pictures of Brazilian history and Atlantic human rights reforms. Chapter 2's chronological organisation highlights changes in the approach to the intractable poor on the eve of the Brazilian independence from Portugal (1821–25), the Second Empire (1840–89), the war of the Triple Alliance (1864–70), and the early First Republic. Chapter 9 focuses on what Beattie terms the 'sequencing of institutional reforms', and on the author's idea that '[a] reform that improved the treatment and condition of one category [of the intractable poor] made it less legitimate to continue for those in other categories (p. 226, and similarly on p. 33). Accordingly, the author engages in a connected study of the movements for the abolition of capital punishment, floggings, military impressment and slavery.

The integration of the comparative and bottom-up perspectives leads to equally original interpretations. In particular, Beattie combines his observations on the substantial lack of differentiation of slave convicts from other convicts on Fernando de Noronha (chapter 8), and on the relevance of the 'jealous institution' in the classification of prisoners more generally (chapter 5). Then he contrasts these findings to the situation in the United States and in penal colonies in New Caledonia, Australia and Sakhalin, and concludes: 'Instead of defending the lower boundaries of whiteness, Brazilian institutions that harboured the intractable poor more often used marriage and conjugal living as a means to rank, reward, and discriminate among them' (p. 236).

The volume is well written and has a clear structure, the documentary basis rich and varied and its interpretations convincing. Moreover, Beattie clearly has a point in arguing for the need of a category that embraces convicts, soldiers, sailors, slaves, and beyond. His 'intractable poor' wisely brings together self-representation, external stereotypes, and material conditions. The author does not address alternative conceptualisations that have been proposed in the scholarship with the same goal. I think of Guha's 'subalterns', Rediker and Linebaugh's 'many-headed Hydra', and concepts such as 'subaltern workers' and 'labouring poor'. These last ones have emerged from global labour historians' quest to re-defining the 'working class' in a way that exceeds 'free' wage labour to include workers across multiple labour relations. Historians increasingly need such inclusive conceptualisations in order to frame their narratives globally, and overcome long-established disciplinary boundaries. Beattie's important book makes a contribution also to this field.

University of Leicester CHRISTIAN G. DE VITO

J. Lat. Amer. Stud. **48** (2016). doi:10.1017/S0022216X16001243

Michael E. Donoghue, *Borderland on the Isthmus: Race, Culture, and the Struggle for the Canal Zone* (Durham, NC, and London: Duke University Press, 2014), pp. xii + 349, $94.95, $25.95 pb.

Until recently, most of the work that covered the relationship between Panama and the United States focused on the diplomatic negotiations between teams of diplomats, and the political realities that informed these relations. Most Panamanian historians, meanwhile, struggled to defend the nationalist narrative, showing that a Panamanian national consciousness existed since the nineteenth century, and depicting the twentieth-century struggle of a nation against an empire. Histories of particular ethnic groups like the Afro-Antilleans (Michael L. Conniff), the Kuna (James Howe) and the Chinese (Lok C. D. Siu), went some way to undermine the image of two stable polities locked in a struggle. But only recently did writers like Julie Greene and

Ashley Carse attack the older scholarship head on. *Borderland on the Isthmus: Race, Culture, and the Struggle for the Canal Zone* will solidify this break by forcing us to come to terms with the impermeability of the borders of the Canal Zone. In this excellent work, Michael Donoghue depicts the 'super enclave' from the post-war era until its dismantling following the Torrijos-Carter Treaties of 1977, showing the numerous ways in which, despite its relative immutability, it lived in perpetual crisis, its boundaries subject to continuous challenge from below.

Donoghue borrows from a variety of scholarly fields (the literature on borderlands, on enclave societies and on modern empires) arguing that the areas surrounding the canal, which included Panama City and Colón, formed a borderland. The evidence that Donoghue brings to support this characterisation is vast. Thousands of Panamanians and US soldiers and civilians crossed the border every day, for work or pleasure; thousands developed sexual and romantic relations; and many more social and economic networks tied people on each side of the border. Scholars of Panama and the Canal Zone will of course be familiar with these facts, but no one has discussed them in such breadth, depth and nuance before.

Following an introductory chapter that lays out the argument, Donoghue devotes a chapter to describe and analyse the world of the white 'Zonians', and another to the Afro-Antilleans of the Canal Zone. Beyond the extensive archival research that supports his nuanced descriptions in these two chapters, Donoghue's massive oral history work allowed him to enliven his depiction and give it a ring-true feel. It also allows him to go beyond the now well-established characteristics of the zone as a Jim Crow society, which segregated its Afro-Antillean 'silver role' employees and their families from its white 'gold role' employees. A separate chapter on gender, sex and sexuality in the imperial context of the zone elaborates on the enormous temptations that lay behind these social boundaries, and the great fears that the forbidden desires elicited. Another chapter explores the special role that the military had in the borderland and the tension that surrounded the civilian-military divide within the Canal Zone. The US military, which held the majority of lands and men in the zone, also had its own judicial and police system, and its own set of interests. Donoghue argues that while soldiers were sometimes responsible for horrendous violence that outraged the Panamanian public, overall, Panamanians held less animosity towards US soldiers because they were more transitory and less committed to the idea of the zone. A full third of the US military in the zone at any given point was Puerto Rican, and many others were Black and Latino. Donoghue unpacks some of the tensions between these groups and white soldiers. A final chapter is devoted to the illicit economy and to the role of crime in the borderland. Donoghue's emphasis on crime throughout the book is developed further here, and while he shies away from viewing all crime in the Canal Zone as a form of resistance, he insists on reading crime within its socio-political context, a context the historical actors were themselves aware of.

Borderland on the Isthmus is the most thorough and best depiction of day-to-day reality in the post-war Canal Zone to date. While the book does not deal with the Panamanian side of the border in great detail, Donoghue is well versed in Panamanian historiography, and has more than enough Spanish sources to give his reader an idea of how Panamanians experienced life along the border.

The book falls a little short on its engagement with borderland theory, however. As Donoghue points out, the majority of the studies in this field have been developed on the United States-Mexico border and other areas along state boundaries. Far from the reach of the state and the centres of hegemony, these frontier zones develop their own

patterns of commerce, social interaction and culture. Donoghue's empirical work shows that the Canal Zone and the Panamanian cities bordering it indeed had many of the characteristics of a borderland, but also a profusion of state agencies and agents. Indeed, it is possible that what created spaces for subaltern infrapolitics along the Canal Zone boundaries was the opposition between authorities, social institutions, legal and normative codes, and the contradictory reality this opposition engendered. Perhaps then, what is needed is a novel theoretical development, which will take into account not only subaltern resistance to the system of domination along the imperial boundaries, but also the penetration of state agents from one side to the other, as well as the dissemination of disciplinary practices, language, habits and culture more broadly.

This is a criticism that is only possible in light of Donoghue's fantastic empirical work, in any case. The theoretical questions that linger here, moreover, make this anthro-historical study all the more important to read for historians interested in Latin America and the US empire.

Harvard University EZER VIERBA

J. Lat. Amer. Stud. **48** (2016). doi:10.1017/S0022216X16001255

Lisa Breglia, *Living with Oil: Promises, Peaks, and Declines on Mexico's Gulf Coast* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 2013), pp. x + 313, $55.00; £39.00, hb.

The political economy and everyday politics of oil extraction are currently highly topical: problems with oil overproduction, decreasing market prices, and the multifaceted environmental harms and social disturbances inflicted by extractive economies on local communities have merged to produce a global crisis. Yet, despite an increasing number of books and articles on the extractive industries published in recent years, the complexities of oil exploitation in Mexico have received scant attention. Lisa Breglia's *Living with Oil* helps to fill this lacuna by offering a unique analysis of the extraction challenges faced by the Mexican parastatal company, Petróleos Mexicanos (PEMEX), the eleventh largest oil company in the world, in a period of post-peak production and ground-breaking energy reform. The book combines sophisticated political-economic analysis of prospects for the Mexican oil industry in terms of global energy markets and hydrocarbon politics, with the author's rich ethnography among the coastal fishing communities of Isla Aguada, Campeche, south-eastern Mexico. Through in-depth analysis of the fishers' experience of oil as both blessing and curse, Breglia presents the everyday concerns characteristic of oil-affected communities struggling to cope with injustices related to air, soil and water pollution, and the uneven distribution of oil-related benefits and burdens.

The book is divided into three parts. It begins by analysing theoretical models of extractive economies, characterised by peaks and declines, linking them to discussion of the effects of extraction booms and busts on the fishing communities in Laguna de Términos, Campeche. Part II presents a detailed ethnographic portrayal of the everyday lives of the fishers of Isla Aguada, dissecting the impact of multiple pressures from globalised oil extraction, a declining shrimping industry and dwindling artisanal fishing. It also examines the ambiguous negotiations and trade-offs inherent to the oil industry's compensation policies and responsibility programmes. The third section analyses the post-peak politics of oil exploitation, characterised by neoliberal resource governance and an intensification of oil production activities. It also explores