strength. Despite the shift to neo-liberalism and a generalised breakdown of state-sponsored corporatism, many of the authors in this volume point out that clientelism continues to be a central element of political structure, culture and practice throughout the region. Kruse links clientelism's persistence to the growing informality of work, suggesting that 'as the productive apparatus becomes more informal 'industrial relations come to rely more and more on despotism and

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

paternalism' (p. 161). Lucy Taylor ('Citizenship and Political Culture: The Political Agent and the Natural Hierarchy') argues that 'clientelism has not disappeared in the new neo-liberal state … [but] has shifted from party channels to personalistic channels as state largesse shrinks' (p. 251). One significant consequence of clientelism's continued strength is that citizens continue to see the resources distributed by the state as concessions granted to them and not as social rights.

While there is much agreement and overlap among the authors on the volume's larger themes, there is a healthy degree of debate and disagreement on display as well. In the book's concluding chapter, Gledhill notes that some authors are much more optimistic than others about the idea of citizenship and its pretension to universality. He also notes that some authors regard the transnational dimensions opened up by globalization with enthusiasm, while others are more wary (pp. 383–84). The editors make no attempt to reconcile or resolve these disagreements. Nor do they draw general conclusions about where citizens and state should go from here. The wealth of information and experiences on record here, however, should give readers plenty of food for thought as they reflect on the current state of citizenship, political culture and state transformation in Latin America.

*Allegheny College* SHANNAN L. MATTIACE

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06301939

Emilio Kourí, *A Pueblo Divided: Business, Property, and Community in Papantla, Mexico* (Stanford, CA: University of Stanford Press, 2004), pp. xiii+389, $60.00; £40.95, hb.

This well-written narrative marks a shift in our understanding of the local processes that drove the transformation of rural Mexico during the long nineteenth century and sets a new standard for the study of the privatisation of communal land. Kourí refuses to read land privatisation merely as a prelude to revolution, fixing his gaze squarely on the history of land use in the indigenous community. Rather than emphasizing the role of legal changes or rapacious *latifundistas*, this study places the transformation of land tenure in the context of local economic, environmental and political processes that dominated peasant life. He presents a complicated picture of the internal dynamics of Papantla's Totonacs under the stress of the expanding demand for vanilla.

Although he did not intend to write a history of vanilla, this volume can be read as a commentary on how demand for a new food commodity transformed a peasant society. The author meticulously describes the social context of the vanilla orchid, its processing and marketing and the technological changes associated with it. Indigenous villagers became the agricultural producers while Spanish town dwellers undertook the risky artisan task of processing the green vanilla into an aromatic spice and exporting it. As is true of many international dessert commodities, processing and export offered the greatest potential profits. But before the 1870s, this arrangement was mutually beneficial since prices were high and Totonacs avoided the risks of processing and marketing. The crisis came as merchants faced fiercer competition for markets and the price for green vanilla declined.

The early chapters describe the environmental context of the Tecolutla river basin showing how Totonac farmers used dispersed settlement patterns and slash-and-burn agriculture to create an extremely autonomous peasant society. The

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

rough terrain and distance from colonial cities made commercial haciendas economically unfeasible and state power tenuous. As a result, there was abundant land, extensive forest reserves and few economic incentives for Totonacs to work for private estates. The 'agricultural decompression' described by John Tutino never occurred in Papantla because there never was a colonial 'compression'. After independence, Kourí finds little change in the relations between Creole merchants who came to dominate the municipal seat and the indigenous residents in their rural *rancherías*.

The central contribution of the book is made in the last three chapters with their exquisite description of the transformation of Papantla's communal territory into private individually exploited parcels. The key factor driving this transformation was not liberal land law but the international vanilla market. The market changed after 1870 in response to improvements in transport and communications as well as growing competition from French colonial producers. The vanilla boom created a crisis in traditional land use arrangements; unlike *milpas* abandoned after a few seasons, *vainillales* required long-term cultivation. The role of the state was secondary in these developments: rather than a conspiracy of government and landlord, Kourí finds an ambivalent state preoccupied with tax revenue.

Papantla's lands were privatised with the creation of *condueñazgos*, a system in which groups of individuals became shareholders in 'agricultural societies' with exclusive rights to a 'large lot' carved out of the town's extensive communal property. Kourí demonstrates that the *condueñazgo* was not an institution that allowed Totonacs to protect their communal traditions under the guise of a private title. A faction of well-to-do Totonac *rancheros* used them to consolidate their dominant positions in the community and take advantage of market opportunities. Non-Indians found ways to be included among the shareholders while many Totonac residents were left out and merchants began to buy up shares. Even creating the lot boundaries offered opportunities for unscrupulous political operators to profit.

To further make his point, the functioning of the *condueñazgos* did not distribute resources equally and the system excluded many (especially young) men who formerly had enjoyed easier access. The *condueñazgo* management used their posts to arrange the distribution of benefits and burdens (such as property taxes) to their favour. These managers became power brokers, courted by vanilla merchants and timber companies. Despite evidence of growing social disparities within the community, Kourí differs with previous scholarship by emphasizing that the first wave of protests centered on tax levies and not privatisation.

The final chapter for communal land was the division of the large lots into individual parcels. The process was rife with abuses that Kourí details with prosecutorial zeal. Increased competition and volatile commodity prices pushed merchants to look for ways to exert direct control over the vanilla supply. Exporters wanted land title to force producers to deliver the vanilla crop to them. The division spelled the end of Totonac autonomy but it did not eliminate the small indigenous farmer, rather it turned them into dependent renters on the land they once owned.

While merchants were the main promoters of the change, a core of Totonac 'speculators' seized the opportunity to gain at the expense of their indigenous brothers. Privatisation created intense partisanship amongst the Totonac *rancherías*, where both advocates and opponents mobilised followers and sought outside political allies to achieve their ends. Those Totonac in opposition to the division soon became known as the 'rebels' while those in favor were designated 'loyals.'

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

The division allowed municipal officials to intervene in indigenous lands and Kourí's sophisticated description of the outrageous political ploys of these actors reveals how privatisation undermined the historic autonomy of the *rancherías*.

Privatisation unfolded at the margin of the state. Rather than the state or *tinterillos* manipulating the different factions, the state was itself being maneouvered by forces beyond its comprehension. *Jefes políticos*, governors and even Porfirio Díaz found themselves on different sides of the divide at different moments. There was no unified *porfirista* project that imposed private property from above. Ultimately the pro-division faction contrived to get the government to support its position and when the 'rebel' party revolted, the federal army unleashed counter-revolutionary terror. This process was not predetermined and the result was far from what the liberals imagined: Land had become capital but without creating an industrious yeoman farming class. Instead, merchants and Totonac *rancheros* excluded approximately half of the Totonac population from their inheritance.

*University of Colorado at Denver* MICHAEL T. DUCEY

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06311935

Gastón R. Gordillo, *Landscapes of Devils: Tensions of Place and Memory in the Argentinian Chaco* (Durham, NC, and London: Duke University Press, 2005), pp. xviii + 304, £69.00, £16.95 pb.

This book is at once a superb ethnography and a challenging theoretical reflection on the agency of indigenous people faced with profound economic and political change. The subjects are the Toba of the Province of Formosa in the Argentine Chaco, on the border with Paraguay, during their incorporation into the capitalist economy since the early twentieth century. As with other indigenous peoples, this process entailed an overwhelming erosion of their subsistence economy, as well as re-signification of their symbolic universe, furthered by the establishment of Anglican mission stations in the 1930s. Commercial sugar-cane growing in the lowlands of the North-Western province of Jujuy (as in other sub-tropical areas of Argentina) was the main incentive for labour migration by the Toba (and other indigenous groups, such as the Wichí, as well as labour migrants from neighbouring countries). The introduction of a highly exploitative labour regime, with wage labour (including piece work) and a fragmented work routine, resulted in massive seasonal dislocation of both men and women, and a significant disruption of the traditional subsistence economy, based on hunter-gathering activities on both sides of the Pilcomayo River.

Space and its practice in history and symbolic signification through memory is the analytical framework which Gordillo employs to understand the sociologically meaningful manifestation of history in Toba territory. The most important of spaces for the Toba are the bush and the river, as sources of economic and symbolic reproduction, but also as sites of historical contestation. Significantly, these sites are not fixed in neither time or space, but shifting with the historical experience and agency of the Toba, both as an ecological habitat (such as when the river changes its course, or its bordering marshlands are encroached upon by cattle ranchers), and as sites of memory reference when recalled during the seasonal migrations to the sugar cane plantations. The sections on the spiritual world, and the supernatural beings which inhabit it, such as the *familiar* (a devil purported to have a pact with the

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

plantation owner), make fascinating reading, and are understood in the context of exploitative and violent labour regimes, with obvious (and acknowledged) parallels with similar phenomena elsewhere in Latin America, such as appear in June Nash's study of the tin miners of Bolivia (*We Eat the Mines and the Mines Eat Us: Dependency and Exploitation in the Bolivian Tin Mines*, New York: Columbia University Press, 1979), or Michael Taussig's writing on imperial British exploitation of rubber in the Putumayo region of Colombia (*Shamanism, Colonialism, and the Wild Man: A Study in Terror and Healing*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987).

Whilst the topic could have been dealt with as a tale many times told of oppression and resistance, Gordillo conveys a more complex picture, skillfully investigating the social agency and dialectics of history and culture, without starting from reified *a priori* notions. Both in fact are inflected by the other, and thus the Toba are as much agents of their history, especially with regard to symbolic production and adaptive strategies of survival, as they are experiencing exploitative labour regimes and marginalisation within the Argentine nation state.

Gordillo's volume is a welcome addition to the growing recent literature on the wider Chaco region and its indigenous peoples, such as Mariana Giordano's *Discurso e Imagen sobre el Indigéna Chaqueño* (La Plata: Ediciones al Margen, 2004), Marcela Mendoza's *Band Mobility and Leadership among the Western Toba of Gran Chaco Argentina* (Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2002) and John Renshaw's *The Indians of the Paraguayan Chaco* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2002). It will be a useful tool to researchers as well as teachers of courses on dominance and resistance in Latin America.

*University of Oslo/University of East London* ARND SCHNEIDER

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06321931

Harold A. Trinkunas, *Crafting Civilian Control of the Military in Venezuela: A Comparative Perspective* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press: 2005), pp. xiv + 297, $59.95, $24.95 pb.

The central proposition Trinkunas advances in this book is that there is no substitute for direct civilian control of the armed forces. He considers the balance of civilian and military control of the armed forces during different periods of Venezuelan history, as well as – by way of comparison – several other countries. He argues that the failure to develop civilian control over the armed forces in Venezuela undermined various democratic experiences beginning with the *trienio* government of 1945 to 1948, which for the first time held direct elections for president. Trinkunas brings his analysis up to the present by predicting that the excessive power that President Hugo Chávez has invested in the armed forces will come back to haunt his government.

The civilian control Trinkunas advocates can not simply be decreed. It requires defence experts placed in legislative and executive oversight agencies, a curriculum for educational institutions within the armed forces designed to emphasize democratic values and respect for the constitution, and a media and civil society capable of tracking military activity and willing to denounce violation of human rights. Furthermore, the 'transparency' (p. 204) that is a fundamental ingredient in the process precludes clientelistic practices whereby politicians use their influence on behalf of officers who aspire to be promoted. Trinkunas concludes that subordination of the military through clearly established rules 'is one of the most

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

difficult tasks faced by democratizers, yet it is also the most critical to the security and stability' (p. 2) of newly installed democratic regimes.

Central to Trinkunas's line of argument is the idea that the fashioning of military relations during the transition to democracy is path dependent. During these periods, democratic leaders need to take advantage of the general enthusiasm and mobilisation in favor of democracy by acting immediately and decisively to bring the armed forces under civilian control. Trinkunas cautions against relying on expedients at this critical moment with the intention of establishing viable mechanisms of control at an unspecified future date and points to the Venezuelan case as evidence of the harm that the deferment of measures to control the military inflicts on democracy over a period of time.

In the chapter 'A Lost Opportunity,' Trinkunas analyses what he perceives as the critical error committed by the provisional president of the 1945–1948 *trienio*, Rómulo Betancourt of Acción Democrática (AD). Betancourt failed to take advantage of the democratic government's upper hand as a result of the factionalism within the armed forces in order to directly control the institution. Instead, his government pursued a 'perverse strategy' (p. 46) of appeasing officers and tripling military spending, at the same time that it provided opportunities to AD party loyalists within the ranks of the armed forces. In the absence of civilian interference, the anti-democratic faction within the military was soon able to consolidate its power and went on to overthrow the fledgling democratic government. After Betancourt returned to power following the 1958 overthrow of military dictator Marcos Pérez Jiménez, the government pursued a new strategy that also stopped short of creating mechanisms and procedures for civilian control. Trinkunas calls the post-1958 approach 'divide and conquer.' Rather than assign resources to the armed forces through a centralised command such as the military-controlled Ministry of Defence, the government in 1958 decreed a decentralised structure in which the federal budget allocated money directly to the army, navy, air force and National Guard branches. This practice in effect pitted the four branches against one another, forcing them to 'compete … for resources and attention from elected officials' (p. 212). Trinkunas argues that instead of fragmenting the armed forces in this way in order to limit the institution's capacity to mount a united threat to the democratic regime, the government should have refrained from naming military officers as ministers of defence in order to establish civilian oversight of the institution.

Trinkunas argues that these characteristics explain why the February and November 1992 coups occurred and why they failed. The planning of the two coups went largely undetected due to the lack of civilian controls and (in the case of the February rebellion led by Chávez) because of the distance between top- and middle-level officers. The February coup was restricted to the army while the November one took in only the air force and navy, a phenomenon that was the result of the rigid separation of the four branches and the distrust between each of them. The Chávez presidency has failed to correct the lack of civilian oversight, although it has created a single command structure.

The military strategy Trinkunas proposes is designed to achieve political stability, not far-reaching structural changes. Thus, for instance, Trinkunas argues that a 'broad civilian consensus on democratization … could have been achieved by a more moderate and inclusive transitional government' (p. 59) during the *trienio*. In addition to its commitment to democracy, however, the AD *trienio* government

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

had a socio-economic agenda that undoubtedly required bold measures at the outset, taking advantage of the party's overwhelming electoral support. Trinkunas has formulated a well constructed thesis and has systematically applied it to the Venezuelan case, in the process demonstrating a thorough command of the nation's military history. His thesis brings out certain continuities in civil-military relations from the period following the October 1945 coup until the present in spite of changing political settings.

*Universidad de Oriente, Venezuela* STEVE ELLNER

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06331938

John A. Adams, Jr., *Bordering the Future: The Impact of Mexico on the United States* (Westport, CT, and London: Praeger, 2006), pp. xii + 167, $39.95; £22.99, hb.

This book examines a range of contemporary policy issues in Mexico and their implications for the United States and for Mexico-US relations. The author (a businessman with some twenty years' practical experience in Latin America and an adjunct professor of international banking and finance at Texas A & M International University in Laredo, Texas) does not engage grand theoretical debates about complex interdependence or globalisation. Nor does Adams address the overall management of the Mexico-US relationship. Rather, he focuses on the ways in which specific issues impinge upon the United States and bilateral relations.

The book's principal contribution is to provide the general reader with an overview of recent economic developments and policy dilemmas in Mexico. Among other topics, it examines agriculture, migratory flows and the Mexico-US border region, energy policy, and the competitive challenges facing Mexico's in-bond manufacturing (*maquiladora*) industry. The data are generally current, and the author is knowledgeable about a number of economic policy issues.

Adams is an enthusiastic advocate of open markets and free trade. This perspective encourages him to highlight some issues that other writers might overlook, such as the pressing transportation infrastructure needs along the Mexico-US border. This same orientation, however, seemingly blinds him to some of the negative consequences of accelerating regional economic integration, including heightened socioeconomic and regional polarisation in Mexico. The author's only reference to organised labour applauds its declining strength (p. 120), a position that contrasts markedly with his concern for the privileges enjoyed by transnational firms (p. 95).

The author is sensitive (and generally sympathetic) to the importance of nationalist sentiment in Mexico. At times, however, his overall analysis is quite apolitical. He limits to a single paragraph (p. 123) his discussion of the challenges of policy making in Mexico's highly competitive, partisan political environment. Even more problematic, Adams asserts without elaboration that 'open markets in Mexico and increased globalization of the Mexican economy have allowed for more political stability' (pp. 103–4).

Several of the thematic chapters (particularly those on immigration and energy issues) include solid historical overviews of their topics. However, the author errs (or is inconsistent) in such matters as the dates of Porfirio Díaz's personalist regime, the periods during which the Bracero Program and 'Operation Gatekeeper' (an intensified effort to control illegal immigration in the San Diego, California area)

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

were in effect, and the origins of negotiations between the administrations of Vicente Fox Quesada and George W. Bush over reform of US immigration policy. Parts of some chapters consist largely of accumulated facts insufficiently integrated with, or related to, the thematic discussion they are supposed to illuminate.

The author's enthusiasm for his subject is not reflected in the quality of his writing. The presentation is at times repetitive. Moreover, in several places it is virtually impossible to fathom the author's intended meaning: 'The flames of change were fanned by a new generation of desires and concerns to once again address the course and meaning of Mexican society' (p. 11); 'Like many emerging nations, Mexico has been caught in the web of major expectations based on hypergrowth, a growth that is often misunderstood and has complicated domestic issues' (p. 14); '… Mexico will remain a pivotal barometer of urban and industrial growth patterns along the U.S.-Mexico border' (p. 100); 'The proximity of the two nations is a fact of geography and pivotal to continued good relations' (p. 124). Even more important in a book whose principal contributions are empirical, the source notes to tables and figures are very inadequate.

*Institute for the Study of the Americas* KEVIN J. MIDDLEBROOK

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06341934

Irving Goldman, *Cubeo Hehénewa Religious Thought: Metaphysics of a Northwestern Amazonian People* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2004), pp. xlv + 438, $64.50, $29.50 pb; £43.00, £20.00 pb.

This posthumous work of Irving Goldman represents a concluding statement on his life's work with the Cubeo (linguistically classified within the eastern Tukanoan family) revealing a deep erudition on Cubeo culture. At Irving Goldman's request, when he was too infirm to go on working on the book, Peter Wilson edited the book. Stephen Hugh-Jones of Cambridge University, specialist on the Northwestern Amazon region, collaborated with Peter Wilson and wrote the postscript, bringing an up-date on the situation in which the Cubeo live nowadays.

The last surviving student of Franz Boas, Goldman shows a strong Boasian influence, avoiding theoretical generalisations separate from ethnography: 'Ethnography is itself sufficiently theoretical' (p. 8). In this book Goldman deals with Cubeo cosmology, aiming to describe the ways in which Cubeo think about religious matters. Goldman presents his work as 'salvage ethnography' (p. 4), focusing on traditional religious thought. However, after his 1939 and 1940 fieldwork among the Bahúkiwa, on which his first book, *The Cubeo*, was based, he returned to the River Cudiarí in 1969–70 and for a short visit in June 1979, to learn that 'Cubean religious culture had not been eradicated. It had gone 'underground' … ' (p. 3).

Contrary to his expectations, Goldman found the Cubeo undergoing a cultural revival, revealing one of the problems of salvage ethnography with indigenous peoples who are deeply affected by interethnic contact. As an approach which presupposes that contact will eradicate indigenous cultures with a 'loss of native religion' (p. 3), it fails to take into account the versatility of indigenous cultures. The fact that despite the tragic consequences and violence of contact, the survivors are able to resist and find positive ways of adapting and reinventing their cultures. As Goldman himself recognises, people do not forget their culture. They may learn

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

another one, but their own goes underground. Goldman's informants were native intellectuals with whom he discussed the aims of anthropological research. His experience in the field altered his own outlook on cultural change. On his return in 1979, 'the entire Cubean ritual culture … had been restored' (p. 6). In Goldman's own words '(a) desire for university education seemed to go along with the restoration of native ethnicity' (p. 6). This book resulted from his collaboration with educated natives. Goldman affirms that '(w)e are in the presence now of genuine collaboration and have cause to be careful that our own field perceptions might not withstand the critical appraisal of smart informants' (p. 7).

Goldman states that 'the ultimate subject matter at the center of their religious thought is ethnicity or Cubeoness' (p. 11). He defines religion broadly as 'a total system that embraces the views, the metaphysics, and the naturalist observations and speculations that set the people within the natural order, as they perceive it. The totality includes the ritual relations that associate them with other powers and beings. Finally, it is the organization of sentiments that generate passions of ethnicity' (p. 12), adding that 'Cubeo see their religion as their passion or, more simply, their love for their ancestors' (p. 14).

Goldman aims to remain close to the Cubeo meanings as he has understood them. He recognises, however, that anthropological interpretation sees indigenous culture through a Western prism and that he cannot claim to have succeeded in rendering their religious thought in their own manner (p. 8). Goldman affirms that 'The act of creation through experimentation with modalities of thought accounts in part for the preoccupation of Cubeo with psychoactive drugs' (p. 14). He presents Cubeo religious thought as being made up of dualities: the distinction between the ancestral and the shamanistic, the forces that generate life and those that deal with its defects; the duality represented by two deities, Kuwai, the creator, and the Anaconda, Master of Riverine Life.

Although it is impossible in a short review to do justice to the ethnographic density and profound knowledge of Goldman's long and dense ethnographic text, I shall attempt to outline just a few of the themes dealt with. As Stephen Hugh-Jones points out in his Afterword, despite being written in the spirit of Boasian-style ethnography, Goldman's work is also in the collaborative and politically-engaged tradition which results from his long-term fieldwork and political commitment to the indigenous cause.

Goldman identifies the organising principles that are implied by myth and are acted upon in ritual and in social relations in Chapter 2 'Creation and Emergence', describing the general scheme of the idea of creation, in which human beings were submerged, the era of the Kúwaiwa, creation and the creation deities, the Anacondas' counterparts in creation of the Kúwaiwa of the prehuman era, the ancients, and Yurédo. Goldman concludes this chapter presenting social principles. In Chapter 3, Goldman presents the tribe. Throughout this book, Goldman revises his earlier work, pointing to its limits. He admits that in his earlier work 'the true nature of the phratry escaped me. The Hehénewa I had listed as a sib are, in fact, subdivisions of the phratry that is also known by that name' (p. 75). While the *phratry* is seen as occupying a segment of a river system, the *sib* is envisioned as being ideally settled within a single village.

Chapter 4 looks at daily life at ground level and Chapter 5 on the cosmic order and has the principal aim of describing the nonhuman realms that most concern the Cubeo. The ritual order is the subject of Chapter 6, Death and Mourning, where the

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

author remarks that traditional mourning rites were forcibly suppressed by the Catholic mission during the 1940s and revived in 1970 (p. 255). The ritual details in this chapter are exceptionally dense and rich. Chapter 8 entitled Shamans, Jaguars and Thunderers, is characterised by Goldman's attempt to represent Cubean culture from a metaphysical and not sociological perspective, and his belief 'that it comes closer to what Cubean have in mind when they talk about themselves' (p. 346). The concluding chapter, entitled Gender, concerns the powers associated with social life.

There are a few small slips in the text, such as the translation of *pupunha*, the edible palm fruit (*Guilielma speciosa*), as 'pineapple' (p. 132). The regional term for cayman, '*jacaré*' (p. 271) is standard Brazilian Portuguese. However, such details in no way distract from this brilliant exemplary work which brings to life Cubeo religious thought.

*Universidade de Brasília* STEPHEN GRANT BAINES

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06351930

Samiri Hernández Hiraldo, *Black Puerto Rican Identity and Religious Experience* (Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida, 2006), pp. xviii + 289, $55.00, hb.

Located on the northeastern coast of Puerto Rico, about half an hour away by car from the capital city of San Juan, Loíza has long been hailed as the most 'African' of the island's towns because of its predominantly black population and folk traditions. Thus, the town is commonly associated with witchcraft, superstition, spiritism and *santería*, an Afro-Caribbean religion with a strong Yoruba component. However, Samiri Hernández Hiraldo focuses on increasing religious diversity in Loíza and elsewhere in Puerto Rico, particularly the rapid growth of Protestantism, the charismatic movement in the Catholic Church, and homegrown institutions such as the Church of the Fountain of the Living Water, the Heavenly Doors Evangelical Church, the Pentecostal Church of God and the Church of the Faithful Disciples of Christ. This fine-grained monograph was primarily motivated by the author's 'process of self-discovery or identity redefinition' (p. 25) as a Puerto Rican graduate student in the United States. Moreover, Hernández Hiraldo, who grew up in the neighbouring town of Carolina, had been familiar with Loíza since childhood and was eager to return to the intriguing place that her family had warned her about with pejorative phrases such as 'they look like blacks from Loíza'. In a reflexive gesture, she uses herself as an informant raised as a devout Baptist participant in various Christian organisations, including a student movement, a university group and a radio show.

As the author writes, 'This book's main argument is that although Loízan experience cannot be reduced to the issue of identity, identity is highly significant to many Loízans. Religion's management of identity is both the cause and the result of this central role of identity' (pp. 3–4). Hernández Hiraldo underlines that 'Loízans' management of identity is (intentionally or unintentionally) strategic' (p. 4). She dwells on how various identities intertwine in religious experience, such as national, regional, racial, gender and generational affiliations, as well as those arising from political and class differences. She acknowledges that certain cultural practices have been 'invented' to represent the Puerto Rican nation in response to US colonialism – largely as white, Hispanic and Catholic (pp. 8–12). However, Loíza has usually been portrayed as black, African and dominated by witchcraft, and

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

thus Hernández Hiraldo's work seeks to counter 'a disproportionate obsession with Afro-Puerto Rican religion in Loíza' (p. 31).

Hernández Hiraldo completed twelve months of ethnographic fieldwork in Las Cuevas, one of the six sectors of Loíza, with about 230 households and 800 residents. The site included both rural and urban areas, poor and lower-middle class families and various denominations: Catholic (50 per cent of the residents), Pentecostal (36 per cent), other Christian (12 per cent) and nonreligious persons (2 per cent). The author's research techniques consisted basically of intensive interviews, participant observation, a census and archival research. Hernández Hiraldo offers vivid first-hand descriptions of ritual practices such as Catholic processions, a Pentecostal Bible school for adults, and a Sunday worship service for the Church of the Fountain of the Living Water. She argues convincingly that 'through systematic and close interaction with participants one can better grasp the whole picture of religious motivation' (p. 7). The argument is fleshed out in revealing interviews with key informants, including Catholic priests and laypeople, and Pentecostal pastors and their flock. As a Christian believer herself, Hernández Hiraldo provides an illuminating and sympathetic account of other people's faiths which would otherwise seem odd to outsiders. No wonder she was recruited by several Protestant ministers to assist them in their mission!

One of Hernández Hiraldo's main findings is that 'in Loíza the actual practice of witchcraft has declined over the past decades' (pp. 28–29), although some Afro-Puerto Rican customs have survived along with various versions of Christianity, especially in folk music. Nevertheless, few of her informants confessed to practicing *santería* or spiritism, due in part to the secrecy of such cults and widespread prejudice against them. In her view, the festival of Santiago Apóstol (St. James) has become a state-sponsored celebration of Loíza's African heritage that does not represent the current religious affiliations of most residents (it is strongly opposed by many Pentecostals as an evil and pagan practice). In turn, the Catholic Church has recently supported the festival as a popular tradition, while transforming itself from a state to a national and local religion, as part of a broader process of modernisation which many informants refer to as 'No more Latin'. Still, Hernández Hiraldo explains that many residents of Las Cuevas were drawn to Protestantism, especially Pentecostalism, because of its emphasis on reading the Bible, popular music, sports, a strict code of behaviour, material prosperity, social mobility and immediate emotional gratification. Furthermore, in Pentecostal churches women have increased their participation as religious leaders, although they have not reached parity with men, particularly as pastors. Finally, the author documents that older people often resort to 'witnessing', as part of Protestant efforts to enhance their status in local spiritual communities.

Hernández Hiraldo's book provides a fascinating collage of religious pluralism in Puerto Rico, a poorly researched topic in recent ethnographies. At the same time, the author dispels the enduring myth of Loíza as the 'capital of (African) tradition' on the island. Her work contributes a well-rounded and perceptive analysis of why Puerto Ricans have converted *en masse* to Protestantism, especially Pentecostalism, as well as how the Catholic hierarchy has grappled with greater religious heterogeneity. As the author recognises, almost in hindsight, she was unable to examine systematically the impact of transnational migration on the religious experience of Loízans, even though 13 per cent of her informants had relatives in the United States. The construction and representation of blackness in Loíza also deserve

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

more critical reflection, since this is the only municipality on the island with a majority black population, according to the 2000 census. Overall, this is a readable, well-documented and insightful assessment of a pressing issue for Puerto Rican and Latin American studies: the often difficult (and sometimes tense) coexistence of Catholic and Protestant congregations that compete to save the souls, define the meaning of a good life, and shape the identities of a large majority of the citizens of a country.

*University of Puerto Rico, Río Piedras* JORGE DUANY

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06361937

Mary Ann Clark, *Where Men are Wives and Mothers Rule: Santería Ritual Practices and Their Gender Implications* (Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida, 2005), pp. xii + 185, $59.95, hb.

By definition, as one of the 'isms', feminism has an ambiguous position in academic research. While by no means incompatible in principle, as any politician will state, the demands of advocacy and of comprehension can be contrasting. So if feminists – just as Marxists or liberalists or 'activists' – are used to one criticism in academic circles it is that their position is too 'ideological', allowing the motivations of political advocacy to subsume and delimit the intellectual task of comprehension. On the other hand, the habitual response to this accusation is to dispute its 'hegemonic' premise, namely that intellectual pursuits can somehow subsist in a neutral space beyond the tussles of political partisanship, as if to uphold the distinction between 'practice' and 'theory' as a theoretical axiom were not itself a political act.

These familiar debating positions appear less hackneyed when it comes to assessing the role of feminism in the study of 'non-Western' cultures, for here post-colonial sensibilities have made the moral stakes feel higher. As detractors of feminists point out, the conflict between politics and understanding becomes all the more perilous when political axes which are, like 'women's liberation', peculiar to Western modernity and are grounded in alien cultural contexts. The obvious risk here is that of cultural projection – 'ethnocentrically', as anthropologists say, reading one's own cultural preoccupations on to other people's (consider, for example, the ambivalence with which Muslim women often view some feminists' militant opposition to veiling or female circumcision). But again, feminists may respond that ethnocentrism can be the more insidious for being built into politically unreconstructed intellectual agendas. They can take much of the credit, for example, for rendering the study of gender central to the social sciences. To ignore the relevance of gender issues to all manner of social phenomena, they have long argued, makes social analysis prone to the old fallacy of assuming that society comprises first and foremost the affairs of men. Indeed, studying the different ways in which gender is organised in varied cultural contexts is a powerful tool for budging such inveterate assumptions, showing that what we take to be natural about men and women is just one among many alternative possibilities.

Mary Ann Clark's book on the role of gender in *santería*, a Cuban religious tradition with roots in West Africa, illustrates the potential of this approach, as well as some of its pitfalls. While not a polemic as such, the book proposes to use an analysis of gender in *santería* to criticise the 'normative male perspective' of Western theology, namely the assumption that the default gender position of

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

both deity and believer is male, so that female roles and symbolisms are downplayed in 'misogynist' fashion (p. 2). With this remit in mind, Clark offers a wide-ranging account of the practice and cosmology of *orisha* (deity) worship, so as to show systematically that devotees 'exist within a female-normative system in which all practitioners, regardless of their own understandings of their sex or gender or sexual orientation, are expected to take up female gender roles in the practice of the religion' (p. 3). Drawing upon the literature on Yoruba *orisha* worship in West Africa and in Cuban *santería*, as well as her own participation in worship among *santería* practitioners in the United States, Clark formulates a coherently 'gendered' theology for *santería*. Devoting chapters to each of the central aspects of worship (including ideas of power and destiny, divination practices, initiation, spirit possession, sacrifice and witchcraft), she is able systematically to examine the role of gender so as to develop a sustained argument to the effect that in the symbology of worship practitioners adopt predominantly feminine roles. To give just one example, Clark draws on the literature on West African kinship organisation to show that in designating neophytes as *iyawo* (a Yoruba kin-term meaning 'new wife'), even biologically male *santería* initiates conceive their relationship to the *orishas*, as well as to elder members of their ritual 'lineage' communities, in irreducibly feminine terms.

This book does a service to the scholarship of Afro-Cuban religion. Breaking with parochial tendencies in the literature, Clark shows how an analytically astute engagement with Afro-Cuban religion can have a purchase on much wider theoretical concerns, in this case the role of gender in religious experience. Most compellingly, Clark brings the detail of *santería* worship to bear not only on familiar social scientific debates about gender, but also on older theological concerns with the relationship between humanity and divinity.

Also evident in the book, however, are some of the dangers of straddling the divide between description and theory in this way. Mobilising descriptions of *orisha* worship to support her critique of Western theological assumptions, Clark tends to draw rather eclectically from historical sources on Yoruba practice, ethnographic accounts from Cuba, and her own experiences among practitioners in the United States. So in her effort to synthesise an alternative to Western theology, she effectively 'theologises' *santería* practice, pasting over much of the historical and ethnographic complexity of these evolving traditions, masterfully documented by David Brown in his recent *Santería Enthroned* (Chicago, 2003).

This at times uncomfortable relationship between description and theory pertains also to the book's feminist agenda, the dilemmas with which this review began. While the impetus of Clark's account is to show that in *santería* gender is 'fluid' (p. 22), irreducible to essentialist notions of biological sex, she also uses her findings to speak to contemporary debates within communities of practitioners in the United States about the relative prestige of male and female initiates. Presenting the increasing dominance of Ifá (the male-only diviner cult associated with *santería*) as a compromise of women's 'full equality' in Orisha religion (p. 151), Clark concludes the book by reflecting on women's prospects of achieving such equality. But the women she has in mind are to be understood straightforwardly as 'sisters' of women 'in other traditions [who] have discovered a stained-glass ceiling limiting their full participation' in worship (ibid.). In view of her penetrating point about the inadequacy of such ethnocentric analogies in the analysis of *santería* gender, Clark's concern for the plight of 'women' in this context seems peculiarly unreconstructed.

*University College London* MARTIN HOLBRAAD

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06371933

Sabine Hyland, *The Jesuit and the Incas: The Extraordinary Life of Padre Blas Valera, S. J.* (Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press, 2003), pp. xii + 269, $30.00, $18.95 pb; £17.00, pb.

Although the writings of Blas Valera have attracted the attention of Andean scholars throughout the years, the details of his life have remained little understood. A *mestizo* Jesuit with a deep knowledge of Inca culture and history, and a distinguished expert of the Quechua language, Valera was the author of what was not only a well-informed treatise on Inca customs, but also a passionate defence of the ancient rulers of Peru. Because of the hardships he had to endure during the final years of his life, Valera's identity as an author has been unclear. Some of his work remained unknown, while some was used by other writers, notably by Inca Garcilaso de la Vega, or was destroyed altogether. Since so few traces were left of him after his tragic end, the scope of his work will perhaps never be sufficiently determined.

In this book Sabine Hyland explores Blas Valera's intriguing career. Her aim is to understand his thought and the impact his work may have had on the missionary and admission policies of the Society of Jesus during the early colonial period. Among several religious orders established in Peru, the Jesuits were in many respects the most influential. During its initial years in the Andes, the Society encouraged the enrolment of *mestizos* in the belief that the conversion of the indigenous population would progress swiftly, thanks to the mastery of *mestizos* of vernacular languages and acquaintance with the local culture. Valera belonged to this first generation of Quechua-speaking Jesuits. During the first decades after his profession, his sharpness of mind and knowledge of indigenous history and culture quickly gained him reputation and respect. In spite of this, Valera's career ended abruptly and, as Hyland argues, this was no isolated event: it was tightly connected to the order's decision to ban the admission of men of mixed blood, a ruling that lasted until the late eighteenth century. Furthermore, Valera's career and demise exemplified the tensions involving the incorporation of Peru's indigenous population into Catholicism, and the place that the Incas held in the historical record. His work has recently been the subject of intense debates over the authorship and contents of other significant sources for the history of the pre-Columbian and early colonial Andes.

By analysing Valera's biography, Hyland's book addresses the different phases in his life: his bi-cultural education as a *mestizo* child and his profession in the Jesuit order; his involvement in decisive times and places for the missionary endeavour in Peru; the contents, sources and meaning of the writings he produced; the circumstances leading to his long imprisonment in Peru; and his eventual exile and tragic death in Spain. In a final chapter, Hyland discusses the controversy generated a few years ago by the disclosure of documents suggesting, among other similarly disconcerting statements, that Valera's death was faked, that he eventually returned to Peru, and that he was in fact the author of the *Nueva Corónica y Buen Gobierno*, a fundamental work for Andean history.

Hyland scrutinises the formation of a *mestizo* consciousness struggling to reconcile the opposing currents that nurtured Valera's life, religious and political commitment, and worldview. The author traces the different phases and experiences of his life, leading not only to his special acquaintance with Inca history and religion, but also to his allegiance to both the Incas and Christianity. Given the paucity of information, it is understandable that there is ample space for speculation; but some

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

of the suggestions the author advances appear as if made to support a preconceived idea of how Valera's thought was shaped, and why his life resembles a road to martyrdom. In this account, therefore, the historical context and Valera's ideas are not always effectively interwoven. For example, Hyland suggests that Valera's mother was of Inca descent, and that it was she who taught him Quechua and instilled in him his 'love for the Incas' (pp. 21–22). She also asserts that Valera's allegiance to Inca Atahualpa was cultivated through his contact with *amautas* (Inca historians and storytellers) in Trujillo (p. 32). The evidence to support this is scanty. More importantly, these statements imply that both the Quechua language and Inca history during Valera's time were homogeneous and uncontested fields, and one wonders how problematic it might have been for Valera's future career and thought that he had learned a rather marginal Quechua dialect, or that, from the point of view of most of the Inca elite of Cusco, Atahualpa was a spurious, not a legitimate ruler. It would be of interest to trace how the Quechua language and Inca culture were transformed and recreated during these years: missionaries and colonial officials enthusiastically adopted the Cusco Quechua dialect as the *lengua general*, and prominent clergymen argued that this was *the* variety of Quechua that should be spread and spoken throughout the viceroyalty. Hyland assigns a leading role to Valera in proposing this, but in fact he was one among several who supported this idea. Moreover, Inca history and religion were rewritten and reinterpreted intensively during these years. Scholars like Pierre Duviols have shown that indigenous elites in the Andes did not profess identical loyalties to the memory of the Incas. In her quest to present Valera as a defender of Andean Indians' rights and civilisation, and as the architect of a 'new vision of Andean Christianity' (which he probably was), Hyland presents a rather idealistic view of Andean culture and society and refrains from considering its historicity. This approach may be useful in presenting Valera in a solitary struggle against the orthodoxy professed by his superiors and colonial officials. However, it seems that Valera was immersed in a much more dense and complex web of debates and social conflicts that account for his vision of the Andean past.

*University of Cambridge* GABRIELA RAMOS

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X0638193X

Jay Kinsbruner, *The Colonial Spanish-American City: Urban Life in the Age of Atlantic Capitalism* (Austin TX: University of Texas Press, 2005), pp. xiii + 182, $40.00, $18.95 pb.

Jay Kinsbruner has written a concise, synthetic overview of Spanish American cities throughout the course of the colonial period. Most of the eleven chapters are quite short, ranging from ten to twenty pages each. Their topics range from 'The Colonial City by Definition and Origin' and 'The Administration of the Colonial City' to 'The Urban Economy', 'Urban Society', 'Caste and Class in the Urban Context', and 'The Urban Family'. They include a ten-page chapter on 'The Pre-Colombian City' that merely describes four indigenous cities from different time periods; the chapter provides no comparisons with Spanish American cities. Kinsbruner identifies the book's central theme as being 'that the colonial Spanish American city evolved during the age of Atlantic capitalism and was itself a circumstance of that capitalism' (p. xi).

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Colonial officials implemented a model for the layout of new cities in the Americas whenever possible. The central plaza was flanked by the government palace, the cathedral, the municipal plaza and a portico for merchant shops. Of course, the geography of the region could impose some variation, while cities that began as mining camps were laid out in a more haphazard fashion, as the initial assumption was that they would be temporary in nature.

The Church typically dominated the urban landscape with religious buildings, hospitals, monasteries and convents. Their architecture often provided a city with its character. Agencies of the Church also invested heavily in apartment buildings, and the rent from them served as a primary source of income for ecclesiastical foundations.

The scale and character of the regional economy determined the vitality of local urban life. The frequent success of commodity, precious metal and import merchants best illustrates this phenomenon. These wealthy wholesalers sustained storekeepers and even street vendors through providing commercial credit to them. While most small store owners were men, a notable minority were women, often widows. These female owners commonly made use of their daughters as clerks.

Artisans composed an identifiable sector of the urban economy, turning out products which were needed by the urban society, but too inexpensive to bear the costs of transportation from Europe. The widow of a master craftsman was permitted to manage his shop provided that she did not remarry. Apprentices contracted with master craftsmen to be trained for a three-to-five year period were often provided with room and board and other emoluments.

Urban Spanish America contained an identifiable middle class. Besides the merchants described above and a property-owning element, higher-ranking administrators, priests and medical practitioners made up its ranks. Kinsbruner considers the chronically impoverished in the bigger cities to make up no more than 20 percent of the population (p. 102).

Spanish America practised a racial hierarchy, with whites at the top, mixed bloods and blacks composing a broad middle spectrum, and Indians at the lowest level. The racial groups married endogamously to an overwhelming extent. However, race mixture did occur occasionally, especially in the cities, and people were able to assert their membership in higher racial strata successfully as a result of some combination of their appearance, occupation and wealth, social behaviour, and the physical attributes of their wedding partners. The members of the middle echelons of the racial hierarchy seem not to have cared greatly about the formal classifications of other members. Instead, they regarded each other as fellow members of an undifferentiated racial group that shared much the same characteristics.

Even though the urban ideal of a family was conjugal and patriarchal, the reality was far different. Colonial officials commonly placed women in safe houses or convents in order to protect them from their respective spouses. In a context where women, with a far higher frequency than today, did not survive pregnancy and childbirth, widowers typically remarried rather soon after the demise of their wives. Besides, men in this culture could not cook or tend to household needs and were inept in the care of children. This resulted in substantial age differentials between husbands and wives. Widows, on the other hand, did not remarry, but instead enjoyed the freedom and rights the culture awarded to widows but not to wives. Thus women in these circumstances could become the heads of households and families.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Social status in the Spanish-American urban world was reinforced by the place that one occupied in public events, the clothes one wore and the way one spoke. Residence was a less accurate predictor of social position, as both the better off and commoners often lived in the same neighbourhoods, the poor living in small rooms attached to the great houses of the rich.

Urban historians and Latin Americanists in general will find this brief work useful for the abundant information it provides about colonial Spanish American cities. Scholars with more expertise on the subject will likewise find some value in this reliable work.

*Washington State University* JOHN E. KICZA

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06391936

Luz María Méndez Beltrán, *La exportación minera en Chile, 1800–1840: un estudio de historia económica y social en la transición de la Colonia a la República* (Santiago de Chile: Editorial Universitaria, 2005), pp. 216, pb.

Luz María Méndez Beltrán (with her team of hard-working research assistants) has produced an important addition to the history of mineral production and export in Chile in the first half of the nineteenth century. This is a work which fits best within the traditionalist camp of Chilean historiography, alongside those produced by Eugenio Pereira Salas, Sergio Villalobos or Sergio Vergara Quiroz. It is based on a tremendous amount of painstaking work in the archives which has resulted in the generation of reliable data sets on mineral production, exports, producers and exporters, which will sustain the work of future researchers exploring the economic history of the early Chilean state. The time frame that Méndez Beltrán has chosen is a valuable one, as it not only allows us to understand the continuity of mineral production across the colonial and national periods (one of her main hypotheses), but for the first time provides reliable data for the period prior to the publication of the first official statistics (in 1844) on the entire mineral producing region in the north. It thereby corrects and supplements data provided by Marcelo Carmagnani and Alberto Herrmann, among others.

The geographical reach of the work is also critical, as it encompasses both the north of Chile and Valparaiso. In the process Méndez Beltrán is able to revise our understanding of the relative productive value of each of the three main mineral-producing regions: Copiapó, Huasco-Vallenar and Coquimbo-La Serena. Given the importance of the Arqueros district, we begin to appreciate that Coquimbo was as important a silver producer as was Copiapó, with its famous Chañarcillo mine.

Méndez Beltrán's data allow us to draw some important conclusions – and to raise some additional questions – both about mining in the early republic as well as about significant issues concerning the effectiveness of the Chilean state. In the first place, by tracing production/export statistics and relative price ranges for the three main types of mineral production (copper, silver, gold), we can better appreciate the impact of gold production on the overall Chilean budget. Even though most historians have focused on copper and silver production, it was gold which accounted for more than 80 per cent of the value of all mineral exports between the years 1800–1840. The export of gold was much more tied to the fortunes of the port of Valparaiso than was the production of either copper or silver. In that

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

sense, and given the importance of Valparaiso to the success of the early Chilean state, we are once again left to ponder the complex relationship between the northern mining zones and the central provinces, home to Chile's state elites. Although historians have tended to explore this relationship most seriously during the civil wars of the 1850s, it is now clear that it should be traced from a much earlier period.

Secondly, Méndez Beltrán uses her data to attempt to estimate the impact of mining on the 'capitalisation of the country' (p. 47). How much of the wealth produced by the mines did 'managers and producers' invest in Chile via their purchases of urban or rural real estate and other personal property, she asks? While the author concludes that mining contributed 21 per cent to Chile's overall 'capitalisation', her figure represents the difference between minerals sent from the mining region to Valparaiso (and then exported), versus direct exportation from the mining zone itself (a product of laws in the 1820s which gradually opened Chile's ports to foreign export). More work will be needed to fully appreciate the extent to which mining capitalised the early national economy in Chile.

One of Méndez Beltrán's most significant conclusions is her suggestion that the fiscal and trade policies adopted by Bernardo O'Higgins in 1820, along with a steady rise in mining output during the first two decades after independence, set the stage for the success of the Chilean state by providing it with an established stream of income which 'allowed it to maintain a stable system despite political changes and military crises' (p. 216). Here, too, additional variables might be considered (particularly regarding the coherence of the Chilean ruling elite after the conservative revolution of the 1830s), but the author's data certainly allows for a new look at that period.

Finally, the concluding chapters of the work present a thorough compilation of the mineral producers and exporters who operated in the northern mining regions during this period, tracing the transfer of control from Spanish hands to Chilean and, importantly, US and British entrepreneurs. It is very valuable to have a global sense of the more than 600 individuals working in this commerce, although one would have liked to see some broader work on the most important among them (for example, Samuel Haviland, Walker Hermanos or the Edwards family), not just as regards their individual biographies, but in terms of how capital from their mining enterprises circulated among and between them and into other areas of the economy, particularly agriculture.

Méndez Beltrán's greatest strength is the invaluable work of data collection which she undertakes, and this volume will provide future historians of the period with a statistical foundation on which to base their work. At the same time, it is best read in collaboration with the work of some of the more analytically oriented historians who deal with the same period (Alfredo Jocelyn-Holt Letelier, Gabriel Salazar, Julio Pinto or María Angélica Illanes, for example). The edition is nicely illustrated with dozens of prints, etchings and paintings of the period – a real service for those doing visually oriented work or who want to know what the northern mining towns and ports looked like in the mid-nineteenth century.

*Oberlin College* STEVEN S. VOLK

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06401930

Barbara Potthast and Sandra Carreras (eds.), *Entre la familia, la sociedad y el Estado: niños y jóvenes en América Latina* (*siglos XIX–XX*) (Frankfurt: Vervuert Verlagsgesellschaft, 2005), pp. 403, €36.00, pb.

In Latin America, where almost half of the population is under eighteen years of age, the number of books published on the history of childhood and adolescence is scarce. One recent study that could most certainly be read in conjunction with this book, however, is Tobias Hecht's *Minor Omissions: Children in Latin American History and Society* (Madison, 2002), which examines the experiences of children and ideas about childhood during the colonial and national periods. In *Entre la familia, la sociedad y el Estado*, Barbara Potthast, Sandra Carreras, and their contributors demonstrate the important roles that girls, boys and adolescents have had in institutions such as the family, social welfare, education and the army during the course of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. With the aim of examining and assessing the changing relationships that have taken place between the family, society and the state in Latin America, the thirteen research articles included in this volume address a very broad range of issues: children in forced and bonded labour; children and adolescents who lack primary caregivers and are exposed to violence, to physical and sexual abuse; and the international conventions, national laws and other mechanisms created for child protection during the course of the twentieth century.

In their contributions to the book, the authors, who comprise historians, sociologists and political scientists, as well as literary critics and cultural historians, continually stress that the study of childhood and adolescence must be situated 'between' the family, society and the state, and that only through a multidisciplinary perspective and approach is it possible to make visible and to assess the experiences of children and adolescents in the region today and in the past.

In the introductory chapter Potthast and Carreras address the changes that ideas about childhood underwent from the colonial period to the late nineteenth century. They underline that from the eighteenth century an abundant literature began to flourish on the theme of the protection of children, in which physicians, administrators, military leaders and many other social observers established close links between the impoverishment of a nation and the lack of education and careless 'preservation' of children. The editors also examine the importance that children acquired in Latin America during the first decade of the twentieth century, when childhood captured the popular imagination, and child-rearing philosophies, child-protection policies and child-saving programmes proliferated. They state that it was precisely during the transition from the nineteenth to the twentieth centuries that juvenile court systems, child labour laws, kindergartens, playgrounds and public education plans were introduced in different Latin American settings in the midst of important transformations in the relationships between the family and the state. In addition, they examine the transformations in the relationship between the family and the state that were further enhanced during the twentieth century, stating that while children became perceived increasingly as innocent victims of social and economic inequalities, adolescents were (and still are) more often than not perceived as a social problem, with an inclination towards crime, and their actions tend to be criminalised.

In the individual chapters Ivette Pérez Vega delves into the lives of slave children during the apogee of sugar production in Puerto Rico (1815–1839). Eugenia Roldán

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Vera studies why children's education was considered to be the vehicle that would transform the inhabitants of the region into true citizens, and examines in great detail the preponderant influence that the educational methods set forth by Andrew Bell and Joseph Lancaster in England had in the region between 1822 and 1845. The intersection between children, adolescents and war is thoughtfully examined by Barbara Potthast in a chapter on the Paraguayan War (1864/65–1870), when numerous minors participated as soldiers. Potthast states that the presence of children of all ages, as well as women, in the military camps of the nineteenth century was not extraordinary. Rather, during the Paraguayan War, a massive recruitment of children and youth took place in the midst of a strong nationalist discourse.

The relationship of the state to children during the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries is thoroughly examined in four contributions. Carmen Ramos Escandón uses the enactment of the 1870 Mexican Civil Code to explore debates over state responsibility for children's education, welfare and wellbeing, and assesses the ways in which it altered family relations. Sandra Carreras analyses legislation that focused on children who were seen as marginal (those who were abandoned, orphaned, criminals and illegitimate), discussions over children as future citizens and the ways in which childhood was conceived as a 'social question' in Buenos Aires from the 1870s to the 1920s. Eugenia Rodríguez Sáenz examines women and girls as young criminals and as victims of sexual abuse, and includes a discussion of the ideas and sanctions relative to sexual exploitation in Costa Rica, through a careful and original analysis of the laws and penal codes implemented from the 1800s to the 1950s. The chapter by Eugenia Scarzanella traces the aims and objectives of the numerous international institutions and national mechanisms and laws created for child protection during the inter-war years.

With respect to the lives of children and adolescents during the second half of the twentieth century, the chapter by Silke Hensel addresses the criminalisation of young Mexican Americans during the 1940s; while Estela Schindel is concerned with the responses that politicised young people in the Southern Cone had towards the repression implemented during the military dictatorships, particularly in Argentina. In addition, Alejandra Torres depicts contemporary children's lives in the streets of Mexico City through a thorough analysis of a recent book by photographer Kent Klich. The final three chapters, by Horst Nitschack, Peter Peetz and Ruth Stanley, address contemporary perceptions of adolescents in literature and film, adolescents and urban violence, and the implementation of the 1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child.

This collection of essays succeeds in assessing the multiple factors and issues that have influenced – and that continue to impinge – on the lives and wellbeing of children and adolescents in Latin America, and will most certainly be of interest to a wide public interested in the history of the changing relationships between the family, the state and society during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

*Instituto de Investigaciones Históricas, UNAM* CLAUDIA AGOSTONI

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06411937

Teresa Prados-Torreira, *Mambisas: Rebel Women in Nineteenth-Century Cuba* (Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida, 2005), pp. xii + 185, $59.95, hb.

Those familiar with modern Cuban history will also be familiar with the term *mambí*, and its plural form *mambises*, for those fighting for Cuba's late nineteenth-century

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

independence from Spain. They may be less familiar with its origins which Teresa Prados-Torreira explains, at the outset of this book, to be a deformation of *mbi*, a Yoruba prefix, picked up by Spanish troops as a slur on the West African racial origins of many of the Cuban rebels, and subsequently widely used during the 1868–78 and 1895–98 wars. Recent historiography has begun to document the significance of race in the dual struggles for political independence from Spain and for the abolition of slavery: full abolition was not achieved until 1886, making Cuba second to last in the Americas. By the 1890s, more than two-thirds of the rebels, it has been estimated, including many of the officer class and a good number of generals, were of African descent.

As Prados-Torreira documents amply in this study of *mambisas*, race was not the only factor, for the rebels were not all men. Curiously, she does not clarify her usage of the term *mambisas*. Conventionally applied to those women involved in the actual independence struggles, for her it extends to the whole century. Her work, which is essentially an incursion into women's history, suggests ways in which nineteenth-century Cuban history was also shaped by gender. Shoring up the critique of orthodox Marxist historiography for failing to engage with race and gender, she frames her research with the landmark studies of Cuban women's history by three US women scholars – Sherry Johnson for the late eighteenth century, Vera Kutzinski for the late nineteenth and Lynn Stoner for the early twentieth – and develops the resistance, rather than collusion, aspects of their work. She challenges the continuity that Johnson saw between independent-minded elite Cuban women of the 1700s and *mambisas* of the 1800s, as well as the stereotypical dualism captured in Kutzinski's treatment of black and white women in the late 1800s. Her focus is on how women across races and classes undermined traditional authority, helping to foster their own Gramscian counter-hegemonic revolutionary climate of *cubanidad*. In the process, she argues, a minority became vocal in their demands for women's rights, their political activism setting the stage for the twentieth-century Cuban women's movement documented by Stoner.

Acknowledging the iconography of *mambisa* women as self-sacrificing 'obedient daughters', wives and mothers, she uncovers ample testimony of 'women who stepped beyond the comfortable confines of the official rebel rhetoric to take a leading role in defining the very terms of the rebellion, thus creating tensions and contradictions in the insurgent society' (p. 5). She questions the formulaic patriotic historiography of the *mambisas* as 'honorable martyrs, their stories hardly distinguishable from each other' (p. 7).

Prados-Torreira bases her research on a wide range of key historical, literary biographical and autobiographical texts, as well as richly and often tantalisingly suggestive archival material in the form of diaries, letters and newspaper articles. Almost inevitably, and lamentably, the sources are thinner for poor and black women, although illustrations add to the text. These rang from portraits of familiar, lesser-known and anonymous women to group photographs of fighters in the *manigua* and activists in patriotic clubs.

The first three chapters set the scene for the early part of the century, with some wonderfully evocative chapter headings. 'The Hammock: Bound by Privilege' includes depictions of plantocratic women as hard-working proto-entrepreneurs running large households and their slaves. It draws on the work of women writers such as Juana Borrero, Luisa Pérez de Zambrana, Gertrudis Gómez de Avellaneda, and many other contemporaries of the time, to suggest ways in which women,

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

bound by limited education and suffocating confines of morality and modesty, sought to break the rules and stretch the restrictions. 'The Whip: Black Women in Slave Society' provides a salutary counterbalance to the elite world, with its focus on enslaved and freed women of colour. Drawing on the work of Cuban historians such as Carmen Barcia, Digna Castañeda and Pedro Deschamps Chapeaux, along with the novels of Cirulo Villaverde and Francisco Calcagno, among others, it charts how, through resistance and racial interaction, the fight against Spain offered a chance to find a place in Cuban society. 'Hair and Prayer: Early Signs of Unrest' highlights how appearance and religion performed as tropes. Creole women cut their hair in Bonapartist modernising fashion, earning for themselves the nickname of *pelonas*, while Spanish women with their long, intricate hair styles were dubbed *godas*. Pious Catholic women breached the Church's loyalty to Spain in their anti-colonial prayers.

The book comes into its own in the two chapters on the 1868–78 and 1895–98 wars, replete with fascinating stories of women soldiers, couriers and nurses; the grandiose discourse surrounding their 'spartan selflessness'; and *mambisa* bravery in battle and suffering in the *recogidas* and *reconcentración*. The earlier chapter is complemented by 'Mambisas as Citizens', which details how Emilia Casanova and Ana Betancourt sought to carve a political niche for Cuban women during the Ten Years' War, demanding women's citizenship rights in proto-feminist speeches. A second intervening chapter documents how, during the inter-war years, women held onto the ideals and dreams of the first war and were active in clubs at home and in exile, preparing to renew the fight.

A final chapter, 'Evangelina Cossío Cisneros and the Yellow Press', switches tenor to chart US journalism's fabricated notoriety of a young imprisoned *mambisa,* in an attempt to shore up the case for US intervention in Cuba. Most poignant of all is the 'Epilogue', which documents the plight and disenchantment of *mambisas* after the end of the war as they struggled to survive in a 'grotesque caricature' of their ideals (p. 146). Prados-Torreira ends by heralding *mambisa* symbolism thus: 'Neither self-sacrificing assistant nor ferocious warrior, she stands, rather, as an icon of women who fought for political adulthood and citizenship' (p. 151). The tragedy was defeat in their time, but their daughters would take up the struggle.

*London Metropolitan University* JEAN STUBBS

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06421933

Graciela Batticuore, Klaus Gallo and Jorge Myers (eds.), *Resonancias románticas: ensayos sobre historia de la cultura argentina (1820–1890)* (Buenos Aires: Eudeba, Universidad de Buenos Aires, 2005), pp. 307, pb.

Although one of three editors of this stimulating collection of diverse essays on nineteenth-century Argentine culture, it falls to Jorge Myers to map the new fields of research, as well as act as cited mentor. His wide-ranging, impressive essay on the cultural universes of Romanticism defines the terrain as cultural criticism, with an underpinning of cultural studies. He outlines the rise of the notion of the individual, the discovery of nature, of the imagination and of sincerity, with the role of the poet, and a stress on *passions folles*, suicide and madness. He brings in the nation-state, national literatures, the debts to revolutions and the shared, daring belief in progress. He cites Shelley and Hazlitt; indeed, he owes much to the Anglo-American tradition

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

of Raymond Williams, Frank Kermode and Edward Said (with a consequent snub to Paris). For an Argentine readership, this new angle is provocative. In linking cultural history with the arrival of democracy in 1983, he suggests that the young historians included in this volume share this British empirical tradition, avoid wild political and ideological speculations, and still respect the discipline of proof and document.

New in this collective volume, then, is an expansion of fields, a crossing over of intellectual disciplines, a re-conceiving of Romanticism that looks at cartography, at the absence of landscape paintings, at travel writing, at the reading public, at fashions, at caricatures and museums. Myers notes that Latin America did not produce a George Sand, but it did have a Flora Tristán (though she did write in French). In trying to pin protean 'Romanticism' down, he does not cite Hugh Honour's work (1979), or pay enough attention to an equally marginal Romantic movement like Spain's, especially with writer-critics like Larra and Espronceda, the latter so similar to Echeverría in persona, pessimism and Byronic bombast.

However, many acute perceptions leap out from the pages. Elías Palti explores how the Rosas regime contradicted the belief of the *Generación del 1837* in the laws of history, that inevitable progress of reason. Alvaro Fernández Bravo equates Gutiérrez's 1846 anthology, *América poética*, with a museum, a construction of a 'patrimonio cultural', so that the colonial Spanish past is appropriated in the creation of the new Latin America. He writes 'son las colonias las que enriquecen a la madre patria' (p. 99). The issue of the reading public and illiteracy crosses Klaus Gallo's piece on theatre as a way to involve this illiterate public, while Graciela Batticuore notes how this same public is seen as 'monstrous', another version of *barbarie* (p. 114). There could be no comedies under Rosas, notes Martín Rodríguez, for all art sought to stir its public into action against him.

Travel writing cuts across this volume, emerging from Adolfo Prieto's work on the foreigners' views absorbed and changed by the Argentine Romantics where travel and exile, and reading as an extension of travel, define local Romantic sensibility. Sarmiento in Algeria (Darío Roldán) or in Spain (Beatriz Colombi) open out issues of how to define emergent Argentina. There is fascinating work on cartography, on the evolution of village-forts, on the strange fact that there is no one text, no justifying 'epic', on the 'Conquest of the Desert'. What emerges from this book is how the travel book, in its all-inclusive Humboldtian sense, becomes the multi-generic way of capturing Argentine peculiarities. The recent rise of the study of travel writing as documentary evidence in academia draws together diverse disciplines, ranging from history to topography to landscape painting to cultural anthropology and, as evidenced in this volume, is held together theoretically by cultural studies.

A few complaints … An index would have increased the reader's ability to cross-reference, itself the underlying and unifying idea of the collection. The typeface is often faded and meanly spaced, so reading becomes a strain. There are very few typos, but most of them come from foreign words (Merime, Woodsworth, etc.). Two articles refer to the Spanish translation of *An Englishman in Buenos Aires* as if it is still an anonymous work, when it is known that George Love, editor of the *The British Packet* in Buenos Aires, was its author. Otherwise, the ample footnotes and references (but no collective bibliography) indicate the density and liveliness of research in Argentina today for those who work in any way on nineteenth-century Argentina.

*University College London* JASON WILSON

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X0643193X

Benedicte Bull, *Aid, Power and Privatization: The Politics of Telecommunication Reform in Central America* (Cheltenham, and Northampton, MA: Edward Elgar, 2005), pp. xiii + 222, £55.00, hb.

For anyone seriously interested in the telecommunication reform process in Latin America, this book should be relevant reading. Carefully researched, it focuses on a comparative study of the reform processes in three Central American countries: Costa Rica, Guatemala and Honduras. Turning away from the usual question of why privatisation is necessary, the author looks more deeply into the process, and reformulates the issue from four critical angles: what has been the main driving force behind the wave of privatisations in Latin America; what has been the role of the international financial institutions (IFIs); what kind of state emerges after privatisation and regulatory reform; and, lastly, why does privatisation remain so unpopular?

Benedicte Bull argues that privatisation should be understood neither as a natural result of governments' response to technological developments and improved knowledge about how to produce goods and services more efficiently, nor as a result of the pressure of the IFIs. Rather, he says, the impetus of privatisation 'must be sought in the relationship between the state and the local private sector elites'. This viewpoint reveals a brilliant avoidance of the traps of the international bureaucratic 'metalanguage' traditionally used by IFIs, to assume a less Cartesian and ambiguous methodology. The thread of his argument underlines the fact that the strength of the local private sector elites and the type of relationship they have built with the state has been the strongest determinant both in the move to privatise and the specific kind of reforms implemented. He does not leave the IFIs out of the picture, but perceives the behaviour of the local elites as key elements to understanding the reactions of different governments to the influence of the IFIs. Moreover, he views privatisation only as an element of a broader scenario: the reform in communications and other sectors of the state machinery. The author does not repeat easy generalisations, but reads the small print in every stance of the process. Through this lens, the emphasis moves from the social sectors behind privatisation to the composition of the forces that have backed specific reforms in the different countries examined. He detects one of the paradoxes of privatisation: even if the worst feared effects on poverty and inequality have not materialised, the process remains profoundly unpopular and social organisations still take to the streets to oppose it because of people's strong perception that the state has been captured by a small elite. In the last twenty years, the author tells us, it has become obvious that privatisation has rather been a vehicle for the small local elites to ensure themselves economic and political positions within the context of a globally liberalised economy. That is why this process cannot be seen separately from the issue of legitimacy of the state. Moreover, he states, in many countries the IFIs cannot be regarded as external actors, but rather as more or less permanent players within domestic politics. Contrary to what has been the norm for many external observers writing on Central America, Bull underlines the profound differences that exist between what he terms 'a captured state' in Guatemala; 'a weak and dependent state in Honduras'; and the symbiosis between private sectors and political elites in Costa Rica.

Between 1986 and 1999, a sum of 396 public sector Latin American institutions were sold or transferred to the private sector. This book, as the author intended,

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

does indeed shed light on the role of competing elites as well as the IFIs in shaping the resulting new political economy in Central America. It could not have come at a better time, since CAFTA is bringing the issue to the streets again in these and other countries of the region. This book is definitely a 'must read' for all those interested in the topic.

*CIAPA, Costa Rica* RODOLFO CERDAS

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06441936

Jorma Ahvenainen, *The European Cable Companies in South America before the First World War* (Helsinki: Finnish Academy of Science and Letters, 2004), pp. 427, pb.

The revolution in international communications during the last quarter of the nineteenth century, the Victorian equivalent of the Internet, has probably attracted less interest than its twenty-first century counterpart. However, the provision of Latin America's commercial infrastructure and the long-term physical investment (often by foreigners) in the region's overhead capital, such as railways and shipping, has been the subject of considerable discussion about its impact upon development and economic growth. The development of telegraphic communication within and beyond Latin America, the subject of this book, is a third important element in the communications revolution that linked the region with the core countries of North America and Western Europe (and cost a fraction of the capital outlay on the railways) has until now been comparatively overlooked.

This neglect is somewhat surprising given the importance of cable communication to governments, businesses and news services. Correspondence between Latin America and Europe or the United States, which took weeks to arrive by ship, could be received in a matter of hours once the cables had been laid. Rapid communication brought news of changing commodity prices and shipping movements, and possibly permitted the swift resolution of diplomatic disputes, although press excitement generated by cabled messages could also created conflict as much as conciliation.

Jorma Ahvenainen has been one of the few who has tackled this topic. But what the subject lacks in numbers of scholars it certainly repays in subject loyalty. Professor Ahvenainen has worked on the history of international cable connections for the last two decades and, indeed, rather like the telegraph companies, he is proceeding piecemeal until he encircles the globe. He first wrote *The Far Eastern Telegraphs* twenty years ago; in 1996 he published his *History of the Caribbean Telegraphs*; and now he has moved on to the cable companies of South America.

His book's central theme is the development by European companies of a submarine cable network, but it also discusses the South American land lines which competed against their cables. The cables that connected Latin America and the Caribbean to the North Atlantic communities were largely operated by British and US companies. Ahvenainen's early chapters relate how the cable business expanded under the direction of two empire-building entrepreneurs, John Pender, who practically formed a world-wide network under British control and James Scrymser, a North American who challenged Pender's hegemony in South America during the 1880s and 1890s. The British also designed and manufactured the cables, although their quality was sometimes questionable, and usually provided the cable-laying

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

ships. Later chapters describe the formation of French and German cable companies in the region. There were also Latin American private sector firms, although much of their capital seems to have come from Europe, and state-owned overland telegraphs. Operation was not straightforward since submarine cables were vulnerable to coral reefs and fishing nets. This account also describes the impact of the unexpected in the form of natural disasters, outbreaks of fever, revolution and civil war, all of which harmed the cable business, literally in the case of the west coast cable which Chile cut during the War of the Pacific. The book is clearly the result of remarkable scholarly endeavour and Professor Ahvenainen seems to omit no detail in his account of the creation of cable and telegraph facilities in South America. He exhaustively describes the negotiations between thrusting businessmen and sometimes reluctant officials, and the concessions eventually wrung from host governments. He records the minutiae of every negotiation or tariff amendment.

What the book lacks, however, is an appreciation of the wider issues. The sources are overwhelmingly the archives of the telegraph companies, especially those of Cable and Wireless, and the corporate viewpoint is very much to the fore. But over-reliance on such sources may blur the focus. Company correspondence inevitably dwells upon operational problems. A greater variety of sources might have yielded a different perspective. The reader does not get a clear sense of the overall impact of the cable companies. What was their long-term effect upon business and government? To what extent did the companies exercise undue influence over the economies and politics of the Latin American republics? Who gained from the establishment of the cable connections? European shareholders seemed at times to have earned few dividends, but many companies were formed by those with interests in cable manufacturing firms which benefited from return orders.

This book is therefore less likely to appeal to readers of this journal or to Latin American scholars in general than it is to business historians. Corporate rivalry, interlocking directorships, bankruptcies, secret agreements, capital watering, profit and tariff disputes are all presented in considerable detail. But even business historians may feel somewhat short-changed. The book is descriptive rather than theoretically informed. Professor Ahvenainen does not exploit the considerable literature on international business, nor does he apply micro-economic analysis to, for example, the issue of inter-firm competition. How far was there a natural monopoly in the provision of cable facilities? Did joint purse and other working agreements, as well as mergers, limit competition? Given that the communications technology of the time required cooperation between rival companies to send messages through shared connection stations, were the markets in telegraph and cable services really contested? The cable tariffs were not cheap, to which one immediate customer response was the invention of improbable code words which summarised complex messages and lowered transmission costs. But how price elastic was the demand for cable services? Principal-agent problems and the economics of the cable industry, such as the issue of 'sunk costs', a particularly apt term in this case, are not explicitly addressed.

However, if the book's scholarly focus is rather narrow, its production qualities are high. It is nicely produced, it contains illustrations and clear maps, and it is fully referenced. Pleasingly, the book's written style is clear and authoritative. One remaining grumble is that the secondary sources generally appear rather dated.

*London Metropolitan University* ROBERT G. GREENHILL

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06451932

Oliver Marshall, *English, Irish and Irish-American Pioneer Settlers in Nineteenth-Century Brazil* (Oxford: Centre for Brazilian Studies, University of Oxford, 2005), pp. xii + 323, £20.00; €30.00; $38.00, pb.

Oliver Marshall is the author of important publications on the English-speaking communities in Latin America. His recent book, *English, Irish and Irish-American Pioneer Settlers in Nineteenth-Century Brazil*, joins Gilberto Freyre's books, *Ingleses* (1942) and *Ingleses no Brasil* (1948), and two other Brazilian studies that map the presence of English-speaking people in Brazil. These are Ana Maria Costa de Oliveira's book on North American immigrants, *O Destino* (*não*) *Manifesto* (União Cultural Brasil-Estados Unidos 1995), and *Os Britânicos no Brasil/The British in Brazil*, a small book published by the Sociedade Brasileira de Cultura Inglesa de São Paulo to accompany an exhibition on the British in Brazil in 2001. Marshall's book is the result of his extensive research on the various settlement attempts of English, Irish and Irish-Americans in Brazil. It concentrates on the background of the isolated agricultural settlement schemes in Brazil, highlighting the causes behind the collapse of some of these colonies and the return migration of their settlers to their place of origin or re-emigration to another country.

The relations between Britain, the United States and Brazil have been the source of studies based mainly on the contribution that the immigrants made to the host country. Marshall's book, however, does not follow this pattern. Its strength lies in the fact that it focuses on a triangular migration flow: emigration, return migration (mainly 'failed' returnees) and re-emigration to a second or third country. Marshall takes a firmly historical approach to the subject, tracing not only the establishment of English-speaking immigrant communities and the conditions that they experienced in Brazil, 'but also an understanding of how the choice of destination was arrived at and what experiences, expectations and ambitions migrants carried with them' (p. 7). He then examines the various colonisation schemes that brought these migrants, attracted by the idealised image of Brazil as a 'lush paradise', to unprepared lands and under-funded agricultural settlements, ending in complete failure. The main sources are Brazilian, British and North American archival collections; published official reports; newspapers and periodicals; as well as other specific primary and secondary publications listed in the bibliography.

The book opens with a short introduction and continues with eight chapters organised asymmetrically in three substantive parts. In the second section, 'Agricultural Colonization in Brazil, 1808–67', the author argues that although the British predominance in import and export trades at the beginning of the nineteenth century and their economic interests in 'mining, shipping services, port facilities, railways, utility companies and banking' became 'synonymous in the mind of many Brazilians with modernization' (p. 14), the British and Irish who settled in Brazil were also protagonists of great failures. Marshall explains that the Sociedade Internacional da Imigração was founded to 'encourage the Brazilian government to look to immigration as a means to meet the country's future labour requirements' (p. 22). From this perspective he discusses the role played by Tipperary-born William Scully, who sought to encourage the recruitment of immigrants from his native Ireland. As owner and editor of *The Anglo-Brazilian Times*, Scully published many articles describing the better climate, lands and jobs that immigrants would find in Brazil compared with the United States.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Part Three contains important information on the Irish diaspora which has never been published before. Marshall explains the schemes to bring former Confederates and New York Irish, as well as Irish from Wednesbury, England, where Father George Montgomery concentrated his attention on education and emigration to Brazil in the same way that Father Anthony Fahy had done in 1844 in Argentina. Upon their arrival in Rio de Janeiro some immigrants were sent to Porto Alegre, a few of the former New Yorkers went to Cananéia, south of Santos, while the largest number of immigrants of Irish origin settled in Colônia Príncipe Dom Pedro in Santa Catarina. Marshall accurately describes the causes for the failure of the Wednesbury party, and how Montgomery and other returnees remained silent about their fate once they were back in their places of origin, thus keeping alive the Utopian vision of a 'New Ireland' in South America.

Part Four is divided into five chapters. The first explains the conditions of life in mid-Victorian England and how the social background was favourable to emigration. The establishment of independent agricultural labourers' unions, as well as local and district branches of the newly emerged National Agricultural Labourers' Union (NALU) 'supported, encouraged and directed migration initiatives' (p. 99). The following chapters describe the recruitment of English emigrants whose 'union membership, involving simply paying 6d in sign-up dues' (p. 108) did not guarantee that they were really 'agriculturalists'. Marshall also presents a detailed account of colonial life focusing on the state of the land, produce and markets, population prior to and after the immigrant's arrival, and the social life and administration of the colonies at Cananéia and Assunguy. Due to the collapse of these poorly supplied colonies many British immigrants returned to Rio and asked for repatriation. By April 1874, 500 immigrants had been dispatched to England while 700 remained, depending on local charity. Marshall illustrates this with diaries and letters, official reports, and articles published in *The Anglo-BrazilianTimes* and other local newspapers.

Marshall concludes that 'many of the Irish and English immigrants were clearly completely unsuited to the rigours of pioneer settlement' (p. 205) and the few skilled workers, engineers, managers and businessmen were 'fully expecting to return "home" in due course rather than having any intention of laying down permanent roots in an adoptive country' (p. 206). The epilogue brings the reader to the twentieth-century life of the former colonies, Príncipe Dom Pedro, Assunguy and Cananéia. The presence of very few descendants of Irish and English immigrants in these places corroborates the stories that the majority of their predecessors had abandoned the colonies to return to their places of origin, or to re-emigrate to Argentina and the United States. The appendices contain letters and charts with important data that not only support the book's arguments, but also open new ways for future investigations.

The emphasis on the processes by which British and Brazilian settlement schemes operated and on the life of the pioneer settlers in the under-funded colonies allows the author to avoid static analysis of these ethno-national communities. Marshall also provides a useful framework for further research on the British immigrants in the context of the tense Anglo-Brazilian political relations of the time. *English, Irish and Irish-American Pioneer Settlers in Nineteenth-Century Brazil* is an outstanding landmark among the few books that have helped to build up the cartography of English-speaking communities in Brazil.

*University of São Paulo* LAURA P.Z. IZARRA

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06461939

Louise H. Guenther, *British Merchants in Nineteenth-Century Brazil: Business, Culture, and Identity in Bahia, 1808–1850* (Oxford: Centre for Brazilian Studies, 2004), pp. 211, £20.00; €30.00; $36.00, pb.

This book marks an important and creative contribution to several different strands in the literature of Brazilian studies, business history and the history of British communities abroad. The chief strength of Louise Guenther's study is her detailed focus on the social and cultural aspects of the British merchant community in Bahia, Brazil. Other areas of interest include the economic and political histories of this community as it rose and fell over time.

The book is divided in two basic parts. The first, shorter and less satisfying comprises the first two chapters, which treat of the business interests of the British merchants of Bahia in general and their relation to the slave trade in particular. There is much of interest in this first section of the book, but the treatment of the economy is at times thin, and the discussion of the slave trade covers well-trodden ground. With respect to the economic history of Bahia and the British merchant community, the book provides far too little context and the analysis is limited to a few pieces of data that are never quite integrated into an argument. Likewise, readers will not be surprised to learn that British subjects traded in and even owned slaves right up until 1850 and the final abolition of the trade.

Once Guenther moves into the territory of social and cultural history, her argument takes wing and the book becomes far more interesting and persuasive. To begin with, in Chapter 3, the reader is introduced to the critical importance of public display and private discipline in the 'construction' of the British merchant community. To say a community is a construct, however, is not to say that these fabrications lacked materiality or force in the real world. Guenther does a good job of evoking the complex layers of presentation and self-fashioning that, taken together, made up the enduring image of the English in Brazil. Not surprisingly, some of the characteristics of this constructed community tended to be valuable in a business sense. Honesty and commitment in business dealings, as projected by the words and deeds of British merchants, became a catchphrase in business dealings more generally: *palavra de ingles*, meaning word of honour.

Attuned to the interplay between the British and Brazilian communities, Guenther devotes significant attention to the way that these groups viewed one another and how these perceptions helped to create a mutual reality shot through with tensions and ambiguities. Examples of the book's strength in this regard are found in the fascinating tale of the widow Vital, told in Chapter 6, and the extended analysis of the writings of Robert Dundas, the community's doctor, found in Chapters 3–5. In the widow's tale, the problem of gender relations in a cross-cultural milieu is illuminated when Vital dies and her British companion (who was not her spouse) enters into conflict with her nephew and sole Brazilian heir. The companion, Mr. Hooper, soon succumbs to an apparent arsenic poisoning. A court fight ensues, and Guenther makes deft use of the conflict to underscore the multiple tensions between the British and their Brazilian hosts: Brazilian inheritance institutions were much more favourable toward women; hybrid 'families' led to confusion regarding whether a person was 'British' or 'Brazilian'. In sections like this, the cumulative effect of Guenther's careful reading of travellers' accounts, consular correspondence, court records and other primary materials pays off in a rich social and cultural history. Similarly, Guenther's close reading of Robert

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Dundas's book, *Sketches of Brazil*, contributes to our understanding of the self-perception of the British community in Bahia, particularly as it was constructed in relation to perceptions of the Brazilian host society and the physical environment of Bahia.

In sum, Guenther breaks new ground in the social and cultural analysis of the British merchant community in Bahia. Although the economic dimension will have to await further studies, this book should appeal to historians of Brazil, the British abroad during the age of empire and business history.

*Stanford University* ZEPHYR FRANK

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06471935

Marjorie Agosín (ed.), *Memory, Oblivion and Jewish Culture in Latin America* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 2005), pp. xxii + 248, $19.95, pb.

The poet and memoirist, Marjorie Agosín, has assembled historians, political scientists, sociologists, literary critics and non-academics to examine Latin American Jewish culture from their respective angles of vision. The resulting fifteen essays include valuable contributions to Latin American Jewish studies.

The editor introduces the collection with a romanticised vision of contemporary Jewish life in Latin America as a continuation of fifteenth-century Jewish Spain, known as Sepharad. In point of historical fact, there was no continuity, and none of the authors represented here suggest that there was. To write that 'the Jews of Sepharad became the Jews of Latin America' (p. xiii) is to distort history. This notion, reproduced on the book jacket, casts over the entire collection a cloud of inauthenticity that is unwarranted. The scholars who contributed essays to this collection are presenting information unearthed by their research, unaware perhaps that their work is being advertised as a medieval romance. It would have helped establish their credentials had their names been accompanied by biographical data which, unaccountably, is absent from the book.

The mystical thread in the Sephardic tradition has always provoked nostalgia for a lost golden age of Spanish Jewry, and this is the subject of the essay by Angelina Muñiz Huberman. Her book, *La lengua florida*, introduced Sephardic mysticism into Mexican literature, but her respect for history prohibits her from identifying this tradition with contemporary Latin American Jewry.

The collection then skips several hundred years, reflecting the fact that there were no Jews in Latin America because they were prohibited from settling in the Spanish and Portuguese overseas dominions. Church and state exerted continuous vigilance to keep their colonies as free of the Jewish 'heresy' as Iberia itself became after the expulsion of the Jews in 1492. This policy remained in force for three hundred years. The first auto-da-fe in New Spain, in which persons accused of Judaising were burned at the stake, was consummated in 1528; the last, in 1826.

The few 'Jewish' adventurers who managed to reach the New World were not Jews but *conversos* (New Christians). They arrived not 'with hopes and songs in their hearts', as Agosín writes in the dedication, but in mortal fear of discovery, which could lead to imprisonment, dispossession or execution. Repression forced any vestiges of Judaism underground, from which they occasionally re-emerge in Catholic families who over the generations have harboured traditions that appear to derive from remote *converso* ancestors. Occasionally featured in the popular press,

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

this evidence of the survival of Jewish traditions under the most dire circumstances has captured the public imagination (although it is not a subject taken up in this book). Unfortunately, the Jews themselves did not survive. Suppressed religiously and bodily, Sephardim who settled illegally under Spanish/Portuguese rule were not the progenitors of today's Jews of Latin America, and contemporary Latin American Jews are not their descendants.

Jews, mainly Ashkenazim, started arriving in the southern Americas from central and eastern Europe in the final decades of the nineteenth century, following the abolition of the Inquisition. Two essays are paradigmatic of the chaotic migratory process. One writer fleeing Nazi persecution arrives in Chile after years in Shanghai; another lands in Panama following a dangerous wartime crossing of the Atlantic, during which he is born. Sandra McGee Deutsch, a distinguished historian of right-wing political movements in Argentina and Chile, reveals that as a child of holocaust survivors, she developed her interest in Latin American Jewish history following an encounter with an Argentine *nacionalista* who denied that the holocaust had taken place.

Graeme S. Mount summarises his own book, *Chile and the Nazis*, tracing the post-war careers of high ranking officials of the Third Reich who resumed their public service at the highest levels of the Chilean government, in some cases following a successful career in Argentina. Two essays on the Jewish community of Mexico follow. One is an anecdotal account of the formation of the first English-speaking congregation in that country. In the other essay, sociologist Adina Cimet brings to bear on the organised Ashkenazic community of Mexico City her heavy-duty critical artillery, much of it developed in her book, *Ashkenazi Jews in Mexico: Ideologies in the Structuring of a Community*.

In a section entitled 'Literature of Transformation', Naomi Lindstrom, associate editor of *Latin American Research Review*, critiques the work of Mexican author Margo Glantz. Argentine literature is represented by a fictionalised journal of a young girl's life in Basavilbaso, the iconic Jewish agricultural colony.

The impunity accorded by successive Argentine administrations to the perpetrators of the bombing of the AMIA, central institution of Jewish life in that country, destroyed the sense of belonging that Jews had struggled to achieve over the century of their life in Argentina. Stephen A. Sadow of Northeastern University presents several 'lamentations for AMIA'. Harking back to the 1940s–1950s, Israeli political scientist Raanan Rein, author of *Argentina, Israel, and the Jews: Perón, the Eichmann Capture and After*, analyses efforts by Argentine Jews to shield their culture from encroachment by the Catholic Church.

On the culture front, Darrell Lockhart, editor of the valuable *Jewish Writers of Latin America: A Dictionary*, investigates the extent to which Jewishness enters into the general national consciousness. David William Foster, authority on Hispano-American literature, conducts an innovative interrogation of Latin American Jewish culture as seen through the lens of a professional photographer. Anthropologist Ruth Behar rehearses scenes from the family drama that resulted from her conflictive Turkish/Polish heritage, played out on a Cuban/American stage.

Despite the claim to be unique, the book is actually one of a shelf-ful of collections of current research on the heteronomous Latin American Jewish experience. These include *The Jewish Presence in Latin America* edited by Judith Laikin Elkin and Gilbert W. Merkx; *The Jewish Diaspora in Latin America* edited by David Sheinin and Lois Baer Barr; *Ensayos sobre Judaísmo Latinoamericano* edited by Bernardo

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Blejmar y Ana E. Weinstein; *Europaische Jüden in Lateinamerika* edited by Achim Schrader and Karl Rengstorf; three volumes of *Judaica Latinoamericana* published by AMILAT; and the most recent contribution to the genre, *The Jewish Diaspora in Latin America and the Caribbean: Fragments of Memory* edited by Kristin Ruggiero. The present book can take a respected place among them.

*The University of Michigan* JUDITH LAIKIN ELKIN

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* **38** (2006). doi:10.1017/S0022216X06481931

Donald J. Cosentino, *Divine Revolution: The Art of Edouard Duval-Carrié* (Los Angeles, CA: UCLA Fowler Museum of Cultural History, 2005), pp. 68, $20.00; £15.50, pb.

The historical underpinnings of Edouard Duval-Carrié's art have led to its association with two of the more prominent commemorations to mark the late twentieth and early twentieth-first centuries. Several of his early canvases (at least one of which is reworked in this volume) were included in the 1989 Paris exhibition at the Musée des Arts Africains et Océaniens, 'La Révolution française sous les Tropiques', part of the official French attempts to 'tropicalise' a revolutionary bicentennial targeted by its critics as excessively Francocentric. By the time Duval-Carrié, now resident in Miami, was commissioned fifteen years later to mark the 2004 bicentenary of independence in his native Haiti, he had established an international reputation as one of the leading artists of the contemporary Haitian diaspora. Invited to install his work in the Quartier Général in Port-au-Prince, Duval-Carrié planned to decorate the outside of the building with posters of his *Milocan* series (depicting the transhistorical, transcultural journeys of the *lwa*), and to fill its interior with quilted portraits of Haitian leaders and other images of revolutionary Saint-Domingue. This contribution to the aborted celebrations on 1 January 2004 was noted, however, for unintended reasons when (in the terms of Mary Nooter Roberts in her introduction to this volume) those events 'turned out to be more violence than festivity' (p. 9). Images of an anti-Aristide mob burning items of Haitian cultural heritage, including reproductions of Duval-Carrié's government-commissioned works, appeared in the *New York Times* of 3 March 2004, suggesting the ways in which art continued to play an active role in the everyday upheavals of Haitian society.

A subsequent exhibition of Duval-Carriés paintings (and a series of banners or *drapo* produced from them) at the UCLA Fowler Museum of Cultural History aimed to recreate, in part at least, what had been destroyed in Port-au-Prince. Donald Cosentino's *Divine Revolution*, published to coincide with this show, offers a succinct and beautifully illustrated introduction to the artist's recent work. Following the magnificent 1995 exhibition of Vodou art (also curated by Cosentino: see *Sacred Arts of Haitian Vodou* [Los Angeles, 1995]), this new event has consolidated the Fowler's commitment to dispelling the widespread ignorance that surrounds Haitian cultural production. It presents Duval-Carrié's art as double-edged, chronicling Haitian history (arguably in the tradition of the artists of the *école du Cap*), whilst at the same time addressing the 'marvellous' connections of this history to the country's present plight. Parallels are sketched out between, for instance, Jean Domingue (the assassinated director of Radio Haiti, portrayed in Jonathan Demme's 2004 film *The Agronomist*, and pictured here in one of the artist's most recent works, *L'exécution*

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

*sommaire de Jean Domingue*) and the revolutionary leader, Toussaint Louverture; or (in an earlier carnivalesque painting, *Mardigras au Fort Dimanche* [1992/3]), the Duvalier régime and the society of colonial Saint-Domingue. In *La Voix des sans voix* (1994), the ancestors look down on Aristide, deposed for the first time, recognising the injustice enacted before them and refusing indifference to it. Underpinning these connections between then and now is often the presence of Vodou (the subversive potential of which, in Duval-Carrié's work, has been explored in a recent article by Hermann Middelanis: see '"Worldpainting", art-vadou, et/ou néo-baroque', *Thamyris/Intersecting*, 8 [2001], 257–71). It is in the light of this engagement with popular religion that (in Cosentino's own terms) the punctual becomes durable, history is transformed into myth (p. 13). The result is an over-determination and a visual excess of signs and symbols, a blending, as disturbing as it is celebratory, of carnival and religion, in which the everyday is juxtaposed – or often, more accurately, merged – with the supernatural.

The catalogue has three principal sections, complemented by Cosentino's excellent introductory essay. The first consists of Vodou *drapo* woven from images in the canvases produced for the 1989 Paris exhibition, with this change of format permitting not only a re-connection of Duval-Carrié's work with the traditions of Haitian folk art, but also a reframing of the earlier historical works whose religious symbolism is now more clearly privileged. The second section presents a series of large-scale paintings, including the 'Série migration', making explicit the Vodou presence in Haiti often only implicit in these earlier images, tracking the spirits' wandering from Africa to Haiti to North America, and suggesting, as the foreword makes clear, that 'Haiti's promise as a nation resides in the resilience and adaptability of its cultural and spiritual traditions' (p. 7). The third presents four recent paintings (including the new portrait of Toussaint Louverture, and the representation of Jean Domingue's assassination, artist's two heroes of the bicentennial), all of which reveal the persistence of the *lwa* in contemporary Haiti, as well as their continued re-rooting in a diaporic context. The new Toussaint image, 'Pretty in Pink' (painted in 2003, the bicentenary of its subject's death), contrasts markedly with the 1989 historical painting (as well as the artist's mural at the Toussaint Louverture Elementary School in Miami). In the 1989 work, the meaning of the snake which its subject crushes underfoot remains ambiguous, possibly representing Napoleon, possibly the *lwa* Danbala, the Patriarch; in the more recent refiguring, the profile of the French general wreathed in smoke becomes more powerfully and obviously ambivalent, projecting Toussaint simultaneously as an elegant agent of a European revolution and as a double of Ogou, the divinity of war. Thus, despite the positivist, 'enlightened' overtones of much traditional historiography of the Haitian revolution, Duval-Carrié continues to suggest an alternative story – that of the *lwa* rising up in Enlightenment garb in order to transform colonial Saint-Domingue into independent Haiti. The Toussaint portrait is a marked illustration of the multiple levels, cultural, spatial and historical, on which his mature art operates.

Given the low levels of literacy in Haiti and the very high proportion of Krèyol speakers among the country's population, it seems paradoxical that much research into the representation of the Haitian revolution and its key actors has focused on Francophone and Anglophone texts. As Edouard Duval-Carrié makes clear in a quotation that appears in this volume: '[The Haitians] have a knack to convert so much into one image … Every work of art from Haiti is either a chronicle of history or a very strong statement about aspirations or frustrated aspirations' (pp. 13–14).

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press

The role of visual culture in Haitian society, politics and religion remains a prominent one, and *Divine Revolution* provides a succinct yet rich introduction to one of its most prominent practitioners. As this volume illustrates, Duval-Carrié's work – forcefully countering Euro-American stereotypes of 'Haitian-ness' (AIDS, 'voodoo', 'Grand Theft Auto' … ) – repeatedly performs those very processes of pictorial conversion that he himself celebrates.

*University of Liverpool* CHARLES FORSDICK

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022216X06281938 Published online by Cambridge University Press