

# European Constitutional Law Review

2014 VOLUME 10 ISSUE 3

*Contributions by*

James Organ, Tuomas Ojanen, Heikki Marjosola, Helle Krunke, Claire Kilpatrick, Victor Ferreres Comella, Madis Ernits, Mark Elliott, Carl Frederik Bergström

*Subjects*

UNITED KINGDOM: European Union law and the contemporary constitution; EUROPEAN UNION: the EU social constitution and the bailouts; also the Commission's decision-making on European Citizens' Initiative proposals; ESTONIA and the principle of equality in its constitution; THE COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION rules on individuals' 'concern' in challenging 'legislative' measures; approves legislative conferral of intervention powers to the European Securities Market Authority; and sets constitutional limits on mass surveillance; THE DANISH SUPREME COURT's judgment on the Lisbon Treaty; THE SPANISH CONSTITUTIONAL COURT rules on Catalonia's 'right to decide'; BOOK REVIEW

*EuConst*

2014/3



ASSER PRESS

## The European Public Prosecutor's Office *An Extended Arm or a Two-Headed Dragon?*

*Edited by*

L.H. Erkelens, A.W.H. Meij and M. Pawlik

In July 2013 the European Commission launched its legislative proposal to create a European Public Prosecutor's Office (EPPO). The proposal provoked fierce debates, politically as well as on the academic level. Many national parliaments opposed and submitted formally their grievances to the Commission and negotiations on the proposal between Member States are ongoing. As early as September 2013, the T.M.C. Asser Instituut in The Hague, The Netherlands, held the first international conference on this unprecedented proposal.

This book reflects the main results of that conference. It provides a concise background of and reasoning for the introduction of this new EU body entrusted with far reaching judicial powers disclosing important legal and policy implications. Within its hitherto limited scope, the existing system of judicial cooperation between EU Member States will change fundamentally, directly affecting the functioning of national courts and public prosecution offices. This book helps answering fundamental questions involved. It provides a solid basis for both academics and practitioners to further structure an EPPO, respecting the interests of all parties involved.

At the time of writing and editing this volume, **Leendert Erkelens** and **Arjen Meij** were both Visiting Research Fellow at the T.M.C. Asser Instituut in The Hague, The Netherlands. **Marta Pawlik** was a Research Assistant in the same Institute.

[www.asser.nl/AsserPress/?978-94-6265-034-3](http://www.asser.nl/AsserPress/?978-94-6265-034-3)

ISBN 978-94-6265-034-3

IX, 247 p., hardcover, € 99.95

For ordering information please click: [www.springer.com/978-94-6265-034-3](http://www.springer.com/978-94-6265-034-3)

Also available online: [link.springer.com/978-94-6265-035-0](http://link.springer.com/978-94-6265-035-0)

Distributed for T.M.C. Asser Press by Springer | [springer.com](http://springer.com)

 **Springer**  
the language of science

# EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

[www.asserpress.nl/cata/euconst/fra.htm](http://www.asserpress.nl/cata/euconst/fra.htm)

[journals.cambridge.org/EuConst](http://journals.cambridge.org/EuConst)

Recommended citation: EUCONST

The journal is edited in the HOGENDORPcentre for European Constitutional Studies, a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence. This Centre is based in the University of Amsterdam. Published three times a year.

Indexed in the following Thomson Reuters products and services: *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Social Scisearch*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Journal Citation Reports/Social Sciences Edition*. Furthermore in the *Index to Foreign Legal Publications*, *International Bibliography of the Social Sciences*, *Westlaw UK Legal Journals Index*, *Scopus* and *LexisNexis*.

## *Editorial Office*

European Constitutional Law Review c/o HOGENDORPcentre, University of Amsterdam, Department of Public Law, P.O. Box 1030; NL – 1000 BA Amsterdam. Tel. +31 20 5253310/3966. E-mail: [EuConst@uva.nl](mailto:EuConst@uva.nl).

## *Distribution*

The *European Constitutional Law Review* is distributed for T-M-C-ASSER PRESS by Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK. The journal is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service. This service can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/EuConst>.

## *Subscription rates and specimen copies*

Subscription to the *European Constitutional Law Review*, Volume 10 (2014): Print + online: GBP 160.00 / USD 291.00 / EUR 230.00. Print only: GBP 146.00 / USD 263.00 / EUR 208.00; Online only: GBP 135.00 / USD 245.00 / EUR 186.00. Subscription orders, changes of address and requests for specimen copies should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK, E-mail: [journals@cambridge.org](mailto:journals@cambridge.org); or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, New York 10994 2133, E-mail: [subscriptions\\_newyork@cambridge.org](mailto:subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org).

## *Advertising*

To advertise in the journal please contact the relevant Advertising Promoter for your area: in the USA, Canada or Mexico: [USAdSales@cambridge.org](mailto:USAdSales@cambridge.org); in the UK, Europe or rest of the world: [ad\\_sales@cambridge.org](mailto:ad_sales@cambridge.org).

## *Photocopying and permissions*

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Permission inquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; permission inquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission inquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/contacts_melbourne.htm). Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com). For republication specific written permission should be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to [press@asser.nl](mailto:press@asser.nl).

ISSN 1574-0196

© 2014 T-M-C-ASSER PRESS, The Hague, and contributors.

## BOARD OF EDITORS

*Leonard F.M. Besselink, co-editor-in-chief*  
Professor of European constitutional law, University of Amsterdam

*Monica Claes, co-editor-in-chief*  
Professor of European and comparative constitutional law, University of Maastricht

*Jan-Herman Reestman, co-editor-in-chief*  
Associate professor of public law, University of Amsterdam

*W.T. Eijsbouts*  
Professor of European constitutional law and history, University of Amsterdam and professor of European law, Leiden University

*Thomas Beukers*  
European University Institute, Florence

*Jan Komárek*  
London School of Economics

*John W. Sap*  
Professor of European Union law, Open University in the Netherlands, Heerlen, and associate professor of European Union law, VU University Amsterdam

*Gerhard van der Schyff*  
University of Tilburg

*Jeremy B. Bierbach, production editor*  
Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam, and attorney at law, Franssen Advocaten, Amsterdam

*Wilma Wildeman, managing editor*  
T.M.C. Asser Press, The Hague

Junior editors

*Geerten Boogaard*  
Leiden University

*Thomas A.J.A. Vandamme*  
University of Amsterdam

*Bastian Michel*  
Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

Special language adviser

*Russell E.M. Lawson*  
Oxford

## BOARD OF ADVISORS

*Andreas Auer*  
Professor emeritus of public law, Universities of Zurich and Geneva

*Paul Craig*  
Professor of English law, St. John's College, Oxford

*Gráinne de Búrca*  
Professor of law, Harvard Law School

*Bruno de Witte*  
Professor of European Union law, European University Institute, Florence; Professor of European Union law, University of Maastricht

*Olivier Duhamel*  
University Professor at IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

*Spyridon Flogaitis*  
Professor of administrative law, University of Athens

*Jörg Gerkrath*  
Professor of European law, University of Luxembourg

*P.J.G. Kapteyn*  
Former judge in the ECJ

*Tim Koopmans*  
Former judge in the ECJ and Advocate General at the Hoge Raad (Supreme Court of the Netherlands), The Hague

*Rick Lawson*  
Kirchheimer Chair, Department of Public Law, Leiden University

*Koen Lenaerts*  
Judge in the ECJ and professor of European law, University of Leuven

*Ingolf Pernice*  
Professor of public law and of international and European law, Humboldt University, Berlin

*Jit Peters*  
Professor emeritus of public law, University of Amsterdam

*Lucas Prakke*  
Professor emeritus of comparative constitutional law, University of Amsterdam

*Sacha Prechal*  
Judge at the ECJ and Professor of international and European institutional law, University of Utrecht

*W.H. Roobol*  
Professor emeritus of European history, University of Amsterdam

*Dominique Rousseau*  
Professor of public law, University of Montpellier 1

*András Sajó*  
Judge of the European Court of Human Rights

*Miroslaw Wyrzykowski*  
Professor of constitutional law at Warsaw University, Poland and judge in the Trybunał Konstytucyjny (Polish Constitutional Court)

*Peter G. Xuereb*  
Professor of European and comparative law, University of Malta

*Jiří Zemánek*  
Jean Monnet Professor of European Union Law, Charles University, Prague

# EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

2014 VOLUME 10 ISSUE 3

## CONTENTS

### *Editorial*

Between the Constitutional Document and the Constitutional Settlement 375

### *Articles*

Mark ELLIOTT – Constitutional Legislation, European Union Law and the Nature of the United Kingdom's Contemporary Constitution 379

Claire KILPATRICK – Are the Bailouts Immune to EU Social Challenge Because They Are Not EU Law? 393

James ORGAN – Decommissioning Direct Democracy? A Critical Analysis of Commission Decision-Making on the Legal Admissibility of European Citizens Initiative Proposals 422

Madis ERNITS – The Principle of Equality in the Estonian Constitution: A Systematic Perspective 444

### *Case Notes*

Carl Fredrik BERGSTRÖM – Defending Restricted Standing for Individuals to Bring Direct Actions against 'Legislative' Measures – Court of Justice of the European Union, Decision of 3 October 2013 in Case C-583/11 P, *Inuit Tapiriit Kanatami and Others v. European Parliament and Council* 481

Heikki MARJOSOLA – Bridging the Constitutional Gap in EU Executive Rule-Making: The Court of Justice Approves Legislative Conferral of Intervention Powers to European Securities Markets Authority – Court of Justice of the European Union (Grand Chamber), Judgment of 22 January 2014, Case C-270/12, *UK v. Parliament and Council* 500

Tuomas OJANEN – Privacy Is More Than Just a Seven-Letter Word: The Court of Justice of the European Union Sets Constitutional Limits on Mass Surveillance – Court of Justice of the European Union, Decision of 8 April 2014 in Joined Cases C-293/12 and C-594/12, *Digital Rights Ireland and Seitlinger and Others* 528

Helle KRUNKE – The Danish *Lisbon* Judgment – Danish Supreme Court, Case 199/2012, Judgment of 20 February 2013 542

Víctor FERRERES COMELLA – The Spanish Constitutional Court Confronts Catalonia's 'Right to Decide' (Comment on the Judgment 42/2014) 571

### *Book Review*

Nicola CONTOURIS and Mark FREEDLAND (eds.), *Resocialising Europe in a Time of Crisis*; Aoife NOLAN, Rory O'CONNELL and Colin HARVEY (eds.), *Human Rights and Public Finance: Budgets and the Promotion of Economic and Social Rights* (Bob HEPPLE) 591

■ author queries on pages:  
541

## EDITORIAL POLICY & GUIDELINES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

In the tradition of the HOGENDORPcentre, the *European Constitutional Law Review* (EuConst) follows the classical approach of constitutionalism, to discuss EU law's developments as well as comparative public law of the member states, political and constitutional theory and history. The journal is a platform for scholarly discussion of European constitutional events and evolution. It is open to contributions in this field from any country in the world and from any discipline. These contributions should satisfy as to substance, apart from the common scholarly criteria, two specific conditions, to a) have a distinctly European relevance and b) include a reference to and discussion of legal aspects involved.

### *Submission of Material*

Authors are requested to send their manuscript to the Editorial Office European Constitutional Law Review, c/o HOGENDORPcentre, P.O. Box 1030; NL – 1000 BA Amsterdam, E-mail: EuConst@uva.nl. All submitted materials should be in English. Detailed instructions and style sheet can be found on <<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayJournal?jid=ECL>>. Materials may be submitted at any time of the year and, if accepted for publication, will be published at the earliest available opportunity.

### *Copyright*

Copyright is exclusively vested in EuConst and the author(s) jointly. Acceptance of the Board of Editors' offer to publish implies, however, that authors agree to an embargo on publication elsewhere, either in English or another language, for a period of two years following the date of publication in EuConst. The agreement of the Board of Editors will be necessary before the article can be subsequently published elsewhere.

### *Revision*

Articles accepted will be edited, linguistically and substantively, subject to author's approval.

### *Books for Review*

These should be sent to Bastian Michel, University of Amsterdam, Constitutional and Administrative Law Department, P.O. Box 1030, NL-1000 BA Amsterdam, e-mail: B.Michel@uva.nl.



The G.K. VAN HOGENDORPcentre FOR EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL STUDIES, short: HOGENDORPcentre, is a Jean Monnet centre of excellence at the University of Amsterdam. Founded in 1996, it promotes research and course development in the field of European Constitutional Studies, bringing together the disciplines of constitutional (including comparative) law, history, political theory. Gijsbert Karel van Hogendorp, 1762-1834, is the *auctor intellectualis* of the Dutch Kingdom's first constitution, of 1814.

Apart from editing the *European Constitutional Law Review*, the HOGENDORPcentre hosts or co-hosts yearly conferences and runs a series of publications, the Hogendorp-papers, published by Europa Law Publishing <[http://www.europalawpublishing.com/european\\_law/erad.htm](http://www.europalawpublishing.com/european_law/erad.htm)>.