The Laestrygonians attack Odysseus' ships. On *mergunt . . . merguntque*, Bömer comments 'Geminatio intensiva', but none of the notes bearing on the subject scattered through his labyrinthine commentary (Heidelberg, 1969–86) offers anything like a real parallel to this instance. Here too the expression strikes me as feeble by Ovidian standards. It might nevertheless be suffered to pass were it not that a glance at his Homeric source[5] suggests otherwise:

οἱ δ' ἀΐοντες
φοίτων ἴφθιμοι Λαιστρυγόνες ἄλλοθεν ἄλλος,
μυρίοι, οὐκ ἄνδρεσσιν ἐοικότες, ἀλλὰ Γίγασιν.
οἵ ῥ' ἀπὸ πετράων ἀνδραχθέσι χερμαδίοισι
βάλλον· ἄφαρ δὲ κακὸς κόναβος κατὰ νῆας ὀρώρει
ἀνδρῶν ὀλλυμένων νηῶν θ' ἅμα ἀγνυμενάων. (Hom. *Od.* 10.118–23)

In the light of *ἀγνυμενάων* there we may deduce that what he originally wrote was *merguntque uiros franguntque carinas*. Ovid was not one to miss an intertextual trick if there was one to be taken.

The result of the change is to give us what commentators are wont to call *hysteron proteron*, a term that explains nothing. Poets exploited the flexibility of Latin in the matter of word-order: here perhaps a case in which 'the order of importance seems to prevail over that of time'.[6] The men drown as (*ἅμα*) their ships are shattered beneath them.

Cambridge E. J. KENNEY

[5] To which my attention was drawn by Professor K. Sara Myers's note ad loc. in her commentary on *Met*. 14, now in preparation.

[6] A. J. Bell, *The Latin Dual and Poetic Diction* (London and Toronto, 1923), 271.

BIRDS, FLAMES AND EPIC CLOSURE IN OVID, *METAMORPHOSES* 13.600–20 AND 14.568–80[1]

Perstat, habetque deos pars utraque, quodque deorum est
instar, habent animos; nec iam dotalia regna,
nec sceptrum soceri, nec te, Lavinia virgo,
sed vicisse petunt deponendique pudore
bella gerunt; tandemque Venus victricia nati
arma videt, Turnusque cadit: cadit Ardea, Turno
sospite dicta potens. quam postquam barbarus ensis
abstulit et tepida patuerunt tecta favilla,
congerie e media tum primum cognita praepes
subvolat et cineres plausis everberat alis.
et sonus et macies et pallor et omnia, captam
quae deceant urbem, nomen quoque mansit in illa
urbis, et ipsa suis deplangitur Ardea pennis. (*Met*. 14.568–80)

But the war went on and both sides had their gods to aid them, and, what is as good as gods, they had courage too. And now neither a kingdom given in dowry, nor the sceptre of a father-in-law, nor you, Lavinian maiden, did they seek, but only victory; they kept on warring for sheer shame of giving up. At length Venus saw her son's arms victorious and Turnus fell. Ardea, counted a powerful city while Turnus was alive, fell. But after the foreigner's sword

[1] The Latin text throughout is quoted from W. S. Anderson's Teubner edition, *P. Ovidii Nasonis Metamorphoses* (Leipzig, 1977); the translations are quoted from F. J. Miller (ed. and trans.), *Ovid IV, Metamorphoses IX–XV*, 2nd edn rev. G. P. Goold (Cambridge, MA and London, 1984) with a few changes.

https://doi.org/10.1093/cq/53.2.620 Published online by Cambridge University Press

destroyed it and its ruins stood open amidst warm ashes, from the confused mass a bird flew forth of a kind never seen before and beat the ashes with its flapping wings. Its sound, its meagre look, its deathly paleness, all things which become a captured city, even the city's name, remained in the bird. And Ardea's self is beaten in lamentation by its wings.

The conflagration of the Rutulian city of Ardea, and the subsequent rise of a heron, the homonymous bird (*ardea*), from the city's ashes, concludes Ovid's reproduction of the *Aeneid*. So far, readings on the fall of Ardea have exclusively focused on the intertextual associations between Ovid and Virgil on the basis of similar wordplay. Thus O'Hara has noted[2] that *Met*. 14.573–80 involves wordplay on the name *ardea* and the action of burning (*ardere*) that most likely alludes to Virgil, *Aen*. 7.623–31, where the description of Italy burning in excitement in preparation for war against the Trojans is framed by the words *ardet* (opening word of line 623) and *Ardea* (opening word of line 631). This suggestive link between the name of Ardea and *ardet* is enhanced by numerous connections between Turnus, the king of Ardea, and fire (and thus Ardea) throughout the Virgilian epic.[3] Critics have also argued that Virgil's other reference to Ardea earlier in *Aen*. 7.411–12 (*locus Ardea quondam* / *dictus avis et nunc magnum manet Ardea nomen*), toys with the visual similarity of *avis* (short 'i') to *avis* (long 'i'), and thus implies familiarity with the city's transformation into a bird.[4]

Yet the metamorphosis of Ardea, the final scene in Ovid's 'little *Aeneid*', apart from recasting Virgilian wordplay, also seems to replicate themes from an earlier episode within the *Metamorphoses* itself, the transformation of the Memnonides (*Met*. 13.600–20), which concludes the poet's 'little *Iliad*'. I wish to suggest that Ovid crafted the narrative of Ardea's transformation to match his account of the Memnonides' rise from the ashes of Memnon's funerary pyre. We shall also see that in addition to mirroring each other the two episodes also recall contextual associations originally made by Virgil. This combination of motif replication and source recollection reinforces the unity of *Met*. 12.1–14.580, underlines Ovid's ongoing interaction with Virgil, and underscores the importance of thematic repetition in accomplishing smooth narrative progression in Ovid's epic.[5]

Memnon's performance as leader of the Trojans following the death of Hector, and his death also in a single combat with Achilles, featured as the central theme of Arctinus' epic *Ethiopis*, and it was a legend frequently recast in ancient literature.[6] The story of the birds of Memnon, however, makes its first literary appearance in this

[2] J. J. O'Hara, *True Names: Vergil and the Alexandrian Tradition of Etymological Word Play* (Ann Arbor, 1996), 70, 84, 192.

[3] On the passages linking Turnus and fire, see M. von Duhn, 'Die Gleichnisse in den Allectoszenen des 7. Buches von Vergils *Aeneis*', *Gymnasium* 64 (1957), 64-79.

[4] Cf. F. Ahl, *Metaformations. Soundplay and Wordplay in Ovid and Other Classical Poets* (Ithaca, 1985), 265, n. 29: 'Hence we have: "a place, once called Ardea by our ancestors", with undertones of "a place, Ardea, once called a bird" '; also P. R. Hardie, 'Augustan poets and the mutability of Rome', in A. Powell (ed.), *Poetry and Propaganda in the Age of Augustus* (London, 1992), 77, n. 16; O'Hara (n. 2), 192; M. Paschalis, *Vergil's Aeneid: Semantic Relations and Proper Names* (Oxford, 1997), 255; A. Michalopoulos, *Ancient Etymologies in Ovid's Metamorphoses* (Leeds, 2001), 36-37. See also J. T. Dyson, 'Birds, grandfathers, and neoteric sorcery in *Aeneid* 4.254 and 7.412', *CQ* 47 (1997), 314-15, arguing that Virgil's pun on the meaning of *avis* is not only intentional but also repeated elsewhere in the *Aeneid* (4.254).

[5] On the theoretical background of narrative progression that is facilitated by the regular recurrence of specific themes along the course of the *Metamorphoses*, see most recently S. M. Wheeler, *Narrative Dynamics in Ovid's Metamorphoses* (Tübingen, 2000).

[6] On Arctinus' surviving fragments and the evolution of the Memnon legend in antiquity, see M. Davies, *The Epic Cycle* (Bristol, 1989), 53-61, and A. Bernabé, *Poetarum Epicorum Graecorum: Testimonia et Fragmenta* (Leipzig, 1987), 67-71.

https://doi.org/10.1093/cq/53.2.620 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Ovidian passage.[7] Its particular structure and placement unmistakably correspond to the fate of Ardea, as both the Memnonides and the Ardea episodes describe the rising of birds from the ashes of destruction in overlapping vocabulary,[8] a similarity in imagery underscored further by the identical opening of *Met*. 13.613 and 14.572 with the phrase *bella gerunt*. Memnon's portrayal as substitute Hector in the Trojan legend, finally, brings the two episodes even closer together since it invites comparison with Turnus, Virgil's successor of Trojan Hector.

The correlation between Turnus and Memnon, and, by association, Ardea/Rutulians and Troy receives strong additional contextual support. When Ovid refers to Memnon's pyre as *arduus alto* / *corruit igne rogus* (13.600–1 'lofty pyre sank into high-leaping flames'),[9] he artfully brings together two additional etymologically charged references to Ardea (lit. translated as 'lofty'), both of which have their origin in Virgil. At *Aen*. 7.412, *magnum manet Ardea nomen*, the term *magnum*, according to Servius, glosses the name Ardea, which is thus to be associated with the word *arduus*.[10] Then at *G*. 1.364, *altam supra volat ardea nubem*, Virgil makes a pun with the literal translation of the name of *ardea* the bird and its lofty flight.[11] What is more, at the conclusion of the *Aeneid*, as the single combat between Aeneas and Turnus is about to enter its final phase, Aeneas taunts his opponent with the suggestive words, *verte omnis tete in facies*, 'turn yourself into any shape you can' (12.891). This phrase, along with the lines immediately following (12.892–3, *opta ardua pennis* / *astra sequi*, 'pray for wings to fly to the lofty stars'), points to the legend of Ardea's transformation as much as it identifies Turnus with the fate of his city.[12] The same identification is reinforced in Ovid's text, when the falls of Turnus and Ardea are juxtaposed, even expressed with the same verb: *Turnusque cadit: cadit Ardea* (14.573). Aeneas is not mentioned by name in the description of Ardea's destruction, yet Ovid's employment of the attributive *barbarus*, the foreigner (13.574), to modify the destroyer of Ardea almost certainly refers to the Trojan hero.[13] A link between the two is made clear by the reference to Aeneas' victorious arms in the previous line (13.572–3).

[7] P. M. C. Forbes-Irving, *Metamorphosis in Greek Myths* (Oxford, 1990), 246-7; cf. also N. Hopkinson, *Ovid: Metamorphoses Book XIII* (Cambridge, 2001), 28-9.

[8] Memnon's pyre and the ruins of Ardea give out smoke that covers their surroundings and rises high (13.601ff. *nigrique volumina fumi* / *infecere diem . . . atra favilla volat* ~ 14.575 *tepida patuerunt tecta favilla*). In both cases the ashes give birth to mourning birds (13.604ff. *atra favilla volat glomerataque corpus in unum* / *densetur faciemque capit . . . et primo similis volucri, mox vera volucris* / *insonuit pennis* ~ 14.576-7 *congerie e media tum primum cognite praepes* / *subvolat*) that beat themselves—Memnon's birds divide themselves into opposing battle lines while Ardea beats herself in mourning (13.610ff. *consonus exit in auras* / *ter plangor . . . bella gerunt rostrisque et aduncis unguibus iras* / *exercent alasque adversaque pectora lassant* ~ 14.580 *ipsa suis deplangitur Ardea pennis*). Finally both the Memnonides and Ardea derive their names from their generating force, Memnon and the city Ardea (13.617-18 *nomen facit auctor: ab illo* / *Memnonides dictae* ~ 14.579-80 *nomen quoque mansit in illa* / *urbis*).

[9] On the etymological relationship between *arduus* and *ardere*, see Pisc. *Gramm*. II.136.7: *ardeo arduus*.

[10] Servius' *Aen*. 7.412: MAGNUM TENET ARDEA NOMEN bene adlusit: nam Ardea quasi ardua dicta est.

[11] Paschalis (n. 4), 255-6, in discussing Allecto's flight to Ardea in *Aen*. 7.406ff., aptly links the name of Ardea with 'Height (*arduus*), Fire (*ardeo*), and Flight'.

[12] Hardie (n. 4), 81, n. 43.

[13] The *barbarus* destroying Ardea can only be Aeneas. The only other time the term appears in Ovid's 'little *Aeneid*' it is unmistakably a synonym for the Trojans: when the Ithacan Macareus wonders how his comrade Achaemenides found himself on board a 'foreign ship' (*barbara Graium* / *prora vehit*, 14.163-4); on *barbarus* as an epithet of Aeneas, see also F. Bömer, *P. Ovidius Naso. Metamorphosen, Kommentar. XIV–XV* (Heidelberg, 1986), 187 ad loc.

https://doi.org/10.1093/cq/53.2.620 Published online by Cambridge University Press

It should be noted at this point that both Turnus and Memnon are also portrayed in certain ways as alternative versions of Achilles, further associating the transformations of Ardea and the Memnonides. Turnus' introduction as *alius Achilles* by the Sibyl (*Aen.* 6.89ff.) is only one of the pointed similarities the Rutulian leader shares with the Greek hero. Yet as the second, the Iliadic, half of the *Aeneid* unrolls the reader gradually realizes that it is Aeneas who ultimately becomes Achilles' successor.[14] Likewise Ovid's Memnon shares a number of biographical details with Achilles: divine parentage and a grieving mother who in the pattern set by Thetis throws herself on Jupiter's knees (*Met*. 13.585–6 *magni genibus procumbuere non est* / *dedignata Iovis*; cf. *Il.* 1.500 *πάροιθ' αὐτοῖο καθέζετο, καὶ λάβε γούνων*), alludes to the services she offered to him (*Met*. 13.591 *quantum tibi femina praestem*; cf. *Il.* 1.503 *εἴ ποτε δή σε μετ' ἀθανάτων ὄνησα*), and as reward asks the god to honour her son (*Met*. 13.598 *da, precor, . . . honorem*; cf. *Il.* 1.505 *τίμησόν μοι υἱόν*) who is doomed to die young (*Met*. 13.596 *primis sub annis*; cf. *Il.* 1.505 *ὃς ὠκυμορώτατος ἄλλων*).[15] Another significant similarity that the ancient epic tradition chronicles between Memnon and Achilles was a magnificent shield also made by Hephaestus.[16]

Finally, the placement of Memnon's funeral at the conclusion of Ovid's 'little *Iliad*' readily evokes Hector's funeral at the end of Homer's epic, and thus reinforces the link between Aurora's son and the Trojan leader whom Memnon replaced, as well as sealing the parallelism to Turnus, Hector's Italian version. Aurora's mourning for Memnon also recalls the lament of the Trojan women over the body of Hector; the Memnon episode begins and ends with the mention of Aurora next to Hector's mother, the leader of the lamenting chorus in *Il.* 22.429ff., and 24.710ff. The clear identification of Hector with his city[17] is in turn readily seen to reflect Turnus' association with Ardea: the pyre of Hector, so appropriately the conclusive scene of the *Iliad*, anticipates the conflagration of Troy, just as the conflagration of Ardea follows the death of *ardens* Turnus. What is more, the description of Ardea as *potens* during Turnus' lifetime (*Met*. 14.573–4 *Ardea, Turno* / *sospite dicta potens*) may recall mourning Hecuba's similar characterization of Troy in Ovid's text as *ingens* (*Met*. 13.505 *iacet Ilion ingens*), in the days before the Trojan war. As a matter of fact, even outside the Ovidian text, Memnon is readily seen as surrogate for Hector, especially when he kills Antilochus, Nestor's youngest son and himself a doublet for Patroclus as Achilles' best friend, on the Trojan battle field. Like the murder of Patroclus, it is the death of Antilochus that causes Achilles to target Memnon and wish fervently for his death in revenge.[18]

All in all, the introduction to the Ardea scene nicely captures the ancient epic spirit

[14] W. S. Anderson's, 'Vergil's Second *Iliad*', *TAPA* 88 (1957), 17-30 (repr. in S. J. Harrison [ed.], *Oxford Readings in Vergil's Aeneid* [Oxford, 1990], 239-52; and in P. Hardie [ed.], *Virgil: Critical Assessments of Classical Authors* 3 [London and New York, 1999], 74-86), constitutes a classic treatment of the theme of *alius Achilles* in *Aen*. 7-12. On introducing both Achilles and Hector as models for Aeneas and Turnus, see A. Traina, *Enciclopedia Virgiliana*, s.v. 'Turno', 328; K. C. King, 'Homer's Achilles in Vergil's *Aeneid*', *MD* 9 (1982), 31-55; T. van Nortwick, 'Aeneas, Turnus and Achilles', *TAPA* 110 (1980), 303-14.

[15] For the similarities of the pleas of Aurora and Thetis, see F. Bömer, *P. Ovidius Naso. Metamorphosen, Kommentar. XII–XIII* (Heidelberg, 1982), 351-2 ad loc.

[16] Davis (n. 6), 55; Bernabé (n. 6), 68.

[17] The mourning that breaks out in Troy as soon as Hector dies at the hands of Achilles is explicitly compared to the lament over the fall of Troy the city (*Il*. 22.410-11). Earlier in the epic (*Il*. 6.402-3) we are told that Hector's son was nicknamed Astyanax, 'city-ruler', by the people of Troy because 'Hector alone guarded Ilion'; cf. Plato, *Cra*. 393A (*ὁ γὰρ ἄναξ καὶ ὁ ἕκτωρ σχεδόν τι ταὐτὸν σημαίνει*). See also *Il*. 24.728-30.

[18] Davies (n. 6), 56; Bernabé (n. 6), 68.

https://doi.org/10.1093/cq/53.2.620 Published online by Cambridge University Press

that Ovid wishes to revive as he draws near the end of his 'little *Aeneid*'. The warriors' bravery, the partisan gods, and especially the desire to reach a military victory, ultimately the principal goal of both contestants as Lavinia and her kingdom gradually move to the background (*Met*. 14.567–71), reflect the situation at Troy, just as much as they echo Virgil's narrative.[19] The conclusions, then, of both the 'little *Iliad*' and the 'little *Aeneid*' not only centre on scenes that replicate and complement each other, but their symmetrical placement strengthens the unity of Ovid's history of the Trojan era. In addition, these concluding scenes generate a network of textual associations, which extend beyond the boundaries of the *Metamorphoses* to converse with the epic's major archetypes, the Homeric *Iliad* and Virgil's *Aeneid*. In sum, the miraculous transformation of Ardea, taken together with its association with the Memnonides episode, aptly illustrates the complex texture of Ovid's epic and advertises the poet's ability to create an orderly and balanced narrative.[20]

University of Cyprus SOPHIA PAPAIOANNOU
psophia@ucy.ac.cy

[19] Although one should note that Turnus, in the night before his final engagement with Aeneas, violently proclaims his determination to fight for the hand of Lavinia (*Aen*. 12.14ff.).

[20] I am grateful to James O'Hara and Andreas Michalopoulos for reading earlier drafts of this paper and offering valuable comments that strengthened my thesis, and to Alison Keith, to the anonymous referee, and to the editor of *CQ* for their most helpful suggestions on style.

OVIDIAN PLUMBING IN *METAMORPHOSES* 4*

Ovid's narrative of Pyramus and Thisbe needs little introduction: two young lovers arrange a nocturnal tryst, but end up committing suicide as a result of a tragic misunderstanding.[1] The story concludes with a description of a mulberry tree that is spattered with blood from Pyramus' wound and thus changes the colour of its fruit from white to red. Although Ovid's narrative has become canonical for the Western tradition, evidence exists of an alternative version of the story. The essential features of the story are the same, with one important metamorphic difference: in this version it is not the fruit of the mulberry that is transformed, but the lovers themselves—Thisbe into a spring, Pyramus into a river.

Evidence for an aquatic version of the Pyramus and Thisbe story postdates Ovid's *Metamorphoses* by some considerable time.[2] It is possible, nevertheless, that the later version has preserved traces of a *pre*-Ovidian, possibly Hellenistic, tradition. This idea was explored by Knox in 1989.[3] He proposed that origins for the aquatic version of the

* I would like to thank Philip Hardie, Vedia Izzet, Jason König, and the anonymous referee of *CQ* for their helpful comments.

[1] The essential components of this story were famously reworked by Shakespeare into *Romeo and Juliet* and *A Midsummer Night's Dream*; more recently Ted Hughes used the Pyramus and Thisbe episode to conclude his *Tales from Ovid* (London, 1997).

[2] The literary evidence dates from the fifth century A.D. onwards: Nonnus, *Dion*. 6.344–55, 12.84–5; Himerius, *Or*. 1.11; Them. *Or.* 11.151; Nicolaus, *Progymn*. 2.9 (*Rhet. Gr*. 1.271 Walz); Ps.-Clemens, *Recogn*. 10.26.

[3] P. E. Knox, 'Pyramus and Thisbe in Cyprus', *HSCP* 92 (1989), 315–28; cf. P. M. C. Forbes Irving, *Metamorphosis in Greek Myths* (Oxford, 1990), 305: 'It is possible that this was the Hellenistic aetiological story from which Ovid derived his own story.'

https://doi.org/10.1093/cq/53.2.620 Published online by Cambridge University Press