

History of Education Quarterly



Fall 1999

Volume 39, Number 3

History of Education Society

The History of Education Society is an international scholarly society. Its purposes are to encourage and facilitate research in the history of education; to promote and improve the teaching of history of education; to encourage cooperation among specialists in history of education; and to promote an appreciation of the value of historical perspective in the making of educational policy. The Society is affiliated with the International Standing Conference for the History of Education, and members of the Society are automatically members of the Standing Conference.

Officers (1999)

President

BARBARA FINKELSTEIN, *University of Maryland*

Vice-President

WILLIAM J. REESE, *University of Wisconsin, Madison*

Secretary-Treasurer

C.H. EDSON, *University of Oregon, 1996-1999*

Directors

JOHN L. RURY, *Past President, 1997, DePaul*

University

BARRY FRANKLIN, *University of Michigan, Flint, 1997-99*

ROBERTA WOLLONS, *Indiana University Northwest, 1998-00*

KATE ROUSMANIERE, *Miami University (Ohio), 1999-01*

THE HISTORY OF EDUCATION SOCIETY AWARD: This award of \$500 will be made biennially to the best essay in the history of education published in any journal over the previous two years. The next award will be presented at the fall 2000 meeting of the History of Education Society. Any article published in 1998 or 1999 will be eligible for the award.

THE HENRY BARNARD PRIZE: This prize of \$500 is awarded biennially to the best essay in the history of education by a graduate student. The next award will be presented at the fall 1999 meeting of the History of Education Society. The recipient will have the essay published in the *History of Education Quarterly*.

The Society reserves the right not to make awards in those years when the Prize Committee judges all entries to be of insufficient quality.

Inquiries regarding these two awards should be directed to the chairperson of the Prize Committee: Professor Jonathan Zimmerman, Dept. of Culture & Communication, New York University, 239 Greene St., 7th Floor, New York, NY 10003.

OUTSTANDING BOOK AWARD: This award of \$500 is made biennially to the author of the best book on the history of education published in the two previous years. The committee will accept nominations but will also make every effort to review all relevant works, whether or not they have been nominated. The award for books bearing 1997 and 1998 publication dates will be announced at the annual meeting of the Society in 1999.

Inquiries regarding the Outstanding Book Award should be directed to the chairperson: Professor Anne Boylan, Department of History, University of Delaware, Newark, DE 19716.

COVER PHOTO: Courtesy of Tedd Levy, Norwalk, Connecticut.

History of Education Quarterly

Editorial Staff

Editor
Associate Editors

RICHARD J. ALTENBAUGH, *Slippery Rock University*
BARBARA BEATTY, *Wellesley College*
LINDA EISENMANN, *University of Massachusetts, Boston*

Managing Editor
Editorial Assistant
Editorial Assistant

ROBERT A. LEVIN, *Youngstown State University*
BRUCE C. NELSON
PHYLLIS KENDZIORSKI
STEVEN SARNESE

Editorial Board

KATHLEEN ALAIMO, *Saint Xavier University*
CLINTON B. ALLISON, *University of Tennessee, Knoxville*
SCOTT BAKER, *Wake Forest University*
NANCY BEADIE, *University of Washington*
KATE CRUIKSHANK, *Indiana University*
WILLIAM CUTLER, III, *Temple University*
DAVID D. DIXON, *Slippery Rock University*
THOMAS FLEMING, *University of Victoria*
MICHAEL FULTZ, *University of Wisconsin, Madison*
PHILIP GARDNER, *Cambridge University*
JAMES LELOUDIS, *University of North Carolina*
TOM O'DONOGHUE, *University of Western Australia*
PATRICIA PALMIERI, *University of Michigan*
DANIEL PERLSTEIN, *University of California, Berkeley*
KATE ROUSMANIERE, *Miami University (Ohio)*
ROBERT R. SHERMAN, *University of Florida*
HARRY SMALLER, *York University*
VANESSA SIDDLE WALKER, *Emory University*
ROBERTA WOLLONS, *Indiana University Northwest*

The *History of Education Quarterly* (ISSN 00 182680) is published Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the History of Education Society in conjunction with the College of Education, Slippery Rock University, Slippery Rock, PA 16057-1326. Membership in the Society, which includes subscription to the Quarterly, is available at the following rates: students, \$15; others, \$30 (non-U.S. members add \$7 to cover additional postage, surface mail; \$20 for overseas airmail). Institutional subscription rates are: \$57, U.S.; \$61, non-U.S. All payment must be made in U.S. dollars. Single copies of some back issues are available at \$10 plus postage. Periodicals postage paid at Slippery Rock, PA and other offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *History of Education Quarterly*, College of Education, Slippery Rock University, Slippery Rock, PA 16057-1326.

The Quarterly can be contacted:

by mail at	220 McKay Education Building Slippery Rock University Slippery Rock, PA 16057-1326
by phone at	724-738-4557 (Office) 724-738-4556 (Managing Editor)
by FAX	724-738-4548
by e-mail	heq@sru.edu
and on the World Wide Web at http://www.sru.edu/depts/bes/bes.htm	

History of Education Quarterly Vol. 39. No. 3 Fall 1999

Copyright 1999 by the History of Education Society

History of Education Society

INDIVIDUAL MEMBERSHIP: Membership is open to all persons interested in the study of the history of education. Membership provides for subscription to the *History of Education Quarterly*; subscription to *Network*, a newsletter published jointly with Division F of the American Educational Research Association; and receipt of the program of the annual meeting of the Society. Members of the Society are automatically members of the International Standing Conference for the History of Education. Membership offers subscription to publications on a calendar-year basis only. Dues are \$15 for students, \$30 for others. Non-U.S. members should add \$7 to cover additional postage for surface mail; \$20 for airmail. The portions of dues designated for support of the *Quarterly* are \$15 of student dues, \$22 of other individual dues. To become a member, send a check for the appropriate amount in U.S. dollars only to the *History of Education Quarterly*, College of Education, Slippery Rock University, Slippery Rock, PA 16057-1326. Make checks payable to History of Education Society. Indicate preferred mailing address and the calendar year in which your subscription should begin.

History of Education Quarterly

INSTITUTIONAL SUBSCRIPTIONS: Institutions may subscribe to the *History of Education Quarterly* directly (send checks to *History of Education Quarterly*, College of Education, Slippery Rock University, Slippery Rock, PA 16057-1326) or through subscription agencies. Rates are \$57, U.S.; \$61, non-U.S., U.S. dollars only.

BACK ISSUES: Some back issues are available (cost \$10 per issue plus postage).

INDEXES: Three indexes are available: Index to Vols. I–X (1961–1970), by Murray S. Shereshevsky (\$5); Index to Vols. XI–XX (1971–1980), by Paul Mattingly and Marilyn Tobias (\$7); and Index to Vols. XXI–XXX (1981–1990), by Gary L. Bailey (\$14 to HES members and \$20 to others).

ARTICLE SUBMISSIONS: Contributions should be addressed to: Editor, *History of Education Quarterly*, College of Education, Slippery Rock University, Slippery Rock, PA 16057-1326. See last page of this issue for guidelines on submission. The editor will only consider articles that have been submitted exclusively to the *History of Education Quarterly*.

BOOK REVIEWS: Assignments of reviews are made from a file of potential reviewers. To have your name added to the file, send curriculum vitae to the editor. Requests to review particular books cannot be honored.

The History of Education Quarterly is printed by Indiana University Printing Services.

The History of Education Quarterly is located at, but independent of, Slippery Rock University.

History of Education Quarterly

Volume 39 • Number 3 • Fall 1999

Contents

Articles

- 237 “The Most Powerful Instrument of College Discipline: Student Disorder and the Growth of Meritocracy in the Colleges of the Early Republic”
Rodney Hessinger
- 263 Solving ‘The Retardation Problem’ in Primary Education: The Case of South Australia
Lynne Trethewey

Conversation

- 291 Historiographic Issues in American Higher Education: Introduction
- 295 Reclaiming Religion: New Historiographic Challenges in the Relationship of Religion and American Higher Education
Linda Eisenmann
- 307 Reconsidering the Community College
Philo A. Hutcheson
- 321 Poor Historiography: The “Poorest” in American Higher Education
Jana Nidiffer

Essay Review

- 337 Xena, Warrior Princess, or Judith, Sexual Warrior? The Search for a Liberating Image of Women’s Power in Popular Culture
Kim Tolley

- Book Reviews**
- 343 Parr, *A Will of Her Own*
By Mary Hoffschwelle
- 344 Beineke, *And There Were Giants in the Land*
By Robert R. Sherman
- 347 Jumonville, *Henry Steele Commager*
By Julie A. Reuben
- 349 Reynolds, *Visions and Vanities*
By Robert E.A.P. Ritholtz
- 350 Warren, *Joseph Leidy: The Last Man Who Knew Everything*
By Christopher Ritter
- 352 Howe, *Luther Whiting Mason*
By William R. Lee
- 354 McGregor, *From Midwives to Medicine*
By Kate M. Dierenfield
- 356 Halttunen and Perry, (eds.) *Moral Problems in American Life*
By B. Edward McClellan
- 358 Rothblatt, *The Modern University and its Discontents*
By Malcolm B. Campbell
- 360 Reuben, *Making the Modern University*
By Mary O. Furner
- 363 Pedersen, *The First Universities*
By David R. Jones
- 365 Jewell, *Education in Early Modern England*
By Diane McDonnell Casey
- 366 Wilson, *In Just Order Move*
By Ursula Payne
- 368 Stearns, *Schools and Students in Industrial Society*
By Roberta Wollons
- 370 Rein, *Politics and Education in Argentina, 1946-1962*
By Michael LaRosa
- 372 Bickley, *The Golden Needle*
By Thomas Clayton
- 374 Smith, *The Gender of History*
By Katherine A. Lynch
- 377 ***Program for the HES Annual Meeting, Atlanta***
- 390 ***Letters to the Editor***
- 392 ***Advertisement***
- 393 ***Did you ever publish in the Quarterly?***
- 394 ***Membership Form***
- 395 ***Guidelines for Submission***