

REMAPPING SPANISH IMPERIALISM,
COLONIALISM, AND POST-COLONIALISM:
THE CASE OF CUZCO, PERU*

Colonial habits: convents and the spiritual economy of Cuzco, Peru. By Kathryn Burns. Durham: Duke University Press, 1999. Pp. xi + 307. ISBN 0-8223-2291-9.

Inka bodies and the body of Christ: Corpus Christi in colonial Cuzco, Peru. By Carolyn Dean. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1999. Pp. xiv + 264. ISBN 0-8223-2367-2.

The world of Túpac Amaru: conflict, community, and identity in colonial Peru. By Ward Stavig. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1999. Pp. xxxiv + 348. ISBN 0-8032-9255-4.

Smouldering ashes: Cuzco and the creation of Republican Peru, 1780–1840. By Charles F. Walker. Durham and London, Duke University Press, 1999. Pp. xiii + 330. ISBN 0-8223-2293-5.

In the past couple of decades historians, influenced by subaltern and post-colonial studies, have increasingly turned their attention to rethinking the workings of imperialism and colonialism. Imperialism, as it turns out, is a rather messy affair 'taking haphazard shape from myriad encounters with alternative forms of authority, knowledge and power'.¹ Questions focus on culture, identity, and the construction of specific cultural, racial, and social categories and how these categories were appropriated and reworked by colonized subjects. Considerable emphasis is placed on re-examination of forms of colonialism from gendered and racialized perspectives. Central to such a re-questioning has been an emphasis on agency – a term that is currently undergoing conceptual surgery as historians and post-colonial critics try to rescue it from a terminal case of formulaic resistance. Recently critics have urged consideration of a 'more diverse politics of agency, involving the dense web of relations between coercion, negotiation, complicity, refusal, dissembling, mimicry, compromise, affiliation, and revolt'.²

Representative of this trend are the four studies under review that, combined, provide a provocative overview of the making and unmaking of Spanish imperialism and colonialism from the regional perspective of Cuzco, the most important city in the southern Peruvian Andes. While the Spanish *conquistadores* chose to build the new capital of colonial Mexico literally on top of the former capital of the Aztec empire,

* The spelling of some Quechua terms is not standardized in the current literature. Some scholars use Hispanized Quechua; others insist on Quechua orthography. Here I have repeated individual authors' usage of Inca/Inka, curaca/kuraka, and Túpac/Túpaq.

¹ Anne McClintock, *Imperial leather: race, gender and sexuality in the colonial context* (New York, 1995), p. 15.

² Srinivas Aravamudan, *Tropicopolitans: colonialism and agency, 1688–1804* (Durham, NC, 1999), p. 15.

Tenochtitlan, the same did not happen in Peru; instead, they built a new colonial capital on the coast, Lima. Not only did this leave intact the physical and symbolic presence of the former Inca capital but it also generated a long-standing rivalry between Cuzco and Lima. The site of cultural and social struggles throughout three centuries of Spanish rule, Cuzco became a crucible for the single most important challenge to Spanish rule, the Túpac Amaru rebellion (1780–1), which left an estimated 100,000 people dead in its wake.

In *Colonial habits* Kathryn Burns focuses on three convents, Santa Clara (1558), Santa Catalina (1605), and Santa Teresa (1673). Their residents included not only nuns, but also large numbers of servants, children, and slaves, and their male proxies and visitors who provided links to the outside world. Heavily influenced by Certeau, Burns uses a broad interpretive concept, that of the ‘spiritual economy’. Burns defines this concept as ‘the inextricability of the material and the sacred, relying on a very old sense of ‘economy’ as the managing of a house (Greek *oikos*) and pointing to the spiritual goals orienting such activity’ (p. 3). Burns argues that nuns, far from being isolated from the world, were instrumental in the securing of Spanish hegemony in Peru and the subsequent production and reproduction of power and privilege in colonial society. The ability to shape local society derived from the nuns’ roles as essentially spiritual and economic brokers – purveyors of prayers, credit, and culture as the educators of young elite women. In line with recent revisionist scholarship on nuns and convents that views the history of convents as ‘a history of power and gender relationships’, Burns emphasizes the colonial convents’ integration into, rather than segregation from, the outside world.³ The additional twist to Burns’s account derives from its geographical focus – colonial Cuzco – that allows reflection on religious women’s roles in the consolidation of Spanish imperialism.

Burns develops her arguments around three paradoxes. The first focuses on the founding of the first convent, Santa Clara, during a period of extreme conflict in Cuzco in the 1550s. She explains the establishment of Santa Clara as a strategy whereby Cuzco’s leading Spaniards could ensure the correct upbringing of their mestiza (the offspring of Spanish and indigenous union) daughters as Catholic and culturally Spanish. This, in turn, ensured their own reproduction, as well as that of the Spanish city they aspired to create. Interestingly, mestizos, the male offspring of Spanish-indigenous unions, were viewed as occupying a potentially destabilizing role as male adults and as threats to, rather than building blocks of, Spanish culture and polity. Yet by the late 1560s the room for both mestizos and mestizas in the upper echelons of Cuzqueño society became increasingly restricted. The nuns’ habits reflected this shaping of racial distinctions inside convent walls. Although mestizas could become nuns in Santa Clara, they occupied a lesser rank, their inferior status signified by their white as opposed to black veils. For Burns the changing nature and place of mestizos in early colonial society underscores the unstable and provisional nature of racial categories: ‘the making of mestizos was a saliently gendered, historical process’ (p. 40). The construction of racial boundaries is developed further in Burns’s analysis of daily life in chapter 4. Santa Clara and Santa Catalina also received many daughters of the indigenous elite whose collaboration made possible Spain’s indirect rule over the Andes. Convent households created a strongly hierarchical order that placed *criollo* (Spaniards

³ Silvia Evangelisti, ‘Wives, widows, and brides of Christ: marriage and the convent in the historiography of early modern Italy’, *Historical Journal*, 43 (2000), p. 239.

born in America) and *peninsulare* (Spaniards born in Spain) nuns in charge of convents' affairs and relegated indigenous chiefs' daughters to the middle ranks of the convent hierarchy, marginalized from control over important convent business affairs.

The second paradox deals with the co-existence of nuns' vows of poverty alongside aggressive acquisition of property and capital. By the 1560s Santa Clara had acquired local assets that rivalled those of the region's *encomenderos* – how was this possible if nuns were supposed to be poor? Burns argues that religious poverty was a gendered activity and a way of life predicated on securing a substantial endowment that ensured a collective prosperity that did not contradict individual vows of poverty. She explores the cultural and economic networks that enabled all three convents to deploy their assets in the local economy in ways that facilitated the convents' prosperity as well as the spiritual health of their benefactors. The nuns' investments and role as major creditors involved them in the shaping of local society. Through their loans and financial negotiations with local elites, the nuns reinforced the colonial ruling class of their region, Spanish and Inca nobles and leaders, albeit a divided one.

The third paradox that Burns poses concerns Cuzco's rapid decline in the late eighteenth century and the immiseration and marginalization of the convents. Part of the explanation lies in the corrosive nature of layers of debt that underlay the seeming prosperity of many families. In the wake of social turmoil and economic and political crises in the region (particularly the massive Túpac Amaru rebellion) debtors could not repay their loans, making the convents vulnerable to financial crises. The end of colonial rule and creation of a republican state that undermined the convents' authority in local society, and appropriated the responsibility for education and charity, only exacerbated such a dire situation. Perceptions of the convents' role in local society changed as the propertied classes became increasingly convinced that the 'dead hand' of the church was responsible for agricultural stagnation.

Burns's discussion offers important new insights into the workings of Spanish colonialism and the gender politics at work in the creation and reproduction of colonial elites and racial hierarchies. Perhaps the least satisfying aspect of this study is the discussion of the 'spiritual' element of the concept of spiritual economy. Although the author states at the very beginning of her study that she found little evidence that would enable her to reconstruct the spiritual lives and devotional aspects of Cuzco's nuns, this remains a lacuna in an otherwise nuanced and perceptive account of convents in Cuzco. This may explain why at times her descriptions of the convent *locutorio* (visitors' parlour) conjure up Wall Street rather than walled cities within a city. The absence of such evidence presents a striking contrast to recent studies on religious women in colonial Mexico and Spanish America. Elisa Sampson Vera Tudela, for example, discusses what she terms a 'piety bordering on the holy, making convents the producers of saints. The importance of a native production of saints in the Spanish Americas as a way of confirming their spiritual conquest is self-evident, and the speed of Sta. Rosa of Lima's canonization is testament to the enthusiasm of the Church itself in this project'.⁴ Nor do we get much sense of nuns' roles as patrons and their links with local artistic and intellectual circles. Changing relations between the Catholic Church and an aggressive Bourbon state in the eighteenth century and their significance for the convents are dealt with in a cursory manner. The unfolding of the common life controversy receives little

⁴ Elisa Sampson Vera Tudela, *Colonial angels: Narratives of gender and spirituality in Mexico, 1580–1750* (Austin, 2000), p. 41.

attention, leaving the reader to wonder whether it caused significant angst in Cuzco's convents as it did in those of colonial Mexico, and if not, why not?⁵ Despite such quibbles this is a refreshing rethinking of the history of empire and conquest. Burns forces us to confront what Anne McClintock has recently described as the 'crucial but concealed relation between gender and imperialism' and the ambiguously complicit nature of white women 'both as colonizers and colonized, privileged and restricted, acted upon and acting'.⁶

One might reasonably assume that a book titled *Inka bodies and the body of Christ* would address itself to the tangled relationship between indigenous religion and Spanish Catholicism. What one gets, instead, is a suggestive study about the construction of post-conquest indigenous nobility and reflections on hybridity and mediativity within the context of the celebration of Corpus Christi in colonial Cuzco. Carolyn Dean's main task is to 'understand how Inkas and other Andeans performed the impossible; how they, as alienated subalterns, faced the triumphant Corpus Christi' (p. 3). Primarily concerned with the seventeenth century, an epilogue, 'The Inka triumphant', examines the 'curious offspring' of the colonial Corpus Christi, the modern *Inti Raymi* festival, introduced in 1944 to promote *indigenismo* and tourism.

In the first three chapters Dean examines how the Spanish Corpus Christi became meaningful as a colonial festival in the former capital of the Inka empire. The idea that Corpus Christi replaced an important Inka festival became crucial to its celebration of military triumph and Spanish domination over a non-Christian people. But, as Dean argues, in Cuzco Corpus Christi was not only the celebration of a single triumph – the triumph over paganism – it was also the assertion of multiple, sometimes contradictory, triumphs. The celebration became a space within which the community's leading individuals and corporate groups displayed their privileged status as the order of the Corpus Christi procession embodied the community's social and political hierarchy. Crucial to the participation of acculturated Inka nobles was the wearing of Andean costume and insignia, and the 'performing' of their royal ancestry. In sum, Andeans used the Corpus Christi procession to create, enhance, and maintain their own social spaces and identities.

The primary evidence for Dean's argument is a spectacular series of paintings that depict Corpus Christi in Cuzco in the mid-seventeenth century and which allude to the triumph of Christianity over Inka religion. In chapter 4 Dean analyses the context within which the Corpus Christi paintings emerged. Nurtured by the aspirations of the Spanish Bishop Manuel de Mollinedo y Angulo (1673–99) to make Corpus Christi celebrations in Cuzco the equal of those in Madrid, the paintings purport to document the festival's magnificence. Patrons included the Andean parishes headed by Inka *curacas* (leaders), an unidentified Hispanic nun, sodalities, and religious orders. Painted by at least two anonymous artists, probably indigenous, and produced over a number of years beginning in 1674–5, they were made to adorn the walls of the Santa Ana parish church. Originally eighteen in the series, only sixteen can be identified securely. Each depicts an aspect of the Corpus Christi celebration in Cuzco. Eight of the canvases depict the procession of images of saints attended by their devotees, including five of the Indian parishes with standard bearers dressed in the costume of their royal Inka

⁵ See Brian Larkin's discussion in 'The common life controversy in Puebla de Los Angeles, 1765–1781: gender, hegemony, and religious representation' (MA thesis, University of Texas at Austin, 1994).

⁶ McClintock, *Imperial leather*, p. 6.

ancestors. Also depicted are the religious orders (Franciscans, Dominicans, Augustinians, and Mercedarians), the secular clergy, as well as key political and ecclesiastic leaders of Cuzco. Chapter 8 focuses on a single canvas – the *Processional finale*. This canvas highlights the festive participation of ethnic Cañaris and Chachapoyas (two prominent Andean groups and rivals of the Inkas) and examines the anti-Inka sentiment it expresses and, by extension, the deep antagonisms that existed within the Andean community. Both Inka and non-Inka Andeans of Cuzco regarded Corpus Christi as the appropriate occasion on which to display their diverse ethnic identities, historical importance, status in the community, and, in the process, actively participate in shaping local culture.

Chapters 5, 6, and 7 develop the cultural and political significance of performance and the politics of identity. Dean examines how Inka nobles confronted the problem of how to express their royal but ethnic and non-Christian heritage in Western terms and non-threatening ways. She describes their attempts to consolidate their own positions and the strategies they employed designed to alienate their Andean rivals (male and female) from colonial discourses of power. Particular emphasis is placed on the modifications in ‘Sapa Inka’ costume and insignia, and the significance of Inka portraits, genealogies, and Inka adoption of European-style coats of arms. Dean suggests that Inka elites invented the festive role of Inka ruler at some point after the demise of Túpaq Amaru I (1572) and attempted to police its performance (including the wearing of insignia such as the *maskapaycha*, the royal fringe) as a way to shore up their declining authority. Yet the Inka nobility’s attempts at such policing was limited in the long term. Dean observes that by the late eighteenth century so customary was the place of the ‘Inka’ in Cuzqueño activities that Inka heritage became an almost generic Andean heritage. Sapa Inka costumes could be rented out to anyone regardless of ancestry who wished to assume the role on a festive occasion. Dean also cautions that such limitations do not mean that late colonial evocations of pre-Hispanic Inkas were worthless; indeed, the myths of the *Inkarri* inspired several insurrections against the Spanish colonial government. So much so, that after the repression of the Túpac Amaru rebellion Spanish authorities attempted to prohibit manifestations of Inka culture such as the wearing of Inka costume and display of Inka portraits, attempts that also met with limited success.

Dean argues that her findings challenge the traditional scholarship on Corpus Christi in Cuzco which has tended to characterize its Andean aspects as fossilized remnants of pre-Hispanic culture, ahistorical native resistance, or a utopian nostalgia for the return to power of the Inka. Based on her detailed analysis of the costumes that Inka elites created for Corpus Christi performances, Dean suggests that the bicultural signification of their costuming ‘allowed them to embody alterity not as nostalgic references to an irretrievable past, but as a means of constructing new selves’ (p. 3). Laying great stress on the mediativity of the Inka elites’ strategies, Dean argues that ‘They are Andean. They are Christian. They are Inka rulers. They are Spanish subjects. And they are all these things simultaneously’ (p. 159).

Despite the occasional lapse into tedious jargon, this is an intelligent, insightful, study that opens up a number of directions for future research. Dean’s brief discussion of the cultural influences of the Jesuits in the expression of ‘noble alterity’ merits further consideration as does the question of the attraction to *Incaismo* by non-Andeans, particularly *criollos*, and the cultural traffic in the symbolism of the Inca and Inca empire.⁷ Dean also provides tantalizing hints about patronage networks (especially

indigenous patronage, male and female) and of the politics behind the painters' guild. Andean indigenous artists broke away from the Spanish painters' guild in Cuzco to create their own at the end of the seventeenth century. Yet the history of this break and its politics is murky. Such a rupture did not occur, in colonial Mexico, for example. Why and what does this tell us about the particularities of Cuzco cultural production, and the relationships between art, race, and colonialism? Dean's discussion of Corpus Christi is a compelling argument for much closer scrutiny of not only conflicts over cultural authority but of the relationship between representations of colonial authority and rituals and colonial politics as well. In a recent review essay in this journal Kevin Sharpe makes a persuasive argument that 'historical engagement both with the images and representations of authority, and the role of subjects in constructing as well as consuming and experiencing those representations, is essential to our understanding of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries ... we know that the story of these representations and negotiations remains the unwritten history of politics'.⁸ Although he was referring to the English Renaissance state his argument is equally applicable to Spain and its empire.

Ward Stavig's study shifts focus away from the city of Cuzco to examine Andean indigenous communities in two provinces of colonial Cuzco, Quispicanchis and Canas y Canchis, during the eighteenth century. Both provinces were linked to local, regional, and international economies via the royal road that passed through them. This imperial artery connected them with Lima, Cuzco, and ultimately Spain in one direction, and with the Lake Titicaca basin, La Paz, and silver mining centres of Oruro and Potosí in the other. Both provinces would become the heartland of the Túpac Amaru insurrection of the early 1780s.

Stavig describes his study as a 'ground-up ethnohistory' that illustrates the historical agency of Andean men, women, and children. He poses the question of why Andean peoples accepted some burdens of Spanish colonialism, but challenged others, some through legal channels, others through violent protest. His analysis draws heavily on a qualified application of E. P. Thompson's 'moral economy' or 'the social dialectic of unequal mutuality'.

Following a helpful introductory chapter that traces the salient features of pre-Inca, Inca, and colonial history in the region, Stavig outlines the quotidian nature of indigenous community life. By looking at legal disputes that involve rape, incest, premarital sex, and divorce, he tries to reconstruct indigenous sexual values and marital life. He analyses criminal activities such as personal violence and robbery between indigenous peoples, as well as between Indians and non-Indians in the countryside and attitudes toward crime of both indigenous and colonial authorities. The significance of land to the Andean people's way of life, and inter- and intra-ethnic agrarian conflicts, are discussed as are intra-community conflicts that involved different *ayllus* and opposing moieties. Stavig examines labour relations in silver mines, textile workshops, and haciendas. Chapter 7 focuses on the noxious *mita* or forced labour system in which he explores strategies devised by communities to resist or ameliorate its impact. Loathed

⁷ On this issue see David Cahill, 'After the Fall: constructing Incan identity in late colonial Cuzco', in Luis Roninger and Mario Sznajder, eds., *Constructing collective identities and shaping public spheres: Latin American paths* (Brighton, 1998), pp. 65–99.

⁸ Kevin Sharpe, 'Representations and negotiations: texts, images, and authority in early modern England', *Historical Journal*, 42 (1999), p. 855.

by indigenous communities, the *mita* provoked continual protest and tension between Indians and the colonial state. Nevertheless, such resistance found its limits in communities' attempts to ensure minimum compliance with the *mita* based on their belief that this service formed part of a reciprocal agreement with the crown that guaranteed their right to land.

Stavig makes several key arguments. First, the values of indigenous peoples in rural Cuzco, rather than being radically different from Spanish values, were often surprisingly similar. This is particularly apparent in the author's analysis of gender relations and disciplinary attitudes toward crime. Such complementarity contributed to the maintenance of colonial rule. Second, Stavig emphasizes the importance of face-to-face relations, custom, and tradition in understanding social conflicts between Indians and local elites. Relationships between Andean rulers and their communities were as important as those between the indigenous population and the colonial state. Stavig also argues that the primary ethnic identity of many Andean peoples in the region focused on their *ayllus* and communities rather than on a larger regional, ethnic, or racial awareness. Third, Stavig emphasizes daily forms of passive resistance, including frequent use of Spanish courts, as the normal form of protest by indigenous communities against the impositions of Spanish colonialism. Dependence on the Spanish judicial system in turn reinforced ties between colonizers and colonized and 'may have enhanced colonial legitimacy' (p. xxvii).

Stavig presents a compelling portrayal of indigenous society, which is a useful addition to a burgeoning corpus of ethnohistories of the colonial Andes. His descriptions of its quotidian rhythms prior to the eruption of the Túpac Amaru rebellion provide a welcome counterbalance to a historiography dominated by the cultural torsions of the Spanish extirpation campaigns against indigenous religion in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries on the one hand, and the explosive movement of Túpac Amaru in the eighteenth century on the other. Whether Stavig is successful in his claim that his findings provide a fresh approach to Túpac Amaru is less apparent. Connections between local grievances and values and communities' responses to the 'Great Rebellion', for example, are rarely made and the author makes no explicit argument as to why his findings require us to revise our understanding of Túpac Amaru.

Charles F. Walker's study overlaps that of Stavig's with his discussion of Túpac Amaru but extends the political chronology by looking at imperial meltdown, Peru's independence war, and the early decades of the Peruvian Republic from the regional perspective of Cuzco. He provides a suggestive comparison between two key individuals in Peru's political history: Túpac Amaru and the Cuzco caudillo and president of Peru, Agustín Gamarra. He is less interested in winners and losers than he is in how politics was to be practised in a particular period and in the unfettering of indigenous agency within the broader political processes.

Chapters 2–4 provide a first-rate analysis of indigenous insurrection, its social and political consequences, and Peru's War of Independence. In a penetrating analysis of the Túpac Amaru rebellion, Walker makes the case for the movement's protonational platform anchored in the Andes and the Indian population. Yet the movement was defeated not only because of Spanish superiority in firearms and Túpac Amaru's hesitation to attack Cuzco, but also because the majority of indigenous leaders who feared losing their privileged position in society supported the Spanish. Despite campaigns to repress expressions of Incaismo, the Spanish proved unable to prevent new uprisings in the decades following Túpac Amaru's rebellion and his execution;

their attempts to rein in Indian political autonomy and increase taxes also met with limited success. Although Cuzco-based movements led the initial struggles against Spanish rule, by 1815 social divisions combined with a military build-up in the region after the 1780s and the fragility of *criollo*–Indian alliances crippled movements based in the southern Andes. Thereafter the main theatre shifted to Lima. For Walker, this explains why Peruvian patriot forces in their ‘long War of Independence’ between 1808 and 1824 relied on external liberators such as San Martín from Argentina and Bolívar of Venezuela. Ultimately, the lack of an effective group that could mobilize rural society explains the breakdown of political insurgency in the southern Andes during the War of Independence.

In chapters 5–7 Walker reflects on *caudillismo* and post-independence state formation by looking at the rise and demise of the conservative Agustín Gamarra within the context of the Cuzco–Lima struggle for national supremacy. He examines the heterogeneous structure of Gamarra’s coalition in his native Cuzco (military officers, priests, local Indian authorities, and much of Cuzco’s common people supported him). Particular attention is paid to the development of an authoritarian ideology that stressed Cuzco’s claim to political and economic pre-eminence based on its former role as the centre of the Inca empire. Walker provides a riveting discussion of how caudillo politics worked on the ground and of changes in political culture in post-independence Cuzco. He explores the public sphere – the press, festivities, and military campaigns and intrigues – in order to emphasize the complex nature of caudillo coalitions and argues that debates and struggles over the state included surprisingly broad sections of urban society, including the illiterate.

One of the main questions that political leaders faced in post-colonial Peru was what was to be done with the Indian population. A penurious republican state quickly reinstated the Indian head tax, thus reviving colonial distinctions. Yet once again the republican state’s attempts to impose its political and fiscal will in the countryside fared no better than that of the colonial state, due mainly to its own precarious position and Cuzco’s declining economy, circumstances that provided indigenous communities some room to negotiate for improved conditions. In contrast to the colonial polity, however, where *kurakas* and priests served as cultural brokers and key intermediaries, no single group connected indigenous society with national political circles in the post-independence period. No military leader recruited a mass indigenous backing in the southern Andes in the first half century after independence, not even Gamarra who failed to recruit Indians for his military campaigns, as was painfully evident in the battle of Yanacocha (1836) in which he was killed.

Walker draws several conclusions regarding broader questions of subaltern agency, nationalism, and *caudillismo*. In line with recent revisionist histories of state formation in post-independence Latin America, he argues forcefully for the indigenous communities’ decisive role in constructing the new republic even though their political intentions were ultimately thwarted. Rather than political enervation, Walker emphasizes the indigenous peasantry’s political energy and choice. Their lack of political participation in caudillo military struggles cannot be explained by resorting to notions of provincialism or cowardice. Rather, one must consider the exercise of choice: ‘the Indians decided not to participate’ (p. 216). Walker contends that the concept of a Peruvian nation needs to be pluralized given a tangled, conflictive relationship between Andean-based and *criollo* nationalisms. Whereas the *criollo* elite’s version of republicanism enabled them to maintain their position of privilege, an indigenous anti-

colonialism imagined a more equitable society modelled on the Inca empire. Finally, Walker argues that caudillo politics constituted a unique type of state formation rather than aberrant political behaviour; caudillos created political coalitions and ran fully functioning, albeit unstable, states. The practice of *caudillismo* and its relationship to state formation in Peru and throughout Spanish America can be understood only through a careful examination of the desires and political efforts of the lower classes and of their relationships with regional and national political movements.

Walker provides a challenging rethinking of Peruvian independence and of the construction of the post-colonial Peruvian state, and certainly one of the most lucid accounts in English to date. While in general his claims for Túpac Amaru's protonationalism are persuasive, he may over-interpret his evidence. Although Walker emphasizes that the objectives and significance of Túpac Amaru's movement remain open to debate, he criticizes interpretations that emphasize the movement's reformist character on the grounds that they imply 'a level of intentionality that cannot be confirmed' (p. 39). Yet he seems to do exactly the same in his confident assertion that there is 'little doubt about [Túpac Amaru's] immediate objective: to demolish Bourbon colonialism' (p. 17). Both Stavig and Walker confirm conventional arguments that emphasize the importance of indigenous use of the Spanish legal system. Walker, however, is much more critical of the argument that such use of the courts and its discourses signified acceptance of colonial rule and its legitimacy, and inhibited other forms of political action such as rebellion. Indeed, as Sergio Serulnikov has recently argued 'indigenous peasants' reference to colonial legality and institutions did not inhibit, but instead unleashed and legitimated, mass violence. Peasant political consciousness grew out of the symbolic articulation of discursive battles in colonial courts and armed battles in the Andean villages'.⁹ Such divergent opinions clearly require a rethinking of how and why Spanish courts could produce both hegemonic and counter-hegemonic responses among their indigenous clients. Walker's emphasis on the importance of racial dynamics in the formation of the early Peruvian republic hints at the crucial differences in post-colonial elite responses and state policies toward indigenous majorities. He observes that in contrast to the intelligentsia in other areas of Spanish America, the Cuzco elite did not believe that the lower classes could be 'symbolically whitened through education, through the influence of the press and civilizing literature' (p. 164) but he does not elaborate why this was the case. Walker's stress on racial dynamics also highlights the need to pay attention to the gendered dynamics of the formation of post-colonial states in future studies.¹⁰ In sum, Walker's study provides compelling evidence for having to rethink 'the post-independence nation as a means of identification and mobilization, given its clear discriminatory history, its inability to mobilize men and women ... and ethnic and religious majorities and minorities on equal terms'.¹¹ Anyone interested in the formation of post-independence states and questions of nationalism will profit from reading this fine study.

All of these studies provide major contributions to our understanding of the often inchoate workings of empire and demonstrate how much further we have to go if we are

⁹ Sergio Serulnikov, 'Disputed images of colonialism: Spanish rule and Indian subversion in Northern Potosí, 1777–1780', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 76 (1996), p. 224.

¹⁰ For a gendered analysis of the transition from colony to republic see Sarah C. Chambers, *From subjects to citizens: honor, gender, and politics in Arequipa, Peru, 1780–1854* (Pennsylvania, 1999).

¹¹ Aamir Mufti and Ella Shohat, 'Introduction', in Anne McClintock, Aamir Mufti, and Ella Shohat, eds., *Dangerous liaisons: gender, nation, and postcolonial perspectives* (Minneapolis, 1997), p. 4.

to grasp the various forms of imperialism and colonialism and the myriad power relationships that lie beneath their successes and failures.

UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT AUSTIN

SUSAN DEANS-SMITH¹