

Irish Historical Studies

Ballsbridge, in 1920. Finally, on the suggestion of Major-General Goff Hamilton, a greatnephew of Lt. Hamilton, it was presented in 1985 to the National Army Museum in London. Cullen makes the point that a work of art that was in fact acquired for the Dublin Museum was, therefore, not available for 'Soldiers and Chiefs', an important exhibition launched by the National Museum in 2007, devoted to 'The Irish at War at Home and Abroad from 1550'.

This is just one example of the way in which Cullen unpicks images and proceeds to reveal their layers and meanings in differing contexts. As Luke Gibbons – quoted on the cover of this book – observes, the importance of this study lies 'not only in tracking the circulation and exhibition practices of Irish visual culture leading up to the Revival but also in its nuanced readings of pictures'. A nuanced reading of images is something for which Cullen has become known: see *Visual politics: the representation of Ireland, 1750–1930* (1997), *Sources in Irish art: a reader* (2000), both published by Cork University Press and edited by Cullen (much-thumbed books in my library), *Conquering England. Ireland in Victorian London* (2003) and *The Irish face: redefining the Irish portrait* (2004), all invaluable reference books.

Ireland on Show is clearly written, its arguments well-laid out in five separate essays: Art institutions in Ireland; Union and display; Displaying distress; Display and integration – Ireland in America; the Lane Bequest: displaying the modern. There is much to praise in this book which continues Cullen's pattern of reflecting on and teasing out the concerns that absorb him, including the development of Irish art and cultural institutions and their interface with the wider world, notably Britain and the United States. His inclusion of material relevant to the U.S. and elsewhere broadens the relevance of Irish studies to wider audiences. It should find its place, alongside his other publications, in every art history and cultural studies department.

> MARIE BOURKE National Gallery of Ireland

SCOTTISHNESS AND IRISHNESS IN NEW ZEALAND SINCE 1840. By Angela McCarthy. Pp xvi, 235. Manchester: Manchester University Press. 2011. £60. (Studies in Imperialism)

The editors of Manchester University Press's *Studies in Imperialism* series state that the underlying theme of the series is that 'imperialism as a cultural phenomenon had as significant an effect on the dominant as on the subordinate societies'. The books in this expanding series contribute to analysis of the diversity and complexity of the dominant European settler populations during the ages of Empire and expansion. The latest book in the series, by Angela McCarthy, professor of Scottish and Irish History at the University of Otago, analyses ethnicity among white/pakeha settlers in that most far-flung settler colony – New Zealand/Aotearoa. She is certainly well placed to do so, given her previous valuable studies on the settlement and ethnic identities of Scottish and Irish migrants in nineteenth- and twentieth-century New Zealand.

In this latest book, McCarthy's familiarity with a diverse range of sources allows her to take a very wide lens to her linked topics – perceptions and experiences of ethnic identities. She has used shipboard diaries, letters, the Scottish and Irish press in New Zealand, emigration agents' reports from Scotland and Ireland, poetry, film and photographs as well as less familiar sources such as lunatic-asylum records. While some of her research findings have been published previously as journal articles, the links McCarthy draws between them here add weight to her arguments. After an historiographical survey in the first chapter, she explores the differences in perceptions of identity based on distinctions rooted in the geographical origins of emigrants, including those between northern and southern Ireland, highland and lowland Scotland and other

360

Reviews and short notices

parts of Britain. The following chapters explore language and accents; materiality in the form of music, festivals and food; politics and religion; stereotyped characteristics and, finally, there is a welcome chapter on how Irish and Scots migrants viewed and interacted with Maori peoples.

By using such diverse sources she presents views of Scottish and Irish ethnicity from both outsiders and insiders over a very long time frame – from the early years of settlement in the first half of the nineteenth century to examples drawn from late twentieth-century media. In delving into the twentieth century, she also analyses how concepts of ethnicity have been imagined and enacted over several generations. Her material, and therefore her analysis, is understandably strongest for the nineteenth century and early years of the twentieth century, when there were greater numbers of settlers arriving from Ireland and Scotland. While her focus is divided fairly evenly between Scots and Irish, there is greater survival of some categories of sources from those of Scottish birth compared with the Irish, particularly Catholic Irish. This is a familiar difficulty for researchers of Catholic Irish experiences in the diaspora and often leads researchers by necessity to make rather large claims from relatively slight evidence.

In moving away from exploration of migrant demography and settlement patterns, McCarthy has explored territory that is at once intriguing and harder to define and capture. What is meant by Irishness or Scottishness is not always easy to tease from her sources, nor is it easy to analyse the extent to which individuals take up and cast off ethnic identities in different situations. As she acknowledges, Scots identities were more commonly expressed using cultural markers such as dress, food and music, while a sense of Irishness was more likely to be evoked within political and religious contexts. McCarthy argues that the political issues that drew Irish New Zealanders together concerned Irish homeland politics rather than ethnically-defined political interests related to their new homes.

Her chapter on the perceptions of Maori notes that there has been relatively little scholarly research on how individual ethnic groups interacted with the indigenous peoples they encountered. As she points out, most scholars do not differentiate between settlers/Pakeha of different ethnicities when discussing colonial encounters in New Zealand. The extent to which the ethnicity of settlers in the colonial encounter is relevant to their attitudes and actions is difficult to gauge and it will be interesting to see if the questions that McCarthy has raised here can be addressed by further research.

McCarthy's analysis of the diversity of ethnic identities within the dominant colonial migrant stream is welcome, as is the breadth of her source material. Pushing her analysis into the twentieth century opens up interesting avenues of enquiry that remain somewhat tentative compared with the relative certainties of the nineteenth-century sources. To what extent did a sense of Irishness or Scottishness survive beyond the arriving generations, and under what circumstances did this occur? Establishing the range of circumstances whereby migrants of Irish and Scots background had less use for ethnic identity markers and more connection with other aspects of their individual, family and group identities will repay future research.

DIANNE HALL School of Social Sciences and Psychology, Victoria University, Melbourne.

JOHN DOOLEY'S CIVIL WAR. AN IRISH AMERICAN'S JOURNEY IN THE FIRST VIRGINIA INFANTRY REGIMENT. Edited by Robert Emmett Curran. Pp xxxiii, 515. Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press. 2012. \$59.

John Dooley (1842–73), the Richmond-born son of a successful Irish businessman, was a student at Georgetown University when the American Civil War began. In 1862 he joined