

spent the last seventeen years of his life as a theology tutor at Prior Park College in Bath before his death in January 1886.

James's critical determination to recover Errington's reputation from the damage done to him by both contemporaries and historians is evident throughout this book. James is particularly thorough in his analysis of the breakdown of Wiseman and Errington's relationship, demonstrating how two shining stars of the post-emancipation English Catholic Church, who shared a similar education at the English College in Rome but whose personalities were incompatible, could find it almost impossible to work together. Errington was the archetypal administrator; well-organised, financially astute, thorough in detail and not afraid to be critical of others if he observed a point of canon law being contravened. Conversely, Wiseman did not take kindly to criticism and expected unquestioned loyalty from his bishops. Indeed, by the time of the cardinal's death in 1865, their relationship had deteriorated to such an extent that Errington could not even bring himself to attend his former school friend's funeral. This had a profound effect on Errington and helps to explain why he was suspicious of the hierarchy's offer of the archbishopric of Glasgow.

James is particularly good on the smaller details of Errington's life – something the archbishop himself would no doubt have appreciated. Away from the pressures of the episcopate, Errington spent the little free time he allowed himself in pursuing his own interests, notably in botany when he could often be found studying the flowers in the hedgerows alongside the navvies building the nation's bridges and railways. His strong sense of duty and responsibility was a lifelong characteristic. It is somehow fitting that, when told that he only had a few hours left to live, the bedridden Errington spent most of this time marking the essays of his Prior Park students.

Criticisms are minor. There is a useful bibliography of secondary sources at the end of the volume but no list of primary sources, although these are referenced in footnotes. The introduction, setting out the context of Catholic history in England from the Reformation to the nineteenth-century, is perhaps a little unnecessary. In general, however, this is an excellent, highly readable book deserving of a larger and broader audience than its price tag will probably permit. James's research should go a long way towards achieving his aim of redeeming Errington's reputation for posterity.

DURHAM UNIVERSITY

JONATHAN BUSH

Apostolikumsstreitigkeiten. Diskussionen um Liturgie, Lehre und Kirchenverfassung in der preußischen Landeskirche, 1871–1914. By Julia Winnebeck. (Arbeiten Zur Kirchen – Und Theologiegeschichte, 44.) Pp. 447. Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 2016. €58. 978 3 374 04146 6

JEH (69) 2018; doi:10.1017/S0022046917001749

The hallmark of German Protestant academic theology in the nineteenth century was its historicisation. Its premise was that Christianity's basic and essential truths could be disclosed through historical criticism of the Bible and other early texts. Even within the Protestant theological faculties, however, this premise was broadly contested, for it seemed to challenge the very idea of divine revelation and the eternal truth of Christian dogma. Repeated controversies between the proponents and opponents of historical criticism thus erupted during the late

nineteenth century; and the most troubling had to do with the question whether the Apostles' Creed represented a sacrosanct text or a historical document. The implications of the debates reached deep into matters of doctrine, liturgy and ecclesiastical constitution. Julia Winnebeck's dissertation draws on exhaustive research in the archives and contemporary sources to analyse these controversies. To Protestant liberals, the intellectual heirs of Friedrich Schleiermacher and Ferdinand Christian Baur, the Apostles' Creed could be objected to on several counts. It entailed dogmatic propositions whose historical authenticity (to say nothing of their plausibility) could not be demonstrated. Particularly problematic was the doctrine of Jesus' miraculous birth: 'conceived by the Holy Spirit, born of the virgin Mary'. Critics objected further to the Creed's central place in the liturgy, particularly the requirement, which prevailed in most of the Prussian and other German Protestant Churches, that it be recited at baptism, confirmation and ordination, as well as in Sunday services, and that it be understood as the word of God. The defenders of the Apostles' Creed, the conservative Protestants who were in the majority in the consistories as well as the synods, resisted both the historical attack on dogma and calls to allow clergymen to eliminate, modify or interpret recitation of the Creed in the light of their own doctrinal convictions. The Creed represented, its defenders argued, the foundational formulation of Christian belief, a common dogmatic bond without which the Church could not exist. In this way, the issue of the Apostles' Creed became, as Winnebeck notes, a 'red flag in the disputes among the parties' (p. 244) into which German Protestantism had split. The disputes played out in parishes, synods, ecclesiastical offices, before special tribunals and in the press. The stakes were high, for the moral as well as the institutional integrity of the Church seemed to be at stake. A number of cases led to the censure or dismissal of critics from clerical office. Julia Winnebeck's dissertation lays out in rich detail the many issues that attended the controversy over the Apostles' Creed. Her work is a welcome addition to scholarship on the theology and politics of German Protestantism in the nineteenth century.

GEORGETOWN UNIVERSITY,
WASHINGTON

ROGER CHICKERING

Mission, science and race in South Africa. A. W. Roberts of Lovedale, 1883–1938. By Keith Snedegar. Pp. xii + 189 incl. 10 ills. Lanham, MD–London: Lexington Books, 2015. £52.95. 978 0 7391 9624 3
JEH (69) 2018; doi:10.1017/S0022046917002585

Most books on the history of mission education in South Africa mention Alexander William Roberts only in passing or in a footnote. Keith Snedegar, Professor of World History at Utah Valley University, has taken the trouble to study the rich material contained in Roberts's papers besides that in an impressive number of other collections, and to reconstruct his life's story. The reader is confronted with a life of many contradictions, rich in success and failure. Roberts was born in 1857 in Scotland and migrated as a young man in 1883 to Lovedale College in the Eastern Cape region of South Africa. Lovedale was a school run by the Free Church Mission of Scotland and during Roberts's career as a teacher