

Social Gospels Thrived Outside the Church

HEATH W. CARTER

THREE vignettes underscore that, in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth-century United States, social gospels often fared best outside the walls of the institutional churches. They also reveal diverging interpretations of Christianity and the church that begin to explain the divergence between religious liberalism and social progressivism during this time.¹⁷

First, the initial battle between labor and capital in Chicago erupted in the spring of 1867, when numerous employers vowed to circumvent a newly passed statewide eight-hour law. The bosses' recalcitrance provoked first a general strike and then a series of mob actions, as workers vented their frustrations in the streets. Those who looked to the churches for support were sorely disappointed. While Chicago's ministers had kind words for labor in the abstract, they would not tolerate an organized workforce. One Baptist minister's sermon on "Labor and Christianity," delivered in the wake of the eight hour movement's collapse, perfectly illustrates this dynamic. A newspaper reported that the Reverend William Everts proclaimed, on the one hand, "if he had to choose between labor and capital, he dare not go against labor, for Christ himself would have gone with it"; and on the other, that "Trade Unions [were] productive of evil. From them had sprung murder, arson, and drunkenness, and all kinds of debauchery."¹⁸

The churches' double-speak did not sit well with many of the city's workers. The week after Everts's sermon a Scottish printer by the name of Andrew Cameron—who had been at the fore of the eight-hour campaign and was the founding editor of the *Workingman's Advocate*—responded directly and angrily that "in all reforms, in which labor and capital have been directly interested, the Church has thrown its influence in behalf of the money changers."¹⁹ Cameron's salvo reflected much wider working-class frustrations, not with Christianity itself but with churches compromised by wealth. As one woman put it in a letter to the *Tribune*, "At present the workingman is rather repelled than otherwise by the grand church, the grand people who are there, and the grand rent marked on the empty pew he finds his way into. Ministers would have a greater influence for good if they opened wide their doors, saying, 'Come one, come all.'"²⁰

A second vignette reveals that theological liberalism and social progressivism were hardly the same thing. The Reverend David Swing was a pioneering liberal preacher and thinker, who presided at Chicago's illustrious

Heath W. Carter is Assistant Professor of History at Valparaiso University.

Fourth Presbyterian Church until he was brought up on heresy charges in the mid-1870s. He prevailed in the ensuing trial but left the Presbyterian Church anyway when his opponents vowed to appeal the decision. Historian William Hutchinson argues in his now-classic work, *The Modernist Impulse in American Protestantism*, “Swing and his heresy trial were of signal importance in announcing and augmenting the presence of modernist ideas within the evangelical churches.”²¹

The Reverend David Swing was also, throughout his career, a ferocious opponent of organized labor. In the waning days of 1873 and amidst a major economic bust, thousands of struggling workingmen marched peacefully to Chicago’s City Hall, where they petitioned the authorities for work or bread. The demonstration did not elicit a compassionate response from Swing. On the contrary, he harrumphed, “The conflict between classes in the cities of our country is not a conflict between labor and capital, but between successful and unsuccessful lives.”²² Swing never wavered in such views. The final sermon of his life tackled the ethics of the 1894 Pullman Strike, which were not in his view especially complicated. He issued this withering rebuke of Eugene Debs and the American Railway Union: “The strike was indeed perfectly destitute of common sense, but the chief disgrace of the hour lay in the willingness of free men to obey a central despot and join in such acts of wrong and violence as would have disgraced savages.”²³ When Swing died shortly thereafter, the editor of the *Railway Times* could not restrain a bit of smugness, writing, “There is something striking in the fact that the man who had all his life devoted his best energies to the defense of the rich, who had used the pulpit as a fortress for the monopoly lords, closed his useless career with a bitter attack upon organized labor. From labor’s vantage, he went on, “The best that can honestly be said of [Swing] is that he was consistent to the last, and for this he may be admired to the same degree as the unwavering course of Mr. Pullman.”²⁴

Third and finally, the early twentieth century is often regarded as the heyday of Social Christianity. These were the years when denomination after denomination issued official statements declaring the gospel’s relevance to social problems. The Methodist Church, which adopted its Social Creed in 1908, was at the vanguard of this burgeoning movement; and yet, throughout the first three decades of the twentieth century, Methodism’s national publishing house was locked in a fierce battle with union printers. In the eyes of countless workers, this fight underscored the hypocrisy of the denomination’s social teaching. An editorial in one labor journal insisted, “Sermon after sermon may be preached and speech after speech may be made to the effect that the church is the true friend of labor; but so long as its attitude in practice is one of hostility to labor, it stands condemned as a

whited sepulcher that ‘outwardly appears righteous unto men, but within is full of hypocrisy and iniquity.’”²⁵

Throughout the conflict the Reverend Harry Ward proved a staunch pro-labor advocate within institutional church circles, campaigning vigorously to see that the Methodist Book Concern accommodated the printers’ demand for a closed shop. But he was continually rebuffed. In 1916, Ward tried a new strategy, writing the leaders of major national labor unions in order to solicit their “observations concerning the effect of our Book Concern controversy with the Allied Printing Trades on the attitude of organized labor toward the church in general, and our church in particular.” As he admitted, “Some of our laymen will not be impressed with this thing until we give them some evidence that it has meant a loss to the church.”²⁶ Ward received many such testimonies, but the lay leaders of his denomination—many of whom enjoyed strong ties to the business community—remained insufficiently impressed. They resoundingly voted down a resolution at that year’s General Conference that called for the publishing house merely to show a preference for union printers. In the wake of the vote James Kline, the president of the national Blacksmiths Union and a Methodist layman himself, confided to Ward: “I want to say in the first place that I am pretty well discouraged. The General Conference was an eye-opener to me.”²⁷ In his response, Ward urged Kline not to give in to despair, saying, “You must not forget that the other crowd has been in control a long time, and we have been at this job only a little while.”²⁸ Patience would, indeed, be required: the dispute between the printers and the Book Concern was not resolved until 1932, when the latter finally agreed to unionize its operations. Briefly, what do these stories illumine about the much larger story of Social Christianity?

First of all, they underscore that this heterogeneous movement defies easy theological categorization. Social Christianity was never just an outgrowth of liberal protestantism. In fact, countless liberals like the Reverend Swing embraced innovative readings of the Bible even while preaching an unmistakably *laissez faire* gospel. Meanwhile, some theological conservatives, including the likes of the blacksmith James Kline, were forceful advocates for a more socially engaged church. Kline was known to send updates via telegram about the status of particular strikes he was overseeing to the beloved members of his Wesleyan Bible class meeting back in Chicago. The inclusion of Catholic actors, who don’t appear in these particular anecdotes but do in my book, only further confounds any attempt to link social Christianity to a particular theological orientation.

Second, these stories suggest that Social Christianity arose on the margins of the institutional church. It flourished first and most often at the grassroots. While the earliest histories of the movement emphasized the primary roles

played by white male ministers and theologians, more recent scholarship has uncovered the vital contributions of middle-class women and African Americans.²⁹ My work expands this cast of characters to include working women and men, and reinforces an emerging scholarly consensus that social gospels emerged out of the experiences of ordinary believers long before *the* social gospel—the one that gets mentioned in the textbooks—took root in middle-class church contexts. In Chicago, the latter was unquestionably a calculated accommodation of working-class religious activism. By the turn of the century workers' sharp criticisms were heightening the fears of church leaders—both protestant and Catholic—that they were losing their foothold amongst the people. This anxiety created an opening for more progressive voices, as the Reverend Ward clearly recognized.

Nevertheless, these stories suggest, third and finally, that at least when it comes to the institutional churches, there was no heyday of social Christianity. Social gospelers were always in the minority and, to varying degrees, embattled. This was in no small part due to the perennially strong cultural and economic ties between the American churches and corporate America—ties that did not materialize *ex nihilo* in the mid-twentieth century, with the advent of Christian-inflected businesses such as Wal-Mart; ties that are, in fact, as old as the corporation itself.³⁰ When a chorus of ordinary voices became loud enough in calling for a more progressive church, ecclesiastical leaders—eager to remain culturally relevant—sought to accommodate; but even then, their responses reflected an overriding desire to keep their elite patrons and benefactors happy. The middle-class social gospel was, in this and nearly every sense, a real but distinctly moderate accommodation of working-class religious dissent.

The Social Gospel as a Grassroots Movement

WENDY J. DEICHMANN

THE social gospel movement in the United States began as a faith-based, grassroots movement of laity and clergy in the aftermath of the Civil War. During this era, American society faced extreme levels of social instability resulting not only from wartime trauma and loss, but also relocation of massive numbers of those emancipated from slavery, a rapidly accelerated pace of both industrialization and urbanization and unprecedented waves of immigration.

In addition to the obvious, dire need for reconstruction, the post-bellum era was characterized by wage depression, high illiteracy and unemployment rates, extensive poverty, racial discrimination, poor sanitation, and plagues of human trafficking, lynching, liquor abuse and civic corruption. These and other social crises pressed hard upon large segments of the populace, compelling the attention of many American protestants who, along with a progressive view of history, had inherited from earlier evangelical and puritan visionaries a vision of a godly nation.

As defined by social gospel proponent Shailer Mathews, the social gospel was, simply, “the application of the teaching of Jesus and the total message of the Christian salvation to society, the economic life, and social institutions such as the state, the family, as well as to individuals.” The goal of the social gospel was to effect Christian salvation that redeemed and transformed both personal lives and the social order. Thus conversion was aimed not only at individuals, but also at American society and the whole world.³¹ Social gospel workers applied themselves to both domestic and foreign social betterment opportunities while the movement’s leaders maximized the persuasive power of pulpit, platform and press. Both clergy and laity leveraged democratic political processes and the emerging social sciences to accomplish the bold, broad mission of the social gospel to build the kingdom of God on earth, starting at home in the United States of America.

The theological emphases of the social gospel movement revolved around commonplace understandings of the biblical teachings of Jesus. These include the advent of the kingdom of God, the first and second Great Commandments (one must love God above all else and one’s neighbor as oneself) and the Golden Rule (one should treat others the way one would want to be treated). These and similar biblical teachings became recognized

Wendy J. Deichmann is President and Associate Professor of History and Theology at United Theological Seminary in Dayton.

as hallmarks of the social gospel movement and provided the foundation for increasingly widespread, formalized teaching of Christian social ethics.

In large part it was the legacy of American evangelicalism's long-standing commitments to mission, social holiness, social reform, and the building of a Christian nation and world that gave rise to this religious, social and political movement in the United States. The American social gospel coincided with and was related to similar developments in other countries, especially in Canada, Great Britain, Germany and other parts of Western Europe. The impact of both its theologies and practices extends past the fifty years or so (1865–1915) of its prominence, through the twentieth century American civil rights movement, and beyond.

In order to grasp the breadth and the racial and gender diversity of the social gospel movement, one must distinguish between at least two important facets of the movement. The first was a concerted, practical element that began to emerge in the 1860s out of a basic, common sense understanding of Christian teachings and ethical imperatives in the face of enormous social crises. The second was the related, widely popularized academic theology that began to appear in the 1870s. That is, a loosely-knit, intellectual sub-movement with its own literary focus led by university and seminary professors such as Shailer Mathews and Walter Rauschenbusch arose as another significant aspect of the social gospel movement. These and other professors attempted both to capture and further promote in and through the academy what formally educated proponents understood to be the movement's essence.

Unless one recognizes both the grassroots and academic elements of the movement, one misses its complexity, which included potent advocacy for racial and gender equality. These convictions were rarely observed in the elite, academic centers that eventually produced the most sophisticated social gospel theologies and publications, such as those penned by Washington Gladden, Josiah Strong and Walter Rauschenbusch. These materials, often without benefit of the full array of grassroots experience and expertise, in turn framed what became the most famous social gospel rhetoric and subsequent scholarly, historical narratives about the movement.

African Methodist Episcopal (AME) pastor Reverdy Ransom (1861–1959) exemplified grassroots social gospel commitments in his founding of Chicago's Institutional Church and Social Settlement in 1900 to help meet needs of blacks and immigrants who were moving into the city. Organized as a residential city mission, it featured an auditorium, dining room, kitchen and gymnasium. Programs included men's and women's clubs, childcare, concerts, classes and lectures. Ransom's work embraced social activism such as mediation in labor disputes and addressing civic corruption in order to improve the social conditions of those with whom he ministered not only in

Chicago, but also later in Boston and New York. Ransom was an outspoken advocate for civil rights for African Americans and a leader in the formation of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People.

Members of African American denominations were especially responsive to the crises precipitated by the residual effects of slavery and racial discrimination. Outraged by the continuing scandals of lynching, segregation and disenfranchisement, AME Sunday School teacher and journalist Ida B. Wells-Barnett became an outspoken and effective grassroots social gospeler and civil rights leader. Women's roles in the social gospel movement ranged from quiet, dedicated social work alongside other laity and pastors, to missionary service, and to advocacy for woman suffrage and full clergy rights for women. When Victorian era white Methodist women like Frances E. Willard felt called to serve in leadership beyond their traditionally designated feminine roles, they often made a compelling case that it was not only in the interest of social holiness, but also "home protection." Thus many social gospel women championed with a vengeance the cause of temperance alongside woman suffrage and other reforms, especially through the Woman's Christian Temperance Union and a plethora of "woman's clubs."

The social gospel movement associated itself with concerns about unchecked capitalism and limited democracy by supporting fair, living wages for workers and by issuing scathing critiques about discriminatory labor and voting laws and practices. It provided programs for social betterment and reconstruction that addressed poverty and the myriad other problems facing society. Social gospel commitments were institutionalized in legislation such as child labor and health and safety laws, and in denominational home mission societies and organizations such as the Methodist Federation for Social Service (1907), the Federal Council of Churches and Methodist Social Creed (1908) and the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (1909).

Between the Civil War and the early twentieth century, forms of literal Biblicism that had developed previously alongside and in support of slavery aligned with American pre-millennialist, fundamentalist and holiness theologies under the rubric of a politicized form of protestant "evangelicalism." This wave of American Christianity expressed virulent opposition to theories of evolution, scholarly higher criticism, ecumenism and social gospel-inclined elements of protestantism. These pre-millennialists devotedly awaited the second coming of Christ for inauguration of the kingdom of God on earth and perfection of society in lieu of joining post-millennialist social gospelers who worked fervently toward its creation in the here and now.

As a result of the World Wars, the post-war critique of progressive history and the growth of pre-millennialist, neo-orthodox, and a variety of new

liberal and other theologies, the social gospel movement lost the significant place it had held for decades in academic circles. Yet social gospel piety and practice remained as important facets of the faith and life of innumerable Christians, their churches, agencies and denominations. The movement's legacy includes a history of legislation and organizations that continue to check the advance of potent social problems. It also includes ongoing, grassroots efforts to live out a faith beyond personal piety in order to transform communities, the nations and the world according to a common sense understanding of the teachings of Jesus about salvation and the Kingdom of God.

Jane Addams, Apotheosis of Social Christianity

RIMA LUNIN SCHULTZ

JANE Addams was not a theologian or a minister; she held no university position. However, in her role as head resident of the Hull-House settlement she became a social theorist of democracy and one of its most influential interpreters. Her primary interest was not in religious institutions, but in the moral and ethical concerns of public life in American society. Was it a good society? Did the people share in a common life? Were the least of them nurtured and protected? In 1892, Addams declared, “This renaissance of the early Christian humanitarianism is going on in America, in Chicago, if you please, without leaders who write or philosophize, without much speaking, but with a bent to express in social service and in terms of action the spirit of Christ.”³²

To an extent that historians have been reluctant to admit, Addams endowed her social justice and service work with religious meaning. In 1897, she delivered an unusual appeal at her alma mater, Rockford College. During her years as a student at the female seminary she had successfully fought off pressures to convert to evangelical Christianity, and rejected a career of traditional missionary work. Now, she reclaimed earlier church vocations by valorizing new professions for young women like herself.³³ At a time when few mainline denominations were willing to expand the definition of female vocation, Addams assured the graduating class, “Those who seek to solve the problems which confront church and state and transform current industrial and political conditions to the requirements of higher Christian standards are well entitled to the name of missionaries.”³⁴

For Addams, who affixed a Chi-Rho Cross to her bodice, her work at Hull-House was religious³⁵; yet by establishing her settlement as an independent association without ties to any religious organization, university, or other agency, and by *not requiring* religious worship or religious education, she set out to spread a Christian humanism that she envisioned as cosmopolitan and democratic, inclusive and tolerant. Did this mean that she resolved to exclude religious ideas from Hull-House? I would argue that this has been an area of misunderstanding about Addams’s intentions. In a letter to a college settlement colleague, Katherine Coman, Addams spoke candidly: “We find each year that it is more possible to discuss frankly religious problems and differences, because our neighbors have constantly less fear that we will proselyte them.”³⁶ So what appears to be a secularizing trend on

Rima Lunin Schultz is an independent scholar.

the part of Addams turns out to be a pragmatic strategy to make conversations about religion non-threatening to the neighbors.

On a personal level, Addams sought a public role for herself at the same time that she had internalized a strong sense of social responsibility and even stewardship for those less fortunate in society.³⁷ She was not alone in this upsurge of college graduates looking for public service, as she indicated in her own understanding of what propelled her generation.³⁸ Her bold project was conceived in the context of a transatlantic social politics³⁹ that was taking place in religious, academic, and political circles. Women had entered the conversation, as had leaders of new labor unions, and innovators in the new fields of evolutionary biology and sociology. Addams had read Darwin⁴⁰ and came to believe that her generation needed “to revolutionize . . . [its] conception of public morality and national righteousness the way that . . . [he] revolutionized the study of science.”⁴¹ Earlier interest in Carlyle, Emerson and Ruskin didn’t satisfy her and she became interested in Auguste Comte and the English Positivists, and Herbert Spencer. She found Tolstoy’s *What To Do Then* and *My Religion* mind expanding and inspirational.⁴² In the early 1880s, she visited Europe’s towns and cities and was startled by the poverty of rural and urban workers. The work that the Anglican priest Samuel Barnett and his reform-minded wife, Henrietta, had begun with young Oxford students in the slums of East London at Toynbee Hall impressed her.⁴³ She especially liked the Barnetts’ humility and the way they were living out the Christ message. Canon Barnett’s approach to holiness was a revelation and left her with a new desire to find the religious meaning in the work she contemplated doing. In both Canon Barnett and Count Tolstoy their ability to connect work and holiness struck deep into Addams’s psyche.

Addams came to Chicago in 1889 not as the uncertain, tentative, small-town Midwesterner, but as an accomplished, well-read and well-traveled cosmopolitan who had already positioned herself advantageously in this discourse of transatlantic social politics and had acquainted herself with a “map” of the Christian sociologists, reformers, and philanthropists of redemptive projects.⁴⁴ Hull-House became a kind of clearinghouse that brought together all the elements in the social reform culture, including a heavy representation of social gospel and social Christian types. The openness and independence from any religious or political affiliation, or agency or even a dominant philanthropist or corporation, nurtured rather than hindered the flow of ideas.⁴⁵

Whether she intended it, or not, Addams’s contemporaries located her in the social gospel movement. Was it self-interest? “Such was Jane Addams’s reputation by the early 1890s,” historian Victoria Bissell Brown writes, “that Christian proponents of the Social Gospel thought it benefited their cause to

claim her as one of their own. But wishing could not make it so.”⁴⁶ Editors of *The Kingdom* wrongly assumed Hull-House would agree to serve as headquarters for their publication. Addams thought otherwise and protected the independence of the place.⁴⁷ Even within the settlement movement there was debate. One of her closest associates, Graham Taylor of Chicago Commons disagreed with Addams on the importance of an institutional church imbedded in the settlement. A social gospel minister, his Tabernacle Church was an integral part of his settlement.⁴⁸ Regardless of this difference in approach, Addams and the women and men of Hull-House worked cooperatively with Taylor and other protestant ministers and sociologists in the Chicago School of Civics and Philanthropy from 1908 until 1920.⁴⁹

Addams greeted the Taylor family on their arrival in Chicago with the gift of a Madonna painting; Hull-House was filled with Madonnas and Italian renaissance art reproductions. These “props” were educational and were a “text” of moral fables rather than religious objects. Taylor did not object to the gift, and promptly interpreted it as a symbol of unselfish motherhood, a maternal figure much like the protestant Jane Addams. Was there *that* much difference between Addams and Taylor? Not in terms of their unstated assumptions about culture and, from Taylor’s viewpoint, Addams was a kindred spirit.⁵⁰ Addams was as anti-papist as most protestants and many social gospel ministers. Hull-House shared protestant America’s anxiety about Roman Catholicism in the formation of new citizens. In the Nationality Maps of the settlement’s neighborhood, those children under ten, and whose parents had been born outside the United States, who attended parochial schools, were aggregated with the nationality group of their parents while children of immigrants of the same age who attended public schools were enumerated as part of the English-speaking group.⁵¹ Hostility to Catholic clergy was evident in the settlement’s sponsorship of the militantly anti-clerical Giordano Bruno Club, at Hull-House.⁵² Addams’s affinities were strongly in the protestant and social gospel camp; even though she refused to have a protestant chapel in the Hull-House complex, it was *culturally* a protestant institution.

Addams shared the common *culture* of protestant social Christianity. The audiences that were most receptive to her point of view were those already exposed to the literature associated with the rise of social Christianity. These middle-class churchgoers, mostly women, had likely read the English novels of Walter Besant and George Eliot, and they had heard about socialism and labor unions. They read denominational periodical literature that reported extensively on the social experiments in England and the U.S. In the days leading up to the opening of the Hull-House settlement in September 1889, an event covered by the press in Chicago and nationally, it was easy to explain its goals as the “Chicago Toynbee Hall” because there was a

readership already familiar with the activities of a transnational social Christianity.⁵³ And the influence of a sociological approach to urban conditions was “in the air,” as this remark in Addams’s letter to her sister Mary indicates: “Mr. [Allen] Pond assured [*sic*] me that I had voiced something hundreds of young people in the city were trying to express, & that he could send us three young ladies at once who possessed both money and a knowledge of Herbert Spencer’s ‘Sociology,’ but who were dying from inaction and restlessness.”⁵⁴

Addams’s agenda was social and political, not religious, but she could sound like a social gospel minister. “Positivism insists that the very religious fervor of man can be turned into love for his race, and his desire for a future life into content to live in the echo of his deeds. This is what George Eliot passionately voices,” Addams declared. “It seems simple to many of us to search for the Christ that is in each man and to found our likeness on Him—to believe in the brotherhood of all men because we believe in His.”⁵⁵ The ethical will required to solve the crises of their times, Addams told these activist women, can be developed in all of us by socializing the Christ spirit that is in all human beings. Little wonder that in William T. Stead’s popular 1894 social gospel exposé, *If Christ Came to Chicago*, the British author, answers Christ’s question, “Who Is my Neighbor?” with the claim that “no one [in Chicago] has fulfilled the task of being a good neighbor better than Jane Addams.”⁵⁶

More than most mainline protestants, Addams challenged her biases and consciously pursued an openness to her immigrant neighbors, though ultimately she was not as successful as her co-religionists claimed. She insisted that Hull-House not proselytize its Jewish and Roman Catholic neighbors, and she took pride in the Greek plays, the Italian and German social get-togethers, and the exhibits of old world arts and crafts displayed in the Hull-House Labor Museum. She handled religious and cultural differences through the “performance” of religious pageantry without worship, religious art without prayer, and enactments of ethnic plays in the context of nationally mixed audiences.⁵⁷ But there was little evidence of any self-criticism or questioning of whether the Christmas tableaux depicting the story of Christ’s birth (often with Jewish youngsters taking part) promoted a specific religion. In this respect, liberal religious protestants who advocated pluralism and social gospel theologians were equally insensitive to the cultural hegemony of the western art forms and literary traditions that focused on protestant understandings of Jesus.

Addams’s passion was not in the religious arena but in social justice movements; she aligned herself not with church institutions but with the women’s, labor, and early civil rights movements. Yet her greatest personal heroes were two men whose humanism Addams contended came out of

their great religious spirit and connection to the people. Abraham Lincoln and Leo Tolstoy each have a chapter in Addams's 1910 autobiographical *Twenty Years at Hull-House*. Hull-House's theater, the central feature of her "cathedral of humanity," had two murals: one of Lincoln's encounter with a slave on the Mississippi; the other of Leo Tolstoy, in peasant garb, plowing his field. As Addams explained, the murals "portray those cosmopolitan heroes who have become great through identification with the common lot, in preference to the heroes of mere achievement."⁵⁸ Lincoln and Tolstoy represented ideas about religious conduct and social ethics that Addams frequently invoked to explain her own religious nature and strivings.⁵⁹

Would the "cathedral of humanity" include people of color? Addams's answer was "yes," but interreligious work which was also interracial was difficult to do in the segregated and denominationally-driven world Addams lived in. Even among otherwise comfortable alliances, Addams learned to dissent but compromise if a larger "good" could be identified.⁶⁰ She found greater cooperation for interracial work among the religious leaders who had already distanced themselves from (or were already rejected by) their denominational organizations. Her relationship with Rabbi Emil G. Hirsch is an illustration of this connection between independent congregations and interracial initiatives. Hirsch was leader of the Reform Jewish Congregation Sinai in Chicago,⁶¹ a uniquely religiously radical and independent congregation well-supported by wealthy German Jews who had successfully assimilated into the civic and business world of Chicago. With Hirsch at her side, and ministers like the Unitarian Jenkin Lloyd Jones, Addams came close to constructing her imagined "cathedral of humanity" or "civil religion" for a democratic society.⁶² Hirsch, like Jones and Addams, shared many of the economic and social beliefs of men like Washington Gladden and George W. Herron, but found fellowship with religious leaders who spoke of Christianizing the nation problematic.⁶³ While Herron, for example, who wrote about the Christian state, had no interest in creating a Christian Party or establishing a theocracy in the United States, he talked of the nation becoming Christian in ways that would trouble liberal religious pluralists.⁶⁴

The organization that most closely expressed Addams's views was the short-lived American Congress of Liberal Religious Societies. Established in 1894 in part as an outgrowth of meetings held at the time of the 1893 Columbian Exposition and the World Parliament of Religions, its incorporators included Hirsch, and two other liberal ministers: ex-Presbyterian Hiram W. Thomas, the pastor of the independent People's Church, and Jenkin Lloyd Jones, whose conflicts with the central body of Unitarians led to his break from the national group. The Congress supported trade unions, collective bargaining,

unrestricted immigration to the U.S., free speech and free press (even for anarchists and socialists whether U.S. citizens or aliens); their members supported interracial work.⁶⁵ Sinai Temple and Hull-House held interracial meetings, where W.E.B. Du Bois and Ida B. Wells Barnett and other African American leaders gave lectures and, even more unconventionally, broke bread and ate with blacks and whites at the same table.⁶⁶ In Jim Crow America, few white institutions ever crossed the race divide. In addition, Addams worked with University of Chicago settlement house head Mary E. McDowell,⁶⁷ a pro-labor interracialist, and with Celia Parker Woolley, Unitarian minister and founder of the interracial Frederick Douglass Center.⁶⁸

The social gospel message engaged and motivated men and women of color, but the organizations of the social gospel movement, as a whole, did not break ranks with Jim Crow segregation policies on an institutional level during the Progressive Era. During its brief history, the American Congress of Liberal Religious Societies was precocious in its positions on race and key figures, specifically Addams, Jones, Hirsch and Woolley had a lasting impact in nurturing the embryonic civil rights association, the NAACP.⁶⁹

Although Addams clearly differed with major social gospel figures on issues of race and religious pluralism, she continued to work with them, most often on issues of economic justice, for social gospel was heavily engaged in reform politics ranging from workers' rights to municipal ownership of streetcars, and a broad agenda of public health, education, and welfare initiatives. She also joined them in many of the moral purity initiatives that seem, in retrospect, to be conservative, even reactionary crusades. For example, Addams was a vice president of the Religious Citizenship League in 1914, a group headed by Walter Rauschenbusch; its program reveals the social control dimension of Addams's "new social ethic" for democracy. It also reveals how much protestant social Christianity was a cultural movement as well as a theological.⁷⁰

In the end, Addams was more invested in promoting understanding and harmony across religion, race, and nationality, and class than the majority of social gospel protestants. In 1927, toward the end of her life, she was an active member of the Advisory Council of the National Conference of Jews and Christians. This was her kind of organization, described as consisting of "Jewish, Protestant, Catholic, white, Negroes, Italians, Irish, Russian, Chinese"—primarily educational, operating through community councils, and pledged to "unite the advocates of good-will in this country with those in European countries in an international effort to increase understanding."⁷¹

Addams's case shows us how deeply imbedded protestant cultural and social values were in the reform movements of her day. Her status as one of the most influential interpreters of social democracy notwithstanding, she had little success in the short term in de-centering traditional religion and

championing cosmopolitan social ethics. Indeed, Addams was culturally more—not less—at home with the social gospel camp than historians have acknowledged.

ENDNOTES

¹Mathews's definition can be found in a co-edited volume with G.B. Smith, *A Dictionary of Religion and Ethics* (New York: Macmillan, 1921), 416–417. An abridged version of this definition was also used by Charles Howard Hopkins in his classic study of the American social gospel, *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism, 1865-1915* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1940), 3. An updated and expanded definition of the social gospel is offered by Susan Hill Lindley, “Deciding Who Counts: Toward a Revised Definition of the Social Gospel,” in *The Social Gospel Today*, ed. Christopher H. Evans (Louisville, Ky.: Westminster John Knox, 2001), 17–26.

²For an analysis on the historiography of the social gospel, see Ralph E. Luker, “Interpreting the Social Gospel: Reflections on Two Generations of Historiography,” in *Perspectives on the Social Gospel*, ed. Christopher H. Evans (Lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin Mellen Press, 1999), 1–13.

³See William R. Hutchison, *The Modernist Impulse in American Protestantism* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1976); Gary Dorrien, *The Making of American Liberal Theology: Imagining Progressive Religion* (Louisville, Ky.: Westminster John Knox Press, 2001), and Dorrien, *The Making of American Liberal Theology: Idealism, Realism, & Modernity* (Louisville, Ky.: Westminster John Knox Press, 2003).

⁴See, for example, William McGuire King, “‘History as Revelation’ in the Theology of the Social Gospel,” in *Harvard Theological Review* 76, no. 1 (1983): 109–129.

⁵See Janet Forsythe Fishburn, *The Fatherhood of God and the Victorian Family* (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981); Wendy J. Deichmann Edwards and Carolyn De Swarte Gifford, eds. *Gender and the Social Gospel* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2003); Christopher H. Evans, *The Kingdom is Always but Coming: a Life of Walter Rauschenbusch* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 2004)

⁶Gary Dorrien, “Social Salvation: The Social Gospel as Theology and Economics,” in *The Social Gospel Today*, 101.

⁷While historians acknowledge that the social gospel continued after World War I, its influence is often seen through the prism of Reinhold Niebuhr and the rise of crisis theology in the 1930s. See for, example, Paul Carter, *The Decline and Revival of the Social Gospel* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1954); Donald Meyer, *The Protestant Search for Political Realism* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1960). A nuanced interpretation of how the social gospel developed after World War I is offered by William McGuire King, “The Emergence of Social Gospel Radicalism in American Methodism” (Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, 1977). King discusses the rise of a more hard-edged theological radicalism that characterized the growth of social Christianity after World War I.

⁸See David Hollinger, *After Cloven Tongues of Fire: Protestant Liberalism in Modern American History* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2013); Elesha J. Coffman, *The Christian Century and the Rise of the Protestant Mainline* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013); Matthew S. Hedstrom, *The Rise of Liberal Religion: Book Culture and American Spirituality in the 20th Century* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013).

⁹Part of the social gospel's diffusion can also be seen in generations of student activists who emerged in protestant youth organizations prior to World War II. See, for example, James Tracy, *Direct Action: Radical Pacifism from the Union Eight to the Chicago Seven* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996).

¹⁰Classic studies of the social gospel in Canada include Richard Allen, *The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1971) and Paul T. Phillips *a Kingdom on Earth: Anglo-American Social Christianity* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1996). On the connection to the Co-Operative

Commonwealth Federation see Eleanor J. Stebner, "Young Man Knowles: Christianity, Politics, and the 'Making of a Better World'," in *Religion and Public Life in Canada*, ed. Marguerite Van Die (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001), 219–236.

¹¹In addition to being the topic of numerous monographs and articles, Rauschenbusch was cited as a primary influence by many prominent social reformers later in the twentieth century, in particular, Martin Luther King, Jr. See King, *Stride Toward Freedom* (New York: Harper & Row, 1958).

¹²See John Ryan, *A Living Wage* (New York: Macmillan, 1906). While Ryan's work draws heavily upon the writings of the economist Richard Ely (who influenced many of the major protestant social gospel theorists), Ryan's thought is grounded in a tradition of Catholic natural law theology. See Harlan Beckley, *Passion for Justice: Retrieving the Legacies of Walter Rauschenbusch, John A. Ryan, and Reinhold Niebuhr* (Louisville, Ky.: Westminster John Knox, 1992); Dorrien, *Social Ethics in the Making: Interpreting an American Tradition* (Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011).

¹³Dores Sharpe, Rauschenbusch's former secretary, published the first full-length biography of Rauschenbusch. While the book is filled with many personal anecdotes, at points its arguments border on hagiography. See Sharpe, *Walter Rauschenbusch: A Biography* (New York: Macmillan, 1942).

¹⁴Specifically, the social gospel movement was instrumental to the rise of "social ethics." See Gary Dorrien, *Social Ethics in the Making: Interpreting an American Tradition*.

¹⁵Rauschenbusch, *A Theology for the Social Gospel* (New York: Macmillan, 1917), 1.

¹⁶Quoted in William McGuire King, "An enthusiasm for humanity: the social emphasis in religion and its accommodation in Protestant theology," in *Religion and 20th-Century American Intellectual Life*, ed. Michael J. Lacey (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1989), 77.

¹⁷For fuller analysis of these vignettes, see my *Union Made: Working People and the Rise of Social Christianity in Chicago* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015).

¹⁸"Labor and Christianity," *Chicago Republican*, September 16, 1867.

¹⁹"A Small Stream from a Large Fountain," *Workingman's Advocate* 4, no. 9 (September 21, 1867).

²⁰H.G.C., "Views of a Mechanic's Wife," *Chicago Daily Tribune*, March 15, 1874.

²¹William Hutchinson, *The Modernist Impulse in American Protestantism* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1976): 48.

²²"The Labor Turmoil," *The Alliance* 1, no. 4 (January 3, 1874): 2.

²³"Swing's Last Words," *Chicago Daily Tribune*, October 7, 1894.

²⁴"Swing is Dead," *Railway Times* 1, no. 20 (October 15, 1894): 2.

²⁵"Are Methodists Hypocrites," *Union Labor Advocate* 6, no. 12 (August 1906): 24.

²⁶See various letters in "Correspondence – Part 2," Records of the Methodist Federation for Social Action, Methodist Collection, Drew University, Madison, New Jersey.

²⁷See James W. Kline to the Reverend Harry F. Ward, February 5, 1917, Records of the Methodist Federation for Social Action, Methodist Collection, Drew University, Madison, New Jersey.

²⁸See Harry F. Ward to Mr. James W. Kline, February 9, 1917, Records of the Methodist Federation for Social Action, Methodist Collection, Drew University, Madison, New Jersey.

²⁹For examples of classic works in the historiography see, for example, Charles Howard Hopkins, *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism, 1865–1915* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1940); and Henry F. May, *Protestant Churches and Industrial America* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1949). For more recent works, see for example, Wendy J. Deichmann Edwards and Carolyn De Swarte Gifford, *Gender and the Social Gospel* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2003); Ellen Blue, *St. Mark's and the Social Gospel: Methodist Women and Civil Rights in New Orleans, 1895–1965* (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 2011); Ralph E. Luker, *The Social Gospel in Black and White* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1991); and Ronald C. White Jr., *Liberty and Justice for All: Racial Reform and the Social Gospel* (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1990).

³⁰See Bethany Moreton, *To Serve God and Wal-Mart: The Making of Christian Free Enterprise* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2009).

³¹Wendy J. Deichmann Edwards and Carolyn De Swarte Gifford, eds., *Gender and the Social Gospel* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2003), 2–3.

³²Addams, “Subjective Necessity for Social Settlements,” *Philanthropy and Social Progress. Seven Essays* by Jane Addams, Bernard Bosanquet, Franklin H. Giddings, J.O.S. Huntington, and Robert A. Woods (Patterson Smith Reprint, 1970, orig. 1893), 20. My thinking about how Addams can be seen in this way has been influenced by David Hollinger’s *After Cloven Tongues of Fire* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2013) and by the thoughtful comments by Amanda Porterfield at our panel session April 4, 2014, Oxford, when she encouraged me to think about where Addams’s religious liberalism might have led.

³³Rima Lunin Schultz, “‘Grace Conferred’: Deaconesses in Twentieth Century Chicago,” in *Deeper Joy: Laywomen and Vocation in the Twentieth Century Episcopal Church*, eds. Fredrica Harris Thompsett and Sheryl A. Kujawa-Holbrook (New York: Church Publishing Incorporated, 2005); Rima Lunin Schultz, “Woman’s Work and Woman’s Calling in the Episcopal Church: Chicago, 1880–1989,” in *Episcopal Women: Gender, Spirituality, and Commitment in an American Mainline Protestant Denomination*, ed. Catherine M. Prelinger (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992). It is noteworthy that Addams taught in Lucy Rider Meyer’s Methodist Chicago Training School for City, Home and Foreign Missions, a Deaconess School in Chicago; see Annual Reports and Catalogs, 1889–1896, United Library, Garrett-Evangelical Theology School, Northwestern University, Chicago.

³⁴“Jane Addams At Rockford College.” *Chicago Tribune* (June 14, 1897): 8. Sharing the biases of the majority of American protestants towards Roman Catholicism, Addams apparently did not consider the local parishes as doing the same community building and civic work as Hull-House; while she valorized immigrants and rejected restrictionist legislation, Addams was unaware of her inability to consider Catholics who identified with their parishes as being social agents in the democracy.

³⁵The simple Chi-Rho Cross she prominently affixed to the collar of her dress can be seen in all the surviving photographs of Addams from the 1890s. It can be seen in the famous photo that has come to symbolize the determined young woman in her inaugural year as co-founder of Hull-House. The Chi-Rho Cross is visible in the 1892 charcoal drawing of Jane Addams by Alice Kellogg Tyler; it is in the famous portrait of Addams that appeared in *New England Magazine*, July 1898, in an article about Hull-House by Florence Kelley. It is visible in the portrait of Jane Addams that is on the cover of Victoria Bissell Brown’s new edition of *Twenty Years at Hull-House* (New York: Macmillan, 1999) and in the majestic photo portrait of Jane Addams seated in an elaborate Victorian chair that graces the front cover of Allen F. Davis’ *American Heroine: The Life and Legend of Jane Addams* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000 reprint). Preparing to open a settlement house, Addams compared her intentions with the goals of the College Settlement Association in New York City: “I will inclose [sic] the circular of a similar thing in New York,” she wrote her sister. “We are modest enough to think that ours is better, is more distinctively Christian, and less Social Science.” Jane Addams to Mary Catherine Addams Linn, March 13, 1889, Jane Addams Papers (JAP) microfilm reel 2-1043-1048, Special Collections, Richard J. Daley Library, The University of Illinois at Chicago.

³⁶Jane Addams to Katherine Coman, Chicago, Dec. 7, 1891, JAP microfilm reel 2-1283, Special Collections, Richard J. Daley Library, The University of Illinois at Chicago.

³⁷Victoria Bissell Brown, *The Education of Jane Addams* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004); Louise W. Knight, *Citizen Jane Addams and the Struggle for Democracy* (Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, 2005).

³⁸Addams, “Subjective Necessity for Social Settlements,” *Philanthropy and Social Progress. Seven Essays* by Jane Addams, Bernard Bosanquet, Franklin H. Giddings, J.O.S. Huntington, and Robert A. Woods (Patterson Smith Reprint, 1970, orig. pub. 1893), 1–26.

³⁹Daniel T. Rodgers, *Atlantic Crossings. Social Politics in a Progressive Age* (Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1998).

⁴⁰Merle Curti concluded, “No one of the other late XIXth-and the early XXth-century movements of thought—the so-called new psychology of the experimental laboratory, or Freudianism, or Marxism—to all of which she responded, exerted so far-reaching an influence on Jane Addams’s view of the nature of man as did the teachings of Darwin and his disciple

Kropotkin, who spent some time at Hull House in 1901." Curti, "Jane Addams on Human Nature," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 22, no. 2 (April–June 1961), 244–245. Addams, in fact, had read Darwin while at Rockford Seminary, not as a part of the curriculum, but outside of class in a little study group: Katherine Joslin, *Jane Addams, A Writer's Life* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2004), 32–33.

⁴¹Jane Addams, "The Reaction of Modern Life Upon Religious Education," *Religious Education* 4 (April 1909): 29.

⁴²Jane Addams, "A Book That Changed My Life," *Christian Century* 44 (October 13, 1927): 1196–98. Writing on the centennial of Tolstoy's life, Addams recalled the initial importance of her reading Tolstoy in the 1880s & how his spiritual quest and personal conduct challenged and informed her own spiritual identity.

⁴³Jane Addams, "The Pioneer Settlement," *Unity* 85 (June 10, 1920): 233–37, JAP microfilm reel 48-0303-0308, Special Collections, Richard J. Daley Library, The University of Illinois at Chicago. In this review of Henrietta Barnett's *Canon Barnett, His Life, Work and Friends*, published that year, Addams revealed her own "take" on Toynbee Hall and its meaning to her initially and over the years in settlement work. For one of Addams's first expressions of connections with Toynbee Hall, see: Jane Addams, "Outgrowths of Toynbee Hall," December 3, 1891, address delivered to the Chicago Woman's Club, in JAMC microfilm reel 46-0480-0496, Special Collections, Richard J. Daley Library, The University of Illinois at Chicago.

⁴⁴Ellen Gates Starr to Mary Houghton Starr Blaisdell, February 23, 1889, Ellen Gates Starr Papers, Sophia Smith Collection, Smith College, Northampton, Mass.; Jane Addams to Mary Catherine Addams Linn, March 13, 1889, JAMC microfilm reel 2-1043-1048, Special Collections, Richard J. Daley Library, The University of Illinois at Chicago.

⁴⁵Henry Demarest Lloyd, the radical journalist and defender of the Haymarket anarchists and of Governor John Peter Altgeld, who pardoned them, became a close friend and advisor on politics, municipal ownership, and labor unions. John L. Thomas, *Alternative America: Henry George, Edward Bellamy, Henry Demarest Lloyd and the Adversary Tradition* (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1983), 283. The social gospel economist and University of Wisconsin professor Richard T. Ely encouraged her to undertake sociological studies of the nearby slums and prodded her to publish books. Ely was involved in three major book projects of Addams: *Hull-House Maps and Papers* (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell and Co., 1895); *Democracy and Social Ethics* (New York: Macmillan, 1902) and *Newer Ideals of Peace* (New York: Macmillan, 1907). Lloyd's radical group and the Hull-House group were close & shared radical politics and social gospel discussions. John L. Thomas, *Alternative America: Henry George, Edward Bellamy, Henry Demarest Lloyd and the Adversary Tradition* (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1983), 134. Social gospel theologians Washington Gladden and George Herron found their way to the settlement; during his American tours, Prince Peter Kropotkin, a disciple of Leo Tolstoy, found support and a base of operations there. Father Huntington, Episcopal priest and founder of the Order of the Holy Cross, pursued a radical social gospel in his support of labor unions and his brand of Christian socialism fired up Ellen Gates Starr, co-founder of Hull-House, and to some commentators, the more committed social Christian of the two women. "Mr. Herron has a most charming personality, a deep religious life which one feels all the time one is near him. He is coming often, he says, and I hope you will know him," Addams wrote her friend Mary Rozet Smith, September 4, 1895, Jane Addams Papers, Series 1, Swarthmore College Peace Collection, Swarthmore, Penn.; Ellen Gates Starr to Mary Allen, Chicago, March 5, 1894, box VII, Ellen Gates Starr Papers, Sophia Smith Collection, Smith College, Northampton, Mass.; "Social Reform," *The Critic: A Weekly Review of Literature and the Arts*. September 28, 1895; 24, 710 in American Periodicals Series Online, p. 197.

⁴⁶Victoria Bissell Brown, "The Sermon of the Deed: Jane Addams's Spiritual Evolution," in *Jane Addams and the Practice of Democracy*, eds. Marilyn Fischer, Carol Nackenoff, and Wendy Chmielewski (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2009), 35.

⁴⁷Herbert W. Gleason to Jane Addams, May 15, 1897, Jane Addams Papers, Series 1, JAPM microfilm reel 3-0663-0664, Swarthmore College Peace Collection, Swarthmore, Penn.

⁴⁸Dean George Hodges, "Religion in the Settlement," National Conference of Charities and Correction Proceedings, ed. Isabel C. Barrows (1896); Graham Taylor, *Religion in Social Action* (New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1913).

⁴⁹It is difficult to gauge how much social gospel theology informed the curriculum or whether tensions over the trend toward secularization of the field led to its eventual demise.

⁵⁰We have Taylor's thank-you letter to Addams and in it we can glean how protestant social Christians were thinking about Catholic symbols in their neighborhood: "The Madonna will ever remind us of the unselfish, mother-like care which Hull House has shown in many ways for Chicago Commons through all these trying months of initiative and experiment. The gift of the [HH] maps was really recognized to be a vote of confidence, when few had any in us and we had none to speak of in ourselves. Personally your generous friendship has been to me one of the three sources of inspiration, courage and hope through the three years of the most serious spiritual conflict, severe struggle and incessant toil which have fallen to my lot. To know that you besides the Heavenly Father and the one who has shared my every thought and feeling these twenty three years, understood the motive and method of my new work, which you have also done not a little to mold and make, has been an ever present cause for gratitude and source of strength." Graham Taylor to Jane Addams, Chicago, December 25, 1895, Jane Addams Papers, Series 1, JAP microfilm reel 2-1831, Swarthmore College Peace Collection, Swarthmore, Penn.

⁵¹Rima Lunin Schultz, "Introduction," *Hull-House Maps & Papers* by the Residents of Hull-House (Urbana& Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2007; reprint of original 1895 edition), 20.

⁵²Peter D'Agostino, *Rome In America. Transnational Catholic Ideology from the Risorgimento to Fascism* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2004), 70-74.

⁵³Rima Lunin Schultz, ed., *Hull-House and Its Neighborhoods 1889-1963*, <http://uic.edu/jaddams/hull/urbanexp> documents this; see Leila G. Bedell, "A Chicago Toynbee Hall," *Woman's Journal* 20, no. 21 (May 25, 1889): 162; "To Meet on Common Ground: A Project to Bring the Rich and the Poor Closer Together," *Chicago Tribune* (March 8, 1889): 8; David Swing, "A New Social Movement," *Chicago Evening Journal* (June 8, 1889): 4.

⁵⁴Jane Addams to Mary Catherine Addams Linn, February 12, 1889, Jane Addams Papers, Series 1, JAPM microfilm reel 2-1008-1016, Swarthmore College Peace Collection, Swarthmore, Penn. Sister Mary is married to an evangelical minister who had associated with Dwight Moody; Mr. Pond is a civic-minded architect who Addams met in her travels with Christian and reform-minded civic leaders in Chicago before opening Hull-House; he became a great support, the architect of the twelve additional buildings of the Hull-House settlement complex, and a trustee of the settlement after its incorporation in 1895.

⁵⁵Jane Addams, "Outgrowths of Toynbee Hall," December 3, 1891, address delivered to the Chicago Woman's Club, JAMC microfilm reel 46-0480-0496, Special Collections, Richard J. Daley Library, The University of Illinois at Chicago.

⁵⁶Quoted in Katherine Joslin, *Jane Addams, A Writer's Life* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2004), 10.

⁵⁷The role of Hull-House theater "in negotiating immigrant difference," as Shannon Jackson puts it, is too large a topic to discuss in this paper. See Stuart J. Hecht, "Hull-House Theatre: An Analytical and Evaluative History," Ph.D. dissertation, Northwestern University, 1983; also: Elizabeth C. Barrows, "The Greek Play at Hull-House," *Commons* (January 1904); Shannon Jackson, *Lines of Activity: Performance, Historiography, Hull-House Domesticity* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2000). Such performances could also be seen as Addams's efforts to simulate a "cathedral of humanity." Jenkin Lloyd Jones, Unitarian minister and ally of Addams, who often invited the settlement leader to lecture from his pulpit, called her "the unordained minister of the unecclasiastical church of human helpfulness that is to be." "Jenkin Lloyd Jones Memorial," *Unity* LXXXII, no. 12 (November 28, 1918): 148.

⁵⁸The two iconic murals, one of Tolstoy and one of Lincoln were painted by resident artists on the walls of the auditorium of the Hull-House Theater. *Twenty Years At Hull-House*, 396.

⁵⁹Jane Addams, "The Reaction of Modern Life Upon Religious Education," *Religious Education* 4 (April 1909), 29; Jane Addams, "A Book That Changed My Life," *Christian Century* 44 (October 13, 1927): 1196-1198.

⁶⁰The best example is Addams's endorsement of Theodore Roosevelt's candidacy for president on the Progressive Party ticket in 1912; many of her closest friends and associates questioned her support primarily because of Roosevelt's militarism and the new party's refusal to seat Negro delegates from the South, were surprised when Addams seconded T.R.'s nomination. Addams had led the fight to seat the blacks. "Platform Makers Disagree," *New York Times*, (August 6, 1912), 2; "Negro Question Up Again." *New York Times* (August 7, 1912), 2. She wrote Lillian Wald of Henry Street settlement, "I can quite understand your bewilderment, it took me three days and night to make up my mind to go in even after the splendid platform suffrage and all had been laid before my astonished eyes. I am [end 6-1410] enclosing a little printed leaflet with the planks in the back which [you] should love most. It is pretty hard not to work for them when they are at last in practical politics. I have always kept out of the Socialist Party because it went further than I was ready to go, but here was this just about as far as I did go and offering a chance to work directly for women's [end 6-1411] causes. You may imagine it was pretty hard for me to swallow warships etc. . . . On the whole I am sure we are marching for social righteousness and I haven't a shadow of a regret." Jane Addams to Lillian D. Wald, August 17, 1912, Lillian D. Wald Papers, Incoming Letters, JAPM microfilm reel 6-1410-1413, New York Public Library. Allen Davis linked the social reform branch of settlement and social workers with the Progressive party platform; he also identified the two areas in which Addams disagreed with the party platform: militarism and race: Allen F. Davis, "The Social Workers and the Progressive Party, 1912-1916," *The American Historical Review* 69, no. 3. (April 1964): 671-688.

⁶¹Emil G. Hirsch, *My Religion*, comp. Gerson B. Levi (New York: MacMillan, 1925); Tobias Brinkmann, *Sundays at Sinai* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012). Wealthy philanthropist Julius Rosenwald attended Sinai and his funding of African American schools in the South, housing in Chicago, and the Rosenwald scholarships for African Americans in the arts, the humanities, and the social sciences has been attributed in part to the influence of his rabbi, Emil G. Hirsch (Brinkmann, *Sundays at Sinai*, 231). Rosenwald became a trustee of the Hull-House Association and served as an advisor and a financial contributor to the settlement.

⁶²Addams does not use this terminology. However it seems to get at the ideas about a religion of humanism that provided fellowship without erasing differences.

⁶³George Herron, *The Christian State: A Political Vision of Christ* (Boston: Thomas Y. Crowell & Co., 1895), 169.

⁶⁴Herron wrote: "The union of church and state is not something the church should seek at all, but is a triumphant and glorious thing that will be added to it through a faithful seeking to fulfill the righteousness of the kingdom of God in the world. The vital and abiding union will not be reached through a plan, but through the uniting spirit that seeks the social justice of the kingdom with a passion so holy that it consumes all jealousies and rivalries of parties, sects, and opinions. The Christian church of the Christian state will not come through the adoption of methods, through revisions and reconciliations of creeds, through the balancing of interests and opinions, through ecclesiastical legislation, but through the immersion of men in the Christ Spirit, and the fusion of all interests, opinions, and politics in the one common purpose to fulfill the society of the kingdom of Christ's righteousness on the earth. Only the accordance of men in the mind of Christ, and their consequent immersion in his passion for right, so that they shall be one as the Father and Son are one, can discover that unity of church and state which shall bring forth the Messianic nation for the social redemption and unity of the world." *The Christian State*, 168-170.

⁶⁵"Bring Up Negro Question," *New York Times* (February 14, 1909), 10.

⁶⁶In 1899 Addams visited Memphis, Tennessee, where she had luncheon with a group of African American clubwomen; later she visited with white clubwomen in the same city. She was criticized by the Memphis newspaper and told, should she visit again, whites would not be as hospitable. The incident was reported in the religious journal *Advance*, whose editor had praise for Addams and disdain for white Memphis society. "The Religious World," *Advance* (December 21, 1899).

⁶⁷Mary E. McDowell first resided at Hull-House where she taught in the kindergarten and instigated the local neighborhood women to form a women's club along the lines of the well-to-do women of the Chicago Woman's Club. McDowell also donned the Chi-Rho Cross in these early years. See *The Commons* (January 1898), 1. McDowell identified strongly with the social gospel and the University of Chicago Settlement that she headed, the project of the women's

Christian Union, had a close relationship with a protestant church nearby. Still standing in the Back-of-the-Yards Chicago neighborhood, the foundation stone of the edifice has cut into it a Chi-Rho cross. I thank historian Ellen Skerrett for bringing this to my attention.

⁶⁸Koby Lee Forman, "Woolley, Celia Anna Parker," in *Women Building Chicago 1790-1990: A Biographical Dictionary*, eds. Rima Lunin Schultz and Adele Hast (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2001), 993-995.

⁶⁹My current research on Addams takes up the sometimes contradictory history of race in the Hull-House settlement. Her own assessment of her generation of reformers on working to achieve race equality is harsh: "Because we are no longer stirred as the Abolitionists were, to remove fetters, to prevent cruelty, to lead the humblest to the banquet of civilization, we have allowed ourselves to become indifferent to the gravest situation in our American life." Jane Addams, *The Second Twenty Years at Hull-House* (New York: Macmillan, 1930), 400-401.

⁷⁰On February 8, 1914, Jane Addams is listed as one of the vice presidents of the Religious Citizenship League, a non-partisan and non-sectarian group for religious leaders and congregants to get together for specific social reforms through legislative enactments. The League advocated: the vote for women; suppression of white slavery by Federal investigation; prosecution and publication of the names of owners of brothels; equal treatment of the men and women found in brothels; voluntary workshops or colonies where prostitutes (women) could retrain; uniform marriage and divorce laws; required health certificates for marriage; prevention of propagation by defectives and degenerates. Hygienic building codes in tenements or dwellings; industrial education; vocational guidance, & moral instruction in schools; schools as social centers; strict censorship and control of all places of amusement; prohibition of child labor; prohibition of night work for women; the minimum wage for women; state colonies for the unemployed, making them self-supporting so far as possible without selling their products at less than market rates; saloon restrictions and prohibition of their connection with the social vice; creation of a National Health Bureau; government loans to farmers; municipal or state markets for agricultural produce; federal regulation of interstate commerce; ownership of stock, earnings, and dividends of all corporations to be public; industrial courts for minor industrial disputes; six-day work week; federal or state report on living wage in all industries; tariff revision; federal supervision of railways and steamship lines. Leaders are Walter Rauschenbusch, President; v.p.'s Josiah Strong, Washington Gladden; Bishop McDowell, Northern Methodist Episcopal Church, and Bishop Hendrix of the Southern; Edwin Markham, the poet; Jane Addams; Mrs. J. Borden Harriman, United States Industrial Commission; general secretary: W. D. P. Bliss; treasurer : William Foulke, American Bible Society; financial secretary: Michael J. Whitty; others: Dr. Clark, father of the Christian Endeavor Society; Dean Robbins, General Theological Seminary; Drs. Thomas C. Hall and Charles P. Fagnani, Union Theological Seminary; Norman Hapgood, editor of *Harper's Weekly*; Rev. Jonathan C. Day of the Labor Temple; Dr. Perry S. Grant, Dr. J. Howard Melish, Dr. Henry S. Coffin, Dr. Frank O. Hall, Dr. John Haynes Holmes, Dr. J. Herman Randall, Dr. Christian F. Reisner; Rabbi Stephen S. Wise of the Free Synagogue; Mary E. Dreier, Lillian D. Wald, Marie Jeney Howe, Mary K. Simkovitch. Rev. W.D. P. Bliss, "Seeks to Make Religion A Legislative Force," *New York Times* (February 8, 1914), SM8.

⁷¹"Aims To Harmonize National Groups," *The New York Times* (December 11, 1927), N1, N2. Among the active members of the Advisory Council of the conference are the following: Jane Addams, E. F. Albee, Alfred W. Anthony, Newton D. Baker, S. Parkes Cadman, Benjamin N. Cardozo, Henry Sloane Coffin, Alfred M. Cohen, W.H.P. Faunce, Edward A. Filene, John H. Finley, Harry Emerson Fosdick, Israel Goldstein, Samuel H. Goldenson, Charles Evans Hughes, Rebekah Kohut, Charles S. MacFarland, Owen D. Young, Louis Marshall, Henry Morgenthau, David de Sola Pool, Theodore Roosevelt, John A. Ryan, Nathan Straus, William Allen White, Stephen S. Wise and Louis Wolsey.